

**The Migrant Other:
A Visual and Textual Analysis of Migration in UK Media**

By:

John McIver
Anthropology, University of Victoria, 2017

An Essay Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements of the

HONOURS PROGRAM

in the Department of Anthropology

© John McIver, 2017

University of Victoria

All rights reserved. This thesis may not be reproduced in whole or in part, by photocopy or other means, without the permission of the author.

Abstract

The lead up to the Brexit vote, which occurred in the UK on June 23rd, 2016, marked a politically tumultuous time for the UK. One issue at the forefront of this vote was migration, and the control (or perceived lack of control) over migrants. However, often overlooked is the question of how issues surrounding migration appeared in the media during this unique time and specifically how media can then be a space for the development and strengthening of political discourse. To this end, I examine images embedded in articles from two major news events that coincided with the Brexit vote: the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher, who was killed on January 25th, 2016, and Pope Francis returning from a trip to Lesbos with 12 Syrian refugees who he settled in Rome on April 16th, 2016. In looking at these events, this analysis turns to two “broadsheet” newspapers from the UK: the left-leaning Guardian and the right-leaning Telegraph. Then, with these two events and two newspapers, this paper examines how images become embedded in, and become indicative of, political discourse. I conclude that in the left-leaning Guardian a sympathetic portrayal and discourse surrounding migration is represented, while the right-leaning Telegraph constructs a less sympathetic, and more threatening, discourse regarding migrants and migration. The essay further shows that images are a key factor in the development and reinforcement of politicized discourses.

KEYWORDS

Migration, media, Brexit, UK, refugees, discourse, code, broadsheet newspaper, visual representation, images, photography

INTRODUCTION

In late 2015, a single photograph made headlines around the world. The photo was of Alan Kurdi, a Syrian three-year-old whose body had washed up on a Turkish beach after drowning:



(Al Jazeera 09/02/2016: <http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/interactive/2016/08/alan-kurdi-changed-death-160831173922096.html>)

This tragic image quickly became widely circulated in media around the world, and was inserted into media coverage regarding the larger migrant crisis that hit Europe in 2016. The prevalence of this image led me, and many others, to automatically associate the image with broader discourses surrounding migration, evidenced by many media sources that continue to refer to the image when talking about migration today. One major issue that this image became inseparable from was the Brexit vote in the United Kingdom (UK), which was a vote that would determine if the UK would activate

Article 50 to leave the European Union. The results of the vote, which occurred on June 23rd 2016, were 51.9% for leaving the EU, and 48.1% for remaining. For the UK, this vote marked a politically tumultuous time. And, at the forefront of this unique time was the migrant crisis, which dominated media coverage in the UK and the rest of Europe.

Mass media reflects political issues, and thus inevitably affects its audience's perception and opinions on certain events. Through this relationship between audience, media, and political issues, political discourse takes its shape. Political discourse here can be understood as the ongoing dialogue of understanding and meaning that occurs within the political realm. With this, media coverage directly influenced the creation and continuation of discourse surrounding migration, as evidenced by the Leave and Remain campaigns of Brexit in the UK. Beyond merely being embedded in discourse, migrants are also perennially represented as an other, by virtue of belonging to a nationality from outside of Europe, and as such are a topic that must be analyzed in an attempt to identify underlying discourses in UK media. Furthermore, the ways in which this migration is addressed in media varies based on political ideologies, and their supporting discourses. It is these discrepancies of discourse on migration, specifically in the UK media, that I aim to explore. To do this I conducted a visual-textual analysis on representations of migration occurring within the UK media. This offers an insightful understanding of the visual representations, and discourses, surrounding migration through qualitative methods. Through this process, I was able to answer the question of how photographs become embedded within political discourses in media from the UK.

THE UNITED KINGDOM

The UK was chosen as it offers an interesting lens in which to view portrayals of migration; this is due to the Brexit vote, as well as a unique media climate, where “most British newspapers make no attempt to be unbiased” (Baker & Gabrielatos 2008: 8). This tendency of the UK’s media industry leads to the establishment of discernible discourses within their media. And it is within the formation and development of these discernable discourses that media becomes entrenched. The Brexit vote was chosen as a timeline indicator due to the unique convergence of social realities that lead to it. These unique social realities inevitably include migration, or more specifically, the migrant crisis that affected all of Europe. This migrant crisis was heavily reported in the UK during the lead up to the Brexit vote, and thus it must be seen as one of the issues that voters saw as crucial when deciding to vote to ‘Leave’ the EU, or to ‘Remain’ in it. Through this, a dichotomy is identifiable, as voters were only given these two choices. These two choices, being a Leave vote or a Remain vote, should then be seen as a reflection of two dominant discourses, connected to issues such as migration. Then, the overt bias in media, along with the Brexit vote, presented the UK as a rich case for studying the embeddedness of images in media discourses surrounding migration.

VISUAL REPRESENTATIONS IN MEDIA

This paper is based upon an understanding that media is entrenched in political discourse. I aimed to understand the ways in which visual representations of migration become, and are embedded in, these discourses. To achieve this, I have analyzed articles from two daily newspapers in the UK, being the Telegraph and the Guardian, which are

both categorized as “broadsheet” (Blinder & William 2015: 9). A “broadsheet” designation in the UK indicates that they feature “high levels of news content and traditional reporting,” and that they “define the notion of a ‘quality’ press”, and is opposed to mid-market and tabloid newspaper distinctions, which comparatively signify a lesser quality of journalism and commitment to facts (Blinder & William 2015: 9). Political bias is entrenched in UK media, as demonstrated in Baker and Gabrielatos’ work on a corpus linguistic analysis of Asylum seekers in UK media from 1996-2005, where they find that newspapers “reveal their stance on issues in a range of explicit and subtle ways” (Baker & Gabrielatos 2008: 8). With this understanding, and looking at the newspapers included in this study, it is seen that the Telegraph is politically right-leaning (indicated by conservative government support), and the Guardian is politically left-leaning (indicated by labour government support). These biases are seen as strengthened by support for the Leave or Remain campaign by the newspapers. There, the Telegraph backed a vote to Leave as “we are not harking back to a Britannic golden age lost in the mists of time but looking forward to a new beginning for our country;” whereas the Guardian backed a Remain vote, as they urged voters to “vote for a united country that reaches out to the world, and vote against a divided nation that turns inward” (Bennet 2016).

