

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Leadership in Adult Education: A Content Analysis of Contemporary Literature

By: Carly Jean Hall
Bachelor of Science in Nursing, University of Victoria, 1997

A Project Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of:

MASTER OF EDUCATION

In Leadership Studies

Department of Educational Psychology and Leadership Studies

Project Supervisor: Dr. Donald Lang

University of Victoria

March 2010

Abstract

This paper explores the concept of leadership in the adult education literature. This is achieved by using a content analysis of relevant academic writing. The research question is simply: what is the contemporary literature saying about leadership in adult education?

This study is significant because it provides an overdue review of the contemporary literature. Six themes emerged from the data: what is a leader, relationships in leadership, empowerment, shared leadership, women's leadership, and leadership preparation. Taken together, these themes describe a relational, inclusive approach to leadership that values a shared vision, collaboration and self-reflection.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1 – Introduction	4
Chapter 2 – Methodology	8
Content Analysis.....	8
Data Sources.....	9
Data Analysis.....	11
Limitations.....	12
Chapter 3 – Findings	13
What is a Leader	13
Leader qualities.....	13
Leader as visionary.....	15
Leader as change agent.....	15
Relationships.....	17
Relationships as foundational to leadership.....	17
Relationship building and leadership styles.....	18
Relationships in a learning community.....	18
Empowerment.....	19
Empowerment and leadership styles.....	20
Empowerment in the context of education.....	22
Strategies for empowerment.....	23
Shared Leadership.....	24
Benefits of shared leadership.....	25
Women’s Leadership.....	27
Leadership Preparation.....	29
Leader learning needs.....	29
Training and education.....	31
Self reflection – an essential tool.....	32
Chapter 4 – Discussion and Conclusion	33
References	39
Appendix A – Tracking Key Concepts	45
Appendix B – Identifying Themes	51

Chapter 1 – Introduction

Purpose

The purpose of this paper is to explore the concept of leadership in the adult education literature. This will be achieved by undertaking a content analysis of current and relevant academic writing and research. This research method was chosen because it allows one to sort through large amounts of data in a systematic way in order to identify themes (Elo & Kyngas, 2008; Hsieh & Shannon, 2005; Stemler, 2001).

Conceptual Justification

I embarked on this analysis because as a beginning leader in a community college, gaining a deeper understanding of leadership in adult education has a great deal of personal meaning for me. In addition, this study is significant because it provides a review of the contemporary literature that has not yet been done. Finally, it highlights a need for leaders to reflect upon their leadership style and to understand the importance of an approach that values relationships and collaboration.

Overview of Methodology

Content analysis results in a set of categories that describe the issue or phenomenon being studied (Elo & Kyngas, 2008). In the inductive approach to content analysis, as was used for my study, the categories are allowed to arise out of the data. The advantage of this particular method is that the understanding of a topic is gained without imposing predetermined categories or themes (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005).

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

I researched six adult education journals, four conference proceedings and one book in order to obtain a broad assessment of the dominant themes related to leadership in adult education. This search produced 65 pieces of writing. After reviewing these pieces I narrowed the date range (1994 to 2009) to ensure I was utilizing current data that would allow me to draw realistic and relevant conclusions regarding leadership in the adult education literature. This resulted in a total of 52 pieces of text from which my data were drawn: 36 articles, 15 conference proceedings and one book.

After compiling these documents, I read each one and noted the key concepts that each addressed (see Appendix A). After having read each piece at least once, I reviewed them and the key concepts to identify the common themes. I prepared a table to identify which pieces addressed each theme (see Appendix B).

I recognize that there are limitations to this study. It is not meant to represent an exhaustive search of all research on leadership in adult education. While I have attempted to be as broad as possible in my search, I acknowledge that it only includes pieces that were accessible online or through the University of Victoria Library or Leadership Studies Department.

Overview of Findings

This review of books and articles on adult education reveals six major themes regarding leadership. The first theme – what is a leader – includes an exploration of leader as change agent and leader as visionary. The second theme examines the significance of relationships in leadership, including which leadership styles tend toward a relational approach as well as relationships in the context of learning. The third theme

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

is empowerment and this is discussed a number of different ways, including the leadership styles that are most likely to utilize or value empowerment, empowerment in the context of education and strategies for empowering people. The fourth theme highlights the concept of shared leadership, including in particular, engagement in decision making. The fifth theme is women's leadership and explores the style of leadership most often demonstrated by women leaders. The sixth theme is leadership preparation, and includes exploration of the skills and competencies required to be a strong leader, as well as the education required and the value of self-reflection. Together, these themes fit within a philosophy of leadership that values relationships, collaboration, and strong vision.

Overview of Discussion

Overall I agree with the themes emerging from the data. I certainly support, and try to implement an approach to leadership that values relationships, empowerment, and collaboration. I was curious that few authors referenced writers such as Kouzes and Pozner, Margaret Wheatley or Peter Senge. While some of these authors may come from backgrounds other than education, they have much to teach us about leadership.

Definition of Terms

Adult education.

For the purpose of this paper, I consider adult education to be any form of learning undertaken by adults. Primarily – although not exclusively – I focus on formal education.

Leadership.

Although there are numerous ways to define leadership, for the purpose of this paper, I define it as a process whereby someone harnesses the energy of a group to work towards some common goal. While I will, at times, use the term ‘followers’, it is meant only to differentiate between the leader and the rest of the group. I see leadership as a process built on mutual relationships, collaboration and support.

Structure of the Paper

This paper is divided into four chapters. Chapter one provides an overview and introduction. Chapter two describes the methodology of content analysis. Chapter three presents descriptions of the six themes that emerged from the data. Chapter four provides further discussion of these themes and concludes the paper.

Chapter 2 – Methodology

Content Analysis

Content analysis is a research method used to make replicable and valid inferences from data to their contexts, according to Krippendorff (2004), who describes three characteristics that distinguish content analysis from other research methods: it is a pragmatic and exploratory process, it goes beyond simplistic notions of content and word counts, and it has had to develop a methodology of its own. Content analysis allows researchers to sort through large amounts of data in a systematic fashion in order to identify patterns (Elo & Kyngas, 2008; Hsieh & Shannon, 2005; Stemler, 2001). The goal of this research technique is to reach a clear description of the phenomenon and therefore the result of the analysis is a set of categories that describe it (Elo & Kyngas, 2008). For the purpose of this study, content analysis was used to identify themes related to leadership in adult education by using journal articles, conference papers and a book.

Content analysis can be used inductively or deductively, depending on the purpose of the study. Deductive content analysis is used when the study is designed to test a particular theory (Elo & Kyngas, 2008). In the inductive approach to content analysis, as was used for my study, the intent is to allow the categories to come out of the data. This approach is also called conventional content analysis (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005). The advantage of this particular method is that information and understanding of a topic is gained without imposing predetermined categories or themes (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005).

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

The inductive or conventional approach to content analysis includes the following steps: immersion in the data (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005), open coding, creating categories and abstraction (Elo & Kyngas, 2008). Immersion in the data involves reading the data thoroughly to get a sense of the overall picture (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005). Open coding refers to the process of highlighting headings or key words in all of the texts and then generating categories from there (Elo & Kyngas, 2008). Once the general categories have been identified, the lists of categories are grouped under major topics (McCain, 1988 and Burnard, 1991, as cited in Elo & Kyngas, 2008). Abstraction means forming a broad understanding of the research topic through generating main, generic and sub-categories (Elo & Kyngas, 2008).

