

**“We Know Where We Are”  
The Role of Place in Indigenous Historiography By Haudenosaunee  
and Northwest Métis Historians**

**by**

**Carla A.R. Osborne**

**B.Sc., University of Calgary, 2006  
M.A., University of Calgary, 2014**

**A Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the  
Requirements for the Degree of**

**DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY**

**in the Department of History**

**© Carla A.R. Osborne, 2023  
University of Victoria**

**All rights reserved. This dissertation may not be reproduced in whole or in part,  
by photocopy or other means, without the permission of the author.**

**We acknowledge and respect the lək'wəḡən peoples on whose traditional territory the  
university stands and the Songhees, Esquimalt and W̱SÁNEĆ peoples whose historical  
relationships with the land continue to this day.**

## **Supervisory Committee**

“We Know Where We Are”  
The Role of Place in Indigenous Historiography By Haudenosaunee  
and Northwest Métis Historians

by

Carla A.R. Osborne

B.Sc., University of Calgary, 2006  
M.A., University of Calgary, 2014

### **Supervisory Committee**

Dr. Christine O’Bonsawin, Department of History and Indigenous Studies  
**Co-Supervisor**

Dr. Peter Cook, Department of History  
**Co-Supervisor**

Dr. Elizabeth Vibert, Department of History  
**Departmental Member**

Dr. Robert Hancock, Department of Anthropology  
**Outside Member**

## **Abstract**

### ***Supervisory Committee***

Dr. Christine O’Bonsawin, Department of History and Indigenous Studies  
**Co-Supervisor**

Dr. Peter Cook, Department of History  
**Co-Supervisor**

Dr. Elizabeth Vibert, Department of History  
**Departmental Member**

Dr. Robert Hancock, Department of Anthropology  
**Outside Member**

Indigenous peoples in the Americas applied many means of encoding and passing down their histories prior to the arrival of Europeans, combining oral and material-based methods. They have maintained their own histories, including these original methods despite the violent disruptions imposed by settler colonialism. Furthermore, Indigenous peoples have adopted European-style methods alongside their own, both to share their histories with newcomers, and to help overcome the impacts of colonialism. The earliest written and published Indigenous histories for these purposes may be misunderstood as works of mythology, memoir, or outright fiction if presented separately from their context in Indigenous intellectual and historiographic tradition. To counter such misunderstandings and read these works in a respectful and accurate way, it is necessary to replace them in context and apply concepts from Indigenous critical and decolonial theory. This dissertation examines the changes in Indigenous historiography since the arrival of Europeans in two steps. First, it presents an overview of pre-invasion Indigenous historiographic methods and of recent Indigenous intellectual tradition. Then it presents two case studies of historical monographs by Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee writers and knowledge keepers published between 1825 and 2018. Each case study applies concepts from Indigenous critical theory and decolonial theory to support reading the monographs according to the epistemologies and narrative genres of the Indigenous nation. The case studies illustrate how the Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis written histories connect to pre-invasion, place-based records, and the ways that these historians have adopted and adapted Euro-style methods to new languages and media.

## Table of Contents

Supervisory Committee .....	ii
Abstract .....	iii
List of Tables .....	vii
List of Figures .....	viii
Acknowledgements .....	ix
Dedication .....	xi
Introduction .....	1
Opening Words .....	1
The Background and Context of This Study .....	3
Defining the Research Question and Objectives .....	13
Refining the Research Question and Justifying the Use of Written Works .....	15
Methodological Considerations: Selecting Sources for the Case Studies .....	24
The Research Plan, Its Limitations, and What Makes it Worthwhile .....	30
Chapter Overview .....	32
Chapter 1: Reading Indigenous History .....	35
Introduction .....	35
A Pause to Gather a Few Like Terms .....	37
Historiography 1.0 .....	43
Historiography 2.0 .....	46
Key Concepts About History in European and Indigenous Contexts .....	47
Indigenous Historiographic Methods Before the Invasion .....	50
Indigenous Historiographic Methods After the Invasion .....	57
Reading Indigenous History .....	64
A Quick Orientation to Recent Indigenous Intellectual Tradition .....	68
Two Possible Theoretical Approaches .....	73
Indigenous Critical Theory .....	83
Methodology: How to Get There From Here .....	90
Indigenous Narrative Genres .....	95
Conclusion .....	100
Chapter 2: Prologue to the Case Studies .....	102
Introduction .....	102
The Northwest Métis .....	103
Northwest Métis Epistemology .....	110
The Haudenosaunee Confederacy .....	113
Haudenosaunee Epistemology .....	119
Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee Narrative Genres .....	123
A Case Study Road Map .....	125
Primary Source Selection .....	126
The Primary Sources .....	131
Conclusion .....	133
Chapter 3: Northwest Métis Case Study .....	139

Introduction .....	139
A Distant View in Place and Theme .....	143
A Distant View in Time Part One: 250 Years of Emergence .....	148
A Distant View in Time Part Two: Surviving the Neoliberal Turn and Beyond .....	156
A Closer View in Mainstream Mode .....	169
From Red Power to Constitutional Debates, 1968 – 1982 .....	171
Contested Sites and Provincial Anniversaries, 1980 – 2001 .....	186
From Ethnohistories to Recording Northwest Métis Communities of BC, 2002 – 2018 .	204
A Closer View in Indigenous Critical Theory Mode .....	219
Early Style “Told-To” Narratives and Popular Histories .....	221
Batoche: A Case Study Within a Case Study .....	225
Single Author Works by Northwest Métis Authors .....	232
Community Histories .....	240
Stepping Back Again, Just A Little .....	243
Conclusion .....	244
Mind the Gap! .....	247
Chapter 4: Haudenosaunee Confederacy Case Study .....	253
Introduction .....	253
A Distant View in Time Part One: A First Hundred Years of Haudenosaunee Publishing Endeavour .....	255
A Distant View in Time Part Two: Phase Shifts and Time Capsules of Haudenosaunee Historiography .....	270
A Distant View in Place and Theme .....	284
A Closer View in a Mainstream Mode .....	295
League History, League Governance, and a Unique Nile Episode, 1851-1911 .....	297
An Amazing Long Writing Decade in the Career of Arthur C. Parker, 1913 – 1926 .....	311
United Empire Loyalists, Late 20 <sup>th</sup> Century Activism, and Reprinting the Great Law, 1955 – 1995 .....	320
New Syncretic Haudenosaunee Historiography, 2000 – 2017 .....	337
A Closer View in Indigenous Critical Theory Mode .....	353
Making Better Sense of Haudenosaunee Content .....	355
Countering Data Euro-(de)formation .....	363
Recontextualizing Complex Legacies .....	375
Conclusion .....	384
Chapter 5: Braiding the Strands Together .....	386
Introduction .....	386
The Professionalization of Indigenous History? .....	393
Place-Relating Histories Versus Space-Making Histories .....	400
Haudenosaunee Historiography: Place-Relating and Space-Making .....	402
Northwest Métis Historiography: Space-Making and Place-Relating? .....	407
Reading Indigenous Histories by Indigenous Authors and Contributors .....	411
Conclusion .....	412
Conclusion .....	415
Revisiting the Main Issues .....	415
Contributions of This Study .....	423

Future Research Possibilities .....	425
Closing Words .....	427
Appendix: Annotated Select Bibliography .....	429
Haudenosaunee .....	429
Articles .....	429
Monographs .....	430
Pamphlets (Less than or equal to 100 pages in length.) .....	432
Published Speeches .....	433
Theses and Dissertations .....	434
“Told-To” Narratives .....	434
Northwest Métis .....	436
Articles .....	436
Autobiography .....	439
Monographs .....	439
Pamphlets (Less than or equal to 100 pages in length.) .....	442
Pamphlet “Told-To” Narratives (Less than or equal to 100 pages in length.) .....	442
Published Speeches .....	443
Theses and Dissertations .....	444
“Told-To” Narratives .....	445
Bibliography .....	447
Primary Sources .....	447
Secondary Sources .....	450
Multimedia .....	478

## List of Tables

Table 1: Overview diagram for the case studies in Chapters 3 and 4. ....	126
Table 2: Northwest Métis Historical Monographs .....	134
Table 3: Haudenosaunee Historical Monographs .....	136
Table 4: Summary of key Indigenous and European historiographic concepts. ....	421

## List of Figures

Figure 1: Department of Indian Affairs Map of Treaty 8 Territory. ....	12
--	----

## **Acknowledgements**

As always, a dissertation is never completed without help from many other people and academic funding. This project was funded by the University Victoria through scholarships and teaching assistantships, and a Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada Doctoral Fellowship. Among the many people are the librarians and interlibrary loan staff at UVic, who always found a way to track down obscure references and work around the complications imposed by the COVID-19 pandemic with aplomb. The UVic library holdings are unique in their scope and quality for the institution's size, and I feel fortunate indeed to have been able to use it. The librarians at the Woodland Cultural Centre in Brantford, Ontario tracked down two different pamphlets for me and found time to scan and email them in spite of their collections being in boxes due to renovations. The Woodland Cultural Centre library staff's indomitable commitment to answering researcher requests in the middle of such upheaval on top of the pandemic is truly humbling.

I have been honoured and privileged to learn from so many distinguished scholars at the Departments of History and Anthropology at UVic. Wendy Wickwire, Judith Berman, and Elizabeth Vibert made sure that the original prospectus described a research project that could actually be completed by one person within the timelines of my program. Christine O'Bonsawin and Peter Cook did a great deal of academic translating, as I made my way to history from my undergraduate degrees and professional work in physics and archaeology via Greek and Roman studies. I suspect there were days my creative typos caused more than their share of confusion, but hopefully also some compensating amusement. Elizabeth Vibert, Robert Hancock, and

Michel Hogue tested and helped further improve the clarity and completeness of this dissertation. Luckily there were not quite as many draft versions of the dissertation as the prospectus though!

I have also benefited from opportunities to work and learn with so many fellow grad students pursuing their own diverse research topics in the course of my program at UVic. The number of relevant references and additional databases to check I learned about from them is astonishing. I wish it was possible to list you all without making anyone feel on the spot or otherwise uncomfortable, or possibly missing any of you! Still, I know you know who you are, and we'll be catching up over caffeinated beverages soon.

This project would have been impossible without the examples and teachings of the Indigenous elders and knowledge keepers I have learned and am still learning from to this day. My own Northwest Métis community and kin, with whom I have worked and travelled all over the lands between the North and South Saskatchewan Rivers in what is currently called the settler state of Canada were of course my first teachers. While living in Calgary, I was able to attend sessions with members of the hardworking Niitsitapi teams who have revised and expanded the interpretation of Head Smashed in Buffalo Jump and took part in designing and producing the Blackfoot Exhibit at the Glenbow Museum in Calgary, Alberta. A remarkable trip to Fort Qu'Appelle not only resulted in my meeting one of the last people to officially serve as an Indian Agent in Canada, but also to reconnect with my Cree relatives and through them Cree historical memory and teachings. Thank you all – Hai hai!

## **Dedication**

To Monica Rodriguez-Galvez,

ἔστι γὰρ ὁ φίλος ἄλλος αὐτός.

## **Introduction**

### ***Opening Words***

At the turn of the twenty-first century, a new cohort of university-trained Indigenous scholars helped complete the reinvigoration of an important genre in Indigenous historiography, an effort initiated by the founders of Indigenous studies in the 1960s. While research and publications in Indigenous history focussed on countering the negative impacts of colonial legal orders and attempts at social re-engineering of Indigenous communities remain necessary, this other genre takes a more proactive line. These newer works start unapologetically from the position that Indigenous history and historiography, governed by rules of evidence, transmission, and error checking within Indigenous communities, do not require settler validation. Their authors adapt and integrate European historiographic methods while emphasizing the importance of place, social relationships, and the absence of a single historical trajectory that all peoples must inevitably follow. However, this incorporation of European methods did not begin in the 1960s, but as early as the mid to late nineteenth century when the first Indigenous scholars were trained in local settler or overseas European colleges and universities.<sup>1</sup> Yet without a sense of how these newer works since the 1960s relate to this deeper Indigenous historiographic tradition, it can be all too easy to mistake Indigenous adaptation of new historiographic methods for something utterly unique and unprecedented. Worse yet, older materials set on paper by Indigenous or non-

1 Two of the earliest Indigenous authors to publish on their nation's histories in Canada were John Ojijatekha Brant-Sero (Haudenosaunee) and Peter Kahkewaquinaby Jones (Anishinabeg). Jones published his *History of the Ojebway Indians with Especial Reference to Their Conversion to Christianity* in 1861. Brant-Sero began presenting papers subsequently published in the proceedings of the Ontario and Wentworth Historical Societies in 1899. Their counterparts across the medicine line include David Cusick, whose monograph *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations* came out in 1825, and William Whipple Warren, with his 1885 *History of the Ojibways, Based Upon Traditions and Oral Statements*.

Indigenous recorders may be misunderstood as works of mythology, memoir, or outright fiction, precisely because they are regularly presented separately from their context in Indigenous intellectual and historiographic traditions. Luckily these challenges point to their own solution, first by setting newer works back into their proper context and second by showing how the older materials relate to new works by examining how Indigenous historiography has changed since the arrival of Europeans in the Americas.

Since 1990, both Indigenous and non-Indigenous scholars have published research illustrating different modes of Indigenous history recording and writing in studies where an interdisciplinary perspective is the rule rather than the exception. For example, anthropologists Audra Simpson and Julie Cruikshank<sup>2</sup> combine anthropological and historical methods and data. Other scholars have examined how specific settler land exploitation practices remove or at least obscure evidence of the depth of Indigenous history on and interaction with the land. This has involved a combination of methods and data from archaeology, geology, and history, as in analyses by Barbara Alice Mann and Michael C. Wilson,<sup>3</sup> a historian and an archaeologist, respectively. Even so, there are few investigations specifically of how Indigenous approaches to recording, passing down, and using their histories have changed over relatively recent history, the central question of this study. To be sure, this is for good reason. Even narrowing the potential scope from the Americas as a whole, not just to North America, but to northern North America, the contiguous area currently divided between the settler states of Canada and the

2 Audra Simpson, *Mohawk Interruptus {Political Life Across the Borders of Settler States}* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014).

Julie Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories: Narrative and Knowledge in the Yukon Territory* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998).

3 Barbara Alice Mann, *Native Americans, Archaeologists, and the Mounds* (New York: Peter Land Publishing Inc., 2003).

Michael C. Wilson, "Editing the Cultural Landscape: A Taphonomic Perspective on the Destruction of Aboriginal Sites on the Northwestern Plains," in *Archaeology on the Edge: New Perspectives from the Northern Plains*, eds. Bryan Kooyman and Jane H. Kelley (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004), 53-77.

United States still leaves hundreds of Indigenous historiographic traditions spanning millennia and potentially thousands of square kilometres. Yet the greater barriers to such investigations have been a delayed mainstream acceptance of Indigenous histories *as* histories, and settler unfamiliarity with Indigenous narrative genres and rhetorical tropes.

### ***The Background and Context of This Study***

From the late 1950s into the 1960s, anthropologists and historians became regular members of the teams of professionals on both sides of legal battles over land and Indigenous rights in the courts and new land claims tribunals in Canada and the United States. On one side were (and are) settler states vying for legitimacy and control of Indigenous lands. On the other were (and are) Indigenous peoples maintaining their legitimacy and resisting land seizures by every means available to them. Indigenous witnesses presented their own histories in these legal venues, including orally transmitted evidence, and scholars on their legal teams sought ways to ensure that such evidence would be accepted. As a result, Indigenous historical consciousness and oral history became established research topics, grudgingly accepted in mainstream academia. The body of publications resulting from this work with oral history is immense and by no means restricted to the Americas. The recognized authorities on both of these topics remained non-Indigenous scholars, however, and their works tended to foreground validations of Indigenous oral tradition via European documents and analytic methods. But as Michael E. Harkin observed in his 2010 retrospective on the field of ethnohistory, as the 1960s approached, “ethnohistory was forced to reckon with a set of epistemological and ethical issues, and thus with questions of identity and boundaries, in a more direct way and at an earlier point than other new disciplines.”<sup>4</sup>

4 Michael E. Harkin, “Ethnohistory’s Ethnohistory,” *Social Science History* 34, no. 2 (2010): 122.

This reckoning led to considerable change based on critiques by Indigenous communities, Indigenous scholars trained in ethnohistorical methods, and non-Indigenous ethnohistorians. By the 1980s, ethnohistorical and closely related language retention projects pursued research objectives determined as much by the participating Indigenous communities as outsider scholars. Examples of particular relevance here include Nora Marks Dauenhauer and Richard Dauenhauer's bilingual annotated volumes of Tlingit oral literature,<sup>5</sup> Keith Basso's work with the Cibecue Apache,<sup>6</sup> and Diane Paulette Payment's still transforming study of the Northwest Métis community of Batoche.<sup>7</sup> Still, it took until the turn of the twenty-first century for scholars to begin more explicitly considering how Indigenous ways of recording and transmitting their history have persisted and changed, at least since the arrival of Europeans in the Americas. Many studies that include meaningful Indigenous participation are still founded mainly on non-Indigenous epistemologies, as they were carried out by non-Indigenous scholars who emphasize respectful translation and recognition of independent Indigenous epistemologies. Over the turn of the twenty-first century, representative examples include edited collections such as 2007's *Myth and Memory: Stories of Indigenous-European Contact*,<sup>8</sup> and monographs by Keith Thor Carlson, Julie Cruikshank, Hans M. Carlson, and June Helm.<sup>9</sup>

- 5 Nora Marks Dauenhauer, and Richard Dauenhauer, *Haa Shuká, Our Ancestors: Tlingit Oral Narratives. Classics of Tlingit Oral Literature Volume One* (Seattle and Juno: University of Washington Press and Sealaska Heritage Foundation, 1987) and Nora Marks Dauenhauer, and Richard Dauenhauer, *Haa Tuwunáagu Yís, For Healing Our Spirit: Tlingit Oratory. Classics of Tlingit Oral Literature Volume Two* (Seattle and Juno: University of Washington Press and Sealaska Heritage Foundation, 1990).
- 6 Keith Basso, *Wisdom Sits in Places: Landscape and Language Among the Western Apache* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996) and Keith Basso, *Western Apache Language and Culture: Essays in Linguistic Anthropology* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1990).
- 7 Diane Paulette Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres: A History of the Métis Community of Batoche, Saskatchewan* (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2009).
- 8 John Sutton Lutz, ed., *Myth and Memory: Stories of Indigenous-European Contact* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2007).
- 9 Keith Thor Carlson, *The Power of Place, the Problem of Time: Aboriginal Identity and Historical Consciousness in the Cauldron of Colonialism* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010). Hans M. Carlson, *Home is the Hunter: The James Bay Cree and Their Land* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2008).

Still, these are not examples of the type of meta-analysis at the centre of this study, one that examines a selection of narratives of Indigenous history as such, let alone those produced specifically by historians who are Indigenous themselves. There are still no obvious follow-up articles to Robin Jarvis Brownlie's 2009 consideration of "Aboriginal thinkers' interventions into historical thought and writing in Canada."<sup>10</sup> Brownlie considers books by George Copway and Peter Jones, whom Brownlie identifies as the two earliest published Indigenous writers in Canada. Brownlie describes the recent leap in Indigenous historical production, including its extension into multimedia, which suggests a whole range of remarkable works not yet considered. However, no one has attempted any kind of survey of such Indigenous historical production, systematic or otherwise.

Meanwhile, despite its promising title, "Twenty-First Century Indigenous Historiography: Twenty-Two Must-Read Books," this 2015 article by Desveaux and colleagues is far more focused on providing an annotated reading list in history written about Indigenous peoples than on historiographic analysis as such.<sup>11</sup> Brownlie and Desveaux *et al.*'s selected publications turned out to be the only articles referring to Indigenous or Aboriginal history as documented and published by Indigenous scholars based in the subfields of Canadian, United States, or North American history. Of the works considered by Desveaux *et al.*, only three are by Indigenous authors, and the focus is on reading more and getting better informed about "Indigenous history"

Julie Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories: Narrative and Knowledge in the Yukon Territory* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998).

June Helm, *The People of Denendeh: Ethnohistory of the Indians of Canada's Northwest Territories* (Montréal: McGill-Queen's University Press).

10 Robin Jarvis Brownlie, "First Nations Perspectives and Historical Thinking in Canada," in *First Nations, First Thoughts: The Impact of Indigenous Thought in Canada*, ed. Annis Mary Timpson (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009), 22.

11 Michelle Desveaux, Patrick Chassé, Glenn Icton, Anne Janhunen, and Omeasoo Wāhpāsiw, "Twenty-First Century Indigenous Historiography: Twenty-Two Must-Read Books," *Canadian Journal of History* 50, no. 3 (2015): 524-548.

in the widest sense, rather than exploring how Indigenous peoples encode and share historical knowledge both within and beyond European forms of writing. An understandably more fruitful place to look is the growing number of articles and books by Indigenous historians, where I found three foundational texts for this study.

The more recently published of these texts is the collection edited by Susan A. Miller and James Riding In, *Native Historians Write Back: Decolonizing American Indian History*.<sup>12</sup> This anthology's purpose is to challenge established modes of settler historiography about Indigenous peoples and bring together a powerful collection of articles dating from 1977 to 2009. Its purpose is also to lay out and illustrate by example what Miller, in her first of two chapter contributions to this collection, refers to as "the Indigenous paradigm" in historiography by Indigenous historians.<sup>13</sup> Her formulation will provide an important framework for the selection and application of theory and methods for this project. The all-important combination of theory with worked examples represented by *Native Historians Write Back* is an essential desideratum for any budding Indigenous historian seeking models to follow.

Lisa Brooks' 2008 book, *The Common Pot: The Recovery of Native Space in the Northeast*,<sup>14</sup> is a profound study of Indigenous place-worlds in the areas currently divided by the political boundaries of the northeastern United States and southeastern extremities of Canada. She does so through the study of communal stories capable of connecting "people with their relations across time, bringing the past, present, and future into the same space."<sup>15</sup> Brooks traces Indigenous

12 Susan A. Miller and James Riding In, *Native Historians Write Back: Decolonizing American Indian History* (Lubbock: Texas University Press, 2011).

13 Susan A. Miller, "Native America Writes Back: The Origins of the Indigenous Paradigm in Historiography," and "Native Historians Write Back: The Indigenous Paradigm in American Indian Historiography," in *Native Historians Write Back: Decolonizing American Indian History*, eds. Susan A. Miller and James Riding In (Lubbock: Texas University Press, 2011), 9-24 and 25-40.

14 Lisa Brooks, *The Common Pot: The Recovery of Native Space in the Northeast* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008).

15 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 12.

recording systems specific to the Northeast, including birchbark writings, wampum strings and belts, and graphical symbol systems demonstrated in Indigenous mapmaking.<sup>16</sup> Furthermore, she emphasizes the Abenaki term *awikhigan* (pl. *awikhiganak*), based on a root referring to drawing, writing, and mapping, and how *awikhiganak* and wampum alike “exemplify a spatialized writing tradition.”<sup>17</sup> Thanks to Brooks’ study, I came to better understand a greater trend in Indigenous scholarship – collaboration with cartographers to produce and integrate maps into Indigenous scholars’ written and spoken publications.

The third source is Winona Wheeler’s 2005 article, “Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories,” drawing on research she conducted for her doctoral dissertation on decolonizing Indigenous histories.<sup>18</sup> In just over 16 pages, Wheeler carefully traces how key elements of relationship, spirituality, and respect for cultural protocol may be lost when scholars treat oral histories as mere “sources.” Like Brooks, she considers how elders and knowledge keepers integrated new recording methods for Indigenous history not as replacements, but as additional tools to help the knowledge live through grim times for their communities.<sup>19</sup> Unlike Brooks, Wheeler bases her discussion in her own *nêhiyawat* community and neighbouring Indigenous nations.<sup>20</sup> Yes, Wheeler is discussing *oral* histories, but the importance of place to those histories and their remembering is ever-present as she describes the hard work on the land and with elders necessary to earn their trust and the right to

16 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 9-12.

17 *Ibid.*

18 Winona Wheeler, “Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories,” in *Walking a Tightrope: Aboriginal People and Their Representations*, eds. David T. McNab and Ute Lischke (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2005), 189-213.

19 Wheeler, “Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories,” 194-195.

20 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 189-190

learn and retell histories.<sup>21</sup> These are still spatialized histories, and, as I argue, also recorded in part by means of a spatialized writing tradition.

Many Indigenous nations have some amount of published historical writing available for study. A remarkable amount of such material made it to print and can be borrowed or downloaded in electronic form from extensive institutional archives or smaller, community-based collections. It is now unusual to be unable to access theses and dissertations completed at public universities either online or by judicious application of even a public library card. In addition, there are many reports, transcriptions, and other manuscripts that have not been published, but that Indigenous communities keep in their archives and may make available to scholars after seeing a research proposal and meeting the scholar. These are just what we could call the Euro-style possibilities, although they take on specifically Indigenous forms, meanings, and alternatives. Ethnohistorical projects in which Indigenous communities work with scholars to produce versions of episodes from their histories for purposes ranging from creating a museum exhibit to animated videos are a whole other universe of choices. But personally speaking, there is what one of my cousins would refer to as “something of a story.”

I am part of a Northwest Métis family, but grew up mainly on the territories of the Songhees, Esquimalt and W̱SÁNEĆ peoples, far from our proper homelands, which are centred on the North Saskatchewan River valley. Much of my family today lives within what is currently called Alberta, spread between the communities of Valleyview, Bonnyville, Cold Lake, Edmonton, and Elizabeth Métis Settlement. We have cousins who are part of Cold Lake First Nations and the Northwest Métis community of Lac Ste. Anne. But it wasn't until I first undertook graduate studies that I learned we likely have cousins at the small but persistent Northwest Métis community in

21 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 189-190; 202-203.

Okanagan territory to this day, although we have lost direct contact with them. I say when I first undertook graduate studies, because my original plan was to undertake a summer graduate program designed for professionals with extensive experience in Indigenous consultation for natural resource projects. My experience in this area derives from over fifteen years of work in the Canadian federal public service, where I took on several different roles. I started focussed on research and assessment, then moved to a more outreach-oriented position centred on presenting information about federal energy regulation to Indigenous communities. For its part, over those years, the Canadian federal government received considerable legal and practical direction to improve its consultation and engagement with Indigenous peoples as part of its duty to uphold the honour of the British Crown.

As a federal employee faced with the need to contribute to implementing this new direction, I proposed and developed a practical means to learn which Indigenous communities and organizations to contact to support doing a more respectful and effective job at consultation. This entailed geographic research in order to develop a sense of whose traditional territory had already been affected by a given project and/or would be affected by a new project proposal. This was how I began learning about archives and about how thoroughly inappropriate most Euro-style mapping methods are in helping us understand the complex relationships between Indigenous communities, their lands, and their waters. Some Indigenous communities were developing websites and posting maps of their traditional territories by the early 2000s, but not many. Most Indigenous representatives I spoke to were pleased to learn that they were being contacted based on what federal employees were learning about their land relationships. Nevertheless, more and more of those representatives very patiently said, “You need to learn

more Indigenous history.” I was a little puzzled by this in the early 2000s because my focus was on gathering maps or at least written or verbal geographic descriptions.

The summer graduate program had strong anthropology, geography, and history components, so I expected it would help me to unpack the guidance to learn more about Indigenous history that Indigenous representatives were sharing with me. Considering my practical and personal background, I was advised to focus my coursework on Métis-specific studies, and to begin thinking of potential cartography-centred ideas for my final project. Northwest Métis traditional land relationships were so poorly understood outside our communities that my final project for the program was already taking discernible shape. I duly started to work, completing a course in advanced Métis ethnography in the fall of 2010, only to receive the shocking news that the summer graduate program had lost its funding, and the person who would have supervised my project would no longer be available. Later that fall, I was working more often on meetings in First Nations and Northwest Métis communities near where my family is from. Consequently, I met more representatives who declared, “Hey, I know your cousin!” which led me to reassess my research plans. If I was going to keep researching Indigenous geographies and histories, it was time to think seriously about accountability to relatives who hoped I would learn the things I had not been able to growing up so far from our own territory. But I still did not know where to start on learning Indigenous history, let alone researching it. All I really had was my class project from the advanced Métis ethnography course, a map-based study of my own family’s land relationships, and a tangle of

unsatisfactory loose ends.<sup>22</sup> Feeling rather stuck, I decided to pursue an alternate graduate project studying Cree literature instead, focussing on the protocols of guest-host relationships.

Returning to my day job and preparing for another series of meetings where I would present to Indigenous representatives about the pending regulatory hearings for yet another project, the map reproduced below (Figure 1) crossed my desk. This copy is in colour and reproduced from Charles Mair's *Through the Mackenzie Basin*,<sup>23</sup> but the original version I saw was a muddy black and white reproduction in Volume 3 of *Indian Treaties and Surrenders, From 1680 – 1912*.<sup>24</sup> Even in the poorer quality black and white version, I could see the deprecated label “Iroquois” well enough to wonder how they could possibly have been signatories to Treaty 8 when their traditional lands were far to the southeast. I had partly misunderstood: they were not signatories to this treaty. But there were enough Haudenosaunee in that region to be noted on the map.

Researching the fur trade in this region led me to Elizabeth Macpherson's book *The Sun Traveller: The Story of the Callihooos in Alberta*.<sup>25</sup> Setting the scene for her account, Macpherson summarized how the North West Company hired Haudenosaunee men from Kahnawà:ke to come west and take part in the beaver wars, explaining how they were mainly assigned to the region administered from Jasper House (today the town of Jasper, Alberta). That, of course, is the very region where the map places the Haudenosaunee. Not long after reading this, I borrowed a copy of Anne Anderson's *The First Métis... A New Nation*,<sup>26</sup> where she presented pages of stories and

22 Carla Osborne, “A Métis Palimpsest: Being an Exploration of Métis Identity Through Places, Stories, and Personal Reflection,” *Anthropology 503: Advanced Ethnography of the Métis*, Instructor Mike Evans (Final Class Project, University of British Columbia – Okanagan, September 2010).

23 Charles Mair and Roderick MacFarlane, *Through the Mackenzie Basin: A Narrative of the Athabasca and Peace River Treaty Expedition of 1899 and Notes on the Mammals and Birds of Northern Canada* (Toronto: William Briggs, 1908), fold out plate between pages 14-15.

24 Canada, Department of Indian Affairs, *Indian Treaties and Surrenders, from 1680-1912*, in 3 Volumes (Ottawa: Queen's Printer, 1912 [1971]), fold out plate between pages 293-294.

25 Elizabeth Macpherson, *The Sun Traveller: The Story of the Callihooos in Alberta* (St. Albert: Musée Héritage Museum, 1988), 4-13.

26 Anne Anderson, *The First Métis... A New Nation* (Edmonton: Uvisco Press, 1985).

genealogies connecting the former Kahnawà:ke hires around Jasper House to my own relatives in the Edmonton and Lac Ste. Anne areas. It was quite a surprise to learn that I had a modest connection to the Haudenosaunee, whose Confederacy and political activism were so prominent in the settler Canadian history I had learned about in grade school. The same books that declared the Northwest Métis extinct said nothing at all about men from Kahnawà:ke coming west during the fur trade. If nothing else, I now understood why Indigenous representatives kept pointing me to *Indigenous history* instead of just maps. Maps and settler histories left out far too much, and I did not understand Northwest Métis history.



Figure 1: Department of Indian Affairs Map of Treaty 8 Territory.

### ***Defining the Research Question and Objectives***

As I now understand, there are Indigenous histories, that is, accounts of past events preserved and passed down by Indigenous knowledge keepers. The mainstream view no longer accepts the idea that Indigenous peoples in the Americas (and the rest of the world) had no historical sense or historical development prior to contact with Europeans. More recent research demonstrating that other means of encoding and preserving history were available before and often alongside writing, including among Europeans, has demonstrated that history is not solely a product of writing. On their part, in order to produce written Indigenous histories, Indigenous writers and collaborators would call on their original archives created and curated according to methods and protocols established prior to the arrival of Europeans. Bearing in mind how great a disruption the European invasion and subsequent settler colonialism has been for Indigenous nations, logically, the original history encoding methods must have been impacted just as their Indigenous practitioners were. I could not find any studies on this aspect of Indigenous historiography; there was no examination of how writing and other Euro-style encoding methods were adapted and adopted by Indigenous peoples. With such a lacuna in the scholarly description of Indigenous history recording, I set out to research the question of how Indigenous methods of recording, transmitting, and applying their histories have changed in recent history.

When it came time to begin preparing the proposal for this project to study Indigenous historiography by Indigenous historians, I did appreciate that this is still an extensive research question. Narrowing the scope of possible Indigenous historiography to examine to that written by scholars and knowledge keepers of Indigenous nations within northern North America did not reduce the pool of potential sources enough. Evidently a case study approach based on writing

from members of a specific Indigenous nation would be necessary, but I did not originally expect to do two of them. Mainstream histories that include the Northwest Métis have been so dominated by the nineteenth-century Resistance movements and the debacle of Métis scrip that I was looking forward to bringing together actual Northwest Métis materials. Yet it was not obvious how to track down Indigenous-based accounts, and I was having difficulties accessing Northwest Métis historiography references, which kept dead-ending at the supplemental CD-ROM of materials from the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1991-1996).<sup>27</sup> Early on I gravitated towards studying Haudenosaunee historiography as well, although not originally for this project. Maybe that would be a task for a follow-up paper focussing on the Jasper House communities. So I thought, until my participation in the mandatory historiography class for my doctoral program led me to reread Barbara Alice Mann's 2000 book *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas*, which I first read in 2006 for an undergraduate ethnography class. Now with a historiography-oriented framework in mind instead of an ethnography-oriented one, this book completely turned my unconscious assumptions on their ears.

First, with refreshed eyes, I could now appreciate that Indigenous histories did not need to centre on “settlers” and colonialism all the time or repeat some strange stubborn claim that all Indigenous people are going extinct as a sad, cruel, inevitable consequence of meeting “superior beings.” Second, I came to better understand that Indigenous peoples have their own deep historical archives that remain accessible to this day. I had taken an intensive course on landscape archaeology earlier as an undergraduate and never made the connection between land, memory, and *history* until this second reading. Quite suddenly, I could see how to bring together all those unsatisfactory loose ends from not just my accidentally truncated summer graduate

<sup>27</sup> *For Seven Generations: An Information Legacy of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples*, CD-ROM, Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (Ottawa: Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1997).

program, but also from my earlier undergraduate archaeology degree. Studying Haudenosaunee historiography would help me make explicit what were, in my mind, implicit rules for composing and conveying Northwest Métis history. I would not be able to properly contextualize or read the texts I was going to study without making what was most familiar to me strange, albeit in a good and respectful way based within an Indigenous framework.

Thinking through this also made clear that in this project, I would be able to honour some important feedback from an elder when I was still living in Alberta, helping at a sweatlodge near Calgary. It was 2001, and we were discussing the then-newly opened Blackfoot Gallery at the Glenbow Museum. We were all excited about it, a mixed crowd of Northwest Métis, Cree and Blackfoot friends and elders. Our conversation wandered from the Blackfoot Gallery to discussing Indigenous history more broadly, leading one elder to comment on how frustrating it was that researchers kept coming back for more stories when they had already gone away with recordings of so much. Let alone all the books by Indigenous scholars; why didn't the researchers read those and spend more quality time with the stuff already in archives before coming for more? It is a good question that offers a Northwest Métis-style direction to learn how to do and read Indigenous history by studying what Indigenous historians and collaborators have already gifted us in print and archives. So that is the launching point for this project, and the chance to research in – or work in – Indigenous-founded and managed archives remains open for follow-up projects.

### ***Refining the Research Question and Justifying the Use of Written Works***

Before previewing subsequent chapters, I have learned that clarifying terminology and the background to my research decisions up-front can be helpful. I will also provide a (very) brief, wide-scale review of Indigenous historiography to orient the reader on the figurative landscape

of Indigenous history writing since the arrival of Europeans in northern North America. By providing temporal markers to complement the geographical ones, I follow the example set by Brooks, Miller, and Wheeler. Like them, I am mindful that for many readers, regardless of whether or not they are Indigenous, without actual dates, it is hard not to feel lost.

It may sound contradictory to examine written materials to understand Indigenous historiographies, but the key is that the Indigenous participants are applying their own traditions in a cross-cultural context. As a result, Indigenous historians are forced to make explicit their ways of recording and understanding their histories, creating snapshots of the methods specific to their time and place. Initially, this meant taking part in the production of what literary theorist Sophie McCall<sup>28</sup> refers to as “told-to” narratives, in which Indigenous historians recounted stories to newcomers who edited and published them. These newcomers were mainly missionaries and anthropologists until the early 1900s when public interest in the fate of the Northwest Métis after the Resistances of 1869 and 1885 and the dramatic Canadian and American efforts to end Haudenosaunee self-government drew journalists into the ranks of story collectors. The ethnohistorians of the 1960s produced a new genre of “told-to” narratives that retold Indigenous histories in settler terms. Later in the decade, Indigenous lawyers working on land claims wrote accounts of their nations using oral tradition combined with written sources,<sup>29</sup> while the first Indigenous scholars to combine European-style training as historians with their own traditions began publishing books in the late 1990s.<sup>30</sup>

28 Sophie McCall, *First Person Plural: Aboriginal Storytelling and the Ethics of Collaborative Authorship* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2011).

29 Vine Deloria Jr., *Custer Died for Your Sins: An Indian Manifesto* (Toronto: MacMillan Company, 1969). Harold Cardinal, *The Unjust Society: The Tragedy of Canada's Indians* (Edmonton: M.G. Hurtig, 1969).

30 A few of these scholars include Olive Patricia Dickason (Northwest Métis, 1992), Georges Sioui (Wendat, 1992, 1999), Barbara Alice Mann (Haudenosaunee, 1998), and David T. McNab (Northwest Métis, 1999).

Although I have consistently used the terms “Indigenous history” and “Indigenous historiography” to this point, I have applied them anachronistically. The earliest scholarly use of the former term I have located is 2008, and the latter nowhere at all. In addition, I have allowed “Indigenous history” to encompass any history of an Indigenous nation or community, regardless of whether the person(s) credited with writing or compiling the publications are Indigenous or not. This is necessary, especially for the period from when Europeans first arrived in force until the late 1960s, since, as already noted, Indigenous people had little to no access to the paths that facilitate writing and publishing history. The earliest access points were commonly via public speeches, such as those delivered by Haudenosaunee leaders Maris Bryant Pierce and Nathaniel T. Strong in 1839. This is a common but not exclusive access point, as there is compelling evidence of earlier pamphlet production by Haudenosaunee authors, such as David Cusick’s *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations*, first published in 1825.<sup>31</sup> Another key access point was found in the sermons delivered by Indigenous men trained as Methodist ministers taking part in the Methodist practice of speaking tours for fundraising, advocacy, and gathering converts. Two of the best-known examples are Peter Jones (Kahkewaquonaby), a Mississauga Ojibwa,<sup>32</sup> and William A. Elias (Ezhaaswe), an Odawa/Ojibwa born on Walpole Island, Ontario.<sup>33</sup> Jones was ordained in 1833<sup>34</sup> and went on to become a prominent missionary and translator.<sup>35</sup> Elias took a different path to the ministry, moving through residential school to training at Victoria

31 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 243.

32 Donald B. Smith, *Sacred Feathers: The Reverend Peter Jones (Kahkewaquonaby) and the Mississauga Indians* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2013), 6-7.

33 David T. McNab, “Landscape and Mindscape Conjoined: The Empire of Nature and the Nature of Empires in the Journals of Ezhaaswe (William A. Elias) (c. 1848–1929),” in *The Nature of Empires and Empires of Nature*, ed. Karl S. Hele (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2013), 222-223.

34 G. Osborn, “A Brief Sketch of the Life of the Author,” in *History of the Ojebway Indians with Especial Reference to Their Conversion to Christianity* by Peter Jones (London: A.W. Bennett, 1861), 10.

35 Smith, *Sacred Feathers*, 57-61; 128-129; 185-186.

College and ordination in 1889.<sup>36</sup> Both Jones and Elias took part in land claims advocacy that led them to trace treaties and land dealings in the oral and written records available to them, although only Jones wrote an Ojibway (Ojebway) history that was published after his death.<sup>37</sup>

Jones' example reinforces the point that almost as soon as Indigenous people could find ways to publish their histories and have them recognized as such, they did. What they published did not necessarily say what mainstream audiences wanted to hear, especially starting in the late 1960s. Vine Deloria, Jr.'s 1969 book *Custer Died for Your Sins*, followed closely by Traveler Bird's *Tell Them They Lie: The Sequoyah Myth* in 1971,<sup>38</sup> are examples of Indigenous books that condemned accepted, even beloved, mainstream accounts of their nations and Indigenous peoples at large.

Since 2000, the study of Indigenous historiography has gained ground via community-based research and as more mainstream scholars publish monographs discussing Indigenous understandings of history.<sup>39</sup> Judith Berman's "'Some Mysterious Means of Fortune': A Look at North Pacific Coast Oral History" from 2004 considers Kwakwaka'wakw, Coast Tsimshian, Haida, and Tlingit materials collected by both Indigenous and non-Indigenous scholars between 1900 and 1940. Berman analyzes these narratives as both a form of history and as traditional literature, including a nuanced discussion of what makes them "history" and their attendant epistemological frameworks.<sup>40</sup> Keith Thor Carlson's contribution to the 2007 anthology *Myth*

36 McNab, "Landscape and Mindscape Conjoined," 223.

37 McNab, "Landscape and Mindscape Conjoined," 230-232.  
Smith, *Sacred Feathers*, 174-178.

38 Traveler Bird, *Tell Them They Lie: The Sequoyah Myth* (Los Angeles: Westernlore Publishers, 1971).

39 For example, some of these scholars in British Columbia are Bev Sellars, Darwin Hanna, Marianne Ignace, and Ronald E. Ignace.

40 Judith Berman, "'Some Mysterious Means of Fortune': A Look at North Pacific Coast Oral History," in *Coming to Shore: Northwest Coast Ethnology, Traditions, and Visions*, eds. Marie Mauze, Michael Harkin and Sergei Kan, (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2004), 130; 135-137.

*and Memory: Stories of Indigenous-European Contact*<sup>41</sup> takes a similar approach by examining how history is understood, then narrated and composed by Coast Salish people.

Still, despite the growing body of work of this type, considerable scholarly resistance remains to accepting that Indigenous peoples have historical consciousnesses that pre-date European presence in the Americas. The “Iroquois Influence Debate” sparked by Indigenous scholars arguing from both pre- and post-European arrival history generated significant backlash from non-Indigenous “Iroquoianists” from the late 1970s to the late 1990s.<sup>42</sup> As late as 2003, ethnohistorians could still describe Indigenous communities as having a “protohistoric period” defined by the arrival of Europeans<sup>43</sup> or produce an old-style “told-to” narrative presenting an Indigenous elder’s oral historical narratives as curious memoirs with little historical content in 2010.<sup>44</sup>

Wendy Wickwire examined the problem of this resistance and challenged scholars of British Columbian ethnohistory and folklore to overcome it in her 2005 article, “Stories from the Margins: Toward a More Inclusive BC Historiography,”<sup>45</sup> where she argues that “current historiography has been slow to incorporate a strong indigenous perspective because of its dependence on an ethnographic archive that is largely devoid of cultural context.”<sup>46</sup> Wickwire presents an example of giving a necessary frame of reference from her long collaboration with Harry Robinson, an Okanagan storyteller.<sup>47</sup> She emphasizes how placing Robinson’s stories in cultural context helps historians grounded in the European tradition to take those stories

41 Keith Thor Carlson, “Reflections on Indigenous History and Memory,” in *Myth and Memory: Stories of Indigenous-European Contact*, ed. John Sutton Lutz (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2007), 46-68.

42 The touchpaper for the debate was Donald A. Grinde, Jr.’s 1977 *The Iroquois and the Founding of the American Nation* (San Francisco: Indian Historian Press).

43 Larry Cebula, *Plateau Indians and the Quest for Spiritual Power, 1700-1850* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2003), 27-51.

44 Dorothy Kennedy and Randy Bouchard, *The Lil’wat World of Charlie Mack* (Vancouver: Talonbooks, 2010).

45 Wendy Wickwire, “Stories from the Margins: Toward a More Inclusive BC Historiography,” *Journal of American Folklore* 118, no. 470 (Fall 2005): 453-474.

46 Wickwire, “Stories from the Margins,” 455-456.

47 Wickwire, “Stories from the Margins,” 456.

seriously, explaining that “Knowing, for instance, that neither he nor his storytelling tradition at large supported fictional accounts... opens new possibilities for the interpretation of myth.”<sup>48</sup>

Furthermore, Wickwire discusses how this approach may support rereading old texts in a more respectful manner.<sup>49</sup> Her study is both a salutary and timely reminder of the importance of tracing the chain of transmission that has built the mainstream archive of Indigenous narratives.

As noted above, the role of anthropologists in bringing “told-to” narratives into print changed rapidly between the 1970s and the late 1990s. Julie Cruikshank’s work with Athapaskan elders, published in 1998 as *The Social Life of Stories: Narrative and Knowledge in the Yukon Territory*, marked a new direction in which the anthropologist took the role of student-collaborator rather than scholar-authority.<sup>50</sup> Louis Bird has been working with both amateur and professional historians since the late 1990s, leading to several publications, including *Telling Our Stories: Omushkego Legends and Histories From Hudson Bay* (2005) and *The Spirit Lives in the Mind: Omushkego Stories, Lives, and Dreams* (2007).<sup>51</sup> Both are complex collections weaving together a sequence of “legends and histories” from the Hudson Bay region dealing with contact, new technologies and goods, and times ranging from the deep past to the near present. Yet another exemplar of this new approach to “told-to” narratives is Elsie Paul’s *Written as I Remember It: Teachings (ʔəms taʔaw) From the Life of a Sliammon Elder* (2014).<sup>52</sup>

48 Wickwire, “Stories from the Margins,” 463.

49 Wickwire, “Stories from the Margins,” 466-468.

50 In this book Cruikshank followed up and built on her learnings in her 1990 book, *Life Lived Like a Story: Life Stories of Three Yukon Native Elders* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press).

51 Louis Bird, *Telling Our Stories: Omushkego Legends and Histories from Hudson Bay* (Peterborough: Broadview Press, 2005).

Louis Bird, and Susan Elaine Gray, *The Spirit Lives in the Mind: Omushkego Stories, Lives, and Dreams*. Edited by Roland Bohr, Anne Lindsay, and Donna G. Sutherland (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2007).

52 Elsie Paul, in collaboration with Paige Raibmon and Harmony Johnson, *Written as I Remember It: Teachings (ʔəms taʔaw) From the Life of a Sliammon Elder* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014).

Now, let me turn specifically to Indigenous histories written by Indigenous historians since 1970, who often, but not always, have mainstream university credentials. These histories are *not* “told-to” narratives. Instead, they range from reassessments of mainstream scholars’ constructions of Indigenous histories to brand-new tellings framed in explicit cultural contexts.