As well, the study focused on two events; chosen due to the time they occurred (in the year leading up to the Brexit vote), as well as with the goal of analyzing an event that invokes empathy, and one that indicates a more inherently negative construction of migration and the migrant other. The first event, being more negative, is the death of

Alexandra Mezher, a Swedish refugee worker who was killed on January 25th 2016, after being stabbed by a male refugee while working in an immigration centre in Sweden. The second, being more empathetic to the portrayal of migration, is Pope Francis taking 12 Syrian refugee children to the Vatican City with him on April 16th, 2016, after their homes and family members had been lost in the Syrian Civil War.

PROBLEM AND SIGNIFICANCE

The major problem that this paper addresses is the fact that while bias in political discourse of media may be apparent, the role that images play in these biases and discourses has yet to be thoroughly analyzed. This absence of academic focus into the role images play in discourse can be seen exemplified within Baker and Gabrielatos' work, as they do not make reference to how images produce and strengthen political bias within UK newspapers. Instead of a focus on images, they choose to study only linguistics, a persistent theme in the supporting literature for this topic. Then, when the same event is being portrayed in two different media sources, how do images become indicative of, and embedded in, this discourse? Here, despite using what may initially seem to be similar images, differing visual representations of migration appear in the politically opposing media sources of the Telegraph and Guardian. This difference appears through subtle code fixed in the images; and thus, I used the images themselves to identify and establish these biases. The images that were examined can also be indicative of "social power," which appears through the ways that discourse is "manifested through the prerogative of the press" (Baker & Gabrielatos 2008: 8). The power that the consumers of media yield helps to dictate what narratives are popularized

in each publication, through forces of subscriptions and purchasing power. This leads to a circular loop where newspapers invest in certain discourses, which attract a certain group of consumers, who then exert power through purchasing and consuming the media, ultimately strengthening the political persuasion of the discourse. This power dynamic indicates that the “relation between the press and its readers is bidirectional and dynamic,” resulting in the ongoing development of discourse (Baker & Gabrielatos 2008: 9). As a form of social power, this bidirectional relationship is especially relevant to this issue of migration because often migrants are in a liminal stateless position where their rights and lives are not tied to one governing body. Their situation becomes a social reality that is international in scope, but localized differently depending on the specific contexts. One such local context is media. Then, exploration into localized visual representation of a global, or at least European wide, phenomenon yields qualitative understanding of discrepancies in political discourses between the two newspapers being analyzed. The discourses were then identified and understood through the identification of visual codes, which are defined as “the rhetoric of the photographs,” representing the data I used to answer my research question (Aker 2012: 327). This rhetoric should be understood as the emotional reactions drawn from images, emotions that are produced through ‘codes’, or the actual visual material included within the image. Then, these codes become the information that indicate to a reader the discourse inserted into the article through the use of the images. By identifying these codes, I explored the role of images as an aspect of the political discourse found within UK media.

METHODS

As stated, the study is focused on two events, chosen due to the time they occurred (in the year leading up to the Brexit vote), as well as with the goal of analyzing an event that invokes empathy, and one that provides a more inherently negative construction of the migrant other. Here, the more negative first event of the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher is compared with the more sympathetic second event, being Pope Francis taking 12 Syrian refugee children to the Vatican City with him. In these two events, I compared articles occurring on the same, or similar, dates, which varies between 1 and 6 published articles per event, per media source. In this, an article from the Guardian published the day after an event was compared with an article from the Telegraph published the day or on a similar day. If there were no pairs available, as there are not an even amount of articles from each source, the images and articles were analyzed with an acknowledgement of the comparative absence of comparable images. Then, the images, based on the dates that they appeared, became the collections with which I conducted my systematic analysis. The specific images in these published news stories were occasionally the same between the two media sources, but were contextualized in different ways through cropping, captioning, and positioning the photograph in the article. When this occurred, discrepancies in code were easily identifiable; however, when there was not the same image, a deeper level of analysis was required. I bring this up to point out that regardless of whether the images were the same across media outlets or not, the images used in the articles were still valuable in a comparative sense.

When looking at the images and visual representations, content analysis was employed. The hypothesis that different visual representations of migration were developed in the politically opposing media sources was examined through an analysis of how the same, or similar, photographs were selected, utilized, and contextually framed in the published media news stories. In this analysis, both linguistic and cultural theories were applied. Linguistically, I looked at how captions and text embedded in the articles can inform and contextualize images. This can be considered another aspect of code, where language assists in providing emotional context for the photograph in terms of its placement within the article (Aker 2012: 327). The rhetoric then becomes emotionally induced clues that inform the reader to the images meaning. This linguistic analysis, which was only utilized when it directly helped to inform and contextualize the image, was qualitatively undertaken, as the relationship between the linguistic codes and the visual representations was only existent in a tangential sense. In this understanding of linguistic implications of political discourse, the value of analytical study was attained. The qualitative use of linguistic codes then is revealed as important because of its supporting role towards the goal of understanding how visual representations of migration, in the UK, were utilized through political discourse towards the creation of a migrant other.

The visual and cultural theories that I engaged with when looking at the images themselves added another dimension beyond what a linguistic analysis alone could provide. This value arises because, in the content analysis fashion that I have outlined, investigation of the images was done in a comparative fashion. In this, I treated the

images, which occurred in articles from similar times, as a collection in which I was able to employ a systematic analysis. This systematic analysis started with the hypothesis that media sources from the right and left will provide different portrayals of similar or the same images in accordance to dominant political discourses. Next, I identified strictly visual codes embedded into the image, which were identified through the comparative analysis. This methodology then provided a unique and insightful lens in which I could view the effect and power of images in political discourses surrounding the creation of a migrant other. In doing so, this analysis allowed me to be able to articulate the ways in which political discourses provided differing visual portrayals of the same events.