Data Sources

I searched several major adult education journals and conference proceedings for this study. The journals were:

- *Adult Education Quarterly*
- *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*
- *Community College Review*
- *Convergence*
- *International Journal of Lifelong Education*
- *Studies in the Education of Adults*

The conference proceedings were:

- Adult Education Research Conference

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

- American Association for Adult and Continuing Education
- Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education
- Standing Conference on University Teaching and Research in the Education of Adults

In order to obtain a broad assessment of the dominant themes related to leadership in adult education I chose the above journals and conference proceedings for five primary reasons. These journals were chosen after consultation with professional colleagues and because they are all peer reviewed, academic/ scholarly journals. I chose the conference proceedings after conversations with adult education colleagues and because they were available through the University of Victoria Library or through the Faculty of Education's Leadership Studies Department. Most importantly, the varied selection of journals and conference proceedings permitted the identification of themes across various populations and adult education settings. It should be noted that in addition to these specifically chosen journals and conference proceedings, other articles and papers were included where appropriate.

I searched the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) and Academic Search Complete (EBSCO) databases through the University of Victoria Library. I began by doing a general search on these databases using the key words: leadership AND adult education. After I had decided on the journals on which to focus I searched within each adult education journal using the key word: leadership. These two approaches ensured that the data would be directly related to leadership in adult education. These searches resulted in a total of 65 pieces from various journals and conference proceedings. In addition to reading these articles, I examined the book, *Leadership for the Emerging Age*

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

(1994) by Jerold W. Apps after it was recommended to me by Dr. Darlene Clover, as being particularly pertinent to my topic of interest.

These 66 pieces of text made up the baseline data for my study. After identifying and reviewing these pieces I decided to narrow down the date range that I was using. I did this to ensure that I was utilizing current data in order to draw realistic conclusions regarding what the contemporary adult education literature is saying about leadership. I hadn't done this when doing the original research because I didn't know how much data would result from the searches. Once I had determined that there was sufficient current data, I decided to only use sources from the past 15 years (1994 to 2009). This resulted in 14 pieces being removed from the list. Therefore my data were drawn from the remaining 52 pieces of text (36 articles, 15 conference papers, and one book).

Data Analysis

In order to start identifying the themes related to leadership in the literature on adult education, I read all of the articles, papers and the book and noted the key concepts that each addressed (please see Appendix A for a list of the key concepts from each document). After having read each piece at least once, I then went back through to identify which themes were arising more frequently. My research question was simple: "what is the contemporary literature saying about leadership in adult education?" (please see Appendix B for a table identifying which documents addressed each theme). Once I had recognized the general themes, I began to identify sub-categories in order to flush out the concepts further.

Limitations

This study is not meant to be an exhaustive search of all writings on leadership in adult education. While I have attempted to keep my search as broad as possible, it only includes journals and conference proceedings that were accessible online or in the University of Victoria Library or Leadership Studies Department. In addition, while there is likely plenty that can be learned from other disciplines, the purpose of this study was to focus on adult education literature so the search was limited by that factor. The focus on adult education journals and conference proceedings was paramount to the purpose of the study. Further research could be undertaken in order to ascertain what other disciplines could teach the field of adult education about leadership.

In addition, I acknowledge that as an adult educator in a community college I am particularly interested in that setting. This led me to search a journal specific to this population. As this is a primary location for adult education I feel it is a worthwhile inclusion, although I recognize that this could be considered a bias.

Chapter 3 – Findings

An extensive review of books and articles on adult education has revealed six major themes regarding leadership in this field. The first is the exploration of what a leader is – including leader as change agent and leader as visionary. The second is the importance of relationships – considering leadership as relational. The third is empowerment and this is discussed a number of different ways. The fourth theme focuses on the idea of shared leadership, including in particular, engagement in decision making. The fifth is women’s leadership, primarily looking at the style of leadership most often demonstrated by women leaders. The sixth theme is leadership preparation – the skills and education required to be a strong leader. Together, these themes fit within a philosophy of leadership that values relationships and collaboration.

What Is A Leader?

Leader qualities.

Seventeen of the items I reviewed include discussion of qualities and characteristics of leaders (See Appendix B for a full list of all of the documents that addressed this theme). Apps (1994), for example, describes these leader characteristics as: passion, awareness of personal history, spirituality, balance, skills, contemplation, tolerance, courage, and perspective (pp. 112 – 122). I will explain in more detail what Apps means by these qualities in the context of leadership.

Apps articulates that when leaders are passionate about what they do they remain committed to what they believe over the long-term. He goes on to describe that having an understanding of our personal history indicates an acceptance that we can’t change our

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

past but can choose to respond to it differently. Apps identifies spirituality as referring to the part of ourselves that “guides us, at the deepest levels of our being, as to who we are, what we do, and how we do it” (p. 113). Attaining a sense of balance between personal and professional lives is another quality Apps highlights. He describes skills including the ability to communicate, think critically, and relate to people as important for leaders. He goes on to explain that another key quality is the ability to develop new skills. Another skill Apps addresses is the ability to reflect and contemplate where they are going, where the organization is moving and why they are doing what they do. Tolerance for paradox is another quality Apps describes as significant for leaders to have. According to Apps, courage is required for leaders in today’s world. Courage means having integrity and doing what you believe is the right thing to do. Finally, Apps suggests that perspective is an essential characteristic for leaders to have. Leaders must be able to assess a situation from multiple perspectives and be aware of the bigger picture.

Other researchers focus on similar characteristics. Fleming and Caffarella (2000) conducted a study to explore leadership in adult education through the eyes of the adult educators themselves. They write that the most highly valued leadership characteristics are: collaboration, caring, communication, commitment, ethical behaviour, consistency, intellectual activity and capability. Pielstick (1998) notes similar qualities including honesty, integrity, trust, respect, and self-confidence. Taken together, these characteristics paint us a picture of the type of person who makes a strong leader in adult education today.

Leader as visionary.

Four of the articles I reviewed speak about the ability of a leader to see and implement a vision of the future (Apps, 1994; Bolden, Petrov & Gosling, 2009; Eddy & VanDerLinden, 2006; Fleming & Caffarella, 2000). Bolden, et al. write about the need for a vision in the context of distributed leadership. They find that having visionary leadership can create an atmosphere of empowerment in which people feel that they can explore new opportunities with confidence, knowing that it is supported by leaders within the organization. Despite an interest in using distributed leadership, the interviewees in this study highlight their desire for a clear vision and direction from leaders. Other research identifies similar results. In their studies of adult education leaders, Fleming and Caffarella (2000) and Eddy and VanDerLinden (2006) find that leaders need to be able to provide direction and communicate the vision to followers. Apps (1994) takes this a step further by clarifying that visioning is a shared process and is not owned by those in positions of leadership. These authors underscore the important role leaders play in developing and articulating the vision and in empowering others to do the same.

Leader as change agent.

Viewing the leader as an agent of change was another concept that emerged from the articles. Four authors articulate the need for leaders to be advocates for change (Apps, 1994; Eddy & VanDerLinden, 2006; Fleming & Caffarella, 2000; McFarlin, Crittenden, & Ebbers, 1999). Apps highlights the need for leaders to be able to foster growth in organizations. He states,

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

A major role for an adult education leader is to encourage, support, facilitate, and otherwise ensure that the organization continues to change. Administrative leaders who see their main role as preserving an organization as it has existed face enormous difficulties in chaotic times. (Apps, 1994, p. 51)

Apps encourages adult education leaders to make a commitment to the growth and transformation of their organization.