The origins of these published Indigenous histories lie in the early 1960s in the United States. Activists and historians Rupert Costo and Jeannette Henry founded and edited a new scholarly periodical, *The Indian Historian*, in 1964. Until the end of its run in 1980, this journal exemplified the main focus of these scholars, which was the revision of histories of Indigenous-invader and later Indigenous-settler interactions.<sup>53</sup> Indigenous scholars built on the support and visibility of this periodical through the 1960s to break into others. After 1970 their momentum grew into scores of articles in new journals, including *American Indian Culture and Research Journal*, *Wicazo Sa*, and the *Canadian Journal of Native Studies*. They were also publishing in such stalwarts as *Folklore*, including Rayna Green’s 1988 article, “The Tribe Called Wannabe: Playing Indian in America and Europe,” an unprecedented challenge to the supposition that Indigenous people always accepted European goods and that they used them in European ways.<sup>54</sup>

In 1989, George Sioui’s *Pour une autohistoire amérindienne: essai sur les fondements d’une morale sociale* debuted from Laval University Press and was released in English translation just three years later as *For an Amerindian Autohistory: An Essay on the Foundations of a Social Ethic*.<sup>55</sup> His programme is deceptively simple: to lay the foundations to challenge the outsider-

53 Rupert Costo, “A Statement of Policy: Indian Journal to Study History and Development of Native Races,” *The Indian Historian: Official Publication of the American Indian Historical Society* 1, no. 1 (October 1964): reverse of cover page.

54 Rayna Green, “The Tribe Called Wannabe: Playing Indian in America and Europe,” *Folklore* 99, no. 1 (1988): 30-55.

55 Georges E. Sioui, *Pour une autohistoire amérindienne: essai sur les fondements d’une morale sociale* (Québec: Presses de l’Université Laval, 1989).  
Georges E. Sioui, *For an Amerindian Autohistory: An Essay on the Foundations of a Social Ethic* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1992).

defined and written version of Wendat history, better known as “the fall of Huronia.” Northwest Métis historian Olive Patricia Dickason also published a book in 1992, *Canada’s First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times*,<sup>56</sup> a survey text that, despite its title, does cover the basics of Métis and Inuit history as well as First Nation histories, all in necessarily wide strokes. By 1994, Sioui had followed up on his plan to write a new history of Wendake,<sup>57</sup> and Dickason’s book was in its third edition. The year before, Daniel Paul’s Mi’kmaq view of English-Mi’kmaq history, *We Were Not the Savages: A Micmac Perspective on the Collision of European and Aboriginal Civilizations*<sup>58</sup> caused significant excitement due to his refusal of an “objective tone” and his lack of university credentials. The beginning of the twenty-first century is a turning point in terms of the sheer number of monographs and collections. From then on, the numbers soar, and Indigenous epistemologies and methods move to the front and centre, reinforcing the necessity for a case study approach in this project.

David T. McNab’s 1999 study *Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario*<sup>59</sup> explicitly frames treaty-making between the Teme Augama Anishinaabeg, southern Ontario Métis, Ottawa, Potawatomi, and Wyandot (also known as Wendat) and the Canadian state. Indigenous epistemology is at the forefront, but McNab is still working with episodes of Indigenous history that suggest the most important events centre Europeans or their settler descendants. Seneca historian Barbara Alice Mann flatly challenged this idea in *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas* (2000).<sup>60</sup> It is clear from the first page that this is no mainstream history

56 Olive Patricia Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992 [2002]).

57 Georges E. Sioui, *Huron-Wendat: The Heritage of the Circle* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1994).

58 Daniel N. Paul, *We Were Not the Savages: A Micmac Perspective on the Collision of European and Aboriginal Civilizations* (Halifax: Nimbus, 1993).

59 David T. McNab, *Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1999).

60 Barbara Alice Mann, *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas* (New York: Peter Lang, 2000).

because it begins with her retelling of the story of the Woman Falling from the Sky. From there, Mann uses humour and an Iroquoian intellectual framework to tell the reader what they should expect up front: Europeans are not at the centre of this history, and their arrival and actions do not define Iroquoian time.

Northwest Métis historians have produced significant numbers of books since 2000. Olive Patricia Dickason initiated a stream of books applying different perspectives to recounting Indigenous histories. Ron Rivard and Cathy Littlejohn released their history of the Willowbunch Métis in 2003.<sup>61</sup> Heather Devine's 2004 *The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660 – 1900*<sup>62</sup> focusses on the history of a single family, tracing Métis ethnogenesis and a different perspective on the syncretic European-Indigenous trade system between 1660 and 1900. Indigenous epistemologies and modes of history writing are first made explicit in a non-Haudenosaunee context in *Cree Narrative Memory: From Treaties to Contemporary Times*, published in 2007,<sup>63</sup> in which Neal McLeod explores the Nehiyaw (Plains Cree) record of the negotiation and signing of Treaty 6 and lays out Cree historical epistemologies. Robert Alexander Innes' 2013 history of the Cowessess band uses the practice of *wahkôtowin* and its role in facilitating openness to new people and new ways of living to determine the shape and scope of the discussion.<sup>64</sup> Without the hard work by both Indigenous and non-Indigenous scholars touched on via the examples given here, this project would simply be impossible.

61 Ron Rivard, and Catherine Littlejohn, *The History of the Métis of Willow Bunch* (Saskatoon: Rivard and Littlejohn, 2003).

62 Heather Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660-1900* (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004).

63 Neal McLeod, *Cree Narrative Memory: From Treaties to Contemporary Times* (Saskatoon: Purich Publishing, 2007).

64 Robert Alexander Innes, *Elder Brother and the Law of the People: Contemporary Kinship and Cowessess First Nation* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2013).

### ***Methodological Considerations: Selecting Sources for the Case Studies***

While selecting which Indigenous peoples' historiography to draw upon to complete the case studies for this project was a vital first step, in some ways, it was the easiest one. Even after deciding to engage with Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee materials, it was critical to narrow the primary source selection to something reasonable. Starting from brass tacks, the first filter for the source selection was that they should be drawn from an existing historiographic tradition recognized by both Indigenous and non-Indigenous scholars. Such works are most likely to be written for a cross-cultural audience and, therefore, likely to provide examples of use of Indigenous sources and adaptation of Euro-style sources. Despite the proliferation of potential materials produced for and published primarily on the world wide web, these were ruled out due to issues of consistent accessibility and the lack of source attributions common to such publications. This still leaves a plethora of more ephemeral media now available via major digitization projects as well as in hard copy archives. Even setting these usually impermanent media aside, there is an expansive collection of anthologies and monographs, their numbers increasing steadily after the advent of "salvage anthropology" in the mid to late nineteenth century.

Next, I needed to identify some key Indigenous historiographic concepts to provide guidelines for the type of document that should be included in the primary source selection, including considerations of length. I ultimately identified four of the many concepts broadly shared across numerous Indigenous modes of thought, generally speaking, based on the combination of readings I completed while refining the research question that applied most directly to historiography. First, there are many histories, not just one, and this is an ordinary circumstance rather than an existential threat. Second, history is characterized by both cyclic and

linear time, although which one predominates during given events may vary. Third, human and other than human beings alike have agency, which is reflected in their direct participation in historical events. Fourth, echoing Brooks' point about Indigenous peoples developing a spatialized writing tradition, *where* is more important than *when*. Indigenous histories do not insist on defining dates so long as events can always be placed in a temporal order. We know that Indigenous peoples in the Americas have developed fantastically precise calendars to define and record dates. The Mesoamerican calendar system shared by the Aztec and Maya, for example, is rightfully famous. But sometimes, what reads like a Euro-style specific date is not one. Ethnohistorian Elizabeth Hill Boone observes of Aztec pictorial histories that important undertakings frequently start in the year 1 Flint.<sup>65</sup> This does not necessarily mean those Aztec deeds began literally in year 1 Flint, but it does reinforce how serious they were.

There is already a great deal of historical writing in print by individuals with Haudenosaunee or Northwest Métis backgrounds, including famous “told-to” narratives or books composed based on information they provided as consultants. I then narrowed this selection still further to non-fiction books and pamphlets, with the latter having no less than 40 pages, all released between 1825 and 2018. Eighteen twenty-five is the publication date of the earliest Haudenosaunee historical pamphlet I found, and 2018 is the date of the most recent of all the historical monographs as of the finalization of my dissertation proposal. There also had to be enough material in each publication to permit checking for the four selected Indigenous historiographic concepts. This pared down the number of possible primary sources to a

65 Elizabeth Hill Boone, “Aztec Pictorial Histories: Records Without Words,” in *Writing Without Words: Alternate Literacies in Mesoamerica and the Andes*, eds. Elizabeth Hill Boone and Walter D. Mignolo (Durham: Duke University Press, 1994), 53.

reasonable number while remaining wide enough to represent a range of perspectives among the authors/narrators.

The impact of the imposition of the border between Canada and the United States has had complex effects on Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee communities. Spatialized histories and writing traditions must inevitably be affected by changes in accessibility to the places and spaces used for information encoding. The Medicine Line could make a significant difference in terms of audience as each publication was released under different social, political, and legal conditions. Many, but far from all, were directed primarily to mainstream audiences, meaning the Indigenous authors and collaborators were working in a cross-cultural context and had to provide more information than they might have done otherwise. In time they also needed to do this for those Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis forcibly separated from their families and communities for long periods, if not their whole childhoods.

These are all types of filters familiar to established mainstream historical techniques. I also bore in mind one more criterion I received from Plains Cree and Northwest Métis elders. Like Margaret Kovach, I have learned from them about what cultural knowledge they have released to the public domain is appropriate to share.<sup>66</sup> This was an important consideration for me because a great number of earlier publications are out of print today and not much read or cited; I would not want to bring these back to attention and thereby ignore this protocol. Luckily, this is not as significant an issue for historical writing as it can be for anthropological writing because of the impact of mainstream positivistic thought. Early non-Indigenous scholars seeking to write history, including information from Indigenous sources, tended to avoid any narrative that struck them as fictional in nature or a potential challenge to

66 Margaret Kovach, *Indigenous Methodologies: Characteristics, Conversations, and Contexts* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010), 46.

Christianity. Early anthropologists in North America applying a salvage-based methodology wanted to document everything Indigenous “before it was gone forever,” such that they did not always respect protocols for sharing sensitive information.<sup>67</sup> All that said, by “not as significant” I do not mean, “not necessary to assess for publications by historians.”

With my primary sources for each case study selected and briefly characterized by type and length, I had to determine how to read and work with them. Many Indigenous and non-Indigenous scholars have provided important guidance already for such a task. Cruikshank pinpointed a key issue, that “Native Americans’ view of their own history remain rare in scholarly literature.”<sup>68</sup> Wickwire responded specifically to this issue in “Stories from the Margins.” I have also followed Wickwire’s example by striving to set each primary source into its proper context, including both its historical setting in the European sense and its Indigenous epistemological setting. In each case study, I took account of storytelling genres and their rules, applying my direct experience where possible. I learned how to start this stage of the project by applying a technique from anthropologist Barbara Wilkes’ undergraduate ethnographic survey course, which I took in 2005 at the University of Calgary. It sounds deceptively simple. To learn the very basics of another peoples’ epistemology, she taught us that we should spend time with a few of their key traditional stories, focussing on those that recount the origins of the people, important social relationships, and ceremonies. These provide thumbnail sketches of the major

67 Jean M. O’Brien’s 2010 study *Firsting and Lasting: Writing Indians Out of Existence in New England* unpacks the origins and development of the “vanishing Indian” myth that became an important impetus for “salvage anthropology” or “salvage ethnography” (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press). Early in his career, founding anthropologist Franz Boas took part in the grave robbing and purchase of stolen artifacts and ancestors’ remains that had become an accepted practice among non-Indigenous scholars and visitors in the late nineteenth century. For a description, see Rosemary Lévy Zumwalt, *Franz Boas: The Emergence of an Anthropologist* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska, 2019), 181-183.

68 Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories*, 119.

social relationships recognized and maintained, broad rules of social behaviour, and the metaphors that describe how that people order and understand their world.

Once again, the problem of so many stories and only so much time meant that I had to limit myself to specific stories. This was not difficult in the end because the primary sources themselves defined the limits. The Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis histories retold or otherwise repeatedly referenced specific stories from the broader intellectual traditions of each nation. The differences in emphasis and application of each story allowed me to note fundamental epistemological elements. For example, in the Northwest Métis case study, I identified these elements as *wahkôtown*, buffalo hunt organization, and placedness. In the Haudenosaunee case study, I distinguished them as twoness, clear thinking, and the importance of speech. The emphasis in Wilkes' technique is on how the technique leads us into an ongoing process of learning and interpretation, in which we do not claim to have the final or only meaning, especially for traditions not our own. Indeed, we might get things wrong, although we should not wind up too far afield if we stick to what the Indigenous sources provide and resist the temptation to import outside theories based on wholly different concepts and values.

Indeed, the pitfalls of using outside theories were another grave concern, even though some have been successfully applied to Indigenous fiction and "told-to" narratives. Many historians and literary scholars have completed important studies informed by Mikhail Bakhtin's notions of heteroglossia and dialogism,<sup>69</sup> for example, or the concepts developed by the scholars usually gathered under the umbrella of postcolonial theory. However, for the purposes of this study, I have opted to centre Indigenous critical theory, which guides scholars to seek interpretive

69 Mikhail Bakhtin, *Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981), 273-275; 285-286; 325-326.

frameworks within the Indigenous stories and traditions themselves.<sup>70</sup> Based on articles and books by Craig S. Womack, Jace Weaver, Kimberly M. Blaeser, and Lisa Brooks, I understand this to mean that Indigenous writers sign-post what we need to know. The sign-posts may include references to specific knowledge keepers, spirit beings, or key events or ceremonies. I have also applied decolonial theory, an approach that builds on respect for place, a refusal to accept claims that people who are not reproducing the European way of developing are therefore trapped in the past, and a goal of delinking from colonial frameworks. Decolonial theory is based on concepts developed by Aníbal Quijano and elaborated by leading decolonial scholar Walter D. Mignolo.<sup>71</sup> According to Mignolo, a decolonial perspective guides us to read Indigenous writing that does not strictly follow European-defined principles as the product of the writer's active choice to prioritize an Indigenous audience and resist colonization. As a result, decolonial theory has special relevance for identifying and characterizing changes in Indigenous methods of encoding and sharing history since the arrival of Europeans in the Americas.

The case studies have a great deal of ground to cover, and it is important not to drop the reader *in media res*, so I will close this section with a brief description of how they are structured. Similar to this introduction, they begin with a broad review in a more mainstream historiographic mode, giving dates and orientation to what I refer to, drawing on Robert Allen

70 Craig S. Womack, *Red on Red: Native Literary Separatism* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1999), 20; 26; 57; 76.

Jace Weaver, *Other Words: American Indian Literature, Law and Culture* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2001), 3-53.

Kimberly M. Blaeser, "Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre," in *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*, eds. Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016), 231-232.

Lisa Brooks, "Intellectual History," in *The Oxford Handbook of American Indian History*, ed. Frederick E. Hoxie (Oxford: Oxford, University Press, 2016), 515-518.

71 Aníbal Quijano, "Coloniality and Modernity/Rationality," *Cultural Studies* 21, nos. 2-3 (2007), 169.

Walter D. Mignolo, *Local Histories/Global Designs: Coloniality, Subaltern Knowledges, and Border Thinking* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009).

\_\_\_\_\_, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global Futures, Decolonial Options*, (Durham: Duke University Press, 2011).

Warrior's example, as the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition.<sup>72</sup> This sets the primary sources into their context in terms of time, place, and ideas. Then each case study discusses the primary source corpus, albeit still in a mainstream mode. Each case study then examines the primary sources in an Indigenous critical theory mode, with special attention to aspects of the monographs that seem strange or out of place in a mainstream reading.

### ***The Research Plan, Its Limitations, and What Makes it Worthwhile***

The main purpose of this study is to demonstrate and explain how Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historians adapted Indigenous methods of encoding and transmitting history while taking up and adapting Euro-style practices. Their examples reveal a part of the complex story of how Indigenous peoples in the Americas maintained connection and continuity with their own historiographic traditions through an era of violent invasion and cultural disruption. To support this primary goal, I have also pursued a secondary purpose: presenting and applying methods and theory that assist in reading Indigenous histories accurately and respectfully.

The broad plan of this project is to use two case studies, one on the Northwest Métis and the other on the Haudenosaunee, considering the changes in how they encoded and passed down their histories over approximately the past two hundred years. Since this topic is not yet covered by existing historical scholarship, and there is little analysis of Indigenous history writing by Indigenous scholars and collaborators, more generally, this project is meant to address this gap. Hence the case studies begin in a mainstream mode, that is, in a style setting out a single, linear account of the publications of Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis history by citizens of those nations without any application of Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis epistemologies. Just as in this introduction, I begin using an approach that is more familiar to general readers and

72 Robert Allen Warrior, *The People and the Word: Reading and Native Nonfiction* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), xiii.

includes dates for keeping oriented. Only then do the case studies shift into a mode that turns to a combination of the contextualizing demonstrated by Wickwire, the technique for identifying and learning important elements of Indigenous epistemology defined by Wilkes, and the application of Indigenous and decolonial theory. While the point of this study is to answer the research question and help ameliorate a gap in historical research, there are more reasons it is worth doing. Besides helping to banish the last traces of the assumption that there was no history in the Americas before Europeans came, this project shows one way of reading and interpreting Indigenous history in a respectful manner and demonstrates that doing so still entails careful research and rigorous analysis.

All this said, it is crucial to emphasize that this project is a starting point, engaging with only a small part of the wide breadth of Indigenous historiography. The selection of primary sources I examined is best described as semi-random, with a rather arbitrary cut-off date. Within that corpus, there were many aspects I could not investigate in detail for this dissertation, such as the impact of economic class on which techniques of Euro-style historiography Indigenous historians adapted. Furthermore, additional monographs located in future may necessitate updates to the analyses and interpretations. Indeed, taking up a different primary source corpus based on articles from periodicals or cartography may reveal other lines of development independent or parallel to those defined by the monographs.

There are also a few points to highlight from an Indigenous-based perspective. I am a Northwest Métis scholar, but I am not claiming to speak for all Northwest Métis, or to be presenting the final answer to how to read and interpret our historiography. Rather, I am seeking to take part in our shared conversation about and presentation of Northwest Métis history. As a non-Haudenosaunee person engaging with Haudenosaunee historiographic works, while striving

to do so in a way that is as respectful and accurate as possible, I will inevitably miss many nuances. My purpose is to illustrate one way to carry out such interpretation as an outside reader, without making any claim to have found the “one true way to do it.” That said, it would be difficult to achieve respectful and sensible readings of any Indigenous nation’s historiography without studying their epistemology and key cultural stories alongside an understanding of how Indigenous and European ways of understanding history differ.

### ***Chapter Overview***

In order to complete this type of study, it is important to start with clear definitions. Readers may have questions about terms that have already appeared, such as my references to “Northwest Métis” and the meaning of “historiography,” particularly if it is not simply equated with what is written or printed on paper. Therefore, Chapter One provides those definitions, including an overview of Indigenous historiographic methods before and after the European invasion. History premised on Indigenous intellectual frameworks and traditions differs from its European counterparts, even though it is still about presenting an interpretation of past events. Explaining some of these differences takes the chapter into a more detailed exploration of the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition in writing.

Chapter Two takes the reader from what constitutes the cardinal directions of this study, preparatory to delving further into the Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis regions of our figurative map. It introduces both nations, then explains the basics of their epistemologies and narrative genres as I understand and interpret them based on the teachings my elders and university instructors have shared with me, alongside what I have read. Finally, this chapter introduces the primary sources in greater detail and provides a “Case Study Road Map.”

The case studies make up Chapters Three and Four, the former presenting Northwest Métis historiography from 1968 to 2018, and the latter Haudenosaunee historiography from 1825 to 2018. Each characterizes the Indigenous-written history of the nation based on a broader corpus of written materials. If any readers expected tales of Indigenous reluctance to adopt new technologies, they will certainly be surprised. Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historians readily adopted whatever new techniques and materials they could purchase or use within their means. From some of the earliest printing presses on Haudenosaunee territory to some of the first Indigenous-gathered, owned, and preserved paper-based archives, the first part of each case study is about more than recounting printed speeches, pamphlet literature, journalism, and early books. Now equipped with a sense of the variety of sources that Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee historians had available to them from their own peoples as well as colonial materials, it is time to work with the primary sources. This allows each chapter to move from a mainstream historiographic analysis to the application of Indigenous critical and decolonial theory.

While the case study chapters have similar shapes, they are meant to shed light on the unique aspects of the historiographic traditions of each nation as represented by the collection of materials studied for this project. For example, Chapter Three investigates the deliberate Northwest Métis policy of founding and maintaining counter-archives to those developed by the colonial states of Canada and the United States. It attempts to explain why Northwest Métis historians could not break permanently into mainstream historiographic conversations until 1968.

Chapter Four considers the contrasting Haudenosaunee success at entering the mainstream historiographic conversation. It must be acknowledged that Haudenosaunee leaders have been and are superlative practitioners of public relations. Nevertheless, Haudenosaunee historiography has not had an easy path to print or recognition, not least because of its difficult early

relationship with the origins of anthropology. Guided by the teachings and guidance shared by Haudenosaunee historians through the primary sources, this chapter revisits the complicated legacies of several Haudenosaunee historical figures and how they may be more respectfully understood as actors in and encoders of history.

Chapter Five brings the two case studies together by examining some of the similarities and contrasts between the selected Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee primary sources. Then it surveys how Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis history has developed as a practice in terms of who gets to write it. Specifically, it compares and contrasts Donald Wright's findings in his book *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*,<sup>73</sup> to elicit the qualifications Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis communities expect of their historians. Finally, it defines and studies place-relating versus space-making ways of writing history and how these ways are used (or not) by Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historians.

73 Donald Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005).

## Chapter 1: Reading Indigenous History

### *Introduction*

An outside observer could reasonably conclude that Indigenous history in northern North America has come a long way over the past sixty to seventy years. Throughout this time, it has changed from an all but non-existent field of study to a place in the academy and burgeoning integration into standard history and social studies textbooks. Although settler institutions can provide a certain legitimacy, Indigenous history remains contested. The stubborn mainstream position that “real history” could not begin in the Americas until rational, literate Europeans arrived has not been dropped so much as modified. It remains recognizable even in its modern guise of frequent denial that Indigenous peoples can be authorities over the transmission and interpretation of their own histories, let alone the reconstruction of those histories after surviving genocide and ongoing colonial violence. Determined to overcome the presumed twin barriers of Indigenous irrationality and illiteracy before European contact, by the mid to late nineteenth century, European scholars turned to the new theory of evolution, spawned by the emergence of a field of study we now call anthropology.<sup>74</sup> To counter this scholarly threat, which allowed European scholars to cloak racist claims and policies with supposedly “scientific” authority, Indigenous representatives worked with scholars who combined anthropological and historical methods. Just how powerful this newer ethnohistory could be against entrenched racist laws for Indigenous peoples remained untested until the 1950s. In this key decade, American Indian tribes in the United States successfully deployed expert testimony by ethnohistorians in court.<sup>75</sup>

74 Alice Beck Kehoe, *Humans: An Introduction to Four-Field Anthropology* (New York: Routledge, 1998).

75 Michael E. Harkin, “Ethnohistory’s Ethnohistory: Creating a Discipline from the Ground Up,” *Social Science History* 34, no. 2 (Summer 2010): 116-118.

However, we should not mistake the strategic use of non-Indigenous scholars to help present Indigenous histories in court as equivalent to Indigenous acceptance of those scholars as the proper authorities and interpreters of their histories. It did indicate a growing Indigenous appreciation of how some anthropological and historical methods, originally developed for European use and convenience, could support important Indigenous needs and interests. Accordingly, Indigenous communities have engaged in rewriting the history of Indian residential schools, the relocation of unmarked graves, and ongoing debates about the meaning and fate of commemorative statues.<sup>76</sup> Other work focusses on such tasks as the retrieval and restoration of disrupted Indigenous knowledges and traditions or winning respect for Indigenous historians whether or not they have had European-style post-secondary training.

Meanwhile, the mainstream academic conflation of European presence with “real history” continued in the form of a belief that Indigenous histories are preserved principally or only in oral traditions. Starting from that belief leads logically to the conclusion that any Indigenous history writing produced since Europeans established themselves in the Americas is a product of European-style education and writing rather than any Indigenous intellectual traditions or methods. If we reject this belief, we need to understand how Indigenous peoples record and transmit historical knowledge without using European writing systems. With that need in mind, in this chapter, I will set out examples of Indigenous historiographic methods used in the Americas before Europeans began to share, then impose, their own. Then I will discuss the broad

76 See for example:

Larry N. Chartrand, Tricia E. Logan, and Judy D. Daniels, *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools* (Ottawa: Aboriginal Healing Foundation, 2006).

Nora McGreevy, “751 Unmarked Graves Discovered Near Former Indigenous School in Canada,” *Smithsonian Magazine* (June 28, 2021), <https://www.smithsonianmag.com/smart-news/751-unmarked-graves-discovered-near-former-indigenous-school-canada-180978064/> (accessed February 19, 2023).

Brenda MacDougall, “Naming and Renaming: Confronting Canada’s Past,” *Shekon Neechie* (August 1, 2018), <https://shekonnechie.ca/2018/08/01/naming-and-renaming-confronting-canadas-past/> (accessed February 19, 2023).

changes in Indigenous historiographic methods altered by this encounter, as identified and described in the sources for this chapter.

Following an overview of Indigenous methods for encoding and transmitting history, this chapter considers the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition, which written Indigenous history is part of, and begins to draw upon at least by the early twentieth century. This guides us to an all-important necessity for this project: determining how to read Indigenous history writing effectively and respectfully. To do that, we need some important cross-cultural tools, bringing together insights from anthropology, Indigenous critical theory, and decolonial theory. I will then close this chapter and move on to the next, which brings us at last to the cases of Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee historiography.

### ***A Pause to Gather a Few Like Terms***

When it comes to terminology concerning Indigenous nations and individuals, there is no perfect answer. Canada and the United States use different legal terminologies and colloquial names.<sup>77</sup> Meanwhile, even common terms like “bibliography”<sup>78</sup> may have both technical, unfamiliar uses and additional commonplace meanings. The usage of “metis,” for example, which is a generic term in French but not in English, has generated its own controversies. While I can not claim to have general or final answers to these questions, it is necessary to provide specific definitions for a number of still contested terms in the context of Indigenous history for this project.

A reasonable starting point is the *Oxford English Dictionary (OED)*,<sup>79</sup> which captures current and historical usages. Its definition of **history** corresponds to the applied meaning of

77 The “First Nations” and “Native” versus “Indian Tribe” and “American Indian” may be the best-known examples.

78 Angus Stevenson and Christine A. Lindberg, eds., *The New Oxford American Dictionary, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), “bibliography, n.”

79 Angus Stevenson and Christine A. Lindberg, eds., *The New Oxford American Dictionary, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009).

the term for this project, “the study of past events,” and “a continuous, typically chronological record of important or public events of a particular trend or institution.”<sup>80</sup> This is indeed the meaning of the term intended here, since it does not arbitrarily exclude Indigenous modes of history composition, not least because of the carefully chosen modifier “typically” on “chronological record.”

When it comes to who is a **historian**, the *OED* is quite catholic, stating simply that a historian is “an expert in or student of history, esp. that of a particular period, geographical region, or social phenomenon.”<sup>81</sup> As Donald Wright’s study<sup>82</sup> of the professionalization of history in English Canada shows, the social role and influence of a historian are shaped and reshaped by their level of social authority, acceptance, and reach. “History wars” are as much about who is allowed to speak authoritatively about history as they are about what history we should make a point of taking seriously and handing down to our descendants. I also accept the breadth of the *OED*’s definition here with a modification. Many students of history shy away from claiming the historian label, be they Indigenous or not, for reasons ranging from simple humility to firm refusal based on technical or ethical reasons (i.e., “I am just providing basic context for the reader” or “historians have played a role in defrauding my community”). Out of respect for such positions that play an important role in the development of Indigenous historiography, I will take care to note them and the cases when a given Indigenous scholar has written a historical work for whatever reason, but who may not consider themselves a historian *per se*.

The more complex term for this project is **historiography**, which, based on its Greek roots, means literally “history drawing,” for which we can understand “history writing.” As the *OED*

80 Stevenson and Lindberg, *The New Oxford American Dictionary*, “history, n.”

81 *Ibid.*

82 Donald Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005), 5-6; 82-83.

notes, this term typically refers to “the study of historical writing,” and “the writing of history.”<sup>83</sup> In the context of formal instruction in historiography, students examine the development of history writing as a practice, including the theories and methodologies historians apply and how those have changed over time. Historiography might be analogous to biography – a history of history. Practically speaking, even the earliest written histories begin by studying previous histories. They respond to how recording and sharing history has changed because the original author had to decide which old or new practices and ideas to apply. European-based education instructs that Herodotus was the first historian, and his successor Thucydides was the first to separate myth from history. Whether or not we agree with this, Thucydides was responding to his earlier exemplars including Herodotus. Herodotus before him was responding to the ancient Greek epic tradition, which was the earlier Greek mode of keeping and handing down history. Herodotus himself explained that he wished to ensure that the great deeds of Greeks and non-Greeks would not be forgotten in reaction to an epic tradition that was no longer recording and transmitting new history.

Rather than try to disentangle these deeply interrelated modes of historical study and writing, I will simply accept that the earliest history writing in any context, be it Indigenous or non-Indigenous, is a dialogic one in the Bakhtinian sense. That is, language is made up of various socio-ideological dialects, and even words may have varied meanings in different contexts, which Bakhtin saw in novels and poetry and referred to as heteroglossia.<sup>84</sup> In historical writing, historians use contrasting styles of writing and reconstructed voices of historical figures to make particular points. They are in a virtual conversation with historians past, present, and future. As

83 Stevenson and Lindberg, *The New Oxford American Dictionary*, “historiography, n.”

84 Mikhail Bakhtin, *Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981), 273-275; 285-286; 325-326.

David Murray and Sophie McCall observed in their studies of the collection and subsequent creation of texts from Indigenous oral narratives, this conversation is about more than reporting. Those historians are trying to manage the impacts of the process of sharing the histories they compose and the vicissitudes of reception in which what the author means may bear little relation to what the audience understands.<sup>85</sup>

Such impact management is a particular challenge for anyone who studies or composes history, yet who is perceived to have little or no agency in the production, sharing, and use of their narratives. The obvious examples in a non-Indigenous context are historians now dead. In an Indigenous context, such as this project, the examples are Indigenous historians and students of history who must still fight through the image of “Indians” as one among many of “the peoples without history”<sup>86</sup> and such constructions as repressive authenticity.<sup>87</sup>

A person may be an expert in Canadian, English, or any other genre of history defined by a national or ethnic label without necessarily being a citizen of that nation or a member of the named ethnic group. **Indigenous** is an umbrella adjective that is often used to refer to peoples whose relationships with the lands where they live precede the incursion of outsiders who have entered those lands to colonize them.<sup>88</sup> By extension, the term is also used to broadly label Indigenous nations’ many histories, cultures, and so on.<sup>89</sup> I follow Taiaiake Alfred and Jeff

85 Sophie McCall, *First Person Plural: Aboriginal Storytelling and the Ethics of Collaborative Authorship* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2011), 1; 3; 41; 103.

David Murray, *Forked Tongues: Speech, Writing, and Representation in North American Indian Texts* (London: Pinter, 1991), 1-2; 36.

86 Eric R. Wolf, *Europe and the People Without History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982 [1997]).

87 “Repressive authenticity” as defined by Patrick Wolfe, in which “authentic Aboriginality is constructed [by settlers] as a frozen precontact essence, a quantity of such historical instability that its primary effect is to provide a formula for disqualification.” See

Patrick Wolfe, *Settler Colonialism and the Transformation of Anthropology: The Politics and Poetics of an Ethnographic Event* (London: Cassell, 1999), 204.

88 Taiaiake Alfred and Jeff Corntassel, “Being Indigenous: Resurgences Against Contemporary Colonialism,” *Government and Opposition* 4, no. 4 (2005), 597-599.

89 J.R. Martinez Cobo, *Study of the Problem of Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations, Volume 5: Conclusions, Proposals, and Recommendations* (New York: United Nations, 1987), 50.

Corntassel's view that the Canadian federal government's "aboriginal" label is a state construction meant to support the assimilation of Indigenous peoples, and will not use it in this thesis.<sup>90</sup> The application of the term Indigenous to post-contact peoples such as the Northwest Métis has been controversial, not least because of the once common European assumption that there could be no new Indigenous peoples after their arrival, instead Indigenous peoples were expected to assimilate or die out.<sup>91</sup> By this definition, Indigenous is an awkward term that effectively centres on the many moments of encounter with Europeans, suggesting that there could conceivably be just one Indigenous history. It parallels adjectives like Canadian or French, suggesting that it is not necessary to be Indigenous to write Indigenous history. Being Indigenous is not a product of meeting Europeans, and there is certainly not just one Indigenous history that fits all Indigenous peoples. But it is true that non-Indigenous people may write Indigenous history. To be fair, I should also note that **European** shares many of the same features of overextension and inappropriate centring, although the question of who counts as European for the purpose of history writing is also not so simple.

Another term that makes many appearances throughout the text is **mainstream**. By it, I intend its usual meaning of being considered normal or conventional, the expected way of doing things.<sup>92</sup> The context of the mainstream is typically, though not always, anglophone with upper class, urban, British roots. The nature of the mainstream will certainly be different in francophone Québec, or regions of southwest Canada with a strong and ongoing cultural connection with the United States.<sup>93</sup> When referring to a mainstream mode or modes, I mean

90 Alfred and Corntassel, "Being Indigenous," 597-599.

91 Gerhard J. Ens and Joe Sawchuk, *From New Peoples to New Nations: Aspects of Métis History and Identity from the Eighteenth to Twenty-First Centuries*, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 17-30.

92 Stevenson and Lindberg, *The New Oxford American Dictionary*, "mainstream, n., adj."

93 These connections are outlined in an anthology edited by Elizabeth Jamieson and Sheila McManus, *One Step Over the Line: Toward a History of Women in the North American Wests* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press

those formats and epistemologies characteristic of non-Indigenous writing as I have learned and experienced it in the settler state of Canada in the provinces of British Columbia and Alberta.

In the context of this study, I will be applying a revised notion of Indigenous that recognizes it is possible for there to be post-contact Indigenous peoples, as both new and continuing polities, and refuses to make Indigenousness contingent on whether Europeans are present or not. Susan A. Miller's discussion in "Native America Writes Back: The Origin of the Indigenous Paradigm in Historiography" captures the desired meaning, explaining that Indigenous means to be a part of a community with intimate relationships to the land and to be in reciprocal relationships oneself with the community and the land.<sup>94</sup> Whether a person or community has a status created by colonial legislation is not a factor here. I am also bearing in mind the definition of Indigenous communities, peoples, and nations applied by U.N. Special Rapporteur J.R. Martinez Cobo in the *Study of the Problem of Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations*, suggesting that:

Indigenous communities, peoples, and nations are those which, having a historical continuity with pre-invasion and pre-colonial societies that developed on their territories, consider themselves distinct from other sectors of the societies now prevailing in those territories, or parts of them. They form at present non-dominant sectors of society and are determined to preserve, develop and transmit to future generations their ancestral territories, and their ethnic identity, as the basis of their continued existence as peoples, in accordance with their own cultural patterns, social institutions and legal systems.<sup>95</sup>

The corpus of works considered in this study are a semi-random selection of those whose primary collaborator or author was an Indigenous person. That is, the person was or is a member of a specific Indigenous nation, recognized by that nation, and from a specific community recognized as part of that nation or a known offshoot of that nation. The reason to include

and AU Press, 2008).

94 Susan A. Miller, "Native America Writes Back: The Origin of the Indigenous Paradigm in Historiography," *Wicazo Sa Review* 23, no. 2 (2009): 11.

95 Cobo, *Study of the Problem of Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations*, 50.

primary Indigenous collaborators is that, at times, the only path to publication for an Indigenous person seeking to create a printed work was through a non-Indigenous mediator. For example, John Norton was born to Cherokee parents and later adopted by Joseph Brant into the Mohawk Nation of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, and was recognized by them as such. For a Northwest Métis example, consider Howard Adams, who was born in St. Louis, Saskatchewan, one of many historic Métis communities on the northern plains in what is now Canada. He was a well-known activist, recognized and honoured by the Northwest Métis Nation. The term “Northwest Métis” is best defined in Chapter Two in the introduction to the primary sources for the Northwest Métis case study, and so will be taken up then.

### ***Historiography 1.0***

Now it is time to return to the concept of “historiography.” Like computer programmers who refer to the first release of a program as “Program Name 1.0” and the subsequent variants that build on it by the next number to record the relationship between them, I will refer to the *OED*’s findings as historiography 1.0. Taking up the most general and common meaning the *OED* records for historiography, we are turned back to history writing, and that points to still widely shared mainstream understandings of the process of how “history” is made into printed materials such as articles, books, and documentaries. The rough outline of this process still reflects the idealized model developed by Leopold von Ranke between 1827 and 1831 as he strove to create a “scientific history.”<sup>96</sup> Ranke argued that instead of focussing on individualized factors that he deemed inappropriate, the historian should stick strictly to the material recorded in primary sources. By sifting the data available from written documents, the historian could write a more

96 Kasper Risbjerg Eskildsen, “Leopold Ranke’s Archival Turn: Location and Evidence in Modern Historiography,” *Modern Intellectual History* 5, no. 3 (2008), 434-437.

accurate, clearer narrative of what happened in the past.<sup>97</sup> It is difficult to overestimate the influence of a scholar widely recognized as the father of archival history, and his conflation of the historical record with a very specific type of archive. The Rankean archive begins as a silent one, and is a raw mass that must be processed to answer specific questions. The results are usually presented by a single author. With the advent of film and then audio tape, the Rankean archive has become far less silent, and indeed so does the historiography derived from it, which now includes documentaries and other projects incorporating sound and video clips. In fact, these very media, with their assumed ability to record data “objectively,” allowed this form of European-defined archive to add Indigenous materials.

Ranke’s program also further reinforced the assumption that “history” began with writing as such, and therefore among the people with the earliest known and translated writing, the Sumerians. Hence by 1961, Samuel Noah Kramer could retitile his expanded and revised edition of *From the Tablets of Sumer to History Begins at Sumer*.<sup>98</sup> By then, amateurs and professionals had been busy attempting to objectively record Indigenous peoples all over the Americas using the new instruments available to them. These primarily non-Indigenous visitors and scholars took it upon themselves to gather and order their new recordings for their own purposes, inadvertently confirming the mainstream expectations of specifically Indigenous history. Focussed on describing Indigenous-European interactions, they produced narratives that did not begin until the Indigenous community met Europeans, implying nothing really happened until contact. They characterized the information their Indigenous collaborators provided about pre-contact times as unwritten, indicating that Indigenous peoples had no capacity to record specific times. The Maya, Aztecs, and Inka are the exceptions who proved the rule, because only the Maya had a

97 Anthony Grafton, *The Footnote: A Curious History* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999), 42-43; 69-72.

98 Samuel Noah Kramer, *History Begins at Sumer* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1961).

writing system in the strict sense, and it remained mostly undeciphered by non-Indigenous visitors and scholars until after 1975.<sup>99</sup>

The emergence of Historiography 1.0 is an impressive achievement, but it is not the final story that it seemed to be until so recently. There is now too much evidence of effective Indigenous encoding methods other than these famous Maya, Aztec, and Inka examples. Furthermore, the evidence shows that the Maya, Aztec, and Inka used multiple encoding systems.

There have always been tantalizing hints that the human capacity to transmit historical memory without writing might be vastly underestimated by mainstream historians and anthropologists in Europe, Africa, and the Americas. The fact that settler efforts to assimilate surviving Indigenous peoples from the late fifteenth century on involved attempts to end Indigenous cultural transmission by stripping languages, material culture, and ceremonies was already suggestive. Milman Parry's fieldwork in the 1920s, as he sought to explain how the Homeric epics were composed and preserved without writing, raised almost as many questions as it answered when he published his results in 1930 and 1932.<sup>100</sup> He helped answer the practical question of how those epics could contain enough information for Heinrich Schliemann to find and excavate the former site of the city of Troy. Nevertheless, Homeric epic is infamously anachronistic, mixing references to material culture and military tactics from diverse periods. Yet it is also impressively accurate geographically. It is not possible to make sense of evidence like this without a more nuanced definition of historiography that acknowledges that writing is not the only way to remember and reconstruct the past.

99 Michael D. Coe, *Breaking the Maya Code*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. (London: Thames and Hudson, 2012), 165.

100 Milman Parry, "Studies in the Epic Technique of Oral Verse-Making I: Homer and the Homeric Style," *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 41 (1930): 73-147.

Milman Parry, "Studies in the Epic Technique of Oral Verse-Making II: The Homeric Language as the Language of an Oral Poetry," *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 43 (1932): 1-50.

## ***Historiography 2.0***

In that case, then, one way to formulate a proposed Historiography 2.0 is as the encoding of the memory of past events in diverse and overlapping media for the purpose of transmitting that memory to people in the future. Those media may include the minds of select community members, the land, and/or specialized objects, stretching a bit beyond Elizabeth Hill Boone's proposed redefinition of writing as "the communication of relatively specific ideas in a conventional manner by means of permanent visible marks," intended to recognize Central American and Andean recording systems.<sup>101</sup> Cultural practices support the need for redundancy, error correction, and interpretation of these encodings in order to meet current needs. The general purpose of this encoding is still to record past events, but how much temporal or geographic precision is encoded may vary. People from one culture may encode their histories within genres that would be unacceptable or at least baffling choices for that purpose in another. By thinking of historiography in this way, it is easier to reflect on the way its practice is reshaped by prominent concepts applied within specific contexts. The next step is to practice applying this way of thinking by providing a comparison and contrast of what I am referring to as "European" and "Indigenous" ideas about history. The descriptions in the next section are starting points and are not meant to be total or absolute. I should also pause to acknowledge that "European" here stands in for primarily elite, urban communities in Europe and their Euro-American and Euro-Canadian counterparts. Rural and plebeian European cultures often have more in common with the ideas gathered under the rubric of "Indigenous" below.

101 Elizabeth Hill Boone, "Introduction: Writing and Recording Knowledge," in *Writing Without Words: Alternative Literacies in Mesoamerica and the Andes*, eds. Elizabeth Hill Boone and Walter D. Mignolo (Durham: Duke University Press, 1994), 15.

### ***Key Concepts About History in European and Indigenous Contexts***

By the nineteenth century, European ideas about history had taken on broad contours familiar to us today and reflected in a group of related key concepts. Our main concern here will be with just four that are notable for their importance in the misrecognition of Indigenous histories: singularity, teleology, temporality, and psychic unity. These four concepts are closely intertwined, powerful ideas arising from the European Enlightenment.

Singularity refers here to the assumption that there is just one human history, not in the anodyne sense that all humans live on the same Earth and, broadly speaking, share a history here, but in the more dangerous sense that all people are living the *same* history. This singular history has a teleological nature; it has an end-point when humans will reach perfection. Logically enough, if history has a direction towards the better, then tracking time is critical to ordering the triumphal narrative of all that change. Yet there were people in and outside of Europe considered less than perfect or backward relative to a presumed superior civilization. For those people to still be included within a singular history, with one direction towards the better, there must be psychic unity. That is, quoting Bruce Trigger, “All human groups... possess essentially the same kind and level of intelligence and the same basic emotions, although individuals within groups might differ from one another in their talents and natural dispositions.”<sup>102</sup> While this concept as applied in anthropology<sup>103</sup> is commonly associated with Edward Burnett Tylor and Lewis Henry

102 Bruce G. Trigger, *A History of Archaeological Thought*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 100.

103 Its origins as a general philosophical concept go back at least to the European Enlightenment, as evidenced by Adam Smith’s famous discussion in *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations* (London: T. Nelson and Sons, 1887), 7. Anthropologists such as Richard Handler in a 1986 article have traced it further back to Michel de Montaigne’s famous essay “On the Cannibals,” in which Montaigne makes an early argument based on cultural relativism. That essay may be read in: Michel de Montaigne, *The Complete Essays*, edited by M.A. Screech (London: Penguin Books, 2003): 228-241. Richard Handler, “Of Cannibals and Custom: Montaigne’s Cultural Relativism,” *Anthropology Today* 2, no. 5 (1986): 12-14.

Morgan in accounts of North American anthropology, its origins go back to another founder of anthropology, German scholar Adolf Bastien.<sup>104</sup> Psychic unity encouraged Europeans to see Indigenous peoples as fundamentally like themselves, but it also encouraged the interpretation of distance from Europe as equivalent to moving back in time.

Indigenous ideas about history include an assumption that there are many histories, time is both cyclic and linear, both humans and other than human beings have agency, and where events happen is generally more important than specifically when.<sup>105</sup> The first premise does not refer to a sort of hyper-individualistic history, but to one of many teachings carried by creation stories. These stories are often denied status as history outside of Indigenous knowledge systems on two grounds: mainstream scholars insist they can not be literally true, and they are too diverse. It probably has not helped that these stories flatly contradict mainstream commitments to the Bering Strait hypothesis and do not suggest a single underlying story that can be taken as “the original.” But the diversity of Indigenous creation stories makes sense if the beginnings of each distinctive people are understood as being part of what makes them distinct in the first place. The active role of other than human beings alludes to animals, plants, rocks, and so on, both in anthropomorphic roles and in assertions of will in their own forms. Other than human beings are widely understood as relatives, in specific degrees: siblings, grandparents, cousins.<sup>106</sup> Finally, the great emphasis in Indigenous history is place; it is necessary to understand where an event happened and how that place relates to other places and beings. Time is not wholly ignored, but it is often secondary. This

104 Luis A. Vivanco, *A Dictionary of Cultural Anthropology*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018) <https://www-oxfordreference-com.ezproxy.library.uvic.ca/view/10.1093/acref/9780191836688.001.0001/acref-9780191836688-miscMatter-1-div1-10> (accessed August 5, 2022), “psychic unity of humankind.”

105 Miller, “Native America Writes Back,” 9-28;

Susan A. Miller, “Native Historians Write Back: The Indigenous Paradigm in American Indian Historiography,” *Wicazo Sa Review* 24, no. 1 (2009): 25-45.

106 *Ibid.*

Margaret Kovach, *Indigenous Methodologies: Characteristics, Conversations, and Contexts* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010), 34.

is both a practical and epistemological point. It is remarkable that it took so long for Europeans and settlers to openly acknowledge the parallels between the ancient mnemonic technique of the memory palace<sup>107</sup> and the systematic association of story and place by Indigenous peoples. The earliest explicit analysis of these parallels I have found was published in 2015 by anthropologist Lynne Kelly.<sup>108</sup>

Although not often discussed, Indigenous and European peoples have some, if not precisely shared, then parallel, assumptions about history as well. Both expect history to hold relevant information for the present, ranging from how to behave to what to eat, and that this in itself connects people in the present to their ancestors. Therefore it is important to preserve and share this history, and deliberately passing down inaccurate or dishonest history is not acceptable. Accordingly, there is a common concern for establishing and maintaining rules for collecting and keeping historical information, and often non-trivial social consequences for breaking them. Indeed, over time both have developed important systems of source citation. I have witnessed Indigenous ways of demonstrating to an audience that a storyteller is an informed and authorized speaker. Keith Thor Carlson, a non-Indigenous ethnohistorian, characterizes this practice as “oral footnoting,” in which “the audience will expect speakers or tellers to explain how they know what they know.”<sup>109</sup> I have witnessed this practice in Plains Cree and Niitsitapi contexts, where the person sharing the historical account begins by explaining how they came to learn the story and earn the right to retell it. Unfortunately, these oral footnotes

107 Frances A. Yates, *The Art of Memory* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966).

108 Lynne Kelly, *Knowledge and Power in Prehistoric Societies: Orality, Memory, and the Transmission of Culture* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2015).