LIMITATIONS

Limitations of my methodology include the fact that in limiting the number of newspapers and events being analyzed, I also limited the scope of representation that my findings will provide. As well, perhaps as a symptom of this, I could not concretely link these portrayals directly to the results of the Brexit vote, being the UK voting to leave the EU; and instead, I am only interested in the unique political climate that the lead up to this vote created for UK media.

CONTEXT

The argument of this paper is chiefly supported by images, and as such I will contextualize the use of images in anthropological study. To this end, looking to analysis

of early adopters of photography and visual materiality in anthropological inquiry can be useful in situating and contextualizing my visual analysis. These authors focus primarily on how images can be used and manipulated after their production. Here, work by Aaron Glass in analyzing Edward Curtis' use of photography and video in capturing Kwakwaka'wakw first nations on BC's coast can be seen as insightful into the processes by which photography can be used to enforce discourses of otherness. Photos Curtis took in the early 1900s are still widely shown in museums today. However, they are seen by many in the academic community to purvey and enforce a "stereotypically savage past," which is "tamed and domesticated for indigenous consumption in the present" (Glass 2009:143). Then, it can be seen that photographs, even those from over 100 years ago, are utilized and embedded in prevalent contemporary discourses, of which it is virtually impossible to separate the images from discursive narrative of the 'savage'. Another example of photographs being embedded in prevalent discourses arises from Boas, where in analyzing his work Ira Jacknis finds that photographs "become detached from the initial encounter that generated them and, given the vicissitudes of their physical survival, they can be reinterpreted" (Jacknis 1984: 31). This reinterpretation is not only influenced by the photographer, as "it is usually the ethnographer who guides this transformation, [however] many others have a hand in it," and it is in this acknowledgement of others utilizing, and altering, the meaning and context of images where the media's role in inserting images into discourses becomes apparent (Jacknis 1984: 31). Then, through both of these examples it can be seen that, depending on the source of the narrative, be it researchers as in these examples or UK media outlets in my research, images are indicative of, and will become embedded in, their respective discourses.

Beyond these examples, I find it important to concretely link the use of images and photographs to anthropological study. Photography developed from a tool used to produce and support early anthropological themes of race and “evolutionary theory,” into a “pervasive,” form of data (Edwards 1990: 235-236). Elizabeth Edwards, in her article titled “The Image As Anthropological Document,” analyses the history of photography, and photographs, in terms of their use and appropriation towards anthropological study. She focuses on the 1860s and 1870s, where “evolutionary theory,” which “had influenced every sphere of thought,” was based upon an understanding that “races were seen as forming a natural but static chain of excellence in human kind” (Edwards 1990: 236). This assumed “fixity of races had particular importance in the establishment of the notion of ‘types’, which were the essence of classificatory method;” and this formation of categorical ‘types’ extended to photography, where the construction of types lends directly to the othering of individuals through the technology of the camera (Edwards 1990: 236). This allowance for photography to create an other by virtue of anthropological theory is echoed by Carlyn Marr in her article titled “Marking Oneself: Use of Photographs by Native Americans of the Southern Northwest Coast, ”as she sees that “although the technology [of the camera] itself is neutral, the manner in which it is used is imbued with issues of power” (Marr 1996: 52). This entrenchment of power within images is the true basis for any anthropological inquiry into photography. In terms of this paper, the embeddedness of power is directly linked to the unique political climate of the pre-Brexit UK; wherein dominant political discourses of both the Remain and Leave campaigns of Brexit became associated with the images of migration, which was a

prominent and politically divisive issue during this period. Then, as I have expressed, it is seen that images become a tool that can both be indicative of, and embedded in, social power and political discourse.

ANALYSIS

To exemplify my claim of the embeddedness of images in political discourse surrounding migration, I looked to all images included in articles pertaining the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher, and Pope Francis returning to the Vatican with the 12 Syrian refugees, which appear in the Guardian and Telegraph newspapers. My findings provoke understandings of just how prominent the use of photographs can become within political discourse.

UNEQUAL REPRESENTATION

While analysis of images in the news articles represents the bulk of the analyses in this paper, one large, overarching theme should not be ignored. That is, in covering the event more sympathetic and positive in relation to migration (the Pope taking in refugee children) the left-leaning Guardian produced six articles compared to only one article for the Telegraph. However, for the less sympathetic event (the death of Alexandra Mezher) the Telegraph produced four articles to the Guardian's one.

	The Telegraph	The Guardian
Stabbing of Alexandra Mezher	4	1
Pope Francis Taking in 12 Syrian Refugees	1	6

A Visualization of the Unequal Representation

What this inequality in coverage shows is that, beyond the images and the content of the articles themselves, the two newspapers are more prone to covering the event that supports their political bias. In this case, the left-leaning Guardian publication is more willing to produce articles that convey a sympathetic view of migration, while at the same time the right-leaning Telegraph shows their willingness to produce articles that support a non-sympathetic view of migration.

Understanding the implications that such blatant unbalanced representation extends towards how images are circulated and portrayed is vital in an analysis of these images. Here, the amount of images portraying each event is clearly going to be limited by the media source's political bias; meaning that the Guardian has a limited amount of images to be analyzed in terms of the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher, whereas the Telegraph inversely has a limited amount of images to be analyzed for the Pope Francis

event. Because of these limitations, the analysis of the images themselves must be understood in terms of the identifiable and patterned absences of visual portrayals from the respective events. When analyzing the much larger amount of images from the Telegraph in relation to the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher, one must remain cognizant of the comparative lack of visual representation on the part of the Guardian, and the same can be said for the Telegraphs lack of visual representation for the Pope event. Then, with this understanding of the importance of the unequal representations of the news events in terms of article numbers, and by extension the amount of images, I will move on to the analysis of the images themselves.