Other authors also highlight the importance of leaders being agents of change. For example, McFarlin, et al.'s (1999) research of outstanding community college presidents indicates that the vast majority of them consider themselves change agents and report that their colleagues also see them as change agents. Similar responses are found in a study by Eddy and VanDerLinden (2006). They find that “initiating change, taking on the change agent role, or making the environment conducive for change” are leadership responsibilities (p. 14). In another study, this one by Fleming and Caffarella, adult education leaders are perceived as needing to be able to “initiate and support movement” (2000, para. 11). These studies all draw attention to the value of leaders being agents for change within organizations. Apps (1994) calls on leaders to be students and teachers of organizational change. He states, “as people change, grow, and develop, so must organizations change, grow, and develop, and one of the leader’s responsibilities is to help it happen” (p. 153). Leaders must embrace this change agent role in order to progress their organization.

Relationships

Relationships as foundational to leadership.

Relationship building is identified by 22 of the authors studied as one of the most significant factors in a positive leadership philosophy and style (see Appendix B for a full list of all of the documents that addressed this theme). Relationships are seen as an essential part of leadership (Apps, 1994; Bolden, et al., 2009; Dodman-Kevany, 2001; Eddy & VanDerLinden, 2006; Pielstick, 1998; Taylor, Martin, Hutchinson & Jinks, 2007). Apps describes the significance of relationships as the underpinning of any strong leadership approach. He states,

It is important to recognize that the leadership needed in this emerging age is concerned with communications and relationship, not solo performance. Even though we are discussing leadership qualities and characteristics, we cannot lose sight of the fact that leadership, in addition to being in context, is always in relationship to other people. (p. 105)

Leadership is, at its foundation, all about relationships.

Eddy and VanDerLinden (2006) also support this notion. They suggest that new forms of leadership are based on forming relationships with people across the whole organization. These relationships are described by Pielstick (1998) as being mutual, collegial and collaborative. He goes on to explain that when people are in these relationships they are fully engaged with one another and are working toward achieving the collective vision of the organization. Without relationships there is simply no potential to lead.

Relationship building and leadership styles.

Several specific styles of leadership are identified by various authors as including relationships as an important underpinning. Bolden, et al. (2009) describe distributed leadership as “relational, inclusive” and “collaborative” (p. 259). These authors clearly highlight the value of relationships in distributed leadership. Leadership is seen as relational in servant-leadership as well. For example, Taylor, Martin, Hutchinson and Jinks (2007) identify that servant leaders commit themselves to the organization and to the people within the organization – once again emphasizing the importance of relationship building. From her research on servant-leadership, Dodman-Kevany calls for “cooperative, multi-disciplinary approaches including values of wholeness, trust, valuing diversity, interdependence and interconnectedness, and honesty” in leadership (2001, para. 5). Pielstick (1998) explores transforming leadership and suggests that transforming leaders demonstrate genuine concern and support for people as well as empowering and challenging them. While these authors address different styles of leadership, they share in the valuing of relationships.

Relationships in a learning community.

In adult education specifically, the literature shows that learning takes place in a context of relationships and a sense of community connection. In other words, learning and leadership are interwoven. Demonstrating the importance of relationship building in an adult education environment can impact our students learning experience. For example, Ettlign (2001) observed that when the women in her study were able to connect in a relationship, a feeling of mutual respect and understanding was generated and

learning was increased. Leading staff and faculty in a way that values the relationships between leader and team will in turn model this behaviour for them to practice with their students. Wilson (2002), affirms this perspective when she states,

In the learning community where we come together, relationships and connection are not only highly prized and considered essential to learning, empowerment and growth, but represent the foundation of a future oriented vision of ‘being, belonging, and becoming’ for all members of the community, for both teachers and learners. (p. 328 – 329)

Wilson suggests that relationships are foundational to learning, thereby acknowledging the value of interpersonal connections in adult education.

Empowerment

Fourteen of the articles I reviewed identify empowerment as an essential element of leadership (see Appendix B for a full list of all of the documents that addressed this theme). Empowerment is seen as a fundamental tool for leadership (Apps, 1994; Cusack & Thompson, 1996; Johnson, 2009; Keller & Dansereau, 1995; Kezar, Carducci, & Contreras-McGavin, 2006; McArthur, 2002; Short, Johnson & Hall, 1994; Taylor, et al., 2007; Tekleab, Sims, Yun, Tesluk, & Cox, 2008; Ward, 1997).

To begin, empowerment in the context of education is defined by Short (1994) as “a process whereby school participants develop the competence to take charge of their own growth and resolve their own problems” (p. 488). She goes on to explain that people who are empowered have a belief that they have the knowledge and skills to identify issues and work to improve them. Short further identifies that empowered schools (and I

would suggest other organizations) create opportunities for people to develop knowledge and skills and then to use them to advance their organization. This understanding of empowerment is shared by Kark, Shamir, and Chen (2003) who describe empowerment as a process resulting in independence and autonomy, and empowered people as those who are self-motivated and believe in their ability to be successful. Ward (1997) identifies that empowerment within a community leadership development program is the most important feature of program success. Her study finds that when people are empowered to remain in control of their neighbourhood, there are higher levels of interest and autonomy as well as longer term success. Apps (1994) identifies the process of empowering, from the administrative leader's perspective as "both giving power (sharing power) and acknowledging the power that already exists in people" (p. 147). He recognizes that accepting the power that exists within the people of an organization goes "several steps beyond the sharing of power" (p. 148).

Empowerment and leadership styles.

A number of authors identify empowerment as a key factor in specific leadership styles. Tekleab, et al. (2008) compare empowering leadership with transformational leadership, stating that transformational leadership is primarily focussed on the vision of the leader, while empowering leadership is directed at "developing the self-leadership qualities of the followers" (p. 187). In other words, the empowering leader allows opportunities for their followers to make decisions and act on them. As a result, empowered people feel a sense of ownership over their ideas and are likely more willing to work in support of an organizational vision (McArthur, 2002). Apps (1994) suggests that the empowered group would develop the vision as a team and then various aspects of

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

the plan are carried out by different people from the organization. This process is, therefore, clearly driven by the empowered team and not solely by the leader. McArthur expresses, “the skills of the leader... require an ability to harness the talent of the department through the nurturing and understanding of the members’ needs” (2002, p. 7). This opinion acknowledges the value and significance of the relationships formed between the leader and followers resulting in an empowered team.

Taylor, et al. (2007) relate the concept of empowerment to the servant-leadership style. They assert that servant-leaders commit themselves to the success of their followers. Empowerment is the tool used to achieve this. Their study of servant leaders identifies that enabling others is a very significant leadership practice. The servant leaders in this study create high levels of trust by enabling subordinates to act, thereby allowing them to feel that they are an important part of the organization.

Apps (1994) takes the concept of empowerment further, drawing a connection between empowerment and accountability. While people have the right to act they must in turn be accountable for those actions. Smilie (1992, as cited in Short, 1994) finds that the more teachers perceive themselves as responsible for student learning, the more they feel that they should be held accountable for their work. Apps states that “for the administrative leader, empowering means encouraging people to act on their own and then take responsibility for their actions” (p. 148). This opinion links the right to make one’s own decisions and have control over their work with the accountability for those decisions and actions.

Empowerment in the context of education.

