Human Trafficking of Indigenous Women and Girls in Canada: A Review of State and NGO Prevention Efforts

by

Derek Turkington
B.A University of Victoria, 2016

A Master's Project Submitted in Partial
Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

MASTER OF DISPUTE RESOLUTION

in the School of Public Administration

University of Victoria

Defense Committee

Client:	Valerie Hisko, Senior Policy Analyst, Indigenous Services Canada, First Nations and Inuit Health Branch & The Family Violence Protection Program, Indigenous Services Canada
Supervisor:	Dr. Astrid V. Pérez Piñán School of Public Administration, University of Victoria
Second Reader:	Dr. Sandrina de Finney School of Child and Youth Care, University of Victoria
Chair:	Dr. Tara Ney School of Public Administration, University of Victoria

Acknowledgements

I would like to begin by acknowledging with respect the Lwkwungen peoples, also known as the Songhees, Esquimalt, and WSÁNEĆ First Nations communities of Vancouver Island, for allowing me to work, live and play on their lands. The beauty and peace of this place was an inspiring backdrop for the long path I took to complete this research and I am humbled every time I breath the salty ocean air and walk the island with all of the other creatures of this land.

I acknowledge Valerie Hisko, who without her inspiration and support this research would never have begun. I send thanks to all of the interview participants whose stories gave this work depth, purpose, and whose words imbued these writings with humanity. I also send gratitude to my family and friends and specifically Doug and Diana McDonald, Hayley Turkington, Samantha de Wit, Dawn Lindsay, Jana Meier, Parveen Kaur, Laura Marie, Becky Rogers and Taylor Little Mustache for guiding and supporting me on this journey.

Finally, I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Astrid V. Pérez Piñán, for her patience, her questions, our conversations, and for her support as I worked to find my way on this project.

Executive Summary

Human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada is a widespread issue across the country. Decades of state interventions have done little to stop the trafficking and sexual exploitation of Indigenous peoples and in some cases have contributed to the problem. A long history of systemic racism, discrimination and the socio-economic exploitation of Indigenous peoples by the state has created an environment where Indigenous women and girls are seen as other and less than their non-Indigenous counterparts, negatively impacting societal pressure to address issues of sexual exploitation (Sethi, 2007, p. 61).

Oppressive and harmful federal and provincial government policies including the Indian Act, residential schools, the sixties scoop[1], over-representation of Indigenous children in the child welfare system[2], and the underfunding of Indigenous social programs such as health care, legal services and infrastructure have negatively impacted Indigenous communities and families across Canada. These policies are contributing factors to high rates of depression, substance use, unsafe housing, low education rates, high rates of domestic abuse and violence, poverty, and intergenerational trauma, leaving many Indigenous women and girls at a high risk for sexual exploitation (Sethi, 2007, p. 61).

The Indigenous Services Canada Family Violence Prevention Program (FVPP) works to address issues of violence and exploitation through survivor focused services. The goal of the FVPP is to improve the safety and security of Indigenous women, children and families. Funding is allocated to programs through calls for proposals that meet guidelines set out by the federal government. Proposals that center around anti-human trafficking efforts are few, however, the client believes there is space for these proposals and for the FVPP to address human trafficking through their funding. The client for this report believes that awareness of human trafficking for women and girls leaving Indigenous communities may be an important gap that needs to be addressed (ISC, FVPP, 2017).

This report was developed to examine current anti-human trafficking efforts and to determine where and how the FVPP can best facilitate change. To accomplish this, this report examines a range of literature published up to 2018, reviews five anti-human trafficking programs across Canada, and analyzes interviews from ten participants who work for anti-human trafficking programs.

This report seeks to answer the following question:

---

[1] Thousands of Indigenous children in the 1960s and 1980s were taken from their homes by child-welfare service workers and placed with mainly non-Indigenous families in Canada and globally (Russell, 2016).

[2] Trocmé, N., Knoke, D., & Blackstock, C. (2004) note that Aboriginal children are twice as likely to be put in foster care than white children and are highly overrepresented in the child welfare system.

How can the Federal government best assist Indigenous women and girls transitioning from small Indigenous communities to off reserve living while supporting them to build awareness of the potential dangers of human trafficking in urban centers?

Methodology and Methods

This research project is a qualitative study using multiple methods with three central components: a literature review, program review, and interviews. The literature review provides a detailed overview of scholarly work and grey literature on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada. The literature review identifies important thoughts and arguments, some conflicting, from authors on the issue of human trafficking. This work supported the development of interviews for participants, helping identify the most pressing questions that would facilitate answering the research question. The second component of the paper looks at five anti-human trafficking programs from across Canada. The critical reviews of these programs support analysis and arguments discussed in the literature review, helping identify gaps in the programs and further questions for interview participants. The third component involves interviews with ten key informants from NGO organizations focused on human trafficking and sexual exploitation, including executive members, management, staff and volunteers. The findings from the interviews give great weight to arguments made in the literature review and add depth to the data analysis, discussion, and helped develop recommendations.

Key Findings

The key findings in the research are broken down into four areas needing attention:

1) Investing in Indigenous communities, women and girls;
2) Weak evaluation practices;
3) The power of social media; and
4) The roles of men.

Investing in Indigenous communities, women and girls

The findings note what governments across Canada have already begun to acknowledge and act on, that Indigenous peoples must be able to govern themselves in all aspects of their lives. Already we are witnessing governance transitions and efforts to shift judicial, health, and child and family services jurisdiction over to communities. The use and prominence of traditional Indigenous practices is supporting communities to work towards sexual exploitation prevention in their own culturally appropriate and traditional ways. It is not just prevention but also traditional means for judicial practices, forgiveness and community healing that differ from Euro-North American centric practices that are needed. This is what truth and reconciliation looks like.

Weak Evaluation Practices

Anti-human trafficking programs suffer from weak and or non-existing evaluation practices. This is not just a problem in Canada but worldwide as noted by the findings. Decades of anti-human trafficking efforts are marred by a lack of simple evaluative practices that would have shown whether or not they were efficient, of value, and if they had the intended impacts on human trafficking. The findings are very clear, that evaluation must be built into funding proposals and contracts and reviewed to ensure whether or not they are effective. It is a disservice and potentially dangerous to fund programming that may have a negative impact on anti-human trafficking efforts and on survivors.

The Power of social media

Of the findings, the power of social media stands out as the most important piece of any future anti-human trafficking efforts. Social media has become a powerful tool for traffickers, allowing them to access Indigenous women and girls lives in urban and rural communities where previous access was limited. Programming is needed that will spread awareness and educate women and girls on how social media is used by traffickers, how to safeguard against potential exploitation and recruitment efforts, and how to identify unhealthy online relationships. The findings show how intergenerational trauma and unhealthy concepts of relationships have made manipulation by traffickers an incredibly powerful method for gaining the trust of women and girls. Work to understand and address the use of social media in human trafficking is vital to ongoing prevention efforts.

The roles of men

An influx of funding on male centered education and programing is identified in the findings as important to any successful anti-human trafficking efforts. There has been a great deal of work on aiding survivors of human trafficking but little on addressing those who create the demand for sexual exploitation. Men and boys need to understand the impacts of toxic masculinity and how their decisions and actions impact the lives of Indigenous women and girls. Male centered programming has been successful as demonstrated by the Edmonton Sex Trade Offender Program for Johns that have been arrested. This program should be expanded nationwide along with education programs such as the Children of the Street's Redefined Manhood programing which addresses toxic masculinity with youth and teenagers in schools.

What stands out from this research is the need for Indigenous communities to be listened to and supported on their paths to self-determination and governance. Euro-North American attempts to end human trafficking and sexual exploitation have not worked. Traditional, culturally appropriate approaches stemming from a millennium of traditions and ways of being are key to addressing this issue.

Options and Recommendations

Options and recommendations were developed after examination of the findings for the client on the best path forward for addressing human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada.

Five key options were considered based on critical analysis of the report's findings:

1) Status quo: Continue with current efforts;
2) Engage with the provinces and territories to invest in communities through a strengthened effort towards self-governance;
3) Focus funding and Calls for Proposals on social media education programming;
4) Shift Jurisdiction of Child Welfare Systems to Indigenous Communities; and
5) Mandate that external evaluations take place as part of funding agreements on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls' programs.

These options are informed by the findings from the literature review, program review, and interviews. The factors that influenced the choice of these options are:

- What actions were identified by both the literature and interview participants as the most pressing need?
- What actions will have the largest overall impact on anti-human trafficking efforts based on the findings?
- What was missing from programming efforts?

The following recommendations are based on the findings of this report.

Recommendation 1:
Focus on investing in communities through self-governance and jurisdictional control.

Recommendation 2:
Increase funding and Calls for Proposals for social media education programming.

Recommendation 3:
Shift jurisdiction of Child Welfare Systems to Indigenous communities.

Recommendation 4:
Mandate evaluations for all program funding.

Table of Contents

1.0 Introduction

Human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada is a pervasive issue that continues even after over a decade of state interventions. The root of this issue stems from a long history of discrimination and the socio-economic exploitation of Indigenous peoples by the state (Sethi, 2007, p. 61). Over a century of harmful federal and provincial government policies including the Indian Act, a history of residential schools, the sixties scoop[3], the current over-representation of Indigenous children in the child welfare system[4], underfunding of Indigenous social programs such as health care, legal services and infrastructure have damaged Indigenous communities and families across Canada. These policies have contributed to high rates of substance use and depression, inadequate housing, poverty, low education rates, high rates of domestic abuse and violence, and intergenerational trauma leaving many Indigenous women and girls at a heightened risk of exploitation (Sethi, 2007, p. 61). Sexual exploitation of Indigenous women and girls in Canada far exceeds that of any other group in Canada and although they make up four percent of Canada's population, they account for approximately half of all trafficking survivors in Canada (Grant, 2016, Part 1, Para 9). Furthermore, discrimination and inequality in education, housing and in government services continues to push many Indigenous women and girls into precarious situations including inadequate housing and sex work where they are more susceptible to human trafficking (Grant, 2016, Part 2, Slide 10).

The Indigenous Services Canada Family Violence Prevention Program (FVPP) works to mitigate these issues through survivor[5] focused services, offering Indigenous women and girls' access to services needed to escape violence, to find culturally appropriate emergency shelters and transition houses, and to educate those in need of prevention and safety. However, these services do not focus on systemic issues that create an environment where sexual exploitation exists. The client believes that awareness of human trafficking for women and girls leaving Indigenous communities may be an important gap that needs to be addressed (ISC, FVPP, 2017). This assertion is supported through much of the literature and addressed in the literature review in Chapter Two. Not only is there a gap, but the transition from small communities to larger urban centers, and for those transitioning out of the child welfare system,[6] can be overwhelming for Indigenous women and girls coming from a culture of close community and familial ties, making them more susceptible to traffickers offering safety and companionship (Malone, 2018; Sethi, 2007, p. 62). It is hoped that by determining the extent of this gap and facilitating transitions, new pro-active programming

---

[3] Thousands of Indigenous children in the 1960s and 1980s were taken from their homes by child-welfare service workers and placed with mainly non-Indigenous families in Canada and globally (Russell, 2016).

[4] Trocmé, N., Knoke, D., & Blackstock, C. (2004) note that Aboriginal children are twice as likely to be put in foster care than white children and are highly overrepresented in the child welfare system.

[5] The term victim is used often to describe those who have experienced human trafficking and sexual exploitation. However, this term is problematic, taking power away from the individual. Where contextually appropriate, the term "survivor" is used instead of victim in this report.

[6] The Observatory's 2016 "Child Welfare and Youth Homelessness in Canada: A Proposal for Action" policy brief notes that youth on the street are 193 times more likely to have been involved with the child welfare system than the general public.

can be initiated that will better prepare Indigenous women and girls for life outside of their communities and the possible dangers of human trafficking.

1.1 Defining the Problem

Although there has been some effort by the Federal government to raise support services for Indigenous survivors of human trafficking since the early 2000s including policy and legislation, criminal code additions and amendments, frontline training and support documents and funding, human trafficking is still prevalent nationwide. Efforts have been targeted to human trafficking as a whole including trafficking for labour, for organs, and trafficking for sexual exploitation, but not directly towards Indigenous women and girls. These include but are not limited to:

- Federal support since 2002 of the Interdepartmental Working Group on Trafficking in Persons (IWGTIP), established in the 1990s as a committee to advance anti-trafficking initiatives in Canada (Shalit et al., 2014, p. 6). IWGTIP consists of numerous federal agencies and departments. In the National Action plan, IWGTIP is set to be replaced by a Human Trafficking Taskforce, led by Public Safety Canada (2012);

- The introduction through immigration legislation in section 118 of the *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act* 2001, human trafficking was officially described as when persons "knowingly organize the coming into Canada of one or more person by means of abductions, fraud, deception or use or threat of violence;"

- In 2005 the concept of human trafficking was introduced into the Canadian *Criminal Code* using a less broad description of human trafficking that "every person who recruits, transports, transfers, receives, holds, conceals or harbors a person, or exercises control, direction or influence over the movements of a person for the purpose of exploiting them…" (*Criminal Code*, *RSC* 1985);

- The National Action Plan launched June 6th, 2012 under the Harper government. Developed to consolidate federal ongoing efforts to combat human trafficking, the plan introduced significant new initiatives to "prevent human trafficking, identify victims, protect the most vulnerable, prosecute perpetrators, and build on [Canada's] partnerships both in Canada and abroad" (Government of Canada, News Release, June 6, 2012);

- In the 2012/2013 fiscal period, the federal government budgeted approximately $8 million for anti-trafficking efforts and pledged over $6 million for anti-trafficking activities annually (Public Safety Canada, 2012);

- RCMP training and training for first responders working with trafficked women (Canada's Anti-Trafficking Newsletter, January 2018);

- The creation of a new dedicated integrated enforcement team to be led by the RCMP (Public Safety Canada, 2012);

- Education for survivors and frontline workers including the report Our Spirits are Not for Sale (NWAC, 2015);

- Federally sponsored campaigns such as Blue Blindfold. In partnership with the Canadian Crime Stoppers Association (CCSA), the government launched a public awareness campaign to raise awareness among Canadians about human trafficking and how to identify and report suspected cases (VAWLearningNetwork.ca); and

- August 2016, 16.17 million in funding was announced for the creation of family information liaison units in each province and territory. This was meant to increase survivor services funding to provide culturally appropriate services for murdered and missing Indigenous women and girls, and survivors of violence (Government of Canada, Department of Justice, 2017).

The relative success of these initiatives has not been studied or evaluated adequately (Davy, 2016). Because human trafficking in Canada is prevalent, more needs to be done using multiple approaches including evaluation of federally funded programs. Literature suggests the issue is with the approach the federal, provincial and territorial governments are taking, that of a paternalistic entity attempting to save the survivors who are consistently described as powerless women and girls (Shalit et al., 2014, p. 6). A different approach of education before women and girls are trafficked is necessary, as well as addressing systemic socio-economic issues. Many trafficked Indigenous women and girls become involved in trafficking after leaving their communities and when entering larger urban centers, and it is here that the client for this research project believes change can be facilitated (Sethi, 2007, p. 62).

This report intends to examine the issue of human trafficking with respect to Indigenous women and girls in Canada in order to determine the extent of federal, provincial, territorial, NGO and community programs and support services available to Indigenous women and girls and their effectiveness. The study also aims to examine their transition from small communities to larger urban centers. Focus will be on determining areas of need and how the federal government can collaborate with Indigenous communities in identifying the best way to inform their community of possible dangers and of supports available.

1.2 Project Client

The Family Violence Prevention Program (FVPP) is an Indigenous Services Canada (ISC) program run by the Child and Family Service Directorate. Its purpose and priority are to improve the safety and security of Indigenous women, children and families.

The Program has two components:

- Funding for the day-to-day operations of a network of shelters that provide services for women and children living on reserve in provinces and in the Yukon; and

- Funding for annual or multi-year community-driven prevention projects such as public awareness campaigns, conferences, workshops, stress and anger management seminars, support groups, and community needs assessments on and off-reserve (ISC, FVPP, 2017).

This funding is meant to aid women and children in need of refuge and to facilitate access to shelters serving Indigenous communities across Canada. Shelters can provide a temporary safe space from violent situations and offer education and support for violence prevention.

The program supports activities that provide communities with tools to address family violence. It funds treatment and intervention, culturally sensitive services (elder and traditional teachings), and awareness and self-development projects. Over 300 family violence prevention projects are supported each year (ISC, FVPP, 2017).

With an annual budget of $31.74 million, the FVPP supports shelters and family violence prevention activities on and off-reserve (ISC, FVPP, 2017). Between 2006 and 2014, the department invested $261.1 million, providing shelter services for 24,290 children and 27,514 women and funding for approximately 2,800 prevention and awareness activities in Indigenous communities (ISC, FVPP, 2017). Some 329 communities (55%) are served by the 41 ISC-funded shelters (ISC, FVPP, 2017).

Human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls is an area the FVPP program works on indirectly through proposal project funding. Of the funding allocated for 2016/2017, none has been put forward for human trafficking due to an absence of proposals in this area. Funding requests tend to focus on family violence prevention in communities and come from Tribal Councils, Provinces, the Yukon Territory, First Nations Authorities, boards, councils approved by Chief and Council, First Nations Family and Child Services (FNFCS) agencies or societies, Indigenous communities and organizations, and non-Indigenous organizations and communities mandated to include First Nations, Inuit and Metis (ISC, FVPP, 2017). However, this is not to say funding does not exist for human trafficking, rather it is proposal based and entities looking for funding under the FVPP generally focus on family violence in communities and not human trafficking specifically. For human trafficking specific funding, entities reach out to Public Safety Canada which has several funding programs including:

- the Contribution Program to Combat Child Sexual Exploitation and Human Trafficking program which is also proposal based and provides funding towards eligible initiatives that support public education and awareness, and research;

- the Victims Fund announced in Budget 2012, the Fund sets aside $11.6 million each year available to fund provinces, territories and non-governmental organizations whose projects, activities and operations support the objective of the Federal Victims Strategy; and

- the Women's Program, which Status of Women Canada administers and is part of its programming priority area "Ending violence against women and girls." The Women's Program includes project funding to support female survivors of human trafficking. (Government of Canada, Public Safety, 2016).

