

# **Circulating tears and managing hearts: Governing through affect in an Indonesian steel factory**

**Daromir Rudnyckyj**

**2011**

Faculty of Social Science

Faculty Publications

This is a postprint version of the article.

© The Author(s) 2011.

The final publication is available at:

Rudnyckyj, D. (2011). Circulating tears and managing hearts: Governing through affect in an Indonesian steel factory. *Anthropological Theory*, 11(1), 63–87. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1463499610395444>

---

Downloaded from UVicSpace Research & Learning Repository

[dspace.library.uvic.ca](https://dspace.library.uvic.ca)



**University  
of Victoria**

Libraries

# **Circulating Tears and Managing Hearts: Governing through Affect in an Indonesian Steel Factory**

Daromir Rudnyckyj

*University of Victoria, Canada*

daromir@uvic.ca

## **Abstract**

This article argues that moderate Islamic spiritual training programs in contemporary Indonesia entail ‘governing through affect.’ This formulation captures the embodied dispositions and ritual forms through which affect can be mobilized to serve as a modality of government. Based on over two years of ethnographic research in Indonesia, most of which took place at Krakatau Steel in western Java, I examine the incitement of affect in ritual settings dedicated toward corporate productivity and self-improvement. The article argues that this process of subjectification took place in three stages. First, what participants referred to as ‘opening the heart,’ which involved making participants receptive to the message of work as worship through recourse to affective enactments in Islamic history and tradition. Second, the circulation of tears which refers to deep collective weeping which simultaneously represented and physically enacted the adoption of a new subjectivity. Finally, ‘managing the heart,’ the ultimate goal of spiritual training was a form of self-management in which one exercised ‘built-in control’ and acted in ways that were deemed simultaneously conducive to corporate competitiveness and other-worldly salvation. I conclude that affect constitutes the virtuality of ritual insofar as it is the medium through which spiritual reform enters into the vital processes of human life.

**Key Words**

affect, governmentality, Islam, ritual, globalization, religious movements, subjectification,

Indonesia

Let the tears spill as a sign of your longing for Allah, of your repentance to Allah. Ya Allah, chill the fire of your hell with these tears! Forgive all our mistakes, ya Allah! Have mercy, ya Allah! Wipe it clean, ya Allah! Wipe everything clean, ya Allah! You promised that you would wipe clean every sin, you would forgive every sin, and this day, ya Allah, we swear that we will wash away every one of our past sins!

With these exhortations to collective weeping Rinaldi Agusyana brought to a close the second day of an ESQ spiritual training session for Krakatau Steel employees in early June 2004. The hall was still shrouded in darkness and illuminated only by an ESQ logo in the shape of an atom with five electrons glowing dissonantly from three huge, floor-to-ceiling projection screens. Before leaving the room and heading off to perform the dusk prayer, employees clasped the coworkers who had been sitting in their immediate vicinity, warmly embracing several of those closest to them. Many still had wet tears below their eyes grimly staining their cheeks and quickly drying in the parched air of the room's cooling system. They exchanged embraces with forlorn expressions after experiencing a deeply moving collective prayer and multimedia presentation that had lasted for over two hours and purported to represent the experience of death. It was the culmination of an eleven-hour day of training that seemed to fatigue even the most enthusiastic employees. Among the most notable aspects of the scene was the way in which the room had been modified to elicit intense affective displays, visible in collective embraces, damp eyes, and plaintive wails of penitence.

This dramatic scene was part of a training program based grounded in principles of moderate Islam and introduced to the company in 2002. This 'spiritual reform' (*reformasi*

*spiritual*) program sought to augment Islamic piety among the company's 6000 employees. For decades the factory was a critical site in the Indonesian government's project of nationalist development, but was faced with a new political economic landscape increasingly characterized by transnational competition. The managers reasoned that through cultivating the Islamic virtues of the workforce they could eliminate corruption, become more internationally competitive, enhance company productivity, and perhaps prepare employees for privatization of this state-owned enterprise. Intersubjective affective enactments enacted in a highly ritualistic setting served as a central means through which reformers sought to inculcate religious virtues. The scene described above depicts a climactic moment on the second day of this new program, which required staff to attend 'spiritual' training sessions totaling 40 hours over three days. The sessions drew on a stirring, if sometimes unwieldy, mix of Qur'anic recitation, business leadership training, Islamic history, and popular psychology. This training program, called 'Emotional and Spiritual Quotient (ESQ) Training,' invokes both Islamic tradition and Euro-American management knowledge in the interest of creating a more disciplined, less corrupt, company employee.

This essay addresses the dramatic affective enactments that were pivotal to projects of merging Islamic practice with neoliberal norms.<sup>1</sup> While most work on neoliberalism depicts it as creating detached subjects, this essay argues that the mobilization of affects was critical to facilitating neoliberal reform in contemporary Indonesia. Building upon the work of Nikolas Rose (Rose, 1999), I term this mobilization of affect 'governing through affect.' Rose has demonstrated how 'advanced liberalism' is premised upon 'governing through freedom' (Rose 1999, 84). Rose describes how modern liberal governments administer and manage populations not through repression or constraints on action but by creating incentives and disincentives for

specific actions. Further, citizens are not compelled to specific courses of action but rather allowed to do as they please as long as they are individually accountable for the consequences of their actions. Freedom becomes both an organizing principle for being and way of being in the world. The concept of governing through affect builds on Rose's notion of governing through freedom insofar as I focus on the micro-practices through which subjects of government can be realized. Thus, here I seek to account for the mobilization of affect in the project of creating new subjects of what I have elsewhere referred to as a 'spiritual economy' (Rudnyckyj, 2009b). In so doing, I build on Charles Hirschkind's attention to the mobilization of sentiment as a means of ethical self-improvement (Hirschkind, 2001). My attention to affect also builds on Carla Jones's description of how middle-class Indonesian women engage in what she terms 'emotion work' (Jones, 2004). Where my approach to governing through affect differs from emotion work, is in a focus on how subjects circulate within and are formed through affect, rather than the circulation of emotions between subjects.

### **AFFECTING SUBJECTS: THE RITUAL DYNAMICS OF SPIRITUAL REFORM**

My interest in the use of affect as a medium to realize a new subject of government draws on over two years of ethnographic fieldwork that I conducted between 2003 and 2008 at Krakatau Steel in Banten, western Java. The initial iteration of Krakatau Steel was a populist project of Indonesia's first president, Sukarno, and was funded with Soviet development aid and technological expertise (Purwadi, Soemantri, Salam, et al., 2003). Although construction ceased following the military coup of 1965 that brought Suharto to power, it was resuscitated in the early 1970s as a centerpiece of national development under the import substitution industrialization prong of Indonesia's New Order<sup>2</sup> development strategy (Arndt, 1975; Hill,

2000). Krakatau Steel produces a material that was absolutely critical to the state's nationalist development project and occupied an iconic position in the nation, receiving frequent visits from the Indonesian President and other official dignitaries.

Until the Asian financial crisis and the concurrent collapse of the Suharto regime in 1998 Krakatau Steel received billions of dollars in state development aid. However, the economic crisis and political collapse presented the company with a number of pressing challenges. These challenges were associated with 'reform' [*reformasi*], which is how Indonesians refer to the political and economic transformations that have occurred in the country since 1998. *Reformasi* simultaneously refers to political changes in the form of increasing democratic governance and the introduction of new economic principles in the form of greater transparency, free markets, and merit (rather than patronage) based systems of competition, compensation, and promotion.

By the early 2000s many company employees, journalists, NGO activists, and academic observers believed that the economic challenges associated with *reformasi* would ultimately lead to the privatization of Krakatau Steel. Privatization of state-owned enterprises was a critical condition of the IMF's US\$40 billion bailout of the Indonesian government in the wake of the 1998 financial crisis (Prasetyawan, 2006). Under the terms of this agreement, foreign companies would be the primary investors and private ownership was expected to create 'efficient and viable enterprises' (Government of Indonesia, 2000).