Just as I spoke of the value of relationships with students, there is a very important role for empowerment of our students. Short, et al. (1994), express that the driving force behind empowerment in education is the opportunity to increase teacher effectiveness. These authors argue that teachers who are empowered and have control over their own teaching are more effective than teachers who feel powerless.

One of the benefits of empowering faculty is the role that it can play in the further empowerment of students. Carlson-Catalano (1994, as cited in Johnson, 2009) found that faculty empowerment led to student empowerment by the use of specific teaching strategies designed to engage and enable students. Cusack and Thompson (1996), state that,

Empowering pedagogy is particularly appropriate as an approach to teaching adults when a difference in power exists between teacher and student and one of the primary objectives is to shift the power and control to the learner. The teacher-facilitator who empowers others does not give up authority and responsibility, but actively works to transfer responsibility for learning to students. Empowering pedagogy involves a shift in power as domination to power as creative energy. (p. 25)

Clearly, empowerment can have important impacts for students and their learning. A number of strategies for empowering people will now be explored.

Strategies for empowerment.

There are numerous ways that people can be empowered to be involved and engaged in their work. Short, et al. (1994) identify several dimensions of teacher empowerment, including: teacher self-efficacy, opportunities for professional development, autonomy and involvement in decision making.

Short, et al. (1994) describe self-efficacy as referring to teachers' beliefs in their skills and abilities. They express that "self-efficacy develops as individuals acquire self-knowledge and the belief that they are personally competent and have mastered skills necessary to effect desired outcomes" (p. 583). Helping staff to acquire these skills through professional development opportunities will assist in ensuring they are confident in their ability to educate their students.

Professional growth refers to peoples' access to opportunities to develop professionally, to continue their learning and to expand their skill set. Apps (1994) shares a similar perspective and states that "leaders are... constant supporters of renewal for the people with whom they work, at every level" (p. 151). There is value in providing the opportunity to develop professionally for at least two reasons. First, people gain new learning about teaching and develop confidence in their teaching ability. Second, this trust in people and concern for assisting them to meet their goals demonstrates the leaders' interest in and support of the faculty.

As a dimension of empowerment, Short, et al. (1994) explain that autonomy refers to teachers' perception that they have control over certain aspects of their work. Short (1994) expresses that, organizations that "support risk taking and experimentation"

by employees will build the employees' sense of autonomy (p. 491). Keller and Dansereau (1995), note that in order to empower our employees, we must be willing to provide both freedom and support. When imbalanced, the result could be an independent employee who doesn't feel supported or a completely dependent employee.

Finally, Short, et al. (1994) identify decision making as an important dimension of empowerment. This relates to the involvement of faculty and staff in decisions that directly affect their work. They articulate that empowered people are more likely to take ownership of their problems and to work to find solutions than those who are excluded from decision making. When leaders provide opportunities for staff to participate in decision making, staff gain control over their work situation. Kezar, Carducci, & Contreras-McGavin, (2006) found that leaders can create empowerment by encouraging participation and shared leadership. Providing these opportunities empowers staff and builds trust within the organization.

Shared Leadership

Shared leadership is a model that involves collaboration and meaningful participation across the organization and is addressed in 23 of the items I reviewed (see Appendix B for a full list of all of the documents that addressed this theme). Shared leadership and specifically participatory decision making are identified as a significant concept of leadership (Apps, 1994; English, 1999; Kezar, et al., 2006; McArthur, 2002; Millar, 1999; Short, et al., 1994; Tekleab, et al., 2008).

Apps (1994) describes the leadership style that is required for adult education as one that values shared power and diverse relationships. As mentioned previously, Short,

et al. (1994) identify that participatory decision making is an important feature of empowerment. They further note that people must believe that their contribution is valued and will have impact on the final outcome. It is essential that this invitation for involvement be genuine and not just a token gesture.

McArthur (2002), in his exploration of democratic leadership and the role of the department chair, asserts that involving others in the decision-making process is going to be most effective. Pellicer (2008) has experienced similar success. He states,

I learned that it is not the leader's prerogative, or even his or her responsibility, to make all the important decisions in the school.... I learned that if you are the formal leader, you have to give others in the organization both a reason and the opportunity to demonstrate that they care by finding ways to involve them in meaningful decision making. (2008, p. 70)

The leader has a responsibility, particularly if this is a change in process or approach, to ensure people across the organization are encouraged to participate in meaningful ways.

Benefits of shared leadership.

The literature describes four primary benefits of a shared leadership approach: acceptance of the decision, multiple perspectives, increased quality of problem solving, and personal leadership skill development. The benefit most frequently noted in the literature on shared authority is that people are more likely to accept decisions into which they have had input (McArthur, 2002; Miller, 1999; Pellicer, 2008). Even if it isn't a positive outcome, people are much more likely to understand and accept it if they have been involved throughout the decision making process.

Another advantage of the participatory model is that it provides multiple perspectives. Birnbaum, (1992, as cited in Kezar, et al. 2006) states “when leadership is shared, a college has multiple ways of sensing environmental change, checking for problems, and monitoring campus performance. Shared leadership is likely to provide a college with a more complex way of thinking” (p. 140). Without a doubt there is benefit to the organization when multiple ways of knowing are encouraged.

Having multiple perspectives increases the quality of problem solving within an organization and within each person involved. Short (1994) identifies the improved problem solving capacity of teachers as the greatest strength of collective decision making. A group who is used to this collaborative approach to problem solving will become more adept and independent with its decision making. A group who is used to the leader making all of the decisions will have their power taken away and will become entirely dependent on the leader. In her study of leadership in parishes, English (1999) finds that a move toward a more egalitarian model of leadership, in which parishioners had ownership, resulted in significantly less dependence on the priest.

Shared leadership also provides people with opportunities to develop skills in areas they may not otherwise have had. Shared leadership develops skills in people who may not have seen themselves as a leader. English (1999) finds that this trust in people’s ability to lead had a reciprocal effect – they then wanted to do more. In their discussion of empowering leadership, Tekleab et al. (2008) state that participation by followers helps to develop their leadership abilities. An approach to leadership that values participatory decision-making and empowerment of staff clearly has benefits on a number of levels.

Women's Leadership

Sixteen of the items I reviewed draw attention to the style of leadership demonstrated by women leaders and each highlights a different aspect (see Appendix B for a full list of all of the documents that addressed this theme). The authors highlight the value of the relational, collaborative approach that women tend towards (Apps, 1994; Caffarella, Clark & Ingram, 1997; English, 1999; Tedrow & Rhoads, 1999; Wang, 2002). Caffarella, et al. (1997), studied women in mid-level management positions and find that their perception of their leadership style is as “sensitive and responsive, especially to the people with whom they work” (p. 90). This focus on relationships is also supported by findings from Tedrow and Rhoads (1999). Their study of community college leadership finds that women in these positions tend to focus on a relational approach.

In her study of Chinese women managers, Wang (2002), finds that the women are likely to make efforts to get to know their employees and pay attention to their needs. She goes on to articulate that even though these women value relationship building with their staff, they are challenged because of their gender, and social norms in this culture, to establish relationships with men within and outside of their organization. This results in potential barriers to their advancement into higher management positions. In this context, gender certainly has a role to play in the level of success the women leaders are able to achieve.

English (1999) finds that women pastors are more likely to encourage participatory decision making and empower their parishioners to assume leadership roles and are more team oriented. She states, “this collegiality was seen to be a specifically

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

female style of leadership and was a welcome departure from previous leadership styles that were regarded as more patriarchal” (p. 389).