1.3 Project Objectives

Research question:

- *How can the Federal government best assist Indigenous women and girls transitioning from small Indigenous communities to off reserve living while supporting them to build awareness of the potential dangers of human trafficking in urban centers?*

This report was developed to examine current anti-human trafficking efforts and to determine where and how the FVPP can best facilitate change. More specifically, this report seeks to:

- Provide an overview of what has been undertaken to date to support Indigenous women and girls and Indigenous communities in trafficking prevention, using available data and literature;

- Provide a wise practices analysis to determine what is lacking as well as valuable lessons in this respect; and to

- Provide recommendations for on and off-reserve community engagement on human trafficking issues.

1.4 Background

Human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls is a problem that can be traced back to the early colonization of Canada and how historical representations have defined how Indigenous peoples are viewed today in regard to sexual exploitation (Sikka, 2009, P. 8). Public views on Indigenous poverty, racism, criminalization, substance use and the infatalization and discrimination of this group has influenced how they are regarded as opposed to non-Indigenous women and girls when trafficked (ONWA, 2016, p. 6). This skewed understanding of Indigenous peoples has carried over into how survivors are viewed, often as complicit in their own situation due to lifestyle choices (ONWA, 2016, p. 6).

Furthermore, there is a general misconception that human trafficking occurs predominantly to Eastern European and Asian women, one that is perpetuated by media in movies, television and the news (Sikka, 2009, p. 1). The evidence suggests that 94% of human trafficking in Canada is domestic and of that, approximately half of these survivors are Indigenous (Grant, 2016, Part 1, Para 8). Although making up a large percentage of human trafficking survivors, Indigenous women and girls in communities are largely unaware of human trafficking, what it is, what it entails, and how to seek help (NWAC, Oct 2014, p. 22).

While work has been done to address these issues such as a four year National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking established by the Government of Canada on June 6, 2012, a front line worker handbook Our Spirits are Not for Sale (NWAC, 2015), Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) training (Government of Canada – RCMP HTNCC, 2015), and legislation and criminal code updates (Government of Canada – Public Safety, 2017), gaps are still present in raising awareness with Indigenous women and girls and in prevention across Canada. Although raising awareness will not address systemic issues that contribute to human trafficking, it may help strengthen Indigenous women and girls by ensuring they are better able to protect themselves by understanding their rights, the laws, and supports available to them.

Awareness campaigns have largely targeted middleclass white Canadians, perpetuating a "white saviour helping the helpless Indigenous woman" narrative that persists in Canadian media and government policies (Shalit et al., 2014, p.10). This does not speak to those in a position to traffic others or those vulnerable to being trafficked (Canadian Crime Stoppers Association, 2013, n.p.). There is a strong connection between non-government organization (NGO) efforts and government efforts as NGOs are largely dependent on government funding. They directly and indirectly support the white saviour/Indigenous victim narrative reflected in past government policies, making research into awareness campaigns including successes and failures an important gap to explore. Anti-human trafficking campaigns all have common themes identifying it as modern-day slavery, grouping it with or depicted as sex work and prostitution also tied to child exploitation and pornography, and narratives presenting human trafficking as good versus evil with the white saviour needed to save the feminized, infantilized victim (Shalit et al., 2014, p.2).

The exploration of human trafficking prevention efforts is important because the literature suggests much of what has been done to date, with the state focusing on protection and prosecution, has missed the mark. Sexual exploitation has occurred in Canada since its founding, yet the state has not sought to intervene until the concept of human trafficking replaced concepts of prostitution, youth exploitation and abduction (Hunt, 2010, p. 27). Historically, the number of Indigenous women and girls being trafficked has been highly exaggerated due to the conflation of sex work and human trafficking. This conflation allows the state to link the sex industry to trafficking and child pornography, positioning all involved as victims or villains (Shalit et al., 2014, p.10). The victim and villain narrative effectively give the state power to protect and prosecute, ignoring and dismissing the agency of all of those involved. This narrative demonstrates the need to review language used in public awareness, education and policy development as its impacts are far reaching, in this case both making Indigenous women and girls highly visible through increased anti-trafficking efforts, yet also invisible because of a history of sexualization, objectification, discrimination and exploitation through colonialization that has helped silence their voices (Shalit et al., 2014, p. 11).

A serious concern and a detriment to human trafficking prevention, protection and prosecution is that human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls is often conflated with prostitution. These women and girls are seen not as victims of exploitation but as individuals with agency, and because of this have become invisible to the general public (Sethi, 2007, p. 61). This works the other way as well, where

prostitution is conflated with human trafficking and prostitutes are viewed as victims, eliminating their agency and rights as sex workers. Differentiating sex work and trafficking and the spectrum between the two is important in order to protect the rights of sex workers while allowing policing entities to focus efforts on human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation (Shalit et al., 2015, p. 13).

The concept of acknowledging and implementing Indigenous law in is one discussed by Sweet (2015) and Snyder (2015) who argue that this will empower Indigenous communities in prevention, protection and prosecution. To do this though, Snyder notes that we must recognize that gendered violence and sexual exploitation occurred for thousands of years in Indigenous communities, long before colonial contact as evidenced through Indigenous stories and teachings (Snyder, 2015, p. 594). This does not minimize the effects of colonialization, but rather opens the state to examining precedent and solutions through Indigenous teachings and law (Snyder, 2015, p. 595). By acknowledging Indigenous law, communities will have the opportunity to look within their teachings and stories to find culturally relevant ways to deal with human trafficking. It is also important to note that Indigenous peoples have always be a diverse and complex population with many different traditions, laws, and teachings and that each community will have its own ways of being and lived reality.

The reality is that the current overrepresentation of Indigenous women and girls in human trafficking, prostitution, and as sexual exploitation survivors stems from numerous socio-economic conditions that are the result of over a century of colonization efforts and discriminatory policies. This list includes residential schools, the sixties scoop, the reserve and welfare system, inadequate housing, inadequate education, inadequate and culturally inappropriate social systems and resources, discriminatory laws and policing, and government policies that have hindered, rather than aided Indigenous peoples. Efforts to prevent human trafficking have suffered a general absence of statistics, poor program evaluations, and by being paternalistic, often ignoring Indigenous input and the recognition of Indigenous laws. By understanding the history and context of human trafficking and anti-human trafficking efforts, it is possible to move forward in a new direction. Furthermore, by ignoring the romanticized assumption that pre-contact Indigenous peoples lived harmoniously together, and by acknowledging traditional teachings and stories and giving Indigenous peoples a voice in law, communities, NGOs and the state may find more collaborative, community driven and culturally appropriate responses to prevent human trafficking (Snyder, 2015, p. 628).

1.5 Organization of Report

Chapter one introduces the topic of human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls and the problem identified by the client. The client and the client's background and role in the federal government is discussed as well as the research question of the report and the historical background and context of human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada. Chapter two, the literature review, looks at key authors and works spanning from 2007 to 2017 in regard to human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada. Focussing on state policies, conflations of human trafficking with prostitution, statistics, evaluations and approaches in prevention, protection and prosecution, the literature review examines key works on which much of this project’s research is based. Chapter three will cover methods

used including interviews, a program review and the coding of interview discussions for themes and analysis. Chapter four will look at 5 programs across Canada that work in preventing sexual exploitation. Chapter five will discuss findings of the reports, followed by chapter six, discussion and analysis of the research. Finally, chapter seven will provide options and recommendations for the client to consider moving forward, followed by a conclusion.

2.0 Literature Review

As part of this research project, a literature review was conducted in order to help identify major themes in research of the trafficking of Indigenous women and girls, to note relevant learnings, points of agreement and contention between authors on the subject, and to help identify gaps in the literature that may need future examination. Four main themes stand out in the literature on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada:

- A general consensus on the confusion around current definitions of Human Trafficking in Canada;
- A complete lack of statistics on human trafficking, including an absence of rigorous evaluation of programs and anti-trafficking efforts;
- Past and current state policies and media myths that continue paternalistic efforts of State "saviours" rescuing Indigenous "victims" and through this the perpetuation of marginalization; and
- Contention on the problematic conflation of human trafficking with prostitution, sexual exploitation, and with the Murdered and Missing Indigenous Women Inquiry (MMIWG).

Authors align on issues of colonialization and past government policies having a large influence on the current state of human trafficking, sexualization and the exploitation of Indigenous women and girls. Agreement is unanimous on the absence of statistics and the need for rigorous evaluations of state and NGO efforts. However, there is disagreement around what constitutes trafficking versus prostitution, sexual exploitation and violence against Indigenous women and girls, and this relates back to colonial and paternalistic narratives discussed in much of the literature. Issues of agency and discussions of complicity are also raised. Discussion around the link between the MMIWG inquiry and trafficking is considered by several authors, making important arguments on each side of the debate on whether to include trafficking as a potential explanation for some of the missing women and girls or not. All of these topics are discussed in the following review.

2.1 Definitions:

Canada recognizes three distinct policy instruments in defining human trafficking including:

- The United Nations *Protocol to Prevent and Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children* (one of the three *Palermo Protocols*);

- Bill C-49, *an Act to amend the Criminal Code (trafficking in persons)*; and

- Bill C-310 *an Act to Amend the Criminal* Code *(trafficking in persons)* which includes two amendments and most importantly, the inclusion of threatened force, coercion, deception and abuse of a position of trust, power or authority as a determinant of exploitation the courts may consider (ONWA, p. 4, 2016).

Canadian legislation and the Canada *Criminal Code* additionally contain a large array of possible criminal offences and actions that are related to human trafficking (see appendix 1). Multiple definitions of human trafficking and amendments, and the large number of criminal offenses involved in human trafficking has had an impact on law enforcement and the judiciary's ability to charge and convict under the human trafficking moniker. The literature demonstrates a similar confusion in regard to trafficking definitions and the potential for perpetuation of the marginalization of Indigenous women and girls.

Much discussion among authors looks at the potential that current definitions of human trafficking have for conflating human trafficking with prostitution. Davy (2016) claims that the *Palermo Protocol* conflates prostitution with trafficking and should not as it impedes both causes (p. 488). The *Palermo Protocol* states that:

- "Trafficking in persons" shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs; and

- The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used; (UNHR, 2000).

Sethi (2007) notes that this definition includes the use of force, threats, fraud, deceptions, abduction, and payment to obtain consent for the purpose of sexual exploitation (p. 59). However, she argues this use of "consent" is misunderstood and mixes trafficking with prostitution. The argument can be made that one who consents is participating in prostitution but Sethi reasons that consent does not mean an informed

choice has been made (2007, p. 59). Hunt (2010) concurs, arguing that through the *Palermo Protocol* and Bill C-49 *an Act to amend the Criminal Code (trafficking in persons)*, sexual trafficking and exploitation have been merged into one, even though they are not (p. 30).

The literature suggests the 2012 Bill C-310 *an Act to Amend the Criminal* Code *(trafficking in persons)* was a positive addition to the *Criminal Code* that added the use of force, coercion and threats of harm as determinants. Further, Sweet (2015) claims that in the amendment, the move from transportation to exploitation was an important shift and acknowledged that human trafficking doesn't necessarily involve movement, rather the potential for the survivor to believe their safety or the safety of loved ones may be at risk if they fail to provide the services demanded by the trafficker (p. 166). However, Sweet (2015), Sikka (2009), Sethi (2007), Hunt (2015/16), and Shalit, Heynen, & van der Meulan (2014) all agree that a key hindrance to addressing human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls resides in current definition inconsistencies.

The framework and legal definition of human trafficking is exasperating the victimization and disempowerment of Indigenous women and girls (Hunt, 2015/16, p. 26; Sweet, 2015, p. 6). Shalit et al., (2014) point out that current definitions of human trafficking paint Indigenous populations as victims which influences understandings of sexual exploitation and abuse (p. 407). What becomes clear through a review of the literature is the need for a new, more precise definition of human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls, developed through an Indigenous gendered framework. A Gender-Based Analysis (GBA) with an intersectional approach can provide a helpful start. According to the Canadian government GBA is "a lens of analysis that examines differences between women's and men's socioeconomic realities as well as the differential impacts of proposed and existing policies, programs and legislative options and agreements on women and men" (Government of Canada (ISC), 2013).

Most recently, the Federal government introduced GBA+ where the 'plus' means intersectionality. GBA+ moves past sex and gender differences, acknowledging multiple identity factors that intersect to make us who we are such as age, religion, race, ethnicity, mental or physical disabilities, and geography to name a few (Government of Canada, Status of Women GBA+, 2017). The GBA+ is important because it is an analytical tool designed to help us challenge assumptions and identify potential impacts when looking at Indigenous women's experiences with human trafficking. The literature is clear that stereotypes and assumptions plague past and current state policies and public perception, further demonstrating the value of using GBA+.

Moving beyond GBA+ , there is a need to acknowledge and work with what Natalie Clark describes as a "red intersectional analysis," that recognizes Indigenous resistance, activism, sovereignty, local and tribal teachings, intergenerational connections between the past and present, and the construction of Indigenous women through the Indian Act (2016, p. 51). As noted by Mohawk scholar Audra Simpson, "We have to understand people within the multiplicity of frames that shape their lives – everyday frames of experience that they choose, that they inherit, that are imposed on them and that may be transformed, disintegrated, forgotten or ritualized" (Clark, 2016, p. 49). An Indigenous Gender Based Analysis+ is needed that

addresses GBA+ while also considering the impact of colonialism, state policies and the Indigenous lived experience.

2.2 Statistics and Evaluations:

The review of the literature exposed a serious lack of statistics based on both Indigenous human trafficking in Canada and on research and evaluations of State and NGO anti-human trafficking programs and efforts. This is disconcerting as articulated by Shalit et al., (2014) who claim that current ideas of human trafficking rely on vague, conflicting and emotive rhetoric rather than evidence (p. 387). The authors are unanimous in their consternation over the complete lack of reliable statistics on human trafficking in Canada and world-wide. There are no reliable statistics on the number of survivors and perpetrators in Canada and this lack of reliable data extends to convictions as well as human trafficking crimes that are charged under different monikers such as assault, kidnapping, forced confinement, threats and much more (Davy, 2016, p. 491). Despite these inaccuracies the media, government and NGOs present acquired estimates as accurate (Davy, 2016, p. 491).

The strongest literature on the lack of statistics and evaluations of programs in Canada comes from author Deanna Davy. In her 2016 work, *Anti-Human Trafficking Interventions: How Do We Know They Are Working?* Davy claims that most early 2000s programs were not evaluated, including hundreds at the regional, national and international levels (p. 487). Programs were developed, including action plans, training materials, journals, and conferences, but little is known about the impact of these efforts which means that State policy makers and NGOs have drawn conclusions from "overviews, commentaries, and anecdotal information regarding the effectiveness of anti-trafficking programs" (p. 487). In the last decade the importance of program evaluation has been emphasized by program managers and evaluations have occurred in some capacity. However, the literature suggests such evaluations have not been externally completed, have not been rigorous enough and are far from determining program effectiveness. Davy's (2016) study looks at 49 programs at the national, regional and international level and determined that anti-trafficking programs were not being evaluated adequately (p. 487).

Sweet (2015) emphasizes the need for more rigorous evaluations and points out that formal studies are needed to ensure prevention, prosecution and protection programs are working (p. 166). This coincides with Davy's (2016) assertion that lack of evaluation and knowledge hinders progress on this subject. Reinforcing this claim is the United Nations Council for Economic and Social Development statement that a basic principle underpinning the prevention of crimes is the "application of research and evaluation findings in the development and implementation of strategies to reduce the problem" (Davy, 2016, p. 490). A review of human trafficking programs by Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) demonstrated that insufficient evaluation was occurring and that poor evaluations are decreasing the effectiveness of anti-human trafficking responses and progress (Davy, 2016, p. 492). GAATW argues that immediate action is needed in developing sufficient evaluation systems to determine if anti-trafficking programs are effective (Davy, 2016, p. 492).

What has developed is a perpetual circle scenario where state and NGO anti-trafficking programs are created based on inaccurate statistics, frameworks and paternalistic victim/saviour tropes reinforced through poor evaluation. These programs are not evaluated for effectiveness and further, similar programs are funded and perpetuate the problem due to a lack of evaluation that might have caused a shift in direction had they been done properly. Based on what is presented to date, the evidence suggests human trafficking programs have been developed and grounded in flawed information (Davy, 2016, p. 491). Sweet (2015) echoes these arguments, claiming that there is no data collection or tracking in Canada that provides a full picture of human trafficking nation-wide (p. 166). Supporting Sweet (2015) and Davy (2016), Weitzer (2014) notes that current statistical figures worldwide on the number of traffickers, survivors, migration, and movement, have no documented sources to support them, yet they are "quickly recapitulated in the media and by various government and international agencies, giving them the veneer of credibility" (para 1). This 'veneer' has been enough to prompt anti-trafficking programs and state support. The issue, as Weitzer (2014) notes, is that millions of dollars have been spent on anti-trafficking programs by governments, but few survivors have been located and helped and even fewer traffickers have been prosecuted (Para. 1).