As debates over the merits and course of privatization flared up among factory employees, managers and officials of Krakatau Steel's labor union turned to a moderate Islamic spiritual training program to create an 'efficient and viable' enterprise. They contracted a Jakarta-based company, the Emotional and Spiritual Quotient (ESQ) Leadership Center, to introduce an innovative program of Islamic-inspired human resources training to company

employees. Ary Ginanjar, the charismatic creator of what is known across Indonesia simply as 'ESQ,' drew ideas for the program from different forms of management knowledge and practice that have greatly expanded in Asia, Europe, and North America in recent decades (Thrift, 1998). He has sought to fuse corporate trainings and life coaching programs, like *The Seven Habits of Highly Effective People*, with a literal interpretation of Islamic practice. Thus, he sees *reformasi* as not as a matter of structural political and economic change as a matter of individual ethical and moral reform.

In the multi-day training sessions offered by his company, Ginanjar stresses that Islamic piety should not simply be restricted to religious worship, such as during one's daily prayers. Instead, he argues that principles conducive to modern business and management can be found in Islamic practice and Qur'anic doctrine. For example, drawing on what he terms 'the ESQ model,' Ginanjar instructs participants in these training programs that the third pillar of Islam is a directive for business success. Thus, the duty to give alms to the poor (*zakat*) is divine sanction for 'strategic collaboration' and exercising a 'win-win' approach in both business transactions and relations with coworkers. A common critique of employees of state-owned enterprises was their poor customer service. The exercise was intended to illustrate the importance of serving, rather than being served, for employees of a modern corporation.

These exercises, lectures and prayer sessions were executed in carefully organized sessions that had a distinctively ritualistic character and the ritual qualities of these sessions were instrumental in eliciting the profound personal transformations that were the intended result. Although Don Handelman has warned of the problematic nature of ritual as a concept in anthropology (Handelman, 1990: 10-11), there were 'simple regularities in the logics of form' (Handelman, 1990: 7) of these 'public events' that made their ritual qualities apparent to

proponents, participants, and observers. The training sessions were repeated multiple times at Krakatau Steel and indeed at multiple sites across Indonesia. At Krakatau Steel ESQ training sessions were held once or twice per month except during Ramadan and the *hajj* pilgrimage season. Although they occurred at the company, they were set off from the everyday routine of work life as employees needed a special invitation to attend and arrangements had to be made to cover their work day responsibilities. A distinct space was created in the company's education and training center through a purposeful arrangement of chairs and other furniture and manipulating the light and air temperature in the room. The sessions were most often held in the large multi-purpose room of the factory's education and training center, which could accommodate over 300 participants at a time. The sessions ran for three consecutive days, usually from Friday through Sunday, but also sometimes in the middle of the week.

Furthermore, these sessions were designed to be a rite of passage (Turner, 1967) in which participants would be personally transformed through their experience of the training program. Ary Ginanjar expected that the transformations achieved through ritualized spiritual training would be conducive to the broader remaking of Indonesian society concordant with *reformasi*. One of his assistant trainers, Zulfikir, gave me a schematic outline of what proponents of the program envisioned as the effect of each day of the training. He explained how the main activities undertaken were expected to elicit a specific kind of personal transformation. He referred to the first day as 'ice breaking and conditioning' in which techniques were deployed to enable participants to open up to the possibility of 'changing themselves' through the methods of ESQ. They were also introduced to the central concepts upon which the training is founded. On the second day, after the participant has been 'broken down' they were 'reprogrammed' by being confronted with existential questions that they were obliged to answer to affirm their identity as

Muslims. These included ‘Where are you from?’ ‘Where are you now?’ and ‘Where are you going?’ He said that by posing these questions participants were encouraged to reflect on their own lives and recognize practices that are not compliant with Islam. Participants were instructed not to ‘worship’ material things, property, their job positions, or their education. They were called on to atone for pursuing material concerns to the exclusion of living acceptably to Allah.

On the third day, Zulfikir told me that participants were ‘rebuilt anew.’ Techniques to practice self-control over material desire and emotional outbursts were introduced. Participants were encouraged to formulate a ‘vision and mission statement’ for their own lives by creating life goals that were consistent with the moral requirements of Islam. Finally, the concept of ‘total action’ was introduced through a *hajj* simulation. Total action referred to taking responsibility for one’s acts and being ‘proactive’ in one’s work and home lives. This was a critical lesson for employees in the new period of *reformasi*, given that corporate relations during the Suharto-era were rigidly hierarchical and workers were expected to wait for orders from above before taking action, rather than acting of their own accord. Thus, these training sessions were not rituals in the sense that they reproduced an existing social order. Rather, as Victor Turner has noted about rituals in general, ESQ was designed to bring about a new social order (Turner, 1969; see also Kapferer, 2008). Concordant with the broader current of *reformasi*, spiritual reform was designed to transform passive objects of the hierarchical system characteristic of the New Order into ‘proactive’ (*proaktif*) subjects who made decisions based on their own judgment.

The ritualistic qualities of the ESQ program were further apparent in the skillful use of technology to elicit the desired effects. The training sessions were given a structure through the use of what is becoming a ubiquitous global form for conveying information and organizing public events, a Microsoft PowerPoint presentation. This presentation consists of the usual slides

with graphs, charts, tables, and a succession of bullet points, but also with spliced film clips, colorful photographs, and popular music. The training was delivered primarily as an interactive lecture in which the main trainer would alternate between engaging with the audience in the familiar style of a television talk show host and proceeding to deliver fiery and profoundly emotive lectures asking for collective atonement from Allah.

In addition to lectures, the assistant trainers would intermittently perform skits to illustrate the main points of the training. Interactive games, participatory role playing activities, and calisthenics were deployed to break up the monotony of sitting and listening. To elicit certain embodied dispositions (Csordas 1994a), the physical environment during the training was carefully calibrated. The sound in the hall was often elevated to earsplitting volume and the lights in the room were manipulated to maximize the dramatic effects of the points made. Further, the air conditioning in the room was turned to its lowest setting creating a disconcerting chill in an otherwise steamy tropical climate. The chill facilitated certain affective enactments, making it more comfortable to embrace other participants.

Although Krakatau Steel was one of the first companies to adopt ESQ, the program has now spread much more widely across Indonesia. Ary Ginanjar has isolated a niche market for the training among employees at state-owned enterprises and government bureaucracies. In addition to Krakatau Steel, this training program was initiated at some of Indonesia's most prominent governmental institutions and state-owned firms including the Directorate General of Taxation, Telkom (the country's largest telecommunications company), Garuda (the national airline), and Pertamina (the state-owned oil company). Current and former military generals also are avid participants in ESQ and a number of sessions were held at the Army's officer candidate training school in Bandung.

In just five years ESQ grew spectacularly, as the number of people who participated in the program jumped from just 15,000 participants when I started my fieldwork in 2003 to over 600,000 by the end of 2008. In addition to offering programs at some of Indonesia's largest companies, the company does a brisk business in so called 'public' trainings. Participants in these public programs pay up to US\$350 out of their own pockets to participate. Ary Ginanjar said that these events, which attract as many as 1000 people at a time, are his biggest growth market. Recently ESQ has met its goal of becoming a national movement, establishing branch offices in 30 out of 33 Indonesian provinces.<sup>3</sup> In late 2005 the ESQ Leadership Center broke ground for a 25-story office tower and convention center in south Jakarta funded in part through investment shares sold to past participants and when I returned to do fieldwork in Indonesia in 2008 full-scale training sessions were already taking place in the conference center portion of the building.

The potent affects deployed in spiritual reform were ethnographically significant for two reasons. First, the use of affect to facilitate personal transformation in ESQ distinguished the sessions from other employee training programs at Krakatau Steel, such as the Seven Habits of Highly Effective People. Whereas both ESQ and the Seven Habits sought to increase the productivity and effectiveness of company employees, the latter program was executed in a dry, sober timbre. ESQ, in contrast, was punctuated with intensely affective displays, which were instrumental to the potency of the ritual experience and, ultimately, the personal transformations sought by proponents and participants. Secondly, as discussed below, anthropological research on Indonesia has highlighted the premium placed on emotional restraint, particularly among speakers of Javanese, the nation's politically and demographically dominant group. Indeed, emotional restraint was a key political technology during the Suharto regime, as the president

used an inscrutable smile to effectively mask his emotional states and the ‘latent violence of the state’ (Strassler, 2009: 76). Yet spiritual training sessions differed from everyday public space in Indonesia insofar as they created a ritual space in which affect was readily expressed, albeit at specifically calibrated times.