Apps (1994) describes several studies about women’s leadership styles. Helgeson (1990, as cited in Apps, p. 158) found that women focus more on the process of leadership than on the outcome. The women in her study were more likely to consider how their actions could impact other people and were also concerned with the needs of the broader community in which they worked. Desjardins and Brown (1991, as cited in Apps, p. 158) found that the women college presidents they studied excelled in taking initiative, being optimistic, being decisive and persuasive and in taking an interest in developing and supporting the people they worked with. In Rosener’s 1990 study, the women leaders said that they gained their power from “personal contacts, charisma, and interpersonal skills” (as cited in Apps, p. 159). Apps states that,

Today many leadership approaches that some claim come more naturally to women – leading from the heart, not merely the mind; concern for the development of others; sharing of leadership; questioning of ‘military-style’ organizations; and so on – are essential for leadership in the emerging age. (p. 160)

Apps summarizes the characteristics that women leaders commonly demonstrate and makes the connection to a leadership style that values relationships and participatory decision making.

Leadership Preparation

Leader learning needs – required skills.

Twenty of articles I reviewed explore the skills required of leaders and a very diverse list of learning needs arises (See Appendix B for a list of all of the documents that addressed this theme). The varied focus may be indicative of the range of organizational goals represented in these articles. Brown, Martinez and Daniel (2002) recognize, for example, that the skills required of a leader to maintain a growing organization may be quite different than the skills required of a leader to start a new organization.

One of the requisite abilities that is common among several authors is that of communication skills (Apps, 1994; Brown, et al., 2002; Losinger, 2002; Wiessner & Sullivan, 2007; Wolverton, Ackerman, & Holt, 2005). Apps (1994) describes the need for leaders to be able to “write clearly, speak concisely, and listen accurately” (p. 60). Wiessner and Sullivan identify similar expectations and quote the American Association of Community Colleges as describing communication as the ability to listen, speak and write for “honest, open dialogue with the internal and external communities” (American Association of Community Colleges, 2004 as cited in Wiessner & Sullivan, p. 95). Brown, et al. (2002) find that communication skills is actually the most important category of skills that community college leaders consider as required in order to perform their job effectively. Wolverton, et al. describe that post secondary institution deans stress that communication and dealing with conflict are very important skills for department chairs to possess. They explain that department leaders must be able to

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

collaborate with their team while maintaining positive relationships with both faculty and with administration.

There are a number of other skills that various researchers identify as essential for leaders in adult education. Brown, et al. (2002) illustrate ten broad categories of skills required for leaders in community colleges: leadership, communication, institutional planning, management, policy, research, legal, finance, technology, and faculty development. Duchesne (1997) highlights the need for leaders to have adaptive flexibility – the ability to adapt to and learn from the challenges we face when dealing with change. Losinger (2002) focuses on the learning needs that are unique to women college presidents and finds that exploring an understanding of power is especially important. This includes how power is defined, how it is used and how women who have it are perceived.

In addition to the communication competency discussed earlier, Apps also identifies the following skills required by leaders in adult education: human relations skills (including the ability to relate to and negotiate with people), thinking skills (thinking creatively and critically), perception skills (seeing the big picture), a sense of time (recognizing the relationship between past, present and future), question-framing skills (encouraging deeper analysis through questioning), reflection skills (including the ability to learn from reflection), abstraction skills (making meaning from chaotic situations), and learning skills (incorporating new learning) (1994, pp. 60 – 61). Clearly there are many significant skills that adult education leaders need to acquire.

Training and education.

Leadership education occurs on both a formal and informal basis. According to English (1999), “informal learning theory explores how individuals learn in the workplace and through daily interactions, outside the mainstream of academe” (p. 386). This form of learning can be augmented by mentoring, networking and coaching (Watkins and Marsick, 1992, as cited in English, 1999). Smith and Stewart (1999) observe that informal learning is how most community college department chairs learn their new role. They identify that this learning comes in many forms: learning from previous administrative duties, serving on committees, reading books and articles and by observing role models. Pettitt (1999) takes this one step further and articulates that “no one can simply *train* for the position of leadership in a community college; he or she must *do* the job to know the job” (p. 57). The study of leadership must be in context.

When it comes to formal education, it is identified by a couple of authors that a degree in leadership is most effective in preparing people to become leaders. McFarlin, et al. (1999) find that two-thirds of the outstanding community college presidents they survey have studied higher education and almost half focussed on community college leadership in particular. Brown, et al. (2002) also agree that a leadership doctoral degree is preferred over other degrees. There appears to be relevance and value in an education focussed on leadership in higher education.

Training for leaders in adult education often involves mentorship in some form. In her study of college leadership training programs, Anderson (1997) finds that most programs include a mentorship component – whether formal or informal. The value of

mentorship programs is identified by both Hansman (2007) and Losinger (2002) in their studies of women leaders in adult education. Both authors recognize that mentorship can have significant impact for both the person being mentored and the mentor.

Self-reflection – an essential tool.

The ability to reflect upon leadership – including our strengths and weaknesses and how to handle difficult situations – is a skill essential to leadership. Apps (1994) states, “adult education leaders in the emerging age must develop the capacity for acting and reflecting and for designing and redesigning action as they perform it... They make adjustments in what they are doing while they are doing it” (p. 58). Apps relates that even when a leader does not know what to do, they should start by doing something, then reflect on the outcome and adjust as the situation continues to unfold.

Kritskaya (1998) describes research about transformational pedagogy in a leadership training program. Fundamental to this program is the use of reflection. This includes self-questioning, critical analysis, and reflective writing. The ability to self-reflect is paramount to strong leadership. Despite (or possibly because of) the broad range of skills required of leaders, Apps (1994) states, “the greatest capacity that any leader can develop is the capacity to learn and then immediately apply those lessons” (p. 60).

Chapter 4 – Discussion and Conclusion

In this chapter, I reflect upon the six major themes that arise from my research on leadership in adult education. I will consider how the findings fit within the context of general leadership research as well as what I have learned about leadership.

What Is a Leader?

The adult education literature explores the leader as a visionary and as an agent of change. Although there are numerous articles that include a discussion of leader qualities, few authors offer their specific definition of leadership. There is discussion of what characteristics are important – and from here one could interpret what the authors' understanding of leadership is – but it is not made explicit in many of the articles.

In addition, there is little examination of how leadership and management differ. There appears to be an assumption that leadership is required to move an organization ahead, however, there is little discussion of why management alone would not suffice. Kotter (1996) states that both leadership and management are required in order to elicit change in an organization. He states, “transformation is not a process involving leadership alone; good management is also essential. A balance of the two is required” (p. 129). However, one of the hallmarks of leadership, according to Kotter, is vision. As discussed in Chapter 3 of this paper, many authors would agree with Kotter that vision is “a central component of all great leadership” (p. 68). This is a significant distinction to make and I would have anticipated that I would find it a more significant topic in the literature.

Relationships

I am encouraged by the attention paid in the adult education literature to the value of relationship building in leadership. Relationships are foundational to my own leadership style so it is affirming to see that supported in the adult education research and writing.