109 Keith Thor Carlson, “Reflections on Indigenous History and Memory,” in *Myth and Memory: Stories of Indigenous-European Contact*, ed. John Sutton Lutz (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2007), 52.

are not always included in the published version of “told-to” narratives, unless the collector/transcriber recognizes their importance.

### ***Indigenous Historiographic Methods Before the Invasion***

Well before Europeans arrived in the Americas, the methods of encoding information for posterity were using materials other than pen and paper, and did not necessarily depend on somehow recording literal words. People in a wide range of places and cultural contexts continue to create historical records. Their concern is not necessarily to pin down *speech* so much as to capture what we ordinarily expect speech to carry for us: ideas, stories and so on.<sup>110</sup> The Aztecs, in particular, were making paper of beaten maguey fibres,<sup>111</sup> and birchbark played a paper-like role where the tree grew. Nonetheless, the presence of paper does not guarantee a glottographic system in itself.<sup>112</sup> Rather than starting with what nevertheless is a system that seems more like European paper-based records and is more likely to be familiar through direct experience to most readers, this section will start with encoding methods that are likely more familiar by reputation. There are certainly more Indigenous historiographic methods than those covered here, but due to space constraints, I have sought to provide a reasonable overview rather than an encyclopedic catalogue.

From that perspective, the first method for consideration was studied famously and presented eloquently from an outsider perspective by Keith Basso.<sup>113</sup> This method is called place encoding. Through his years of work with the Cibecue Apache to map the proper names of their places in their language, he learned parts of both their map and their history in what is currently known as

110 Hill Boone, “Introduction,” 20-22.

111 Alice Beck Kehoe, *Traveling Prehistoric Seas: Critical Thinking on Ancient Transoceanic Voyages* (Walnut Creek: Left Coast Press, 2016), 98-99.

112 Geoffrey Sampson, *Writing Systems: A Linguistic Introduction* (London: Hutchinson, 1985), 29.

113 Keith Basso, *Wisdom Sits in Places: Landscape and Language Among the Western Apache* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996).

central Arizona. In particular, as Basso explains unflinchingly in the early pages of *Wisdom Sits in Places: Landscape and Language Among the Western Apache*, his Cibecue Apache colleagues instructed him that he was doing no less than quoting the speech of their ancestors. This made learning to speak Western Apache fluently and well with them in the present that much more important.<sup>114</sup> Each place has a powerful, descriptive name that provides an epitome of the events that happened there that the Cibecue Apache keep in their historical record. Basso's account of place, language, and stories that work among the Cibecue Apache give the reader a sense of density, a sense that there are more and more place names where the people have gotten to know the land more deeply. Basso recounts a vivid example in the penultimate chapter of his 1996 book, as his teacher Dudley Patterson explains the phrase that became the book's title, "wisdom sits in places." Patterson does so by telling a story from before the Cibecue Apache lived in permanent houses, and the adults instructed children in the names of places and their associated narratives. As Patterson continues, he explains the necessity for repeatedly thinking about and revisiting the places in order to appreciate the wisdom in them, because it is too much to absorb all at once. This practice connects the Cibecue Apache to their ancestors, and to their contemporaries.<sup>115</sup>

A different style of place encoding is recorded by Oetelaar and Oetelaar, based on their work with the Niitsitapi, whose lands span the southwestern plains in an area roughly marked at its north and south extremes by the North Saskatchewan River and Yellowstone Park. As the Oetelaars explain, the Niitsitapi landscape is a network of places that are themselves mnemonic devices that remind people of necessary ceremonies, important materials they may gather there, and their own histories and oral traditions.<sup>116</sup> They note, "travel across the landscape is much

114 Basso, *Wisdom Sits in Places*, xv; 10.

115 Basso, *Wisdom Sits in Places*, 120-129.

116 Gerald A. Oetelaar and D. Joy Oetelaar, "The Landscape as Historical Archive Among Hunter-Gatherers of the Northern Plains," in *Structured Worlds: The Archaeology of Hunter-Gatherer Thought and Action*, ed. Aubrey

more than an annual pilgrimage; it is a spiritual, social, and educational journey through the archive of the group.... In effect, movement across the landscape becomes a strategy designed to preserve and transmit faithfully the language, culture, and oral traditions of the group.” This strategy of systematic travel and structured remembering is a major part of how accuracy in information transmission is maintained over time.<sup>117</sup> Salience is built up by recording information at significant places through names, stories, and actions. Places are visited in a particular sequence, although which selection of sites out of the greater map of places may vary with the climate and weather conditions. I should also note that the wide extent of Niitsitapi land does precede the introduction of Old World horses to the Americas.<sup>118</sup>

Indigenous peoples did (and do) have sky-based mnemonic systems for navigational purposes, as reported by Ininew star stories expert Wilfred Buck.<sup>119</sup> His calling to gather and share Indigenous star maps and stories has led him to work with elders primarily from First Nations in Manitoba and southern Ontario. Some star lore has also been shared by Niitsitapi elders through their collaboration with the Glenbow Museum in Alberta.<sup>120</sup> From a mainstream perspective, these verbal sky maps might be understood as simply a logical extension of the land-based methods already described.

Cannon (Sheffield: Equinox Publishing Ltd., 2011), 69.

117 Oetelaar and Oetelaar, “The Landscape as Historical Archive Among Hunter-Gatherers of the Northern Plains,” 70; 88.

118 The mainstream historical consensus is that horses went extinct in the Americas over 10 000 years ago and were reintroduced by the Spaniards at the turn of the sixteenth century. Then, the mainstream account continues, acquiring horses enabled Indigenous peoples to travel greater distances faster, especially on the plains. This account is not accepted by Indigenous peoples, however. Yvette Running Horse Collin provides an overview of Indigenous perspectives and an analysis of the European historical record in her doctoral dissertation, “The Relationship Between Indigenous Peoples of the Americas and the Horse: Deconstructing a Eurocentric Myth” (PhD Dissertation, University of Alaska Fairbanks, 2017).

119 Wilfred Buck, *Tipiskawi Kisik: Night Sky Star Stories* (Winnipeg: Manitoba First Nations Education Resource Centre, Inc., 2018).

120 Blackfoot Confederacy and Glenbow Museum, “Traditional Stories,” Niitsitapiisinni: Our Way of Life, [https://www.glenbow.org/blackfoot/EN/html/traditional\\_stories.htm](https://www.glenbow.org/blackfoot/EN/html/traditional_stories.htm) (accessed July 5, 2020).

From many Indigenous perspectives, sky maps are far more than this, since there are traditions recounting how certain Indigenous nations' ancestors came from the stars.<sup>121</sup>

The integration of ceremony into place-based encoding systems hints at another method using material culture, ranging from regalia to dwellings. Among the peoples most famous for explicitly making, trading, and handing down regalia for this purpose are Indigenous nations of the Northwest coast of North America. In the introduction to their second volume of Tlingit oratory, Dauenhauer and Dauenhauer quote Raven House Steward Austin Hammond's address to Chilkat weavers who are making *at.oów*, "We wear our history."<sup>122</sup> *At.oów* is a general term for "an owned or purchased thing,"<sup>123</sup> and so the items that may carry historical information include a wide range of objects imprinted with a meaningful design. The design itself provides a condensed embodiment of the story it encodes. The regalia or other objects that are *at.oów* are taken out and used during ceremony, and there is a sequence of ceremony that runs throughout the year.

The role of dwellings as mnemonic objects is not as widely discussed in the academic or popular literature, although the fact that space is carefully ordered even in movable homes like tipis is familiar to anthropologists specializing in the study of Plains First Nations.<sup>124</sup> The Haudenosaunee conceptualization of their Confederacy as a longhouse is another, under-appreciated example.<sup>125</sup> Longhouses, with their lengthwise symmetry and series of hearths representing each family living in

121 Buck, *Tipiskawi Kisik*, 14.

122 Nora Marks Dauenhauer, and Richard Dauenhauer, *Haa Tuwunáagu Yís, For Healing Our Spirit: Tlingit Oratory. Classics of Tlingit Oral Literature Volume Two* (Seattle and Juno: University of Washington Press and Sealaska Heritage Foundation, 1990), 355.

123 Nora Marks Dauenhauer, and Richard Dauenhauer, *Haa Shuká, Our Ancestors: Tlingit Oral Narratives. Classics of Tlingit Oral Literature Volume One* (Seattle and Juno: University of Washington Press and Sealaska Heritage Foundation, 1987), 24-26.

124 Gerald A. Oetelaar, "Beyond Activity Areas: Structure and Symbolism in the Organization and Use of Space Inside Tipis," *Plains Archaeologist* 45, no. 71 (2000): 35-61.

125 Haudenosaunee and Rotinonshonni are both usually translated as "the People of the Longhouse" and refer to all members of the Confederacy. See Brian Rice, *The Rotinonshonni: A Traditional Iroquoian History Through the Eyes of Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera* (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2013), 1; 212; 223.

the house in their due order, are repeated in the traditional plan and seating of their council meetings. They can also be read to recount the story of the formation of the Confederacy itself. It is probably not coincidental that as a people who customarily maintained villages in one place and grew extensive crops, the Haudenosaunee adopted additional encoding methods that were not strictly dependent on specific places. These methods were not only independent of distinct places, but also externalizations of the information encoded on them so that they could be read independently of the person carrying them if necessary. These techniques include carved walking sticks, clothing designs, and wampum, the famous purple and white beads used and traded throughout northeastern North America. Wampum played a central part in treaty-making and maintenance between Indigenous nations throughout the region, and could be misconstrued as money, especially when presented as loose beads or in simple strings to ransom captives or make amends to families grieving for lost relatives.<sup>126</sup> Its historiographic use is in the form of belts worked with designs representing specific treaties.<sup>127</sup> The Haudenosaunee examples are best known in part because of the seizure of the wampum records traditionally cared for and recited by Onondaga keepers and the subsequent ongoing legal struggles to repatriate them.

Another mnemonic medium independent of specific places used across much of northeastern North America is the birchbark document Brooks refers to in *The Common Pot* as *awikhiganak*, the plural form of *awikhigan*. She says the term is from the Abenaki language, built on a root referring to drawing, writing, and mapping.<sup>128</sup> Particularly in the Great Lakes region, birch bark maps and pictures are regularly referred to by non-Indigenous travellers and visitors. Due to their ephemerality,

126 Richard Hill Sr., "Regenerating Identity: Repatriation and the Indian Frame of Mind," in *The Future of the Past: Archaeologists, Native Americans, and Repatriation*, ed. Tamara L. Bray (New York: Garland Publishing, 2001), 131-132.

127 Hill Sr., "Regenerating Identity," 131-132.

128 Lisa Brooks, *The Common Pot: The Recovery of Native Space in the Northeast* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008), xxi.

they are probably the most contentious contenders for recognition as a mode of historiographic recording. But they are not so contentious if we bear in mind that the system of symbols used in marking *awikhiganak* were conventionalized,<sup>129</sup> and used to invoke stories people had learned. The necessary symbols would be reproduced on birchbark from memory during and after systematic training, rather than left to carry the burden of maintaining the historical record on their own.

A main purpose of Brooks' study is to bring *awikhiganak* and wampum together both due to the overlapping areas of their use and because they "exemplify a spatialized writing tradition."<sup>130</sup> In this case, the spatialization is via the representation of "relationships between people, between places, between humans and nonhumans, between the waterways that joined them. The communal stories recorded on birchbark and wampum could even connect people with their relations across time, bringing the past, present, and future into the same space."<sup>131</sup> Barbara Alice Mann argues that Haudenosaunee talked ideas into wampum, and came to realize they could then talk the ideas out again.<sup>132</sup> There are ethnographic accounts of Haudenosaunee councils where trained and respected speakers literally picked up each wampum belt or string in succession in order to recount their contents.<sup>133</sup> This practice is reflected in the labelling and organization of Chief Jacob E. Thomas' revised edition of Seth Newhouse's transcription of an 1897 wampum recitation session.<sup>134</sup>

The methods covered so far are characteristic of northern North America.<sup>135</sup> Meanwhile, in North America's southern extremes and Mesoamerica more generally, we find other methods at once more similar but still very different from European writing. These include the maguey paper records and

129 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 12-13.

130 *Ibid.*

131 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 12.

132 Barbara Alice Mann, "The Fire at Onondaga: Wampum as Proto-Writing," *Akwesasne Notes* 1, no. 1 (1995): 40.

133 Horatio Hale, ed., *The Iroquois Book of Rites* (Philadelphia: Wm. Fell and Co., 1883).

134 Seth Newhouse, *The Constitution of the Confederacy by the Peacemaker*, revised by Chief Jacob E. Thomas (Wilsonville: Sandpiper Press, 1989): 1-48.

135 Characteristic, but not exclusive. See Santos-Granero and J. Hill for examples of place encoding in South America.

monumental carvings of the Aztecs and Maya. Part of what makes their records seem familiar despite their utterly different iconography and content is their concern with time. The Aztecs developed an entire genre of historical document, the year-count annal, composed of conventionalized symbols in defined arrangements that were then read out to an audience gathered for that purpose.<sup>136</sup> The salience of time did not obviate the importance of place; in fact, quite the opposite. Hill Boone says in her discussion of the Aztec year counts that “Location is fundamental: it is the reason for the story in the first place, and qualifies and justifies the major events in the narrative.”<sup>137</sup> She reiterates the role of these documents as means to refresh the memory and allow for embellishment with further detail, features available in any system of structured encoding.<sup>138</sup>

Things get much more difficult when we come to the Maya, however. They developed a hieroglyphic writing system, and they did indeed represent speech with it. But their development and usage of this system also seem to have been primarily for the use of the ruling class. Mayan scribes had to train in how to write the glyphs and produce the structured documents as well as how to calculate the dates in the Mayan calendar. Their training was centralized in urban schools which would have reduced access to this particular historiographic tradition irrespective of the intentions of its founders.<sup>139</sup> After the Mayan city-states ceased to function and their former citizens left them behind, the hieroglyphic Mayan writing system was lost, although Mayan scribes adopted the Roman alphabet to preserve their written histories in a new format.<sup>140</sup> The question of whether the Maya maintained a place-based encoding system remains an open question, if not an unasked one.<sup>141</sup>

136 Elizabeth Hill Boone, “Introduction: Writing and Recording Knowledge,” in *Writing Without Words: Alternative Literacies in Mesoamerica and the Andes*, eds. Elizabeth Hill Boone and Walter D. Mignolo (Durham: Duke University Press, 1994), 50; 53-54; 71.

137 Hill Boone, “Aztec Pictorial Histories,” 53.

138 Hill Boone, “Aztec Pictorial Histories,” 72.

139 Michael D. Coe and Justin Kerr, *The Art of the Maya Scribe* (New York: Harry N. Abrams, 1998).

140 Dennis Tedlock, *2000 Years of Mayan Literature* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2015), 2; 8-9

141 Paul Sullivan, “Anthropology and Ethnohistory of the Maya,” *Reviews in Anthropology* 43, no. 4 (2014): 260-281.

The last encoding system with this quality of severely restricted access used by an Indigenous people in the Americas included in this overview is the Inkan quipu. On a practical basis, it is hard to see how a recording system based on knotting string could be limited from broader use, and it probably was not in a general way. The most elaborate records using multiple strings, highly differentiated knots and different colours appear to have required a dedicated and trained group to encode and then recite their contents.<sup>142</sup> Nonetheless, it must also be noted that it is not strictly certain that quipus were applied to historiographic use, although they were definitely bureaucratic tools. The case is by no means closed, and based on over two decades of research, anthropologist Gary Urton has argued that the role of quipus as imperial accounting tools makes them feasible primary sources for *long durée* history in the mode of the French Annales school.<sup>143</sup> It does not appear that he means by this that the *Inka* were necessarily encoding or otherwise composing such histories, but that present-day anthropologists who study quipus may produce such histories. However, if the Inka were notionally encoding something like *long durée* history, they likely recorded different facets of their history in a place-based encoding system defined in part by stone.<sup>144</sup>

### ***Indigenous Historiographic Methods After the Invasion***

Maintaining continuity of Indigenous knowledge systems of all kinds, let alone historical knowledge was no small challenge for many communities dealing with multiple sources of stress. That reality by itself would lead anyone to expect that these other means of encoding historical knowledge were mostly overwhelmed and lost viability in the face of so much disruption. Nevertheless, this was not a universally held view among European-style trained scholars even through the most difficult decades of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

142 Hill Boone, "Introduction," 21-22.

143 Gary Urton, *Inka History in Knots; Reading Khipus as Primary Sources* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2017). He summarizes his case on pages 251-257.

144 Carolyn J. Dean, *A Culture of Stone: Inka Perspectives on Rock* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2010).

The Aztec and Maya peoples were apparently no longer writing except in the Roman alphabet by the late sixteenth century. The peoples referred to as the Five Civilized Tribes<sup>145</sup> in the United States were famed in part for apparently acculturating to “white men’s ways” before their forced removal to Oklahoma, including adopting European-style literacy and becoming “historical” by writing and printing with paper and ink. Yet the surviving wampum belt records intrigued outsiders, and their growing understanding of the linguistic relationships between Indigenous nations incidentally revealed to them that many stories they once simply dismissed as myths in fact encoded accurate information. Still, the temptation to interpret complex Indigenous story traditions as analogous to the garbled understanding of history characteristic of some parts of Europe after the fall of the Roman empire can be hard for mainstream scholars to resist. This section provides a preliminary sense of the level of potential adaptation and continuity in Indigenous historiographic methods in post-contact conditions.

Starting with glottographic systems, those that represent sounds and words in languages, we are plunged almost immediately into controversy. Among the most famous in northern North America are the Cherokee syllabary and the syllabics originally developed for representing Cree then adapted to a range of Anishinabeg dialects and Inuktitut. The mainstream account of Cherokee syllabics is that they were invented by Sequoyah to write with, a rather unusual attribution because he was a Cherokee himself. Also known as George Guess or Gist, he was a controversial Cherokee political leader and artist.<sup>146</sup> The corresponding account of syllabics attributes them to the Wesleyan Methodist missionary James Evans.<sup>147</sup>

145 These peoples are of the Cherokee, Chickasaw, Chictaw, Muscogee, and Seminole Nations. Grant Foreman, *The Five Civilized Tribes* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1934).

146 Turtle Island Productions LLC, “The Story,” Searching for Sequoyah, <https://searchingforsequoyah.com/the-story/> (accessed February 17, 2023).

147 Winona Stevenson, “Calling Badger and the Symbols of the Spirit Language: The Cree Origins of the Syllabic System,” *Oral History Forum* 19-20 (1999): 19-20.

These credits have both been challenged; the former by Traveler Bird in his now little-known book *Tell Them They Lie*,<sup>148</sup> the latter by Cree scholar Winona Stevenson (now Wheeler), most prominently in her 1999 article “Calling Badger and the Symbols of the Spirit Language.” Stevenson’s challenge hinges on arguments for “stimulus diffusion,”<sup>149</sup> the development of both the Cherokee and Cree syllabaries on inspiration in part from long-term contact with European forms of writing. Bird does not use such technical terms, instead focussing on arguing against the idea of a single man alone performing this feat, claiming that the syllabary was already in existence.<sup>150</sup> For the purposes of this section, the key points to note are the evidence of adaptation either of a pre-existing Indigenous symbol system or the idea of representing speech directly in symbols.

Lisa Brooks summarizes some specific transformations of Indigenous encoding methods and their associated historical material in the Northeast, observing:

Transformations occurred when the European system entered Native space. Birchbark messages became letters and petitions, wampum records became treaties, and journey pictographs became written “journals” that contained similar geographic and relational markers, while histories recorded on birchbark and wampum became written communal narratives. All of these forms were prolific in the northwest long before Indian people began writing poetry and fiction. These texts, which emerged from within Native space, represent an indigenous American literary tradition.<sup>151</sup>

It is striking that specific types of encoding were adapted into different genres of European-style written records. Indeed, we can find an impressive example from the Niitsitapi in the form of Old Swan’s map, one among several collected by Peter Fidler during his travels in what is currently

148 Traveler Bird, *Tell Them They Lie: The Sequoyah Myth* (Los Angeles: Western Lore Publishers, 1971).

149 Stevenson, “Calling Badger and the Symbols of the Spirit Language,” quoting anthropologist Verne Dusenbury from his monograph *The Montana Cree: A Study in Religious Persistence*, on page 22.

150 Bird, *Tell Them They Lie*, 13-14; 18; 25.

151 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 13.

called western Canada.<sup>152</sup> These maps were highly stylized, applying formalized cartographic conventions interpretable among Niitsitapi individuals. Theodore Binnema explicated many of these conventions in his analysis of Old Swan's map in 2001, emphasizing the way they facilitated bearing the contents of the map in mind and reproducing it in such temporary media as sand or snow.<sup>153</sup> Fidler labelled Old Swan's map with place names for his own future reference.<sup>154</sup> This brings promptly to mind the Cibecue Apache maps, and in the Niitsitapi case, more recent versions of their maps including place names labelled in Roman orthography adapted to their language are a centrepiece of their exhibit at the Glenbow Museum.<sup>155</sup>

These are examples of continuity and successful resistance to assimilation alongside adaptation of European methods and genres. However, it would be, at best, an oversimplification to suggest that Indigenous knowledge keepers always felt assured that they were carrying out an efficacious process. Sometimes they were doing what they could to save what they feared would otherwise be lost to their descendants forever, often by dictating to a non-Indigenous amanuensis. Winona Wheeler describes a project coordinated by the Saskatchewan Indian Cultural Centre involving Cree, Assiniboine, Saulteaux, Dakota, and Dene elders who were responding to just this concern.<sup>156</sup> Much earlier examples involve transcription by linguists, anthropologists and their students, from Franz Boas<sup>157</sup> to Leonard Bloomfield.<sup>158</sup> Knowledge

152 Theodore Binnema, "How Does a Map Mean? Old Swan's Map of 1801 and the Blackfoot World," in *From Rupert's Land to Canada*, eds. Theodore Binnema, Gerhard J. Ens, and R.C. McLeod (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2001): 201-211.

153 Binnema, "How Does a Map Mean?" 210-211.

154 Ibid.

155 Blackfoot Confederacy and Glenbow Museum, "Traditional Stories."

156 Winona Wheeler, "Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories," in *Walking a Tightrope: Aboriginal People and Their Representations*, eds. David T. McNab and Ute Lischke (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2005), 195.

157 See, for example, Franz Boas and George Hunt, *Kwakiutl Texts* (Lieden: E.J. Brill Ltd., 1902-1905).

158 Leonard Bloomfield, *Sacred Stories of the Sweet Grass Cree*. Bulletin No. 60 of the Anthropological Series No. 11 of the National Museum of Canada (Ottawa: F.A. Acland, King's Printer, 1930).

keepers who were unsure their usual means of transmitting knowledge would survive the changes they were seeing took chances to ensure cultural continuity to the best of their ability. The results include thousands of books, articles, recordings, and maps as well as various items of regalia surrendered under duress of poverty or legal action to museums and universities, or stolen.<sup>159</sup> Another potential strategy an Indigenous community could use was to select younger members to attend European schools and then have them apply their newly acquired skills in writing the older narratives in new forms.<sup>160</sup> The Mayan, Aztec, and Inka transliterations of their histories into Roman script held in museums around the world are prominent examples,<sup>161</sup> composed in the wake of outright destruction of their social and physical infrastructure for training scribes and quipu workers.

Indigenous peoples have developed a range of solutions when faced with new colonial borders cutting across their homelands and potentially disrupting the system of ongoing place encoding and transfer of knowledge between generations. For many, the first and most effective solution is their strategic use of travel for work, including, for example, Haudenosaunee

159 For specific examples, see:

Saskatchewan Indigenous Cultural Centre, “Library and Information Services,” <https://www.sicc.sk.ca/library-information-services> (accessed February 19, 2023). Winona Wheeler discusses the results of one of the Saskatchewan Indigenous Cultural Centre’s programs in “Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories.”

U’mista Cultural Centre, opened in 1980 specifically to house regalia confiscated from a potlatch held during Canada’s potlatch ban from 1885 – 1951. “About Us,” <https://www.umista.ca/pages/about-us> (accessed February 19, 2023).

160 Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), 2-4, 7.

Dennis Tedlock, introduction to *Popul Vuh: The Mayan Book of the Dawn of Life*, Revised Edition, trans. Dennis Tedlock (New York: Touchstone, 1996), 21-22, 25-27.

161 Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 2-4; 7.

Hill Boone, “Introduction,” 18-22.

Dennis Tedlock, introduction to *Popul Vuh*, 26-27.

steelworkers,<sup>162</sup> Plains First Nation rodeo and ranch hands,<sup>163</sup> and Northwest coast seasonal cannery and agricultural labourers, all in the late nineteenth to early twentieth centuries.<sup>164</sup>

Economic change has reduced the effectiveness of this strategy, but with the Canadian federal government's 1951 revisions to the Indian Act ending most restrictions on gatherings of Indigenous people in that settler state, powwow circuits, sports events, and ceremonial gatherings have taken much of its place. An important tactic pursued by Haudenosaunee activists and their allies in earnest starting in the late 1960s was winning partial enforcement of a key section of the 1794 Jay Treaty signed between Britain and the United States.<sup>165</sup> The section was intended to protect the right of Indigenous persons to live and work on either side of the new colonial border for the benefit of fur trade interests.<sup>166</sup>

Yet other important strategies focus on Indigenous languages: their retention, revitalization, and translation. Okanagan author Jeannette C. Armstrong discussed the relationship between land and language in her 1998 essay "Land Speaking," explaining that in the Okanagan view, language is spoken and given by the land.<sup>167</sup> Furthermore, Armstrong argues, "In this sense, all indigenous peoples' languages are generated by a precise geography and arise from it. Over time and many generations of their people, it is their distinctive interaction with a precise geography which forms the way Indigenous language is shaped and subsequently how the world is read,

162 For an overview of Haudenosaunee high steel work up to the early 1960s, see: *High Steel*, DVD, directed by Don Owen (National Film Board, 1965).

A more recent, Indigenous-led exploration is *Mohawk Ironworkers*, Series, directed by Paul Rickard, Courtney Montour, Michelle Smith, Margaret Horn, and Jeff Dorn (Mushkeg Media, 2014).

163 On rodeo and ranching, see Morgan Baillargeon and Leslie Tepper, eds. *Legends of Our Times: Native Cowboy Life* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1998).

164 On Indigenous labourers travelling for work, see, for example, the case of early colonial British Columbia in John Sutton Lutz, *Makúk: A New History of Aboriginal-White Relations* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2008), 163-231.

165 Clinton Rickard, *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*, ed. Barbara Graymont (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973), 71-83.

166 R.J. Sutherland, Gretchen Albers and Zach Parrott, "Jay's Treaty," *The Canadian Encyclopedia*, <https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/jays-treaty> (accessed August 15, 2022).

167 Jeannette C. Armstrong, "Land Speaking," in *Speaking for the Generations: Native Writers on Writing*, ed. Simon J. Ortiz (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1998), 175-176.

approached, and expressed verbally by its speakers.”<sup>168</sup> Therefore maintaining and reviving Indigenous languages, in turn, maintains and revives relationships with places and preserves the histories encoded in them, even if immediate access is not possible. Stories not specifically focussed on places may nevertheless serve as practical maps for those locations a person has not seen, as Laguna Pueblo scholar Leslie Marmon Silko described in 1996.<sup>169</sup> If we turn our minds back to the Niitsitapi examples of Old Swan’s map and the current Blackfoot Exhibit at the Glenbow Museum, annotated maps composed according to Indigenous conventions also allow virtual place visits in lieu of in person ones.

Just as we need to understand and apply Indigenous cartographic conventions to accurately read and understand Indigenous maps, we need to understand and apply the conventions of Indigenous histories. Discussion of Indigenous literary conventions has expanded over time in scholarly introductions to transcribed collections. Early notes about broad types of narrative are often brief, such as references to *ācimōwina* “everyday stories” and *ācađōhkīwina* “earliest, sacred stories” while introducing Cree story transcriptions.<sup>170</sup> These discussions are often now more detailed in nature, as, for example, in Berman’s exploration of North Pacific Coast oral histories drawn from materials collected and documented by Franz Boas’ Tlingit-English consultant George Hunt.<sup>171</sup>

There is a further difference in emphasis between Indigenous and European historiographic methods with respect to the role of the community as contributors and archivists. Indigenous

168 Armstrong, “Land Speaking,” 178-179.

169 Leslie Marmon Silko, *Yellow Woman and a Beauty of Spirit: Essays on Native American Life Today* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1996), 32.

170 Robert A. Brightman, *Grateful Prey: Rock Cree Human-Animal Relationships* (Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre, 2003), 37-38.

171 Judith Berman, ““Some Mysterious Means of Fortune’: A Look at North Pacific Coast Oral History,” in *Coming to Shore: Northwest Coast Ethnology, Traditions, and Visions*, eds. Marie Mauze, Michael Harkin and Sergei Kan (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2004), 136-142.

methods were and are typically cited in community practice. There is usually a role for many people as active audience members, if not as reciters of historical narratives within formal contexts. European methods tend to produce documents that may be more easily dissociated from a community of participants, although paradoxically, the resulting archives still require a community of collectors and interpreters. The recent development of social history and alternative archival practices in settler and European contexts has led mainstream scholars to reconnect with their own oral histories and oral history encoding practices.<sup>172</sup>

Overall, the main impacts of the advent of European historiographic and encoding methods for Indigenous peoples are threefold. First is the integration of literal representations and recordings of speech. Second is a shift from Indigenous to European languages, especially English, French, and Spanish. Third, and far from least, is a reduced level of access to Indigenous historiographic records that have been left encoded in objects and places and to those carried by language holders and knowledge keepers who still speak Indigenous languages while younger people may not.

### ***Reading Indigenous History***

Having considered a selection of the methods Indigenous peoples in the Americas used and use to encode and transmit their histories, it is time to set out how to effectively and respectfully read Indigenous history writing. This way of reading must start by setting Indigenous epistemologies at the centre of the interpretive framework for the histories considered here.

<sup>172</sup> Social history strives to explore the past through records of “the common man,” such as by statistical analysis of government records, or the records of the Mass Observation Movement in the United Kingdom. Reconnection to oral histories and practices is described in many of the Northwest Métis primary sources.

For examples of each of these, see:

Bruce Curtis, *The Politics of Population: State Formation, Statistics, and the Census of Canada, 1840 – 1875* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001).

Juliet Gardiner, *Wartime Britain 1939 – 1945* (London: Headline Publishing, 2004).

Albina Jacknife, *Elizabeth Metis Settlement: A Local History* (Altona: Friesen Printers, 1977).

Therefore I seek to apply what Kimberly Blaeser called tribal-centred criticism in 1993<sup>173</sup> and Craig S. Womack first referred to as American Indian literary nationalism in 1999.<sup>174</sup> The hostile early reception of this approach to Indigenous writing by mainstream scholars reflects its commitment to decolonization and challenge to the once assumed priority of non-Indigenous perspectives. Taking this approach has an ethical component in that it treats Indigenous materials and communities respectfully in a way that resists positioning Indigenous histories as derivative or defective. This does not preclude the use of reading methodologies derived from European traditions but does reiterate the need to handle them with care. Indigenous histories must be treated with care and respect, but not without question. Indigenous scholars and knowledge keepers test their sources and check for transmission problems just as their non-Indigenous counterparts do.

The method for building this knowledge I have applied is one learned from Barbara Wilkes as a student in her undergraduate-level course, “An Ethnographic Survey of Native North America.”<sup>175</sup> She taught us that to learn the very basics of another peoples’ epistemology, we should spend time with a few of their key traditional stories, focussing on those that recount the origins of the people, important social links, and ceremonies. These provide thumbnail sketches of the major social relationships recognized and maintained, broad rules of social behaviour, and the metaphors that describe how that group of people orders and understands their world. To help those of us taking the class get started on the right foot, she said, “When you read these stories, think of it as something you would hear at your grandmother’s knee.” I

173 Kimberly M. Blaeser, “Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre,” in *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*, eds. Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016), 231-232.

174 Craig S. Womack, *Red on Red: Native Literary Separatism* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1999).

175 Barbara Wilkes, “Introduction,” *Anthropology 355: An Ethnographic Survey of Native North America* (class lecture, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, January 15, 2005).

have never forgotten another lesson from Wilkes' anthropology class, in which one of my peers imposed a remarkable Freudian reading on an Anishinabeg creation story: make sure the theory or method makes sense to the narrative at hand. This last example hints at another critical aspect of the tribal-centred approach, its practicality. Separated from their connections to Indigenous thought and rhetorical structures, Indigenous narratives, in whole or in part, can be gravely misunderstood. For instance, many of the histories discussed in the case studies include materials categorized as myth and, therefore, outside European history. Sometimes the connection of such stories to the main narrative may seem tenuous, yet they are obviously there for a reason important enough to appear in the eventual publication. This is true even for some of the earliest examples from the turn of the nineteenth century, when non-Indigenous editors had far more license to cut such materials than today. Returning these narratives to an at least Indigenous-informed context renders these inclusions understandable.

Until the turn of the twentieth century, the majority of scholarly engagement with Indigenous-sourced narratives was based on non-Indigenous literary and subject categories. Works labelled fiction and autobiography have won consistent mainstream interest. In comparison, non-fiction seems neglected, despite a printed publication history stretching back at least two hundred years based on the books and pamphlets I examined for this dissertation, and the findings of Robert Allen Warrior, which I discuss below.<sup>176</sup> Mainstream critics and readers generally shared a “commonsense” view that Indigenous peoples lacked historical consciousness or active logical reasoning prior to European intervention. As a consequence, Indigenous-authored non-fiction was not so much ignored as not expected to exist. Ideas about the proper activities of the “authentic Indian,” including firm disengagement from the sort of education and

<sup>176</sup> Robert Allen Warrior, *The People and the Word: Reading and Native Nonfiction* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005).

intellectual activity associated with non-fiction, initially made it harder for settlers to recognize Indigenous non-fiction as part of any Indigenous intellectual tradition. Indeed, it also made it that much harder for settlers to accept there was any Indigenous intellectual tradition in the first place. Luckily the grip of these ideas about the “authentic Indian” was never absolute and lost significant purchase in the years surrounding the infamous Columbus anniversary of 1992.

Robert Allen Warrior published his monograph *Tribal Secrets: Recovering American Indian Intellectual Traditions* in 1994, arguing for an Indigenous intellectual tradition exemplified by the work of scholars from nations primarily in North America.<sup>177</sup> In 2005, he went on to state in *The People and the Word: Reading and Native Nonfiction* that “Though contemporary fiction and poetry receive the lion’s share of scholarly attention in studies of Native literature, the historical centrality of non-fiction in Native writing in English since the late eighteenth century is inarguable.”<sup>178</sup> The corpus of primary sources for this project is consistent with the existence of an Indigenous intellectual tradition.

The next section provides a brief guide specifically to the recent written Indigenous intellectual tradition, referring to works published from the late eighteenth century up to the present. This guide combines Warrior’s findings based primarily on writers in the United States together with observations from Craig S. Womack and Sophie McCall, plus the analysis I completed of the annotated bibliography of Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historiography presented in the Appendix to this thesis.<sup>179</sup> Then the discussion will shift to a more abstract approach as I lay out the theories and methods that make up my toolset for analyzing the primary

177 Robert Allen Warrior, *Tribal Secrets: Recovering American Indian Intellectual Traditions* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1994), xx-xxi.

178 Robert Allen Warrior, *The People and the Word: Reading and Native Nonfiction* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), xvi-xvii.

179 *Appendix: Annotated Select Bibliography*, 429-446.

sources. The presuppositions in mainstream theories make them difficult tools to apply to Indigenous writing, but based on the examples provided by scholars such as Kimberly M. Blaeser, Robert Allen Warrior, Linda Tuhiwai Smith and Audra Simpson, it is possible to overcome the presuppositions with care. I then turn to the reading methodology for the case studies. I will discuss important changes in how mainstream scholars engage with “told-to” narratives via method and practice developed by an interdisciplinary group of scholars, including Sophie McCall and Julie Cruikshank. These methods are important for anyone reading “told-to” narratives that are part of other people’s traditions. Finally comes the question of how to read from an Indigenous framework and, therefore, better appreciate the structure and function of what might seem otherwise puzzling inclusions in the primary sources. To answer the question, at least for this study, I will tangle briefly with the conundrum of myth versus history from an anthropological perspective before presenting Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee narrative genres and structures.

### ***A Quick Orientation to Recent Indigenous Intellectual Tradition***

Today it is not as controversial as it once was to acknowledge an Indigenous intellectual tradition in North America, although this does not mean all potentially interested parties are comfortable with the notion or the materials defining an Indigenous intellectual tradition. This discomfort often seems to tie to worries that identifying an Indigenous anything, be it literature, material culture, or ceremony, must somehow depend upon a constant essence or idealized figure like the “authentic Indian” that does not exist. Yet this concern does not arise when recognizing a European or European-based intellectual tradition, where we recognize it based on shared history, language, and epistemology. We can also observe the dialogue between its participants as reflected in citation practices, who their publishers were, and their anticipated audiences. While

it is true that a similar analysis cannot be done as easily for Indigenous intellectual tradition in North America prior to the advent of the European printing press, an important start has been made in the post-printing press era, spanning circa the late 1700s to the present. The turn of the twenty-first century is rich in publications describing and analyzing specific elements of this tradition, most often novels and poetry, and several of the histories featured in the case studies in Chapters Three and Four. For an overview more focused on non-fiction, however, the first and most detailed example is in Robert Allen Warrior's comparative study of writing by Vine Deloria, Jr. and John Joseph Mathews' in *Tribal Secrets: Recovering American Indian Intellectual Traditions*.

As the subtitle reassures us, Warrior is quite clear that there is more than one American Indian, or in the terminology of this study, Indigenous intellectual tradition. However, with respect to written and published work, he deploys a more specific concept "that the history of Native writing constitutes an intellectual tradition, a tradition that can and should inform the contemporary work of Native intellectuals."<sup>180</sup> He distinguishes Deloria and Mathews as participants within a series of "four important moments for Native public intellectuals between 1890 and the present."<sup>181</sup> Warrior loosely defines these moments as 1890 – 1925, 1925 – 1961, 1961 – 1973, and 1973 – 1994, further explained below, based primarily on the level of interaction and cooperation between Native public intellectuals. Considering Native writing in greater detail, he notes important changes in content and who contributes to the literary conversation. Overall, he describes a growing diversity of participants and viewpoints alongside a raw increase in the number of publications in numerous genres.

180 Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xiii.

181 Warrior, *Tribal Secrets*, 3.

Warrior characterizes the first period, 1890 – 1925, as one when Native public intellectuals worked closely together.<sup>182</sup> Indeed, the tenure of the first Indigenous lobby group founded and led primarily by Indigenous intellectuals in North America, the Society of American Indians (SAI), falls within this period (1911 – 1923).<sup>183</sup> This is also an era when Indigenous authors were mainly “Christian converts or thoroughgoing secularists,”<sup>184</sup> and this can be observed about the authors in the subset of materials analyzed for this project. Warrior offers a more specific reflection on the origins of this predominance in his follow-up discussion of Indigenous non-fiction writing in 2005, explaining that published non-fiction came almost exclusively from “Native male Christians” until the 1820s. Furthermore, he notes that in the southeast, the Cherokees, among other Indigenous communities, included non-clergy writing non-fiction in their local media, still predominantly a male practice and centred in newspapers printed and distributed for those communities.<sup>185</sup>

During the second period, 1925 – 1961, despite the efforts of Native intellectuals like SAI alumna Zitkala-Să (Gertrude Bonnin), who founded the National Council for American Indians in 1926,<sup>186</sup> Warrior describes this as a period of “lack of associative cohesion.”<sup>187</sup> This is not so surprising from a Canadian perspective, as Indigenous ceremonies and soliciting funds for legal advocacy were illegal, the former from 1885 to 1951, the latter from 1927 to 1951 under the

182 *Ibid.*

183 K. Tsianina, “The Society of American Indians,” in *The Oxford Research Encyclopedia of American History*, ed. Jon Butler (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780199329175.013.31> (accessed August 26, 2021).

184 Warrior, *Tribal Secrets*, 5.

185 Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xvii.

186 Dorothy Rogers, “Bonnin, Gertrude Simmons,” in *The Dictionary of Modern American Philosophers*, ed. John R. Shook (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), <https://www-oxfordreference-com.ezproxy.library.uvic.ca/view/10.1093/acref/9780199754663.001.0001/acref-9780199754663-e-116> (accessed 26 August 2021).

187 Warrior, *Tribal Secrets*, 3.

Indian Act.<sup>188</sup> These are two of the best known oppressive policies imposed under the Indian Act, but there were many others affecting band membership and access to reserves.<sup>189</sup> In the United States, practising Indigenous ceremonies remained formally banned until 1954.<sup>190</sup> Even if Indigenous intellectuals were in favour of the suppression of non-Christian ceremonies, these conditions reflected a general settler hostility to Indigenous gatherings and coordinated advocacy. Furthermore, the Great Depression, World Wars and the Korean War fall within this period. Accordingly, Indigenous literary production crashed, and most writing about Indigenous people or their concerns was by settler anthropologists and historians.<sup>191</sup> Yet, all contradictory to these features is the leap in participation by Indigenous women in writing non-fiction and leading public political action. Then in the 1920s and 1930s, the number of novels published began to rise, again beginning with works by women.<sup>192</sup>

The contrast between these difficult years and Warrior's next identified moment, 1961 – 1973, is sharp, and not just in terms of considerable associative cohesion. It is at this point that Indigenous intellectual discourse shifted from “tremendously one-sided, favouring the most moderate, cooperationist voices”<sup>193</sup> to one much less comfortable for mainstream ears. One of the most famous exemplars of the new tone is Vine Deloria, Jr.'s first book, *Custer Died for Your Sins: An Indian Manifesto* (1969).<sup>194</sup> This was also the era of the Red Power movement, when young Indigenous activists came together in legal action and civil disobedience to revitalize their

188 Canada, *An Act Further to Amend 'The Indian Act' 1895*: Chapter 35 (57-58 Victoria). Ceremony ban.

Canada, *An Act to Amend 'The Indian Act' 1927*: Chapter 32 (17 George V). Ban on soliciting legal funds for land claims without a special license.

189 *Ibid.*

190 Michael P. Guéno, “Native Americans, Law, and Religion,” in *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Religion*, ed. John Barton (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780199340378.013.140> (accessed August 26, 2021).

191 Warrior, *Tribal Secrets*, 24.

192 Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xvii.

193 Warrior, *Tribal Secrets*, 4.

194 Vine Deloria Jr., *Custer Died for Your Sins: An Indian Manifesto* (Toronto: MacMillan Company, 1969).

communities. Meanwhile, novel publication by Indigenous authors fell back again during the 1950s and 1960s.<sup>195</sup> However, the earliest hints of what would grow into the neoliberal turn were already present at the end of this period, and Warrior describes 1973 – 1994 as another time lacking associative cohesion. There is a certain irony in this because this fourth period was also when a significant number of Indigenous scholars entered the academy, and novels and short story collections by Indigenous authors were released in unprecedented numbers.<sup>196</sup>

So far, the emphasis has been on the Indigenous intellectuals rather than on the audiences they wrote for; of course, the latter were hardly irrelevant. As Craig Womack reminds us, in the nineteenth century, “we might note two facts: lots of whites spoke on behalf of Indians, and when Indians did author their own books, they had to address a white audience, since they were writing in English, and their people, for the most part, could not read them.”<sup>197</sup> While Indigenous literacy in English rose all through the twentieth century, Indigenous-authored books directed mainly to an Indigenous audience remained relatively uncommon, whether fiction or non-fiction, until the 1961 – 1973 period. The materials analyzed for this project suggest that this shift to include Indigenous readers and, at times, to centre them came somewhat later to non-fiction than fiction, at least in mainstream categories.

Although Warrior did not limit himself to Indigenous authors based in what is now called the United States, he did focus on single-authored non-fiction works. This leaves out a significant type of co-authored text, the “told-to” narrative, in which generally an Indigenous narrator’s words are recorded and transcribed by a non-Indigenous person. At first, this type of publication

195 Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xvii.

196 Penny Petrone, “Aboriginal Literature: 4. 1982 to 1996.” in *The Oxford Companion to Canadian Literature*, eds. William Toye and Eugene Benson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), <https://doi.org/10.1093/acref/9780195411676.001.0001> (accessed August 26, 2021).

Rebecca Tillett, *Contemporary Native American Literature* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), 34-66.  
197 Womack, *Red On Red*, 21.

outnumbered all others. In *First Person Plural: Aboriginal Storytelling and the Ethics of Collaborative Authorship*, for example, literary scholar Sophie McCall traces the complexities of the genre, including its historical roots. She explains, “Whereas the dually authored life story was the dominant mode of told-to narratives in the 1970s and early 1980s, publications in the 1990s included greater numbers of collectively produced Aboriginal life stories.”<sup>198</sup> While McCall refers only to life stories in this quote, the examples she considers insistently recount lives in the context of communities and nations and their histories. With Indigenous persons taking up both roles in the “told-to” collaboration in shared productions, they joined a general movement toward Indigenous intellectual sovereignty advocated by Indigenous scholars at that time. There has also been a general increase in Indigenous intellectual cooperation in the period from 1994 to the present, as reflected in such works as Weaver, Womack and Warrior’s *American Indian Literary Nationalism* and Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra’s major edited collection, *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*.<sup>199</sup>

### ***Two Possible Theoretical Approaches***

Kimberley Blaeser’s compelling essay, “Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre,” part of the 1993 anthology *Looking at the Words of Our People*,<sup>200</sup> described the challenge facing scholars seeking to criticize and interpret Indigenous literature. In the 1990s, a difficult paradox beset the task. Ideally, Blaeser argued, any theory applied should come “from within Native literature or tradition.”<sup>201</sup> It would be easy to misread her as arguing that there is no way to achieve this, as she

198 Sophie McCall, *First Person Plural: Aboriginal Storytelling and the Ethics of Collaborative Authorship* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2011), 122-123.

199 Jace Weaver, Craig S. Womack and Robert Warrior, *American Indian Literary Nationalism* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2005) and Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra, eds., *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016).

200 Jeannette C. Armstrong, coll., *Looking at the Words of Our People: First Nations’ Analysis of Literature* (Penticton: Theytus Books, 1993).