This essay analyzes a different deployment of affect in the post-Suharto period. I show how trainers and participants in ESQ mobilized affect and suggest that attention to such mobilization has broader implications for analyzing both movements for religious reform and the articulation between religious resurgence and globalization. The project of subjectification entailed in governing through affect involved three stages. First, what participants referred to as ‘opening the heart,’ which involved making participants receptive to the ESQ model through recourse to Islamic tradition. Second, what I term the circulation of tears, which refers to deep collective weeping which both represented and physically enacted becoming a new type of person. The final stage was ‘managing the heart,’ the ultimate goal of spiritual training, that was represented as a form of self-management in which one exercised ‘built-in control’ and acted in ways that were deemed simultaneously conducive to global corporate competitiveness and individual other-worldly salvation. Thus, the personal change sought through the mobilization of affect during ESQ was designed to harmonize self-interest with collective interest. The affective transformations sought through ESQ were part of the larger personal transformation that was seen as necessary to resolve Indonesia’s development failures and political crises.<sup>4</sup>

## **AFFECTING SUBJECTS**

When I participated and observed ESQ training I was struck at how participants were so effectively moved to collective weeping and other affective enactments and how this

mobilization was instrumental to the personal transformation expected of the ritual setting. In focusing on the deployment and circulation of affect, I build on previous anthropological work on emotion.<sup>5</sup> Earlier anthropological treatments of emotion have sought to seize analytical terrain from psychology by noting the inherent sociality of emotion (Abu-Lughod and Lutz, 1990: 2). In contrast to most psychological approaches, anthropologists showed how emotions are historically constructed and locally meaningful (Hollan and Throop, 2008). However, this work tends to use the term emotion interchangeably with the term affect. In the introduction to their edited volume Abu-Lughod and Lutz use the words as synonyms. They assert that ‘emotional discourses... seem to have some affective content or effect’ (Abu-Lughod and Lutz, 1990: 10). In a review article entitled ‘The Anthropology of Emotions,’ Lutz and White for the most part avoid the term affect except in reference to the work of others (Lutz and White, 1986). When they do invoke affect, it is largely as a synonym for emotion. Recently other scholars have directed attention to emotion as a key site for understanding developments in contemporary Southeast Asia (Boellstorff and Lindquist, 2004).

This essay contributes to an emerging interest in affect in anthropology (Masco, 2008; Mazarella, 2009; Navaro-Yashin, 2009). As Analiese Richard and I have previously argued, affect offers a potential generative alternative to work centered on emotion (Richard and Rudnyckyj, 2009). Affect refers to relations practiced *between* individuals rather than experiences born by sole individuals. The transitive qualities of affect are apparent in words derived from the same root such as affection, a ‘favourable or kindly disposition towards a person or thing; fondness, tenderness; goodwill, warmth of attachment’ (Oxford English Dictionary, 2008). It is this transitive quality that simultaneously creates its progenitor as well as its recipient that is analytically valuable. The verb form of emotion, to emote, is an intransitive

verb and thus does not necessarily take (and therefore make) an object. Unlike the noun emotion, affect is both a noun and a transitive verb. Thus, grammatically it necessarily takes an object, pointing to its inherently reflexive capacity. Indeed, affect is useful because it contains the transitive qualities of what Foucault referred to as ‘conduct’ (Foucault, 1983: 220-221). The transitive verb form of affect is defined as ‘to have an effect on’ (Oxford English Dictionary, 2008). I take affect as a form of conduct: a means through which people conduct themselves or conduct others by making certain avenues of action possible and foreclosing other potential courses. However, affects and the forms of conduct enabled through affect are never completely determined and may also give rise to unintended consequences (Sedgwick, 2003).

Furthermore, affect is a powerful form of communicative action that is visible both within and outside language. As a participant in Thomas Csordas’s research on charismatic Christians noted spirituality cannot ‘easily be discussed...because we have no language for it, and hence we are forced by default to describe it in the language of emotions’ (Csordas, 1994b: 39). While I participated in spiritual training sessions I observed that affective enactments were communicated through emotional discourse, but also through powerful embodied practices. For example, I was told that certain forms of religious speech were thought to be more effective if they were articulated through tears. Practices such as crying and embracing were critical means through which subjects worked on themselves and others, formed new collectivities and adopted new configurations of personhood.

Previous anthropological studies of emotion have focused heavily on language as the primary means through which to understand emotion as an object within cultures (Lutz and Abu-Lughod, 1990). This attention to the critical role of language in studies of affect has yielded important results. However, I focus on both discourses about affect as well as what might be

thought of as extra-discursive affect. Although affective discourse was central to governing through affect, I do not treat affect as limited solely to language. Affect may be most visible (and most effective) when mobilized in embodied practices. In emphasizing the materiality of affect, I draw on the recent work of Eve Sedgwick who calls attention to the multiple sensory experiences associated with affect, such as sight, sound, touch, and feel (Sedgwick, 2003). Sedgwick suggests that while affect is expressed in language, it is sometimes even more powerfully expressed outside language. In my account communicative acts exercised through the body play a central role. Mutual embraces and the circulation of bodily fluids, like tears, are critical to the production of new forms of personhood and new relations between people. Embodied practices like the contact between bodies, the release of bodily fluids, and paralinguistic features like wails and sobs or cheers and howls of delight are powerful techniques through which subjects and relations between subjects are manipulated, acted upon, and transformed.

### **HARMONIZING INTERESTS: REGIMES OF AFFECT**

Albert Hirschman provides valuable inspiration for what I term governing through affect, insofar as he identifies an analogous assemblage in early modern Europe (Hirschman, 1977). He shows how a recurrent problem for 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> century government experts was that the passions of the sovereign threatened the ability of new states to guarantee order and stability.<sup>6</sup> These theorists sought to harness passions toward some productive end and align the self-interest of those who govern with the collective interests of the governed. Those involved in spiritual reform in contemporary Indonesia undertook a project that resembled converting passions into interests in a similar context of political instability. They sought to ‘open hearts’ through various affective enactments and ultimately achieve what they termed ‘management of the heart.’

Hirschman's account of the conversion of passion into interest, which he argues enabled the formation of both capitalism and the modern state, contains striking parallels with the Foucaultian approach to the emergence of governmentality.<sup>7</sup> Hirschman, like Foucault, focuses on 'a new turn in the theory of the state, [an] attempt at improving statecraft within the existing order' (Hirschman, 1977: 12). He further addresses the development of what he terms 'more effective ways of shaping the pattern of human actions than through moralistic exhortation or the threat of damnation' (Hirschman, 1977: 15). This is analogous to Foucault's analysis of liberalism as a technology of government whose objective is its own self-limitation (Foucault, 2008: 297, 318) and consequent focus on the conduct of conduct or what he termed 'actions upon other actions' (Foucault, 1983: 220).

Hirschman's account of the relationship between affect and capitalist transformation offers insight into the emergence of modern forms of government of the self. Hirschman details efforts by the 18<sup>th</sup> century physiocrats who 'wanted to motivate [the sovereign] to act correctly...of his own free will. In other words, they were looking for a political order in which the power holders are impelled, *for reasons of self-interest*, to promote the general interest' (Hirschman, 1977: 97, emphasis original). Similarly, Foucault writes that a constitutive feature of governmentality is the emergence of the principle that 'a sovereign who wishes to govern the state well must first learn how to govern himself, his goods and his patrimony, after which he will be successful in governing the state' (Foucault, 1991: 90). Thus, for both Hirschman and Foucault a characteristic feature of modernity is that the sovereign no longer exists in a relation of externality to the state or society (Foucault, 1970: 3-18). A well-ordered state entails the harmonization of the interests of those who govern with the interests of the governed. Thus, government of the self and government of the collectivity become part of a single, seamless

order. The problem of aligning self-government with government of the collectivity was what was at stake in ESQ training. The Suharto regime had been able to consolidate and hold political power through the capricious and wanton use of violence (Sidel, 2006: 46-48; Siegel, 1998; Vatikiotis, 1998). The end of the regime had called the political technologies it deployed into question and paved the way for alternative modes of exercising power. Thus, spiritual reformers sought to inculcate what they termed ‘built-in control’ through management of the heart. Affect played a critical role in achieving this personal transformation. In developing the notion of governing through affect, I supplement Foucault’s analysis of the production of modern subjects with Hirschman’s insights into the role of affect in this process.