The concern with inaccurate statistics feeding anti-trafficking programs that are not evaluated is a perpetuation of the marginalization of Indigenous women and girls. Davy (2016) notes that some initiatives may be counterproductive and cause harm to survivors, violating their rights (p. 492). Shalit et al., (2014) argue similarly regarding the impact of programs on sex workers due to the conflation of prostitution with trafficking where many programs result in increased surveillance and pressure from law enforcement on sex trade workers (p. 396). Hunt (2015/16) states that a lack of data on human trafficking, its extent and nature, has led to research conflating domestic trafficking with sexualized violence, youth sexual exploitation, intergenerational violence, disappearances, and other forms of abuse and violence (p. 27).

One detriment to the successful gathering of statistics on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls noted by Sethi (2007), Davy (2016), and Sweet (2015) is the absence of Indigenous survivor's inclusion in both statistics and program development. Sethi (2007) argues statistics are lacking because of the nature of trafficking and survivors' fear of repercussions from traffickers if they report their victimization (p. 59). Davy (2016) notes that evaluators and researchers purposefully exempt survivors from data collection due to fear of harm to the participants and although morally responsible, it silences those already made invisible (p. 499). Further, this exclusion does nothing to improve community engagement, collaboration and trust with Indigenous peoples. Moving toward Indigenous driven approaches in evaluation and research will not only open researchers to non-western methods and approaches to research but will ensure fuller and more evocative results. This is relevant to this research project as the researcher and client decided the potential for harm outweighed the possibility of doing good with the inclusion of Indigenous women and girls' voices. Further details will be addressed in the limitations section.

Moving forward, it is clear from the literature that there must be a concerted effort by the federal government, the provinces and territories, cities and communities, NGOs, law enforcement and the

judicial system to track statistics on human trafficking survivors, human traffickers and convictions. This needs to be a collaborative national effort in order to obtain a clear picture of the issue across Canada. Further, federally funded programs must be evaluated externally through an Indigenous lens, not just from a need to ensure efficiency, relevance and progress, but to guarantee Indigenous survivors are being helped and not further marginalized by programs meant to support them.

2.3 Saviour and Victim Tropes

Consistently discussed throughout the literature is a saviour/victim framework that finds historical reference from past colonialization efforts in Canada. Every author on the subject of human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada references the negative impact this narrative has on current efforts to prevent, protect, prosecute and build partnerships in regard to human trafficking. There are two themes of discussion on the issue of saviour/victim tropes:

- the inherent and perpetuated paternalistic state relationship with Indigenous women and girls where the state is responsible for saving helpless victims from exploitation and violence; and

- the media and the myth; the perpetuation of state paternalistic views and of Indigenous women and girls as victims.

Shalit et al. (2014), Sikka (2009), and Hunt (2015/16) all agreed that it is this narrative that is not only thwarting successful prevention, protection, and prosecution efforts but that it further reinforces discrimination and the marginalization of Indigenous women and girls. Victim tropes give the state justification for intervening in Indigenous women's lives for their own good, further silencing the same women they assume to protect (Hunt, 2015/16, p. 34).

State paternalism towards Indigenous peoples extends from a dominant protagonist and antagonist narrative where the state is the hero and protector and the traffickers are the villains (Shalit et al., p. 388). Shalit et al., (2014) contend that not only have campaigns by government and NGOs been framed in a way that further victimizes women and paints the state as the saviour and protector, but this framing has influenced policy formation and in turn, policy continues to feed this narrative (p. 387). Sethi (2007) uses a Crime Stoppers program to demonstrate this issue. Crime Stoppers perpetuated the saviour/victim dynamic through its "Blue Blindfold" campaign. It featured mostly white people blindfolded and watching exotic dancers, private home servers, racialized employees in poor labour positions, and massage parlors, setting up white viewers as the only ones that can save all of these helpless victims (Canadian Crime Stoppers Association, 2013b, n.p., Sethi, 2007, p. 11).

Survivors of trafficking are consistently racialized, feminized and infantilized in order to paint them as vulnerable, lacking agency and in desperate need of saving (Shalit et al., 2014, p. 389). Indigenous women specifically are thought to be putting themselves and society at risk and this is demonstrated through spaces that Indigenous women and girls occupy. Hunt (2015/16) argues that First Nations reserves, remote highways, and areas like East Vancouver in British Columbia are spaces that have been

naturalized as degenerate, making the Indigenous women in those spaces complicit in their victimization and invisible to law enforcement and the state (p. 28). Traffickers are also part of the narrative and are villainized. Shalit et al., (2014) notes that traffickers are described as evil, as the antagonist, and often as foreign in nature (p. 402). This could mean different colored skin, different languages and religions, and that they come from other countries. The state acts as the saviour in combat with the trafficker over the life of the trafficked victim (Shalit et al., 2014, p. 402).

Shalit et al., argue that past media narratives present trafficking as good versus evil with the need of a saviour to intervene to save the victim, often relying on stories and images of bondage, sex slaves, savages and saviours, all prominent in anti-trafficking North American narratives (2014, p. 390). Sikka (2009) expands this argument, explaining that victims are portrayed often as foreign, subdued, meek, scared and always excited to be saved (p. 7). Anything outside of this picture, including prostitution and drug use, is thought to be by choice and moves those individuals from victims to criminals and complicit in their situations (Sikka, 2009, p. 7). This is an interesting argument; however, it generalizes efforts and minimizes all of the work that state, NGOs, and law enforcement agencies do. The literature from other authors demonstrates a general understanding by these groups that human trafficking comes in many forms and that traffickers use many methods to bait and groom women and girls including drug addiction and forced prostitution.

Although use of the media in raising awareness can be beneficial, contradictions from authors on the movement of human trafficking survivors demonstrates the negative impact it can also have. A topic that arose during preliminary discussions with the client on this project and with early news research conducted, alluded to a serious problem with the movement of trafficking survivors from city to city as part of a triangular trafficking ring and to large sporting events such as the Olympics in Vancouver (2010) and during Grey Cup football playoffs. However, the evidence from authors has been conflicting. Sethi (2007) discusses a triangular human trafficking ring and that key informants from her study claimed that girls were moved from city to city in a triangle pattern across provinces, for example Saskatoon, Edmonton, Calgary or Saskatoon, Winnipeg, Regina (p. 59). These triangle paths, they argued, were interconnected and spread nation-wide (Sethi, 2007, p. 59). One of Sethi's (2007) key informants claimed the triangular paths followed oil rig and mining business fluctuations in Alberta, and movement allowed the traffickers to follow the laborers moving from city to city for work (p. 60). This supports Sweet's (2015) entire work which focuses on the pressure of men moving into northern communities for work and the increases in human trafficking that follow (p. 175). Although some studies discuss the transportation of women and girls from city to city, Sikka (2009) reiterates that this is not really an issue, and that the problem is they are moved from place to place within cities where they don't have the time to build a sense of home or community, meet friends, and gain confidence in their surroundings (p. 13).

Recruitment in cities and in Indigenous communities is a subject the literature is not clear on. Sikka (2009) notes that women and girls move to larger urban cities like Edmonton, Regina, Winnipeg, and Vancouver because they are major centers for health, Indigenous services and education (2009, p. 13). Once there, they are susceptible because of their isolation from family and community (Sikka, 2009, p. 13). Likewise, Hunt (2010) says that women and girls are not specifically being trafficked from small

communities to urban cities, but rather, they are falling victim to traffickers after having moved (p. 28). When women and girls arrive in new towns or cities, they often have no means to survive or a place to stay, making them susceptible to men looking for sexual favours in return for necessities of life (Hunt, 2010, p. 28).

Dustin William Louie (2017) disagrees with Hunt (2010) and Sikka's (2009) assertion, arguing social media has recently facilitated recruitment by traffickers reaching out to smaller communities and reserves (p. 97). His study focused on interviews conducted in Western Canada with sexual exploitation survivors and intervention staff, trying to determine how Indigenous women and girls are recruited by traffickers (Louie, 2017, p. 99). He claims that social media is the largest contributor to large sale recruitment into the exploitive sex trade and highly effective in luring young Indigenous women and girls to urban cities as it is an easy way for traffickers to connect to and manipulate women and girls in secret (Louie, 2017, p. 97). Social media and the constant connection to forums for exploitation and recruitment has made it extremely effective for grooming (Louie, p. 103, 2019). Further, he notes that while First Nations groups are using social media to strengthen communities and culture, it has also become a tool for exploiters that "includes the violent manipulation and oppression of Indigenous girls" (Louie, 2017, p. 110).

Where Sikka (2009) argues human trafficking and prostitution are viewed by media as two different themes, victims and criminals, Sethi (2007), Sweet (2016) and Hunt (2010) note the tendency of media, the state and NGOs to conflate sex work and prostitution, arguing any sexual exploitation is victimization. Hunt (2010) warns against painting all Indigenous women in the sex trade as victims as it removes agency and disempowers them (p. 29). Although the route to working in the sex trade for Indigenous women is often tied to exploitation, trying to save them is another form of paternalism and disempowerment (Hunt, 2010, p. 29). The conflation of prostitution and human trafficking is a major theme in the dialogue around human trafficking and further discussed in the next chapter.

2.4 Issues of conflation

The conflation of human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls with prostitution is a common concern among authors in the literature.[7] This conflation is unanimously seen as a by-product of historic colonization efforts and paternalistic policies and works from the state. Shalit et al., (2014) suggests two issues of conflation are present and that human trafficking is often grouped with or depicted as sex work and prostitution and tied to child exploitation and sexual abuse (p. 387). This results in the infantilization of all survivors, removing agency from those exploited and strengthening the paternalistic saviour/victim narrative. Because there are many complexities to both issues, the majority of authors believe they must

[7] Conflation of sex work and human trafficking for sexual exploitation is universal and does not just impact Indigenous women, but all sex workers across Canada (Arthur. 2009). However, due to the overrepresentation of Indigenous women being trafficked and participating in sex work, it is a much larger concern for Indigenous women.

be separated. A final conflation of note is that between human trafficking survivors and Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls (MMIWG) under the MMIWG inquiry and this is discussed briefly at the end of this section.

The evidence from the literature suggests conflations of trafficking with prostitution and the infantilization of Indigenous women are perpetuated by research, NGO anti-trafficking programs, and state policies. In regard to infantization of Indigenous women, Shalit et al., (2014) note that Canadian news agencies and media historically refer to Indigenous peoples as children (p. 399). Indigenous peoples are often depicted as child-like and inferior in comparison with non-indigenous peoples, lacking decision-making abilities. In the past, this facilitated the government's justification for the use of residential schools and the sixties scoop and many government policies discriminating against Indigenous peoples (Shalit et al., 2014, p. 399). By combining women and children together, women are infantilized and brought under the paternalistic umbrella, where women, much like children, lack agency in their decision-making abilities. Government and NGOs fill the paternal role and trafficked women and girls are denied decision making power over their lives. By linking the sex industry to trafficking and child exploitation, all are positioned as victims.

The Canadian Council for Refugees offers a counter narrative to the state view of human trafficking. It argues many groups see any form of prostitution to be exploitation and therefore a form of trafficking. However, by reducing prostitution to "trafficking" it denies agency to sex workers (CCR, 2013, para 4). Sethi (2007) argues that "instead of being contextualized in a trafficking framework, sexual exploitation of Aboriginal girls is portrayed and understood as a problem of prostitution or sex work" (p. 57). Sweet (2015) likewise claims that much of the data that is available on trafficking stems from prostitution and commercial sexual exploitation research studies and many of these women are considered trafficked under Canada's legal definitions (p. 167). Shalit et al., (2014) also agree, noting that more information is needed to differentiate trafficking and sex work (p. 400).

Many sex workers rights organizations including First and Pace in Vancouver, British Columbia, argue for the agency of sex workers, their ability to make informed decisions about their work, mobility and lives, and the need for more sex worker rights rather than rescue (Shalit et al., 2014, p. 405). Sex worker rights organizations want prostitution decriminalized to allow them control over their work and lives. However, the literature suggests the trafficking narrative generally views sex work as exploitation and women involved as powerless victims. Sweet (2015) argues similarly, noting that sex workers can be classified as trafficking victims under domestic and international standards (p, 162). Hunt (2010) concurs with Shalit et al., (2014) and Sethi (2007) claiming that sex work should be disentangled from the "associated stigma and criminalization" in order to give those workers a voice, allowing them to speak for themselves rather than have the "saviours" speak for them (p. 34). Further, she argues sex workers lives are evaluated through anti-prostitution prohibitionist frameworks that make them victims of domestic trafficking, further weakening their agency. Hunt (2015/2016) claims that anti-prostitution prohibitionists, having failed to get an appropriate state reaction to prostitution, have attempted to victimize and criminalize sex workers, facilitating their goals to end prostitution while simultaneously directing state

and public attention away from survivors of human trafficking who have limited or no agency and are in need of help (p. 35).

Not all of the authors are in agreement over the negative impact that conflation of human trafficking with prostitution has. Sweet (2015) does not disagree with the conflation of sex trafficking and prostitution but warns that those that do so must "proceed cautiously when linking prostitution and human sex trafficking data" (p. 167). Her research seems to side with the Canadian Standing Committee on the Status of Women that links prostitution and sex trafficking, arguing prostitution is a form of violence and a violation of human rights and therefor consent is irrelevant (p. 167). Sikka (2009) indicates there is a tendency for law enforcement to combine rape, sexual exploitation, and kidnappings, and suggests this has the potential to turn all sexual abuses into human trafficking, making human trafficking the only exploitation worthy of prosecution (p. 4). She continues, intimating that reframing exploitive acts against Indigenous women and girls as trafficking such as prostitution and criminal activity under coercion, may help reduce stereotypes associated with both (Sikka, 2009, p. 24). The argument Sikka makes is that programs aimed at anti-human trafficking have failed to recognize the broader context of exploitation in which trafficking of Indigenous women and girls takes place (2009, p. 24). Hunt (2010) suggests that a rights-based framework is needed, focused on Indigenous women's right to health care, safe housing, education, and protection from violence, which will give them more choice as whether or not to participate in the sex trade, also helping differentiate between human trafficking and prostitution (p. 29).

One important conflation addressed by Hunt (2010, 2015/2016), Sikka (2009), and Sethi (2007) is that of human trafficking and missing and murdered Indigenous women and girls and the MMIWG inquiry. Sethi (2007) argues that ties to missing and murdered women and trafficking must be considered, and this is supported by the Native Women's Association of Canada (NWAC) (Sikka, 2009, p. 22). With over 1000 women missing over the last 30 years, Sethi (2007) argues there is a connection to be made between human trafficking and MMIWG and the general violence and exploitation Indigenous women and girls experience, one that may facilitate human trafficking prevention (p. 57). The Toronto Police concur with Sethi (2009) and NWAC, suggesting a link between women and girls trafficked and missing women in Ontario (ONWA, 2016, p. 15).

Sikka (2009) and Hunt (2010) criticize this conflation between human trafficking and missing and murdered Indigenous women and girls. Sikka (2009) argues that to conflate the two "does an injustice to both," and allows exploitation without the element of kidnapping to lose worthiness, suggesting runaways are then viewed as holding responsibility for their own exploitation (p. 23). Likewise, Hunt (2010) argues trafficking is not "a significant factor in the disappearance and murder of more than 500 aboriginal women" in Canada (p. 28).[8] She further claims that explaining some missing and murdered women cases as trafficking victims diminishes their experiences and that the two should remain separate (p. 32). However, almost two centuries of physical, sexual and emotional violence on Indigenous peoples,

[8] The MMIWG Final Report (2019) notes over 1500 cases were reviewed.

combined with systemic racism and racist state policies suggest that missing and murdered Indigenous women and girls are inextricably linked to human trafficking and sexual exploitation.

2.5 Approaches for change

The literature on ways to prevent, protect, prosecute and build partnerships in human trafficking varies, but what is consistent is a need for new and novel approaches. Anti-human trafficking efforts have had over fifteen years to make an impact and the research suggests little has changed. However, it would be difficult to know what has improved due to a fundamental lack of statistics and program evaluations as discussed previously in this literature review. Methods for facilitating anti-human trafficking efforts noted in the literature are through more appropriate awareness programming, through looking at jurisdictional wise practices, collaborative efforts, and through training.

Sweet (2015) argues local communities need to raise awareness among community members about human trafficking definitions, what to look for, and how traffickers work to reach out to susceptible women and girls (p. 177). Further, she asserts that awareness should be in the form of education programs in schools, community awareness gatherings, public service announcements, and special training to warn youth of internet traffickers and what to watch for (p. 177). Shalit et al., (2014) discusses a 2014 Crime Stoppers anti-trafficking campaign funded by Public Safety Canada that focused on posters, pamphlets, and presentations provided to all crime stoppers associations meant to raise awareness in communities (p. 395). Although the imagery in this campaign supported state narratives of human trafficking and the white saviour, foreign victim narrative, it was a step forward, though ill conceived. Sweet asserts that raising awareness about human trafficking in the public, its many forms, and the ways in which it can impact communities is important and that until service providers, police, and communities can recognize signs of trafficking, the problem will continue to thrive (2015, p. 166).

Davy (2016) looks at international actions including those of Australia, parts of Asia, and Cambodia. The Australian government developed the Commonwealth Action Plan to eradicate trafficking in persons which includes prosecution, prevention, detection, investigation and supports. An important component of the plan is the inclusion of community awareness campaigns to increase knowledge of human trafficking (p. 489). Davy (2016) also discusses work done by MTV EXIT (end exploitation and human trafficking). MTV EXIT was a multimedia, multiplatform awareness and prevention campaign that worked with local groups in Asia to understand the nature of human trafficking. It incorporated music concerts and documentaries to "build knowledge and influence attitudes and behavior of target audiences" which were young people at risk of victimization, those who represent the demand, and the general public which needs inspiration to take action (Davy, 2016, p. 490).