STABBING OF ALEXANDRA MEZHER

January 26th, 2016: Guardian (appendix image 1)

Telegraph (appendix images 2-7)

Image 1 in the appendix is the only image included for the entirety of the Guardian's coverage of the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher. The coverage also occurred the day after the event itself took place. This is the only image that readers of the Guardian would ever relate to this tragic stabbing. In contradiction to the minimal visual coverage on the part of the Guardian, the Telegraph produced two articles totaling 6 images (appendix images 2-7) on this day alone. The most stark contradiction between the Guardian's and the Telegraph's visual coverage of this event is in the cropping of the very same photo taken from Mezher's social media page. This image (appendix image 1 for the Guardian and appendix image 2 for the Telegraph) shows Alexandra Mezher posing for a 'selfie' with her friend. Mezher, who is on the right hand side of the image, and her friend are both wearing official looking hats, that may or may not have been an

aspect of her uniform as a refugee centre worker. These hats, at least in the image appearing in the Telegraph, include an official looking insignia on the front of the hat above the brim. This official looking insignia, however, is cropped from the Guardians representation of the image. This cropping is most likely deliberate, as in online articles there is no justification for the cropping of an image beyond an attempt at altering the codes that the image portrays to the reader. Here, the official looking insignia draws reference to authority and the nation-state; and thus the attack on Mezher, who is pictured in this hat, implicates an attack on the authority of the nation-state and the body politic. Then, due to the inclusion of this insignia, an attack on Mezher is presented as an attack on those very values. However, in the Guardian's portrayal of this image, that implication is entirely avoided through the purposeful cropping of the image. Why, then, would the Guardian omit such an indicative code? In terms of political discourse, the left-leaning Guardian limits the association of a migration related attack with an attack on the state, as their wider stance on immigration is one that is pro-migrant. Conversely, the Telegraph's more right wing, anti-migrant stance, is strengthened and displayed through inclusion of the codified insignia.

Other images that appear in news articles from this day that are of special interest include appendix image 7, which portrays Martha Lane Fox, who is an English philanthropist that had made pro-Remain in the EU comments to the media. The Telegraph used this image of the philanthropist, placed within an article on the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher, to pose a direct link to a risk of safety for UK women if the UK were to vote to Remain in the EU during Brexit. There is no reason to involve an image

of a philanthropist completely unrelated to the stabbing, besides to make the stabbing a political tool with which the Telegraph used to further their Leave the EU campaign during Brexit. To illustrate this forced connection, I look to a linguistic analysis of the article that accompanied this image. The emphasis on this connection is even evident in the title of the article, which states that “The only way to protect women is to regain control of our borders: The murder of a 22-year-old refugee centre worker demonstrates the danger women are in worldwide” (Pearson 2016). The link to Martha Lane Fox comes in response to Fox’s assertion that “leaving the EU would be a disaster for the next generation of Britain’s entrepreneurs,” where the author, Allison Pearson, asks “I don’t know about entrepreneurs, but how about a disaster for the next generation of British women, Martha? Does that bother you at all? Have the signatories to that letter been watching the news, I wonder. The stories from Europe get darker by the day” (Pearson 2016). This hyperbole on the part of the author reflects the identification of the Telegraph in utilizing this tragic event towards a political end, through a political discourse centred on a threat public safety due to attacks such as the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher.

February 12th, 2016: Telegraph (appendix images 8 and 9)

On the 12th of February, the Telegraph ran another article on the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher. In this article, another allusion to authority and statehood, and thus the threat to it posed by this attack, is included in an image of the Swedish flag (appendix image 9). The inclusion of an image of the Swedish flag on the part of the Telegraph provides a direct link to the nation. Thus, the stabbing is posed as a threat not just to people, but also to national security. Furthermore, the inclusion of the flag encourages

attentions towards issues such as borders, and national security; both of which were issues seen in debates surrounding Brexit. Here then, while the inclusion of an image of the Swedish flag may seem innocuous, the flag as a code leads the readers to ponder broader issues beyond that of the stabbing. These issues are also certainly activated within political discourse surrounding Brexit, where border control of migration and migrants was a key issue. Then, the Telegraph deploys representations of the stabbing, which imply threats to nationhood, as a tool to further develop a political discourse that indicates the risk migration poses to the UK people, and the UK as a political entity. Through this, the Telegraph's support of a vote to Leave the EU through Brexit becomes strengthened and emboldened with their visual representations of this tragic stabbing.

July 23rd, 2016: Telegraph (appendix images 10-12)

In the Telegraph's July 23rd article the author, Tim Stanley, again connects the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher to a threat to the UK through the use of images. This time, the stabbing is connected with the Calais "Jungle" migrant camp. The migrant camp was situated just outside the city of Calais, on the western coast of France. What is unique about the use of images in this article is that in the actual text of the article, the Calais migrant camp is not mentioned once. However, every single one of the three images included in this article directly include the camp. Why include images of an issue that is not being discussed in the article? One could argue that because both the Calais camp and the stabbing include migrants, that they could be linked. However, that does not justify why the Telegraph would include only images of one issue, and not discuss it at all in the article.

One could provide an answer to this strange issue through viewing the article not as an item of news, but rather as a part of a larger discourse portraying migration, and migrants, as a threat to the UK. The images then fulfill a role of showing otherness and unfamiliarity. One image in particular, which shows two refugee men covering their heads in green towels (appendix image 11), specifically embodies this sense of otherness. The two men covering their heads, making it so the reader cannot identify them in any way, let alone see what they look like, could be seen as a code indicating the unknown that migration generally represents. By covering their faces, and being surrounded by other official looking men, possibly representatives of the state, the two migrants evade any sense of sympathy in the readers' minds. This avoidance of the portrayal of empathy, and subsequent othering of the migrant, then strengthens the article itself, which discusses directly the threats that migrants, who cannot be identified within the image, pose to UK society.