### **GOVERNING THROUGH AFFECT**

During ESQ training sessions intense displays of affect, (such as shame, grief, joy, kindness, and fear) were notable because according to prevailing anthropological wisdom overt displays of affect are rare in Indonesia. The mobilization of affect during spiritual training sessions did not fit either of the two dominant themes in anthropological attention to emotion in Indonesia. On the one hand, anthropologists have focused on the way in which great emphasis is placed on concealing emotions and, on the other, on periodic instances in which individuals and groups violate this normal state of affairs and run amok. Conventional anthropological representations of ‘inner’ Indonesians (inhabitants of the islands of Java and Bali) hold that tremendous personal pride is placed on the exercise of *halus* (refined) behavior. Thus, visible displays of affect are often constrained in Indonesia (Geertz, 1961: 110-118). More recently anthropologists have argued that a personal ethics of restraint often masks inward states of discord and turbulence for many Indonesians (Lindquist, 2004; Wikan, 1990). The converse of the norm of emotional

restraint is amok—the infrequent but highly visible instances in which individuals or groups violate the normal focus on concealing emotion and launch into mad frenzy (Good and Good, 2008: 83-98; Kresman, Hadin, and Sumarni, 1989; Winzeler, 1990). Whereas Kathleen Stewart has drawn anthropological attention to ordinary affects, what drew me to the affective displays in spiritual reform was how extraordinary they were in Indonesia (Stewart, 2008).

Management of the heart did not refer to concealing affects, but instead to more effectively administering them for individual and collective benefit. This involved enacting affects in public settings at specific times. These affective displays were not the ecstatic states of amok, but rather involved employees of huge industrial operation enmeshed in distinctly modern techniques of proselytization that included digitally reproduced images and sound. At the same time that participants were enlisted in the management of their own affects, they themselves were entangled in a new regime of governing through affect, insofar as affective modulation was a step toward eliciting different configurations of personhood. Extensive planning to elicit desired affective states had clearly gone in to the development of these programs. This planning involved the creation of a ritual space through the careful manipulation of sound, light, temperature and other sensations to facilitate particular spiritual and emotional states. Participants quickly learned (or already knew) the appropriate responses to the cues that were deployed. Furthermore, the emphasis was not so much on concealing affect as on mobilizing its transformative capacities. The circulation of tears and mutual embraces took place in collective, public sessions in which these affects would be visible to coworkers, friends, and other colleagues. Like the laying on of hands in charismatic Christian rituals (Csordas, 1994b: 54-56), contact between individuals had the power to elicit spiritual experiences and personal transformation.

Suzanne Brenner has shown how emotional restraint has been linked to economic action in Java (Brenner, 1998). Javanese see controlling desire as productive in both the religious and the economic realms, as a means of accumulating not only material wealth but spiritual merit as well. Building on Brenner's approach I seek to show how mastering affect was viewed as a means of attaining greater spiritual fulfillment and becoming a more productive worker in a global economy. The notion of governing through affect builds on this notion by considering how affect was deployed on a wider scale to achieve political and economic objectives. My focus is on the mobilization, modulation, and manipulation of affect to elicit new subjective dispositions. Thus, I build on Rachel Silvey's recent work on 'emotional-religious regulation' in creating transnational labor migrants (Silvey, 2007: 221-223). Thus, governing through affect refers as much to the government of selves through affect as to the ways in which selves seek to govern their own affect. This type of government entailed a three-fold process: opening hearts, the circulation of tears, and finally management of the heart.

### **OPENING HARDENED HEARTS**

As is common in Egyptian cassette sermons, spiritual reform represented the heart as the central object of individual transformation and ethical self-improvement, which Charles Hirschkind has referred to as part of 'a kind of moral physiology' (Hirschkind, 2001: 627-628). The initial step in achieving personal transformation entailed what was referred to as 'opening the heart' (*membuka hati*). Both proponents of and participants in ESQ considered opening the heart as a primary goal of the training, by which they meant submitting completely to Islam as a means of becoming both a better Muslim and a better corporate employee. Many of those who professed spiritual transformations averred that they knew that their heart had been opened because they

were ‘able to cry’ during religious practices like prayer (*sholat*) only after they had attended ESQ sessions. An indication of the transformation of one’s heart was the embodied practice of grief through crying.

This metaphor of opening the heart circulates in a wider Indonesian discursive frame in which, like English, the heart is viewed as an individual’s emotional center.<sup>8</sup> Before a participant in ESQ could be immersed in the circulation of tears and achieve management of the heart it had to be opened. This association between opening one’s heart and crying was repeated throughout spiritual training. This process was illustrated through a dramatic rendition of the story of Umar bin Khattab in the morning of the second day of ESQ training. Umar was the second caliph who initially had refused Muhammad’s revelations, but ultimately became one of his staunchest devotees. Participants were reminded that crying during religious worship followed the precedent set by Umar.

Umar’s heart was described as the site in which he experienced personal transformation. Initially he was a fierce warrior with a ‘hard heart’ (*hati keras*) who had denigrated Muhammad’s teachings during the period when Muslims were being persecuted in Mecca. However, after hearing the recitation of Qur’anic verses, Umar was moved to tears and converted to Islam. Umar was invoked as an example of one who was physically powerful and ‘arrogant’ (*sombong*) because of his worldly prowess, but upon hearing the ‘beauty of the Qur’an’ his heart was opened. During ESQ Rinaldi related the story of Umar’s conversion:

He allowed the light to enter himself and what a light it was that entered him...So his heart became pure; it purified his feelings...That is what is known as divine guidance [*hidayat*]. That is what happens when someone says, “This is what I am seeking! This is what I am seeking! This is what I am seeking!” At that moment

Umar was not able [*mampu*] to hold back the tears. These are the signs [*ciri-ciri*] that Allah gives to those who attain divine guidance.

Umar's tears, visible signs that he was affected and his heart had been opened, were an oft-cited symbol for ESQ participants. They were invited to follow Umar not in the sense of converting to Islam, but rather in opening their hearts to intensify their religious commitment and transform themselves. This was metaphorically represented when his previously closed heart was unblocked allowing it to be filled with the 'light' of divine instruction. Participants were enjoined to make themselves more than mere 'ritual' subjects of Islam. Becoming immersed in the circulation of tears, an embodied state and a material symbol of personal transformation, was how subjects of spiritual reform convinced themselves and others that their hearts were opened.

### **THE CIRCULATION OF TEARS**

Effusive weeping was the embodied practice through which the metaphorical project of 'opening the heart' was achieved. I refer to these tearful expressions of grief as the circulation of tears. At key moments of spiritual training and in other public practices of Islam in contemporary Indonesia, participants engaged in *qolbun salim* which James Fox has described as 'ritual weeping for one's sins in a concentrated effort to achieve purity of heart' (Fox, 2004). This weeping, often elicited by a particularly moving collective prayer or lecture on a religious topic, was central to the project of spiritual reform. Tears were a material representation of the transformation of the heart that is the object of spiritual reform. At key moments of the training tears visibly circulated on the bodies of those affected, rolling down their cheeks accompanied by mournful wails. Furthermore, the act of crying circulated through the audience during ESQ training sessions. What began as a small number of people weeping during particularly evocative

lectures, collective prayers, or moving videos, effectively elicited tears from the bodies of others in an escalating crescendo. The weeping typically began with one or two isolated individuals, but steadily spread to other bodies. By the end of especially moving sessions it appeared that virtually everyone in the room was in tears.