Cambodia also implemented a local level effort; The Information Campaign to Combat Trafficking of Women and Children in Cambodia. This was a four-year campaign with funding support from the US agency for International Development conducted in 18 villages. It was a mass information campaign using event specific activities, workshops, and training (Davy, 2016, p. 490). Sweet (2015) points out the success of the Nordic model in Sweden which penalizes demand for sexual exploitation and prostitution

while decriminalizing prostitutes (p. 179). The Nordic model is one also highlighted by the Native Women's Association of Canada Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Aboriginal Women and Girls: Final Report (NWAC, 2014). Data suggests the Nordic model has worked effectively to make Sweden an undesirable place for traffickers (Sweet, 2015, p. 179).

The above examples of anti-human trafficking efforts demonstrate multiple local and national programs, target audiences and objectives, and it would be beneficial for Canada to look at international efforts for wise practices moving forward. Sethi (2007) says the propensity of the federal government to focus on one issue at a time in regard to Indigenous issues as opposed to a holistic wide-ranging approach limits examination of connections between these issues and human trafficking (p. 57). Sweet (2015) agrees, arguing no one system can combat human trafficking and that a multi-system approach is needed to empower communities to protect themselves and their members (p. 177). Further, she discusses the need for federal, provincial, and local communities to collaborate in the implementation of anti-human trafficking programs and training in order to rigorously prevent and protect against this problem (Sweet, 2015, p. 177).

The training of those who deal with human trafficking is noted as important in a majority of the literature reviewed. Sweet (2015) says training is a step needed that should focus on front line workers most likely to encounter survivors such as police, social workers, educators, and medical professionals, so they can recognize trafficking survivors and signs, and greater coordination between these groups can be facilitated (p. 177). Further, NWAC (2014) notes the need for cultural awareness and sensitivity training for these groups which is desperately needed in order for those offering help to not only understand the sensitive needs of survivors but also the historical issues behind their vulnerable positions (p. 60).

Sweet (2015) notes that NGOs need to be more culturally aware and should respect local traditions and standards (p. 184). Sweet's argument is important as it ties into other authors' claims for the empowerment of Indigenous peoples and the need for their participation, if not complete control over their own healing and efforts to prevent human trafficking (Sikka, 2009). Sweet notes that a lack of data regarding human trafficking of Indigenous women has left communities and local law enforcement unprepared to recognize and combat human trafficking. However, she claims that directing resources into trafficking prevention in Indigenous communities will decrease the opportunity for trafficking to take place while empowering the communities to take effective action (Sweet, 2015, p. 187). This empowerment can come from more nuanced approaches to trafficking, approaches that are in the form of a rights-based framework so that those with agency are not denied (Hunt, 2010, p. 27). Based on international human rights standards meant to protect human rights, a rights-based framework looks to understand inequalities while addressing discriminatory practices and unfair distributions of power (HRBA Portal, 2018). This includes supporting communities with resources that are needed in housing, health, transportation and the demand for healing from intergenerational abuse, and community capacity building (Hunt, 2010, p. 30).

Sikka (2009) maintains that empowerment can come from giving women and girls involved in human trafficking stronger voices in judicial processes and communities more capacity in the process (p. 25).

Sweet (2015) reaffirms the need for more Indigenous voices, arguing that recognizing Indigenous communities as legitimate partners in trafficking enforcement, prevention, protection, policy and legislation will ensure the voices of those impacted are heard and that culturally appropriate responses are considered and valued (p. 183). Further, Sweet contends that this must include recognizing and acknowledging Indigenous law which will allow survivors and communities to participate judicially in their own welfare (2015, p. 183/184). The literature is clear in that anti-human trafficking success will come from ensuring responses are broad based and that they include training, raising awareness publicly, in communities and with frontline workers, that they are collaborative between all stakeholders, they strengthen communities and survivors, and they do this while acknowledging root causes of exploitation: poverty, isolation, marginalization, discrimination, and the normalization of violence.

2.6 Root causes

The root causes for human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls are identified unanimously in the literature. All of the authors discuss human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls as one component of a greater problem of exploitation and violence on this group and that it must be viewed in this context (Sethi (2007), Davy (2016), Sweet (2015), Hunt (2010/2015), Shalit et al., (2014), Sikka (2009)). Further, they all argue a legacy of residential schools and colonization efforts is viewed as an overarching factor for past and current exploitation of Indigenous women. Residential schools, the sixties scoop and discriminatory government policies took parenting responsibilities and knowledge away from Indigenous families, destroying family systems and communities, while rendering family units dysfunctional. With this, Sethi notes that an environment of physical and sexual abuse and a lack of resources encourages young women to leave communities for larger urban centers, exposing themselves to potentially exploitive situations (2007, p. 61).

Sweet (2015) claims a reason for ongoing trafficking is that trafficking crimes are highly underreported, largely due to the nature of the crime and the shame and embarrassment and a history distrust of law enforcement (p. 166). A history of marginalization and distrust has made for common suffering, with trafficking survivors having generally suffered sexual, emotional, physical abuse, and exploitation. Survivors having lived in poverty, with unsafe housing and poor education are the norm and these are issues most Indigenous communities struggle with, making the correlation of being Indigenous and being susceptible to human trafficking clear (Sweet, 2015, p. 169).

Sikka (2009) argues a history of colonization and sexualization of Indigenous women has led to the inability of the justice system to acknowledge trafficking as a serious issue (p. 2). Further, she claims the child welfare system has been implicit in "creating the conditions for girl's entry into the sex trade" with surveys in Winnipeg noting that two thirds of women in prostitution were in the child welfare system at some point in their childhood (p. 11). The foster care system perpetuates the destruction of Indigenous community learning and cultural upbringing, and girls that run from foster homes are easy targets for men looking to sexually exploit them (Sikka, 2009, p. 11). Sikka (2009) makes some interesting observations that a history of not viewing Indigenous women as victims but as implicit in their decisions to inhabit

degenerate spaces has made them invisible to the criminal justice system, preventing them from getting the assistance that survivors would normally receive (p. 20).

Hunt (2010) argues that sexual violence as a tool of colonial conquest is well documented throughout human history and that historical stereotypes in Canada viewed Indigenous women as sexual predators and bloodthirsty with white men and women in need of protection against them (p. 27). Hunt (2010) makes an interesting comparison, that if forced migration, confinement, and facilitated sexual abuse has the characteristics of trafficking, then the state is also a culprit; tactics of past colonial governments fit that of current traffickers (p. 27/28). The authors all note differing problems in Canada that have led to and perpetuate violence and sexual exploitation of Indigenous women and girls in Canada. However, they all agree with Hunt (2015/2016) in that human trafficking must be addressed as a legacy of sexualized violence and not dissociated from the normalized violence in communities and sexual exploitation of Indigenous women and girls (p. 30).

2.7 Conclusion

The literature on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada demonstrates the harsh reality that not only have discriminative policies, programs and processes marginalized Indigenous women and girls, but they continue to perpetuate the problem. The authors all agree that human trafficking definitions by the United Nations and by the Federal government are lacking clarity and consensus. Further, these definitions have the potential to marginalize women. The literature is also clear on the lack of statistics of trafficking and how anti-trafficking programs are built upon and supported by unreliable research and numbers. To exasperate the problem, these programs suffer from little outside evaluation to determine need, efficiency and effectiveness.

The issue of conflation of human trafficking and prostitution and murdered and missing women is where authors do not completely agree. Points are made in support of broadening human trafficking to include prostitution, as exploitation in any form is deemed wrong and rightfully so. The idea that consent is irrelevant when exploitation occurs is a powerful one. However, it is difficult to argue in support of something that removes agency and a voice from women and that may negatively impact efforts in human trafficking prevention.

Transportation of trafficked Indigenous women and girls is other point of contention among authors. Several authors argue Indigenous women are susceptible to trafficking after having moved to urban centers while others note the impact social media has on facilitating off-reserve recruitment. Further research into how, when and where Indigenous women and girls are making contact with traffickers is needed. It is clear from the literature that there is no one method traffickers use to groom and lure women and girls, making it necessary to fully comprehend the range of methods for recruitment in order to help communities in prevention.

There are some great wise practices and information to be gleaned from international experiences and prevention efforts. Although further research is needed on the success of international efforts that could

not be covered by this report, it is clear that community centered information campaigns such as those in the Asia, Australia and Cambodia examples have been successful in raising awareness through original means. On the prosecution component of anti-human trafficking efforts, a more complete international scan may benefit Canadian efforts. The Nordic model in Sweden is one such example that has had great success deterring traffickers by shifting criminalization from prostitutes to those making up the demand for exploitive services and this is echoed in recommendations suggested by the Native Women's Association of Canada (NWAC, 2014).

What is evident from the literature is that collaboration with and leadership from within Indigenous communities on all aspects of anti-human trafficking programming is needed. Further, Indigenous law and investing in traditional teachings and ways of being in Indigenous communities is necessary if human trafficking is going to end. There is a history in Canada of paternalistic efforts to end exploitation, based on a view that the state is the benevolent parent and Indigenous women and girls must be saved. Neither the need for the state as a savoir nor the narrative of Indigenous women and girls as hapless victims are true and strengthening Indigenous communities by giving them voice and the power to decide and direct their own path to healing may be the wisest decision the state can make.

3.0 Methodology and Methods

3.1 Methodology

This research project is a qualitative study using multiple methods with three central components: literature review, program review, and interviews (Johnson, Onwuegbuzie, & Turner, p. 119, 2007). The first component is a literature review that was conducted in order to provide a detailed overview of scholarly work and grey literature on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada. The goal was to identify key commentaries and thoughts on the issue, identify conflicting ideas, and to summarize the main arguments of authors. This work has facilitated the refinement of interview questions for stakeholders and the overall direction of this project. It is useful because it will allow the FVPP to understand how outside scholarly research views state efforts and where wise practices can be gleaned. The second component of the paper is a review of five Canadian anti-human trafficking of programs used to support information and arguments discussed in the literature review and to aid in identifying gaps and new themes in the programs. The third component involves interviews with ten key informants from NGO organizations including executive, management, staff and volunteers that will be used in the data analysis and discussion chapters.

3.2 Methods

The literature review includes the collection, review and critical analysis of relevant academic research, reports, Canadian regulations and legislation, and quantitative statistics and interviews from the primary research available. The review facilitated understanding the current environment in regard to sexual exploitation and trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada, services available, and gaps in pro-active education.

A review of five anti human trafficking programs from across Canada demonstrates different strategies and approaches to the issue. These programs include:

- The Coalition Against Human Trafficking (Newfoundland)
- Covenant House (Ontario)
- TERF: Transition, Education, Resources for Females (Manitoba)
- CEASE: The Centre to end all sexual exploitation (Alberta)
- Children of the Street Society (British Columbia)

Findings are linked back to lessons learned and recommendations discussed in the literature review. Documents include those from each program website and webpage content. The program review demonstrates current strategies and approaches to addressing human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls, giving the researcher information on how the federal government can benefit from using lessons learned, and/or aiding the provinces and NGOs in their efforts. These particular programs were chosen to ensure Canada wide inclusion as strategies differ from province to province, and because these programs are the most prominent. This program strategy information is compared with key arguments from authors in the literature review to further demonstrate gaps in program delivery.

Data and information sources come primarily from publicly available internet websites through google search, academic and professional literature, and provincial and federal documents. Data includes findings from interviews with NGO staff from BC, the Yukon, and Alberta.

Interviews were conducted with 10 staff and volunteers with organizations gathered through referrals. Information collected from interviews was coded and analyzed for themes using X coding tool / approach (McNabb, p. 33). NGO interview participants were contacted through internet searches based on publicly available information and client referrals, and further referrals were requested from key informants generating a snowball sample. Interviews with key informants were conducted as part of research discovery and offer insight into resources available for Indigenous women and girls moving from small First Nations communities into urban centers.

Although known to the researcher, key informants' personal information is confidential and not included in the report. Any personal information and interview notes were stored on the researcher's personal hard drive and confidentially deleted upon completion of the research. Participant responses were coded, and the information used to find themes (McNabb, p. 330, 2013). Interviews followed a semi-structured format, allowing for topics to flow and expand based on the participants' openness. No questions regarding personal experiences with sexual exploitation were asked at any point by the researcher.

3.3 Data Analysis

On completion of each interview, a transcript of the recording was created from the audio recordings and notes taken by the researcher. A thematic analysis was conducted where transcripts were thematically arranged and coded in Microsoft Excel and those themes obtained were used in the data analysis and

findings. Key themes were supportive perspectives, ideas and arguments by key informants. For the program review, a SWOT analysis was conducted in order to identify key strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats that supported findings from the literature review and interviews and facilitated development of options and recommendations.

3.4 Project limitations and delimitations

Service providers and resource center key informants interviewed are from British Columbia, the Yukon, and Alberta. The limitation faced is that of broad territorial research information rather than having it be specific to large urban center and surrounding communities. This does not give a full picture of issues facing these organizations in one area but rather a general impression of issues based on findings.

Due to the sensitivity of the topic and with feedback from the client, interviews were not conducted with Indigenous women and girls specifically, limiting potential information from the target population. This impacts the depth of research possible; however, focus on NGOs and government organizations facilitated completion of the project and the client's needs. The exclusion of interviewing Indigenous women and girls is intentional due to the sensitivity of the topic, recommendations from frontline workers familiar with trafficking, and the background of the client and researcher; the client being Indigenous Services Canada and the researcher a white male graduate student. With a history of colonialization efforts and discrimination from the state and the largely white population of Canada, it was deemed inappropriate and unnecessary for client and researcher interaction with this vulnerable population.

Another point to note is that Indigenous men and boys experience sexual exploitation and human trafficking as well as Indigenous women and girls, making this a shared experience of exploitation. However, they do not receive the exposure in media nor similar support in scope from government and NGOs that Indigenous women and girls receive. A report for Indigenous Services Canada by Susan McIntyre (2010) noted that sexual exploitation of young Indigenous men is a serious issue, with young men sharing similar experiences and exploitation to Indigenous women (McIntyre, 2010, p. 10). Part of the absence of exposure is a lack of survivors coming forward due to exploitation against Indigenous men being considered a taboo subject and one that causes a great deal of embarrassment to the survivor, their family and the community. A final consideration is that of traffickers themselves. This project is examining government and NGO efforts to educate potential and current human trafficking survivors and prevention efforts but not traffickers or potential traffickers. It is possible that an existing gap is a lack of government and NGO focus on traffickers, however, this is not within the scope of this research project.

4.0 Review of Human Trafficking Provincial Programs

After reviewing the literature on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls, it became evident that Canada-wide there was a variety of approaches to prevention and protection. A review of existing anti-trafficking websites and programs across Canada was completed to add to knowledge gained through the literature review and that would facilitate and inform the interview process. Five programs across Canada were selected based on suggestions from the client and because they were noted in discussions during a

seminar in Victoria BC, presented by the Children of the Street Society.[9] It was also important to look at programs across Canada in order to gain a fuller picture of how they vary from province to province.

4.1 The Coalition Against Human Trafficking Newfoundland

The Newfoundland Coalition Against Human Trafficking (NLCAHT) offers an array of information for front line service workers and those looking to help survivors. A list of red flags and indicators meant to help inform family, friends, frontline workers, and the public on how to identify survivors of human trafficking is very in-depth, ranging from attire and appearance to the type of language used and lifestyle (see appendix 2). The NLCAHT, unlike other organizations noted in this report, does not offer programs, instead. taking an approach of educating the public through its website. The website is geared less to survivors and more towards those able to help in prevention and protection. Of note is the lack of focus on sexual trafficking and an overall focus on international components of the human trafficking trade. Child and domestic servitude, labour exploitation and trafficking for the purpose of petty crime and begging are discussed in detail, in part due to Newfoundland's position as a port of entry province (NLCAHT, 2018). The program's tagline, "Freedom should come with no strings attached" supports this assertion and demonstrates a focus on international trafficking and trafficking for labour and servitude (NLCAHT, 2018).

Important to note is a lack of attention paid to domestic Indigenous survivors of human trafficking. If, as the evidence suggests, 94% of human trafficking in Canada is domestic and approximately half of these survivors are Indigenous, then it should be expected that there be a larger focus on Indigenous human trafficking (Grant, 2016, Part 1, Para 8). A main achievement of the Coalition Against Human Trafficking in Newfoundland was a conference in 2014 and a follow up report, *NL Coalition Against HT INC: The Global Sex Trade in NL* (NCAHT, 2014). The goal of the conference and report was to educate and inform Newfoundland communities about human trafficking while identifying potential partnerships. Many of the speakers at the event repeated concerns that are highlighted in this paper's literature report:

- A concern in regard to the conflation of prostitution and human trafficking for sexual exploitation;
- A tendency for Police to charge and news releases to report human trafficking survivors as prostitutes; and
- The value of integrating a Nordic model and following it.

[9] This was a training seminar attended by the researcher and hosted by the Children of the Street Society in partnership with the Government of British Columbia on Thursday, September 28th, 2017 at the Comfort Inn and Suites, 3020 Blanchard Street, Victoria BC. Hosted by the Capital Region Action Team and funded by the Department of Justice Canada.

Member of Parliament at the time, Joy Smith, who presented at the conference, specifically noted an RCMP report *Hidden Abuse – Hidden Crime* (2010) that identified First Nations youth moving from reserves to urban areas as particularly vulnerable to sexual exploitation and human trafficking which is in line with the Family Violence and Protection Program's concerns (NCAHT, 2014, p. 21). The *NL Coalition Against HT INC: The Global Sex Trade in NL* report is beneficial in that it touches on many of the concerns described in the literature review, however, it lacks significant discussion about Indigenous women and girls being trafficked, and participation and voices from Indigenous groups and communities.