The article discusses that “not all child asylum seekers are children,” something which is connected to the stabbing as it was found that the stabber, who was at first presented as a child, was in fact over the age of 18 (Stanley 2016). The article is directed towards issues in Sweden, however it is clearly represented as a warning for the UK, especially in the lead up to the Brexit vote. The sense of threat present in the article, exemplified by the author stating that “some [migrants] may be criminal, [so] it makes far more sense to focus on ensuring stability and development in their home countries than encouraging mass relocation here [to the UK]” (Stanley 2016). This anti-immigration

message is then bolstered by images of an unruly and threatening Calais migrant camp, as well as unidentifiable migrant men hiding their faces in towels. These images, though not related to the issues written about in the article, could be seen as producing a similar reaction to the fear mongering that is present in the written article. Thus, by showing a migrant camp, and easily othered migrants, the Telegraph produces images that, although are not directly related to the article they appear in, are nonetheless embedded in the wider discourse within which the article is produced.

POPE FRANCIS HELPING 12 SYRIAN REFUGEES

April 16th, 2016: Guardian (appendix images 13-21)

Telegraph (appendix images 30 and 31)

In the case of the Pope Francis event, the Telegraph produced only one article. In this article, only older individuals dressed in religious clothing are shown. The clothing is important as it serves to other, and alienate the reader from those represented. In this case, one image of a woman holding a “welcome to Lesbos” sign, shown with a cloth head covering (appendix image 31), stands out as linking a sense of otherness to the migrants. As well, the other image included in the one Telegraph article is that of two Greek Orthodox bishops greeting the Pope (appendix image 30). In this image, one can see how the religious dress, combined with the formal rigidity of the subjects of the image, leads to any feelings of sympathy towards the migrants being limited. Then, the Pope’s visit to the Greek island of Lesbos, where many would be refugees and migrants are held, is visually portrayed by the Telegraph in a way that actively reduces sympathy for the migrants’ struggle, and instead focuses on a cultural distancing and othering of the migrants, where only adults in religious dress are shown.

Conversely, in the Guardian's two articles pertaining to this event on April 16th, the sense of othering is limited, and a more sympathetic and relatable visual portrayal of the visit is put forward. One such way the Guardian achieves this is through the inclusion of children in the images. Five out of the nine images in these two articles include children (appendix images 13, 14, 17, 18, and 20), with the other images being a map (appendix image 15 and 19), the prime minister of Greece (appendix image 16), and the Pope standing with the prime minister and the Patriarch of Constantinople (appendix image 21). This focus on children induces a sense of sympathy and humanity towards the migrants struggle. The sense of sympathy can be seen as indicative of a political discourse present in the Guardian that is pro-immigration, and by extension, pro-Remain in the EU during the Brexit vote. Then, the choice to include children in these images, and the inverse exclusion on the part of the Telegraph, reveals the political discourses embedded into the image choices undertaken by the respective newspapers.

Another aspect that was present in the visual representation of this story in the Guardian, but not in the Telegraph, was the inclusion of a map (appendix images 15 and 19). The map allows the reader to spatially place the story. As well, the map shown includes the islands location in the Aegean Sea, in addition to the location of the island in relation to Europe as a whole in the bottom corner. This limits the distancing, or otherness, conveyed to the reader, as the map brings a sense of familiarity and recognition to the events unfolding. Then, the map serves to frame the event in a way that becomes familiar and non-foreign, especially due to the inclusion of the whole of Europe

in the bottom right corner. This inclusion also lends to the Brexit vote, as the Guardian was decidedly pro-Remain in the EU, and as such the inclusion of spatially placing this migrant camp within a map of Europe becomes highly a highly politicized decision. Then, it appears that the decision on the part of the Guardian to visually highlight the geographical location of this event, combined with a majority of the images in these articles containing sympathy-inducing children, points to a wider pro-EU and pro-migration discourse, one that reveals itself through the very images that are embedded within it.

April 17th, 2016: Guardian (appendix image 22)

This article and image, while not particularly unique, offers some insight to the dominant discourses of positivity surrounding this event in the Guardian newspaper. The image itself (appendix image 22), is of the Pope smiling as he is talking to a child and her mother. Again, the use of children, combined with the smiling Pope, indicates that the Guardian is humanizing the struggle of the migrants, and as such produces a sense of sympathy surrounding this event. To see this sense of positivity and humanity, one just needs to look to the title of this article, which is: “Pope Francis hailed as savior by Syrian refugees taken in by Vatican” (Guardian 2016). This title, taken from the expressed gratitude on the part of the 12 Syrian refugees who were taken to the Vatican City by the Pope, explicitly portrays this event in a positive, cheerful light. And, as such, a sense of well-being is extended to migrants and migration. Then, the Guardian’s visual portrayal of the event in this article can be seen as embedded in a wider discourse of a more

sympathetic portrayal of migration, especially when compared to the lack of coverage on the part of the Telegraph.

April 18th, 2016: Guardian (appendix images 23-25)

On April 18th the Guardian produced two articles pertaining to this event. Both articles revolve around the arrival of the refugee migrants to Rome. What is especially unique about this portrayal is the complete lack of coverage their arrival garnered in the Telegraph, which is indicative of biases in the coverage of the events; an inherent reflection on the diverging discourses found within the two different newspapers. The images included in the two Guardian articles depict the refugee families disembarking the plane that took them to Rome (appendix image 23), as well as portraying the families walking the streets of Rome (appendix images 24 and 25). All three of these images include family units, where children are pictured with their parents. This focus on the family portrays the migrants in a recognizable and identifiable way to the UK readers. As well, the families look to be well adjusted, which again supports the Guardian's discourse of humanizing the migrants and portraying a sense of sympathy towards them. To this end, one could look to an image of a Syrian family holding hands while walking down a street in Rome (appendix image 25). In this image, the parents are both smiling as the wife looks towards the husband. The symbolism of them holding hands surely suggests a sense of togetherness and care for each other, which provokes a sympathetic interpretation of the image in the reader's minds.