201 Blaeser, “Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre,” 234.

notes that most Indigenous people are now bi-cultural, mostly speak and write in English, and often work in forms that are drawn from mainstream culture. What Blaeser actually says however is, “The writers themselves have generally experienced both tribal and mainstream American culture and many are in physical fact mixed-bloods. Beyond this, the works themselves generally proceed from an awareness of the ‘frontier’ or border existence where cultures meet.”<sup>202</sup> A less than friendly mainstream scholar might declare if the writers are not “authentic Indians,” then there is no serious possibility of Indigenous critical theory anyway, and it would be best to return to the readily available mainstream materials. Blaeser is having none of this:

While I believe these theories, like Bakhtin’s distinction between monologue and dialogue and between linear and pictorial writing styles, have been helpful, they still have the same *modus operandi* when it comes to Native American literature. The literature is approached with an already established theory, and the implication is the worth of literature is essentially validated by its demonstrated adherence to a respected literary mode, dynamic, or style. Although the best scholars in Native studies have not applied the theories in this colonizing fashion but have employed them, the implied movement is still that of colonization: authority emanating from the mainstream critical centre to the marginalized Native texts.<sup>203</sup>

This quote is about refusing to accept the authority of mainstream critical theory based on different epistemologies and being able to accept the existence and relevance of Indigenous intellectual tradition. Blaeser emphasizes the potential for experimentation and that Indigenous texts “contain the critical contexts needed for their own interpretation” and are part of an existing intertextual conversation and commentary among themselves.<sup>204</sup>

Nearly thirty years later, the scholarly context has changed significantly. Scholars, including Brooks, Warrior, and many Indigenous historians whose works are the foundation of the case studies, have answered Blaeser’s call for an Indigenous critical theory. They are part of an

202 Blaeser, “Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre,” 234.

203 Blaeser, “Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre,” 233.

204 Blaeser, “Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre,” 237.

ongoing project to restore and fortify Indigenous intellectual traditions and to acknowledge and make visible to the mainstream its recent written production as well as the already better-known oral intellectual portions. But this does not simply sweep away the challenge of how to deal with “told-to” narratives, where the final publication is shaped and published by a non-Indigenous person. Sophie McCall uses Bakhtin’s concepts of dialogism and heteroglossia in her 2011 study of “told-to” narratives, for example. She applies these concepts to support her contention that these narratives should be understood as multiply authored and inevitably a product of an interaction between narrator, recorder, and other witnesses to the original performance. The interaction itself may be a struggle.<sup>205</sup> Among the most powerfully evocative moments in the book are McCall’s portrayal of the divergent interpretations of the meaning of the Sayisi Dene collective life narrative *Night Spirits: The Story of the Relocation of the Sayisi Dene* expressed by its named co-authors,<sup>206</sup> and Lee Maracle’s reframing of her memoir *Bobbi Lee, Indian Rebel*.<sup>207</sup> McCall presents an unequivocal challenge to the branding of “told-to” narratives “as inherently examples of textual colonization.”<sup>208</sup>

McCall is responding in part to a specific mainstream view of “the author” still based in the model of one person, usually European or of European descent, who produces and owns the books they write. This model took a severe drubbing among mainstream scholars in the middle to late twentieth century, epitomized in Roland Barthes’ famous essay “The Death of the Author.”<sup>209</sup> It makes sense then to engage with the impact of recognizing that authors are actually

205 McCall, *First Person Plural*, 39-40; 98.

206 McCall, *First Person Plural*, 122-136.

Ila Bussidor and Üstün Bilgen-Reinert, *Night Spirits: The Story of the Relocation of the Sayisi Dene* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1997).

207 McCall, *First Person Plural*, 94-99.

Lee Maracle, *Bobbi Lee, Indian Rebel* (Women’s Press: Toronto, 1990).

208 McCall, *First Person Plural*, 6.

209 Roland Barthes, “The Death of the Author,” *Aspen* 5-6 (1967): Essay 1.

people in social and historical context to seek another mainstream theorist whose works provide a new model that goes further and explores more forms of authorship. Bakhtin does just this;<sup>210</sup> he rediscovers the active listener, and then rediscovers the network of allusions made up of all spoken and written utterances in a shared intellectual tradition. But this is not new news in the context of the Indigenous intellectual tradition, as the forms of encoding already discussed show. I am chary of throwing out the wheat with the chaff on the role of mainstream theory in the context of “told-to” narratives. While I strive to follow the example of Indigenous scholars applying Indigenous critical theory and resisting to the extent possible falling back on colonial authorities, mainstream theories do provide helpful information of another type. They reveal the likelihood of omissions or additions that do not come from Indigenous thought and practice. For example, if oral footnotes are not present in the final published transcription, there is a high likelihood they were deleted during editing.<sup>211</sup> Homiletic closures that hastily explain how the narrator became a Christian suggest another type of possible editorial addition.

Still, other theories attempt to enact a non-colonial way of interpreting works published since the arrival of Europeans in the Americas. There are two in particular whose proponents and developers include both Indigenous and non-Indigenous scholars that demand consideration here: postcolonial theory and analysis and the approaches drawing on the concept of decoloniality. Opinions vary as to whether postcolonial theory is, in fact, a part of the mainstream critical centre, while participants in the intellectual applications of decoloniality firmly disavow any membership in the colonial centre.

210 Mikhail Bakhtin, *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1987), 104.

211 Ethnographers and other people with similar training or understanding of Indigenous practices preserve them. Early twentieth century editors and transcribers without such training or experience were less likely to preserve them, as in the case of William W. Canfield’s *The Legends of the Iroquois: Told By “The Cornplanter”* (New York: A. Wessels Company, 1902).

Postcolonial theory has been somewhat unfortunate in its name because regardless of the intent of its proponents, to many Indigenous scholars, its prefix suggests that colonialism is over. Linda Tuhiwai Smith's pointed descriptions of the new colonial agents in the form of a new wave of genetic prospectors and evangelical missionaries are among the most cited counters to any suggestion that "colonialism is finished business."<sup>212</sup> Proponents of postcolonial theory insist that this is a misinterpretation. Literary scholar Bill Ashcroft, whose oeuvre includes multiple books explaining and applying it, such as *On Post-Colonial Futures* and *The Empire Writes Back: Theory and Practice in Post-Colonial Literature* (with Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin), provides a consistent definition to address the "post" problem:

if we understand the post-colonial to mean the discourse of the colonized, rather than a discourse post-dating colonialism, then post-colonial analysis becomes that which examines the full range of responses to colonialism, from absolute complicity to violent rebellion and all variations in between. There is no post-colonial discourse which is not complicit in some way, and extremely little which is not oppositional, but all of it is about change in some form or other. A theory which may more faithfully engage the actual practice of post-colonial subjects in this situation is a poetics and politics of *transformation*.<sup>213</sup>

A few pages later, Ashcroft adds that postcolonial theory "is born from the struggle of colonized intellectuals to appropriate the discursive tools of imperial discourse and to interpolate their own realities and cultural activities into the global arena."<sup>214</sup>

This striking formulation sweeps together a remarkable diversity of scholars, from Edward Said and Stuart Hall to Homi K. Bhabha and Gayatri Spivak. In all fairness to them and many of their colleagues, they are explicit in their work that colonialism is not finished – hence my suggestion that, at the least, postcolonial theory is unfortunately named. Echoes of Said's classic

212 Linda Tuhiwai Smith, *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples* (London: Zed Books, 1999), 97-98.

213 Bill Ashcroft, *On Post-Colonial Futures: Transformations of a Colonial Culture* (London: Continuum, 2001), 19. Emphasis in the original.

214 Ashcroft, *On Post-Colonial Futures*, 25.

analysis of Orientalism<sup>215</sup> reverberate through examinations of the pernicious imagery of the “white man’s Indian”<sup>216</sup> and the early development of Indigenous literary theory, including Blaeser’s article cited above. Spivak’s germinal article “Can the Subaltern Speak?” revised and updated until its final form in her book *A Critique of Postcolonial Reason*<sup>217</sup> has its own extensive body of responses and rejoinders. Inevitably, one of the rejoinders is titled “Can the Subaltern be Heard?”<sup>218</sup> and argues that there is a way to overcome the limits on the subaltern’s ability to talk back to colonizers. Bhabha, who, like Spivak, is an Indian English literature specialist, is most associated with notions of colonial hybridity.<sup>219</sup> In fact, these four scholars write in English, and overall postcolonial theory arises from an Anglo-American colonial background. The linguistic homogeneity is in spite of postcolonial theory’s net, which stretches very wide to easily scoop up Indigenous scholars and writers throughout the Americas, so long as we are willing to agree that their work is primarily a response to the colonial centre. But, following Blaeser, refusing to seek authority or validation from the colonial critical centre is hardly a desideratum for an Indigenous literary criticism. It is the very definition of Indigenous criticism itself.

Thomas King spotted further issues with postcolonial theory quite apart from its imposition upon Indigenous authors like himself who had never chosen to engage with it. By starting with Europeans arriving in the Americas, several other potent effects followed, including the

215 Edward Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978).

216 Robert F. Berkhofer Jr., *The White Man’s Indian: Images of the American Indian from Columbus to the Present* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979).

217 Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, “Can the Subaltern Speak?” in *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*, eds. Cary Nelson and Lawrence Grossberg (London: Macmillan, 1988), 66-111 and Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, *A Critique of Postcolonial Reason: Toward a History of the Vanishing Present* (Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1999).

218 J. Maggio, “‘Can the Subaltern be Heard?’: Political Theory, Translation, Representation, and Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak,” *Alternatives: Social Transformation and Humane Governance* 32, no. 4 (2007): 419-443.

219 Homi K. Bhabha, “Front Lines, Border Posts,” in *Displacements: Cultural Identities in Question*, ed. Angelika Bammer (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994), 269-272.

suggestion that colonialism induced progress and improvement. “No less distressing, it also assumes that the struggle between guardian and ward is the catalyst for contemporary Native literature, providing those of us who write with method and topic. And, worst of all, the idea of post-colonial writing effectively cuts us off from our own traditions.”<sup>220</sup> Even the revised formulation of postcolonial theory does not overcome these difficulties, and King presciently states, “Post-colonial might be an excellent term to use to describe Canadian literature, but it will not do to describe Native literature.”<sup>221</sup>

If we return to Ashcroft’s description of the activities of colonial intellectuals and the European arrival start date enshrined in postcolonial discourse overall, it does indeed work well for scholars affiliated primarily to European or otherwise mainstream intellectual traditions. Affiliated by their practice, that is, they are directly taking up and working with elements from colonial cultures in the “Old World” and treating them as solely authoritative, to the exclusion of Indigenous perspectives and intellectual history. However, even if such scholars predominated among the collaborators on “told-to” narratives in the primary source corpus for the case studies, which they do not, postcolonial theory is not helpful for analyzing them. Previous analyses that assume Indigenous historical monographs are responses to colonial authorities already exist, some older, some newer, and what they share is a misunderstanding and misidentification of the narratives. Postcolonial theory is consistent with the common European demand for one truth and one story that explains everything. Rather than repeat this fault here, along with its accompanying centring of Europeans and mainstream frameworks, it is time to turn to decolonial theory.

220 Thomas King, “Godzilla vs. Post-Colonial,” in *New Contexts of Canadian Criticism*, eds. Ajay Heble, Donna Palmateer Pennee, and J.R. Struthers (Peterborough: Broadview Press, 1997), 242-243.

221 King, “Godzilla vs. Post-Colonial,” 243.

The leading theorist of decolonial theory to date is Argentinian scholar Walter D. Mignolo, building on a body of work developed by a group of scholars from the Andean region of South America, with emphasis on key concepts conceived by Aníbal Quijano.<sup>222</sup> Quijano, who passed away in 2018, took great care to differentiate *colonialism* from *coloniality*. He defines colonialism as an explicit political order produced by systemic oppression,<sup>223</sup> while coloniality is the steps taken by the colonized who have been trained in European culture to act according to this training in order to win the power and benefits normally held by colonists.<sup>224</sup> But most significant for Mignolo is Quijano's recognition of the relationship of coloniality to modernity, and his definition of the colonial matrix of power. Mignolo argues that coloniality is the darker side of modernity, and modernity is "a complex narrative whose point of origination was Europe."<sup>225</sup> This narrative recounts the presumed superiority of European culture and why it is the one true culture to be imposed upon all the world. The colonial matrix of power includes four domains that Europeans sought to control and subsequently use to reformat their colonies with the assistance of rationalizations based in religion, philosophy, and science. The domains consist of the practical matters of economic and social organization and control.<sup>226</sup> Therefore the central goal of decoloniality is "delinking from the colonial matrix of power."<sup>227</sup> This element of dealing explicitly with power and seeking to act rather than continue merely reacting to the colonial matrix of power is critical to the whole theory. Mignolo defines decoloniality as "both the

222 Walter D. Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global Futures, Decolonial Options* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2011), 8-10; 55.

223 Aníbal Quijano, "Coloniality and Modernity/Rationality," *Cultural Studies* 21, nos. 2-3 (2007), 169.

224 Quijano, "Coloniality and Modernity/Rationality," 169-170.

225 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 2.

226 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 8-11.

227 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 74.

analytic task of unveiling the logic of coloniality and the prospective task of contributing to build [sic] a world in which many worlds will coexist.”<sup>228</sup>

Explicit description and documentation of decolonial theory began in the early twentieth century, but that is not when decoloniality began. As thought and practice by scholars, it started in the fifteenth century when the non-European world began responding to European projections of power and ideas onto it.<sup>229</sup> This still sounds suspiciously like postcolonial theory in principle, with a bit more affixed to permit its application to political action. Contrasting decolonial to postcolonial then, Mignolo explains:

The decolonial originated during the Cold War... and from the experience of decolonization in the Third World and in the works of Afro and Afro-Caribbean intellectuals and activists. The point of origination of the postcolonial is the experience of decolonization of British India...<sup>230</sup>

Furthermore, Mignolo reiterates from his book, *Local Histories/Global Designs: Coloniality, Subaltern Knowledges, and Border Thinking*, that to have Orientalism, Occidentalism had to exist first, and that was invented in Latin America. Both representations of peoples and geographies enshrine problematic claims or at least ambitions “to globality, if not universality.”<sup>231</sup> Decolonial approaches explicitly avoid such claims, seeking instead to demonstrate roots in the place where the practitioner lives and works.<sup>232</sup> As a result, decoloniality has a narrow sense in terms of its application within the academy, and a larger significance in its application to activism and politics that, in turn, draws scholars into action outside of the ivory tower.<sup>233</sup> Overall, the participants in decoloniality are often, though not exclusively, the

228 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 54.

229 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 3.

230 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 55.

231 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 58.

232 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 56-57; 92.

233 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 58.

subalterns, peoples of the third (Africa) and fourth (American Indigenous) worlds, including those descended from European immigrants like Mignolo himself. On this last point, the question of whether Indigenous scholars and thinkers are decolonial thinkers themselves comes into sharp relief. Despite initially writing in *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global Futures, Decolonial Options* in a manner suggesting that Indigenous scholars, intellectuals, and leaders might not be decolonial thinkers,<sup>234</sup> this is not Mignolo's view. He shows this by his extensive engagement with Linda Tuhiwai Smith's analysis of decolonization and practice of "anthropology as a Maori, rather than studying the Maori as an anthropologist."<sup>235</sup> This should remind us of Quijano's definition of coloniality. If an Indigenous person is not to enact coloniality, then the challenge is to learn that which is genuinely useful and constructive in such venues as "western education" without slipping into merely replacing the colonizers with similar training in their former roles.

Decolonial theory has a great deal in its favour, starting with its respect for place and a refusal to accept claims that people who are not reproducing the European notion of historical development are therefore trapped in the past. As a result, it does not cut off Indigenous peoples from their own traditions and histories, and while it acknowledges that colonized peoples have suffered colonization, it does not force them back into the role of ward to a European or Euro-descended guardian. Delinking from the colonial matrix of power does not require spinning off into a vacuum, and arguably is easier for Indigenous peoples who have independent histories and traditions that do not entail coloniality. This does not mean that there were no Indigenous empires. The Aztec, Inka, and Maya immediately come to mind, and the Haudenosaunee engaged in forced incorporation of other Iroquoian communities during the desperate period of

234 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 10.

235 Mignolo, *The Darker Side of Western Modernity*, 136.

condolence raids through the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries.<sup>236</sup> Unlike European-style empire building, however, total depopulation and attempts to enforce complete cultural assimilation were not part of their systems.

There are two ways decolonial theory can be applied in the context of this project. First, it suggests a different and potentially more revealing way of reading the monographs. Many were received on first publication in effect as responses to or even acts intended to demonstrate acculturation, if not assimilation to the colonial matrix of power. Reading them as disconnected from that matrix by active choice rather than by implied failure to assimilate, and considering how it changes their meaning to see them as directed primarily to an Indigenous rather than a settler audience, provides a different perspective. Second, applying decolonial theory also points back to Blaeser's call for tribal-centred criticism and using the apparatus for reading and interpretation Indigenous texts themselves provide. I understand this to mean that Indigenous writers sign post what we need to know. The sign posts may include references to specific knowledge keepers, spirit beings, or key events or ceremonies.

### ***Indigenous Critical Theory***

The general consensus among Indigenous scholars holds that Indigenous literary criticism and/or Indigenous critical theory should arise from Indigenous thought and culture, from early calls by Blaeser, Armstrong, and LaRocque<sup>237</sup> to more recent development by Brooks, Warrior, Weaver, and Womack.<sup>238</sup> The challenging aspect of the maturation of Indigenous theoretical approaches to

236 Barbara Alice Mann, *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas* (New York: Peter Lang, 2000), 143-144.

237 Jeannette C. Armstrong, "'Editor's Note' From Looking at the Words of Our People: First Nations Analysis of Literature," in *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*, eds. Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016), 229-230; Blaeser, "Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre," 231-238; and Emma LaRocque, "Teaching Aboriginal Literature: The Discourse of Margins and Mainstreams," in *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*, eds. Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016), 61-64.

238 Lisa Brooks, "Intellectual History," in *The Oxford Handbook of American Indian History*, ed. Frederick E.

literature for this project is that, to date, most of the approaches have been based on novels, poetry, and various forms of memoir. Overlaps in approach are certainly possible, as literary theorists who have successfully applied class analysis to novels and poetry from different eras have shown. Such parallel analyses between historical monographs and other texts that fall more within the mainstream category of non-fiction are not yet as common in Indigenous scholarship, but their numbers are growing. In some cases, Indigenous authors have provided important models and interpretations of their own work in essays and reflections on their writing, reiterating in those texts the same organizational structures they use in their novels. Leslie Marmon Silko is a notable example, in part due to the way her controversial novel *Almanac of the Dead: A Novel*<sup>239</sup> challenged mainstream historical interpretations. Specific formulations of Indigenous critical theory, including greater detail, date mostly from 1999 and later, including those by the theorists whose frameworks will be considered here. These theorists have all explicitly taken up the question of Indigenous non-fiction, although only two of them, Warrior and Brooks, have written book-length studies on it. Weaver has engaged with the controversial question of whether a non-fiction work just has to be written by an Indigenous writer to count as part of an Indigenous literary tradition. I have sought to evade this difficulty by the filters I applied to select this study's primary source corpus but make no pretense of having solved it for the case of Indigenous historiography altogether.

Hoxie (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), 515-518.

Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xiv-xvi; xix-xx.

Jace Weaver, *Other Words: American Indian Literature, Law and Culture* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2001), 3-53.

Weaver, Womack and Warrior, *American Indian Literary Nationalism*.

Craig S. Womack, *Red on Red: Native Literary Separatism* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1999), 20; 26; 57; 76.

239 Leslie Marmon Silko, *Almanac of the Dead: A Novel* (New York: Penguin Books, 1991).

One of the earliest book-length applications of Indigenous critical theory is Womack's consideration of a selection of Creek (and one Cherokee) -authored texts, *Red on Red: Native Literary Separatism*. Bringing together elements including Creek oral tradition, other Creek texts, and a series of letters in what he refers to as Red English, Womack presents a potent challenge to mainstream literary theories. Contrary to some responses to his approach, Womack emphasized that his is not "the *only* way to understand Creek writing but an important one given that literatures bear some kind of relationship to communities, both writing communities and the community of the primary culture, from which they originate."<sup>240</sup> He argues that this perspective may be generalized to Indigenous authors and writing, and "assumes that there *is* such a thing as a Native perspective and that seeking it out is a worthwhile endeavor."<sup>241</sup> Countering the obvious suggestion that this assumption is an essentialist or romanticized one, Womack states that, in his view, this perspective derives from shared historical experiences and memories among peoples conscious of themselves as distinct from settler peoples.<sup>242</sup> Cognizant of the still common conflation of Indigenous traditional stories with "myths for children," he reminds the reader that oral tradition includes political critique and numerous references to other stories.<sup>243</sup> In words that echo Blaeser's above, Womack says:

If nothing else, I hope to use one story as an example of how profound literary nuances of Creek traditional narratives can be so that the next phase of work might become obvious to others: the need to examine them for the interpretive principles they provide.<sup>244</sup>

Postcolonial theory posits that colonized intellectuals take over colonial tools in order to insert themselves into the colonizer's conversation as active subjects. Decolonial theory posits

240 Womack, *Red on Red*, 4. Emphasis in the original.

241 *Ibid.* Emphasis in the original.

242 Womack, *Red on Red*, 5; 26.

243 Womack, *Red on Red*, 57.

244 Womack, *Red on Red*, 76; 95.

that the colonized reject colonial tools and the colonial matrix of power to create a world amenable to social and intellectual diversity. Jace Weaver provides a similar framing of Indigenous critical theory in the essay “In Other Words: Literature and Community.”<sup>245</sup> Specifically, Weaver contrasts Indigenous and non-Indigenous perspectives on the role of mediation in literature by considering the interpretations of Indigenous narratives by James Ruppert and David Murray:

The concern with getting rid of ‘old and isolating world views’ and ‘unbridgeable chasm[s]’ has always been more of a concern for Amer-Europeans than for Natives, who don’t view their own cultural responses as ‘old and isolating’ and who often express scant interest in bridging their worldview with that of the dominant culture.<sup>246</sup>

This draws out at least three key aspects of Indigenous critical theory in quick succession that are of special interest in the context of Indigenous history writing because they conflict with common expectations in mainstream academia. First, that Indigenous application of mainstream modes (for example: novels, ballads, or historical monographs) are examples of adaptation for Indigenous purposes, not slavish imitation.<sup>247</sup> Second, that while mediation must be present for Indigenous literature to be published, it is not necessarily the motivation for the text as such; “Native authors most often privilege the Native reader.”<sup>248</sup> Third, citing Louis Owens, that the hybridity of these works makes them subversive.<sup>249</sup> It remains for the person interpreting the Indigenous literature example to argue whether the subversion is a conscious strategy of the author or not.

245 Weaver, *Other Words*, 3-53.

246 Weaver, *Other Words*, 39.

247 Weaver, *Other Words*, 29-30.

248 Weaver, *Other Words*, 40.

249 Weaver, *Other Words*, 41.

Warrior, Womack, and Weaver venture to analyze and name the further development of a concept related to what Womack referred to as “the Native perspective” and Weaver as “the Native worldview.” Warrior refers instead to synchronicity “between writers who seemingly share little in the way of geographical, chronological, and circumstantial realities,” based on his extensive reading of their work.<sup>250</sup> This synchronicity includes “a discourse on the possibilities of a Native future,” a tendency to commentary and critique (not necessarily directed outward), and a consistent range of topics, such as presenting revised histories of treaties and imposition of colonial policies. Thinking through this expression of a shared conception between Indigenous writers of non-fiction helps make sense of the difficulties besetting attempts to separate non-fiction founded in Indigenous thought and history from non-fiction an Indigenous person simply happened to write. Mainstream non-fiction cannot be categorized according to an overarching explanation or theory expected to apply over all the world and for all time. The expectation of a single explanation may hold greater plausibility in some subjects, such as the physical sciences, than in most of what are now called “the humanities,” and until recently, it was not generally questioned. Take, for example, Albert Einstein’s general theory of relativity in physics, which can be used to explain phenomena anyone can observe with the right equipment and training.

The results of testing and applying this theory have held up under high scrutiny now for over a hundred years. In contrast, attempts to model social behaviour and the shape and results of historical events are not as stable. Social behaviour cannot be simplified in the same way as the interactions of stars and planets. Indigenous non-fiction tends to resist these mainstream categories and oppose the basic assumptions encoded into them, including those concerning Indigenous futures and the Indigenous capacity to reason. It seems that

<sup>250</sup> Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xx.

mainstream readers still find it difficult to accept that non-fiction writing that demonstrates an application of scientific reasoning and method can count as “Indigenous,” perhaps because there is not necessarily a shared definition of “scientific reasoning.” I would suggest that there is a reasoning *method* shared across the mainstream categories of “sciences” and “humanities,” based on careful observation and exploratory questions. One of Einstein’s exploratory questions during his development of the theory of general relativity was why Mercury’s orbit around the Sun wobbled over successive periods. Historians have pursued fruitful research into the questions of why and how the English Revolution in 1649 was different from the French Revolution in 1789. We can recognize the same basic method applied in Indigenous narratives explaining crucial social relationships, for example, in the Haudenosaunee account of the foundation of their league after a long period of widespread warfare and social chaos. The longest and most detailed versions detail how to curb over-ambitious leaders, conflict within and between families, and make good relations with formerly hostile neighbours. Gregory Cajete provides extensive examples of Indigenous employment of this reasoning method in *Native Science: Natural Laws of Interdependence*.<sup>251</sup> He states that “the Indigenous science paradigm”<sup>252</sup> is carried out in a participatory, holistic, and spiritual manner.<sup>253</sup> Cajete clarifies what this means in terms of carrying out experiments and in theorizing by observing:

Both Western science and Native science use research and data gathering. Over the millennia, Native people observed and experimented to understand how the world worked, and to apply what was learned. But to learn about relationship, Native people believed they had to learn through contact or direct experience rather than through abstraction.<sup>254</sup>

251 Gregory Cajete, *Native Science: Natural Laws of Interdependence* (Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000).

252 Cajete, *Native Science*, 5.

253 Cajete, *Native Science*, 13-14.

254 Cajete, *Native Science*, 44.

Seeking a metaphor to properly describe both the temporal and spatial reach of Indigenous intellectual traditions, Brooks opted for Warrior's evocative catchphrase "intellectual trade routes."<sup>255</sup> She illustrates this by briefly comparing the emergence traditions carried by the Mayan Popol Vuh and the Haudenosaunee Great Law of Peace. These powerful narratives, which have been passed down in both oral and written versions and in multiple translations, share central images and tropes as well as similar purposes in their respective nations. Her point is that Indigenous intellectuals have been, and are, engaged in an ongoing network of exchange of ideas and shared influences as well as independent development. Furthermore, the tradition of thought in these two specific cases and in other cases includes political and creative elements.<sup>256</sup> Debunking and refusing caricatures of Indigenous intellectual tradition as a type of fossil, sealed off, unchanging, and incapable of responding to changing conditions are vital aspects of Indigenous critical theory.

The foundations of the case study analyses for this project are in this theory and the important examples and guidelines provided by the Indigenous scholars whose work I have synthesized here. Although much of the discussion of form referred to Indigenous writers adapting new models from Europeans, if they are favouring an Indigenous audience, then it is probable that Indigenous narrative forms were adapted for publication as well. This possibility has been touched on by a few scholars, with far more research at first going into assessing the impact of editorial interventions, including not just introduction and annotation, but sometimes also extensive rewriting. While editorial rewrites could be well-intended efforts to improve the style and clarity of language, they could be more intrusive impositions of mainstream

255 Brooks, "Intellectual History," 516-518.

Warrior, *The People and the Word*, 181-187.

256 Brooks, "Intellectual History," 516.

interpretations presented as if the Indigenous person shared them. For example, one of the earliest “told-to” autobiographies published in northern North America is *A Narrative of the Life of Mrs. Mary Jemison* in 1824.<sup>257</sup> Captured from her white family as a child in a Shawnee-French raid, Mary Jemison (Deh-he-wä-mis) was given to two Seneca women who adopted her.<sup>258</sup> In 1823, a wealthy local living near Jemison’s home in Genesee, New York, Daniel W. Banister, took it upon himself to have her memoirs collected and published. Banister then hired a local doctor, James Everett Seaver,<sup>259</sup> to work with the publisher J.D. Bemis to complete the required interviews and rewrite Jemison’s story for printing.<sup>260</sup> Literary scholar Susan Walsh wrote a recontextualization of this autobiography in 1992, focussing on Indigenous elements and attempting “to suggest some of the places where the perspectives and agendas of subject and editor are in clearest conflict.”<sup>261</sup> Indigenous critical theory supports asking different questions about telltale pages of prefaces and introductions alongside editorial attempts at producing standardized narratives of white captivity or inevitable Indigenous loss. They are not just about the power struggle between editor/transcriber and efforts to manage reception by a “white” audience, although they are about those things too.<sup>262</sup>

### ***Methodology: How to Get There From Here***

Equipped with these theoretical tools, it is time to explain how they will be applied to the primary sources for this project. The early guidance from Barbara Wilkes on how to read traditional stories recorded by anthropologists provides tantalizing hints to inform readings of

257 James Everett Seaver, *A Narrative of the Life of Mrs. Mary Jemison* (Canandaigua: J.D. Bemis and Co., 1824).

258 James E. Seaver, *Life of Mary Jemison: Deh-he-wä-mis*, 4<sup>th</sup> Edition (New York: Miller, Orton, and Mulligan, 1856), 42; 55.

259 ancestry.com, “Dr. James Everett Seaver (1787-1827),” ancestry.com, <https://www.ancestry.com/genealogy/records/dr-james-everett-seaver-24-22cl2nm> (accessed August 15, 2022).

260 Seaver, *Life of Mary Jemison*, 16-17.

261 Susan Walsh, “‘With Them Was My Home’: Native American Autobiography and a Narrative of the Life of Mrs. Mary Jemison,” *American Literature* 64, no. 1 (1992): 51.

262 Susan Walsh, “‘With Them Was My Home’,” 52-54.

Indigenous non-fiction. Julie Cruikshank provides a helpful bridge from engaging with traditional stories directly to addressing more recently composed non-fiction narratives via her exploration of social roles and meanings of stories told by Yukon First Nations elders Mrs. Kitty Smith, Angela Sidney, and Annie Ned.<sup>263</sup> In explaining how she learned to make sense of their stories, Cruikshank notes several points relevant to written stories as much as oral ones. One of these points is easy to miss, and that is her observation that oral tradition is always new, even if it is repeated in the same words.<sup>264</sup> Then, she reiterates her interlocutors' teaching: "If I expected to learn anything, they implied, I needed to become familiar with pivotal narratives 'everybody knows' about relationships among beings who share responsibility for maintaining the social order."<sup>265</sup> This is a powerful principle, and while it comes from a very different social and cultural context from that of the primary sources, it draws out a widely shared Indigenous criterion for which stories provide the interpretive principles for the stories that cite them. In this Yukon First Nations storyteller case, Cruikshank emphasizes their demonstrated "ability to build connections where rifts might otherwise appear," contrasting this with western practices of classification based on division.<sup>266</sup> We can reasonably expect that other Indigenous storytellers will seek to recreate order in their accounts via their own classification practices.

Still considering oral narratives for the moment, it is necessary to identify the questions the interviewer provided where the original Indigenous speaker's own framing has been edited away. Cruikshank reminds us that a structured interview makes for a very different story than one that responds to open-ended priming questions or, indeed, to the project she developed and carried

263 Julie Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories: Narrative and Knowledge in the Yukon Territory* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998), xii.

264 Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories*, 40.

265 Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories*, 46.

266 Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories*, 3.

out with Mrs. Smith, Sidney, and Ned.<sup>267</sup> At one point, she reports explicitly how Mrs. Sidney defined the task she was undertaking with the stories she chose to tell and have Cruikshank transcribe.<sup>268</sup> Evidence of such purpose may be more or less available in Indigenous non-fiction. The greatest potential for an obvious clash between the Indigenous speaker's intent and that of a non-Indigenous collaborator is in the case of "told-to" narratives. In other cases, especially for late nineteenth century to early twentieth century exemplars, contradictions between the interpretive framework of the pivotal narratives and the introduction and conclusion of the text may indicate subtle contradictions.

Considering that in Indigenous historical writing, place is generally more important and specific than time in the narrative, the potential impacts on published versions may surprise us. Greg Sarris explains that an Indigenous community holds knowledge of a shared and named landscape, hence their oral traditions leave out "natural description and human motivation."<sup>269</sup> The absence of a description of the land may seem obvious, human motivation less so, except that where a person is going in the context of such stories will often provide considerable indirect information about their purpose. Taking a Northwest Métis example, if I began a story by saying Chi-Jeanne was going to *mânitow sâkihikanihk*, called in English Lac Ste. Anne, a Northwest Métis listener would know immediately that Chi-Jeanne is most likely on her way to take part in ceremony there. This will impact many aspects of her behaviour on her way, and since she is a spirit being with a knack for trouble, similar to her elder cousins Nanabush and Wisakeyachak, hijinks will likely ensue. Returning to Sarris and his discussion of features that may mark

267 Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories*, 25.

268 Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories*, 26.

269 Greg Sarris, *Keeping Slug Woman Alive: A Holistic Approach to American Indian Texts* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), 31. The Pomo are an Indigenous nation whose traditional lands are in what is currently referred to as northern California.

transcribed oral narrative, he comments, “Older Pomo narrators, like speakers from many other traditionally oral cultures, move back and forth in time and place to use the past to comment on the present and vice versa.”<sup>270</sup>

This may sound almost antithetical to producing historiography in a way that uses Indigenous forms and yet can be identified as a report or reflection on past events. However, having cast aside the assumption that Indigenous peoples did not have a conscious historical sense prior to meeting Europeans, we can also set aside such pessimistic expectations. Indigenous histories may indeed lack extensive descriptions of geography, provide only a very brief orientation, or even do precisely the opposite. In the first two cases, it is possible to take some time to look up information about the land, and to check the basics of how the Indigenous community in question typically lived and lives within that landscape. All three possibilities can tell us something important about the anticipated audience and how much knowledge they are expected to share with the original speaker or author. In a mainstream historiographic mode, whether the author includes a map or maps as part of the apparatus of the text depends on the expected familiarity of their intended audience. By contrast, human motivation is often indicated in mainstream history by its subgenre (e.g., political, military, economic, or social histories).

One aspect of Indigenous critical theory needing further discussion here is the purpose and outcome of carrying out a reading of Indigenous literature due to its immediate reflections on how to read those works. Among the earliest characterizations of the purpose and result of reading is by Sarris in *Keeping Slug Woman Alive*:

<sup>270</sup> Sarris, *Keeping Slug Woman Alive*, 99.

The task is to read American Indian written literatures in a way that establishes a dialogue between readers and the texts that works to explore their respective worlds and to expose the intermingling of the multiple voices within and between readers and what they read. The objective here is not to have complete knowledge of the text or the self as reader, nor to obtain or tell the complete story of one or the other or both, but to establish and report as clearly as possible that dialogue where the particular reader or groups of readers inform and are informed by the text(s).<sup>271</sup>

In part, Sarris is responding to a tendency still prevalent in the late twentieth century of reading Indigenous literature for closure, a “once and for all” interpretation. Today it would be unusual to encounter a scholar claiming to have produced such a reading of Indigenous literature, be it fiction or non-fiction. The former tendency to present Indigenous traditional narratives as equivalent to children’s stories is also now firmly broken.

More recently, Warrior’s approach has been “to create a historical context for Native writing and to demonstrate approaches to reading Native texts that highlight the existential and theoretical meaning those texts have in a contemporary context.”<sup>272</sup> Like Sarris, he emphasizes interaction between the text as written and subsequently as read, the processual nature of reading, and the origin of meaning in this interaction.<sup>273</sup> From there, he considers the complex interplay of language, history, genre, form, social location, and the circumstances of writers and critics of the examples of Indigenous literature for his analysis of Indigenous non-fiction.<sup>274</sup> His method resonates with the aspects of Mrs. Smith, Sidney, and Ned’s teachings highlighted above, identifying a helpful overlap in method between mainstream and Indigenous approaches. There is a place for a standard historiographic overview and summary in both. There is even a place for bibliography in its more technical sense of “a history or systematic description of books, their

271 Sarris, *Keeping Slug Woman Alive*, 130-131.

272 Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xiv.

273 *Ibid.*

274 Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xiv-xv.

authorship, printing, publication, editions, etc.”<sup>275</sup> An intriguing final aspect of Warrior’s technique for reading Indigenous non-fiction is his adoption of Rayna Green’s mode of reading “not only for what can be documented but for what the viewer/reader might see as possible in considering a Native subject.”<sup>276</sup> Reading in this way is more challenging to the expectations of a mainstream reading approach because it explicitly opens the door to informed conjecture. An ethnohistorian might identify this with “controlled speculation,”<sup>277</sup> especially because Green’s discussion delves into the reconstruction of possible motivations of Indigenous subjects otherwise left unrecorded. Here, then, is another means to shed light on the motivation for the many cases where landscape and activities may not be as forthcoming.

### ***Indigenous Narrative Genres***

The old myth versus history conundrum is no longer so salient today due in great part to developments in ethnohistory as a collection of practical tools and a reassessment of Claude Lévi-Strauss’ structuralist approach to analyzing Indigenous societies. Lévi-Strauss contributed to the reassessment of his own approach, although the fundamentals of his original ideas remain tenacious because of their commitment to strictly delineated categories. For example, in his introduction to the 1988 anthology *Rethinking History and Myth: Indigenous South American Perspectives on the Past*, Jonathan D. Hill presents an overview of this reconsideration of structuralist tools and their applicability. He carefully refutes Lévi-Strauss’ notion of cold societies that avoid historical change and therefore have myths versus hot societies that embrace change and have histories. Using an example drawn from the Arawak-

275 Angus Stevenson and Christine A. Lindberg, eds., *The New Oxford American Dictionary*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), “bibliography, n.”

276 Warrior, *The People and the Word*, xv-xvi.

Rayna Green, “Rosebuds of the Plateau,” in *Partial Recall*, ed. Lucy Lippard (New York: New Press, 1992), 46-53.

277 Frederic W. Gleach, “Controlled Speculation: Interpreting the Saga of Pocahontas and Captain John Smith,” in *Reading Beyond Words: Contexts for Native History*, eds. Jennifer S.H. Brown and Elizabeth Vibert, (Peterborough: Broadview Press, 1998), 21-42.

speaking Waurá, he presents a case of the Waurá apparently overriding their usual distinction between mythic narratives and stories or “events witnessed by human beings at some firmly fixed point in the past.”<sup>278</sup> He concludes the section by stating that “The more we read into the essays in this volume, the more apparent it becomes that the structuralist concept of ‘cold,’ mythic societies is a historically and culturally specific construct of our own society, one that neither comprehends nor does justice to the colorings of the past embodied in indigenous South American oral narrative, ritual practice, and oratory.”<sup>279</sup> This is emblematic of what a challenge it was and, to a degree, continues to be to enact in writing and speech in a non-Indigenous academic context the revised approach Hill introduces whereby “Both history and myth are modes of social consciousness through which people construct shared interpretive frameworks.” These interweaving narratives are part of an ongoing social process of remembering, interpreting, and incorporating new knowledge and experience.<sup>280</sup> Now we can make good sense of the Waurá reframing or recategorizing a given story because their stories are, in a real sense, alive and capable of changing in response to new conditions. Shifts in the social importance of information in a story may draw it further into a different mode than it started in, and all stories begin with a person who composes and recites it. Nevertheless, these changes are not arbitrary; they follow culturally-specific rules and express the constraints of real-world experience and geography.

The rules of how to mark emphasis and importance in an Indigenous narrative and how literally we should take what we read or hear are not universalized across Indigenous cultures and modes of historiographic encoding. Hill Boone describes the Aztec practice in their pictorial

278 Jonathan D. Hill, “Introduction: Myth and History,” in *Rethinking History and Myth: Indigenous South American Perspectives on the Past*, ed. Jonathan D. Hill (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1988), 4.

279 Hill, “Introduction,” 5.

280 *Ibid.*

histories of marking the date 1 Flint, “Over and over again... 1 Flint is the year the Aztecs initiate great undertakings.”<sup>281</sup> What renders this date important in its own right, as Hill-Boone explains in a footnote, is that “As one of the dates in the Aztec 52-year cycle, the year 1 Flint recurs every 52 years. On 1 Flint years, the first Aztec ruler (Acamapichtli) took office, as did the first imperial ruler (Itzcoatl)...”<sup>282</sup> Whether or not we should understand a socially and historically significant Aztec undertaking as literally beginning on 1 Flint, we definitely should realize that such a date attribution means the Aztecs consider this undertaking important, and we ought to pay close attention to what comes next. Sign-posting techniques of this sort are common. Mainstream histories still often try to do this by using dates deemed accurate and precise and then arguing why those dates are so momentous. More conservative historians express grave reservations at any suggestion that a given narrative, be it “mythical,” “historical,” or both, is somehow better because it is old. To be sure, mere age is not a guarantee of validity or truth – nor indicative of absurdity or falseness. Fortunately, the actual Indigenous criterion loosely referred to by labels such as “traditional,” the Creek discourse marker “long time ago,” or the Plains Cree phrase *kayâs âcimowina*, translated by Wheeler as “stories of long ago,” are not simple equations between value and age.<sup>283</sup> Rather, as Womack explains:

The emphasis on “long time ago,” from a traditional perspective, does not mean the medicine is outdated and no longer functional in contemporary society. “Long time ago” increases rather than diminishes the validity of the story because of the reverence for the past and extraordinary happenings of myth. It does not serve the same function as “once upon a time.” “Long ago” reminds the audience that the

281 Elizabeth Hill Boone, “Aztec Pictorial Histories: Records Without Words,” in *Writing Without Words: Alternative Literacies in Mesoamerica and the Andes*, eds. Elizabeth Hill Boone and Walter D. Mignolo (Durham: Duke University Press, 1994), 53.

282 Hill Boone, “Aztec Pictorial Histories,” 73.

283 Womack, *Red on Red*, 91.

Winona Wheeler, “Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories,” in *Walking a Tightrope: Aboriginal People and Their Representations*, eds. David T. McNab and Ute Lischke (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2005), 199.

story's origins date back to that time when the culture's most important developments took place.<sup>284</sup>

These are stories that have stood the test of time and maintained relevance *in spite* of significant change and even *because* of significant change. We can also think about the examples in Cruikshank's commentary on Yukon elders Mrs. Smith, Sidney, and Ned building connections, or Brooks' careful analysis of northeastern North American Indigenous historical writing.

Anthropologists and their collaborators have documented emic classifications of narratives within specific Indigenous cultures from at least the late nineteenth century, and in earnest under Franz Boas and the salvage paradigm since the turn of the twentieth. These divisions are based on criteria such as evidentials (i.e., what the storyteller knows by direct experience versus secondhand), type of cultural development, or direct presence or absence of Spirit Beings. Yet, from peoples as diverse as the Kwakwaka'wakw to the previously mentioned Waurá and indeed the Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis, the broad range of historical narratives includes two related types. For the Kwakwaka'wakw, these are the age of myth and the later secular age.<sup>285</sup> The Waurá reference *aunaki yaji* "real story" and *kamalajita* "mere facts," which Hill glosses further as "mythic events" as opposed to "events witnessed by human beings at some firmly fixed point in the past."<sup>286</sup> This evidentiary contrast also holds in the Kwakwaka'wakw case, but in that circumstance, we have far more detail via Boas' colleague George Hunt.

In fact, I should emphasize an important corrective that Berman provides in her discussion of Hunt's explication of Kwakwaka'wakw genres here. The model of time Hunt and Boas describe is not a linear one,<sup>287</sup> rather "both mythic and secular 'qualities' are potentially

284 Womack, *Red on Red*, 91.

285 Berman, "'Some Mysterious Means of Fortune,'" 136.

286 Hill, "Introduction," 4.

287 Berman, "'Some Mysterious Means of Fortune,'" 140.

accessible at any moment along the arrow of time; one is merely dominant, and the other muted at any given time.”<sup>288</sup> This Kwakwaka’wakw concept is somewhat mindbending, but a metaphor I have used to clarify this type of mixture is to consider it from the perspective of the land. The land has witnessed all these events and developments, but the more human-scale in time and space they become, the more blurred together they are on the land which remembers such events and developments. Under the right conditions, the Kwakwaka’wakw can access this remembering at any time, so long as they are in the right time and place. This Kwakwaka’wakw perspective cannot be presumed to be shared by all Indigenous peoples, but it is worth bearing in mind the general predominance of place over time in Indigenous historical thought.

Another nuance present in the Kwakwaka’wakw framework and its Haudenosaunee counterpart is a further subdivision within these two categories, bringing the total to four. In both cases, the subdivision contrasts times and places when there were only Spirit Beings and cosmic forces at work to when the first humans reached maturity in the “mythic age.”<sup>289</sup> They diverge on stories from the “secular age,” however, with the Kwakwaka’wakw differentiation between stories about ancestors and recountings of direct personal experience.<sup>290</sup> This is consistent with the critical importance of recited genealogies and their role in establishing and maintaining social rankings within Kwakwaka’wakw society. Haudenosaunee differentiate stories from direct experience and encoded in wampum versus those considered fictional and perhaps mundane in nature. There is no place for fiction in what Barbara Alice Mann describes as stories with a

288 Berman, “‘Some Mysterious Means of Fortune,’” 138, citing Franz Boas, *Kwakiutl Ethnography*, ed. Helene Cordere (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966), 172.

289 Berman, “‘Some Mysterious Means of Fortune,’” 136-137.  
Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 30-31.

290 Berman, “‘Some Mysterious Means of Fortune,’” 137.

cosmic focus.<sup>291</sup> This renders the Haudenosaunee classification less jarring to mainstream sensibilities, on the one hand, because there is no parallel to the Algonquian mode of storytelling centred on the mishaps of a trickster figure. On the other hand, occasional non-Indigenous efforts to find a presumed “Iroquoian trickster” have not been successful. The adventures of Nanabush and Wisakeyachak may be world-changing, or to mainstream eyes and ears, infamously hilarious and ribald. This does not mean there is no room for humour in retellings of more cosmically oriented Haudenosaunee stories, however, as evidenced by the work of writers such as Mann and Thomas King.

Summarizing in this way risks implying a blandness and general calm to maintaining and passing down these narratives that are not actually there. The presence of rules and the social impact of storytelling means that things may become at least embarrassing to a narrator who has gotten a bit too enthusiastic or highly controversial as communities struggle to assess the impact of missionaries and residential schooling. Carlson notes, “Among the Coast Salish, history is a serious matter. It continues to be used to validate social and political status, as well as personal and collective identity.”<sup>292</sup> We can reasonably extend this to any nation or community, Indigenous or not.

### ***Conclusion***

In this chapter, I have provided some important definitions, starting with history, historian, historiography, and Indigenous. Those terms set out, I then explained what “Indigenous history” is for the purposes of this study, drawing out what makes it distinct from mainstream history by outlining some of the Indigenous history encoding and transmitting methods in use before the European invasion. Connecting pre-invasion to post-invasion Indigenous historiography required

291 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 30.

292 Carlson, “Reflections on Indigenous History and Memory,” 48-49.

an introduction to the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition, when Indigenous nations added writing to their suite of existing encoding and transmitting methods. With written Indigenous history now placed into its proper context, it was time to set out the cross-cultural tools necessary for reading it effectively and respectfully, drawing from the fields of anthropology, Indigenous critical theory, and decolonial theory. This has provided the general theoretical and methodological foundations for the case studies presented in Chapters Three and Four. However, it is still necessary to introduce the Northwest Métis and the Haudenosaunee Confederacy with an overview of their epistemologies and narrative genres, and present the primary sources analyzed for this project. These are the tasks of the next chapter, “Prologue to the Case Studies.”

## **Chapter 2: Prologue to the Case Studies**

### ***Introduction***

Equipped with an overview of the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition, theories and methods for reading Indigenous history, and a grounding in the basics of Indigenous narrative genres, it is time to move from these wider matters and prepare for the case studies in Chapters Three and Four. Therefore this chapter begins with a discussion of the Northwest Métis, setting out who we are and some of our history, before sketching Northwest Métis historiography and some details of its development since the late 1960s. In the last Northwest Métis-focussed section, I apply Barbara Wilkes' technique for recognizing and learning key elements of another people's epistemology, but in reverse, in order to describe Northwest Métis epistemology for readers who are not from my nation. Next, I present the same information for the Haudenosaunee, now applying Wilkes' approach in the more usual way to discuss another people and nation than my own. Haudenosaunee readers would certainly add more detail and nuance than I am able to impart in this chapter. For the purposes of this study, my goal is to provide basic starting points to support reading and interpreting Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis history writing. One more step is needed before further narrowing the scope to the primary sources, setting out the basic plan for each case study by laying out a "Case Study Road Map" summarizing the case study structure. The map restates the key Indigenous historiographic concepts, summarizes major Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis epistemological elements, then outlines the questions I will use to guide reading and analysis of the primary sources.