Relationships are also a central theme in Wheatley's philosophy of leadership and I find it surprising that her writing is not referenced more frequently. She writes that when leadership is not understood to be centred on relationships, we find leaders using "primitive emotions of fear, scarcity, and self-interest to get people to do their work, rather than the more noble human traits of cooperation, caring and generosity" (2005, p.2). The problem with this approach is that it can often "lead us to a difficult time, when nothing seems to work as we want it to, when too many of us feel frustrated, disengaged and anxious" (p. 2). Moving to a place of mutual respect and collaboration will have many benefits to the organization as well as to those involved. It's an important priority for the leader of any group to put energy into the development of relationships with the people who make up the organization. Simply put – relationships are the foundation of leadership.

Unmistakably, building mutual and collaborative relationships with people across the organization is fundamental to leadership. As Kouzes and Posner (2007) summarize, "leadership is a relationship between those who aspire to lead and those who choose to follow" (p. 24). They go on to explain, "a relationship characterized by mutual respect and confidence will overcome the greatest adversities and leave a legacy of significance"

(p. 24). Endorsing a leadership style based on relationships can have a lasting impact, both on an organization and on the people within it.

While I am heartened to see the focus on relationships in adult education leadership I was surprised that Wheatley and Kouzes and Posner are not cited more. I think looking outside of the adult education leadership literature could broaden our understanding. The fields of business and philosophy, to name two, can teach us a great deal about leadership.

Empowerment

The literature speaks of empowerment as another essential part of leadership. I was curious that few authors speak of the challenges of empowerment, particularly that empowerment appears to assume that the authority to empower lies solely with the leader. According to Argyris (1998), change requires commitment from employees and this comes in two forms: internal and external commitment. He argues that “only internal commitment reinforces empowerment” (p. 99). Argyris identifies that internal commitment is participatory and is closely aligned with empowerment. In order to empower people, one must encourage the development of internal commitment. He goes on to caution leaders not to misuse empowerment. He explains that leaders must be clear about who has the power to change things. He encourages leaders to assist their employees to understand the choices they can make about their own level of commitment. This slightly different view of empowerment – where internal commitment is significant to empowerment – was not addressed in the literature.

The understanding of empowerment articulated by Apps (1994) is shared by Blanchard, Carlos and Randolph (2001). These authors identify that empowerment is not simply giving people power, but is actually releasing the power that is already within them. Blanchard, et al. (2001) state, “empowerment offers the potential for tapping into the wellspring of underutilized human capacity that must be harnessed if organizations are to survive in today’s increasingly complex and dynamic world” (p. ix). These authors clearly articulate the value of empowerment as a tool in today’s workplace.

Shared leadership

I am again encouraged to find the adult education literature values an approach to leadership that is participative. The benefits of shared leadership are many and leaders must pay close attention to these significant gains. Certainly, I can relate to feeling more positively about a decision if I’ve had some involvement in the process. Even if the outcome is not perfect, I believe people are more likely to accept it if they have been involved in the process. I always try to ensure that I remember the value of this process when I am faced with important decisions.

The other benefits to shared leadership as identified in the literature – increased quality of problem solving and personal skill development – are also points that I try to keep in mind when faced with an important decision. Wheatley (2006), states that

An organization rich with many interpretations develops a wiser sense of what is going on and what needs to be done. Such organizations become more intelligent. It would seem that the more participants we engage in this participative universe, the more we can access its potentials and the wiser we can become. (p. 67).

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Wheatley eloquently urges leaders to engage people in participatory leadership for the good of the organization. Clearly the advantages to participatory leadership need to be forefront in the minds of today's leaders in order to move an organization ahead.

I am curious that few authors speak of the challenges to shared leadership. Specifically, I would expect that the literature would include exploration of the time it takes for leaders to develop trust with people to engage in shared leadership and to come to consensus when multiple perspectives are considered. While there is undoubtedly value in participative approaches to leadership, there are challenges that would need to be considered. Certainly the benefits still outweigh the challenges but I am surprised that few authors addressed these factors.

Women's Leadership

The adult education literature speaks to the significance of women's leadership style – one that is seen as relational and participative. Although I know of several men who share a similar leadership style, I would concur that it tends towards women's typical approach. I am heartened by the value placed on this approach as opposed to the more traditional, patriarchal approach that once dominated leadership.

Leader Preparation

The adult education literature investigates the skills and competencies that are required of today's leaders. I was struck by the amount of data in this particular theme. Many of the other themes were ones that I might have predicted when I began; however, I was interested to find the high number of articles that spoke to the need for leader preparation.

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

As I would expect, the literature determines that the majority of leadership education occurs on an informal basis. I was pleasantly surprised to learn that several authors conclude that a degree in leadership is most effective in preparing a leader for their role. I can certainly attest to the value from my own experience in leadership education. I would certainly agree that this education has made me a better leader.

Conclusion

Taken together, the themes that have come out of the adult education literature describe a relational, inclusive approach to leadership that values a shared vision, participation and self-reflection. This research has affirmed for me the value in this approach. Specifically, I have learned the significance of self-reflection and ongoing leadership development, the importance of being a visionary and looking beyond the present, and the value of empowering people to participate in the development and implementation of our shared vision. Apps summarizes this approach well, stating that,

This new perspective on adult education leadership is shifting from a mechanistic attitude marked by objectivity, control, predictability, competition, efficacy, and single views of knowledge to an attitude that values context, shared power, multiple relationships, and varied knowledge sources in which predictability is often impossible. (1994, p. 18)

References

- Apps, J. W. (1994). *Leadership for the emerging age: Transforming practice in adult and continuing education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Anderson, J. A. (1997). Leadership training initiatives for community college administrators: A focused synthesis of the literature. *Community College Review*, 24(4), 27 – 54.
- Argyris, C. (1998). Empowerment: The emperor's new clothes. *Harvard Business Review*, 76(3), 98 – 105.
- Blanchard, K., Carlos, J. P., & Randolph, A. (2001). *Empowerment takes more than a minute*, (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers.
- Bolden, R., Petrov, G., & Gosling, J. (2009). Distributed leadership in higher education. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 37(2), 257 – 277.
- Brown, L., Martinez, M., & Daniel, D. (2002). Community college leadership preparation: Needs, perceptions, and recommendations. *Community College Review*, 30(1), 45 – 73.
- Caffarella, R., Clark, C. M. & Ingram, P. (1997). Life at the glass ceiling: Women in mid-level management positions. In P. Armstrong, N. Miller and M. Zukas (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 27th Annual Standing Conference on University Teaching and Research in the Education of Adults* (pp. 90 – 93). University of London, United Kingdom.
- Cusack, S. & Thompson, W. (1996). Building a community of leaders: Research and development of a program to train seniors as empowering leaders. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*, 10(2), 19 – 36.

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

- Dodman-Kevany, K. (2001). Facilitating more servant leadership & stewardship. *Proceedings on the 20th Anniversary Conference of Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 189 – 191). Laval University, Quebec.
- Duschesne, R. (1997). Critical thinking, developmental learning and adaptive flexibility in organizational leaders. *Journal of Lifelong Learning*, 6, 19 – 28.
- Eddy, P. L. & VanDerLinden, K. E. (2006). Emerging Definitions of leadership in higher education. *Community College Review*, 34(1), 5 – 26.
- Elo, S. & Kyngas, H. (2008). The qualitative content analysis process. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 62(1), 107 – 115.
- English, L. (1999). Learning from changes in religious leadership: a study of informal and incidental learning at the parish level. *International Journal of Lifelong Education* 18(5), 385 – 394.
- Ettling, D. (2001). Leadership for Action: Wedding adult education and social change. *Proceedings of the Adult Education Research Conference*. Retrieved April 13, 2009 from <http://www.edst.educ.ubc.ca/aerc/2001/2001ettling.htm>
- Fleming, J. E. A & Caffarella, R. S. (2000). Leadership for adult and continuing education. In T. York, V. Chapman and R. St. Clair (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 41st Annual Adult Education Research Conference* (pp. 118 – 122). Vancouver, BC.
- Hansman, C. A. (2007). Leading or following? Women learning leadership roles in higher education. *Proceedings of the Adult Education Research Conference*. Retrieved September 22, 2009 from <http://www.adulterc.org/Proceedings/2007/Roundtables/Hansman.pdf>

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Hsieh, H. F. & Shannon, S. E. (2005). Three approaches to qualitative content analysis.