Indeed, the circulation of tears had the greatest impact on past participants in the program. For example, when I brought up ESQ with Kusmanto, a technical expert in the public relations office at Krakatau Steel, several times he focused on the fact that many participants wept during the training program. This had made an overwhelming impression on him. He had never seen coworkers cry and he had never wept himself during religious worship. His amazement and fixation at how ESQ participants were so dramatically affected were indicative of the profound personal transformation that he had himself experienced during the program. In part this may be attributable to the fact that, although he had lived in Banten for over 20 years, he was originally from the central Javanese court center of Solo whose inhabitants are reputed to be some of the most refined (*halus*) in the archipelago. The ability to effectively mask one's emotional states is considered to be a manifestation of this refinement (Heider, 1991). It was only during his participation in ESQ that he found himself acting contrary to these dispositions.

Kusmanto first attended ESQ in 2002 and expressed amazement to me that his attendance marked the first time he was 'able to cry' during religious activity. He invoked Al-Anfal, the eighth chapter of the Qur'an, to demonstrate the textual justification for feeling moved in one's heart when the verses of the holy book are recited. This verse reads 'those only are believers who, when God is mentioned, their hearts quake, and when His signs are recited to them, it increases them in faith, and in their Lord they put their trust' (Arberry, 1955: 8:2). The Qur'anic precedent enabled him to account for the fact that he unexpectedly broke into tears during his

participation in ESQ. He said that this was a sign of ‘divine revelation [*wahyu*] from Allah. If we hear Allah’s name [*asma Allah*] and we then tremble [*gemetar*], it means that our hearts have been touched [*hati tersentuh*].’

Other past participants in ESQ emphasized that spiritual training made them ‘able to cry’ during Islamic ritual activity, often for the first time. To them this was an indication of the power of the program and its ability to transform nominal Muslims into pious practitioners of the faith. This aspect of spiritual training was frequently recounted when ESQ adherents explained the how the program had become popular among elite members of the armed forces. During a retreat for high-level officials of the Indonesian military, a general named Syamsul was crying openly during a collective prayer session. Syarifuddin, another general who was the head of the Army’s Officer Candidate Training School (widely referred to in Indonesia by its acronym, SESKOAD), noticed him shedding tears and afterward asked him how ‘he could be so devout [*khusyuk*] in his prayers.’ Syamsul affirmed that his experience at ESQ had made him ‘able to cry’ during religious worship for the first time. Shortly thereafter Syarifuddin decided to try the program himself and attended one of the four-day long executive sessions in Jakarta. He was likewise moved to tears and attributed this experience to his new found devotion to religious practice. He decided that it would also be beneficial for officers undergoing training at SESKOAD and brought ESQ to Bandung for officers in the Indonesian military training there. Photographs of vast groups of military members taking part in ESQ were a prominent feature of the introduction to ESQ on the first day of training at Krakatau Steel and lent the program a great measure of authority.

## **HYDRAULIC SUBJECTIFICATION: THE MESSAGE OF THE MEDIUM**

Water was a commonly repeated theme in lectures delivered by Ary Ginanjar or Rinaldi and a key material symbol of the subjective transformation that ESQ training was designed to achieve. Water was both a material medium circulated by the body and a metaphor through which a subjective transformation could be represented and understood. Experiences of a failure to change were metaphorically represented as dryness and as an ‘inability to cry’ during religious practice. These metaphors were not strictly connected to ESQ, but connected more broadly with how Indonesians explained the subjective transformation associated with enhanced religious practice. Suparman, a mechanic in the hot strip mill, invoked hydraulic metaphors to illustrate his own religious transformation that had occurred ten years prior to our conversation, long before ESQ had even been conceived. He said that he had been inattentive to religious practice, would rarely attend his local mosque, and almost never prayed. He referred to this condition as ‘dryness overtaking his heart’ (*kekeringan dalam hati*). He said that this dryness was abated after he became more devout in his religious observance, which took place shortly after the birth of his first child.

These metaphors of dryness were common in explaining the effects of ESQ training. Sukromo, a senior manager in human resources, contrasted the relationship between work and religion before the introduction of ESQ with the role of religion in the workplace afterwards. He said:

Before the culture of the company was from outside [*budaya dalam perusahaan langsung dari luar*]. It was secular [*sekular*] because we adopted a notion of industry from Germany and the US. This involved a separation of work from the rest of an employee's life activities. All the aspects of planning, operations, and control were done without the local culture, the religious culture [*tanpa lokal*]

*kultur, budaya relijius*]. This resulted in dryness from the religious side [*sisi relijius kering*].

Here dryness metaphorically refers to the influence of the west, which is characterized by a strict separation of work and religious activity. This division, attributed to secularism, is depicted as something that was ultimately not commensurable with ‘local culture’ and results in religious ‘dryness.’ This dryness is redressed through the collective public circulation of tears that takes place during spiritual training. Tears serve as a material sign of a state that is otherwise only expressed metaphorically: having one’s heart opened.

ESQ training sessions represented religious ‘dryness’ as an effect of western modernization and the diagnosis for it was the ritual weeping that was a common attribute of the programs. Early on the first day of each training, Rinaldi would allude to the possibility that participants might be transformed through weeping. In metaphorically evocative terms he likened the audience to Umar bin Khattab, portentously proclaiming ‘God willing at the end of these three days, we too will find the water inside of us.’ Shortly thereafter a custom-made animated video played on the three large projection screens at the front of the hall that showed blocks of ice melt away to reveal a pulsating heart. Rinaldi alluded to the transformative potential of the circulation of tears, remarking that ‘hopefully we will be able to melt the ice and make water.’ He continued with numerous metaphorical references to water in various forms during a long communal prayer:

Let these hearts bathe [*siram*], these hearts that are so hard...Our hearts have already become frozen [*beku*]. That is how hard our hearts are! Every piece of advice whatsoever we are given does not stick with us! Depicted here is their entombment in this ice. [He gestured to a video image of a pulsating heart

encased in dark ice]. We see a deep freeze, how little light shines on it, hard like this ice, but with the permission of Allah, finally even this hard heart can begin to be opened. Wherever there is a heart that is hard, there are actually the values of softness and wisdom that are symbolized [*dilambangkan*] by water, the water that gives life.

Like dryness, freezing was another important metaphor related to water that is central to spiritual reform. References to freezing, ice, and bathing were also evoked in the concluding remarks to the second day of the training that are reproduced at the beginning of this essay. Like ice melting to become water, so a hardened and closed heart could become soft and open. Rinaldi represented both tears and feelings of longing for repentance as ‘spilling over.’ Furthermore tears had the potential to extinguish the ‘fires of hell.’ This evocative quote also shows how tears are invoked as capable of ‘washing away’ one’s past misdeeds.<sup>9</sup> Symbolically tears, or what are literally in Indonesian ‘water of the eyes’ (*air mata*), represent melting ice. This ice is the symbolic material that shackles the emotional centers of those who are deficient in Islamic practice and, thus, whose hearts remain closed.

Circulating tears was a material means through which management of the heart could be achieved. Water was not only a symbol, but an actual physical object that circulated on the bodies of subjects of spiritual reform. A return to Islam, partially attained through ritual weeping, is depicted as the means to know oneself and in doing so transform oneself. Further, crying was the embodied practice through which one demonstrated submission to a new regime of self-government. As demonstrated below, spiritual reformers argued that by transforming oneself one could transform the company and in transforming oneself and the company, one could transform

the nation as a whole. Proponents of this project expect to achieve this economic transformation through a form of affective government that they termed management of the heart.