Turning to the primary sources, I explain how I filtered the rich and far-reaching possibilities ranging from journalism to multimedia websites to settle on a subset of Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historical monographs. Besides many considerations familiar to mainstream scholars, such as accessibility, language, and length appropriate to the form of analysis, I also had to check that candidate texts were free of sensitive information that should not be shared outside of a ceremonial context. The final section presents a historiographic overview of the primary source corpus, followed by two tables documenting their type, length, and whether they are “told-to” or direct-authored in nature.

### ***The Northwest Métis***

There are at least four better-known terms for the Northwest Métis, and they can be found across a wide range of historical, anthropological, and legal writing: in English, Halfbreed (also spelled Half-Breed), in French Métis, and in Plains Cree, *Otipemisiwak*. Most leading scholars who study the culture, history, and politics of Northwest Métis communities use Red River Métis, Métis, or Metis firmly divested of the French accent. They have excellent reasons for their choices, based on the requirements of their specific areas of research. For the purposes of this study, I am keeping to a variant on these that, by accident, resonates with the title of Jean Teillet’s 2019 history, *The North-West is Our Mother: The Story of Louis Riel’s People, the Métis Nation*. My purpose in doing so is to hold in mind the importance of place for Métis, and how part of what holds us together is a shared geography in the Northwest of northern North America and our extensive (in both the scale and geographic senses) family relationships. Red River is just one of our most important places, even for those of us who have literally never been there, even in its present incarnation as the city of Winnipeg. My usage of this term also follows Chris Andersen’s use of the term “Métis”:

I use “Métis” to refer to the history, events, leaders, territories, language, and culture associated with the growth of the buffalo hunting and trading Métis of the northern plains, in particular during the period between the beginning of the Métis buffalo brigades in the early nineteenth century and the 1885 North West Uprising.<sup>293</sup>

I am indebted to Andersen for his careful deconstruction of racializing definitions of Northwest Métis. While not denying our “mixedness,” Andersen goes back to the specific historical evidence of our social organization and self-consciousness of being a separate collectivity from others.<sup>294</sup> “Mixedness” in the context of Northwest Métis ethnogenesis refers to the fact that many of our ancestors were born of marriages between usually European men, especially French, Scottish, and Irish, and Indigenous women, usually Anishinabeg, Cree, or Nakota. Closer to the edges of the Northwest, the origin of our First Nations maternal ancestors shifts to include Blackfoot, Dakota, Lakota, and Dene. But of course, this by itself does not a distinct community make. As Emma LaRocque observed, as the population of such mixed people grew, many of them playing distinctive socio-economic roles characterized by long-distance travel, trade, translation, and diplomacy, they began to practice endogamy.<sup>295</sup> If there is a possible single moment of Northwest Métis emergence as a people, then shifting to a preponderance of endogamy from exogamy may be it.

The assumption that this endogamy reflects some sort of rejection by the European and Indigenous communities of our earliest ancestors is still embedded in many outside accounts of Northwest Métis ethnogenesis. There is plenty of evidence that early settler elites were not welcoming of Northwest Métis individuals or other people whose heritage was known to be

293 Chris Andersen, *“Métis” Race, Recognition, and the Struggle for Indigenous Peoplehood* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014), 24.

294 Andersen, “Métis,” 198-199.

295 Emma LaRocque, “Native Identity and the Metis: Otehpayimsuak Peoples,” in *A Passion for Identity: Canadian Studies for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, 4<sup>th</sup> Edition, eds. David Taras and Beverly Raspovich (Scarborough: Nelson Thomson Learning, 2001), 284-285.

mixed. For example, Northwest Métis men who engaged with fur trade companies found that they could not advance beyond the rank of postmaster. Northwest Métis women were originally welcome in fur trade society, then rapidly marginalized during the mid to late nineteenth century. Conversely, the propensity of Indigenous communities to adopt and make relatives of newcomers is at least as well documented in both mainstream and Indigenous records. Northwest Métis periodically ran into trouble when choosing to take a different trade or diplomatic policy than their First Nations relatives. The trouble was acute in the turbulent southern fringes of the Northwest, where the United States' expansionary policies disrupted the *modus vivendi* of many First Nations whose traditional lands physically overlapped. Prior to any settler interference, First Nations managed these overlaps by a combination of avoidance and scheduling reinforced by raiding. Settler-imposed borders made it much more difficult to follow these practices for newer peoples trying to join that system.<sup>296</sup>

There is still a bit more needed to explain why “Northwest” is an important modifier here, and that is in part to recognize the communities that the Métis dispersed from Red River left to join. They did not flee at random; they travelled along lines of kinship to the furthest northwest portions of the Northwest, where their kin had a closer relationship to fish and caribou.<sup>297</sup> In fact, on a second look at the Lake Winnipeg watershed, it does not take long to discover that some Northwest Métis communities there also worked extensively with the local fish,<sup>298</sup> reminding us that the Northwest is not just the prairies and high plains. Those are the areas that have won the most mainstream attention because of dramatic bison hunts and open military conflict, but the

296 Morgan Baillargeon and Leslie Tepper, eds. *Legends of Our Times: Native Cowboy Life* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1998), 2; 4; 6.

297 Brenda MacDougall, *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010), 143-144.

298 Zoe Todd, “From a Fishy Place: Examining Canadian State Law Applied in the Daniels Decision from the Perspective of Métis Legal Orders,” *Topia* 36 (2016): 43-57.

Northwest is tied together by its major river systems, which stretch far beyond them. Already we are getting strong hints that Northwest Métis historiography will have a great deal to say about family and places.

One of the major challenges for anyone interested in Northwest Métis historiography is that we are an interconnected post-contact Indigenous people whose emergence can not be pinned to a single date, although it can be reasonably associated with specific places. The earliest places are furthest east, starting from what is now called the Sault Ste. Marie region of Ontario. Then the next places are in the northern plains and southern parklands, including southern Manitoba, Montana, and the Dakotas. Last of all in time are the places in the present-day Northwest Territories, mainly the southern Deh Cho (Mackenzie River) valley.<sup>299</sup> The moments of emergence in non-Indigenous records include such (in)famous events as the Battle of Seven Oaks<sup>300</sup> or the determined efforts of Anishinabeg leaders to include their Métis kin in Treaty 3.<sup>301</sup> Where Haudenosaunee histories extend into time immemorial, Northwest Métis histories can reach no further back than the late eighteenth century. The question remains whether that is when Northwest Métis became aware of themselves as a unique people with distinct relationships to

299 Leah Dorion, "Are the Métis a Western Canadian Phenomenon? A Case Study of the Dorion Trading Family," in *Metis Legacy*, eds. Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, (Pemmican Publications: Winnipeg, 2001), 115-117.

Martha Harroun Foster, *We Know Who We Are: Métis Identity in a Montana Community* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2006), 16-18.

Brenda MacDougall and Nicole St-Onge, "Rooted in Mobility: Metis Buffalo-Hunting Brigades," *Manitoba History* 71 (2013): 22-30.

Jean Teillet, "The Boundaries of the Métis Nation," Presentation on Métis Nation Constitutional Reform Portal, posted December 19, 2019, <http://www.metisportals.ca/cons/?p=1811> (accessed October 13, 2020), Slides 8-11 and 16-17.

Jean Teillet, *The North-West is Our Mother: The Story of Louis Riel's People, The Métis Nation* (HarperCollins Publishers Ltd.: Toronto, 2019a), Endpapers.

300 Gerhard J. Ens and Joe Sawchuk, *From New Peoples to New Nations: Aspects of Métis History and Identity from the Eighteenth to Twenty-First Centuries*, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 5-16; 83-88.

301 David T. McNab, "Hearty Co-operation and Efficient Aid: The Métis and Treaty #3," *Canadian Journal of Native Studies* III, no. 2 (1983): 131-149.

the land, to other peoples, and to one another, or when other peoples began to consistently refer to them separately from others, or perhaps both.

A second major challenge in Northwest Métis historiography is overcoming the impact of the Canadian federal government's concerted effort to declare us non-existent after 1885.<sup>302</sup> This challenge is exacerbated by the United States federal government's determination to insist that we could not possibly have relationships to the land south of the 49<sup>th</sup> parallel.<sup>303</sup> The Canadian attempt to dissolve Northwest Métis Indigenous land title is tied together with the government and Catholic church assumption that it was effectively only this title and ongoing direct relationships to First Nations that prevented Northwest Métis from being assimilated.<sup>304</sup> The United States government position was that Northwest Métis could not be separate, viable peoples unless they were from Canada and therefore, should be sent north. Otherwise, they were considered white or had to show that they were affiliated by blood relationship to a recognized tribe south of the 49<sup>th</sup> parallel. These views especially affected Northwest Métis living in the Turtle Mountain region of North Dakota, many of whom hoped to settle with the Chippewa already living on the reservation set aside there in 1882. In Canada they were declared, as Michel Hogue notes in *Métis and the Medicine Line: Creating a Border and Dividing a People*, "United States Indians." In the United States they were declared "Canadian half-breeds."<sup>305</sup> Rampant land speculation combined with the 1887 General Allotment (Dawes) Act increased American

302 Ens and Sawchuk, *From New Peoples to New Nations*, 190-216.

Andersen, "Métis," 59-90.

303 Michel Hogue, *Metis and the Medicine Line: Creating a Border and Dividing a People* (University of Regina Press: Regina, 2015), 183-225.

304 Metis Association of Alberta, Joe Sawchuk, Patricia Sawchuk, and Theresa Ferguson, *Metis Land Rights in Alberta: A Political History* (Edmonton: Metis Association of Alberta, 1981), 159-185.

Ens and Sawchuk, *From New Peoples to New Nations*, 243-255.

305 Hogue, *Metis and the Medicine Line*, 199-201.

Gregory S. Camp, "The Dispossessed: The Ojibwa and Métis of Northwest North Dakota," *North Dakota History* 69, no. 2 (2002): 62-70.

pressure to reduce the size of the reserve, incentivizing officials to declare the Northwest Métis Canadians without the right of occupation or citizenship. The result reduced the official reserve population before and during allotment.<sup>306</sup> A similar episode occurred at Fort Belknap Reservation in Montana, where Northwest Métis families were declared “foreign” and struck off the rolls by the 1921 Enrollment Commission. This was in spite of the United States Army declaring these families “American halfbreeds” during the 1860s while driving many other Northwest Métis families out.<sup>307</sup> Yet as a matter of practical experience, Northwest Métis remained distinct, though admittedly not always by choice. Language, names, material culture and the persistence of communities in place and over time contradicted settler narratives of disappearance and deficit.<sup>308</sup>

These two challenges continue to structure Northwest Métis historiography, leading to the development of five major themes:

1. Demonstration of Northwest Métis existence as unique and self-aware post-contact Indigenous peoples.
2. Arguing for the existence and persistence of Northwest Métis Indigenous rights and title.
3. Rebutting depictions of Northwest Métis as without any real cultures or histories.
4. Recovering prairie community histories from the Road Allowance era (approximately 1885 – 1950).
5. Identifying and reconstructing the legal and social factors that produced the conditions for Northwest Métis emergence as self-aware peoples.

306 Camp, “The Dispossessed,” 62; 65-70.

Hogue, *Metis and the Medicine Line*, 199-201.

307 Hogue, *Metis and the Medicine Line*, 205-207.

308 Metis Association of Alberta *et al.*, *Metis Land Rights in Alberta*, 159-185.

Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion and Darren R. Préfontaine, eds., *Métis Legacy* (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001).

These themes have persisted, but their expression has shifted as Northwest Métis have worked to revitalize their relationships with our First Nations kin and neighbours. They will reappear in the Northwest Métis case study.

We have been encouraged to expect syncretism from Northwest Métis as part of that all-consuming notion of “mixedness” in settler depictions, in which we are supposed to be an uneasy mix of “savage and civilized.” Syncretism is hardly unique to post-contact Indigenous peoples and, in fact, characterizes any situation where a community faced with new challenges adapts and adopts new ways of thinking and acting. Northwest Métis access to European-style education and full fluency in one or more European languages was (and is) a class-bound phenomenon. Through the nineteenth century, wealthier Northwest Métis families sent one or more children to take formal education out east, one of the more famous examples being the Riels of Red River. Such training could be a double-edged sword, as Northwest Métis equipped in this way were vulnerable to attempts by settlers to appropriate their words and actions for political reasons. The contest with French Canadian nationalists trying to claim Riel as a convenient Catholic-French martyr in *their* struggle with a Protestant-English government is a famous example.

The impact of different levels of education on Northwest Métis history encoding is that the methods of record-making and keeping available varied wildly over short periods. On the one hand, the Northwest Métis involved in the Red River Resistance actively sought to gather documents and record statements from participants into an archive they founded and maintained. In time, they commissioned a trusted writer to produce a narrative of the events of the Resistance from these materials. On the other hand, many Northwest Métis communities maintain a primarily oral-based historiographic tradition, one in close relationship with those of the First

Nations to whom they are related. As highly mobile people to this day, there is also a selective pressure to adopt and adapt methods of encoding history that are themselves more mobile. One expression of this is curating a small collection of potent objects such as scrip coupons, beadwork, and ceremonial regalia.

### ***Northwest Métis Epistemology***

To build a picture of Northwest Métis epistemology to share with readers from outside our nation, I started by applying the methodology I learned from Barbara Wilkes, summarized in Chapter One, in which a person begins by studying the key stories and concepts of a people. Linguist Peter Bakker's 1997 study of Northwest Métis language use through the late nineteenth into the early twentieth century documented the prevalence of admixtures of Cree verbs with French nouns in Michif dialects.<sup>309</sup> More recent research by Indigenous scholars, including works by Brenda MacDougall and Robert Alexander Innes, demonstrates the continuing salience of key Cree relational terms and associated social practices.<sup>310</sup> Anthologies including *Metis Legacy II: Michif Culture, Heritage and Folkways*<sup>311</sup> in 2006 and *Stories of Our People/Lii Zistwayr Di La Naasyoon Di Michif: A Métis Graphic Novel Anthology* in 2008<sup>312</sup> confirm the authority of Cree narrative as a guide to social behaviour and source of historical knowledge. These books are vital parts of an ongoing Northwest Métis cultural renaissance that began at the turn of the twenty-first century, when Northwest Métis elders and knowledge keepers began developing and

309 Peter Bakker, *A Language of Our Own: The Genesis of Michif, the Mixed Cree-French Language of the Canadian Métis* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), 72-76.

310 MacDougall, *One of the Family*.

Robert Alexander Innes, *Elder Brother and the Law of the People: Contemporary Kinship and Cowessess First Nation* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2013).

311 Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah M. Dorion, and Audreen Hourie, eds., *Metis Legacy II: Michif Culture, Heritage and Folkways*. (Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2006).

312 Norman Fleury, Gilbert Pelletier, Jeanne Pelletier, Joe Welsh, Norma Welsh, Janice DePeel, and Carrie Saganace, *Stories of Our People/Lii Zistwayr Di La Naasyoon Di Michif: A Métis Graphic Novel Anthology* (Regina: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2008).

implementing new educational programs in our culture and languages. They have also led important initiatives to restore proper relationships with our First Nations kin in politics, ceremony, and trade. Unfortunately, there is not sufficient space here for inserting even brief versions of Northwest Métis key stories, so I will instead provide a summary through the Cree term *wahkôtowin* and the former practice of the buffalo hunt.

Going by mainstream depictions, the Northwest Métis are defined by the buffalo hunt almost as much as the nineteenth century Resistances. Buffalo hunts were exciting and dangerous events that made for great newspaper copy and the sort of imagery enshrined in the heyday of wild west shows. The brigades of Northwest Métis families travelling with their ox-drawn carts to take part in running the buffalo herds on horseback and processing the animals their hunters were able to kill were impressive in size and organization. Firsthand accounts are readily available from contemporary newspapers and historical society periodicals. Almost every artist who toured the Northwest drew or painted episodes from the hunts, whether from life or stories they heard in the camp. *Wahkôtowin* is little known by contrast, a Cree term brought to broader scholarly attention in the context of Indigenous studies and Indigenous history by Brenda MacDougall, beginning with her 2010 monograph *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan*. In her careful unpacking of this term, MacDougall describes *wahkôtowin* as more than just a word, indeed as no less than a worldview

based on familial – especially interfamilial – connectedness, *wahkotoowin* also conveys an idea about the virtues that an individual should personify as a family member. The values critical to family relationships – such as reciprocity, mutual support, decency, and order – in turn influenced behaviours, actions, and decision-making processes that shaped all [of] a community’s economic and political interactions. *Wahkotoowin* contextualizes how relationships were intended to work with Metis society by defining and classifying relationships, prescribing patterns of behaviour between relatives and non-relatives, and linking people and communities in a large, complex web of relationships. Just as *wahkotoowin*

mediated interconnections between people, it also extended to the natural and spiritual worlds, regulating relationships between humans and non-humans, the living and the dead, and humans and the natural environment.<sup>313</sup>

The importance of *wahkôtowin* is difficult to underestimate for Northwest Métis communities. Without an ability to enter into the web of relationships First Nations had built between one another, Northwest Métis communities could not have developed or survived.

Dramatic pictures and episodic accounts of the buffalo hunt focus on swift-moving animals and daring hunters, but by themselves, these are misleading sources. In fact, entire families travelled together to participate in the buffalo hunt as a matter of safety and practicality. Safety, because the lands the people crossed to reach the buffalo herds were shared with Dakota and Blackfoot communities with whom Northwest Métis did not always have treaties, and non-Indigenous strangers could be thoroughly dangerous in their own right. Practicality, because to prepare, pack, and distribute the many products the buffalo provided was impossible in the spring and summer heat without many people contributing to the task.<sup>314</sup> Work teams were organized along family lines, and those lines included the buffalo hunt leader, his lieutenants, and the scouts.<sup>315</sup> Contrary to settler expectations, the religious and linguistic differences that helped spur such violence and division in their communities did not have as powerful an effect in Northwest Métis communities.<sup>316</sup> *Wahkôtowin* moderated these divisions via intermarriage and participation in the buffalo hunt, which in itself presented many chances to build new interconnections.

With this in mind, it should not surprise us if we observe repeated framing of Northwest Métis history in terms of webs of relationship, including efforts to replace specific individuals

313 MacDougall, *One of the Family*, 8.

314 Frederick C. Jamieson, "The Edmonton Hunt," *Alberta Historical Review* 1, no. 1 (1953): 21-23, 27-28.

315 MacDougall and St-Onge, "Rooted in Mobility," 21-32.

316 Irene M. Spry, "The Métis and Mixed-Bloods of Rupert's Land Before 1870," in *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*, eds. Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985), 95-118.

who were heroized or demonized in settler media. Nor should we be surprised if we find insistent descriptions of treaty-making and pipe smoking with representatives of other Indigenous communities, because these are part of the practice and worldview of *wahkôtowin*. The prominence of the buffalo hunt has a tricky aspect, however. Non-Indigenous intermediaries who interviewed Northwest Métis who had participated in them tend to focus their interviews on the few hours of the hunt and its immediate aftermath precisely because non-Indigenous people tend to find it of particular interest. Take, for example, Frederick C. Jamieson's article published in *Alberta Historical Review*, based on an interview with Northwest Métis elder Victoria Callihoo in 1953, "The Edmonton Hunt."<sup>317</sup> Later in 1953, Callihoo herself wrote "Early Life in Lac Ste. Anne and St. Albert in the 1870's" for the same journal, giving a more nuanced picture of the role and context of the buffalo hunt.<sup>318</sup> Therefore, it is critical to examine similar narratives gathered by Northwest Métis interviewers instead, such as *L'Espace de Louis Goulet* by Guillaume Charette.<sup>319</sup>

### ***The Haudenosaunee Confederacy***

The Haudenosaunee Confederacy, whom I usually refer to simply as Haudenosaunee here, is at once among the most known and least known Indigenous polities in the Americas. After all, they and neighbouring Iroquoian-speaking peoples have been under intense scrutiny ever since the French and English invited themselves to the Americas and began trying to missionize them. Haudenosaunee soon found that being the object of such intense newcomer interest was a mixed blessing. A quick comparison of where they and their immediate neighbours live today versus

317 Jamieson, "The Edmonton Hunt."

318 Victoria Callihoo, "Early Life in Lac Ste. Anne and in St. Albert in the 1870's," *Alberta Historical Review* 1, no. 3 (1953), 21-26.

319 Guillaume Charette, *L'Espace de Louis Goulet* (Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 1976).

when Europeans first began to arrive in more than token numbers provides a measure of how mixed this blessing was and is to this day.

To their north and east, the culturally and linguistically related Wendat Confederacy stretched roughly from the St. Lawrence River valley and the lands and waters around Lakes Erie, Ontario, and Huron. Like Haudenosaunee, they lived in an organized political alliance of peoples speaking closely related languages, pursuing a mixed economy based on farming, hunting, and trade.<sup>320</sup> From the south side of the line defined by the St. Lawrence River and the eastern end of Lake Ontario extended the lands of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, roughly bounded to their far south by the Susquehanna River and including the Finger Lakes. The Haudenosaunee Confederacy was founded by five nations, who are from east to west: Mohawk, Oneida, Onondaga, Cayuga, and Seneca. The Tuscarora Nation joined the Haudenosaunee Confederacy in 1722 nearly two hundred years after the first Europeans arrived on the St. Lawrence.<sup>321</sup> Today, although both Wendat (Wyandot in the northern United States) and Haudenosaunee still live across their original homeland, the lands and waters they specifically control are confined within a few reserves on either side of the settler-imposed international border. For Haudenosaunee in particular, a significant portion of their population were forced by the British war with the Americans from 1775 to 1783 to move onto the traditional lands of the Mississaugas along the Grand River in what is now called southwestern Ontario.<sup>322</sup>

320 John L. Steckley, *Words of the Huron* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2007), 1-2; 125-132; 168-175.

321 Elizabeth Quintana / Akwe:kon Press, "Haudenosaunee Homelands, c. 1500," in *Encyclopedia of the Haudenosaunee (Iroquois)*, eds. Bruce Elliott Johansen and Barbara Alice Mann (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2000), vii.

Barbara Alice Mann, *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas* (New York: Peter Lang, 2000), 41.

322 Six Nations of the Grand River, *Land Rights: A Global Solution for the Six Nations of the Grand River* (Ohsweken: Six Nations Lands and Resources Department, 2019), 5.

Mississaugas of the New Credit First Nation, "Mississaugas of the New Credit First Nation: Traditional Territory, Revised 2014," Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation, <http://www.newcreditfirstnation2015.com/wp-content/uploads/MNCFN-Traditional-Map.pdf> (accessed July 7, 2021).

Regardless of the challenges and changes they have experienced, the Haudenosaunee Confederacy remains connected to its deep history, including considerable pride in the Great Law of Peace, which defines their governance structure. However, the mainstream political and often also scholarly commitment to denying Haudenosaunee political sophistication and historical memory has been firm. This mainstream commitment has fuelled clashes between scholars and government bodies over important wampum belt collections (mentioned in Chapter One) and the twenty-first century controversy over claims that Haudenosaunee directly influenced the structure of the United States federal government. In the United States, the response to attempts by Indigenous scholars to acknowledge the Haudenosaunee Confederacy as one of the primary models for the United States federal government inspired considerable angst in both the academic and popular mainstream.<sup>323</sup> In Canada, the clash was represented in concrete terms on the ground by what the media christened the 1990 “Oka Crisis,” when Kanien’kehaka (Mohawks) occupied lands slated for a golf course expansion and set up blockades. Their actions were part of a Haudenosaunee historical memory of 400 years of treaty-making with English and French newcomers, including an agreement applying specifically to the lands the golf course owners intended to use made roughly 270 years ago.<sup>324</sup> Haudenosaunee historical knowledge remains deep and detailed.

The Haudenosaunee Confederacy had a robust historiographic tradition in place well before Europeans began to arrive, including, at minimum place-based encoding, wampum belts, and strong suggestions of a sky-based encoding system. The latter is not as well accepted or understood by outsiders, despite the Haudenosaunee’s ready sharing of the story of Sky Woman’s

323 Donald E. Johansen with Donald A. Grinde Jr. and Barbara A. Mann, eds., *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom* (San Jose: Clearlight Publishers, 1998).

324 Leanne Simpson and Kiera L. Ladner, eds., *This is an Honor Song: Twenty Years Since the Blockades* (Winnipeg: Arbeiter Ring Publishers, 2010), 1-2.

origins and reference to a sign in the sky at the founding of their Confederacy.<sup>325</sup> The chiefs undertook work to formally recite their wampum belt archives to outside witnesses from at least the late eighteenth century and, in time, to carry out their transcription. Such efforts were not always welcome to colonial authorities since they were bound to contribute to Haudenosaunee resistance to having their lands taken over by settlers or their culture overwritten by English or French alternatives. Nevertheless, even my random sampling of early Haudenosaunee historiographic writing suggests a stubborn optimism. If Haudenosaunee kept explaining their history and how the newcomers were braided into that history, then the newcomers would be able to reach a positive consensus and learn to live together with Haudenosaunee in a respectful manner. To present their history to the newcomers and adopt new and useful techniques and tools from them, Haudenosaunee readily pursued instruction in reading and writing in European languages and joined the eighteenth-century publishing boom as speechmakers, journalists, authors, and sometimes printers.

This all sounds quite promising, because unlike the Northwest Métis case, at minimum, nobody seems to be arguing seriously that “true” Haudenosaunee do not exist today. They had cohesive traditions before Europeans arrived, and so did not have to become a people “under fire” of the European invasion, which is not to say they did not become the Haudenosaunee Confederacy under easy conditions, far from it. It is clear from their explanation of the founding of the Great Law of Peace that they came together under profoundly difficult conditions. The challenges to pursuing an interest in Haudenosaunee historiography derived from Haudenosaunee-centred sources come instead from the difficulties of ensuring those sources are recognized, and then winning and maintaining visibility for those histories in legal, scholarly,

325 Barbara A. Mann and Jerry L. Fields, “A Sign in the Sky: Dating the League of the Haudenosaunee,” *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 21, no. 2 (1997): 105-163.

and public venues. Mainstream responses to Haudenosaunee histories repeatedly find fault with them for not agreeing on a single version of each episode and overall historical account. On that basis, practically all non-Indigenous histories fall apart because interested parties, be they amateurs, formally trained in history, or working in allied disciplines, argue about how to best present and interpret their histories constantly. And in that context, despite the excesses of “history wars,” these are often seen as evidence of healthy debate. Therefore, let us turn the tables for Indigenous histories in general, and for this section, Haudenosaunee histories specifically. When we meet evidence that there is not a single, absolutist Haudenosaunee view of every detail of their collective history and what it should mean and what it implies for their future, we will take it as evidence of healthy debate.

Haudenosaunee scholars write regularly about their Confederacy’s fierce resistance to settler interference in their self-governance and citizenship systems. For example, they document settler attempts to enforce the destruction of their government established by the Great Law of Peace in favour of the band council system defined by the Indian Act in Canada, or tribal governments organized under the Indian Reorganization Act in the United States.<sup>326</sup> This complex and shifting stance has led to a striking set of themes structuring Haudenosaunee historiography:

1. Instructing newcomers in the basics of Haudenosaunee history, politics, and geography, with a focus on the Great Law of Peace in order to facilitate treaty-making.

326 Canada, Department of Justice, *Consolidated Indian Act R.S.C. 1985, c. I-5*, Section 74: Elections of Chiefs and Band Councils.  
United States of America, United States Department of State, *The Indian Reorganization Act, June 18, 1934*, Sections 16-17.

2. Demonstrating Haudenosaunee contributions to settler communities and governments and their survival in Haudenosaunee and neighbouring lands, and that settlers have not yet upheld their treaty relationships, to the detriment of all parties concerned.
3. Documenting successful Haudenosaunee resistance to settler interference and attempts to enforce Haudenosaunee disappearance as Indigenous peoples.
4. A turn of the twenty-first century shift to exploring and developing new modes of syncretic Haudenosaunee historiography and examining how Haudenosaunee society has changed and adapted to new conditions.

Just as in the Northwest Métis case, there is a loose chronological order to these themes, but they overlap significantly depending on the origins of the person writing or narrating the historical work. For example, it is reasonable to expect that a community recently moved onto a reserve with restrictions on their movement and extensive controls delegated by outside governments to Indian agents or missionaries are more likely to focus their efforts on the first three themes. Recently, the Six Nations of the Grand River have been more interested in themes 3 and 4 as they strive to resolve unfinished business with the British Crown. We will take up these themes again with examples in the Haudenosaunee case study.

Haudenosaunee have been able to take better advantage of the settler newcomers' publishing industry centring its operations in their traditional lands, accessing printing presses and publishers' distribution networks. In line with their adaptation of elements of European-style literacy, Haudenosaunee sought schooling in New England schools and colleges, which were often founded by Protestant or Catholic interests seeking to train missionaries in the eighteenth and early nineteenth century. These early institutions were not part of the later boarding and

residential school systems, and their non-Indigenous male students often came from well-to-do families. Haudenosaunee men could and did turn the social connections they built in these schools to their advantage for later Haudenosaunee publishing and publicity. No Northwest Métis author/illustrator is comparable to Tuscarora doctor and artist David Cusick, who wrote and printed his own Haudenosaunee history in 1825, and produced a second edition in 1827. The Six Nations of the Grand River maintained a small press producing materials for sale to tourists, museums, and educational institutions beginning in the early twentieth century and continuing to the present. Despite significant difficulties in restructuring their economies based on severely curtailed access to land, waters, and markets, the Haudenosaunee, on average, appear to have maintained better access to education and publication facilities compared to the Northwest Métis.

### ***Haudenosaunee Epistemology***

At this point, it is important to note that the discussion that follows is written by a non-Haudenosaunee person applying the methodology described in the Northwest Métis epistemology section. Haudenosaunee knowledge keepers would certainly add far more detail and nuance than I am able to provide here. What I am describing is, as Barbara Wilkes explained, the basics, a place to start. In this case, the Haudenosaunee consensus on which traditional stories are critical to share when attempting to instruct outsiders is straightforward. Again and again, Haudenosaunee interlocutors and later writers recite the stories of Sky Woman and the founding of the Great Law of Peace. There are other important stories, including those recounting the origins of the Haudenosaunee clans and the deeds and teachings of Handsome Lake, and these are certainly critical for anyone to learn who wishes to develop a deeper understanding of Haudenosaunee society and thought. For the purposes of this section and this study, however, I will focus mainly on themes from the published versions of the arrival of Sky Woman on Turtle

Island and the founding of the Great Law of Peace: twoness, clear thinking, and the importance of speech. Just as in the Northwest Métis epistemology section, I will also be drawing on the findings of scholars and knowledge keepers to explain these themes.

The meaning of twoness in these stories has troubled European missionaries, in particular, from the earliest times. The level of twoness seems too simple: there is a Sky World and Turtle Island, Sky Woman and her daughter, Flint and Sapling, earth and water. Haudenosaunee scholar Deborah Doxtator explains that in the eighteenth century, Haudenosaunee clans were arranged around the balanced sides of clearing and forest.<sup>327</sup> The contrast between Sapling and Flint presented a particular puzzle to missionaries, and to this day, to many non-Indigenous people who understand that any binary must be an expression of a clash between good and evil. Sapling and Flint are twins; they are strikingly different from one another. Tempting as it may be to interpret them as an expression of good versus evil, even the simplest versions of episodes from their lives show that this binary is a poor fit. Nor can pairs more generally be taken as a contrast between a thing, person or concept that is better versus a worse counterpart.

The Wendat Nation, whose culture and language are closely related to those of Haudenosaunee nations, are of assistance here. Linguist and historian John L. Steckley has carried out a deep and ongoing investigation of the Wendat languages, including work with early Jesuit grammars and engagement with the traditional Haudenosaunee languages. In his discussion of the Wendat dualic, a prefix that adds a sense of twoness to a statement, Steckley carefully parses his observations of its semantic scope.<sup>328</sup> He reports that seventeenth century records note that the Wendat understood people to have two souls, one particularly associated

327 Deborah Doxtator, "What Happened to the Iroquois Clans? A Study of Clans in Three Nineteenth Century Rotinonhsyonni Communities" (PhD Dissertation, University of Western Ontario, 1996), 1-2.

328 Steckley, *Words of the Huron*, 15-22.

with thought, the other with strong emotions.<sup>329</sup> Steckley also observes the dualic in words that refer to dangerous uncertainty.<sup>330</sup> On the question of souls, Barbara Alice Mann states that “the non-Longhouse Iroquois of Ohio, western Pennsylvania, and West Virginia remember the older ways... every human being has two Spirits...”<sup>331</sup> She does not describe the same type of correspondence between one type of soul and mental or emotional quality that Steckley found in his Wendat materials. The broader point is not to try to force equivalencies that are not present between Haudenosaunee and Wendat notions of twoness, but to learn from what we can appreciate of their overlap.

To return to Sky Woman’s arrival and subsequent adventures on the Water World, a sense of completeness comes from the appearance of paired beings, events, and places. This sense is also layered in that the addition of Turtle Island creates a new twoness on the Water World itself that wasn't there before. There is risk and a great deal hanging in the balance as Sky Woman plummets towards the water, and the water animals and birds strive to bring earth up from below the waters. At this moment in the narrative, then, there is dangerous uncertainty, and a sense that the right sort of twoness can create safety and stability, just as Steckley suggests in his description of the dualic.

Still following Sky Woman’s story, a first hint of the importance of clear thinking and a calm mind comes through the tragedy of the loss of her daughter in childbirth and the subsequent alienation of Sapling and favouring of Flint. Her mind is clouded by grief, which understandably affects her judgement. To truly understand this, though, it may be most effective to read or listen to the early portions of the recounting of the founding of the Great Law of Peace, focussing on

329 Steckley, *Words of the Huron*, 15.

330 Steckley, *Words of the Huron*, 20.

331 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 327.

Hiawatha's journey through the loss of his family to the gifts of wampum and the condolence ceremony. By means of the condolence ceremony, he learned how to process his grief and restore the clear thinking and calm so necessary to his work in assisting the Peacemaker. In 2008, John Mohawk explained aspects of the Haudenosaunee tradition of clear thinking in his contribution to the anthology *Original Instructions: Indigenous Teachings for a Sustainable Future*:

I come from a complex tradition that acknowledges a wide range of beliefs. The fundamental thing about being Iroquois is that people will not argue about beliefs or religions. Inside our traditional religion are all kinds of different beliefs, and not everyone shares those beliefs.

But there is also in our culture a core requirement that ultimately, whatever our beliefs are, we are encouraged to maintain: the tradition of *clear thinking*. Clear thinking is the foundation of the Great Law and is an ever-recurring theme in what is known as the *Ganyodaiyo*, or Good Message of Handsome Lake. It's also discussed even in parts of our ancient tradition, the story of how the world came to be the way it is. We call this in English the Creation Story.<sup>332</sup>

The relationship Mohawk draws between having a wide range of beliefs and holding onto clear thinking as a practice and a value is echoed by other Haudenosaunee thinkers.

Finally, we come to the importance of speech. Its significance is not just that Haudenosaunee traditions have been and still are transmitted orally. Nor is it just about the highly developed formal speechmaking tradition observed by anthropologists right into the late twentieth century, which is now experiencing a new resurgence.<sup>333</sup> After all, it is quite ordinary in Haudenosaunee thought (and Indigenous traditions generally) for animals and plants to speak. They may do so more often or while humans are awake as opposed to dreaming, depending on the genre of story, but the point is that speech is a universal medium. Accounts of the founding of the Great Law of Peace reinforce the power of words, as the application of discussion and persuasive speech by

332 John Mohawk, "Clear Thinking: A Positive Solitary View of Nature," in *Original Instructions: Indigenous Teachings for a Sustainable Future*, ed. Melissa K. Nelson (Rochester: Bear and Company, 2008), 48.

333 Michael K. Foster, *From the Earth to Beyond the Sky: An Ethnographic Approach to Four Longhouse Speech Events*. National Museum of Man Mercury Series, Canadian Ethnology Service Paper No. 20 (Ottawa: National Museums of Canada, 1974).

the Peacemaker, Hiawatha, and in time more and more Haudenosaunee leaders as they join the new political alliance show. The pièce de résistance is truly the final encounter with the Onondaga leader Atotarho. He is unbeatable by any means *but* speech.

### ***Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee Narrative Genres***

On the subject of narrative genres, the Northwest Métis perspective follows the Cree system, often but not always using Cree names. Generally, the further north and west a person travels, the Northwest Métis communities they encounter are more likely to refer to *âtayôhkêwina*, “sacred stories” and *kayâs âcimowina*, “stories about long ago,” as translated by Wheeler.<sup>334</sup> Linguist Peter Bakker gathered Métis-French parallel terms for these, *les contes* and *les histoires*,<sup>335</sup> while northern Michif speakers are more likely to use the terms *âtayôhkêwina* and *lii zistwayr*.<sup>336</sup> The “sacred stories,” as we may expect, concern accounts from when Spirit Beings still openly walked in the world and animals, plants, and in time, humans could all speak to one another. The “stories about long ago” recount primarily human experience. There are Cree stories of such quality, and not exclusively *âtayôhkêwina*, which must be treated according to cultural protocols such as observing appropriate times for their recitation and performing ceremony to prepare for their telling.<sup>337</sup> In 1997, Bakker stated that these protocols were not observed among the Red River Métis, consistent with their reputation for a relatively unmodified Catholic spiritual practice. However, travelling north and west, Northwest Métis communities are more likely to follow these protocols together with a syncretic form of

334 Wheeler, “Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories,” 201-202.

335 Bakker, *A Language of Our Own*, 68.

336 Norman Fleury, Gilbert Pelletier, Jeanne Pelletier, Joe Welsh, Norma Welsh, Janice DePeel, and Carrie Saganace, *Stories of Our People/Lii Zistwayr Di La Naasyoon Di Michif: A Métis Graphic Novel Anthology* (Regina: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2008), Preface.

Norman Fleury and the Gabriel Dumont Institute, “Story,” Heritage Michif Dictionary, [http://www.metismuseum.ca/michif\\_dictionary.php](http://www.metismuseum.ca/michif_dictionary.php) (accessed August 20, 2021).

337 Wheeler, “Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories,” 202.

Catholicism or Cree spiritual practice, or both. I have observed this directly during my own travels for work, research, and at family functions.

In her discussion of elements of Haudenosaunee oral tradition, Barbara Alice Mann draws on materials recorded by C.M. Barbeau and Thomas McElwain, both of whom worked extensively with the western Seneca. Barbeau gathered additional material from the Detroit and Oklahoma Wyandots and the Wendat community at Lorette, Québec.<sup>338</sup> I reported in the previous chapter that Haudenosaunee narrators differentiated stories from direct experience and encoded in wampum versus those considered fictional and perhaps mundane in nature.<sup>339</sup> Now it is time to give their English names. The secular stories are “truly tales” and “walking tales,” the first including wampum recitals and other narratives deriving from human experience. The second Mann refers to as fictional and describes a knowledge keeper as beginning a story of this type with a phrase such as “see the man walking” or “it is as if that man were walking.” Conversely, she states that a keeper begins “truly tales” with a clear statement that the story actually happened. In the case of stories from sacred or cosmic time, Mann describes Epochal Keepings, which are cosmically oriented narratives with no place for fiction. The remaining genre is that of spirit stories, often centred on the experiences of a person whose name is not given.<sup>340</sup> Barbeau recorded from his informants that originally, spirit stories were told only in winter or on special occasions.<sup>341</sup>

338 C.M. Barbeau, *Huron and Wyandot Mythology With an Appendix Containing Earlier Published Records*, Memoir 80, No. 11 Anthropological Series, Canada Department of Mines Geological Survey (Ottawa: Government, 1915), 1-3.

Thomas McElwain, *Mythological Tales and the Allegany Seneca: A Study of Socio-Religious Context of Traditional Oral Phenomena in an Iroquois Community* (Stockholm: Almqvists and Wiskell International, 1978).

339 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 30.

340 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 30-31.

341 Barbeau, *Huron and Wyandot Mythology With an Appendix Containing Earlier Published Records*, 5-6.

In both Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee contexts, stories about real events, persons, and matters are well-defined. Whether or not a given story is allowed to be literally true in mainstream terms does not change that they are true stories in Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee contexts. This is something that may be very difficult to accept for a mainstream reader and helps drive ongoing work to check these stories against recognizable locations,<sup>342</sup> astronomical events,<sup>343</sup> and forms of geological and archaeological evidence.<sup>344</sup>

### ***A Case Study Road Map***

With these foundations set out, it is now possible to summarize the exploratory questions that will shape the case studies in Chapters Three and Four in the diagram below. After providing a high-level overview of the historiography, applying the themes already identified above and marking key dates, the study will concentrate on the selected monographs. For both the Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee cases, the case studies will trace evidence of the four key concepts of Indigenous historiography described in Chapter One. Then the case studies will move to a more detailed consideration of what expression, if any, there is of specifically Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee epistemologies. Those epistemologies may be thoroughly obfuscated if not deleted in certain publications, or they may persist even through the most hostile conditions. In order to carry out this analysis, it will be necessary to apply analytic methods from Indigenous critical theory discussed in Chapter One.

342 Virginia Steen-McIntyre, Roald Fryxell, and Harold E. Malde, "Geologic Evidence for Age of Deposits at Hueyatlaco Archaeological Site, Valsequillo, Mexico," *Quaternary Research* 16, no. 1 (1981): 1-17.

343 Barbara A. Mann and Jerry L. Fields, "A Sign in the Sky: Dating the League of the Haudenosaunee," *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 21, no. 2 (1997): 105-163.

344 Paul McNeil, L.V. Hills, B. Kooyman, and M. Shayne Tolman, "Late Pleistocene Geology and Fauna of the Wally's Beach Site (DhPg-8) Alberta, Canada," in *Archaeology on the Edge: New Perspectives from the Northern Plains*, eds. Brian Kooyman and Jane H. Kelley (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004), 79-94.

**Table 1: Overview diagram for the case studies in Chapters 3 and 4.**

Northwest Métis Case Study	Haudenosaunee Case Study
Historiographic Overview	
Key Indigenous Historiographic Concepts <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• many histories</li> <li>• both cyclic and linear time</li> <li>• agency of human and other than human beings</li> <li>• where more important than when</li> </ul>	
Epistemological Elements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• wahkôtowin</li> <li>• buffalo hunt organization</li> </ul>	Epistemological Elements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• twoness</li> <li>• clear thinking</li> <li>• importance of speech</li> </ul>
Applying Indigenous Critical Theory in Order to Trace Any: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• evidence of Indigenous historiographic concepts</li> <li>• expression of Indigenous epistemology, including identification of relevant pivotal stories</li> </ul>	
By Looking For Evidence Of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• adaptation of mainstream historiographic methods</li> <li>• privileging of the Indigenous reader</li> <li>• evidence of intellectual exchange between Indigenous writers and knowledge keepers</li> <li>• subversive form/content, strategies to manage risks raised by these</li> <li>• what a reader might see as possible for Indigenous peoples in the narrative</li> </ul>	

### ***Primary Source Selection***

Now equipped with a better sense of pre- and post-contact Indigenous historiographic methods, an initial characterization of the impact of the introduction of European methods and colonialism, and an overview of Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis peoples and philosophies, it is time to consider the corpus of primary sources for this project. As a matter of sheer practicality, it is necessary to sample the wide range of materials available, which points to a case study-based approach. By a case study, I mean the term in its second sense of “a particular instance of something used or analyzed in order to illustrate a thesis or principle,”<sup>345</sup> where the “instance” is the corpus of primary sources, and the “thesis or principle” is the question of how

<sup>345</sup> Angus Stevenson and Christine A. Lindberg, eds., *The New Oxford American Dictionary*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), “case study, n.”

Indigenous methods of recording, transmitting, and applying their histories have changed in recent history. Despite the Indigenous emphasis on place over time, there is still significant time-depth, even with a focus solely on published documents. Leaving aside the diversity of both Indigenous and settler languages, some of those nations have complex post-contact origins, and still other communities have contested claims to Indigeneity for a range of reasons. This provides a first filter for sources to be considered here: they should be drawn from an existing historiographic tradition recognized by Indigenous leaders and scholars, as well as non-Indigenous scholars. After studying such relatively uncontested examples, it will be possible to consider more controversial sources in a follow up project, equipped with a better understanding of Indigenous historiography, and therefore analyze them more effectively. Despite the proliferation of potential materials produced for and published primarily on the world wide web, these were ruled out due to issues of consistent accessibility and the lack of source attributions common to such publications.

There is still a remarkable range of materials to consider with this filter in place. Particularly in the Northeast, Indigenous authors and collaborators took part in a minor industry of pamphlet and speech publication related to land claims, missionary endeavours, direct participation in brand new area historical societies, and journalism. These briefer works in ephemeral media are more available to scholars today than they have ever been due to extensive digitization projects. There are not as many anthologies and monographs, but they are still abundant, with the numbers increasing consistently after the advent of “salvage anthropology.”

As a scholar based in Canada with a modest travel budget and reasonable reading fluency in French, Ancient Greek, and Latin, in addition to English, this narrowed the range of possible sources still further. At this time, I am unable to work with materials written in Northwest Métis

or Haudenosaunee languages. With that in mind and taking account of my own Northwest Métis background, as explained in the Introduction, I opted to focus on historiographic writing concerning the Northwest Métis. On learning about the men from Kahnawà:ke who married into Northwest Métis communities during the fur trade, I also chose to examine historiographic writing by members of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy. In both cases, there was already considerable historical writing in print by individuals with Northwest Métis or Haudenosaunee backgrounds, including famous “told-to” narratives or books composed based on information they provided as consultants. I then narrowed this selection still further to non-fiction books and pamphlets, with the latter having no less than 40 pages, all released between 1825 and 2018. There had to be enough material in each publication to permit checking for the four selected Indigenous historiographic concepts at work and maximize the likelihood that the author or transcriber would have room to identify their sources. This whittled down the quantity of possible primary sources to a reasonable number, while remaining wide enough to represent a range of perspectives among the authors/narrators.

In general, the source selection process was at most semi-random from the start because while I did my best to start with a wide net, the acquisition and deaccession policies of libraries and archives inevitably affected the visibility and availability of pamphlets and monographs. On my first reading of each new source, I traced other sources via its bibliography and the author’s references to other Indigenous histories and historians. Sometimes this meant locating a Haudenosaunee or Northwest Métis person’s name in anthropology, linguistics, or history books in order to find the other publications they contributed to or wrote. I borrowed materials from both public and academic libraries and archives, including those owned and run by Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee communities and organizations. Please note that I did *not* use

Warrior's periodization of the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition as a filter. Even if I had attempted to do so, the attempt would soon have foundered on the fact his work has not been generally adopted for cataloguing published Indigenous works.

The imposition of the settler border between Canada and the United States has had complex effects on Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee communities. Spatialized histories and writing traditions must inevitably be affected by changes in the accessibility of the places and spaces used for information encoding. The Medicine Line could make a significant difference in audience as each publication was released under different political, social, and legal conditions. Many, but far from all, were directed primarily to mainstream audiences, requiring Indigenous authors and collaborators to work in a cross-cultural context and provide more information than they might have otherwise. In time they also needed to do this for those Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis people forcibly separated from their families and communities for long periods, if not their whole childhoods.

These are all types of filters familiar to established mainstream historical techniques. I also bore in mind one more criterion I learned from Plains Cree and Northwest Métis elders. Like Margaret Kovach, I have learned from them what types of cultural knowledge are appropriate to share in the public domain, and that in the past, materials have been released that should not have been.<sup>346</sup> There are narratives, regalia, and recordings that today Indigenous communities strive to bring back home from museums or at least to arrange for appropriate treatment of these items, including access restrictions. This was an important consideration for me because a significant number of earlier publications are out of print today and little known. I would not want to bring any back to attention that need to be treated with such care and thereby ignore this protocol.