S.W.O.T Analysis			
Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
- Informative - Expansive list of red flags to identify survivors - Easy to access and understand	- No programming offered - Geared towards frontline workers and not survivors - Lack of focus on human trafficking for sexual exploitation	- Expanding public focus on human trafficking for sexual exploitation - Federal support and funding available to develop programing	- Secure and consistent funding

4.2 Covenant House Toronto (Ontario)

Covenant House (Ontario) is a homeless youth agency that has made human trafficking for sexual exploitation a central part of its programing. Providing year-round transitional housing and shelter, it also offers counseling, education, employment assistance, and aftercare (Covenant House, 2018). In 2016 an urban response model to combat human trafficking was implemented. This was a 10-million-dollar plan that "… propose[d] measures ranging from prevention to enhanced victim services, including its transitional housing program, and a research and evaluation component to assess the services and develop an online resource hub" (Covenant House, 2018).

A unique approach was taken by Covenant House Toronto in the development and creation of the Rogers Home, an important part of the Urban Response Model plan that is allowing seven women aged 16-24 to live in residence for up to two years. These women and girls receive 'wraparound support' which will include trauma counseling, addictions treatment, education, and a permanent live in figure acting as a mentor/mother. The Rogers Home was conceived and developed after four years of consultation and planning with communities and includes research and evaluation which is rare but invaluable as noted by Davy (2016). Although evaluations of the Rogers Home's effort were not available at the time this paper was written, it will be vital information, valuable to ongoing and future federal, provincial, and community efforts to combat human trafficking.

While the vulnerability of Indigenous youth is mentioned on the Covenant House's website, there is not a visible focus on Indigenous women and girls. A video tour of the Rogers house that was available for

viewing on YouTube, but that has now been taken down, showed a welcoming and beautiful home for women and girls in transition, but did not have any Indigenous cultural components, nor was an Indigenous perspective present in the form of a space for smudging (Covenant House, Sept 22, 2016). The Covenant House Toronto acknowledges that over ninety percent of trafficking survivors are domestic, and the evidence shows that approximately half of these are Indigenous, so it is important to note that an Indigenous influence is absent (Covenant House, Sept 22, 2016).

S.W.O.T Analysis			
Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
- Wraparound services - Research and evaluation components - Rogers Home	- No visible Indigenous programming	- More focus being placed on offering culturally appropriate services - Shifts to better evaluative practices ensure accountability through consistent culturally responsive evaluations	- Secure and consistent funding

4.3 Transition Education Resources for Females (TERF) Winnipeg, Manitoba

The Transition Education Resources for Females (TERF) program in Winnipeg, Manitoba is a transition and healing program for children, youth, adults and transgender people who have been survivors of sexual exploitation through prostitution (New Directions, 2017). TERF is a program run through the New Directions service provider which offers Winnipeg residents in need "Counselling, Assessment, Support and Prevention Programs; Training and Education Programs; and Residential and Support Programs" (New Directions, 2017).

TERF uses a combination of approaches and programs that are participant directed and "delivered through a holistic healing model of balancing spiritual, mental, physical, and emotional needs of participants" (New Directions, 2017). This approach to healing, protection and prevention that includes spiritual health is important and could be advantageous for Indigenous survivors that may respond better to Indigenous cultural methods for healing. The TERF program also offers training opportunities for professionals and front-line workers who interact with survivors of sexual exploitation. Further, there is a community-based training program that is Indigenous based. The Kapaapako Miikiwaap (Lodge Teachings) focuses on preventing child and youth exploitation. A four-day course that was developed to help train communities on how to deliver this curriculum to children and youth is also available. This program training is culturally sensitive and free in exchange for participant commitment to combat human trafficking in their communities (New Directions, 2017). TERF is funded by Manitoba Family Services, Manitoba Justice and the Manitoba Metis Foundation (New Directions, 2017).

The TERF program underwent an evaluation in 2007. The evaluation highlighted participant's need for culturally sensitive programing and appropriate support. Without the cultural component and influence, participants argued they would not have had success transitioning out of their exploitive situation (Ursel, E. Jane., Proulx, J., Dean, L., Costello, S., 2007, p. 15). This effectively validates The Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women and Davy's argument that the development of sufficient evaluation systems will contribute to the effectiveness of anti-trafficking programs (Davy, 2016, p. 492). Knowledge that it's participant population of exploited children, youth, women and transgender persons are 87-89 percent Indigenous and that the evaluation demonstrated they benefit from the cultural components, helped ensure those components remain and are multiplied (Ursel et al., 2007).

It is important to note that TERF helps those who have experienced sexual exploitation "through prostitution." This is an important consideration as it conflates human trafficking with prostitution. Painting both sex workers and trafficking survivors as prostitutes embodies them with the associated "stigma and criminalization" while denying sex workers agency (Hunt, 2010, p. 34). This may not be intentional, however, conversations with programs around language used could have an impact on both those engaged in prostitution and trafficked survivors, and there may be benefits to clearly separating the two during engagement.

S.W.O.T Analysis			
Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
- Wraparound, holistic approach to healing - Training opportunities for survivors and communities - Cultural component and considerations for Indigenous peoples - Self-evaluated in 2007	- Conflation of prostitution and human trafficking in program language	- Conversations around defining prostitution and human trafficking could help expand programing and support for both - Public demand towards more culturally appropriate programs	- Secure and consistent funding

4.4 The Centre to End All Sexual Exploitation (CEASE) Alberta

The Centre to End All Sexual Exploitation (CEASE) located in Edmonton, Alberta, was created in response to an increase in sexual exploitation and prostitution activity in communities. CEASE looks to end poverty while providing tools for sexually exploited and trafficked persons. The organization's work includes "public education, participant support, bursaries, counselling, trauma recovery and emergency poverty relief" (CEASE, 2015). Further, the organization works to inspire community partners to collaborate in order to find long term solutions to human trafficking.

CEASE takes a unique approach compared to other programs noted in this report. Its programs are geared towards sex trade workers and sex trade buyers, those selling sexual services and those buying. Programs for the benefit of sex "trade workers" are as such:

- Counselling and Trauma Recovery
- Empower U- Financial literacy and matched savings
- COARSE Success Coaching
- Bursaries for going back to school
- Resource Circle: Peer and community support
- Poverty Relief (Hope Emergency Fund)
- Building Bricks for Women: Success Coaching
- Project Star – Advocate and Court Support for Victims of Crime; and
- Below the Belt Men's Project (geared towards men) (CEASE, 2015).

A single program was developed for sex trade buyers that has evolved since its inception in 1996. The Sex Trade Offender Program (STOP), formally known as John school, was developed by the Prostitution Awareness and Action Foundation of Edmonton, now known as CEASE. Created for men apprehended for sex solicitation, it's gives first time offenders the opportunity to participate in the program as a condition of probation. John School is a post-court diversion program that, like the Nordic Model, focuses on the Johns for criminal charges and in this case, rehabilitation efforts (CEASE, 2015). Participants spend a day listening to stories from survivors, families and community members impacted by the Johns' actions. Further, they attend education classes focused around sex trafficking laws, probations and consequences, healthy sexual behaviours, and the impact of sex solicitation on others (Cease, 2015).

A 2016 CEASE report, "Prostitution Offender Program 2016," is very informative in that it contains statistics about Johns and the characteristics of people who solicit sex from trafficked survivors (CEASE, 2016). There is a great deal of statistics about the Johns involved in the program, however, some stand out. For example:

- 50% of Johns are aged 30-54 with an overall average age of 43;
- 61% of Johns have children and of those 59% resided with the children when the sexual solicitation attempt occurred;
- 79% of Johns involved had high school or higher education;
- 39% of the Johns had University/College education with 40% of all Johns making over 75,000 dollars a year income; and
- 50% of Johns identified labour as their profession, 19% identified as professionals, 14% retired and 12% made up of students, unemployed and those on social assistance (CEASE, 2016).

The statistics demonstrate that a majority of the Johns are educated, middle-class men with children. Although ethnicity was not considered within the report, it is noted 54% of Johns were born in Canada and 46% elsewhere with 33% born outside of Canada having immigrated within the last ten years

(CEASE, 2016).[10] This is important when trying to develop wise practices for trafficking prevention, prosecution, and protection and this program looks to target this group by offering education and treatment. On completion of the program, 88% of Johns claimed they would stop seeking sexual services and 96% said they had changed their opinion surrounding paying for prostitution (CEASE, 2016).

There is again, concern with the language in this report, specifically that of prostitution. The program is centered around Johns whom seek sexual services from prostitution. No statistics are available on the number of women who identify as prostitutes, versus women and girls being trafficked. However, it is safe to assume that when Johns seek sexual services they do not ask or try to identify whether or not those rendering services are trafficked or not. It would be wise to change the language of the program to ensure conflation does not occur. This issue was identified by Sethi (2007) when she argued "instead of being contextualized in a trafficking framework, sexual exploitation of Aboriginal girls is portrayed and understood as a problem of prostitution or sex work" (p. 57). Shalit et al., (2014) echo this statement, claiming that it is important that we differentiate between trafficking and sex work (p. 400).

As with previous programs reviewed, CEASE does not have programs geared specifically towards Indigenous women and children. However, their services do support all women of all ethnicities and they have Indigenous volunteers and staff. As with previous organizations, CEASE identifies those who sell sex as "sex-trade workers." Sex trade worker denotes a "profession' or "work" for pay which, in the case of human trafficking, is not appropriate. Human trafficking survivors do not work for personal financial gain but are forced to work for the trafficker's financial gain. The World Health Organization defines sex work as "women, men and transgendered people who receive money or goods in exchange for sexual services, and who consciously define those activities as income generating even if they do not consider sex work as their occupation" (Overs, 2002, p. 2). CEASE operates to help "persons with past or current sex trade experience, including the commercial sex industry and that have been sex trafficked or exploited" (CEASE, 2015). With this in-mind and acknowledging the problem with the term "sex trade workers," CEASE could consider adjusting the language in its programming to ensure a clear separation between sex work and human trafficking for sexual exploitation.

S.W.O.T Analysis			
Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
- Many programs with wraparound support for survivors - John program directed at men	- Language and conflation around prostitution and human trafficking - No Indigenous specific programing	- Public demand towards more culturally appropriate programs - Shifts to better evaluative practices ensure accountability through consistent culturally responsive evaluations	- Secure and consistent funding

[10] Although ethnicity was not included in this CEASE report, it is an important statistic that could be useful in understanding who these Johns are and how to better target anti-trafficking efforts.

4.5 The Children of The Street Society

The Children of the Street Society is a federal charity and provincial society in British Columbia dedicated to preventing the sexual exploitation and human trafficking of children and youth. Prevention efforts focus on family support, public awareness campaigns, education programs and a new tool kit for service providers (Children of the Street, 2017). A core program is TCO2: Taking Care of Ourselves.

The Taking Care of Ourselves (TCO2) program identifies the key to prevention of human trafficking and sexual exploitation as the ability to educate and as such, approaches the issue with education as the focus. The program's goal is to ensure children and youth gain a clear understanding of what sexual exploitation and human trafficking is, how to identify it, how to know if a trafficker may be grooming them, and to provide them with essential tools to keep them safe. It is an interactive program, unique across Canada in its scope, and as of 2017, has been delivered "518 times to 22,909 children and youth in 31 different communities across British Columbia" (Children of the Street, 2017). Every year facilitators are hired to deliver these workshops and the content is frequently developing based on current trends and methods of exploitation used by traffickers. One example noted in the 2017 report was a refocus on grade 4/5 classes, tailoring the workshop to address online apps and exploitation through these apps while helping identify what healthy relationships with others should look like (Children of the Street, 2017).

Another important component of Children of the Street's approach is a tool kit for service providers. Developed with assistance from the Province of British Columbia and the Federal government, the tool kit *Addressing the Human Trafficking of Children and Youth for Sexual Exploitation in BC: A Toolkit for Service Providers* (2017), was created for agencies and individuals working with children and youth in British Columbia. The toolkit helps define human trafficking and works through legislation for the reader. It examines the impacts of trauma on survivors, discusses current and past trafficking cases in the courts, and offers questions that can be asked to help readers identify a trafficked youth. The tool kit also identifies resources and methods of response, including reporting incidents, connecting with law enforcement, and locating and accessing services in the province. A valuable component of the toolkit is the inclusion of an overview of the criminal justice process in British Columbia and how to support youth through the process from investigation, to trial, to post court processes, and long-term services.

What is missing is an Indigenous lens and workshops specific to Indigenous communities. With the scope of the program, and its ability to reach across BC communities, an Indigenous orientated workshop that could reach reserves and isolated First Nations communities could be beneficial in prevention efforts in regard to the trafficking of Indigenous women and girls and may be an effective approach to targeting youth and children.

S.W.O.T Analysis			
Strengths	Weaknesses	Opportunities	Threats
- Focus on public awareness, education programming and family support - Staff travel to communities to present - Programs focused on social media and toxic male behavior - Tool Kit developed for frontline workers	- No Indigenous focused programing	- Public demand towards more culturally appropriate programs - Shifts to better evaluative practices ensure accountability through consistent culturally responsive evaluations	- Secure and consistent funding - Recently taken over by PLEA Community services (in transition)

5.0 Findings - Interviews

The following findings reflect information gleaned from an interview process with ten participants, all working within organizations focused on ending sexual exploitation and human trafficking. Using the interview questions, this chapter highlights the main themes that emerged from the participant's responses. Interviews were carried out with one executive director, one program director, one program coordinator, two program managers and five volunteer/support workers. Although not sought out, it must be noted that the five volunteer/support workers are survivors of human trafficking and sexual exploitation which was brought up by the participants and discussed during their interviews.

1) Please tell me about some of the work your organization is involved with
Key themes include Advocacy – Education – Support

Three overarching themes noted by all ten participants are that of advocacy, education, and support. All participants noted these as key to their organization's work. Education was described in multiple forms with some noting a focus on children and youth as a means of prevention while others noted adults, both Indigenous and non-Indigenous, as key to prevention. The participants that work as volunteers and support workers had all been victims of human trafficking and noted that it was their experiences with support groups and organizations when they were trafficking victims that gave them the desire to pay back to the community and to help others. They all argued it was their experience that enables them to offer positive support in their current positions because survivors are more willing to open up to others. Demonstrating the benefit of peer support from those with past experience, one participant argued:

> Get them the resources they need to know about human trafficking, exploitation and have peer led groups, have a peer, [the] thing we're not doing is using our peers, people like me. I have been there. I have suffered for over 25 years working the street. I can tell you I have suffered but if I can stop my youth, so many young women coming saying I want to help the next generation, we need to start counting on the survivors and have a peer in every organization (Interview #2, January 5, 2019).

Three participants noted advocacy on the community, provincial and federal level as a key component of their organization's work, advocating for more funding, better awareness, and more policy and laws to protect survivors and prosecute offenders. Support work the organizations are involved in ranges from counseling, overnight and long-term care, information, education and training, food and medical care, to help with banking, housing, and basic household tasks.

2) What is/was your role in this organization?
Key themes include Volunteer – Support – Programs

The roles of participants varied from volunteer work and support services, research, funding proposals and outreach, to management of programs and organizations. Those volunteering and working support positions, five out of ten of the participants, were all Indigenous women whom had been trafficked and or had become traffickers and were now working to help support others experiencing sexual exploitation. This knowledge was not known at the time of the interviews but was divulged on behalf of the interviewees during the course of the interviews. All of the participants noted that the organizations they work with focus on a variety of programs targeting children, youth, adults, elders, Indigenous and non-Indigenous peoples, and two-spirit and transgender people. The programs also varied greatly on methods with some focusing on the internet and apps, some on Johns that have been arrested, and one program was focused on male youth in high school and addressing masculine toxicity. Two participants noted advocacy not just for survivors but for structural change as part of their roles. This includes meeting with MPs, MLAs and municipal, provincial and the federal government on behalf of trafficking survivors.

Support offered varied between programs but all volunteers/support workers, the program coordinator, program managers, the program director, and the executive director's roles were part of the programs and worked with survivors in some capacity. Some participants offered immediate shelter and safe spaces for survivors while other's roles were far more structured and focused on long-term support. Long term support included education, training, help with simple things like doing taxes and grocery shopping, healing groups, counseling, and peer support. One participant said that the program she attended and now worked for "offered me an empower you course which was so huge for me, a money management course which I had no tools to, you know, [for] resourcing towards housing…" (Interview #5, March 4, 2019).

3) What is your organization's key strategy to help vulnerable Indigenous women and girls?
Key themes include Listening – Education – Community

Five participants noted the need to support survivors by listening in a non-judgmental way as key to offering help. One participant answered, "Well, I'd say our key strategy is to continue to listen and maybe it's not a strategy but I think it's more of a practice, continuing to listen to the women who knock on our door and tell us what they need and then we try to… advocate one on one as well as advocate for structural change" (Interview #3, January 5, 2019). Three participants discussed the importance of walking with survivors, metaphorically through their eyes, but also in marches, vigils, and rallies.

In regard to peer support workers walking with women on the street, one applicant explained that they saved her, "they walked with me when I was still out there and they walk with me now" (Interview #2,

January 5, 2019). Two participants said people need to really listen to survivors and not just pay lip service. One participant noted that the most important thing for her as a survivor was "knowing I wasn't alone" and that support workers with shared experience helped offer a safe, non-judgmental and supportive space. All she needed was someone to "walk with me and again, that was it, valuing and seeing me and loving me, just as I was, right, because the way people see, value you, you're dehumanized, devalued, so it was key" (Interview #5, March 4, 2019).

Participants all claimed there is a need for an Indigenous lens and an education piece needed when working with Indigenous peoples. Central to an organization's success was acknowledging Canada's long history of colonialization, discrimination and displacement and approaching communities with this understanding. Collaborative efforts with Indigenous communities, being allies, creating lasting relationships, mutual understanding and cultural planning were noted by all of the participants as key to helping end sexual exploitation.