### **MANAGEMENT OF THE HEART**

After one's heart had been opened through the circulation of tears one could manage one's heart and emerge from spiritual training as a new subject. Management of the heart referred to achieving a form of self-government in which desire for personal gain was constrained and one's self-interests were harmonized with the broader collective interests of the company (and by extension the nation). The notion of managing the heart was not particular to ESQ, but rather part of a larger formation in contemporary Indonesia in which the administration of affect was deployed to yield more effective self and collective government. Those who used this phrase to refer to practices associated with ESQ, were in fact borrowing it from another moderate Islamic spiritual reform movement that similarly combines management knowledge and life-coaching principles with Islamic practice. The term originates with the hugely successful Islamic business Manajemen Qolbu Corporation. This prominent Islamic media and direct marketing conglomerate uses first an English and then an Arabic word to yield a name that translates into Indonesian as 'Management of the Heart Corporation.'<sup>10</sup>

Manajemen Qolbu and ESQ were understood as different means toward the same ends. Employees of Krakatau Steel often contended that ESQ enabled better 'management of the heart.' In both ESQ and Manajemen Qolbu enactments of affect, like ritualized weeping and plaintive pleas for forgiveness, are mobilized to produce a new subject. While their audiences overlapped, Ary Ginanjar considered ESQ more narrowly as a human resources training, whereas Manajemen Qolbu was directed toward a wider audience. Manajemen Qolbu sought to

make both Islam and life-coaching principles accessible to families and citizens as a way of improving Indonesian national morality (Hoesterey, 2008). The founder of Manajemen Qolbu, Aa Gym, cultivated a mass following through television and he was ubiquitous presence on numerous Indonesian stations in the early 2000s (Watson, 2005). In contrast, Ary Ginanjar was more limited with his television appearances, preferring to appeal to prospective followers through his training program. Indeed, many people were attracted to ESQ by virtue of his magnetic charisma. Other programs that contributed to the larger formation of managing hearts were Arifin Ilham's public zikir movement (Howell, 2008) and what the director of Indonesia's largest Islamic bank, Riawan Amin, called 'celestial management' (Amin, 2004).

Among ESQ participants at Krakatau Steel, managing the heart was thought to enable one to become a more disciplined and responsible worker who would not engage in corruption because he or she<sup>11</sup> is aware that all human action is subject to the gaze of Allah. Spiritual reformers argue that managing emotions facilitates better relations at work between employees of both equal and unequal rank. The heart is represented as the location from which material desires spring. By learning how to manage one's heart, the desire for material objects can be better controlled and reduce the potential for employees to engage in corrupt activities (Brenner, 1998).

Djohan, who saw ESQ as a means of achieving what he termed 'built-in control,' illustrated the relationship between affect, management of the heart, and the circulation of tears. Proponents of spiritual reform sought to inculcate an ethic of self-management in order to eliminate corruption and make the company more attractive to outside investment. Djohan's awareness of this mode of self-government emerged from the way in which he became enmeshed in the circulation of tears. Toward the end of my fieldwork in Cilegon in 2004, Djohan spoke

with me openly with me about Islam, ESQ, and the problems Krakatau Steel had adjusting to new political and economic conditions in Indonesia. He had by this time warmed greatly to my presence and appeared comfortable with a foreign observer at the factory. In one conversation, he connected an experience that he had after completing the *hajj* for the first time in 2002 to a subsequent experience he had shortly thereafter when he participated in ESQ:

After I did the hajj, I started to do *tahajud* prayers<sup>12</sup>... This was the first time I cried during prayer. I had no idea why I cried. This happened again after ESQ... After that I had to do good behavior.... My heart sees that God sees us.... What I am saying is that we have to believe in two different worlds, this world and the afterlife. You see [the afterlife] by what? Not by the eyes, but by the heart.... We can develop our built-in control, so that we won't do prohibited acts.

Djohan connects his immersion in the circulation of tears to achieving more effective self-management. In this instance, Djohan shows how crying is a physical sign of atonement that represents the personal transformation of a worshipping worker. Ritual weeping and an 'open heart' enable development of 'built-in control.' This produces a figure whose self-interests are no longer determined by a passion for individual gain, but rather are harmonized with the interests of the collective.

I asked Djohan for an example of how he had changed following his new ability to manage his heart. He said that prior to his enhanced devotion to Islam on business trips he would pocket any outstanding per diem allowance. However, after he had participated in the circulation of tears and learned how to better manage his heart, he realized that this was contrary to the central Islamic value of honesty. He declared 'it is not my money, but the company's money.... If everyone did it the company will not exist anymore.' Following his participation in ESQ he said

that he was always certain to return the unused portion of his per diem allowance to the company. Given the precarious position of Krakatau Steel, which faced an increasingly competitive global steel market, managers like Djohan see management of the heart as indispensable to corporate survival. Spiritual reform involves eliciting certain affective states in order to affect the action of company employees. Djohan's account of his transformation, in part achieved through the circulation of tears, represents a new regime of affect. In this sense it is reminiscent of the affective transformation from the passions to the interests that Hirschman described as facilitating the emergence of the modern economic order.

Later, in the same conversation, Djohan connected the affective dimension of built-in control to the new political realities that had reconfigured the problem of government in post-New Order Indonesia. He asked me rhetorically 'why was Mr. Suharto so effective?' Without pausing to allow me to respond he answered:

Because at that time most people came from the village, so what Suharto said, everyone agreed. One hundred percent agreed! And at that time the situation—political, economic—was very stable. "OK boss, I'll just support you"...but now it has changed. With ESQ, to control people it is not enough if it just comes externally, like the enforcement of regulations. It is more effective if the person has built-in control. Control to what? To do the right things! Control to have good behavior! If they can establish this control, discipline will emerge and if the people can be disciplined, the company will be ordered.

Djohan sees the Islam represented in ESQ training as a means of resolving the new problem of harmonizing government of the self and the collective in contemporary Indonesia. The New Order was characterized by external force, which was dependent on maintaining stability through

the threat of physical violence on the body. ESQ offered the possibility of internal control. This was a form of power that worked through the body, affecting it from the inside. This was designed to motivate people to act according to what corporate managers and spiritual reformers had decided matched both the interests of citizens and the nation at large.

## **CONCLUSION**

Spiritual reform in contemporary Indonesia entailed what I have referred to as governing through affect. Conceiving of the heart as an object of management and immersing program participants in the circulation of tears, spiritual reformers sought to elicit a set of personal transformations commensurate with a new global economy. Deployed in ritualistic settings, affect was the central medium through which these transformations could be achieved. Proponents of spiritual reform engaged in a set of practices that resembled those analyzed by Hirschman, in which affect was deployed as an ‘effective way of shaping the pattern of human actions.’

Thus, affect was absolutely central to the effectiveness of the ritualized practices of spiritual reform that were popular at state-owned and other Indonesian companies in the years following the end of the Suharto regime. In this sense, affect was indispensable to creating the ‘virtual’ of ritual. Bruce Kapferer has recently argued that virtuality produces the truth of ritual action. The virtual of ritual is a method for ‘entering within life’s vital processes and adjusting its dynamics. By entering within the particular dynamics of life by means of the virtuality of ritual, ritualists engage with positioning and structuring processes that are otherwise impossible to address in the tempo and dynamics of ordinary lived processes’ (Kapferer, 2004: 48). Affect constitutes the virtual of ritual insofar as it was the medium through which spiritual reform could

enter into the vital processes of human life. Thus, it was indispensable to creating the reality that ESQ is designed to achieve.

I conceive of affect as simultaneously internal and external to those enmeshed in new neoliberal norms. It moved through them and both represented and enacted a new form of personhood. The dynamic, reflexive qualities of affect enable it to make both its subject and object. The immersion of subjects within affect was designed to have specific effects. Spiritual training would likely have had little effect on those upon who subjected themselves to it without its intensely affective component. Indeed, this was one of the main differences between ESQ and other training programs contracted by the company, like the Seven Habits of Highly Effective People Training.

This new form of governing entailed the mobilization of affect to forge a subject amenable to new norms. This form of government linked self-interest to collective interest through a powerful means of affecting action. This was expressed by Djohan in his affirmation that through more effective management of his heart he became aware that the long-term survival of Krakatau Steel was more important than immediate personal gain. Further, the modulation of individual affect was linked to greater productivity and efficiency at iconic sites of national production, such as Krakatau Steel. Drawing on the already existing cultural norm of *qolbun salim* (Fox, 2004) and introducing bodily contact from what some Krakatau Steel employees identified as ‘Middle Eastern’ Islam, spiritual reformers offered affect as a means of harmonizing self-interest with collective interest. Developing affect offered a means through which corporate employees could better participate in the transnational economy.