<sup>346</sup> Margaret Kovach, *Indigenous Methodologies: Characteristics, Conversations, and Contexts* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010), 46.

Luckily, this is not a significant issue for historical writing as opposed to anthropological writing, but this did not allow me to presume that if a publication was historical, I could simply use it.

The four main tests I employed to cross-check whether a given early historical publication was appropriate to share are:

- the publication did not include any detailed discussion of ceremonies or the contents of sensitive materials such as medicine bags;
- if ceremony was discussed, I sought to find a widely accepted and respected early report on it written or described by an Indigenous person whom the record shows was or is today respected and trusted to share appropriate and accurate information;
- I searched for any notes that the speaker had stopped to pray, smudge, or carry out a similar practice at the start of the story, in which case I checked to see if they had also given permission to share the whole or just specific elements of the story in print; and
- researching the origins and publication history of the item did not reveal protests by communities or Indigenous ceremonial leaders that it had been released at all.

As we should expect, the second and third items were the most difficult to manage, although much easier for Northwest Métis works because I could seek and apply advice from my elders, and cross-reference materials with the help of Winona Wheeler's 2005 article. For Haudenosaunee publications, I read the most recent historical monographs first because the authors stated directly or by example which reports and stories are appropriate to share and how to properly refer to influential Haudenosaunee ancestors and Spirit Beings. I also gathered Haudenosaunee authors' citations and recommendations of earlier historical monographs and articles, adding those items to my bibliography for this study. For both Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis articles and monographs, I followed the guidance from my elders that it is not a

problem to mention ceremony as part of what people did in the process of deciding what to do in a given situation. What would be a problem, they emphasized, was if a writer tried to recount the actual events within the ceremony. I never encountered such descriptions by any Haudenosaunee or Northwest Métis writer or collaborator in an article or monograph that I read for this project.

### ***The Primary Sources***

After applying the criteria described above, the corpus of primary sources for this project includes 62 historical monographs by Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee authors. The authors include both professional and amateur historians, activists and anthropologists, single-authors and communities. The earliest Haudenosaunee exemplar is by David Cusick, originally published in 1825. On the Northwest Métis side, the earliest published item is by Howard Adams, released in 1968. Overall, these publications fall into three broad categories:<sup>347</sup>

1. pamphlets of 40 or more pages, typically recording or responding to a significant event such as a military expedition or commemoration;
2. narrative monographs recounting events through the perspective of a single person or community; and
3. episodic monographs with one framing narrator, be it a single person or a community, who guides the reader through a series of documents and/or events to build a broader story.

From the earliest examples, many of the primary sources defied any attempt on my part to simply divide them into “told-to” and single author categories outright. Indigenous authors after 1960 stand out if they do not include materials they have transcribed from members of their community. One type of “told-to” text I did not include is the genre of transcriptions first

<sup>347</sup> The details of category, narrative type, and length are enumerated in *Table 3: Northwest Métis Historical Monographs*, 134-136, and *Table 4: Haudenosaunee Historical Monographs*, 136-138.

collected by anthropologists “in the field” and later edited and published by the same or another anthropologist or linguist. It is an important genre with many contributors whose memoirs and reports are still referenced today, such as those I made use of in this study by C.M. Barbeau<sup>348</sup> and J.N.B. Hewitt.<sup>349</sup>

The first primary sources were published after the establishment of the United States and the War of 1812. Therefore the earliest Haudenosaunee materials were composed and printed in a tumultuous era in northeastern North America that included the marginalization of Indigenous nations as military and political allies and further encroachment on their traditional lands afterward. Yet these books were written and printed, something far beyond the resources of any Northwest Métis community at that time. Arthur C. Parker is a towering figure in the 1890 – 1925 period, producing three out of five monographs of the time during his career in anthropology. Then there is a near total silence until a 1955 biography of Joseph Brant by Harvey Chalmers and Ethel B. Monture. I originally expected a peak number of monographs to fall in the 1961 to 1973 interval, but this was not borne out by the primary sources. The four Haudenosaunee items clustered into the last three years, and Howard Adams’ book has already been mentioned. For the Northwest Métis, there is an outpouring of 16 and then 18 publications in the next two periods, 1973 to 1994 and 1994 to 2018. Monographs remain steady but few in number, dropping to just two after 1973 for Haudenosaunee historiography. The pace picks up sharply after 1994, with eight of nine works dating to 2000 or later. There is a dearth of French language output, with none for the Haudenosaunee case as expected for a historically British-allied Confederacy. Yet there are only two French language items even for

348 Barbeau, *Huron and Wyandot Mythology With an Appendix Containing Earlier Published Records*.

349 J.N.B. Hewitt, “The Myth of the Earth-grasper of De’haen’hiyawa’khon,” *Bureau of American Ethnology Annual Report* (1900): 1-130.

the Northwest Métis, many of whom spoke mainly French with outsiders until well after World War One. This linguistic shift was marked on the Canadian prairies by the 1932 reorganization of the Association des Métis Alberta et les Territoires du Nord-Ouest into the Métis Association of Alberta.<sup>350</sup>

Preparatory to close reading and analysis of the primary sources, I determined their type, length, and whether they are “told-to” or direct-authored in nature. For ease of reference, the primary sources are listed in publication year order and annotated according to these features in Tables 2 and 3 at the end of this chapter.

### ***Conclusion***

Where the previous chapter tended to be somewhat abstract, this prologue has taken up more practical concerns. I introduced the Northwest Métis and the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, and applied Wilkes’ methodology to the task of describing their epistemologies and narrative genres. These descriptions are a starting point for reading and analyzing Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis histories, applied to carrying out the program summarized in the Case Study Road Map. Finally, I presented the primary source corpus, explaining its selection, including how I verified that the oldest items did not include sensitive material that should not be shared today in a general or academic context. Now it is time to turn to the case studies, beginning with the Northwest Métis.

350 Métis Nation of Alberta, “Métis in Alberta: Timeline,” Métis Nation of Alberta, <https://albertametis.com/metis-in-alberta/timeline/> (accessed August 31, 2021).

**Table 2: Northwest Métis Historical Monographs**

Item Citation	Type	# of Pages*
Adams, Howard. <i>The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867: The Roots of Separatism</i> . Montreal: Harvest House, 1968.	Monograph, Single Narrative	129
Adams, Howard. <i>Prison of Grass: Canada from the Native Point of View</i> . Toronto: New Press, 1975.	Monograph, Single Narrative	219
Goulet, Louis. <i>L'espace de Louis Goulet</i> . Winnipeg: Éditions Bois-Brûlés, 1976.	"Told To," Episodic	197
Carpenter, Jock. <i>Fifty Dollar Bride: Marie Rose Smith – A Chronicle of Métis Life in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century</i> . Sidney: Gray's Publishing, 1977.	Episodic	160
Jacknife, Albina. <i>Elizabeth Metis Settlement: A Local History</i> . Altona: Friesen Printers, 1977.	Pamphlet "Told To," Episodic	60
Daniels, Harry W. <i>We Are the New Nation: The Métis and National Native Policy</i> . Ottawa: Native Council of Canada, 1979.	Pamphlet, Single Narrative	54
Supernault, Carol, Mary Auger, Marcella Cunningham, and Velma Bellerose. <i>East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979: 40 Years of Determination</i> . Place of publication and publisher not indicated, 1979.	Pamphlet "Told To," Episodic	100
Redbird, Duke. <i>We Are Métis: A Métis View of the Development of a Native Canadian People</i> . Toronto: Ontario Métis and Non-Status Indian Association, 1980.	Pamphlet, Single Narrative	70
Charette, Guillaume. <i>Vanishing Spaces: Memoirs of Louis Goulet</i> . Translated by Ray Ellenwood. Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 1980 [2004].	Monograph "Told To," Episodic	177
Horstman, Louise and David May, eds. <i>Tired of Rambling: A History of Fishing Lake Metis Settlement</i> . Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Metis Settlement Associations, 1982.	Pamphlet "Told To," Episodic	69
Payment, Diane Paulette. <i>Batoche (1870-1910)</i> . Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 1983.	Monograph, Single Narrative	137
Dickason, Olive Patricia. <i>The Myth of the Savage and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition</i> . Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1997 [1984].	Monograph, Single Narrative	331
Gift Lake Settlement. <i>Mud Roads and Strong Backs: The History of the Métis Settlement of Gift Lake</i> . Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Métis Settlement Associations, 1984	Pamphlet "Told To," Episodic	57
Miller, Bill, ed. <i>Our Home: A History of Kikino Metis Settlement</i> . Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Metis Settlements, 1984.	Pamphlet "Told To," Episodic	50

Verbicky, Eleanor (Editor). <i>Life and Times of the Métis: A History of Caslan Métis Settlement</i> . Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Métis Settlement Associations, 1984.	Pamphlet, Episodic	50
Anderson, Dr. Anne. <i>The First Métis... A New Nation</i> . Edmonton: Uvisco Press, 1985.	Monograph and "Told To" + Document Based, Episodic	487
Payment, Diane Paulette. "The Free People – Otipemisiwak" <i>Batoche, Saskatchewan 1870-1930</i> . Ottawa: National Parks and Sites Park Service Environment Canada, 1990.	Monograph and "Told To," Single Narrative	349
Dickason, Olive Patricia. <i>Canada's First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times</i> . Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992 [2002].	Monograph, Single Narrative	506
Zeilig, Ken and Victoria Zeilig (Transcribers). <i>Ste Madeleine, Community Without a Town: Métis Elders in Interview</i> . Winnipeg: Penniman Publications, 1997.	Monograph "Told To," Episodic	203
Adams, Howard. <i>Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization</i> . Pentticon: Theytus Books, 1999.	Monograph, Single Narrative	149
McNab, David T. <i>Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario</i> . Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1999.	Monograph, Single Narrative	258
Vermette, Auguste. <i>Au temps de la Prairie: L'histoire des Métis l'ouest canadien racontée par Auguste Vermette, neveu de Louis Riel</i> . Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 2000.	Monograph "Told To," Episodic	139
Lavallée, Guy. <i>The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba: Their Life and Stories, 1920-1988</i> . Winnipeg: Self-Published, 2003.	Monograph, Single Narrative	125
Rivard, Ron and Catherine Littlejohn. <i>The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch</i> . Saskatoon: Rivard and Littlejohn, 2003.	Monograph, Single Narrative	249
Devine, Heather. <i>The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660-1900</i> . Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004.	Monograph, Single Narrative	295
Evans, Mike and Lisa Krebs with John Eagle, Bob Parris, and Heidi Standeven. <i>A Brief History of the Short Life of the Island Cache</i> . Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2004.	Monograph "Told To," Episodic	141
Campbell, Craig, Alice Boucher, Mike Evans, Emma Faichney, Howard La Corde, and Zachary Powder (Presenters). <i>Mikwākamīwi sījīsīs – Stories and Pictures from Metis Elders in Fort Mckay</i> . Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2005.	Pamphlet "Told To," Episodic	74
Chartrand, Larry N., Tricia E. Logan, and Judy D. Daniels. <i>Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools</i> . Ottawa: Aboriginal Healing Foundation, 2006.	Monograph, Single Narrative	178

Evans, Mike, Marcelle Gareau, Lisa Krebs, Leona Neilson, and Heidi Standeven. <i>What It Is To Be a Métis: The Stories and Recollections of the Elders of the Prince George Métis Elder Society</i> . Prince George: UNBC Press, 2007.	Monograph “Told To,” Episodic	260
Goulet, George and Terry Goulet. <i>The Métis in British Columbia: From Fur Trade Outposts to Colony</i> . Calgary: FabJob, Inc., 2008.	Monograph, Episodic	216
McNab, David T. <i>No Place for Fairness: Indigenous Land Rights and Policy in the Bear Island Case and Beyond</i> . Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2009.	Monograph, Single Narrative	192
Payment, Diane Paulette. <i>The Free People – Li Gens Libres: A History of the Métis Community of Batoche, Saskatchewan</i> . Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2009.	Monograph and “Told To,” Single Narrative	362
MacDougall, Brenda. <i>One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan</i> . Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010.	Monograph and “Told To,” Single Narrative	300
Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935. <i>Mark of the Métis: Traditional Knowledge and Stories of the Métis People of Northeastern Alberta</i> . Altona, MB: Friesens, 2012.	Monograph “Told To,” Single Narrative	259
Andersen, Chris. “MÉTIS” Race, Recognition, and the Struggle for Indigenous Peoplehood. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014.	Monograph, Single Narrative	227
Brissenden, Constance, ed. <i>Memories of a Metis Settlement: Eighty Years of East Prairie Metis Settlement, With Firsthand Memories, 1939 to Today</i> . Penicton: Theytus Books, 2018.	Pamphlet “Told To,” Episodic	102

\* Excludes front and back matter pages.

**Table 3: Haudenosaunee Historical Monographs**

Item Citation	Type	# of Pages*
Morgan, Lewis Henry. <i>League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois</i> . Rochester (NY): Sage and Brother Publishers, 1851.	Monograph w. “Told To” Elements	477
Johnson, Elias. <i>Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois, or Six Nations, and History of the Tuscarora Indians</i> . Lockport, N.Y.: Union Printing and Publishing Company, 1881.	Monograph, Single Narrative	226
Hale, Horatio. <i>The Iroquois Book of Rites</i> . Philadelphia: D.G. Brinton, 1883.	Monograph w. “Told To” Elements + Transcription	190
Jackson, Louis. <i>Our Cauhgnawagas in Egypt: A Narrative of What was Seen and Accomplished by the Contingent of North American Voyageurs Who Led the British Boat Expedition for the Relief of Khartoum up the Cataracts of the Nile</i> . Montreal: W. Drysdale and Co., 1885.	Pamphlet, Single Narrative	40

Canfield, William W. <i>The Legends of the Iroquois: Told By "The Corrupter."</i> New York: A. Wessels Company, 1902.	Episodic, Purported "Told To"	196
Scott, Duncan C. (Editor). <i>Traditional History of the Confederacy of the Six Nations</i> . Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada. Ottawa: Royal Society of Canada, 1911.	Monograph "Told To," Single Narrative	153
Parker, Arthur C. <i>The Code of Handsome Lake, the Seneca Prophet</i> . Albany: University of the State of New York, 1913.	Monograph and "Told To," Single Narrative	148
Parker, Arthur C. <i>The Constitution of the Five Nations</i> . Albany, N.Y.: University of the State of New York, 1916.	Monograph and "Told To," Single Narrative	155
Parker, Arthur C. <i>The Life of General Ely S. Parker: Last Grand Sachem of the Iroquois and General Grant's Military Secretary</i> . Buffalo, N.Y.: Buffalo Historical Society, 1919.	Monograph "Told To," Single Narrative	333
Parker, Arthur C. <i>The Archaeological History of New York</i> . Albany, N.Y.: University of the State of New York, 1920.	Monograph, Single Narrative	456
Parker, Arthur C. <i>An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians</i> . Researches and Transactions of the New York State Archeological Association, Volume 4, Numbers I-V. Rochester: Lewis H. Morgan Chapter of the New York State Archeological Association, 1926.	Monograph, Single Narrative	162
Chalmers, Harvey with Ethel B. Monture. <i>Joseph Brant: Mohawk</i> . East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1955.	Monograph, Single Narrative	364
Norton, John. <i>The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816</i> . Edited by Carl F. Klinck and James J. Talman. Toronto: The Champlain Society, 1970 and 2011.	Monograph, Single Narrative	358
Greene, Alma (Gah-wonh-nos-doh). <i>Forbidden Voice: Reflections of a Mohawk Indian</i> . New York: Hamlyn, 1972 [1997].	Monograph, Single Narrative	157
Montour, Enos T. <i>The Feathered U.E.L.'s: An Account of the Life and Times of Certain Canadian Native People</i> . Toronto: Division of Communication, United Church of Canada, 1973.	Pamphlet, Episodic	148
Rickard, Clinton. <i>Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard</i> . Edited by Barbara Graymont. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973.	Monograph "Told To," Single Narrative	178
Newhouse, Seth; revised by Chief Jacob Thomas. <i>The Constitution of the Confederacy by the Peace-maker</i> . Wilsonville, ON: Sandpiper Press, 1989.	Pamphlet "Told To," Single Narrative	49
Blacksnake, Governor. <i>Chainbreaker: The Revolutionary War Memoirs of Governor Blacksnake as Told to Benjamin Williams</i> . Edited by Thomas S. Abler. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989 [2005].	Monograph "Told To," Single Narrative	277
Gibson, John Arthur. <i>Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John</i>	Monograph "Told To,"	746

Arthur Gibson. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser's Manuscript. Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992.	Single Narrative	
Goodleaf, Donna H. <i>Entering the War Zone: A Mohawk Perspective on Resisting Invasions</i> . Penticton: Theytus Books Ltd., 1995.	Monograph, Single Narrative	186
Mann, Barbara Alice. <i>Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisds</i> . New York: Peter Lang, 2000.	Monograph, Single Narrative	488
Mann, Barbara Alice. <i>George Washington's War on Native America</i> . Westport (CT): Praeger, 2005. †	Monograph, Single Narrative	247
Mann, Barbara Alice. <i>The Land of the Three Miamis: A Traditional Narrative of the Iroquois in Ohio</i> . Toledo: Urban Affairs Centre Press, 2006.	Monograph, Single Narrative	116
Rice, Brian. <i>The Rotinoshomni: A Traditional Iroquoian History Through the Eyes of Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera</i> . Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 2013.	Monograph, Single Narrative	324
Monture, Rick. <i>We Share Our Matters = Teionkwakhashion tsi niionkwariho:ten: Two Centuries of Writing and Resistance at Six Nations of the Grand River</i> . Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2014.	Monograph, Single Narrative	232
Jamieson, Keith and Michelle A. Hamilton. <i>Dr. Oronhyatekha: Security, Justice, and Equality</i> . Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2016.	Monograph, Single Narrative	331
Hill, Susan M. <i>The Clay We Are Made Of: Haudenosaunee Land Tenure on the Grand River</i> . Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2017.	Monograph, Single Narrative	288

\* Excludes front and back matter pages.

† The 2008 University of Nebraska Press version of this book is a paperback printing with no revisions to the text and the same pagination.

## **Chapter 3: Northwest Métis Case Study**

### ***Introduction***

Equipped now with tools to read and analyze the monographs at hand, it is time, at last, to consider them directly, beginning with the Northwest Métis portion of the primary source corpus. Despite being post-contact in origin, Northwest Métis authors have produced almost as many monographs since 1968 as their Haudenosaunee counterparts, related in part to how paradoxically and intensely documented portions of the Northwest Métis population have been since the mid to late nineteenth century. Paradoxically documented because the last thing many of the most insistent non-Indigenous recorders wished to do was accidentally provide evidence of Northwest Métis existence as independent polities, let alone support the composition of future history writing by Northwest Métis scholars. Intensely documented via wide-scale Northwest Métis participation in the late fur trade, political organization, treaty negotiation, scrip commissions, and experiments in government-sanctioned Métis settlements. Officials from trading companies to religious orders to various levels of government produced reams of documents, and Northwest Métis communities created and assembled more modest collections of their own. Yet these records have not always been easily accessible to Northwest Métis authors, who often wish to challenge settler records or keep them in firm second place relative to the oral histories maintained in their communities. One of the effects of the shifting accessibility of records in the more Rankean, paper-based document sense is the correlated shift in visibility and role of both written and oral materials curated by extended families and, by the mid to late twentieth century, Northwest Métis educational and political organizations.

Another effect is the hologram-type visibility of stories and descriptions expressing Northwest Métis epistemological elements.

Having introduced the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition in non-fiction in the previous chapter, for this chapter, my analysis begins with an orientation to its Northwest Métis strand in a more mainstream mode. That is, I will provide a historiographic overview with a stronger emphasis on dates and change over time, adding Northwest Métis history-specific dates into the chronological framework already given. This provides a distant view in time, but in order to appreciate the five main themes of Northwest Métis historiography, we also need a distant view that examines Northwest Métis geography. Therefore, the next section traces the Northwest Métis authors through their connections to the land along with their engagement with those themes. Up to this point, the discussion includes a broader selection of materials in order to provide a sense of the matrix of Northwest Métis history writing within which the monographs developed. After this point, the focus narrows to the selected monographs, although at first still in a more mainstream mode that considers their research questions, methods, and sources. Even hewing more closely to a mainstream mode reveals tantalizing connections between authors and differences over time and distance. These are best understood via the Indigenous critical theory-based analysis that considers the details of Northwest Métis epistemology and historiographic methods. In closing the case study, I will revisit a 2001 gap analysis of Northwest Métis historiography by Leah Dorion and Darren R. Préfontaine,<sup>351</sup> in which they identified eight areas where publications were lacking or biased. On the one hand, Dorion and Préfontaine's article generally suggests a plan of action that looks like it could be assessed using a simple check for whether the eight areas have or have not been addressed. On the other hand, it turns out the

351 Leah Dorion and Darren R. Préfontaine, "Deconstructing Métis Historiography," in *Métis Legacy*, eds. Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001), 13-36.

question is not quite so simple due to issues of audience, and who figuratively or literally “holds the pen.”

“Who holds the pen” is not just a theoretical issue. Northwest Métis emerged as a people in an era when mass media publishing using European methods were firmly established in the Americas. Newspapers and broadsheets played a bigger role than ever in shaping ideas about Indigenous peoples in settler communities in northern North America. The United States experienced what the American Antiquarian Society characterizes as a “newspaper boom”<sup>352</sup> and Canada followed suit.<sup>353</sup> Historian Paul Rutherford argued in his study of the daily press in nineteenth-century Canada that it played a special role in settler mythmaking, shaping both settlers’ self-image and settlers’ views of others.<sup>354</sup> Until the late nineteenth century, Northwest Métis were primarily written about, and overall early Northwest Métis communities had found a role in the complex world of trade, travel, and diplomacy in northern North America. As the population balance between Indigenous peoples and settlers tipped further in settlers’ favour through the nineteenth century, this role was reduced, if not lost outright, in many Northwest Métis communities. The Resistance Movements of the late nineteenth century put Northwest Métis in direct conflict with the new Canadian federal government, and on the front pages of many of the era’s daily periodicals.<sup>355</sup> The coverage of the Resistances and later Louis Riel’s trial left a legacy of Northwest Métis determination to tell their side of the story. But there would be few opportunities to do so until the second half of the twentieth century.

352 American Antiquarian Society, “The Early Nineteenth-Century Newspaper Boom,” *The News Media and the Making of America, 1730 – 1865*, <https://americanantiquarian.org/earlyamericannewsmedia/exhibits/show/news-in-antebellum-america/the-newspaper-boom> (accessed February 22, 2023).

353 Paul Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority: The Daily Press in Late Nineteenth-Century Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1982), 9-35.

354 Rutherford, *A Victorian Authority*, Chapter 5, especially 167-169; 170-176.

355 In the archives of Peel’s Prairie Provinces alone, over 100 periodicals from the era covered the Resistances, including ten French and one bilingual newspaper.

In the aftermath of the 1869 and 1885 Resistance Movements, the Canadian federal government sought to prevent recurrences by distributing scrip to clear Northwest Métis land title in the Northwest. The scrip could be redeemed for land or cash to buy land, but was not assigned to lands Northwest Métis claimants already occupied, and worse yet had to be redeemed at offices distant from the assigned lands and the claimants' original homes.<sup>356</sup> Between the Canadian scrip distributions and the sanctioned social violence against Northwest Métis in their homes at Red River and later Batoche, Northwest Métis travelled across their homeland to restore their social and trade connections by the early twentieth century. That restoration included returning to Red River and Batoche.<sup>357</sup> But many more Northwest Métis had no land at all, and by the end of the Great Depression, most had lost their scrip, their land, or even both, and were reduced to living in settlements built on road allowances until circa 1950.<sup>358</sup> Under such circumstances, access to education, let alone publishing, was minimal for any Northwest Métis individual or community. By the 1950s, the hard work of Northwest Métis activists had won improved access for their communities to health care, education, and housing across the Northwest. The stage was set for a new generation of Northwest Métis to write and publish in all genres, and especially in history.

356 Frank Tough and Véronique Boisvert, "I am a Half-breed Head of a Family...': A Database Approach to Affidavits Completed by the Métis of Manitoba, ca. 1875 – 1877," in *Histoires et identités métisses: A Tribute to Gabriel Dumont*, eds. Denis Gagnon, Denis Combet, and Lise Gabourg-Diallo (Winnipeg: Presses Universitaires de Saint-Boniface, 2006), 142; 145-151; 165-166.

Frank Tough and Erin McGregor, "The Rights to the Land May be Transferred': Archival Records as Colonial Texts – A Narrative of Métis Scrip," in *Natives and Settlers Now and Then: Historical Issues and Current Perspectives on Treaties and Land Claims*, ed. Paul W. DePasquale (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2007), 39-55.

357 Diane Paulette Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres: A History of the Métis Community of Batoche, Saskatchewan* (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2009), 179-185; 188-193.

Evelyn Peters, Matthew Stock, and Adrian Werner, *Rooster Town: The History of an Urban Métis Community, 1901 – 1961* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2018): 11; 14-20.

358 Jean Teillet, *The North-West is Our Mother: The Story of Louis Riel's People, The Métis Nation* (Toronto: HarperCollins Publishers Ltd., 2019), 420-422.

### *A Distant View in Place and Theme*

Since the discussion here begins in a more mainstream mode, it may seem reasonable to begin by placing the five themes observable in Northwest Métis historiography described in Chapter One in chronological order. By chronological order, I mean the familiar mainstream sequence of years counted by the Gregorian calendar at the moment. It is not simple to do this, however, because when the theme becomes salient depends on the major topic or lens taken up by the Northwest Métis historians in their work. The task is not simple, though by no means impossible, but first, it is necessary to reproduce the five themes here again for ease of reference, as follows:

1. Demonstration of Northwest Métis existence as unique and self-aware post-contact Indigenous peoples.
2. Arguing for the existence and persistence of Northwest Métis Indigenous rights and title.
3. Rebutting depictions of Northwest Métis as without any real cultures or histories of their own.
4. Recovering prairie community histories from the Road Allowance Era (approximately 1885 – 1950).
5. Identifying and reconstructing the legal and social factors that produced the conditions for Northwest Métis emergence as self-aware peoples.

Using the lens of peoplehood, for example, the mainstream chronological line would likely begin with an exploration of Northwest Métis ethnogenesis. Europeans did not seek to encourage the development of new peoples, not when they were focussed on the fur trade, nor later when actively engaging in settler colonialism. Hence historiography on this theme asks how and why Northwest Métis emerged and remained distinct. Then this line could move on to a combination

of demonstrating Northwest Métis self-awareness as a people, including their production of a distinct culture as reflected in artifacts, oral tradition, and written works. Exploring evidence of Northwest Métis culture leads smoothly to the Road Allowance Era and identifying communities otherwise hidden by poverty and removal, and then to the matter of Northwest Métis Indigenous rights and title. On balance, this sequence would be logical from an outsider perspective, but for an insider such as a Northwest Métis historian, examinations of ethnogenesis are more likely to be last. For an insider, Northwest Métis ethnogenesis tends to be taken, if not for granted, then as something quite ordinary. Settler concerns with ethnogenesis have, on average, been less relaxed due to a strong tendency to conflate difference with not just conflict, but also some level of near irretrievable social breakdown. This is certainly an understandable response to recent European history, even if it is not necessarily helpful for making sense of developments elsewhere among very different peoples.

On further examination, which themes have predominated in Northwest Métis historiography reflects a contradictory dynamic related to the ability of Northwest Métis to maintain or re-establish socio-economic cohesion in specific places, as Warrior's periodization (discussed in Chapter One) would lead us to expect. Northwest Métis could resist demands for variations of the "dying race" and "Riel rebellion" stories, opting to share different and more nuanced narratives. To better support the discussion of the themes, it is time now to follow the trail of places to which these works have a relationship in terms of where their publisher was based. The traditional lands of the Northwest Métis are extensive; however, based on my analysis of the broader corpus of documents I examined for this study as well as the historical monographs, it becomes clear there are currently four main sites of Northwest Métis intellectual and archival production. These are Winnipeg-St. Boniface, Regina, Saskatoon, and Edmonton. Besides having

large and deeply rooted Northwest Métis communities, each of these cities is home to important Northwest Métis-founded and -managed organizations engaged in historical research and publishing, each with a different emphasis.

The question of who gets to control the narrative of Northwest Métis history has plagued Northwest Métis historians from at least the turn of the nineteenth century, beginning at the easternmost intellectual locus, St. Boniface-Winnipeg. L'Union Nationale Métisse and its important archival project feeding into the eventual book *Histoire de la Nation Métisse Dans L'Ouest Canadien* in 1935 was and is based there. Yet, to publish the manuscript, L'Union Nationale Métisse had to work with a company in Montréal. By the late twentieth century, Northwest Métis in Manitoba had made important changes to their publishing options. Community leaders and activists who developed their organizational and fundraising skills through nearly twenty years of work to improve housing access for Northwest Métis in Manitoba formally incorporated the Manitoba Métis Federation (MMF) in 1967.<sup>359</sup> Just five years later, University of Manitoba professor Bruce Sealey founded the Manitoba Métis Federation Press (MMFP) and served as its main contact and business manager in its early years. MMF staffer Émile Pelletier joined as an editor for the MMFP and its French section, Éditions Bois-Brûlés,<sup>360</sup> until his sudden death in 1979. He also carried out historical and sociological research for the MMF published through the MMFP, including *Social History of the Manitoba Metis* and *The Exploitation of Metis Lands*.<sup>361</sup> After Pelletier's death, the MMFP was transformed into the non-

359 Lawrence J. Barkwell, *The Early History of the Manitoba Métis Federation* (Winnipeg: Louis Riel Institute, 2014), 3; 31.

360 Émile Pelletier, "A Glimpse of the Manitoba Métis Federation," in *The Other Natives, The – Les Métis: Volume Two – Tome Deux, 1885 – 1978*, eds. Antoine S. Lussier and D. Bruce Sealey (Winnipeg: Manitoba Métis Federation Press and Éditions Bois-Brûlés, 1978), 163-164.

Lawrence J. Barkwell, *The Early History of the Manitoba Métis Federation* (Winnipeg: Louis Riel Institute, 2014), 3; 31.

361 Émile Pelletier, *A Social History of the Manitoba Metis: The Development and Loss of Aboriginal Rights* (Winnipeg: Métis Federation Press, 1974).

profit organization Pemmican Publications, which continues to publish Northwest Métis authored books.<sup>362</sup> In 1985, the MMF founded the Louis Riel Institute (LRI) to support ongoing education and historical research, including providing a home and organized access to archival materials and a reference library.<sup>363</sup> Until the early 2000s, the majority of Pemmican Press publications dealt with arguments for Northwest Métis uniqueness and the persistence of Northwest Métis rights and title due to the MMF-led long-running land claims case that began litigation in 1981. Today the proportion of linguistic and material culture publications is growing.

Complementing the Pemmican Publication releases is a still small but growing number of academic books published through the University of Manitoba Press by Northwest Métis scholars completing graduate studies at both local universities and the University of Ottawa. The role of the University of Manitoba Press may be somewhat constrained by the renewed politicization of the duty to consult with Northwest Métis in Manitoba due to their 2013 Supreme Court of Canada victory in their land claims case against Canada.<sup>364</sup> This is indeed the same case that began in 1981.

The Gabriel Dumont Institute (GDI) is a joint project between Northwest Métis and non-Status Indians in Saskatchewan, founded in 1980, eventually establishing offices and associated archives and libraries in both Regina and Saskatoon. Primarily created for educational and cultural purposes, the GDI has little, if any, direct relationship to land claims

Émile Pelletier, *The Exploitation of Métis Land* (Winnipeg: Manitoba Métis Federation Press, 1975).

362 Pemmican Publications, “About Us,” Pemmican Publications, <http://pemmican.websites.ca/About-Pemmican-Publications.page> (accessed December 30, 2021).

363 Louis Riel Institute, “Research, Archives, and Special Collections,” Louis Riel Institute, <https://www.louisrielinstitute.ca/research-archives> (accessed December 30, 2021).

Manitoba Métis Federation, “Louis Riel Institute,” Manitoba Métis Federation, <https://www.mmf.mb.ca/louis-riel-institute> (accessed December 0, 2021).

364 McLachlin, Beverley *et al.*, “Manitoba Metis Federation Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General) – SCC Cases,” Supreme Court of Canada, <https://decisions.scc-csc.ca/scc-csc/scc-csc/en/item/12888/index.do> (accessed January 30, 2022).

litigation. Its first publications include the *Journal of Indigenous Studies* and a range of books dealing with history, material culture, and language from the late 1980s.<sup>365</sup> Since road allowance communities developed primarily in Saskatchewan and eastern central and northern Alberta, the GDI has maintained a special interest in documenting their histories. Many of these materials are provided electronically through the GDI's Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture.<sup>366</sup> The authors and researchers associated with the GDI have been the leaders in publishing Northwest Métis historiography and demonstrating Northwest Métis existence and self-awareness, and rebutting claims that there is no distinct Northwest Métis culture. On its side, the GDI has taken steps to keep important histories in print. For example, it is now the publisher and distributor of *The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch*, following its original release in 2003.

Although the Métis Association of Alberta originally printed and distributed land claims focussed research, by 1991, when it became the Métis Nation of Alberta, this aspect of its operations was discontinued. Many Northwest Métis scholars carried out historical research in co-projects with the University of Alberta, leading to numerous theses and dissertations later transformed into books and the Métis Archival Project Research Lab. One of the effects of such direct university influence is that Northwest Métis scholars are, arguably, more likely to research and deal with questions of ethnogenesis, cultural distinctiveness, and continuity since those are more mainstream-oriented questions and universities are not Northwest Métis-run organizations. Prior to the 1990s, self-publishing by Northwest Métis authors with provincial and industrial grant assistance and the Alberta Metis settlements was most common. Although there are major

365 Gabriel Dumont Institute of Native Studies and Applied Research, "History," Gabriel Dumont Institute of Native Studies and Applied Research, <https://gdins.org/about/overview/history> (accessed December 30, 2021).

366 Gabriel Dumont Institute, Gabriel Dumont Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture, <http://www.metismuseum.ca/> (accessed December 18, 2021).

urban Northwest Métis communities in Alberta, including Edmonton and its rival Calgary, Edmonton remains the administrative hub for Northwest Métis in that province. In 2010 the Métis Nation of Alberta added to the Northwest Métis offices based there by establishing the Rupertsland Institute. The Rupertsland Institute's mandate includes performing Northwest Métis focused research and supporting the growth of such research at other institutions.<sup>367</sup>

There is still no initiative analogous to the GDI or LRI in Alberta. This reflects the impact of the long, slow recovery of the Alberta communities from the Great Depression, which led to both the creation of the Alberta Métis Settlements and a highly disruptive provincial attempt to relocate the Northwest Métis population of southern Alberta north. More positively, it also reflects the fact that most of the Northwest Métis population in Alberta is connected to the Regina-Saskatoon nexus via their shared location within the Saskatchewan River watershed. Overall, Edmonton is developing into a centre of publishing and research on Northwest Métis geography by Northwest Métis scholars, drawing in work on communities in northeast British Columbia and the Northwest Territories as well.

### ***A Distant View in Time Part One: 250 Years of Emergence***

As already noted, a conservative estimate of when Northwest Métis histories begin is the late eighteenth century, which falls within the first period of the recent written Indigenous intellectual tradition. Although Northwest Métis were certainly active and visible as peoples to settlers from at least the early nineteenth century, at first, they were only published *about* (if any publication mentioned them at all). Various Europeans and Americans published travel diaries describing Northwest Métis guides, packers, and farmers whom they found picturesque at best, shocking at worst.<sup>368</sup> By the mid to late nineteenth century, it was not uncommon to read about Northwest

<sup>367</sup> Rupertsland Institute, *Strategic Plan 2022 – 2027* (Edmonton: Rupertsland Institute, 2022), 2; 11.

<sup>368</sup> Two famous examples include: James Carnegie Southesk, *Saskatchewan and the Rocky Mountains: A Diary*

Métis in local prairie newspapers,<sup>369</sup> larger newspapers in eastern Canada, and the records of various fur trade companies. Not until just before World War II do the earliest “told-to” articles and publications featuring Northwest Métis collaborators appear, albeit sporadically. Among the very earliest is *The Last Buffalo Hunter*, first published in 1939 by Mary Weekes and based on a series of interviews with Norbert Welsh in late 1931.<sup>370</sup> *The Last Buffalo Hunter* is early, but unusual in its length and production as a book. More common are journal and magazine articles recounting specific episodes of Northwest Métis life, such as Victoria Callihoo’s account of the spring bison hunts based out of Edmonton, published by Frederick C. Jamieson in the *Alberta Historical Review* in 1953.<sup>371</sup> Therefore Northwest Métis monographs begin as a phenomenon of the fourth period of the recent written Indigenous tradition when authors take more challenging stances and participate in fewer “told-to” writing projects.

Nevertheless, there is a powerful and important exception here, and that is *Histoire de la Nation Métisse Dans L’Ouest Canadien*,<sup>372</sup> written by Auguste-Henri de Trémaudan by commission of L’Union Nationale Métisse du Saint-Joseph du Manitoba (L’Union Nationale Métisse). The book was originally published by Éditions Albert Lévesque in 1935 in French, but it was not translated into English until 1982 by Elizabeth Maguet for MMF subsidiary Pemmican Publications.<sup>373</sup> De Trémaudan was well-known for his respect for and friendship

*and Narrative of Travel, Sport, and Adventure Through the Hudson’s Bay Company’s Territories in 1859 and 1869* (Toronto: J. Campbell, 1875) and

Henry Youle Hind, *Narrative of the Canadian Red River Exploring Expedition of 1857, and of the Assiniboine and Saskatchewan Exploring Expedition of 1858* (London: Longman, Green, Longman and Roberts, 1860).

369 For example, see the back issues of *The Edmonton Bulletin* or *The Nor’-Wester* (Winnipeg).

370 Mary Weekes, *The Last Buffalo Hunter* (Saskatoon: Fifth House, 1939 [1994]). The original edition was published with Thomas Nelson and Sons, New York and Toronto.

371 Frederick C. Jamieson “The Edmonton Hunt.” *Alberta Historical Review* 1, no. 1 (1953): 21-33.

372 A.H. de Trémaudan, *Histoire de la Nation Métisse Dans L’Ouest Canadien* (Montréal: Éditions Albert Lévesque, 1935).

373 A.H. de Trémaudan, *Hold High Your Heads (History of the Métis Nation in Western Canada)*, trans. Elizabeth Maguet (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 1982).

with the Northwest Métis community, both within that community and among Canadian historians. L'Union Nationale Métisse included survivors of the critical events of 1869 – 1871 and 1885. The organization set out to collect written documents and then oral testimony to present a Northwest Métis perspective on those events. This broke an apparent early twentieth century taboo in that an Indigenous organization sought to produce a history monograph independent of the control of a Christian church or settler government body, and to challenge settler narratives head-on. The result was entanglement in an ongoing and acrimonious public debate, including considerable participation by Northwest Métis historian Guillaume Charette and the Oblate A.G. Morice.<sup>374</sup>

This situation had changed completely within a mere twenty years, as the reverberations of the growing Red Power movement spread from the United States to Canada in the early 1970s.<sup>375</sup> The United States federal government pursued a post-World War II policy of unilaterally ending recognition of Native American tribes, ironically reinvigorating Indigenous resistance to assimilation and catalyzing an ongoing renaissance of Indigenous cultures.<sup>376</sup> The Canadian federal government pursued a more piecemeal strategy of enforced enfranchisement of targeted “Indian bands” and specific individuals registered under the Indian Act. Then Canada’s federal government released the “Statement of the Government of Canada on Indian Policy, 1969,” better known as “the White Paper,” summarizing its intent to follow the American example of unilaterally ending treaty and other legal relationships with Indigenous peoples in Canada.<sup>377</sup> As should have surprised no one, this had a similar effect to the American

374 A.H. de Trémaudan, *Hold High Your Heads*, xviii-xxii.

375 Deborah Simmons, “In Tribute to Howard Adams,” *Political Economy* 68 (2002), 8-10.

Maria Campbell, *Halfbreed* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1973 [2019]): 182-189; 191-194.

376 Gregory S. Camp, “The Dispossessed: The Ojibwa and Métis of Northwest North Dakota,” *North Dakota History* 69, no. 2 (2002): 76-77.

377 Canada, Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, *Statement of the Government of Canada on*

policy, leaving no Indigenous community untouched, including those of the Northwest Métis.<sup>378</sup> But like other Indigenous peoples, the Northwest Métis had not merely been waiting for such a catalyst.

Similar to their First Nations kin, Northwest Métis had been engaging in renewed political organizing to deal with economic, social, and political problems. Indigenous communities had not experienced a recovery like that of their non-Indigenous counterparts from the impacts of the Great Depression and the two World Wars. In 1961, the Canadian federal government repealed the section of the Indian Act that automatically enfranchised status Indians deemed sufficiently “civilized” for such reasons as completion of a post-secondary degree, taking religious orders, or service in the military.<sup>379</sup> This helped make post-secondary education more visible to Indigenous people more generally, regardless of status under any Act. Better yet, it transformed post-secondary education into something that could help rather than hurt Indigenous communities, reforming it into “the new buffalo.”<sup>380</sup> This transformation may have played a role in a young Northwest Métis man’s decision to abandon his short tenure with the Royal Canadian Mounted Police to go to graduate school at the University of California (UCLA) at Berkeley in 1963.<sup>381</sup>

Three years after his arrival at UCLA, Howard Adams completed a PhD dissertation in the history of education. Two years later, in 1968, this early work made its published debut as *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867: The Roots of Separatism*.<sup>382</sup> He had already made a strong

*Indian Policy* (Department of Indian and Northern Affairs: Ottawa, 1969).

378 Martin F. Dunn, “All My Relations – The Other Métis. Discussion Paper for the Métis Circle Special Consultation of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (March 1994),” *The Other Metis*, <https://web.archive.org/web/20080305050630/http://www.othermetis.net/Papers/CircleTxt/CrcToc.html> (accessed November 14, 2021).

379 Canada, Department of Justice, *An Act to amend ‘The Indian Act,’* c. I-5, (9-10 El.II).

380 Blair Stonechild, *The New Buffalo: The Struggle for Aboriginal Post-Secondary Education* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2006): 45-70.

381 Simmons, “In Tribute to Howard Adams,” 7.

382 Howard Adams, *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867: The Roots of Separatism* (Montréal: Harvest House, 1968).

public impression during his participation in an education conference the year before, and his book touched on the sensitive topic of Québec separatism, marking him as a controversial figure. It was not Northwest Métis history yet, but Adams had established key contacts and a profile that would later facilitate the publication of his writing in that area.

Two years after Adams completed his dissertation, award-winning journalist Olive Patricia Dickason returned to university in response to her frustration with the lack of acknowledgement of Indigenous action and existence common in Canadian history publications. She remained in Canada, completing her graduate degrees at the University of Ottawa, her undergraduate alma mater. There her first order of business in focusing on Indigenous-newcomer relations was persuading her academic supervisors that there was such a thing as Aboriginal history.<sup>383</sup> But her work would not reach the public eye just yet.

The book that heralded an explosion of Northwest Métis historical writing was not overtly historical, at least not in the form that it reached bookstore shelves,<sup>384</sup> and was written by a young Northwest Métis woman from the same area of Saskatchewan as Howard Adams. Maria Campbell's memoir *Halfbreed* recounted her childhood growing up in a Saskatchewan road allowance community and her early adulthood struggling to bring up her younger siblings, then falling into and fighting her way out of drug addiction and poverty. It also shocked the general Canadian reading public. It was published in 1973, when the conceptualization of Canada as the peaceable kingdom that had treated "its" Native peoples fairly using an "anticonquest"<sup>385</sup> approach, unlike the United States, was already heavily criticized. The fact that Campbell wrote

383 Olive Patricia Dickason, "Out of the Bush: A Journey to A Dream," in *The Long Journey of a Forgotten People: Métis Identities and Family Histories*, eds. Ute Lischke and David T. McNab (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2007), 16-18.

384 Maria Campbell, *Halfbreed* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1973 [2019]).

385 Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 1992), 7.

her own memoir, revealing the sex-specific ways that Canadian law and racism impacted Indigenous women, struck a nerve among non-Indigenous Canadians. The more important reaction was among Indigenous authors, who now had an undeniably Indigenous-written and mainstream published exemplar that has rarely been out of print. For Northwest Métis with road allowance connections, here was the first book that made their communities visible again, in a way that neither idealized nor pathologized them. Arguably, Campbell's book defines the beginning of the fifth period of the recent Indigenous written tradition.

Between 1975 and 1980, the major Northwest Métis historical publications were usually brief, between 40 to 100 pages, and reached the public via paths as diverse as the works themselves. In 1975 Howard Adams' next book, *Prison of Grass: Canada from the Native Point of View*,<sup>386</sup> became a best seller that, like *Halfbreed* has rarely been out of print. Polemical, combining autobiography, history, and critical frameworks derived from Karl Marx and Frantz Fanon, his work drew considerable criticism from mainstream critics and scholars, including at least one whose work would eventually centre on the Northwest Métis community of Batoche.<sup>387</sup> In 1977 came a very different work, developed from the writing and journals of Marie Delorme Smith together with family stories of her life by her granddaughter Jock Carpenter in *Fifty Dollar Bride: Marie Rose Smith – A Chronicle of Métis Life in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century*.<sup>388</sup> Delorme Smith is a recurring presence in Canadian historiography more generally because of the potent combination of timing, her striking appearance, and that her family was and remains powerful in Northwest Métis politics. She witnessed the shift in settler views of “mixed race marriages,”

386 Howard Adams, *Prison of Grass: Canada From the Native Point of View* (Toronto: new press, 1975).

387 Diane Paulette Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres: A History of the Métis Community of Batoche, Saskatchewan* (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2009), 2.

388 Jock Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride: Marie Rose Smith – A Chronicle of Métis Life in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century* (Sidney: Gray's Publishing, 1977).

lived through the socioeconomic effects of the changes, worked with several “famous personalities” of the era, and had her likeness captured in multiple early studio photographs.<sup>389</sup>

Despite actively searching in French indices and through cross-references in English language Northwest Métis history publications, French language works are strangely few considering the French heritage and use of spoken French in many Métis communities. Among the earliest of those I have found is *L'espace de Louis Goulet*, edited and published by Guillaume Charette in 1976 with Éditions Bois-Brûlés, one of the predecessor presses to the MMF's Pemmican Publications.<sup>390</sup> Of interest at the time primarily because Goulet had indirectly participated in the 1885 Métis Resistance, it did not appear in English translation until 1980.<sup>391</sup>

During the 1970s and 1980s, the Canadian Secretary of State and the Alberta Department of Culture provided funding for numerous local history projects culminating in publications and museum exhibits. This reflected a continuing federal interest in narrating Canada even ten years after the centennial, and the Alberta provincial government's interest in documenting its history for its approaching 80<sup>th</sup> anniversary celebrations. Elizabeth Metis Settlement was one of the first Northwest Métis communities to take advantage of this funding. Project lead Albina Jacknife guided three summer students, Rosemarie Desjarlais, Kathy Jacknife, and Maureen Lepine, as they collected interviews from settlement elders<sup>392</sup> to document the changes and continuities in Métis life between the founding of the settlement and circa 1977. This is the earliest Northwest Métis-led ethnohistorical project in the corpus of works found for this project. Just two years

389 Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, front matter (unnumbered pages) and photograph reproduction inserts.