Qualitative Health Research, 15(9), 1277 – 1288.

Johnson, B. H. (2009). Empowerment of nurse educators through organizational culture.

Nursing Education Perspectives, 30(1), 8 – 13.

Kark, R., Shamir, B., & Chen, G. (2003). The two faces of transformational leadership:

Empowerment and dependency. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 88*(2), 246 – 255.

Keller, T. & Dansereau, F. (1995). Leadership and empowerment: A social exchange

perspective. *Human Relations, 48*(2), 127 – 146.

Kezar, A. J., Carducci, R. & Contreras-McGavin, M. (2006). Revolutionary leadership

concepts in higher education. *Association for the Study of Higher Education, 31*(6), 137 – 156.

Kotter, J. P. (1996). *Leading change*. Boston: Harvard Business School Press.

Kouzes, J. M. & Posner, B. Z. (2007). *The leadership challenge* (4th ed.). San Francisco:

Jossey-Bass.

Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology* (2nd ed.).

Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Kritskaya, O. (1998). Teaching leadership: implications for transformational pedagogy.

In M. Taylor (Ed.), *Proceedings of the 17th Annual Conference of Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 154 – 159). Ottawa, Ontario.

- Losinger, I. D. (2002). The development of university leaders: Supporting the professional development needs of university presidents. In S. Mojab and W. McQueen (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 21st Annual Conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 374 – 375). Toronto, Ontario.
- McArthur, R. C. (2002). Democratic leadership and faculty empowerment at the community college: A theoretical model for the department chair. *Community College Review*, 30(3), 1 – 10.
- McFarlin, C. H., Crittenden, B. J., & Ebbers, L. H. (1999). Background factors common among outstanding community college presidents. *Community College Review*, 27(3), 19 – 32.
- Millar, M. T. (1999). The department chair as speaker of the house: Shared authority in the community college department. *Community College Journal of Research and Practice*, 23, 739 – 746.
- Pellicer, L. O. (2008). *Caring enough to lead: How reflective practice leads to moral leadership*, (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.
- Pettitt, J. M. (1999). Situating midlevel managers' training: Learning and doing in context. *New Directions for Community Colleges*, 105, 57 – 65.
- Pielstick, C. D. (1998). The transforming leader: A meta-ethnographic analysis. *Community College Review*, 26(3), 15 – 34.
- Short, P. M. (1994). Defining teacher empowerment. *Education*, 114(4), 488 – 492.
- Short, P. M., Johnson, P. E. & Hall, W. (1994). Exploring the links among teacher empowerment, leader power, and conflict. *Education*, 114(4), 581 – 534.

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

- Smith, A. B. & Stewart, G. A. (1999). A statewide survey of new department chairs: Their experiences and needs in learning their roles. *New Directions for Community Colleges*, 105, 57 – 65.
- Stemler, S. (2001). An overview of content analysis. *Practical Assessment, Research & Evaluation*, 7(17). Retrieved September 22, 2009 from <http://pareonline.net/getvn.asp?v=7&n=17>
- Taylor, T., Martin, B., Hutchison, S., & Jinks, M. (2007). Examination of leadership practices of principles identified as servant leaders. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 10(4), 401 – 419.
- Tedrow, B. & Rhoads, R. A. (1999). A qualitative study of women's experiences in community college leadership positions. *Community College Review*, 27(3), 1 – 18.
- Tekleab, A. G., Sims, H. P., Yun, S., Tesluk, P. E., & Cox, J. (2008). Are we on the same page: Effects of self-awareness of empowering and transformational leadership. *Journal of Leadership and Organizational Studies*, 14(3), 185 – 201.
- Wang, Y. (2002). Gendered leadership experiences of Chinese women managers. In S. Mojab and W. McQueen (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 21st Annual Conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 350 – 356). Toronto, Ontario.
- Ward, C. M. (1997). Leadership development in an inner-city neighborhood. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 16(1), 39 – 53.
- Wheatley, M. J. (2005). *Finding our way: Leadership for an uncertain time*. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler.

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Wheatley, M. J. (2006). *Leadership and the new science: Discovering order in a chaotic world*. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler.

Wiessner, C. A., & Sullivan, L. G. (2007). Constructing knowledge in leadership training programs. *Community College Review*, 35(2), 88 – 112.

Wilson, A. (2002). Mending our ways: Leading dialogically as adult educators for a stronger civil society. In S. Mojab and W. McQueen (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 21st Annual Conference of the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education* (pp. 328 – 334). Toronto, Ontario

Wolverton, M., Ackerman, R., & Holt, S. (2005). Preparing for leadership: What academic department chairs need to know. *Journal of Higher Education*, 27(2), 227 – 238.

Appendix A – Tracking Key Concepts

AUTHOR	DATE	SOURCE TYPE	SOURCE TITLE	KEY CONCEPTS
Affloter & Findlay	2002	Journal	Convergence	Community mobilization Need for leadership in refugee camps Definition of leadership Participatory decision-making
Anderson	1997	Journal	Community College Review	Learning needs of college leaders Training institute (value of theory and practice) Use of mentors Leader as change agent
Apps	1994	Book		Leadership in adult education Relationship as power source Partnerships/ participatory decision-making Leader as change agent Communication skills Empowerment
Bartunek, Walsh & Lacey	2000	Journal	Organizational Science	Women’s leadership styles Empowerment Relationships are valued Democratic decision-making
Bolden, Petrov & Gosling	2009	Journal	Educational Management Administration and Leadership	Distributed leadership Focus is on the collective Value of relationships/ networks Importance of strong leadership at “top” Visionary leadership required Devolved vs. emergent leadership

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Brown, Martinez & Daniel	2002	Journal	Community College Review	Leadership training Self-reflection required Cultural competency Communication skills – most significant area of training required
Burke, Deschamps, Jackson, Martin & Paavo	2002	Conference Paper	Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Role of gender
Caffarella, Clark & Ingram	1997	Conference Paper	SCUTREA	Role of gender in leadership (awareness level) Characteristics of leader – collaborative, team building, consensus-seeking
Cusack & Thompson	1996	Journal	Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education	Empowerment Shared-servant leadership Training needed
Daniels	2003	Journal	Adult Education Quarterly	Participative research Women leaders
DeLany & Rogers	2004	Journal	Convergence	Black women’s leadership
Dodman-Kevany	2001	Conference Paper	Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Inclusive approach Community
Duschesne	1997	Journal	Journal of Lifelong Learning	Critical thinking development Correlates with education & on-job learning
Eddy & VanDerLinden	2006	Journal	Community College Review	Definition of leadership Leader as change agent Importance of providing vision
English	1999	Journal	International Journal of Lifelong Education	Shared ownership “communal” decision making Empowerment Role of gender in leadership
Ettling	2001	Conference Paper	Adult Education Research Conference	Social justice Empowerment