Beyond this portrayal of familial bond, another key code embedded in these images is the fact that the families are wearing predominantly western style clothing in all images. This serves to limit any cultural distancing the readers may feel between themselves and the migrants. The clothing, while operating as a code, depicts the families as well-adjusted, and not alien, as they walk through the streets of Rome, a city that symbolizes European civilization. Then, the Guardian's images of the refugee migrants' arrival to Rome could be understood as a visual suggestion for the de-othering of the migrants. In this, migrants are seen as naturalized and comfortable in the streets of Rome, thus allowing the reader to sympathize and identify with the migrants. This sense of connection is nurtured by the Guardian throughout the visual portrayals of migration embedded into this story. As such, it should be seen as quite deliberate that the Guardian choose images that would limit any distancing between the reader and the migrants, as the images used are embedded in the wider discourse of a more sympathetic portrayal of migration that is consistent within the Guardian.

May 25th, 2016: Guardian (appendix images 26-29)

This article, written by the Guardian a little over a month after the Pope brought the refugee migrants back with him to Rome, is meant to inform readers of how the families are adjusting to life in the city. This article also clearly showcases how committed the Guardian is to circulating this story, whereas comparatively, the Telegraph is not. The commitment to this story shows bias, as the Guardian wants to portray these migrant families as well-adjusted and thankful to be in Rome. This portrayal, however, does not fit the less sympathetic view of migration that the Telegraph conveys, and as

such they declined to write any more than what was necessary surrounding this event. As could be expected, the images included in this article overwhelmingly portray the migrants in an affirmative, family-oriented light, wherein they again are chiefly wearing more western style clothing. The image that most exemplifies this positive sentiment is one of a family of three, Nour Essa, Hasan Zaheda, and their two year old son Riad (appendix image 28). This image shows the family all embracing each other, where the mother and father are happily smiling, while their son is preoccupied with his mother's hair. In the background of this image, a Roman-European style courtyard with orange buildings surrounds them. This seemingly picturesque traditional family portrait photograph encapsulates much of what can be seen embedded in the Guardian's portrayal of this event. First, the family's embrace represents a sense of kinship and bonding, with which many readers are able to empathize, serving to limit any perceived social distance between the readers themselves and the migrants. Second, the placement of the shot showing the family outside, in a square in Rome, positions the migrant family as having adapted and acclimatized into a cosmopolitan European environment. And finally, the clothing of the family is not immediately othering, and does not clearly reference the family as a migrant family without the surrounding article and image caption. This allows the image to portray the family as people who, at least in a visual sense, belong in a European context. Then, the Guardian could be seen as clearly establishing these migrant families as thankful, and comfortable, in an urban European context, thus furthering a discourse that lends to an overall more sympathetic view on migration than that of the Telegraph.

DIVERGING VISUAL DISCOURSES

Through this visual analysis, it appears that there are very clearly differences in portrayals of migrants and migrations within the images shown in the Telegraph and the Guardian. Beyond the distinctly unequal representation of these events, wherein the Telegraph represented the more negative story relating to migrants much more often than the Guardian, while the Guardian portrayed the event more sympathetic towards migration much more frequently, the ways the respective discourses develop through the images also diverges greatly between these two media sources. To frame this, I look to Foucault, as Michael Heller interprets, when he sees that what is “central to Foucault’s thought is the concept of discourse: the creation and organization of statements, which create domains of human knowledge and practice” (Heller 2016: 652). This statement lends to the fact that Foucault sees that discourses create what citizens take to be true about themselves, and the social spaces they reside in. Then, in looking at the event of the stabbing of Alexandra Mezher, it is clear that discourses, developed through the images that are included in the news articles pertaining to the story, in the Telegraph clearly reference a threat to authority and the state. This is first seen in the inclusion of the official insignia on Alexandra Mezher’s hat, then in the British philanthropist who has direct ties to Brexit, and finally in the flag of Sweden. The development of this discourse is one that frames migrants as a threat to authority, and to national values and security. However, in the Guardian, the visual discourse surrounding this event unfolds much differently. Or, as I should say, it is avoided entirely, as shown by the cropping of the official insignia on Alexandra Mezher’s hat. Then, in this event, a differing in visual discourse becomes obvious.

For the event of the Pope visiting Lesbos and taking 12 Syrian refugees back with him to the Vatican, the visual discourses in the two newspapers diverge in a similarly sizable fashion. In the Guardian, a visual discourse centred on portraying the migrants as recognizable, and thus not as the other, becomes apparent. This discourse first appears through a majority of images including children, which naturally injects a sense of humanity and duty into the images. Then, images appear showcasing the families walking around the streets of Rome in predominantly western-style clothing, which induces sympathy through a sense of familial bonding; and as well it limits a sense of otherness by portraying the families as having easily adapted, looking comfortable and natural, in the streets of a major European city. However, in the Telegraph, only images of easily othered older adults dressed in religious clothing are visually portrayed, further distancing the migrants to their readers. Then, again, it becomes very apparent that both media sources engage in very different politically influenced discourses pertaining to migration, as identified through the visual portrayal of these two news events that occurred in the lead up to the Brexit vote.

CONCLUSION

In my analysis, it becomes clear that images can become entrenched within prevailing discourses surrounding politicized issues. During the unique time period of the lead up to the Brexit vote, one of the major politicized issue was migration. It stands to reason that a more right-leaning publication, which also supported a vote to Leave the EU

in the Telegraph, would produce a noticeably different portrayal of the topic than the left-leaning, pro EU Guardian, in relation to migration. What I find particularly interesting, however, is the extent to which images can be indicative of, and simultaneously embedded in, these politicized discourses. The embeddedness can be seen through the ‘codes,’ identified through my analysis. Some examples include the official insignia on Alexandra Mezher’s hat (appendix images 1 and 2), where the Telegraph linked the attack with an attack on, and threat to, authority through keeping the insignia in the image; whereas the Guardian, who in their discourse of a sympathetic portrayal of migrants and migration attempt to limit this connection, achieving this through the cropping out of this code. Another example would be the use of children and family in representing the Pope taking Syrian refugees back to the Vatican with him in the Guardian, which naturally induces a sense of sympathy and humanity. However, the Telegraph instead focused on older individuals in religious clothing, a portrayal of the event that supports their discourses; discourses that other the migrants, while also representing them as a foreign threat. Then, it appears that the manipulation and portrayal of certain visual material can be used as a tool with which media sources apply to both develop, and enrich, their respective political discourses.