Four of the participants argued that adaptation was also key to their success. As one participant claimed, "we tailor our presentation to that specific community and the risk factors with what's going on there" (Interview #8, May 24, 2019). Their programs have the ability to constantly change according to community needs, and new staffing every year allows for creative opportunities, letting them support the communities while staying relevant as it was also noted that human trafficking and grooming methods are always changing.

4) How has your organization's programming evolved during your time working there? Key themes include Awareness – Cultural – Growth

Organizational growth, not just with staffing but also reach and funding was noted by three participants. All of the participants interviewed claimed their organizations started on a small and often grassroots level with few staff and small funding levels. However, these organizations were now employing many people, offering multiple programs, and receiving much more funding. Participants relate this to an increase in awareness of human trafficking over the last decade.

Awareness of human trafficking was a prominent topic discussed by all of the participants. It was noted by one participant that awareness is helping NGOs evolve to meet cultural needs of Indigenous survivors (Interview #1, November 26, 2018). This awareness has had an impact on state funding available and community support and has led to acknowledgment by Indigenous and non-Indigenous communities that human trafficking is a serious problem and one that must be addressed at local and federal levels. The awareness in Indigenous communities has opened up opportunities for NGOs to work with them by invitation where previously Indigenous communities were not included in programing discussions. Four participants argued this has also encouraged more culturally relevant approaches to Indigenous peoples seeking support and communities with Indigenous specific education workshops being developed and administered.

The development of cultural sensitivity has been a prominent evolution in the organization's all participants work in. The volunteer/support workers noted the use of ceremony, smudges, and cultural

services such as food, décor and practices as extremely effective and important in helping survivors and that it's use has become far more prominent in the last few years. One participant noted the importance of cultural inclusion in services saying that when she was exploited and sought out help before becoming a support worker:

> …cultural services wasn't even an option for me, it wasn't offered. Well, I wasn't willing to look at it because I didn't see it helping anybody else and I grew up and everyone said it was bad and it was like, not good for me. Like I grew up that way, but then realizing now that's what saved my life… I remember actually some programing having that option, but I don't know, maybe I just needed somebody to say "here lets smudge, let's go to ceremony…" that was pivotal to… me finding myself and getting to where I am at today. (Interview #6, March 4, 2019).

Also noted by one participant was a move from reactive programing to preventative work. Three of the participants work in schools and communities offering programs to educate children and youth on what exploitation, grooming and unhealthy relationships look like. Two participants claimed preventative programing has developed in regard to internet and app use among children and youth as it has become a main tool for traffickers trying to engage with potential survivors.

5) Have you identified gaps in your services and how would you improve on them? Key themes include Funding – Staffing – Training – Cultural

Funding was the overarching theme in the responses. Funding concerns center around staffing, the ability to train support workers, develop and present workshops, and to support survivors. Participants noted the start and stop funding cycles as a gap that can have a profound impact on organizations including staffing and programming. One participant claimed "Well I think I could say there's always gaps in service and there's always [the] challenge of what can be called the start, stop of funding cycles, so this is not a unique story... it's that for many non-profits but probably especially smaller one[s] more so" (Interview #3, Jan 5, 2019).

Three participants argued that funding cycles should be longer, over 3 years and that they should not be politicized, meaning regardless of elections and new incoming governments, the funding should remain consistent and secure. One participant claimed that "…in Canada we need to ensure that sexual exploitation and sex trafficking is always on our national table and is seen as a priority issue and not a partisan issue" (Interview #3, January 5, 2019).

Housing was a gap mentioned by two participants. More housing that is culturally relevant and supportive was noted as key to transitioning women. One participant argued that "Housing is really a huge gap… we have no housing for anybody, it just seems housing has so much stipulations on them and we need more housing meeting you where you are at your time and more harm reduction housing" (Interview #2, January 5, 2019). "At your time" refers to where the girl or woman is in their healing journey; whether they are considering getting help, struggling to get clean and in and out of housing, or they are fully committed and clean.

Support gaps noted include the need for more cultural awareness training and inclusion in organizational programing. Of concern with three participants was a general lack of knowledge of the history of colonization, residential schools and the sixties scoop, and that it would be beneficial to offer frontline workers and organizational staff training on these subjects. A participant described the problem with a lack of safe cultural space for Indigenous women saying "I get frustrated that we are a city, with such big money and yet, we have very little places that women can go that are re-traumatized or not valued when they want to speak…"(Interview #5, March 4, 2019).

One clear positive action NGOs are having, as noted by four participants, was that they have peer supports; women that have also experienced sexual exploitation and human trafficking, and they let women and girls know that they are not on their own and that help is out there. One participant said that what saved her was, "Knowing I wasn't alone. That was the main thing like, I went to numerous… supportive environments… they came at with me in a non-judgmental way and they came at me with a harm reduction output that I never got anywhere else" (Interview #6, March 4, 2019). Another participant claimed that in regard to successful programs:

> Peer support guidance would be pivotal because, like I said, I never had that, someone to look up to or someone to help me because I had the workers, amazing, amazing, amazing workers, but when it came to the shit, they've never been through it so why the fuck would I take their words right? (Interview #6, March 4, 2019).

6) In your role do you or your organization partner with Indigenous communities, the province, and or the government of Canada, in preventing sexualized violence and human trafficking? What does this look like? Key themes include Police – Canada – Communities

All ten participants noted that their organizations partner with provinces, Canada, police, Indigenous communities and with municipalities. Several participants said that NGOs know of each other and reach out to one another when in need of help or contacts. Organizations also reach out to MPs and MLAs to advocate for human trafficking survivors in support of new programing initiatives, justice reform, or policy changes. All participants noted that when partnering with Indigenous communities it is by invite from the communities.

In regard to collaboration and working with Indigenous communities, four participants explained the need to avoid a paternal approach. Contact must be by invitation and customs and protocols must be understood and followed. The NGOs cannot act as saviours but must come to communities seeking to facilitate the communities desired approach. One participant argued:

> The Indigenous communities have different protocols and there are different ways of doing things. So, whoever I guess is organizing those types of gatherings, of sharing circles, they have to be very in-tuned to the communities that they are working with and very, you know, go with a very sensitive non-cookie cutter approach which means you have to get out and talk to the community and basically get a sense from the community what they want (Interview #4, February 4, 2019).

7) What do you believe is working and not working with current government efforts? How do you think they can create positive change? Key themes include Funding – Media – Sharing Stories

Funding was noted by five of ten participants as not working and not sufficient enough to meet current needs for anti-trafficking programs and that NGOs often compete with each other for funding. Specifically, two participants noted funding cycles as a concern as well as short turnarounds on calls for proposals for funding. The funding cycles were described as one to three years with calls for proposals often being announced shortly before the deadline for submission. One participant claimed in regard to funding that:

> If you're lucky you get 3 years and I believe you need minimum 3 years to learn anything. …but I think to truly bring about good effective change and good programing we need a ten-year funding cycle. As an executive director I would welcome that (Interview #3, January 5, 2019).

Discussing the amount of funding available and competition among NGOs to obtain funding, a participant argued:

> My boss is always writing, thinking, "I wish it would just stop and have a pot of money", we are so busy fighting over the same pot… we're all trying to fight and invent something new. We're so busy finding new words, new things to get more funding that we're really not getting to the purpose, the issue of human trafficking. It's not political. Human trafficking is not political and every time we get someone new in government, we have to fight for new funding again, right? (Interview #2, January 5, 2019).

Two participants noted the difficulty some smaller organizations and Indigenous communities can have in filling out the funding requests as they can be cumbersome, difficult, and act as a barrier. Training for these groups on how to fill out proposal templates and respond to funding calls was suggested. Media was another common theme. Four participants noted a lack of commercials on TV and the internet about human trafficking. Participants want to see more media on prevention but also on trafficking cases, so the public can be made more aware that human trafficking is a Canadian problem. As one participant claimed, "This type of activity sees no borders… People across the world [see] there's a way to make money and exploit someone. They move them around. It's called the circuit. It's Toronto, Vancouver, Las Vegas, New York, Chicago, Miami" (Interview #4, February 4, 2019).

The need to share stories and of safe spaces to share stories was noted by two participants. It was suggested that government start looking at ways of providing opportunities for people to share their stories in a safe culturally appropriate space. One participant said that "we all have to decolonize our minds, even the non-indigenous population, right? We really have to cleanse ourselves of that way of thinking," further suggesting that story sharing is a vital part of healing (Interview #4, February 4, 2019). The process, the participant claimed, should be:

> …non-colonial… because the minute that… community members feel that it's too structured and too formal, that scares people off because it reminds them of the institutionalized processes that can bring up a lot of painful experiences like residential school and being put into care and all of those things being institutionalized in any way. (Interview #4, February 4, 2019).

All ten participants noted that public awareness about human trafficking of Indigenous peoples was growing. They claimed and that government efforts to address human trafficking were increasing. Two participants argued the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, acceptance of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, and ongoing efforts in reconciliation were all positive changes the government is undertaking.

8) In your experience, where does the path to exploitation start, and what is the best way to stop it? Key themes include Relationships – Colonialization – Education

Canada's history of colonialization and the impact of displacement, residential schools, the sixties scoop, discriminatory policies, and racism were prominent responses to this question. It was argued that this history resulted in intergenerational trauma, substance abuse, lost generations, and families prevented from caring for their children or themselves. From this came the theme of relationships and how this history has caused generations of unhealthy relationships and families. One participant claimed:

> …our kids are not understanding unhealthy relationships. So, we need to do more work on showing what good relationships look like, mother father relationships, what a mom, and mom relationship looks like, because the relationships are so broken with Indigenous people. So, we grow up and never really see what a good relationship looks like and then when you finally get to it, you're already 40-50 years old and [have] gone through so much shit. You're so worn out. So, if we can teach our kids younger what healthy relationships are, I think we will succeed a lot further… (Interview #2, January 5, 2019).

All ten participants argue that intergenerational trauma, including sexual, physical, and emotional abuse and addictions, lead to familial exploitation and trafficking and to children and youth falling victim to trafficking. One participant highlighted how trauma is passed on, saying:

> My path started with family, that's Familia exploitation… starts from very young… we just have to educate [children] as young as possible. Your uncle can't, you know, touch you for a drink, or your aunt, because we always think sexual exploitation and human trafficking is about strangers but it's not. It's always somebody we know right? (Interview #2, January 5, 2019).

Education and a lack of social media awareness were also noted by five participants as part of the path to exploitation. One participant claimed:

> These kids are getting access to the internet from… grade four now and parents don't even understand they're giving them access to the whole world and then, you know, at their

> fingertips and they're not having discussions with them on what the dangers are. They're not monitoring them, and I think that's a huge risk of exploitation… (Interview #7, April 26, 2019).

All ten participants discussed the importance of learning how to use social media appropriately as this was a direct path to exploitation.

The best way to help fix the problem of human trafficking noted by several participants was to invest in Indigenous communities. This investment comes from listening and offering requested support and funding. Addressing poverty and housing was noted by two participants as key as poverty was discussed as a pathway to exploitation. Finally, three participants noted the need for healing support, counseling supports, and helping Indigenous communities heal. A participant offered that part of the healing process and stopping the pain and exploitation is by "…forgiving our parents… so we can forgive ourselves and we can move forward with our children…" (Interview #2, January 5, 2019).

6.0 Discussion and Analysis

The purpose of this section is the interpretation of results presented in the findings section and an examination on how they speak to arguments discussed in the literature review to answer the project research question "*How can the Federal government best assist Indigenous women and girls transitioning from small Indigenous communities to off reserve living while supporting them to build awareness of the potential dangers of human trafficking in urban centers?"* Using four key themes from the findings and literature review, the chapter will answer the research question while discussing the implications of the research.

6.1 Answering the Research Question

The findings reveal that answers to the research question are multifaceted and that issues around human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls is a complex problem. There is no single tactic the Federal government can take that will better support Indigenous women and girls. However, the findings do identify multiple approaches that could have a significant impact on efforts to end human trafficking. This can come by directing funding to Indigenous supported efforts, conducting rigorous evaluations of state funded programs, supporting Indigenous directed education and awareness efforts, strengthening internet and social media laws and legislation to prevent sexual exploitation, and by ensuring non-partisan secure long-term funding. However, approaches to investing in Indigenous communities, evaluations, social media, and the roles of men were the four prominent themes identified in the research that may lead to positive, transformative change.

6.2 Implications of findings

Investing in Indigenous Communities, Women and Girls

Community investment and the creation of Indigenous driven research, policies, programming, funding, and outreach is vital to attaining positive outcomes in the fight against human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls. The findings from the literature review and the interviews are conclusive, that Indigenous-driven efforts are needed. The status-quo has been as such: Government sees a problem, government organizes research and analysis, decides on what it deems will be the best approach to a solution, and then moves forward. The problem with this is the exclusion of voices from communities and survivors of sexual exploitation that would ensure a rich and fulsome approach guided by Indigenous wise practices that the state could never hope to understand without these voices. Sexual exploitation is not something new to Indigenous communities and as noted in the literature (Snyder, 2015, p. 594) and by an interview participant, it has occurred for thousands of years, long before colonial contact. Who better then to develop strategies and practices than the community itself, guiding state efforts?

Part of this work must include an Indigenous Gender Based Analysis Plus (IGBA+) approach. The federal and many provincial governments now include a Gender Based Analysis Plus (GBA+) framework from which all work should be approached through. The BC Provincial government for example demands all policy work, treasury board and cabinet submissions use a GBA+ lens when being developed. Natalie Clark (2016) argues we must go a step further, challenging conventional intersectionality to include Indigenous resistance, sovereignty/nationhood, and anti-colonialism responses (p. 50). She voices a need for "a more complex understanding of policy and programming as it affects Indigenous girls" (p. 50).

In order for government to successfully incorporate IGBA+, the Indigenous experience and the impacts of that experience must be considered in all government and organizational work. IGBA+ takes GBA+ and works through it using an Indigenous lens, recognizing intersectionality with Indigenous communities and peoples and how to approach GBA+ through a culturally safe and inclusive means. More than this, Clark (2016) argues it must recognize:

> …the importance of local and traditional tribal/nation teachings, and the inter-generational connection between the past and present, while also recognizing the emergent diversity of Indigenous girlhood and the geographic movement off and on reserve, and the construction of Indigenous girls through the Indian Act (p. 51).

This necessitates "listening" to Indigenous peoples, communities and trafficking survivors, noted by the literature and all of the interview participants as vital to the success of any state efforts. The findings are clear that assumptions and stereotypes have shaped and been shaped by government policies and public perceptions. An IGBA+ approach, one that "…does not perpetuate narratives of risk located within Indigenous girls and their families and communities" and that steps away from colonial images of Indigenous women and girls is an important step towards fulfilling promises of reconciliation and ending sexual exploitation and human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls (Clark, 2016, p. 51).

Weak Evaluation Practices

The findings from the literature review and interviews point to a serious issue around evaluation for anti-human trafficking programs. The findings show that programs are not evaluated rigorously, if at all. An interview participant supported this, arguing that not only were evaluations not occurring but that based on funding cycles NGOs are bound by, it makes rigorous evaluation difficult as three years or more of work is necessary in order to get a fulsome evaluation of a program and to determine its success, needs, and efficiency. This results in programs that may not have the desired positive impacts intended, in fact, as noted in the literature it may have the opposite effect and further marginalize those it aims to help.

Short funding cycles also make it difficult for NGOs to maintain staff, program for the future and evaluate their work. This can have an impact on relationships with communities and survivors if funding and programing stops or is intermittent. Consistent, secure, non-partisan support is needed. Change of governments should not impact funding and programs because, as an interview participant claimed, governments must ensure "…sexual exploitation and sex trafficking is always on our national table and is seen as a priority issue and not a partisan issue" (Interview #3, January 5, 2019).

Understanding the Power of Social Media

Social media and its use as a tool of traffickers to identify, groom and traffic Indigenous women and girls, stood out in the research as the most important area needing further research, programming, education, and attention. Louie (2017) argues social media is facilitating recruitment by traffickers, especially in small remote communities (p.97). Further, he argues social media is the largest contributor to recruitment and very effective at luring women and girls to cities (Louie, 2017, p. 97). The evidence from the interviews and literature review is undeniable, identifying social media as a problem and that internet and social media use with women and girls has become a main tool of sexual exploiters.

Lack of social media awareness stands out in the research as an area needing focus, one in which several NGOs such as Children of the Street are targeting through social media classes and presentations that go into schools to address concerns around social media use. This "lack" of awareness refers to women and girls not historically experiencing what healthy relationships look like, how social media is used by sexual predators to groom women and girls, and how to protect themselves from online human traffickers and exploitation. The findings show that intergenerational trauma has led to broken families and skewed views of healthy relationships as described by one interview participant who said that:

> …being a first nations sixties scoop kid, my parents were res [sic] school survivors… and their parents were residential survivors and had generational trauma that has been handed down, and abuse and addiction, right, and it just keeps generating and messing up relationships… there was no intimacy, no love (Interview #5, March 4, 2019).

Intergenerational trauma and unhealthy concepts of relationships has made manipulation, especially through social media, a very powerful tactic to groom women and girls seeking relationships, attention

and belonging. Healing and community investment will have a big impact on traffickers' ability to lure women and girls. Toxic behaviours that traffickers embody often stem from previous trauma and unhealthy relationships as well. Strong and informed Indigenous communities will be far more successful than the state in addressing human trafficking and toxic behavior while supporting their members.