390 Guillaume Charette, *L'Espace de Louis Goulet* (Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 1976).

391 Guillaume Charette, *Vanishing Spaces: Memoirs of Louis Goulet*, trans. Ray Ellenwood (Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 2004).

392 Albina Jacknife, *Elizabeth Metis Settlement: A Local History* (Altona: Friesen Printers, 1977).

later, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979: 40 Years of Determination* appeared, a similar local history project, except that it seems to have been funded by the settlement itself.<sup>393</sup>

Meanwhile, Northwest Métis and non-status Indian activists engaged in federal-level discussions, arguing for the recognition of their Indigenous rights. Political leader, activist, and actor Harry W. Daniels published his presentations to various federal and Native organizations in 1979, including a brief Métis counter-history of Canada. He later became the second Northwest Métis leader to negotiate recognition of Métis existence and rights explicitly into federal legislation since Louis Riel in 1982.<sup>394</sup> Daniels was not alone in his work on the Northwest Métis specific aspects of this work. The next year Duke Redbird's revised interdisciplinary studies thesis completed at York University appeared under its original title, *We Are Métis: A Métis View of the Development of a Native Canadian People*. Focussed on demonstrating Métis indigeneity and importance as founders of Canada's confederation, Redbird recounts Northwest Métis history, including an original challenge to what even Canadian historians soon came to refer to as "Red River myopia."<sup>395</sup>

Four more Alberta Metis Settlement local histories reached publication between 1982 and 1984,<sup>396</sup> all in the form of compiled interviews and reproductions of selected photographs and documents. All were funded by either the province, the Canadian Secretary of State, the Alberta

393 Carol Supernault, Mary Auger, Marcella Cunningham, and Velma Bellerose, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979: 40 Years of Determination* (Place of publication and publisher not indicated, 1979).

394 Harry W. Daniels, *We Are the New Nation: The Metis and National Native Policy* (Ottawa: Native Council of Canada, 1979).

395 Duke Redbird, *We Are Métis: A Métis View of the Development of a Native Canadian People* (Toronto: Ontario Métis and Non-Status Indian Association, 1980).

396 Gift Lake Settlement, *Mud Roads and Strong Backs: The History of the Métis Settlement of Gift Lake* (Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Métis Settlement Associations, 1984).

Louise Horstman, and David May, eds., *Tired of Rambling: A History of Fishing Lake Metis Settlement* (Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Metis Settlement Associations, 1982).

Bill Miller, ed., *Our Home: A History of Kikino Metis Settlement* (Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Metis Settlements, 1984).

Eleanor Verbicky, ed., *Life and Times of the Métis: A History of Caslan Métis Settlement* (Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Métis Settlement Associations, 1984).

Federation of Metis Settlements Association, or a combination of these three bodies. Who led the compilation project and edited the final text made a significant difference to its overall tone and message. Non-Northwest Métis outsiders, even well-meaning ones, tended to impose narratives of degradation and near-savagery before the creation of the settlement, followed by tales of social deficit and close-pending assimilation post-settlement.<sup>397</sup>

In 1983, Saint Boniface-based Les Éditions du Blé released Diane Payment's University of Ottawa thesis<sup>398</sup> under the title *Batoche (1870 – 1910)*.<sup>399</sup> This document-based account of a Northwest Métis community's early history began from research Payment undertook as part of the redevelopment of Batoche as a national park and tourism site. Funded by the Canada Council of Arts and the Manitoba Council of Arts, its original appearance is of special note here.<sup>400</sup> How this book would develop next as Payment went on to work directly with the Batoche Métis community turned out to be more potent and interesting than might be expected of a book produced under Canadian federal government auspices. Payment and perhaps Parks Canada anticipated that her work would chronicle the founding, expansion, and lingering end of the Northwest Métis community of Batoche. In mainstream histories of Canada, the "Battle of Batoche" regularly served as a synecdoche for the purported fate of the Métis Nation.

### ***A Distant View in Time Part Two: Surviving the Neoliberal Turn and Beyond***

The second of the periods of lack of associative cohesion identified by Robert Warrior, 1973 – 1994, and the sudden dearth of political and research work across the medicine line is striking. This reflects a number of factors, from the increasing state repression of Red Power activism in

397 Paul Driben, "We Are Métis: The Ethnography of a Halfbreed Community in Northern Alberta" (PhD Dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1975).

398 Diane Payment, "Batoche (1870-1910): Profil d'une communauté métisse, Naissance-Expansion-Déclin," (Thèse de maîtrise ès arts, l'Université d'Ottawa, 1982).

399 Diane Paulette Payment, *Batoche (1870-1910)* (Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 1983).

400 *Ibid*, bottom of the page just before the Preface and the Preface itself, both unnumbered.

the United States to the rumbling discontent of Québec expressed in the continuing political popularity of the Separatist movement. The Northwest Métis had emerged fully into general public consciousness in Canada, but remained little known in the United States except for North Dakota and northern Montana, where they remained stubborn fixtures at the Rocky Boy and Turtle Mountain reservations.<sup>401</sup>

Olive Patricia Dickason's dissertation, originally completed in 1976, finally appeared as *The Myth of the Savage and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas* in 1984.<sup>402</sup> A striking and still little-cited part of the book is its appendix, which unpacks the origins of the term "Canadian" and how it began as a designation for Indigenous people and then was used to refer to French habitants, until finally it was appropriated by English-speaking settlers. Within the next decade, other Northwest Métis historians, including Dick Garneau and Martin F. Dunn, would argue that at one time, "Canadian" specifically designated none other than the Northwest Métis.<sup>403</sup>

Dickason was not the only Northwest Métis woman who responded to gaps in Canadian history books and other educational materials. Dr. Anne Anderson, one of the many descendants of Haudenosaunee men who came to western central Alberta and the adjacent areas of British Columbia during the fur trade and intermarried with local Cree and Northwest Métis women,

401 Morgan Baillargeon and Leslie Tepper, eds. *Legends of Our Times: Native Cowboy Life* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1998), 13.

Ed Stamper, Helen Windy Boy, and Ken Morsette Jr., eds., *The History of the Chippewa Cree of Rocky Boy's Indian Reservation* (Box Elder, MT: Stone Child College, 2008), 140.

Patline Laverdure and Ida Rose Allard, *The Michif Dictionary: Turtle Mountain Chippewa Cree*, ed. John C. Crawford (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications Inc., 1983), vii-x.

402 Olive Patricia Dickason, *The Myth of the Savage and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1984 [1997]).

403 Dick Garneau, "Objective and Motivation for This Site," Canadian History, A Distinct View Point, <https://web.archive.org/web/20150219165041/http://metis-history.info/author.shtml> (accessed December 17, 2021).  
Dunn, "All My Relations – The Other Métis."

came to serve as a supervisor on the Fishing Lake Metis Settlement in 1947.<sup>404</sup> Frustrated with the lack of Cree language materials for use in schools, Anderson began writing them and gathering the source materials for one of her best-known books, *The First Metis... A New Nation*, released in 1985.<sup>405</sup> Similar to Daniels, Redbird, and Adams, Anderson combined activism with an avocational historiographic practice that emerged from and supported that activism. Although the publications here are primarily monographs, the late 1980s also saw a burgeoning number of academic conference presentations, such as Dunn's on "The Unwritten History of Metis Nationhood" at the University of Ottawa Conference of First Nations.<sup>406</sup>

In parallel to Métis-authored works, the MMF and Metis Association of Alberta (MAA) were pursuing independent historical and legal research programs pertaining to Métis rights and title in Canada. Much of this work was completed between 1970 and 1985, and generally involved non-Métis historians as lead researchers and primary authors. They worked together to report findings related to Métis scrip in the nineteenth century and subsequent flooding of what are now the prairie provinces with land speculators and Ontario settlers.<sup>407</sup> These publications appeared under the publishing imprints of each organization, although ultimately, of these two only the Manitoba Métis Federation's press survived beyond the 1980s. Having begun with books researched by land claims research departments and composed by non-Métis scholars, both the

404 Lawrence Barkwell, "Anne Gairdner (Anderson, Irvine), C.M. LL.D. (1906 – 1997)," Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture, <http://www.metismuseum.ca/resource.php/10587> (accessed September 21, 2021), 1.

405 Anne Anderson, *The First Métis... A New Nation* (Edmonton: Uvisco Press, 1985).

406 Martin F. Dunn, "The Unwritten History of Métis Nationhood. Presentation to the Conference of the History of First Nations, University of Ottawa (1988)," *The Other Metis*, <https://web.archive.org/web/20051028040853/http://www.othermetis.net/Papers/Unwritten/UnwritTOC.html> (accessed November 14, 2021).

407 Founding examples include: Émile Pelletier, *A Social History of the Manitoba Metis: The Development and Loss of Aboriginal Rights* (Winnipeg: Métis Federation Press, 1974),

Émile Pelletier, *The Exploitation of Métis Land* (Winnipeg: Manitoba Métis Federation Press, 1975),

D. Bruce Sealey, *Statutory Land Rights of the Manitoba Métis* (Winnipeg: Manitoba Métis Federation Press, 1975), and

Metis Association of Alberta, Joe Sawchuk, Patricia Sawchuk, and Theresa Ferguson, *Metis Land Rights in Alberta: A Political History* (Edmonton: Metis Association of Alberta, 1981).

MMF and MAA went on to fund or publish Métis community histories and works by Métis scholars that will be discussed below. The role of university presses in producing and distributing works of Northwest Métis history began to grow at about this time, led by the Universities of Manitoba and Alberta.

The 1990s were a key decade in Northwest Métis historiography, as Northwest Métis scholars completed four theses in the areas of art history, history, and anthropology that applied ethnohistorical methods.<sup>408</sup> These theses combined one or more elder and community interviews with anthropological data and European-style written documents.<sup>409</sup> Among these is Sharon Blady's early study of Northwest Métis material culture, revealing an additional line of evidence that later scholars, including Sherry Farrell Racette, would use to trace community linkages through both trade and genealogy in the 2000s.<sup>410</sup> In 1990 Diane Payment released the first successor edition to her French monograph of 1983. It was no mere translation, but a full rewrite, including integration of oral history interviews and contributed family photographs, transforming it into "*The Free People – Otipemisiwak*" *Batoche, Saskatchewan 1870 – 1930*.<sup>411</sup> As she noted herself in the introduction, work with the Batoche community led her to further critique the all-too-common construction of Northwest Métis as a dying people saddled with a culture of

408 Sharon Blady, "The Flower Beadwork People: Factors Contributing to the Emergence of a Distinctive Métis Culture and Artistic Style at Red River From 1844 to 1869" (MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 1995).  
Anne Chrétien, "'Mattawa, Where the Waters Meet': The Question of Identity in Métis Culture," (MA Thesis, University of Ottawa, 1996).  
Margaret L. Clarke, "Reconstituting the Fur Trade Community of the Assiniboine Basin, 1793 to 1872" (MA Thesis, University of Winnipeg/University of Manitoba, 1997).  
Emma LaRocque, "Native Writers Resisting Colonizing Practices in Canadian Historiography and Literature" (PhD Dissertation, University of Manitoba, 1999).

409 John S. Lutz, *History 526: Topical Field in Ethnohistory* (University of Victoria, Winter 2016).

410 Sharon Blady, "The Flower Beadwork People: Factors Contributing to the Emergence of a Distinctive Métis Culture and Artistic Style at Red River From 1844 to 1869" (MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 1995).  
Sherry Farrell Racette, "Sewing Ourselves Together: Clothing, Decorative Arts, and the Expression of Metis and Half Breed Identity" (PhD Dissertation, University of Manitoba, 2004).

411 Diane Paulette Payment, "*The Free People – Otipemisiwak*" *Batoche, Saskatchewan 1870 – 1930* (Ottawa: National Parks and Sites Park Service Environment Canada, 1990).

poverty.<sup>412</sup> Although Payment is still listed as the single author on the book cover, this marks a near end to old-style “told-to” narratives in Northwest Métis country, a point perhaps reinforced by Mohawk resistance in Québec, commonly known as the “Oka Crisis,” spanning much of the latter half of the year.

Of course, there was an infamous date in the 1990s, the five hundredth anniversary of Christopher Columbus’ arrival (nowhere near where he intended to go) in the islands of Central America. Publishers had a particular interest in releasing books that could catch the increased interest in Indigenous history around this date. Dickason’s next book appeared in that year, her direct response to the poor treatment of Aboriginal history in Canadian history books: *Canada’s First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times*.<sup>413</sup> Dickason’s text now centres an exploration of Indigenous responses to European and settler incursions. The fall-out from the failed Meech Lake Accord, a 1987 attempt to change Canada’s constitution, and the Oka Crisis (1990), among other clashes and protests between Indigenous communities and non-Indigenous authorities, forced the Canadian federal government to act. It established the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1991-1996), held hearings across the country, and funded hundreds of research papers. Included among these was Martin F. Dunn’s presentation challenging “Red River myopia” and settler constructions of “métisness” by tracing Northwest Métis and other mixed heritage communities in Canada.<sup>414</sup>

With that, the decade entered a new period of associative cohesion for Indigenous peoples in North America, as the reconnections initiated by the “Oka Crisis” continued in both political and research activity. Political activities included the occupations at Ipperwash in Ontario and

412 Payment, “*The Free People – Otipemisiwak*,” 18-19.

413 Olive Patricia Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992 [2002]).

414 Dunn, “All My Relations – The Other Métis.”

Gustafsen Lake in British Columbia in 1995, renewed treaty negotiations across the prairie provinces for specific claims, and the completed transformation of former Indian agencies into First Nations-run organizations. Treaty negotiations drove further Indigenous historical research, with more Indigenous people undertaking it after post-secondary degrees in related fields.

The latter half of the 1990s saw the publication of *Ste. Madeleine, Community Without a Town: Métis Elders in Interview*, a series of conversations with surviving Ste. Madeleine community members transcribed by Ken and Victoria Zeilig.<sup>415</sup> This “told-to” history was and to some degree still is controversial because it documents the destruction of a road allowance community under the auspices of the Prairie Farm Rehabilitation Act, first passed in 1935 in response to drought conditions affecting southern Alberta and Saskatchewan.<sup>416</sup> The distinctive histories and cultures of Northwest Métis peoples in the Northwest Territories appeared in the form of an anthology overseen and published by the Métis Heritage Association of the Northwest Territories and Parks Canada, *Picking Up the Threads*.<sup>417</sup> A key participant in bringing the work to press was none other than Diane Payment, although the majority of the contributors were not Northwest Métis.

The decade closed with the revised edition of Howard Adams’ last historical monograph, *Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization*.<sup>418</sup> This book applies the same combination of history narrated from an Indigenous point of view, political critique of European behaviour, and depictions of Indigenous peoples as *Prison of Grass*.<sup>419</sup> He explains, “[m]y objective is to

415 Ken Zeilig and Victoria Zeilig, eds., *Ste. Madeleine, Community Without a Town: Métis Elders in Interview* (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, Inc., 1997).

416 Zeilig and Zeilig, *Ste. Madeleine*, xi-xii.

417 Métis Heritage Association of the Northwest Territories and Parks Canada, *Picking Up the Threads: Métis History in the Mackenzie Basin* (Winnipeg: Métis Heritage Association of the Northwest Territories, 1998).

418 Howard Adams, *Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization* (Penticton: Theytus Books, 1999).

419 Howard Adams, *Prison of Grass: Canada from the Native Point of View* (Toronto: New Press, 1975).

provide a theoretical framework for analyzing Aboriginal history and culture,”<sup>420</sup> contributing to the early development of Indigenous critical theory as applied to historical writing. 1999 also marks the beginning of a striking intervention in Northwest Métis history by public historian David T. McNab. At this point, making no open claim to be Northwest Métis himself, he began producing works synthesizing his experiences as a land claims researcher and negotiator, first for the province of Ontario and later for Bkejwanong First Nation.<sup>421</sup> *Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario* documented the problematic relations between Indigenous peoples and the Ontario provincial government, including a brief essay outlining Northwest Métis participation in treaty negotiations from the mid-nineteenth to the late twentieth centuries.<sup>422</sup> In his introduction, McNab argued that Indigenous peoples do not divide their history into periods, making it equally valid but different and separate from European or Canadian histories. He insisted that studying Indigenous history in terms of cyclical time was both necessary and appropriate.<sup>423</sup> Direct references to Indigenous epistemologies of any kind were not otherwise in evidence in works of this type in the late 1990s. A parallel electronic tradition of Northwest Métis historical publishing also began in 1999, with Richard Garneau’s first release of his website, *Canadian History: A Distinct Viewpoint*, to present the results of what began as his genealogical research.<sup>424</sup>

Almost as many Northwest Métis historiographic works were written and published between 2000 and 2010 as all the items from 1990 to 1999 together, indicating the completion of a

420 Adams, *Tortured People*, second unnumbered page of the Introduction.

421 David T. McNab, *Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1999).

422 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 21-34.

423 *Ibid.*

424 Dick Garneau, *Canadian History, A Distinct View Point*, <https://web.archive.org/web/20150219165041/http://metis-history.info/> (accessed December 17, 2021).

significant number of research projects. There were six theses in history and anthropology, and by this time, also in Native studies and interdisciplinary studies. This is also a major decade for general Indigenous and Northwest Métis-specific anthologies. Dickason contributes to both types of anthology with a study of the changing laws used to rationalize European actions on encountering Indigenous peoples over nearly three hundred years in *Expressions in Canadian Native Studies* and reflections on her personal journey to becoming a historian in *The Long Journey of a Forgotten People: Métis Identities and Family Histories* in 2007.<sup>425</sup>

*The Long Journey of a Forgotten People* marks McNab's growing contributions to these types of publications as well, in this case, as co-editor and contributor. Both *Long Journey* and *Expressions in Canadian Native Studies* bring together a selection of scholarly articles spanning history, sociology, and in the latter case, genealogy. *Long Journey* is complemented by the first volume of the *Metis Legacy* series released in 2001.<sup>426</sup> An anthology itself, *Métis Legacy* has a much stronger historical focus in its first volume, including an introductory essay by Leah Dorion and Darren R. Préfontaine, "Deconstructing Métis Historiography: Giving Voice to the Métis People."<sup>427</sup> This essay will play an important part in the historiographic analysis in the next section.

Les Éditions du Blé continues to publish occasional French language books of Métis history, in this decade Auguste Vermette's memoir *Au temps de la Prairie: L'histoire des Métis l'Ouest canadien racontée par Auguste Vermette, neveu de Louis Riel*,<sup>428</sup> collected and transcribed by

425 Olive Patricia Dickason, "Old World Laws and New World Political Realities," in *Expressions in Canadian Native Studies*, eds. Ron F. Laliberte, Priscilla Settee, James B. Waldram, Rob Innes, Brenda MacDougall, Lesley McBain, and F. Laurie Barron (Saskatoon: University Extension Press, 2000), 147-162.

Dickason, "Out of the Bush."

426 Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion and Darren R. Préfontaine, eds. *Métis Legacy* (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001).

427 Dorion and Préfontaine, "Deconstructing Métis Historiography."

428 Auguste Vermette, *Au temps de la Prairie: L'histoire des Métis l'Ouest canadien racontée par Auguste Vermette, neveu de Louis Riel*, éd. Marcien Ferland (Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 2000).

Marcien Ferland. Ferland's introductory remarks<sup>429</sup> suggest that he is not comfortable with Vermette's account, emphasizing its philological and ethnographic value while suggesting that he is truthful but partial. The positioning is reminiscent of the most unfortunate of old-style "told-to" narrative framings. As noted in Chapter One, old-style "told-to" narratives may be rare after the early 1990s, but the form and framing still linger.

Nearly fifteen years after completing his master's thesis in anthropology,<sup>430</sup> Guy Lavallée self-published his study of his own community of St. Laurent, Manitoba, in 2003. His original work fell within a period of resurgent pessimism about Northwest Métis survival as peoples among anthropologists, the same period as Diane Payment's first version of Batoche's history.<sup>431</sup> This pessimism is reflected in Lavallée's recounting of changes in Northwest Métis culture at St. Laurent from 1920 to 1988, and his conclusion, where he suggests that St. Laurent is becoming "Canadianized." The contrast with another Northwest Métis community history from the same year, *The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch*<sup>432</sup> by Ron Rivard and Catherine Littlejohn is startling. Their text frames a selection of reproduced photographs and documents while recounting Willow Bunch's ties to the famous buffalo hunts and ongoing survival as a Northwest Métis community despite the imposition of the nearby international border, the influx of settlers, and the infamous Prairie Farm Rehabilitation Act.

In 2003 the tools of digital history and several long-term archival projects founded and maintained by Métis socio-political organizations reached a level of maturity and accessibility

429 *Ibid*, xv-xvii.

430 Guy Lavallée, "The Métis People of St. Laurent, Manitoba: An Introductory Ethnography" (MA Thesis, University of British Columbia, 1988).

431 Guy Lavallée, *The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba: Their Life and Stories, 1920 – 1988* (Winnipeg: Self-Published, 2003).

432 Ron Rivard, and Catherine Littlejohn, *The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch* (Saskatoon: Rivard and Littlejohn, 2003).

that upended the established landscape of Métis primary sources. In March 2003, the Gabriel Dumont Institute of Applied Research's<sup>433</sup> *Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture*<sup>434</sup> went live, providing access to thousands of digitized photographs, audio files, scanned records, and historical essays suitable for use in classrooms from elementary to university level. Today this online archive continues to grow, now including tens of thousands of items, embracing fonds gifted by the families of many of the elder Métis historians whose works were published throughout this decade. Other online archives and databases were soon established, including mapping projects sponsored by provincial and federal Northwest Métis organizations and universities, such as the BC Métis Mapping Research Project<sup>435</sup> and the Métis Archival Project Research Lab based at the University of Alberta.<sup>436</sup> While not publications in themselves, like Northwest Métis organization-owned and funded presses, they play a key role in supporting research and production of historical works by Northwest Métis communities and scholars.

Other Northwest Métis historians returned to the question of Métis ethnogenesis in 2000 – 2010, including Heather Devine in *The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660 – 1900*,<sup>437</sup> and Brenda MacDougall, whose studies led her to draw on the key concept of *wahkôtowin*.<sup>438</sup> Both historians trace genealogical connections to answer questions about Northwest Métis being and becoming, although their

433 Gabriel Dumont Institute, Gabriel Dumont Institute of Native Studies and Applied Research, <https://gdins.org/> (accessed December 18, 2021).

434 Gabriel Dumont Institute, Gabriel Dumont Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture, <http://www.metismuseum.ca/> (accessed December 18, 2021).

435 Métis Nation British Columbia, BC Métis Mapping Research Project, <http://document.bcmetiscitizen.ca/> (accessed December 18, 2021).

436 Frank Tough, Métis Archival Research Lab, <https://www.ualberta.ca/native-studies/research/map-lab> (accessed December 18, 2021).

437 Heather Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660 – 1900* (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004).

438 Brenda MacDougall, *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010).

focus is perforce different. In many ways, Devine’s study caps a long line of research by both Indigenous and non-Indigenous scholars into the origins and development of the Northwest Métis. While ethnogenesis remains an active topic into the present, for Northwest Métis scholars, interest has turned more to the diversity of peoples whose genealogical ties, trade connections, and overlapping histories and cultures bring them together. The practice of social and cultural integration, as expressed in the practices and links of *wahkôtowin* are at the centre of MacDougall’s research, as demonstrated through both 2010’s *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan* and an earlier article published in 2008 in the open access e-journal *Labour/Le Travail*.<sup>439</sup>

There is more to this formidable shift in Northwest Métis historiography because it expresses more than just different interests. It enacts a long-simmering but not always successfully expressed Northwest Métis critique of the persistent colonial efforts to redefine us as neither a people nor a nation, but merely as a racialized product of miscegenation between “real” Indigenous people and Europeans. These colonial efforts are detrimental not only to Northwest Métis, but also to other Indigenous peoples in Canada, both those akin to us and those not. To directly challenge the established colonial narrative, now entrenched in judicial decisions, censuses, and academia would require a more sociological approach to Northwest Métis history. Chris Andersen implemented this approach in his 2014 book, *“Métis”: Race, Recognition, and the Struggle for Indigenous Peoplehood*.<sup>440</sup> His work harmonizes with both MacDougall’s examination of *wahkôtowin* and contemporary studies by First Nations

439 Brenda MacDougall, “The Comforts of Married Life: Metis Family Life, Labour, and the Hudson’s Bay Company,” *Labour/Le Travail* 61 (2008): 19-39.

440 Chris Andersen, *“Métis” Race, Recognition, and the Struggle for Indigenous Peoplehood* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014).

academics such as Indigenous studies scholar Robert Alexander Innes<sup>441</sup> and political scientist Glen Coulthard.<sup>442</sup> Together, they represent a broader Indigenous intellectual movement to end colonial interference with Indigenous citizenship and recognition frameworks.

The role of scholarly as opposed to popular publishing in Northwest Métis historiography is now much greater, consistent with greater access to the credentials and connections to produce work through those outlets. Sherry Farrell Racette's historiographic publications in this decade include articles in a non-open access journal<sup>443</sup> and an anthology from UBC Press.<sup>444</sup> Conversely, Northwest Métis ethnographers such as Mike Evans have advocated for and produced works in cooperation with academic presses under open access licenses and written for a non-scholarly audience. Evans has been the lead or contributing investigator on a series of "told-to" compilations completed between 2004 and 2007, documenting Northwest Métis communities in British Columbia whose presence is often denied by non-Indigenous historians.<sup>445</sup> Popular Northwest Métis historian George Goulet and his partner Terry Goulet completed their own account, *The Métis in British Columbia: From Fur Trade Outposts to Colony*, in 2008.<sup>446</sup>

441 Robert Alexander Innes, *Elder Brother and the Law of the People: Contemporary Kinship and Cowessess First Nation* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2013).

442 Glen Sean Coulthard, *Red Skin White Masks: Rejecting the Colonial Politics of Recognition* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2014).

443 Sherry Farrell Racette, "My Grandmothers Loved to Trade: The Indigenization of European Trade Goods in Historic and Contemporary Canada," *Journal of Museum Ethnography* 20 (2008): 69-81.

444 Sherry Farrell Racette, "Sewing for a Living: The Commodification of Métis Women's Artistic Production," in *Contact Zones: Aboriginal and Settler Women in Canada's Colonial Past*, eds. Katie Pickles and Maya Rutherford (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005), 17-46.

445 Mike Evans and Lisa Krebs with John Eagle, Bob Parris, and Heidi Standeven, *A Brief History of the Short Life of Island Cache* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2004).

Craig Campbell, Alice Boucher, Mike Evans, Emma Faichney, Howard La Corde, and Zachary Powder (Presenters), *Mihkwâkamiwi sîpîsis – Stories and Pictures from Metis Elders in Fort McKay* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2005).

Mike Evans, Marcelle Gareau, Lisa Krebs, Leona Neilson, and Heidi Standeven, *What It Is to Be a Métis: The Stories and Recollections of the Elders of the Prince George Métis Elder Society* (Prince George: UNBC Press, 2007).

446 George Goulet and Terry Goulet, *The Métis in British Columbia: From Fur Trade Outposts to Colony* (Calgary: Fabjob, Inc., 2008).

In this decade, Northwest Métis historians Larry N. Chartrand, Tricia E. Logan, and Judy D. Daniels faced the painful task of gathering evidence for the *Métis History and Experience of Residential Schools*,<sup>447</sup> a monograph still available in electronic format from the Aboriginal Healing Foundation. Its 2006 release preceded the court-ordered creation of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada on the residential school system and responded to a growing need to face the far from minor impact of residential schools on Northwest Métis families and communities. This thread in Northwest Métis history is still poorly represented outside of grey literature of this type.

Just before the end of the decade, David T. McNab chronicled the legal battles and negotiations impacting the Indigenous places of Bear Island and Toronto, based on his own experiences and related documentation from the province of Ontario between 1979 and 1991. Northwest Métis participation in treaty negotiations and legal proceedings on both sides of the table extends back to nearly the origins of Northwest Métis peoples, yet this too is a little-covered area of Northwest Métis history. Admittedly, this is a far from comfortable history to explore, as McNab notes in his chronicle, *No Place for Fairness: Indigenous Land Rights and Policy in the Bear Island Case and Beyond*.<sup>448</sup> Apart from the discomfort of Northwest Métis historical figures who may be perceived as working against their own or other Indigenous peoples, there is the problem of the inappropriate conflation of mixed heritage with being Northwest Métis in both scholarly and popular literature.

A new, revised, and expanded edition of Diane Payment's "told-to" collaborative history of Batoche appeared in 2009, now titled *The Free People – Li Gens Libres: A History of the Métis*

447 Larry N. Chartrand, Tricia E. Logan, and Judy D. Daniels, *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools* (Ottawa: Aboriginal Healing Foundation, 2006).

448 David T. McNab, *No Place for Fairness: Indigenous Land Rights and Policy in the Bear Island Case and Beyond* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2009).

*Community of Batoche, Saskatchewan*.<sup>449</sup> Unlike its predecessors, this version includes a detailed discussion of Payment’s methodology and an index. The subtitle’s insistence that this text is “a” history, not “the” history, is a subtle contribution to the deconstruction of the two-dimensional and singular narrative of decline imposed on Northwest Métis communities through much of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Up to 2018, the number of historical works by Northwest Métis researchers is a minority of all the items examined. “Told-to” works predominate and include originals such as *Métis Soldiers of Saskatchewan 1914 – 1953*, compiled and edited by Catherine Littlejohn under the auspices of Métis Nation – Saskatchewan,<sup>450</sup> the Fort McMurray Métis Local 1995’s *Mark of the Métis*,<sup>451</sup> and a revised edition of the history of East Prairie Metis Settlement.<sup>452</sup> More recent research indicates new areas Northwest Métis histories may arise from in the near future, from Adam Gaudry’s dissertation on the “Political History of Métis Self-determination in the North-West, 1830 – 1870”<sup>453</sup> to Chantal Roy Denis’ recovery of the almost lost history of one of the unilaterally disestablished Alberta Metis Settlements, Wolf Lake.<sup>454</sup>

### ***A Closer View in Mainstream Mode***

As shown above, Northwest Métis participation in deliberately producing historical publications in non-Indigenous venues began no later than the 1930s. They began by purposefully collecting relevant documents and interviewing community members who had witnessed or engaged

449 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*.

450 Catherine Littlejohn, *Métis Soldiers of Saskatchewan 1914-1943* (Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2012).

451 Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935, *Mark of the Métis: Traditional Knowledge and Stories of the Métis People of Northeastern Alberta* (Altona, MB: Friesens, 2012).

452 Constance Brissenden, ed., *Memories of a Metis Settlement: Eighty Years of East Prairie Metis Settlement, with Firsthand Memories, 1939 to Today* (Penticton: Theytus Books, 2018).

453 Adam Gaudry, “Kaa-tipeyimishoyaahk – ‘We Are Those Who Own Ourselves’: A Political History of Métis Self-Determination in the North-West, 1830-1870” (PhD Dissertation, University of Victoria, 2014).

454 Chantal Roy Denis, “Wolf Lake: The Importance of Métis Connection to Land and Place” (MA Thesis, University of Alberta, 2017).

directly in key activities or events, then working with an amanuensis or trusted outsider to compose a text. It took nearly forty years before Northwest Métis historians began penning their own texts directly, and almost twenty more before their publications began to escape the confines of land claims research and rewriting the stories of the Red River and Batoche resistance movements. Many Northwest Métis authors found ways to get their work published through the 1990s, from self-publishing to academic presses. By 2001 Dorion and Préfontaine could refer to “Métis studies” as an established discipline that had become more balanced as Métis themselves “moved into the role of historical narrators with their own views of their ancestors as historical participants.”<sup>455</sup> Due to the role of their essay as a framework for the *Métis Legacy* project as a whole, Dorion and Préfontaine’s reconnaissance of “Métis studies” discussed few Northwest Métis-authored works in any detail. Instead, they focussed on giving evidence for anti-Métis bias in mainstream histories written about Northwest Métis<sup>456</sup> and presenting a gap analysis.<sup>457</sup> The gap analysis, in turn, became the practical research and compilation program for the *Métis Legacy* series.

This closer examination of the selected monographs will begin in a more mainstream mode by considering their research questions, methods, and sources, followed by consideration of their relationship to the five themes under investigation. The combination of theme and citation analysis reveals the challenges the authors faced in defining and accessing their own historiographic tradition as they syncretized Indigenous and non-Indigenous modes of history writing. Those challenges, in turn, point the way to evidence of which Indigenous historiographic methods were used and how, including their sometimes fraught, sometimes favourable

455 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 13.

456 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 16-18; 25-30.

457 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 19-35.

relationship with ethnohistory. In line with the mainstream mode in play here, the discussion is broken into three sections. The first section includes works from 1968 to 1982, the year in which Métis were explicitly included in the revised Canadian constitution. The second traces the monographs published post-1982 to 2001, the year of Northwest Métis activist, educator, and historian Howard Adams' passing. The third and final section deals with the remaining works, many of them (but not all) a product of a significant phase shift in Northwest Métis historiographic production at the turn of the twenty-first century, from 2000 to 2018.

*From Red Power to Constitutional Debates, 1968 – 1982*

The published version of Howard Adams' PhD dissertation did not receive much attention. For example, even Chad Gaffield's classic 1987 study of the intersections of language, religion, and education in an 1850s Upper Canada francophone community does not cite Adams.<sup>458</sup> Originally titled "The Role of Church and State in Canadian Education, 1800 – 1867," its publication title, which may have been a product of the editorial staff rather than Adams himself,<sup>459</sup> attempted to reframe it as really about Québec separatism. The starting question is not about political separatism *per se*, but rather about secularization and democratization of education in Upper and Lower Canada, and whether these educational changes had occurred by 1867.<sup>460</sup> To answer this complex question, Adams undertook a class-based analysis that traced intersections between demographics, religion, language, and the changing political rules in force over his study period.<sup>461</sup> In the closing lines of the text, Adams states:

458 Chad Gaffield, *Language, Schooling, and Cultural Conflict: The Origins of the French-Language Controversy in Ontario* (Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1987).

459 Howard Adams, *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867: The Roots of Separatism* (Montreal: Harvest House, 1968).

460 Adams, *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867*, 109-111; 112-116.

461 Adams, *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867*, 63-73; 88-96.

It is only within the last few years that Canadians have been seriously challenging the character of their public school systems: the curricula are being revised with an emphasis upon national culture; biographical dictionaries of ‘great ancestors’ are being compiled and Canadians generally are experiencing a quickening of national consciousness. They are anxiously seeking an identity; they are discovering that they must first create an indigenous culture in order to establish a national identity.<sup>462</sup>

Here then, is Adams’ argument, suggesting that Canadians need to develop and transmit their own culture independent of imperial powers while refusing a colonial and dependent mentality.<sup>463</sup>

Adams speaks to what José E. Igartua referred to in 2006 as “the other quiet revolution,”<sup>464</sup> a refusal of “British” identity by anglophone Canada that was gaining serious momentum in the late 1960s. That Adams connects this refusal by “white” English Canadians of British descent with finally recognizing their own colonial or dependent mentality was far from uncontroversial. His interest in how a colonial or dependent mentality may be encouraged and engrained in a people is a consistent thread throughout Adams’ work.

As the topic and timing suggest, this earlier project is researched and written entirely within the parameters of document-based mainstream history. Adams’ primary sources include transcriptions of parliamentary debates and related education proceedings recorded in newspapers, official documents, and preserved correspondence. His selected secondary sources cover the major books and biographies related to nineteenth-century Canadian education available at the time.<sup>465</sup> He works hard to produce a critical social history as opposed to a flat chronicle of the actions and motivations of “great men” counterbalanced by their reconstructed counterparts among the middle and lower classes.

462 Adams, *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867*, 117.

463 *Ibid.*

464 José E. Igartua, *The Other Quiet Revolution: National Identities in English Canada, 1945 – 71* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2006).

465 Adams, *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867*, 119-123.

Adams is an early Northwest Métis historian who has carried out research that apparently does not concern the Northwest Métis at all, nor does it engage with any of the five themes above. H.H. Walsh of McGill University, who wrote the forward to Adams' book, found himself, if not lost, then dissatisfied with the positioning of the study unless as an examination of the origins of Québec separatism.<sup>466</sup> Walsh comments rather testily in his forward that "One may well ask why Dr. Adams, a Métis himself, who has become closely identified with the hopes and aspirations of the aborigines of Canada should spend so much time in research on the white man's educational systems in Ontario and Quebec."<sup>467</sup> Like most Canadians then and now, Walsh may not have realized what Igartua explained in his book: "The Ontario textbooks... were also used in the Maritimes, on the Prairies, and in British Columbia, since Canadian regional markets were too small for publishers to offer province-specific texts. Indeed, Ontario texts were essentially English Canadian texts, and thus what we learn from analyzing their content applies far beyond the confines of the province."<sup>468</sup> Textbooks written from an Ontario-centred point of view were used all over Canada, forcing historians of education to engage with the impact of the Ontario curriculum even if they were not from that province.

*Prison of Grass* is a completely different composition, as it entered the market through a partnership between new press<sup>469</sup> and Trent University with funding from the Ontario Arts Council. In it, Adams is determined to answer the question of the origins and purpose of racism, how it is enforced, its role in colonialism, and how the colonized are induced to accept racist claims as truths about themselves. He argues that racism is primarily about economics, ensuring access to a cheap

466 Adams, *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867*, vii.

467 *Ibid.*

468 Igartua, *The Other Quiet Revolution*, 64.

469 This capitalization follows that of the publisher on the copyright page.

and docile labour force and ready access to lucrative resources.<sup>470</sup> Adams uncompromisingly identifies Canadian mainstream society as premised on white supremacy.<sup>471</sup> His assertions came at a time when the image of Canada as “the peaceable kingdom,” largely without racism or social injustice, was accepted in much of English Canada without question. Furthermore, Adams applies a dialectical writing mode, setting autobiography, Indigenous archives and official mainstream archives on par with one another, using the parallels and contrasts between them to critique mainstream society and challenge the accepted historical record.<sup>472</sup> The power of this dialectical technique is nontrivial. As Simmons observes in her tribute to Adams in the journal *Political Economy*, “This dialectical approach distinguishes Adams’s work from the canonical historiography of defeat.”<sup>473</sup> This book would not, indeed, could not be ignored like its predecessor not only because of its content but also because of its timing, catching the peak of Red Power activism in Canada and the foundation of Native Studies as an academic discipline.<sup>474</sup>

It is important to examine *Prison of Grass* starting from its original edition, not least because the 1975 preface is much longer and provides an important summary description of Adams’ sources. These include statistical data to describe “objective conditions,” “discussions with senior native people, primary documents, and secondary sources. One study I have used extensively is *L’Histoire de la Nation Métisse dans l’Ouest Canadien...*”<sup>475</sup> The 1989 preface omits this material in order to focus on the colonial constraints on Indigenous people engaged in recording and writing their histories. Adams reiterates there his contention that the government authorities fabricated many of the documents used by mainstream Canadian historians writing

470 Adams, *Prison of Grass*, x-xi; 5.

471 Adams, *Prison of Grass*, 9-10.

472 Adams, *Prison of Grass* (1975), xi. Also, *Prison of Grass* (1989), 6.

473 Deborah Simmons, “In Tribute to Howard Adams,” *Political Economy* 68 (2002), 7-8.

474 Simmons, “In Tribute to Howard Adams,” 8-10.

475 Adams, *Prison of Grass* (1975), xi.

about Indigenous history, noting, “Hence, it is not only an exceedingly difficult task for us to construct an authentic Indigenous history, but it also requires an extremely prolonged period of time to reach publication.”<sup>476</sup>

The primary themes at work in *Prison of Grass* are: (1) rebutting depictions of Northwest Métis (and First Nations) as lacking authentic cultures and histories, and (2) arguing for the persistence of Indigenous rights and title. Accordingly, Adams reinterprets the Indigenous resistance movements on the Canadian plains in the nineteenth century. He demands that the reader question the authority of Canadian history books as the word of truth and critiques both Indigenous leadership and the Canadian federal government. Indeed, his tone, now open rather than a covert application of Marxist class analysis, was not always well-received. For example, he begins by arguing that racism is a product of economics within a capitalist framework, where racist beliefs justify the exploitation of racialized people.<sup>477</sup> Then he uses personal anecdote to show the Catholic clergy in a poor light and to introduce a longer discussion of the Catholic Church’s interests in taking up Indigenous lands.<sup>478</sup> At the core of the book is Adams’ controversial insistence that Indigenous peoples were set up as scapegoats for unrest on the Canadian plains by federal government use of propaganda and provocateurs among the local clergy and non-Indigenous community leaders.<sup>479</sup>

The contrast between *Prison of Grass* and the original French edition of *L’Espace de Louis Goulet* could hardly be greater. In this posthumously published book, Guillaume Charette adds to the ranks of “told-to” narratives gathered from Northwest Métis elders who took part in or witnessed the nineteenth century Northwest Métis resistances. The interviewer and transcriber

<sup>476</sup> Adams, *Prison of Grass* (1989), 6.

<sup>477</sup> Adams, *Prison of Grass* (1975), 3-11.

<sup>478</sup> Adams, *Prison of Grass* (1975), 29-32.

<sup>479</sup> Adams, *Prison of Grass* (1975), 97-98; 100-103.

Charette insists, “Dans le récit suit, le lecteur ne trouvera pas un mot de fiction.”<sup>480</sup> Editor Émile Pelletier avers in his own prefatory comments that “Les Editions Bois-Brûlés ont conservé les canadianismes et les mots indiens qui se trouvaient dans le texte, et éliminé l’anglais à part quelques mots et une dizaine d’anglicismes.”<sup>481</sup> The subsequent narrative is arranged into eighteen chapters and lightly illustrated with twenty line drawings and a map printed on the front fly-leaves. The acknowledgements list a twelve-person research team.<sup>482</sup> This is all standard practice, and the result was both one of Les Edition Bois-Brûlés’ most successful books and an early work of popular social history. It won over English translator Ray Ellenwood almost immediately when he first read it and was released in his English version in 1980.

Over time Ellenwood began to have more and more questions about how this book was composed and edited, so he began full bibliographic research at the Société Historique de Saint-Boniface (SHSB), and recounted his findings in a 1988 paper.<sup>483</sup> Today it is possible to look at scans of many of the pages Ellenwood consulted on the SHSB website as he tried to reconstruct the development of the French text from Charette’s original series of newspaper articles recounting Goulet’s life.<sup>484</sup> Although Ellenwood concludes that Charette and subsequently the team of editors behaved honestly, he still says, “Of course, much more research is needed before Goulet’s memoirs can be discounted or acclaimed as historical documents with any authority.”<sup>485</sup> This edges into damnation by faint praise, especially considering that through these memoirs,

480 Guillaume Charette, *L’Espace de Louis Goulet* (Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 1976), 11.

481 Charette, *L’Espace de Louis Goulet*, 9.

482 Charette, *L’Espace de Louis Goulet*, 7.

483 Ray Ellenwood, “Voices of Louis Goulet,” in *Reflections: Autobiography and Canadian Literature*, ed. K.P. Stich (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1988), 103-113.

484 Centre de patrimoine, “La Société historique de Saint-Boniface (SHSB),” <https://shsb.mb.ca/societe-historique-de-saint-boniface/> (accessed December 30, 2021).

485 Ellenwood, “Voices of Louis Goulet,” 108.

Goulet, and by extension Charette, are challenging elements of the mainstream narrative of the 1885 Métis Resistance, especially constructions of Northwest Métis as a homogenous mass of savages. Goulet describes the coherent Northwest Métis community he grew up in, including episodes from the bison hunt, and emphasizes his employment as a freighter, guide, and interpreter. According to him, Northwest Métis were not savages, nor he observes, did all Northwest Métis willingly take part in the Resistance, and he was involuntarily swept up into the events of 1885 himself.<sup>486</sup> Therefore, the results touch on the theme of showing Northwest Métis conscious existence, but emphasize that Northwest Métis had (and have) independent culture and history from their neighbours.

On the one hand, the 1977 publication of *Fifty Dollar Bride* is consistent with the growing market for accounts of nineteenth century Northwest Métis life. On the other hand, it demonstrates that these accounts might be based on historical writings produced by Northwest Métis themselves, though the writers might be wary about using such contemporary labels as “Métis” or “Halfbreed.” As noted above, this book garnered considerable interest because of Marie Delorme Smith herself, although, at first little notice was taken of Jock Carpenter’s note in the preface that “It is fortunate that Marie Rose chose to record the story of her life on the prairies in numerous diaries and writings.”<sup>487</sup> Delorme Smith attempted to have her historical writings published as a book in the 1930s, and produced a successful nine-article series from them for the periodical *Canadian Cattlemen*.<sup>488</sup> Nevertheless, the inclusion of *Fifty Dollar Bride* in this study may seem controversial for two reasons. First, it is most often referred to as a

486 Charette, *L’Espace de Louis Goulet*, 31-33; 35-39; 125-129; 137-138; 141-144.

487 Jock Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride: Marie Rose Smith – A Chronicle of Métis Life in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century* (Sidney: Gray’s Publishing, 1977), Preface (page unnumbered).

488 Doris Jeanne MacKinnon, *The Identities of Marie Rose Delorme Smith: Portrait of a Métis Woman 1861-1960* (Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre Press, 2012), 35.

memoir. Second, Delorme Smith is typically positioned by non-Indigenous historians as a source of “folk history,”<sup>489</sup> which may be informative on certain topics but is not shaped by the demands of mainstream historical writing.<sup>490</sup> In other words, Delorme Smith was not a university-trained historian, and despite her family’s extensive connections and participation on both sides of the nineteenth-century Northwest Métis resistance movements, she all but elided these details.<sup>491</sup> Most challenging to mainstream scholarly sensibilities, Delorme Smith does not trace events in chronological order in her original manuscripts. It is later editing, such as that by Jock Carpenter, that creates a chronological framework.<sup>492</sup>

These are important factors to acknowledge in that they neatly illustrate some of the challenges facing a Northwest Métis person’s effort to record and preserve information for posterity outside of an Indigenous context. There are other factors affecting Indigenous people who found themselves with enough education and resources to engage in creating, preserving, and sharing historical accounts, regardless of whether they intended to be historians as such. The other factors are also well illustrated by Delorme Smith’s case.

Delorme Smith was sold into an arranged marriage at sixteen years old to a wealthy trader nearly twenty years her elder in 1879.<sup>493</sup> After travelling with her family for a year, Delorme Smith’s husband opted to leave and start a ranch in the area of Pincher Creek, Alberta.<sup>494</sup> As a result, Delorme Smith was at least partially cut off from family storytelling networks. Her formal education consisted of two to four years of instruction at the then Grey Nuns’ Convent at Saint-

489 MacKinnon, *The Identities of Marie Rose Delorme Smith*, 6; 35-36; 59.

490 John E. Foster, “Some Questions and Perspectives on the Problem of Métis Roots,” in *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*, eds. Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985), 75.

491 MacKinnon, *The Identities of Marie Rose Delorme Smith*, 42; 45-47.

492 *Ibid*, 42-59.

Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, 153-157.

493 Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, 56; 60.

494 Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, 64; 69-70.