Overall then, specifically relating to my study, I find that the Guardian provokes a sense of sympathy and humanity when portraying migration and migrant related events. Conversely, I find that the Telegraph produces a more threatening and othering representation of migration, where migrants pose a threat to the values and statehood of the UK. In this clear and distinct divergence, one can see the true value and importance of

the role that images play in the political discourse; specifically in that images can be seen as an indication of, and result of, the discourse, as well as a tool with which the discourse can be created and developed. And, in identifying codes, such as clothing, the insignia on the hat, or the background setting of the image, the ways in which the image as a tool is activated becomes apparent. Ultimately, through my visual analysis, it can be concretely determined that, in the lead up to the Brexit vote, the politically left-leaning Guardian utilized images that both supported, and become entrenched, in more sympathetic and pro-migrant discourses, while the politically right-leaning Guardian utilized images that represented a inherently negative, anti-migrant discourse. Looking forward, it seems that the divergence in discourses surrounding migration will only grow wider, as Article 50, the article in the EU constitution that allows for any member to break from the union, on which the Brexit vote was determined, was only officially invoked on March 29th, 2017. Then, it seems to be more appropriate now than ever to be conscientious of the ways in which divergent political discourses can become activated and established through visual representation.

APPENDIX

NEWSPAPER	ARTICLE TITLE	DATE	IMAGE NUMBER	IMAGES	CAPTION (if available)
The Guardian	Crowding concerns after refugee centre worker fatally stabbed in Sweden	January 26th, 2016	1		
The Telegraph	Family of refugee centre worker stabbed in Sweden blames politicians as teenager charged with murder	January 26th, 2016	2		
			3		
			4		
			5		A police officer is seen outside a home for juvenile asylum seekers in Molndal in south western Sweden (Photo: AFP)
The Telegraph	The only way to protect women is to regain control of our borders	January 26th, 2016	6	 	Alexandra had worked at the refugee helter for just a few months when she was stabbed to death (Photo: Facebook/EPA)
			7		Martha Lane Fox expressed her desire this week to stay in the EU
The Telegraph	Child migrant who killed asylum centre worker is an adult, Swedish migration rules	February 22th, 2016	8	 	Alexandra had worked at the refugee helter for just a few months when she was stabbed to death (Photo: Facebook/EPA)

NEWSPAPER	ARTICLE TITLE	DATE	IMAGE NUMBER	IMAGES	CAPTION (if available)
			9		
The Telegraph	Sweden was overwhelmed by influx of child migrants. We should heed their lesson	July 23rd, 2016	10		The Jungle, Calais. CREDIT: PAUL GROVER
			11		Refugees from 'The Jungle' Calais camp arriving at Lunar House. CREDIT: NICK EDWARDS
			12		Citizens UK welcome refugees from 'The Jungle' Calais camp as they arrive at Lunar House. CREDIT: NICK EDWARDS
The Guardian	Pope Francis takes refugees to Rome after Lesbos visit	April 6th, 2016	13		A group of Syrian refugees arrive to board a plane to travel to Italy with Pope Francis. Photograph: Filippo Monteforte/AFP/Getty Images
			14		A woman kisses the hand of Pope Francis as he greets people at the Moria refugee camp. Photograph: Filippo Monteforte/AFP/Getty Images
			15		
			16		Pope Francis is greeted by the Greek prime minister, Alexis Tsipras (centre) and Archbishop Ieronymos. Photograph: Louisa Gouliamaki/AFP/Getty Images

NEWSPAPER	ARTICLE TITLE	DATE	IMAGE NUMBER	IMAGES	CAPTION (if available)
			17		Pope Francis meets refugees on Lesbos. Photograph: Petros Giannakouris/AP
The Guardian	'Before they are numbers, these people are human beings': Pope's poignant visit to refugees in Lesbos	April 6th, 2016	18		Pope Francis shakes hands with a boy in the Moria refugee camp in Lesbos.
			19		
			20		A group of Syrian refugees prepare to board a plane back to Italy with Pope Francis. Photograph: Filippo Monteforte/AP
			21		Ecumenical Patriarch Bartholomew, Pope Francis, and Greek prime minister Alexis Tsipras. Photograph: Louisa Gouliamaki/AFP/Getty Images
The Guardian	Pope Francis hailed as saviour by Syrian refugees taken in by Vatican	April 7th, 2016	22		Pope Francis visits the Moria refugee camp on the Greek island of Lesbos on Saturday. Photograph: Paul Haring/CPP/Rex/Shutterstock
The Guardian	Let him who is without sin cast the first stone at Pope Francis's refugee gesture	April 8th, 2016	23		Pope Francis welcomes Syrian refugees as they arrive at Ciampino airport in Rome. Photograph: Reuters
The Guardian	'Here it is a big dream': Syrians taken in by Vatican begin new life in Rome	April 8th, 2016	24		The Syrians are being housed in the charity complex Sant'Egidio in Trastevere while their longer-term accommodation in the Vatican. Photograph: Filippo Monteforte/AFP/Getty Images