Management of the heart was the central preoccupation of spiritual reformers in contemporary Indonesia. What was termed ‘emotional quotient’ was not directed toward

restricting emotional outbursts, but of better *administering* them. This involved developing techniques intended to exercise constant control over one's emotional states. Employees were instructed in precisely when it was appropriate (and when it was not) to enact specific affects. These lessons were not only linguistic. Instead they are directed towards inculcating bodily practices, such as the circulation of tears, both communicated and enacted affective transformation.

Ultimately, affect was indispensable to spiritual reform because it offered a means to a personal transformation that was better felt than known. As Kusmanto noted, proponents of spiritual reform had decided that technical competence was insufficient for achieving global competitiveness. Employees at Krakatau Steel lamented that the over emphasis on technical knowledge led to the moral problems of corruption and labor indiscipline. In response spiritual development was needed. Yet spirituality itself was not something that could be known rationally or, as Csordas's informant notes, represented in language. It could only be felt. The intense affects deployed at ESQ training sessions thus enabled participants to experience a spiritual transformation, something that was inaccessible through the forms of technical knowledge that dominated Suharto's New Order developmentalism.

## Acknowledgements

I extend my deepest gratitude to the employees of Krakatau Steel who enabled me to conduct research at the factory. I regret that in order to protect their confidentiality, I am not able to thank them individually. I also would like to thank and to offer my most sincere thanks to Ary Ginanjar, Rinaldi Agusyana, and the rest of their staff from the ESQ Leadership Center for kindly and patiently addressing my entreaties. I am grateful for constructive criticism and insightful comments that I received from mentors, colleagues, and friends as I worked on the ideas in this paper. I also received exceptionally useful comments from two *Anthropological Theory* reviewers and the editor, Joel Robbins. This research was enabled with material support from the Wenner-Gren Foundation for Anthropological Research; the International Dissertation Research Fellowship Program of the Social Science Research Council; the United States-Indonesia Society; a University of Victoria Internal Research Grant; and Fulbright-Hays. All outstanding errors are my own.

## Notes

---

<sup>1</sup> I have addressed the neoliberal dimensions of this program of Islamic spiritual reform elsewhere (Rudnyckyj, 2009a; Rudnyckyj, 2009b). For other analyses of the articulation of religious and economic reform see Osella and Osella, 2009; Soares, 2005.

<sup>2</sup> The New Order refers to the period during which Suharto held power in Indonesia, 1966-1998.

<sup>3</sup> As of December 2008 the three Indonesian provinces with no ESQ presence were Gorontalo, Maluku Utara, Nusa Tenggara Timur. These are among the poorest and least developed provinces in Indonesia.

---

<sup>4</sup> The circulation of affect entailed in these spiritual training sessions resembles the release of emotions noted by Thomas Csordas in his studies of ritual healing in contemporary Navajo society and among charismatic Catholics. Furthermore, Csordas's explanation of how ritual healing entails the simultaneous construction of personal and collective identities indicates a social phenomenon similar to the one I describe here (Csordas, 1999: 18-20; Csordas, 1994b: 40).

<sup>5</sup> For examples see Boellstorff and Lindquist, 2004; Lutz and Abu-Lughod, 1990; Lutz and White, 1986; Rosaldo, 1980.

<sup>6</sup> My use of Hirschman's work is meant not to suggest that governing through affect unfolded in Europe and was disseminated around the world in Hegelian fashion. There are clear differences in these historical settings. Rather, I seek to underline that a similar process was apparent in both contexts, and perhaps too in other settings removed in time or space. Furthermore, I invoke Hirschman's work to suggest that governing through affect is associated with the emergence of modern, liberal forms of political organization.

<sup>7</sup> This paper demonstrates how attention to affect is useful to the growing anthropological literature on governmentality (Ferguson and Gupta, 2002; Greenhalgh, 2003; Hoffman, 2006; Kanna, 2010; Karpiak, 2010; Li, 1999; Ong, 2000; Rudnyckyj, 2004).

<sup>8</sup> As Boellstorff and Lindquist note, 'the key Indonesian term *hati*, which means both 'liver' and 'seat of the emotions' is thus sometimes rendered as "heart"' (Boellstorff and Lindquist, 2004: 438). By contrast, the word for a physical heart is *jantung*. Some adherents of ESQ, like Arief, a veteran employee of the hot strip mill, connected the two signifiers by explaining that one's physical heart (*jantung*) 'beating more quickly is a sign of the transformation' of one's emotional center (*hati*).

---

<sup>9</sup> It is relevant here to note the material and symbolic importance of water in Indonesia.

Historically water has been crucial to social relations and political organization in Southeast Asia (Geertz, 1980: 69-86; Lansing, 1991). Rinaldi alludes to the importance of water in what was until recently an agrarian society by emphasizing that water ‘gives life.’ Anthropologists have long argued that many features of social organization in ‘inner Indonesia’ can be attributed to the elaborate irrigation systems that are an enduring feature of the landscape of Java and Bali (Geertz, 1963).

<sup>10</sup> For an overview of this organization and its founder Aa Gym, see Watson 2005.

<sup>11</sup> Although the vast majority of the workforce of Krakatau Steel is male, there was usually a small group of female employees at the company in attendance at spiritual training sessions.

<sup>12</sup> These are special prayers that are executed during the middle of the night. In the five-fold Islamic classification of human action *tahajud* prayers are not mandatory (*wajib*), but are encouraged (*sunnah*).

## References

- Abu-Lughod, Lila and Catherine Lutz (1990) 'Introduction: Emotion, Discourse, and the Politics of Everyday Life', in Catherine Lutz and Lila Abu-Lughod (eds) *Language and the Politics of Emotion*, pp. 1-23. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Amin, Riawan (2004) *The Celestial Management*. Jakarta: Senayan Abadi.
- Arberry, Arthur J. (1955) *The Koran Interpreted*. New York: Macmillan.
- Arndt, Heinz W. (1975) 'P.T. Krakatau Steel', *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies* 11(2): 120-126.

- 
- Boellstorff, Tom and Johan Lindquist (2004) 'Bodies of Emotion: Rethinking Culture and Emotion through Southeast Asia', *Ethnos* 69(4): 437-444.
- Brenner, Suzanne April (1998) *The Domestication of Desire: Women, Wealth, and Modernity in Java*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Csordas, Thomas (1994a) *Embodiement and Experience: The Existential Ground of Culture and Self*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Csordas, Thomas (1994b) *The Sacred Self: A Cultural Phenomenology of Charismatic Healing*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Csordas, Thomas (1999) 'Ritual Healing and the Politics of Identity in Contemporary Navajo Society', *American Ethnologist* 26(1): 3-22.
- Ferguson, James and Akhil Gupta (2002) 'Spatializing States: Toward an Ethnography of Neoliberal Governmentality', *American Ethnologist* 29(4): 981-1002.
- Foucault, Michel (1970) *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*. London: Tavistock Publications.
- Foucault, Michel (1983) 'The Subject and Power', in Hubert L. Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow (eds) *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, pp. 208-226. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Foucault, Michel (1991) 'Governmentality', in Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon and Peter Miller (eds) *The Foucault Effect*, pp. 87-104. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Foucault, Michel (2008) *The Birth of Biopolitics: Lectures at the College De France, 1978-1979*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Fox, James (2004) 'Currents in Contemporary Islam in Indonesia'. Paper presented at the Harvard Asia Vision 21 Conference. Cambridge, Massachusetts.