The Roles of Men

It is important to acknowledge how the roles of men in discussions around human trafficking have not been sufficiently problematized. Although focus on anti-human trafficking efforts is preventative and reactionary, it slants towards survivors. Often disregarded is the role of men who fuel the market for human trafficking by paying for experiences with trafficked women and girls. Based on statistics (see Appendix 3) gathered through the Sex Trade Offender Program in Edmonton, Alberta, we know that the average male john is middle aged, educated, middle class, in a relationship, and has children (2016, CEASE: Prostitution Offender Program – Who are the johns?). However, from the findings and interviews we also know that some men who exploit Indigenous women and girls have been exploited in the past as well.

One interview participant who worked with the offender program noted that:

> …working with over 3000 men now, what I see, I have learned some of the men sitting in that room do have childhoods similar to many of the women who come speak at the program. However, because of our patriarchal culture… the men acted out their childhood pain by becoming exploiters whereas often the women became… vulnerable to being exploited (Interview #3, January 5, 2019).

Change will come from both acknowledging and supporting those men with past trauma, but by also addressing their toxic behavior that exploits and traumatizes vulnerable Indigenous women and girls. One interview participant works directly with men who exploited women and girls. She argued:

> I'm not there to brow beet you or embarrass you, my goal is to educate you. I can't change my past, all I can do is move forward and hope that you understand that the damage you're causing yourself, your wife and the Indigenous women and the trauma that you're causing us moving forward. We're not there for the joy of sex... does paying for it really give you permission? Paying for it, is that consent, right? (Interview #2, January 5, 2019).

The findings support the need for further education and programing for men and boys, both to gain knowledge about what exploitation looks like and how harmful it is, but also to develop empathy and a better understanding of how their actions may be damaging to women and girls both physically and mentally. Children of the Street has a program that does just this. One interview participant described the coed program called Redefined Manhood as:

> … a workshop that's about hour and fifteen minutes where I talk to youth from ages 13-18 about the role that men play in sexual violence. We ended up finding that conversations were more productive when it was a coed class, we found this is an issue that many girls in our classes and people that are even non-binary are already talking about and interested in wanting to talk more about. And discussions come out of that. We get some of the guys to be more open to discussing, and it kind of brought out that empathy piece for a lot of guys because we had some students who would talk about their own experiences with it which I think ultimately made this issue more real for them (Interview #8, May 24, 2019).

Acknowledging the role of men and addressing toxic behavior and where that behavior comes from must be a focus of future government funding and programing. With the rise of social media and tools for traffickers to groom girls, with industry developing near Indigenous communities and work (man) camps being built to supply labour, and with toxic masculinity an ongoing problem in schools, workplaces and the public, targeting men and boys with programming and information on these issues is key to human trafficking prevention and transformative change.

6.3 Project Limitations and Delimitations

The literature review and findings make it clear that more research and additional resources are needed on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls across the board, including from academia, NGOs, law enforcement and all levels of government. In addition, there is a need for more expansive research on human trafficking of Indigenous peoples; women, men, girls, boys, and LGBTQ2P+. At the request of the client and due to time and scope, this report focuses solely on Indigenous women and girls, but they are only a part of the picture. The findings note the need to examine the stories and lived experiences of all exploited Indigenous peoples and the systems that allow and perpetuate exploitative practices. Everything is interconnected and understanding how the different experiences of men, women, boys, girls, and those who identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, questioning, two-spirit, and pansexual can only add voices to the conversation, ensuring more robust and rich research and findings. Although this project's focus was on Indigenous women and girls, two-spirit and Indigenous men and boys are also overrepresented in cases of sexual exploitation and human trafficking and an important part of the story where more research is needed.

Another limitation of this report is the small number of interview participants. The research would have benefited from a much larger and wider range of NGO participants across Canada. Different regions have different experiences and problems with trafficking. One example is Newfoundland and the Newfoundland Coalition Against Human Trafficking (NLCAHT) in comparison to Alberta. As a major shipping and port province, NLCAHT's focus is in international trafficking of humans, organs, and labour where Alberta's CEASE in a landlocked province is more concerned with domestic human trafficking. Being able to interview not only staff at NGOs across Canada, but police, frontline workers, government staff, and human trafficking survivors would make for far richer findings and research material. Finally, the inclusion of johns and human traffickers as participants in the research interviews would be invaluable as they are the suppliers and customers of human trafficking.

A barrier encountered was the researchers own identity as a white male and the potential discomfort of a non-Indigenous male interviewing Indigenous women on possibly triggering subjects. The intent of the interviews was to identify frontline workers and management in NGOs working in anti-human trafficking and sexual exploitation organizations. However, the researcher had not considered that many of the participants were in their field of work because of past experiences with exploitation. Although personal experience questions were not asked, some interviewees used the interview as an opportunity to share their stories. Cognizant of the strength needed and importance of having their voices heard, the researcher listened to their experiences without probing and or judgment and much of what was discussed was not used in this research project due to personal privacy and parameters of the research questions and report. Had a more appropriate individual such as an Indigenous woman conducted the interviews, there was the potential for more probing questions, and more fulsome and rich information for this report may have been attainable.

7.0 Options and Recommendations

The purpose of this chapter is to outline options and recommendations for the client on the best path forward for addressing human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada. The recommendations are ordered in terms of timeframe for implementation, immediate and on-going. Immediate refers to options that should begin immediately with a planned completion within 12 months. On-going refers to processes that have already begun and that should continue indefinitely.

Five key options are being considered based on critical analysis of the report's findings:

1. Status quo: Continue with current efforts;
2. Engage with the provinces and territories to strengthen communities through an increased effort towards self-governance;
3. Focus funding and Calls for Proposals on social media education programming;
4. Shift Jurisdiction of Child Welfare Systems to Indigenous Communities; and
5. Mandate that external evaluations take place as part of funding agreements on human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls' programs.

These options are informed by the findings from the literature review, program review, and interviews. The factors that influenced the choice of these options are:

- What actions were identified by both the literature and interview participants as the most pressing need?
- What actions will have the largest overall impact on anti-human trafficking efforts based on the findings?
- What was missing from programming efforts?

It is important to note that there are a multitude of steps that could be taken noted in the findings and by interview participants, many intersecting, that would have a positive impact. However, the options chosen

will have the largest impact with the hope that these changes will have trickle down effects on other areas for addressing anti-trafficking efforts.

7.1 Options

Option 1: Status quo - continue with current efforts

Data collection for this report was completed in 2018. From 2018 to 2020 there has been many positive developments with anti-trafficking efforts, research and data collection. The Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls Final Report released on June 3, 2019 was an important step forward in recognizing the scale of violence against Indigenous women and girls across Canada. The report links human trafficking to high rates of violence against Indigenous women and girls which intersects with a history of colonialism and systemic racism in Canada. Further, the information adds to and affirms the main findings in this report. Canada's *National Strategy to Combat Human Trafficking 2019-2024* builds on past federal efforts and the MMIWG report with a focus on "empowerment, to enhance support and services to victims and survivors of human trafficking" (National Strategy, 2019). The strategy also includes measures to increase public awareness, education and capacity building (National Strategy, 2019).

The new National Strategy touches on much of what this reports finding's note as deficiencies such as Canada-wide awareness of human trafficking, deficient data collection, funding and capacity. Option one allows the federal government to continue on its current path with a prescribed National Strategy to 2024 in place that while likely have a positive impact on anti-human trafficking efforts across Canada. However, much of what is in place and being improved on is based on a lack of data, a colonial perspective, and one that does not go far enough in recognizing the importance and value of strengthened Indigenous self-governance and control of anti-trafficking efforts in their communities.

Option 2: Focus on investing in communities through self-governance and jurisdictional control

Investing in communities refers to steps taken to acknowledge the power they have to protect themselves and to address human trafficking how they best see fit. This includes increased and secured funding for communities and community led programs and further work towards self-governance for Indigenous communities. Legislation such as the *United Nations Declaration on Indigenous Peoples Act* in British Columbia affirms the application of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP) in BC and requires that Indigenous people are included in all decision making. This is an important step in ensuring Indigenous communities have a voice and that the state listens. Nationwide, provinces and territories must affirm the application of UNDRIP into all aspects of governance. The recognition of Indigenous groups as governing authorities equipped with the capacity and a millennium of culture, customs and laws, able to govern themselves will lead to positive change.

As noted in the findings, Indigenous communities are best situated to confront human trafficking on a local level. Programs such as Children of the Street's workshops that go into communities to give members information and raise awareness are important, but what is really required is communities developing or co-developing those efforts. Over a century of outside intervention has only caused

complications. It is time for the state and NGOs to step back and to offer support and funding through invitation and collaborative efforts.

More nuanced approaches to anti-trafficking efforts are needed and invigorating self-governance and transferring jurisdictional control will be a novel move forward. One such approach noted in the findings is working with Indigenous communities to support and implement traditional judicial processes. Sikka (2009) notes that allowing trafficking survivors a voice in judicial processes and communities stronger capacity, is an important step (p. 25). Snyder (2015) goes further, arguing that acknowledging and implementing Indigenous law will give back traditional judicial power to communities. Indigenous communities have dealt internally with sexual exploitation and violence for generations before Europeans first stepped onto Turtle Island (2015, p. 594). We must acknowledge that their own teachings, stories and culture may not only be a superior approach to anti-trafficking efforts but may offer solutions the state cannot fathom.

Option 3: Increase funding and Calls for Proposals for social media education programming

The findings point to the proliferation of social media-based apps and websites as a conduit for exploitive practices and grooming of potential survivors including men, women and children. Indigenous peoples can be an easier target for traffickers due to their often-isolated communities and social media is a means to bridge isolation. All of the interview participants noted social media as a tool that human traffickers use to lure Indigenous women and girls and Louie's (2017) findings support this claim. His findings show that social media is the leading contributor to recruitment into sexually exploitive activities and the best tool for traffickers wanting to lure Indigenous women and girls into sexually exploitive situations (Louie, 2017, p. 97). The difficulty is that social media is a powerful tool to help strengthen communities, but it is also the easiest way for human traffickers to gain access to the women and girls in their communities.

A solution to addressing the rising use of social media as a trafficking tool was raised by five of the interview participants, that of education in schools and for communities. Expanding funding for programs in and outside of Indigenous communities, programs run by and or coordinated with Indigenous peoples, will have a positive impact on community awareness. This awareness will come with the community understanding how traffickers use social media, with the ability to identify red flags to look for with children, youth and young adults using social media, and with being confident in how to protect one's privacy. These programs exist in some capacity such as Children of the Street's Taking Care of Ourselves (TCO2) discussed on p. 35. Encouraging more programs like the TCO2 across Canada through directed funding will have an immense impact on communities, women, and girl's knowledge of sexual exploitation tactics and methods.

Option 4: Shift jurisdiction of child welfare systems to Indigenous communities

The foster care and child welfare system across Canada perpetuates the loss of languages, cultural identity, and the agency of Indigenous communities. Shifting jurisdictional control of childcare to Indigenous communities enables them to use Indigenous methods, cultural teachings, and traditional laws to address child welfare in a culturally appropriate way. The removal of children from Indigenous

families for over a century was enacted as a tool of assimilation and is still viewed that way by Indigenous communities. An option to move family and child services jurisdictional control over to Indigenous communities will have a wide-ranging and positive impact and demonstrate efforts of true reconciliation.

Work to transition control over child services and children in care to Indigenous communities is under way thanks to Federal Bill C-92, *An Act respecting First Nations, Inuit and Métis children, youth and families* (Government of Canada, Bill C-92, 2019). This bill enshrines into law the recognition of jurisdiction over child and family services while addressing the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada's action #4 calling on the state to enact child-welfare legislation (Government of Canada, Bill C-92, 2019). The bill was co-developed with Indigenous, provincial and territorial partners and the act:

- affirms the rights of First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples to exercise jurisdiction over child and family services;
- establishes national principles such as the best interests of the child, cultural continuity and substantive equality;
- contributes to the implementation of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples; and
- provides an opportunity for Indigenous peoples to choose their own solutions for their children and families (Government of Canada, Bill C-92, 2019).

By shifting jurisdictional control, the state further strengthens Indigenous communities. Over a century of child welfare control out of the hands of Indigenous communities has been a failure and Bill C-92 is a positive step towards reconciliation. It will be important for all levels of government to facilitate this shift and the federal government should move forward with provincial and territorial governments in support of comprehensive reform of child welfare services (Government of Canada, Bill C-92, 2019).

Option 5: Mandate evaluations for all program funding

The findings uncovered a severe lack of evaluations of state and NGO anti-human trafficking programs and efforts. Shalit et al., (2014) note overriding concern, that current ideas of human trafficking and programming relies on rhetoric rather than evidence (p. 387). This is not just a problem in Canada but is a worldwide issue. Davy, in her 2016 work *Anti-Human Trafficking Interventions: How Do We Know They Are Working?* argues most early 2000s programs were not evaluated (p. 487). However, programs have continued on and new one's have developed that function with little critical evidence to support their impacts.

The Family Violence Protection Program should make program evaluation mandatory with funding. Programs must be evaluated as they may not be offering their intended support and may in fact be hindering anti-human trafficking efforts. As noted by United Nations Council for Economic and Social Development, a basic principle underpinning the prevention of crimes is the "application of research and evaluation findings in the development and implementation of strategies to reduce the problem" (Davy,

2016, p. 490). Further, a review of human trafficking programs by Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) confirmed that insufficient evaluation was occurring and that poor evaluations are decreasing the effectiveness of anti-human trafficking responses and progress (Davy, 2016, p. 492).

It is not reasonable that programs exist and are funded that are not critically evaluated. By ensuring federally funded programs are rigorously evaluated externally for efficiency, relevance and success, the state can safeguard Indigenous survivors from further marginalization from programs meant to support them. This may require extra funding to cover the cost of external evaluation, to be included in funding proposals, however, the cost is well worth it to ensure the programs are effective.

7.2 Recommendations

It is recommended that the following options be actioned:

Option 2: Focus on investing in communities through self-governance and jurisdictional control
Option 3: Increase funding and Calls for Proposals for social media education programming
Option 4: Shift jurisdiction of child welfare systems to Indigenous communities
Option 5: Mandate evaluations for all program funding

Immediate Actions

Options 3 and 5: These options work in conjunction with one another. It is recommended that the federal government increase funding across the board for anti-human tracking programming, with a focus on social media education programing in communities, schools and high schools. With this, program evaluation should be made mandatory for all funded programs in order to secure subsequent funding. There needs to be accountability on part of Canada regardless of the political party in power or current politics. As noted in the literature and by interview participants, funding should be secured for 3 to 5-year periods in order to allow NGOs the capacity and space to evaluate and develop their programing. Current funding has been noted in the findings as inadequate and funding cycles too short. These two options do not require legislative changes but option 3 may require policy work and treasury board submissions in order to allocate or increase funding. Option 5 can be worked into proposal guidelines and funding contracts.

Ongoing Actions

Options 2 and 4. Recent actions from all levels of government including UNDRIP legislation from British Columbia and Bill C-92 from the federal government demonstrate that these options are already happening. It is recommended that the federal government engage provincial and territorial governments to strengthen commitments to truth and reconciliation and work to further shift jurisdictional control over all aspects of life in Indigenous communities. The expanding impact of this will invariably work to prevent human trafficking and sexual exploitation of Indigenous women and girls. The Indian Act is an important consideration for option 2 and 4 as it sets out the federal government as a fiduciary. The Act

legally governs Indigenous communities across Canada; however, it is also an obstacle to self-governance and self-determination as colonial law has been used to control and marginalize Indigenous peoples. Although beyond the scope of this paper, the Act's dismantling will coexist with ongoing efforts and legal agreements across the country to transition governance and jurisdictional control over all aspects of Indigenous life from the state to Indigenous communities (*Indian Act*, R.S.C., 1985, c I-5).

8.0 Conclusion

Human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls has a long history in Canada with slow progress in anti-human trafficking efforts occurring. The reasons human trafficking still exists are numerous and include centuries of systemic racism, government policies such as residential schools and the sixties scoop, and racist media portrayals and images of Indigenous women and girls as other, as savages needing saving, as survivors needing white saviours, and as responsible for any and all exploitation they experience. Canada has made efforts to raise support services for Indigenous survivors of human trafficking since the early 2000s including policy and legislation, criminal code additions and amendments, frontline training, and program funding. However, human trafficking is still prevalent. So how then can the FVPP best assist Indigenous women and girls transitioning from small Indigenous communities to off reserve living while supporting them to build awareness of the potential dangers of human trafficking in urban centers?

The findings describe areas where increased focus will have a positive impact on human trafficking prevention, namely expanding social media awareness and monitoring, increased secured funding for programs, a shift of child welfare jurisdiction to Indigenous communities, and mandated program evaluations. However, a focus on investing in Indigenous communities through a continued transition of jurisdictional controls over all aspects of Indigenous life will have the largest overall impact, allowing communities to use culturally appropriate and traditional ways of being to work on anti-human trafficking efforts. This is beyond the capacity of the FVPP, but as a component of the federal government, the FVPP can work towards funding programs that strengthen Indigenous communities. Further, the findings note that pushing for programming that focuses on social media education programming and on the roles of men in exploitative practices will have a positive impact on human trafficking and exploitation education and awareness.

The size and scope of this report is a limitation as the subject of human trafficking of Indigenous women and girls is interwoven within government policies, education systems, childcare systems, health and mental health systems, resource extraction and development, media, policing, and the judicial system to name a few. Research on the role of law enforcement and the RCMP on the lived experiences of Indigenous women and girls is an area that will benefit human trafficking prevention efforts. As noted by the MMIW Final Report (2019) "policing was established as another institution – like marriage – that worked to exert colonial control over Indigenous women and gender-diverse people through negatively transforming relationships between the genders, by intervening in intimate aspects of women's lives, by enabling sexual abuse..." (p. 257).