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Fleming & Caffarella	2000	Conference Paper	Adult Education Research Conference	What is a leader? Characteristics of leaders
Greene	2006	Journal	Convergence	Student participation Listening skills Value of inclusiveness
Hansman	2007	Conference Paper	Adult Education Research Conference	Women leaders Mentoring
Harris	2002	Journal	Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education	Community Partnerships
Johnson	2009	Journal	Nursing Education Perspectives	Participative decision-making Empowerment
Keller & Dansereau	1995	Journal	Human Relations	Empowerment Balancing freedom and support
Kezar	1998	Journal	Community College Review	Participatory leadership Alternative styles of leadership (e.g. pluralistic) Disadvantages of servant-leadership
Kezar, Carducci & Contreras-MaGavin	2006	Journal	Association for the Study of Higher Education	Ethical leadership Shared power Empowerment Collaboration Role of gender
Kritskaya	1998	Conference Paper	Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Leadership training Transformational pedagogy Critical self-reflection Participatory learning Experiential learning
Leach	2007	Journal	New Zealand Journal of Adult Learning	Distributed leadership Collaboration Shared decision making

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Losinger	2002	Conference Paper	Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Leadership development Women leaders
McArthur	2002	Journal	Community College Review	Role of department chair Empowerment Link students, faculty and administration Democratic decision-making
McAtee, Hansman & Monaghan	2008	Conference Paper	Adult Education Research Conference	Women leaders Transformational leadership Relationship building
McFarlin, Crittenden & Ebbers	1999	Journal	Community College Review	Factors leading to strong community college leadership Education (PhD), training
Magro	2002	Conference Paper	Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Transformational learning Self-reflection
Mejiuni	2006	Conference Paper	Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Religious roles of women Education of women
Millar	1999	Journal	Community College Journal of Research and Practice	Consensus decision-making Faculty involvement Department chair - “first of equals” Consultation (not tokenism)
Millar & Kilpatrick	2005	Journal	Studies in the Education of Adults	Community development
Oduaran	1999	Journal	Convergence	Empowerment People skills
Pessoa de Carvalho & Rabay	1999	Conference Paper	Adult Education Research Conferen	Politics Empowerment Gender
Pettitt	1999	Journal	New Directions for Community Colleges	Department chair’s roles & responsibilities, preparation for role and training needed

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Pielstick	1998	Journal	Community College Review	Creation of vision Relationship building Supportive culture Character (honesty, integrity, fair) Trust Participatory decision-making
Rogers	2004	Conference Paper	Joint International Conference of the Adult Educaiton Research Conference and the Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Role of gender in leadership Role of race in leadership
Short, Johnson & Hall	1994	Journal	Education	Conflict management Power Participatory decision-making Empowerment
Smith & Stewart	1999	Journal	New Directions for Community Colleges	Role of department chair Role transition Need for training Relationships with faculty are important
Taylor, Martin, Hutchison & Jinks	2007	Journal	International Journal of Leadership in Education	Servant leadership Characteristics of leaders Relationships Empowerment
Tedrow & Rhoads	1999	Journal	Community College Review	Women leaders at colleges Relational vs. instrumental styles of leadership
Tekleab, Sims, Yun, Tesluk & Cox	2008	Journal	Journal of Leadership and Organizational Studies	Empowering vs. transformational leadership Empowerment Participatory decision making

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

Townsend & Bassoppo-Moyo	1997	Journal	Community College Review	College leader competencies (personal and professional) Adapt to change People skills Communication skills Lifelong learner Participative style
Wang	2002	Conference Paper	Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Gender perceptions Relationship building
Ward	1997	Journal	International Journal of Lifelong Education	Community education Leadership development Empowered to lead
Whitsett	2007	Journal	College Student Journal	Compared faculty and chair perceptions of leadership styles
Wiessner & Sullivan	2007	Journal	Community College Review	Leadership training Communities of practice Competencies required (relationships, foster change)
Wilson	2002	Conference Paper	Canadian Assoc. for the Study of Adult Education	Relationships Dialogue
Wolverton, Ackerman & Holt	2005	Journal	Journal of Higher Education	Skills required People skills highlighted
Zacharakis & Flora	2005	Journal	Adult Education Quarterly	Social capital

Appendix B – Identifying Themes

AUTHOR	THEME 1 What is a Leader/ characteristics of a leader	THEME 2 Relationships	THEME 3 Empowerment	THEME 4 Shared Leadership	THEME 5 Women's Leadership	THEME 6 Leader Preparation & Training
Affloter & Findlay				✓		
Anderson	✓					✓
Apps	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Bartunek, Walsh & Lacey		✓	✓	✓	✓	
Bolden, Petrov & Gosling	✓	✓		✓		
Brown, Martinez & Daniel	✓					✓
Burke, Deschampes, Jackson, Martin & Paavo					✓	
Caffarella, Clark & Ingram	✓			✓	✓	
Cusack & Thompson			✓	✓		✓
Daniels					✓	
DeLany & Rogers					✓	
Dodman-Kevany		✓		✓		

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

AUTHOR	THEME 1 What is a Leader/ characteristics of a leader	THEME 2 Relationships	THEME 3 Empowerment	THEME 4 Shared Leadership	THEME 5 Women's Leadership	THEME 6 Leader Preparation & Training
Duschesne						✓
Eddy & VanDerLinden	✓	✓			✓	
English			✓	✓	✓	✓
Ettling		✓	✓	✓		
Fleming & Caffarella	✓					
Greene	✓			✓		
Hansman					✓	✓
Harris		✓				
Johnson			✓	✓		
Keller & Dansereau			✓			
Kezar	✓			✓		
Kezar, Carducci & Contreras-MaGavin	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
Kritskaya				✓		✓
Leach		✓		✓		

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

AUTHOR	THEME 1 What is a leader/ characteristics of a leader	THEME 2 Relationships	THEME 3 Empowerment	THEME 4 Shared Leadership	THEME 5 Women's Leadership	THEME 6 Leader Preparation & Training
Losinger					✓	✓
McArthur		✓	✓	✓		✓
McAtee, Hansman & Monaghan		✓			✓	✓
McFarlin, Crittenden & Ebbers	✓					✓
Magro						✓
Mejiuni						
Millar		✓		✓		
Millar & Kilpatrick						
Oduaran	✓			✓		
Pessoa de Carvalho & Rabay			✓		✓	
Pettitt						✓
Pielstick	✓	✓		✓		
Rogers					✓	

LEADERSHIP IN ADULT EDUCATION

AUTHOR	THEME 1 What is a Leader/ characteristics of a leader	THEME 2 Relationships	THEME 3 Empowerment	THEME 4 Shared Leadership	THEME 5 Women's Leadership	THEME 6 Leader Preparation & Training
Short, Johnson & Hall		✓	✓	✓		
Smith & Stewart		✓				✓
Taylor, Martin, Hutchison & Jinks	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓
Tedrow & Rhoads		✓			✓	
Tekleab, Sims, Yun, Tesluk & Cox			✓	✓		
Townsend & Bassoppo-Moyo	✓	✓		✓		✓
Wang		✓			✓	
Ward			✓			✓
Whitsett						
Wiessner & Sullivan	✓	✓				✓
Wilson		✓				
Wolverton, Ackerman & Holt	✓	✓				✓
Zacharakis & Flora						