- 
- Geertz, Clifford (1963) *Agricultural Involution: The Process of Ecological Change in Indonesia*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Geertz, Clifford (1980) *Negara: The Theatre State in Nineteenth-Century Bali*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Geertz, Hildred (1961) *The Javanese Family: A Study of Kinship and Socialization*. New York: Free Press.
- Good, Mary-Jo Delvecchio and Byron Good (2008) 'Indonesia Sakit: Indonesian Disorders and the Subjective Experience and Interpretive Politics of Contemporary Indonesian Artists', in Mary-Jo Delvecchio Good, Sandra Hyde, Sarah Pinto, et al. (eds) *Postcolonial Disorders*, pp. 62-108. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Government of Indonesia (2000) 'Memorandum of Economic and Financial Policies'. Available at:  
<http://www.worldbank.or.id/eap/eap.nsf/2500ec5f1a2d9bad852568a3006f557d/66af15a48da09728472569af001857b6?OpenDocument>, accessed December 15, 2006.
- Greenhalgh, Susan (2003) 'Planned Births, Unplanned Persons: "Population" In the Making of Chinese Modernity', *American Ethnologist* 30(2): 196-215.
- Handelman, Don (1990) *Models and Mirrors: Towards an Anthropology of Public Events*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Heider, Karl G. (1991) *Landscapes of Emotion: Mapping Three Cultures of Emotion in Indonesia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hill, Hal (2000) *The Indonesian Economy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hirschkind, Charles (2001) 'The Ethics of Listening: Cassette-Sermon Audition in Contemporary Egypt', *American Ethnologist* 28(3): 623-649.

- 
- Hirschman, Albert O. (1977) *The Passions and the Interests: Political Arguments for Capitalism before Its Triumph*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Hoesterey, James (2008) 'Marketing Morality: The Rise, Fall and Rebranding of Aa Gym', in Greg Fealy and Sally White (eds) *Expressing Islam: Religious Life and Politics in Indonesia*, pp. 95-112. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Hoffman, Lisa (2006) 'Autonomous Choices and Patriotic Professionalism: On Governmentality in Late-Socialist China', *Economy and Society* 35(4): 550-570.
- Hollan, Douglas and C. Jason Throop (2008) 'Whatever Happened to Empathy?', *Ethos* 36(4): 385-401
- Howell, Julia Day (2008) 'Modulations of Active Piety: Professors and Televangelists as Promoters of Indonesian 'Sufisme'', in Greg Fealy and Sally White (eds) *Expressing Islam: Religious Life and Politics in Indonesia*, pp. 40-62. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Jones, Carla (2004) 'Whose Stress? Emotion Work in Middle-Class Javanese Homes', *Ethnos* 69(4): 509-528.
- Kanna, Ahmed (2010) 'Flexible Citizenship in Dubai: Neoliberal Subjectivity in the Emerging "City-Corporation"', *Cultural Anthropology* 25(1): 100-129.
- Kapferer, Bruce (2004) 'Ritual Dynamics and Virtual Practice: Beyond Representation and Meaning', *Social Analysis* 48(2): 35-54.
- Kapferer, Bruce (2008) 'Beyond Symbolic Representation: Victor Turner and Variations on the Themes of Ritual Process and Liminality', *Suomen Antropologi: Journal of the Finnish Anthropological Society* 33(4): 5-24.

- 
- Karpiak, Kevin G. (2010) 'Of Heroes and Polemics: "The Policeman" In Urban Ethnography', *Political and Legal Anthropology Review* 33(s1): 7-31.
- Kresman, R.A., Y.M. Hadin and D.W. Sumarni (1989) 'Amok: Sebuah Ilustrasi Kasus [Amok: Illustrated Cases]', *Jiwa* 22(3): 49-52.
- Lansing, John Stephen (1991) *Priests and Programmers: Technologies of Power in the Engineered Landscape of Bali*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Li, Tania Murray (1999) 'Compromising Power: Development, Culture, and Rule in Indonesia', *Cultural Anthropology* 14(3): 295-322.
- Lindquist, Johan (2004) 'Veils and Ecstasy: Negotiating Shame in the Indonesian Borderlands', *Ethnos* 69(4): 487-508.
- Lutz, Catherine and Lila Abu-Lughod (1990) *Language and the Politics of Emotion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lutz, Catherine and Geoffrey M. White (1986) 'The Anthropology of Emotions', *Annual Review of Anthropology* 15:405-436.
- Masco, Joseph (2008) "'Survival Is Your Business": Engineering Ruins and Affect in Nuclear America', *Cultural Anthropology* 23(2): 361-398.
- Mazzarella, William (2009) 'Affect: What Is It Good For?' in Saurabh Dube (ed) *Enchantments of Modernity: Empire, Nation, Globalization*, pp. 291-309. London: Routledge.
- Navaro-Yashin, Yael (2009) 'Affective Spaces, Melancholic Objects: Ruination and the Production of Anthropological Knowledge', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 15(1): 1-18.
- Ong, Aihwa (2000) 'Graduated Sovereignty in South-East Asia', *Theory, Culture & Society* 17(4): 55-75.

- 
- Osella, Filippo and Caroline Osella (2009) 'Business and Community between India and the Gulf: Muslim Entrepreneurs in Kerala, India', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* (n.s.) 15(s1): 202-221.
- Oxford English Dictionary (2008) Available at: [www.oed.com](http://www.oed.com), accessed June 25, 2008.
- Prasetyawan, Wahyu (2006) 'The Unfinished Privatization of Semen Padang: The Structure of the Political Economy in Post-Suharto Indonesia', *Indonesia* 81:51-70.
- Purwadi, Dibyo Soemantri, Alfuzi Salam, Purwo Djatmiko, et al. (2003) *Sejarah P.T. Krakatau Steel: Memelihara Momentum Pertumbuhan [The History of P.T. Krakatau Steel: Maintaining Momentum for Growth]*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Raja.
- Richard, Analiese and Daromir Rudnyckyj (2009) 'Economies of Affect', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* (n.s.) 15(1): 57-77.
- Rosaldo, Michelle Z. (1980) *Knowledge and Passion: Ilongot Notions of Self and Social Life*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Rose, Nikolas S. (1999) *Powers of Freedom: Reframing Political Thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Rudnyckyj, Daromir (2004) 'Technologies of Servitude: Governmentality and Indonesian Transnational Labor Migration', *Anthropological Quarterly* 77(3): 407-434.
- Rudnyckyj, Daromir (2009a) 'Market Islam in Indonesia', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* (n.s.) 15(s1): 183-201.
- Rudnyckyj, Daromir (2009b) 'Spiritual Economies: Islam and Neoliberalism in Contemporary Indonesia', *Cultural Anthropology* 24(1): 104-141.
- Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky (2003) *Touching Feeling: Affect, Pedagogy, Performativity*. Durham: Duke University Press.

- 
- Sidel, John T. (2006) *Riots, Pogroms, Jihad: Religious Violence in Indonesia*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Siegel, James T. (1998) *A New Criminal Type in Jakarta: Counter-Revolution Today*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Silvey, Rachel (2007) 'Mobilizing Piety: Gendered Morality and Indonesian-Saudi Transnational Migration', *Mobilities* 2(2): 219-229.
- Soares, Benjamin F. (2005) *Islam and the Prayer Economy: History and Authority in a Malian Town*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- Stewart, Kathleen (2008) *Ordinary Affects*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Strassler, Karen (2009) 'The Face of Money: Currency, Crisis, and Remediation in Post-Suharto Indonesia', *Cultural Anthropology* 24(1): 68-103.
- Thrift, Nigel (1998) 'The Rise of Soft Capitalism', in Andrew Herod, Gearóid O'Tuathail and Susan Roberts (eds) *An Unruly World?: Globalisation, Governance and Geography*, pp. 25-71. London: Routledge.
- Turner, Victor (1967) 'Betwixt and Between: The Liminal Period in Rites De Passage', in *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* (ed) pp. 93–111. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press.
- Turner, Victor (1969) *The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure*. Chicago: Aldine.
- Vatikiotis, Michael R. J. (1998) *Indonesian Politics under Suharto: The Rise and Fall of the New Order*. London: Routledge.
- Watson, C.W. (2005) 'A Popular Indonesian Preacher: The Significance of Aa Gymnastiar', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute (n.s.)* 11(4): 773-792.

---

Wikan, Unni (1990) *Managing Turbulent Hearts: A Balinese Formula for Living*. Chicago:  
University of Chicago Press.

Winzeler, Rober (1990) 'Amok: Cultural, Psychological, and Historical Perspectives', in Karim  
Wazir-Jahan Begum (ed) *Emotions of Culture: A Malay Perspective*, pp. 96-122.  
Singapore: Oxford University Press.