Moreover, the roles of men in human trafficking and sexual exploitation must be further examined. Males take on the roles of Johns, traffickers and in many cases survivors of sexual exploitation. Their voices and engagement in preventative efforts will add more context, depth and fullness to anti-human trafficking efforts. Likewise, engaging all non-Indigenous Canadians through awareness, education and media that supports survivors rather than systems of racism will bring this discussion to tables across the country. Human trafficking is not a conversation most Canadians are discussing, and this must change.

The findings from this report will add to current and ongoing research and efforts in human trafficking prevention, identifying a path forward for the Family Violence Protection Program, Canada and all levels of government, but there is a much larger underlying picture of systemic racism in Canada. Current developments with the Black Lives Matter movement and attention being brought to racism in policing in North America is fueling a new civil rights movement that includes Indigenous voices. Acknowledgement by Prime Minister Justin Trudeau and Royal Canadian Mounted Police Commissioner Brenda Lucki, that systemic racism exists in our federal institutions, and the subsequent backlash from portions of the public and RCMP members to this acknowledgement, demonstrates that there is still difficult work ahead. Systemic change is needed, but the recommendations of this report will offer little wins in efforts to end human trafficking and to assist Indigenous women and girls, wins that are worth pursuing.

9.0 References and Appendices

9.1 References

Cease, (2015). Center to End all Sexual Exploitation. Retrieved from http://www.ceasenow.org

Cease, (2016). Prostitution Offender Program 2016 – Who are the johns? Retrieved from http://www.ceasenow.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/2016-POP-Report-Copyright-COLOUR.pdf

Clark, N. (2026). Red Intersectionality and violence-informed witnessing praxis with indigenous girls. *Girlhood Studies*, 9(2), 46.

Covenant House, 2018. Sex Trafficking. Retrieved from https://www.covenanthousetoronto.ca/homeless-youth/Sex-Trafficking

Covenant House, Sept 22, 2016. Video provides look into new housing for trafficked victims. Retrieved from https://www.covenanthousetoronto.ca/homeless-youth/New-Housing-for-Trafficked-Victims-Video

Criminal Code, *RSC* 1985, c. C-46, s. 279.01.

Davy, D. (2016). Anti-human trafficking interventions: How do we know if they are working? American *Journal of Evaluation, 37*(4), 486-504.

Dyck, Jannelle, and Kev Lescisin. Addressing the Trafficking of Children and Youth for Sexual Exploitation in BC: A Toolkit for Service Providers. *Children of the Street Society*, 2017.

Government of Canada. (2012). *National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking. Public Safety Canada*. Retrieved from https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrcs/pblctns/ntnl-ctn-pln-cmbt/ntnl-ctn-pln-cmbt-eng.pdf

Government of Canada. (June 6, 2012). *News Release: The Harper Government Launches Canada's National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking*. Ottawa, Ontario.

Government of Canada. (2017). What is GBA+. *Status of Women Canada*. Retrieved from https://www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/gba-acs/index-en.html

Government of Canada. (2019). Bill C-92.

Grant, Tavia. (2016, February). Missing and Murdered: The Trafficked. Globe and Mail. Retrieved from https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/the-trafficked-sexual-exploitation-is costing-canadian-women-their-lives/article28700849/

Grant, Tavia. (2016, July 01). "Ontario reveals anti-trafficking plan: Strategy will prioritize indigenous women and girls, who comprise about a quarter of all cases according to Covenant house." *Globe and Mail*. Retrieved from http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/canada-continues-to-be-a-source-for-sex-trafficking-annual-report/article30700484/

HRBA Portal. (2018). Retrieved from https://hrbaportal.undg.org

Hunt, Sarah. (2010). Colonial Roots, contemporary risk factors: A cautionary exploration of the domestic trafficking of Aboriginal girls I British Columbia, Canada. *Alliance News*, 33, 27-31.

Hunt, Sarah. (2015/2016). Representing colonial violence: Trafficking, sex work, and the violence of law. *Atlantis: Critical Studies in Gender, Culture & Social Justice, 37*(2).

Johnson, R. B., Onwuegbuzie, A. J., & Turner, L. A. (2007). Toward a Definition of Mixed Methods Research. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, *1*(2), 112–133.

Louie, Dustin William. (2017). Social Media and the Sexual Exploitation of indigenous Girls. *Girlhood Studies*, 10(2): 97-113.

Louie, D. (2018). Sexual exploitation prevention education for indigenous girls. Canadian Journal of Education, 41(2), Retrieved from http://search.proquest.com.ezproxy.library.uvic.ca/docview/2076267657?accountid=14846

Malone, Kelly Geraldine. (2018). *Current child welfare system doesn't work for Indigenous kids: former B.C. advocate*. Canadian Press, CBC.

McIntyre, Susan. (2010). *Aboriginal Domestic Trafficking in Persons*. Indian Affairs and Northern Development, Government of Canada.

McNabb, David, E. (2013). *Research Methods in Public Administration and Nonprofit Management: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. M.E Sharpe.

National Film Board of Canada. (2000). *Hallow Water*. Retrieved from https://www.nfb.ca/film/hollow_water/

Neuman, W. Lawrence. (2011). *Social research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. Boston: Pearson Education Inc.

New Directions. (2017). TERF: Transition, Education, and Resources for Females. Retrieved from https://newdirections.mb.ca/training-education-programs/terf-transition-education-resources-for-females/

NLCAHT, (2019). NL Coalition Against Human Trafficking. Retrieved from https://www.nlcoalitionagainsthumantrafficking.com/

NWAC. (2015). Our Spirits are not for sale. *Native Women's Association of Canada*. Prepared for the Department of Justice Canada and Indigenous Affairs and Northern Development Canada. Akwesasne, Ontario.

NWAC. (2014). *Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Indigenous Women and Girls: Literature and key informant interviews, Final Report.* Native Women's Association of Canada.

ONWA. (February 2016). Sex Trafficking of Indigenous Women in Ontario. *Ontario Native Women's Association*.

Overs, Cheryl. (2002). SEX WORKERS: PART OF THE SOLUTION: An analysis of HIV prevention programming to prevent HIV transmission during commercial sex in developing countries. *WHO International*. Retrieved from https://www.who.int/hiv/topics/vct/sw_toolkit/115solution.pdf

Province of British Columbia. (2014). *Human Trafficking: Canada is not immune*. Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons. Retrieved from http://www.pssg.gov.bc.ca/octiptraining/index.html

Province of British Columbia. (2019). *Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples Act*.

Russell, Andrew. (August 23, 2016). What was the 60s Scoop? Aboriginal children taken from homes a dark chapter in Canada's History. *Global News*. Retrieved from https://globalnews.ca/news/2898190/what-was-the-60s-scoop-aboriginal-children-taken-from-homes-a-dark-chapter-in-canadas-history/

Sethi, Anupriya. (2007). Domestic Sex Trafficking of Indigenous Girls in Canada: Issues and Implications. *First Peoples Child and Family Review Volume 3*, Number 3, p.57-71.

Shalit, Ann De, et al. (2014). Human Trafficking and Media Myths: Federal Funding, Communication Strategies, and Canadian Anti-Trafficking... *Canadian Journal of Communication, Volume 39*, Issue 3.

Sikka, A., Federal Interlocutor for Métis and Non-Status Indians (Canada), Institute on Governance, & Canadian Electronic Library (Firm). (2009). *Trafficking of Indigenous women and girls in Canada*. Ottawa, Ont: Institute on Governance.

Snyder, E., Napoleon, V., & Barrows, J. (2015, July). Gender and violence: drawing on Indigenous legal resources. *University of British Columbia Law review, 48*(2), 624+.

Sweet, Victoria. (2014). Rising Waters, rising threats: the human trafficking of indigenous women in the circumpolar region of the United States and Canada. *The Yearbook of Polar Law online, 6*(1), 162-188.

Taggart, M. J. (2015). *AmINext? A discussion on the sexual violence and trafficking of aboriginal women in Canada and the link to domestic extractive industries*.

Trocmé, N., Knoke, D., & Blackstock, C. (2004). Pathways to the overrepresentation of aboriginal children in Canada's child welfare system. *Social Service Review, 78*(4), 577-600. doi:10.1086/424545

United Nations. (2000). Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nation Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. Retrieved from http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/ProtocolTraffickingInPersons.aspx

Unknown, 2014. NL Coalition Against Human Trafficking INC.: The Global Slave Trade in NL. Retrieved from http://www.nlcoalitionagainsthumantrafficking.com/wp content/uploads/2015/11/Conference-Report-April-7th-to-9th.pdf

Unknown. (2015). "Our spirits are not for sale or trade' – PSA's to hit national media." *Wawatay News*. Retrieved from http://www.wawataynews.ca/home/%E2%80%98our-spirits-are-not-sale-or-trade%E2%80%99-%E2%80%93-psa%E2%80%99s-hit-national-media

Ursel, E. Jane., Proulx, J., Dean, L., Costello, S. (2007). Evaluation of the TERF Youth and Adult Programs. *RESOLVE*, University of Manitoba. Retrieved from https://umanitoba.ca/centres/resolve/media/FINAL_Evaluation_of_TERF_Youth_and_Adult_Program_Report_2007.pd

Weitzer, R. (2014). *Miscounting human trafficking and slavery*. Retrieved from https://www.opendemocracy.net/beyondslavery/ronald-weitzer/miscounting-human-trafficking-and-slavery

9.2 Appendix 1: Canadian Legislation on Human Trafficking

Specific criminal laws against trafficking in persons (TIP) in the *Criminal Code.* Six offences in the *Criminal Code* specifically address human trafficking:

a. Trafficking in Persons (section 279.01): which carries a maximum penalty of life imprisonment and a mandatory minimum penalty of 5 years where the offence involved kidnapping, aggravated assault, aggravated sexual assault or death, and a maximum penalty of 14 years and a mandatory minimum penalty of 4 years in all other cases;
b. Trafficking of a person under the age of eighteen years (section 279.011) which carries a maximum penalty of life imprisonment and a mandatory minimum penalty of 6 years where the offence involved kidnapping, aggravated assault, aggravated sexual assault or death, and a maximum penalty of 14 years and a mandatory minimum penalty of 5 years in all other cases;
c. Receiving a Financial or Other Material Benefit for the purpose of committing or facilitating trafficking in persons -Adult Victim (subsection 279.02(1)): which carries a maximum penalty of 10 years imprisonment;
d. Receiving a Financial or Other Material Benefit for the purpose of committing or facilitating trafficking in persons -Child Victim (subsection 279.02(2)): which carries a maximum penalty of 14 years imprisonment and a mandatory minimum penalty of 2 years;
e. Withholding or Destroying a Person's Identity Documents (for example, a passport) for the purpose of committing or facilitating trafficking of that person - Adult Victim (subsection 279.03(1)): which carries a maximum penalty of five years imprisonment; and,
f. Withholding or Destroying a Person's Identity Documents (for example, a passport) for the purpose of committing or facilitating trafficking of that person - Child Victim (subsection 279.03(2)): which carries a maximum penalty of 10 years imprisonment and a mandatory minimum penalty of 1 year.

Trafficking in persons is about exploitation and does not necessarily involve movement. For the purpose of the trafficking offences, the Criminal Code states that a person exploits another person if they:

1. cause someone to provide, or offer to provide, labour or a service by engaging in conduct that, in all the circumstances, could reasonably be expected to cause the other person to believe that their safety or the safety of a person known to them would be threatened if they failed to provide, or offer to provide, the labour or service.
2. cause a person, by means of deception or the use or threat of force or of any other form of coercion, to have an organ or tissue removed -(section 279.04).

Other provisions in the *Criminal Code* which address TIP-related offences

Other *Criminal Code* offences can also be used by police and Crown prosecutors depending on the facts and circumstances of the case. They include:

- Kidnapping/Forcible confinement

- Criminal organization offences
- Extortion/Uttering threats
- Prostitution-related offences
- Sexual assault/Assault
- Aggravated sexual assault

9.3 Appendix 2: NL Coalition Against Human Trafficking: Red Flags/Indicators

(https://www.nlcoalitionagainsthumantrafficking.com/human-trafficking/#whatishumantrafficking)

People who have been trafficked may:

- Believe that they must work against their will
- Be unable to leave their work environment
- Show signs that their movements are being controlled
- Feel that they cannot leave
- Show fear or anxiety
- Be subjected to violence or threats of violence against themselves or against their family members and loved ones
- Suffer injuries that appear to be the result of an assault
- Suffer injuries or impairments typical of certain jobs or control measures
- Suffer injuries that appear to be the result of the application of control measures
- Be distrustful of the authorities
- Be threatened with being handed over to the authorities
- Be afraid of revealing their immigration status
- Not be in possession of their passports or other travel or identity documents, as those documents are being held by someone else
- Have false identity or travel documents
- Be found in or connected to a type of location likely to be used for exploiting people
- Be unfamiliar with the local language
- Not know their home or work address
- Allow others to speak for them when addressed directly
- Act as if they were instructed by someone else
- Be forced to work under certain conditions
- Be disciplined through punishment
- Be unable to negotiate working conditions
- Receive little or no payment
- Have no access to their earnings
- Work excessively long hours over long periods
- Not have any days off
- Live in poor or substandard accommodations
- Have no access to medical care
- Have limited or no social interaction
- Have limited contact with their families or with people outside of their immediate environment
- Be unable to communicate freely with others
- Be under the perception that they are bonded by debt
- Be in a situation of dependence
- Come from a place known to be a source of human trafficking

- Have had the fees for their transport to the country of destination paid for by facilitators, whom they must payback by working or providing services in the destination
- Have acted on the basis of false promises

CHILDREN:

- Children who have been trafficked may:
- Have no access to their parents or guardians
- Look intimidated and behave in a way that does not correspond with behaviours typical of children their age
- Have no friends of their own age outside of work
- Have no access to education
- Have no time for playing
- Live apart from other children and in substandard accommodations
- Eat apart from other members of the "family"
- Be given only leftovers to eat
- Be engaged in work that is not suitable for children
- Travel unaccompanied by adults
- Travel in groups with persons who are not relatives

The following might also indicate that children have been trafficked:

- The presence of child-sized clothing typically worn for doing manual or sex work
- The presence of toys, beds and children's clothing in inappropriate places such as brothels and factories
- The claim made by an adult that he or she has "found" an unaccompanied child
- The finding of unaccompanied children carrying telephone numbers for calling taxis
- The discovery of cases involving illegal adoption

SEXUAL EXPLOITATION - People who have been trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation may:

- Be of any age, although the age may vary according to the location and the market
- Move from one brothel to the next or work in various locations
- Be escorted whenever they go to and return from work and other outside activities
- Have tattoos or other marks indicating "ownership" by their exploiters
- Work long hours or have few if any days off
- Sleep where they work
- Live or travel in a group, sometimes with other women who do not speak the same language
- Have very few items of clothing
- Have clothes that are mostly the kind typically worn for doing sex work

- Only know how to say sex-related words in the local language or in the language of the client group
- Have no cash of their own
- Be unable to show an identity document

The following might also indicate that children have been trafficked:

- There is evidence that suspected victims have had unprotected and/or violent sex.
- There is evidence that suspected victims cannot refuse unprotected and/or violent sex.
- There is evidence that a person has been bought and sold.
- There is evidence that groups of women are under the control of others.
- Advertisements are placed for brothels or similar places offering the services of women of a particular ethnicity or nationality.
- It is reported that sex workers provide services to a clientele of a particular ethnicity or nationality.
- It is reported by clients that sex workers do not smile.

9.4 Appendix 3: Prostitution Offender Program 2016[11] - Who are the "johns"?

This is a snapshot of the men who attended the Prostitution Offender Program after they were charged in Edmonton Police Service undercover stings in 2016. Only eligible first-time offenders may attend the Program, an Alternative Measures Program. Some men are sent as part of a probation order, and occasionally a man will ask if he can come, even when he hasn't been charged because he wants to change his behaviours. Prostitution offenders, also called "johns" or sex consumers, come from all walks of life, all ages, and all races. Some are predators, some are pedophiles, some are perpetrators of violence, and some kill women. Some are lonely, some act on impulse, some just want cheap, anonymous sex and some are addicted to porn and cruising for sex. They cruise the streets and the internet.

2016 Prostitution Offender Program Statistics
28 people filled out at least part of the evaluation

Age and Place of Birth

- Age range: 19 to 76
- Average age: 43
- Age 18-29: 21%
- Age 30-54: 50%
- Age 55+: 29%
- 54% were born in Canada, 46% elsewhere
- 33% of those born outside of Canada immigrated to Canada within the past 10 years, 68% identified themselves as speaking English well or very well

Relationships and Children

- Married/Girlfriend/Common-law: 54%
- 61% had one or more children, and 59% of those had children living with them at the time
- 93% had viewed pornography on the internet, 13% reported viewing either daily or weekly
- The youngest reported beginning watching pornography at age 11.
- 19% believe they have a sex addiction

Education

- High school or higher: 79% - University or College: 39% - Grade school only: 21%

---

[11] Retrieved from http://www.ceasenow.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/2016-POP-Report-Copyright-COLOUR.pdf

9.5 Appendix 4: Interview Questions

- Please tell me about some of the work your organization is involved with.
- What is/was your role in this organization?
- What is your organization's key strategy to help vulnerable Indigenous women and girls?
- How has your organization's programming evolved during your time working there?
- Have you identified gaps in your services and how would you improve on them?
- In your role do you or your organization partner with Indigenous communities, the province, and or the government of Canada, in preventing sexualized violence and human trafficking? What does this look like?
- What do you believe is working and not working with current government efforts? How do you think they can create positive change?
- In your experience, where does the path to exploitation start, and what is the best way to stop it?

Thank you for taking the time to help us in our research.