NEWSPAPER	ARTICLE TITLE	DATE	IMAGE NUMBER	IMAGES	CAPTION (if available)
			25		A Syrian family walks with a member of the Sant'Egidio Roman Catholic charity in the Rome district of Trastevere. Photograph: Filippo Monteforte/AFP/Getty Images
The Guardian	What happened to the 12 Syrian refugees rescued by the pope?	May 25th, 2016	26		Rami Alshakarji and Suhila Ayiad with their daughter Quds inside the Sant'Egidio community in Rome. Photograph: Christian Sinibaldi for the Guardian
			27		Pope Francis meeting refugees at the Moria refugee camp in Lesbos in April. Photograph: Filippo Monteforte/AFP/Getty Images
			28		Nour Essa, Hasan Zaheda and their two-year-old son Riad. Photograph: Christian Sinibaldi for the Guardian
			29		Pope Francis welcomes the refugees after landing at Ciampino airport in Rome. Photograph: Reuters
The Telegraph	Pope Francis transforms lives of 12 Syrian refugees plucked from Lesbos but thousands left behind in Greece	April 6th, 2016	30		Pope Francis is greeted by Greek Orthodox bishops as he arrives in Lesbos to highlight the plight of refugees. CREDIT: EPA
			31		A refugee waits to greet Pope Francis in the Greek island of Lesbos. CREDIT: AFP

REFERENCES

Åker, Patrik. "Photography, Objectivity and the Modern Newspaper." 2012. *Journalism Studies* 13(3): 325-339.

Baker, Paul, and Gabrielatos, Costas. "Fleeing, Sneaking, Flooding: A Corpus Analysis of Discursive Constructions of Refugees and Asylum Seekers in the UK Press, 1996-2005." 2008. *Journal of English Linguistics* 36(1): 5-38.

Bennet, Asa. "Here's where Britain's newspapers stand on the EU referendum." *The Telegraph*. 2016. Accessed March 2017. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/0/heres-where-britains-newspapers-stand-on-the-eu-referendum/>

Bell, Philip. "The Handbook of Visual Analysis. Ch. 2, Content Analysis of Visual Images." Edited by Theo Van Leeuwen & Carey Jewitt. Sage publishing. 2004.

Blair, David. "Pope Francis transforms lives of 12 Syrian refugees plucked from Lesbos – but thousands left behind in Greece." *The Telegraph*. April 16th, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2016/04/16/pope-visits-lesbos-to-highlight-ordeal-of-refugees/>

Blinder, Scott, and William L. Allen. "Constructing Immigrants: Portrayals of Migrant Groups in British National Newspapers, 2010-2012." 2015. *International Migration Review* 50(1).

Cocozza, Paula. "What happened to the 12 Syrian refugees rescued by the pope?" *The Guardian*. May 25th, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/may/25/what-happened-pope-francis-syrian-refugees-rescued-lesbos-vatican-rome>

“Crowding concerns after refugee centre worker fatally stabbed in Sweden.” The Guardian. January 26th, 2016. Accessed January 2017.
<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/jan/26/worker-stabbed-to-death-at-swedish-refugee-centre>

Edwards, Elizabeth. The Image as Anthropological Document. Photographic “Types”: The Pursuit of Method. Elizabeth Edwards. Visual Anthropology. 1990. 3: 235-258.

Glass, Aaron. “A Cannibal in the Archive.” Visual Anthropology Review. 2009. 25(2): 128-149.

Heller, Michael. “Foucault, Discourse, and the Birth of British Public Relations.” Enterprise & Society. 2016. 17(3): 651-677.

Jacknis, Ira. “Franz Boas and Photography.” Studies in Visual Communication. 1984. 10(1): 2-60.

Kirchgaessner, Stephanie, and Scammell, Rosie. “Here it is a big dream: Syrians taken in by Vatican begin new life in Rome.” The Guardian. April 18th, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/apr/18/here-it-is-a-big-dream-syrians-taken-in-by-vatican-begin-new-life-in-rome>

Marr, Carolyn. “Marking Oneself: Use of Photographs by Native Americans of the Southern Northwest Coast.” American Indian Culture and Research Journal. 1996. 20(3): 51-64.

Orange, Richard. “‘Child’ migrant who killed asylum centre worker is an adult, Swedish migration rules.” The Telegraph. February 12th, 2016. Accessed January 2017.
<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/sweden/12153428/Child-migrant-who-killed-asylum-centre-worker-is-an-adult-Swedish-migration-rules.html>

Orange, Richard. "Family of refugee centre worker stabbed in Sweden blames politicians as teenager charged with murder." The Telegraph. January 26th, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/sweden/12121070/Migrant-fatally-stabs-female-refugee-centre-worker-in-Sweden-say-police.html>

Ormerod, Peter. "Let him who is without sin cast the first stone at Pope Francis's refugee gesture." The Guardian. April 18th, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2016/apr/18/pope-francis-lesbos-refugee-catholic-church-criticise>

"Pope Francis hailed as savior by Syrian refugees taken in by Vatican." The Guardian. April 17th, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/apr/17/pope-francis-hailed-saviour-syrian-refugees-lesbos-vatican>

Pearson, Alison. "The only way to protect women is to regain control of our borders." January 26th, 2017. Accessed January 2017. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/sweden/12123606/Why-Cecil-Parkinson-was-a-prisoner-of-his-time.html>

Smith, Helen. "Before they are numbers, these people are human beings: pope's poignant visit to refugees in Lesbos." The Guardian. April 16th, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/apr/16/pope-refugees-vatican-lesbos-eu-humanity>

Smith, Helen. "Pope Francis takes refugees to Rome After Lesbos Visit." The Guardian. April 16th, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/apr/16/pope-francis-flies-to-lesbos-to-highlight-humanitarian-crisis-in-europe>

Stanley, Tim. "Sweden was overwhelmed by influx of child migrants – we should heed their lesson." The Telegraph. October 22nd, 2016. Accessed January 2017. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2016/10/22/sweden-was-overwhelmed-by-influx-of-child-migrants--we-should-he/>

Vargas-Silva, Carlos. "EU Migrations to and from the UK After Brexit." 2016. *Intereconomics* 51(5): 251-255.