Boniface, Manitoba.<sup>495</sup> The rest of her education came “on the job” as a ranch and later boarding house manager, both demanding regular English correspondence; however, as Delorme Smith notes, she spoke three languages fluently, French, English, and Cree.<sup>496</sup> For much of her life, Delorme Smith had many children at home to care for, bearing seventeen during her marriage.<sup>497</sup> Amongst all this work and responsibility, Delorme Smith found the most accessible outlet for publishing her writing was in periodicals. By the 1930s, magazines and newspapers were not as open to amateur writing as they had been in the nineteenth century, although specialist publications like *Canadian Cattlemen* pursued an interest in work by respected ranchers.<sup>498</sup> Nevertheless, Delorme Smith clearly meant to preserve information about events and people she deemed important to remember, and her family understood her intentions. Her daughter Eva Forsland deposited her manuscripts in the Glenbow Archives in Calgary, where Delorme Smith’s granddaughter would consult them in the early 1970s.<sup>499</sup> Still, when it comes to the five themes, from a mainstream perspective, Delorme Smith’s story is perplexing because it does not seem to engage with any of these matters.

Unravelling at least some of the puzzle requires examination of Delorme Smith’s memoir as published in *Canadian Cattlemen*, so as to compare it to *Fifty Dollar Bride*. The two versions are (as expected) generally similar, except that Delorme Smith originally wrote in the first person, while Carpenter has shifted the text into the third person. In composing her version from these articles, Delorme Smith’s diaries, and other drafted material, Carpenter has also dropped some

495 MacKinnon, *The Identities of Marie Rose Delorme Smith*, 20-21.

496 MacKinnon, *The Identities of Marie Rose Delorme Smith*, 20; 33-34.

Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, 97-98; 134.

497 Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, 158.

498 MacKinnon, *The Identities of Marie Rose Delorme Smith*, 34-35; 77.

499 MacKinnon, *The Identities of Marie Rose Delorme Smith*, 59.

Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, Preface (unnumbered pages).

episodes not directly involving Delorme Smith herself from the published series. For example, Carpenter used only Chapter V of the fourth part of “Eighty Years on the Plains.”<sup>500</sup> Chapter VII of this instalment includes a brief account of “The Two Rebellions,” as well as the “Story of Almighty Voice,” and “Another Fugitive.” The latter two items treat two different examples of violent encounters between Cree men and the then North West Mounted Police.<sup>501</sup> These episodes and others like them are quite short compared to the biographical material, and the listing of items among the textual records of Delorme Smith’s fonds at the Glenbow Archives suggests they were written from contemporary newspaper clippings.<sup>502</sup> However, Delorme Smith did not engage with the five themes in these articles either, so their absence in the book is probably not a product of this filtering. Furthermore, apart from dropping non-biographical episodes and the person-shift, Carpenter has edited her grandmother’s texts very lightly. There is not a shift in perspective on how Delorme Smith came to be married between the earlier articles and the later book, for example.

A major focus for Delorme Smith is her home at Pincher Creek, the Jughandle Ranch. Unlike most Northwest Métis over her lifetime, 1861 – 1960, she had land and a stable home through the worst years of displacement and economic depression spanning 1870 – 1950. While there is no denying she had many years of struggle there, neither seeking recognition of Indigenous rights and title, nor living on a road allowance were part of her or her immediate family’s experience. Even when Delorme Smith provides detailed descriptions of women’s day-to-day activities while on the bison hunt and in camp, she presents these as a distinct, but past way of life.<sup>503</sup> Insofar as she notes Northwest Métis cultural distinctiveness, it is to emphasize they are

500 Marie Rose Smith, “Eighty Years on the Plains,” *Canadian Cattlemen* 11 (March 1948), 216-217; 220-221; 224-225.

501 Smith, “Eighty Years on the Plains,” 216-217; 220-221; 224-225.

502 Marie Rose Smith Fonds, “Series S0001 – Textual Records,” *Glenbow Archives Online Catalogue Search*, <https://searcharchives.ucalgary.ca/textual-records-36> (accessed February 27, 2023).

503 Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, 12-14; 22-23; 28-30; 35-37.

now past practices, and to show Northwest Métis as different from “Indians,” generally in a manner derogatory to First Nations. But her descriptions also suggest that perhaps Northwest Métis have contributed to worse behaviour on the part of “Indians.” Both types of statement fall close together early in Chapter 2 of *Fifty Dollar Bride*:

With the arrival of traders like Urbain Delorme, the Indians grew accustomed to goods strange to their palates. Now they hunted and trapped for more than their needs dictated and excess skins were exchanged for the trader’s tobacco, tea and cloth....

The Indians often followed the Métis, picking off unfortunates who strayed from the camps and stealing horses whenever they could. The Métis in turn developed a cunning and resolute will to become superior as hunter-warriors.<sup>504</sup>

On the question of ethnogenesis, there is a brief and simple account, consistent with the mainstream view of Northwest Métis origins circa 1972, when *Fifty Dollar Bride* was published:

A mingling of bloods and customs came together with the marriage of the swarthy Saulteaux woman and the slender Frenchman; the woman carried the genes of the turbulent tribe of the Saulteaux, while the Frenchman brought to his issue the way of the white, his scanty education and French culture. Their progeny were Métis.<sup>505</sup>

Delorme Smith is not anxious about the details of how this “mingling of bloods and customs” came about; they are presented simply as facts. Specific analysis of Northwest Métis origins, self-awareness, and land title began well after Delorme Smith’s passing in 1960.<sup>506</sup>

The Elizabeth Settlement and East Prairie Metis local histories share many formal qualities, including their ethnohistorical nature and the broad divisions applied to the material they cover, moving rapidly from a general overview of Prairie Métis history to a tight focus on each settlement. They are the outcome of projects led and carried out by women of the respective Northwest Métis communities, from basic research to writing and editing. Importantly, they

504 Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, 15-16.

505 Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride*, 18.

506 The earliest example I have found so far is Émile Pelletier’s *A Social History of the Manitoba Metis: The Development and Loss of Aboriginal Rights*, published in 1974 (Winnipeg: Métis Federation Press).

show how the Elizabeth and East Prairie Metis communities shared a concern about disrupted historical memory and cultural continuity, which these publications were meant to mitigate. Maureen Lepine, a student researcher for the Elizabeth Settlement local history, reflected, “Over the years we were told many kinds of stories but we never had a complete picture of how things really were in the past. Nor did we have an appreciation of the richness of life in the older days and just how many things the younger generation should be proud of.”<sup>507</sup> The East Prairie Metis research team emphasized their work with older members of their community on and off settlement, “The key resource that we tapped in this project has been the huge bundle of views and memories of the folks who live, or have lived, on the Settlement.”<sup>508</sup> In effect, these brief works focus on the themes of rebutting depictions of Northwest Métis as without culture or ahistorical, and recovering memories from the Road Allowance era. Each history begins by emphasizing the origins of the Alberta Métis settlements in Métis activism due to land loss and problems maintaining stable access to land for farming and building homes.<sup>509</sup> Then, via the words of the earliest settlers, the histories reveal that the “road allowance people” while poor, were neither destitute nor without skills and ability to self-govern. In fact, they travelled to the settlements to take up land using their own vehicles and bringing their own tools to clear brush and build new homes. According to the Elizabeth settlement account:

The first Settlers arrived early in the fall of 1939. At that time, the country around Elizabeth was thick with bush and they had a hard time trying to find an open space where they could pitch their tents. The first Settlers started to build their houses for the winter with only two teams of horses.... Most of the furniture in the first houses was hand-made.

507 Jacknife, *Elizabeth Metis Settlement*, v.

508 Carol Supernault, Mary Auger, Marcella Cunningham, and Velma Bellerose, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979: 40 Years of Determination* (Place of publication and publisher not indicated, 1979), v.

509 Jacknife, *Elizabeth Metis Settlement*, 1-4.

Supernault *et al.*, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979*, iii; 1.

...the people lived mainly by hunting moose, deer, rabbits, and partridge... A few men also went fishing at Cold Lake.

Our early settlers got much of their cash by trapping in the winter and selling the furs. In the summertime, they took out their camping gear and went looking for seneca roots. The women tanned deer and moose hides and made moccasins to sell. Every member of the family used to help pick berries for the women to sell.<sup>510</sup>

The East Prairie settlers lived similarly, and the elders' accounts explain that they travelled by horse and cart to the settlement:

Most of the settlers made their living by farming, trapping, doing odd jobs, and then, later on, logging timber. For food, most of their meat came from moose and deer, and vegetables from their gardens.

Housing then was mostly log cabins with sod roofings, with little or no flooring. Only a few people had lumber shacks.

[The Auger family] came to the colony in July of 1941. It took them about four days to get here, as they had an old broken-down wagon that needed fixing along the way.

Eddie L'Hirondelle [said,] When we came out to East Prairie to apply for land there were only horses. Then, when the cars came out, there were only two cars here.<sup>511</sup>

Each Métis settlement originally had a paid provincial employee, a "supervisor," to oversee the community. In the case of Elizabeth Settlement, this position was filled at the founding of the settlement by revered Métis leader Joe Dion. At East Prairie the position went unfilled until 1945, when the province sent a non-Métis teacher, Jack Kachuk, who then found himself butting heads with the community's established council.<sup>512</sup>

With so many things in common between these two histories, considerable space remains for differences between them. Elizabeth Settlement features numerous period photographs and an overall "narrative of progress" emphasizing the role of the Catholic church and of supervisors and school teachers who were often non-Northwest Métis outsiders. While the narrative begins

510 Jacknife, *Elizabeth Metis Settlement*, 10-11; 11.

511 Supernault *et al.*, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979*, 4-5; 13; 70.

512 Jacknife, *Elizabeth Metis Settlement*, 6.

Supernault *et al.*, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979*, 1; 41.

with a full description of early settler life with no amenities or pre-established farms or ready buildings, as noted in the quote on the previous page, in the next chapter the story leaps ahead to the 1960s. New amenities and easier travel begin the next section, which recounts many new buildings and social programs compared to the earlier dearth of all of these.

There have been many changes in Settlement life since the 1960's. The improvement of roads in Elizabeth during the 1960's strongly affected the community. In 1965, the Department of Highways responded to the community need for safe roads to transport school children within Elizabeth. Once the roads got better, members of the Settlement began to travel further to shop, do the laundry, find entertainment, and get jobs. In general the Settlers started to have more contact with outside communities.<sup>513</sup>

A full four pages of text and photographs focuses on the community's religious activities, religious education, and the first local Catholic priest, Armand Beaupré.<sup>514</sup> Information and vignettes from the interviews with older settlement residents were synthesized into chronological narratives on broad themes of community interest and a series of biographies for the final chapter. Each member of the Elizabeth Settlement research team speaks for herself in the prefatory remarks.

In contrast, East Prairie's history de-emphasizes the Catholic church and presents a more nuanced narrative of uneven progress and indirect critique of provincial policies affecting the settlement. Regarding the Catholic church, the longest comment about it is by Carol Supernault, who observes:

513 Jacknife, *Elizabeth Metis Settlement*, 25.

514 Jacknife, *Elizabeth Metis Settlement*, 36-39. These pages were very hard to read because Armand Beaupré was convicted and sentenced for indecent assault on a 14 year old male parishioner in 1990-1991. His attacks on the boy began in 1976, a year after he came to serve as pastor in the Cold Lake parish, which includes Elizabeth Settlement.

Diana Coulter, "Before Sex Began Teen Saw Priest 'Like a Savior'," *Edmonton Journal*, November 3, 1990, A7.

Diana Coulter, "Priest Ordered Into Sex Offender's Program," *Edmonton Journal*, March 2, 1991, C1.

Canadian Press, "Priest Apologizes," *The Globe and Mail*, February 11, 1991, A3.

While the highway was being built, a church was moved to East Prairie from Enilda. It was named the “Church of the Good Shepard [sic]”. It was a nice change to attend mass in a church instead of going to the old school for services.<sup>515</sup>

Older settlers’ narratives are quoted at length within themed chapters and make up the bulk of the longest chapter in the book. The elders narrate their own lives and that of the settlement as a whole. Both photographs and a judicious selection of original written documents frame the major sections. In order to characterize how the years of change have affected East Prairie, the research team asked elder Margaret Supernault to comment, and her two pages of reflection close the chapter, including her final comment:

Today there are good roads, children going to a good school, nurses and a hospital a few minutes away – yet the people are not friendly to each other. The friendship that was binding at the beginning is lost. Now people are trying to live as city people; trying to have more material things, to ‘keep up with the Joneses’ but they have lost one of the most important things – friendship.<sup>516</sup>

The East Prairie Metis research team produced a joint statement in their preface, rather than each providing personal impressions. They openly, albeit briefly, discussed how their work was affected by time and resource constraints, giving a strong and culturally correct hint that an updated edition should happen soon. The East Prairie Metis history has gone on to a new 2018 revised and expanded edition co-published by the settlement and Theytus Books,<sup>517</sup> while, unfortunately, Elizabeth Settlement’s history remains out of print. The new edition of East Prairie Settlement history adds more material on the roles and leadership of local women, an introduction by the community elders, and extends the narrative to 2018.

On a cursory reading, these Settlement histories are consistent with the theme of proving the existence of their own histories as opposed to outsider stories about themselves they retell. They

515 Supernault *et al.*, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979*, 89.

516 Supernault *et al.*, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979*, 96.

517 Constance Brissenden, ed., *Memories of a Metis Settlement: Eighty Years of East Prairie Metis Settlement, with Firsthand Memories, 1939 to Today* (Penticton: Theytus Books, 2018).

are, in fact, something more: the first recovered histories from the Road Allowance era. A significant number of road allowance community members relocated to the Alberta Metis settlements from central Alberta and adjacent regions of Saskatchewan. As the quotes above show, the histories emphasize Northwest Métis arriving by their own initiative, with the skills necessary to survive until they could build substantial houses, put in gardens, and so on. A few people came from farms left to other family members or that they feared they could not hold onto, especially those who went to East Prairie, but most did not.<sup>518</sup>

*Contested Sites and Provincial Anniversaries, 1980 – 2001*

I have discussed these two early Alberta Metis settlement local histories in some detail because they set the basic format and content range of those published for Fishing Lake, Gift Lake, Kikino, and Caslan (Buffalo Lake). They also mark the Alberta Federation of Metis Settlements Association's greatest foray into book or pamphlet publishing up to the present. In general, the Alberta Federation of Metis Settlements Association did not publish any documents or books except for its annual report. This has remained the case since 1990, when it was renamed the Metis Settlements General Council.<sup>519</sup>

Duke Redbird's 1980 book is one of a number of early monographs that invoke and recount a version of Northwest Métis history for explicitly political or land claims-related purposes. It is also exceptional in that it was written by a Northwest Métis person.<sup>520</sup> Up to the 1980s, education beyond the secondary level remained uncommon among those living in Northwest Métis communities, although the number of Northwest Métis who had gone on to trade school or

518 Supernault *et al.*, *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979*, 13; 56.

519 Metis Settlements General Council, *Metis Settlements of Alberta: Our People*, <https://msgc.ca/#ourpeople> (accessed October 1, 2022).

520 Duke Redbird, *We Are Métis: A Métis View of the Development of a Native Canadian People* (Toronto: Ontario Métis and Non-Status Indian Association, 1980).

entered trades after some time in the waged workforce was already growing. As a result, their social and political organizations hired legal and research staff from outside their communities to document and write reports and other documentation pertaining to Northwest Métis history and land claims. By the 1980s, more Northwest Métis were successfully completing university degrees, especially, although not exclusively, in law and anthropology. Redbird's master's degree is an interdisciplinary one from York University's Environmental Studies program,<sup>521</sup> and his thesis was published as *We Are Metis* in its revised form.

In this book, Redbird's focus is on challenging what he considers inaccurate depictions of "Métis" and recommendations as to how to counter and replace them, falling within the parameters of the third major theme in Northwest Métis historiography. He characterizes his book as "an examination of Metis history that proves that the Metis are in a strong moral – and legal – position to demand their aboriginal rights and recognition of their major role as a founder of Canadian confederation."<sup>522</sup> In this, he directs much of his attention to books by the early trio of mainstream historians purporting to define and document Northwest Métis history, Marcel Giraud, Joseph Kinsey Howard, and G.F.G. Stanley.<sup>523</sup> Redbird cites publications by Northwest Métis historians Howard Adams, Martin Dunn, and Antoine Lussier throughout his presentation, although his main engagement with Adams is to oppose Adams' political

521 Library and Archives Canada – Theses Canada, "Search Result: 461758126 – Redbird, Duke," <https://www.bac-lac.gc.ca/eng/services/theses/Pages/item.aspx?idNumber=461758126> (accessed December 30, 2021).

522 Redbird, *We Are Métis*, iii.

523 The major works in which these three men documented and represented early non-Indigenous views of Northwest Métis history are:

George F.G. Stanley, *The Birth of Western Canada: A History of the Riel Rebellions* (London: Longmans, Green, 1936).

Marcel Giraud, *Le métis canadien: son rôle dans l'histoire des provinces de l'Ouest* (Paris: Institut d'Ethnologie, Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle, 1945)

Joseph Kinsey Howard, *Strange Empire: A Narrative of the Northwest* (New York: Morrow, 1952).

Marcel Giraud, *The Métis in the Canadian West*, trans. George Woodcock (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1986).

positions. Redbird does not make explicit reference or connection to his own community or others despite making six claims intended to summarize the “Métis Perspective” of the time, that “Metis see themselves” as a distinct Aboriginal people capable of contributing to Canada and building their own future.<sup>524</sup> The resulting monograph hovers between history and political manifesto, revealing in its conclusion and appendix that Redbird’s audience is primarily Indigenous politicians and activists.

Olive Patricia Dickason’s first book is a product of the first Northwest Métis scholar able to carry out their graduate work in Canada, establishing a new perspective in “Canadian” historiography. Right up to the late twentieth century, colonial representations of Indigenous peoples started from the assumption of inherent deficit because they were presumed to be uncivilized: even the “noble savage” at minimum lacked “true religion.”<sup>525</sup> The unquestioned seer and centre in these works is the colonial eye, even in cases where an Indigenous person is the alleged speaker, as in Lahontan’s famous conversations with Adario recorded in his account of his time in North America.<sup>526</sup> It is striking then that Dickason opts to examine and indirectly question this colonial eye and the default narrative of an Indigenous deficit. She pursues an examination of “some of Europe’s responses to the richly varied spectrum of Amerindian societies during the sixteenth and early part of the seventeenth centuries.”<sup>527</sup> Dickason starts with an analysis of the ideas Europeans brought to the Americas and tracing their development, she then lays out a series of ethnographic sketches of Amerindian nations in New France, and finishes with examples of European actions in conditions of first and early contact. A reader

524 Redbird, *We Are Métis*, 55.

525 Olive Patricia Dickason, *The Myth of the Savage and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1984 [1997]), 31.

526 Baron Charles de Lahontan, *Mémoires de L’Amérique Septentrionale, ou la Suite Voyages de Mr. Le Baron de la Hontan, Tome Second* (Paris: Charles Delo, 1706), 228-310.

527 Dickason, *The Myth of the Savage*, xi.

would be unwise to expect this to produce a simple linear account, as Dickason explains, “Because attitudes and ideas cannot be reduced to a calendar, as can events, a strict chronology has not been maintained.”<sup>528</sup>

Although Dickason completed her dissertation in 1977, a lengthy production process led to it appearing in 1984, the year after her fellow University of Ottawa alumna Diane Payment’s thesis went into print. In comparing the thesis to the printed version, the main divisions of Dickason’s text persisted into the final text, while the subdivisions were reordered and revised. This is when the intriguing appendix on the term “Canadian” and how its meaning changed between the arrival of French traders and Confederation was carved out, and longer chapters were broken into several smaller ones. Payment’s thesis re-emerges little changed into its first formal edition, except for several changes to chapter titles and divisions. The dedication page to *Batoche* notes at the bottom, “Le Recherche en vue de ce travail a été réalisée sous les auspices de Parcs Canada en fonction du projet du Lieu historique national de Batoche.”<sup>529</sup> It was well-known in the 1970s – 1980s that Parks Canada opposed any suggestion that the new Batoche historical site could be used as a Northwest Métis political gathering place,<sup>530</sup> and this change suggests a subtle “depoliticization” of the text. The changes are certainly consistent with federal views of Northwest Métis as not having rights or title and *lack* of nationhood at the time. For instance, the last sections of the thesis Chapter Three change from “Question d’une réserve métisse,” and “Règlement de la question,”<sup>531</sup> to “Demande en vertu des droits autochtones,” “Le question de

528 Dickason, *The Myth of the Savage*, xiv.

529 Diane Paulette Payment, *Batoche (1870-1910)* (Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 1983), 8<sup>th</sup> unnumbered page after the cover.

530 Redbird, *We Are Métis*, 50.

Adams, *Prison of Grass* (1989), 179.

531 Diane Payment, “Batoche (1870-1910): Profil d’une communauté métisse, Naissance-Expansion-Déclin” (Thèse de maîtrise ès arts, l’Université d’Ottawa, 1982), iii.

*scrip*,” and “Demandes de *scrip* et de *homestead*.”<sup>532</sup> A reexamination of Dickason’s original chapter titles reveals two intriguing alterations, “The Original People of New France,”<sup>533</sup> which became “Amerindians of New France,”<sup>534</sup> and the apparent loss of the suggestive “New France: A Dream That Proved Difficult to Realize.” Dickason documents why she found “Amerindian” more congenial than such terms as “original or first peoples” or First Nations in her next book, released in 1992, discussed below.

The slowly growing number of university-trained Northwest Métis historians did not block ongoing participation by those trained in community and self-taught, like Anne Anderson. *The First Metis... A New Nation* is not a seamless whole, instead consisting of carefully curated and arranged images and summaries of historical documents and family-based oral histories. Despite an apparently elegiac framing, Anderson subtly undermines this as she carefully demonstrates the ongoing survival and success of her own community, the Northwest Métis of St. Albert. Her texts engage powerfully with the themes of demonstrating Northwest Métis self-awareness and persistence. This engagement begins with the table of contents, which reveals such pointed chapter titles as: “A New Nation – the Metis,” “The First Iroquois in the West – Names of First Metis,” and “The Land Which Belongs to Papachase [sic] (Gladu, Quinn).”<sup>535</sup> The third title would have raised eyebrows among non-Indigenous Albertans at the time, as this refers to the still ongoing controversy of the expropriation of the Papaschase reserve in 1888.<sup>536</sup> She challenges mainstream narratives fixated on Red River and repetitions of a story of Northwest

532 Diane Paulette Payment, *Batoche (1870-1910)* (Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 1983), 156.

533 Olive Patricia Dickason, “The Myth of the Savage and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas” (PhD Dissertation, University of Ottawa, 1976).

534 Dickason, *The Myth of the Savage*.

535 Anne Anderson, *The First Métis... A New Nation* (Edmonton: Uvisco Press, 1985), vi, viii.

536 Dwayne Trevor Donald, “Edmonton Pentimento: Re-Reading History in the Case of the Papaschase Cree,” *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies* 2, no. 1 (2004): 39-40.

Métis social dissolution starting in the first sixty pages. There she explains the St. Albert Métis' genealogical connections to Kahnawà:ke Mohawk men who came west with the fur trade.<sup>537</sup> Neither Red River, Winnipeg, nor even Batoche have chapters in the book, since it is "Alberta" focussed, but Anderson carefully traces the connections between the Alberta Northwest Métis communities to them and other eastern settlements of note. From there, Anderson brings together her materials in loosely chronological order, often marking changes of place and its sequence of events by an account of the generations of a specific family.<sup>538</sup>

In origin, *The First Métis* shares roots with the Alberta Metis settlement local histories produced around the same time, including a research team funded by the province and a rapid turn-around from inquiry to publication. Drawn from the ranks of students who signed up for the federal Summer Student Employment Program<sup>539</sup> in 1983, the research team delved into a range of archives for material, mostly in and around Edmonton, St. Albert, Calgary, Regina, and Ottawa.<sup>540</sup> Certainly, Anderson's project is a local history in many ways because its centre is the region marked by the Métis communities in Edmonton, Lac Ste. Anne, and St. Albert, but she pushes the form to its limits as she traces ancestors back to Red River, Montréal, and Kahnawà:ke; then their descendants out to Lac Ste. Anne, Crow's Nest Pass, and the Fishing Lake Colony. Though it is not seamless, the resulting text is certainly intended as a whole. In mainstream terms, its form remains a puzzle, and a person may well wonder if *The First Metis* is supposed to be among the gifts handed out at a family reunion. The nearest analogue I am aware of by mainstream historians is the genre of companion books such as *The World of Agatha*

537 Anderson, *The First Métis*, 57.

538 Anderson, *The First Métis*, vi-x.

539 Anderson, *The First Métis*, v.

540 *Ibid.*

*Christie*.<sup>541</sup> They are generally highly illustrated, following a loose chronological order, and directed at fans of a particular fiction author with a basic interest in the historical context of that author's work. *The First Métis* raises important questions about form taken up in the Indigenous critical theory-based section.

Diane Payment's study of the Northwest Métis community of Batoche from 1870 to 1910 led her to challenge the once common sense understanding that after 1885 it dissolved as its members dispersed.<sup>542</sup> Instead of a "simple" economy based on irregular subsistence farming, Payment found documentary evidence of a diversified economy blending merchandising at local stores, bison hunting, and freighting with farming.<sup>543</sup> This evidence also revealed Northwest Métis returned to their homes, farms, and stores after the worst of the aftermath of the Battle of Batoche.<sup>544</sup> Her 1990 revisions following the development of Batoche up to 1930 rely on a significant corpus of new data, both written and oral, demonstrating an ethnohistorical turn. Alongside a more detailed analysis and presentation of homestead declarations and scrip beneficiaries at Batoche, Payment draws on the few Northwest Métis statements from the period; some written, others transcribed as "told-to" narratives. It is Payment's overview of the oral component of this new data that first reveals her longer-term engagement with the Batoche community. Between 1976 and 1983, Payment had already carried out 28 interviews with elders supported by preparatory research and a questionnaire.<sup>545</sup> By this time, ethnohistory had developed a stable core tool set for

541 Martin Fido, *The World of Agatha Christie: The Facts and Figures Behind the World's Greatest Crime Writer* (Vancouver: Adams Media, 1997).

542 Payment, *Batoche (1870-1910)*, 5-6.

543 Payment, *Batoche (1870-1910)*, 132-135.

544 *Ibid.*

545 Diane Paulette Payment, "*The Free People – Otipemisiwak*" *Batoche, Saskatchewan 1870-1930* (Ottawa: National Parks and Sites Park Service Environment Canada, 1990), 13.

interviewing elders and analyzing Indigenous oral histories, learning Indigenous languages, eliciting context and interpretations from elders, and bringing older transcriptions and recordings back to community for re-transcription and re-translation. Nonetheless, Payment was writing a Parks Canada publication for a potentially broad audience, including many non-Indigenous visitors to Batoche. For the reader skeptical of the validity or utility of oral tradition, she briefly lays out how she tests and verifies it, emphasizing her long-term engagement with the Batoche community:<sup>546</sup>

[Oral history's] validity, much like that of the written document, depends largely on the skill of the researcher in evaluating testimonies and data. In the context of this study, prior intensive research was done to prepare for each interview whenever possible. In some cases, the testimonies of interviewees could be corroborated but generally, reliability of the testimony was strengthened through repeated contact and cross-checks, both formal and informal. A fairly large sample of 28 interviews, conducted at intervals between 1976 and 1983, and an adaptable questionnaire provided an information base for our analysis. Finally, my long-term involvement with and commitment to the project meant increased rapport with the community itself, and on my part, greater comprehension of its values and culture. Also, the elderly Métis interviewed had generally experienced or witnessed the way of life, customs, practices, and events they reported. Although time may have altered or perhaps romanticized their recollections, their 'long-term' memory, or the tendency of many seniors to remember the past better than the present, was also an important factor.<sup>547</sup>

Apart from expanding her study's evidentiary base, Payment has made several other important innovations in the course of her 1990 revisions. The preface now includes an explicit discussion of methodology that is complemented by her description of the twentieth century context of Northwest Métis historiography early in the Introduction.<sup>548</sup> Payment observes, "The 'new' social history has produced some of the most pertinent and balanced perceptions of the Métis, more specifically by viewing them within a society founded on the fur trade."<sup>549</sup> Indeed,

546 *Ibid.*

547 *Ibid.*

548 Payment, "*The Free People – Otipemisiwak*," 11-13; 17-19.

549 Payment, "*The Free People – Otipemisiwak*," 19.

she shows how the interdisciplinary and quantitative nature of her study is part of the latest developments in the field. The interdisciplinarity comes through in her gathering and use of oral testimony, and the quantitative nature in the analysis applied in the body of the text and summarized in tabular form in Appendices F – G: “Claims for Losses Suffered in 1885, Batoche and vicinity,” “Beneficiaries of Land Scrip, Batoche and vicinity, 1885-87,” and “Beneficiaries of Land Scrip, Batoche and Vicinity, 1900.”<sup>550</sup> Finally, a better publication budget allowed Payment to include more photographs of important social and political Batoche community members and views of fairs and construction projects. The overall effect of these changes brings the study closer in tone to the Alberta Metis settlement local histories, including its explicit engagement with the history of a living community. It is clear that community participation has added to the book’s questioning of previous presumptions about Batoche and Northwest Métis history, taking up themes of Northwest Métis as distinct and self-conscious people who persisted in action and thereby continue to have Indigenous rights and title.

This presentation of Indigenous peoples as living into the future, continuous with their ancestors, is a strong message throughout Dickason’s 1992 book. In many ways, *Canada’s First Nations*<sup>551</sup> is a mainstream history in its structure, which is chronological and follows the east to west unfolding of “Canada” defined by French and English incursion. Dickason endeavours to start her narrative, beginning as early as humanly possible, combining the contemporary mainstream archaeological and geological models of how the Americas were populated<sup>552</sup> with several Indigenous accounts. Sixty-four pages is a small space to pack an account of thousands of years across a vast territory, but it is far more than the more typical five to ten pages or brief

550 Payment, “*The Free People – Otipemisiwak*,” 337-342; 343-346; 347-350.

551 Olive Patricia Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992 [2002]).

552 Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations*, 3-16.

side bars in other Canadian history texts of the time. Terminology for Indigenous peoples and nations in Canada is fraught with complications still rarely dealt with head-on before the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1991 – 1996). Yet, Dickason confronts this in the opening pages, explaining how she will manage complexity in terminology for the duration of her text in the introduction, noting her preference for the today still little accepted (in anglophone circles) “Amerindian” as, in her opinion, a less ambiguous term than others such as “Indian,” “Native,” or “Aboriginal.”<sup>553</sup> The scholarly battles over the term “Métis,” from how to capitalize and spell it to who is actually referred to, were simmering but not yet in the open.

Northwest Métis do not feature explicitly in *Canada’s First Nations* until after the half way mark in the book, as is to be expected. Once they do, Dickason begins a recounting that hits the standard beats in a mainstream narrative of Northwest Métis history, which starts with Red River and the Battle of Seven Oaks, moves on to the 1869 resistance and Louis Riel, Manitoba scrip, the 1885 Resistance, more scrip, and fades out on the Alberta Metis settlements.<sup>554</sup> These beats fall between descriptions of sometimes parallel, more often interleaved portions of First Nations and Inuit-specific events as Dickason cycles through the four directions in each of the book’s main divisions. For example, in Part IV, “Towards New Horizons,” which covers the early nineteenth century, begins in the east, briefly turns to the far north, returns to the east and then takes up events on the prairies and continues west to the coast of what is currently called British Columbia in its first two chapters.<sup>555</sup> The next three chapters begin with events in the east again, but this time takes an excursion to the west coast before returning to the prairies and recounting events as they track across the land from Manitoba to the Rocky Mountains, and then again to

553 Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations*, xiv-xv.

554 Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations*, 241-251; 272-275; 285-290; 293-296; 346-353.

555 Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations*, 191-268.

the west coast.<sup>556</sup> As the lack of far northern coverage in the second half of this sequence suggests, this method of presentation is a guideline rather than a straitjacket. If there are no treaties, important trading encounters, or conflicts in the Arctic or Subarctic for the period covered by the chapters, Dickason does not return to them. All five themes in Northwest Métis historiography are present in the text, but they are relatively muted since it is a history treating all Indigenous peoples in what is now referred to as Canada.

“Told-to” narratives collected from Northwest Métis elders by outsiders were few and far between after World War I, then began to increase in number again after an explicit mention of “Métis” was added to the Canadian Constitution in 1982.<sup>557</sup> Outsiders remained most interested in chasing down the last few elders with living memory of Northwest Métis life in the nineteenth century, if not the Resistance movements during that period. Some outsiders attempted to help Northwest Métis document how they were driven from their lands in Manitoba. A difficult and well-meaning addition to the books developed from the second category is Ken and Victoria Zeilig’s work on *Ste. Madeleine, Community Without a Town*. Then Manitoba Métis Federation (MMF) president Yvon Dumont encouraged freelance reporter and radio journalist Ken Zeilig to interview the Ste. Madeleine elders on what had happened to their physical community in southern Saskatchewan during the 1930s.<sup>558</sup> The result consists of a preface and transcribed interviews by Ken Zeilig and a three-page introduction by Victoria Zeilig. She presents a “fact-based” summary of Ste. Madeleine’s origins, development, and apparent end, based on her

556 Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations*, 192-235 (Chapters 15-16); 236-268 (Chapters 17-19).

557 Canada, Department of Justice, *A Consolidation of the Constitution Acts 1867 to 1982*, c. 3 (30-31 Vic) and c. 11 (30 El. II), Section 35(2).

558 Caitlyn Gowriluk, “Long-Lost John Lennon Interviews from Winnipeg-Born Journalist Go Up for Auction,” CBC News (September 7, 2021), <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/manitoba/ken-zeilig-tapes-john-lennon-yokono-auction-wfpcbc-cbc-1.6190333> (accessed December 31, 2021).

Ken Zeilig and Victoria Zeilig, eds., *Ste. Madeleine, Community Without a Town: Métis Elders in Interview* (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, Inc., 1997), viii.

archival research on land tenure and farm rehabilitation policy in the 1930s.<sup>559</sup> Both Zeiligs are presented as co-authors on the front cover and back matter, but it is not clear what other material Victoria Zeilig collected. Ken Zeilig's preface suggests how risky it can be to engage a person trained in journalism rather than ethnographic interviewing for such a task. Going by Ken Zeilig's comments in the preface alone, the elders spun him a romantic tale of noble poverty in a place left untouched by time until its end, a strange contrast to Dumont's account of injustice and the cruel destruction of the town.<sup>560</sup> Having suggested that the differences reflect problems with elders' memories and, by implication, perhaps Dumont's politics, Ken Zeilig reassures us that he has acquired a relevant outsider's account to verify what happened.<sup>561</sup>

The Zeiligs' interventions aside, the actual interviews are not so romantic in content. The elders recount difficult years of poverty both before and after the Great Depression, including the loss of children and siblings and moving from other parts of Manitoba in hopes of taking up land for subsistence farming and commuting long distances for waged work.<sup>562</sup> They note how their poverty prevented them from paying back taxes, rendering them squatters on their land and unable to resist expropriation, a familiar issue in Northwest Métis history.<sup>563</sup> Sometimes with a bit of direct questioning, sometimes without, the elders added information about what they did for fun in their youth, but this is hardly the elders' focus.<sup>564</sup>

To be fair to the Zeiligs, their desire to validate the elders' interviews may have had as much to do with the publishers of the final book as general mainstream attitudes toward oral history at the time. That publisher was the MMF's independent non-profit, Pemmican Publications. Their

559 Zeilig and Zeilig, *Ste. Madeleine*, x-xii.

560 Zeilig and Zeilig, *Ste. Madeleine*, ix.

561 *Ibid.*

562 Zeilig and Zeilig, *Ste. Madeleine*, 106; 109; 111-112; 127; 133-134.

563 Zeilig and Zeilig, *Ste. Madeleine*, 124-125; 171; 117.

564 Zeilig and Zeilig, *Ste. Madeleine*, 165.

project began with a conversation with the president of the MMF, and it was printed and distributed by an MMF-affiliated business. The events covered by the interviews were disputed at the time because federal representatives insisted that Ste. Madeleine was not dispersed under the PFRA, and the MMF was reviving its long-running land claim case against Canada.<sup>565</sup> Therefore including verification from non-MMF-attached sources such as a non-Métis witness and a summary of documentary evidence does seem a sensible precaution.

In *Prison of Grass*, published in 1975, Howard Adams' purpose was to challenge Canada's image of itself and its relationship to Indigenous peoples, especially Northwest Métis, critiquing that image as based on egregiously dishonest sources and accounts. Twenty years later, the image remained firmly in place, and Adams was concerned "that eurocentric history and the politics of colonization are not widely understood by many Canadians, and particularly by Aboriginal peoples."<sup>566</sup> Frustrated but unbowed, Adams wrote *Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization* in order to explain both of these things, especially how eurocentric history enables Canadian colonialism to continue by adapting to new conditions.<sup>567</sup> Revisiting Canadian history from a "Native point of view," Adams includes a concise critique of Métis historiography as produced by non-Native historians, arguing that it is eurocentric and a method of intellectual colonialism denying them, and all Indigenous people true knowledge of their history.<sup>568</sup> He also provides a description of and programme for Métis and Indian history:

Métis and Indian history is both a movement and a discipline challenging eurocentrism. Intrinsic to our history is our people's sense of resistance and struggle that emerges from a growing counter-consciousness and realization that we have suffered injustices and oppressive inequalities because of our race and

565 Manitoba Métis Federation, "Understanding Manitoba Métis Federation Land Claims," Manitoba Métis Federation, [http://www.mmf.mb.ca/land\\_claims\\_landing\\_page.php](http://www.mmf.mb.ca/land_claims_landing_page.php) (accessed December 30, 2021).

566 Howard Adams, *Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization* (Penticton: Theytus Books, 1995).

567 Adams, *Tortured People*, 2.

568 Adams, *Tortured People*, 93-101.

colonization. As a movement, authentic Aboriginal history attempts to confront the inequalities in the justice, economic, and political realms; however, in order to do this it is first necessary to examine the processes and structures that promote and house racism.<sup>569</sup>

For the 1999 edition, Adams focussed on bringing the text up to date, including reordering chapters for clarity. He also added a four-page autobiographical forward after the Introduction titled “My Halfbreed Torture,” in which he recounts the personal cost of openly describing himself and his community to outsiders as Métis in 1965, including social ostracism and angry responses from his family and their neighbours.<sup>570</sup> It can be considered a forewarning of the struggles to come as Northwest Métis communities sought to uphold and enforce their right to determine who they are and who may claim to be them and speak for them. In many ways, Adams never gave up participation in the themes of rebutting inaccurate depictions and insisting on the ongoing existence of Northwest Métis as a people.

Adams remains a controversial founding scholar in Northwest Métis historiography by Northwest Métis historians. Uncompromisingly polemic and personal, his historical research and narration can struggle to take their place alongside his critique. He continued his development of Indigenous critical theory in an article published in 2001, just after his death, in *Expressions in Canadian Native Studies*, a wide-ranging anthology of theoretical perspectives by Indigenous scholars. In it, he reiterated his argument that mainstream versions of Aboriginal history are eurocentric and dishonest, while Métis and Indian history challenges this eurocentrism and dishonesty in an absolutely necessary way.<sup>571</sup> Throughout his academic career, Adams worked to

569 Adams, *Tortured People*, 35.

570 Howard Adams, *Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition, (Penticton: Theytus Books, 1999), follows page vi.

571 Howard Adams, “Challenging Eurocentric History,” in *Expressions in Canadian Native Studies*, eds. Ron F. Laliberte, Priscilla Settee, James B. Waldram, Rob Innes, Brenda MacDougall, Lesley McBain, and F. Laurie Barron (Saskatoon: University Extension Press, 2000): 40-53.

understand how oppressed people can be persuaded to accept their situation, and how to disrupt that persuasive process. Difficult as his language may be for readers accustomed to more sedate forms of academic writing, Adams' prose has an undeniable ability to spur productive analysis. Consider such pointed descriptions as: "'Discovery,' is obviously only a notion of European imperialism, and which applied only to vulnerable Indigenous countries. Wandering European pirates encroached upon any foreign land they sighted and plundered the homes of Indigenous citizens,"<sup>572</sup> or "State-sanctioned self-government is a move toward a deeper colonization and suppression by the global corporate state."<sup>573</sup>

There are many parallels between David T. McNab and Olive Patricia Dickason's historical publications, although their academic careers and areas of interest are quite different. Like Dickason, McNab's first monograph analyzes non-Indigenous perspectives and responses to Indigenous communities. In *Circles of Time*, he takes full advantage of new trends from social history that not only allow but even encourage authorial presence in the narrative as he recounts Indigenous-newcomer negotiations, including later phases that he was part of himself.<sup>574</sup> For the purposes of his study, however, McNab makes an interesting decision: he begins by discussing the Northwest Métis in Ontario, emphasizing that even the province acknowledged their existence and negotiated treaties with them, before continuing on to other cases.<sup>575</sup> But before presenting his study, McNab sets the stage with his understanding of how Indigenous people perceive history through time and place, stating "The concept of circles of time is not bounded by time or by place."<sup>576</sup> Referencing Miguel Leon-Portilla's study of the Mayan

572 Adams, *Tortured People* (1995), 9.

573 *Ibid*; 148.

574 David T. McNab, *Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1999), 1-7.

575 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 21-34.

576 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 1.

conceptualization of time-place and Kahgegagahbowh's (George Copway) description of a similar Ojibway understanding of time as defined by the Sun, McNab clarifies how time and place are connected:

Place is nature and the natural world. This world is animate, not dead. It has a life of its own and within nature is time and all living things, including mankind. This concept of history is alien to European-trained historians and is not very well understood.<sup>577</sup>

Without 'pen or ink,' First Nations remember and understand, through their stories, their internal and external landscapes of being and becoming. There are no boundaries and no beginnings or end points. In short, there is no periodization of history. Their history is both separate from and parallel to the history of Canada as understood by non-Aboriginal people – the history of the newcomers.<sup>578</sup>

With the question of how Indigenous history was understood and transmitted before Europeans arrived in the Americas, McNab then describes the impacts of this critical disjunct between Indigenous and European understandings of history. He emphasizes its negative impacts on treaty making and subsequent Indigenous-newcomer relationships and the present-day consequences. Those consequences include court actions, such as court cases dealing with Aboriginal rights and title, failed federal attempts to change the Canadian constitution, and Indigenous-newcomer clashes in Oka, Ipperwash, and Gustafsen Lake.<sup>579</sup> McNab bluntly describes the modern day treaty making and land claims processes as baroque and unfair, likening the latter to a nightmare income tax return that has no meaningful or fair resolution.<sup>580</sup>

After this thorough introduction, McNab provides a brief disquisition on Northwest Métis presence and influence in Ontario. There he finds an early expression of the central issue of Northwest Métis relations with the Canadian federal government to this day in the negotiations

577 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 2.

578 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 4.

579 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 3-19.

580 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 12-13.

for the Métis adhesion to Treaty 3 in 1875, “But the issue was whether the Métis could have status as Métis people, thereby reaffirming their Aboriginal title and rights. It was not a question of declaring their status as Indians or as whites.”<sup>581</sup>

The next seven chapters indirectly critique previous approaches to providing context for treaty and legal cases in Ontario. In the case of the Teme-Augama Anishnabai,<sup>582</sup> for example, McNab spends only the first three pages of their chapter detailing the litigation between them, the province of Ontario, and the federal government.<sup>583</sup> Over the next 17 pages, McNab details the historical relationship between the Teme-Augama Anishnabai and the British Crown from 1763 to circa 1976, including their attempts to resolve issues through negotiation.<sup>584</sup> In 1978, the thread of litigation begins as negotiations fail, as well as a sequence of desperate camps and blockades by the Teme-Augama Anishnabai to protect their lands.<sup>585</sup> He closes with a summary of the outcomes of the legal and on-the-ground struggles of the Teme-Augama Anishnabai as of circa 1996.<sup>586</sup> This is McNab’s procedure in each subsequent chapter: describe the Indigenous community’s efforts to maintain and resolve disputes with the British Crown by negotiation, then how the community resorts to litigation and/or blockades when talks stall or fail, and the most recent developments as of 1998.

By the final chapter, “Retrospect: Towards a Meeting Ground,” McNab shifts to an overt appraisal decrying a lack of engagement with oral traditions by Canadian historians and the subsequent impact of that lack on the comprehension of Aboriginal title and land rights.<sup>587</sup> The

581 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 29.

582 The Teme-Augama Anishnabai live on Bear Island in Lake Temagami, roughly due north of the town of North Bay, Ontario. Their chapter is in McNab, *Circles of Time*, 45-74.

583 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 45-47.

584 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 48-65.

585 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 66-72.

586 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 73-74.

587 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 187-199.

way to resolve current negotiations successfully and avoid further expensive legal actions and blockades must be grounded in oral tradition. McNab affirms that:

Alternatively, we must turn to spirit and intent, indeed to first principles. The treaty-making process, as understood by Aboriginal people through their Elders and their oral tradition, must become paramount. Fundamental to such an understanding is the respect which must be shown by white Canadians to the values, traditions, and history of Aboriginal people.<sup>588</sup>

Unfortunately, at the end of this epilogue, McNab had to report another barrier to such a turn, the Canadian federal government's 1998 failure to follow through on a promise to establish an independent land rights tribunal.<sup>589</sup>

In the distant view section, I mentioned the puzzling qualities of *Au temps de la Prairie*. On closer examination, such qualities derive from the book's origins, which stretch back to nearly twenty-five years before its release by Les Éditions du Blé. Marcien Ferland, a Franco-Manitoban musician and French instructor, had already compiled and published a book of Manitoba folk music, and had set out to produce a second volume of songs when he met Auguste Vermette.<sup>590</sup> Having found a Northwest Métis elder directly related to Louis Riel, and with the centennial of Riel's death rapidly approaching, Ferland did not miss the opportunity to interview him.<sup>591</sup> From 1981 to 1985, Vermette provided a description of daily life "on the prairie," a de rigueur account of the bison hunt, and a range of reflections and comments on Northwest Métis history in general and Riel's life in particular.<sup>592</sup> Ferland went on to present the edited interviews as 65 articles in the Manitoba French weekly *La Liberté*, starting with a teaser announcement on

588 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 192.

589 McNab, *Circles of Time*, 200.

590 Auguste Vermette, *Au temps de la Prairie: L'histoire des Métis l'Ouest canadien racontée par Auguste Vermette, neveu de Louis Riel* (Éd. Marcien Ferland, Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 2000), ix.

Annick Poussart "Marcien Ferland," *The Canadian Encyclopedia*, <https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/marcien-ferland-emc> (accessed December 31, 2021).

591 Bernard Bocquel, "Qu'on donne au peuple métis ce qui lui revient," *La Liberté*, January 25, 1985, 5, Winnipeg. Vermette *Au temps de la Prairie*, x-xi.

592 Vermette *Au temps de la Prairie*, 141-143.

January 15, 1985,<sup>593</sup> and the first article proper on February 1, 1985.<sup>594</sup> Re-edited again for the 2000 anthology edition, Ferland spent several pages describing his editorial choices before stating his views about the value and accuracy of Vermette's testimony.<sup>595</sup> In this, he reiterates many of his original points in the teaser announcement of 1985, including Vermette's fundamental honesty and accuracy. His program is not a Northwest Métis one, however. Consequently, Ferland does not engage with established lines of discussion by Northwest Métis historians, such as those encapsulated in the five themes.

*From Ethnohistories to Recording Northwest Métis Communities of BC, 2002 – 2018*  
*Au temps de la Prairie* was not the only project with a lengthy gestation period before appearing between two covers. The ethnography, or in Darren Préfontaine's words,<sup>596</sup> community biography, of St. Laurent by Guy Lavallée is not quite as pessimistic as its original 1988 draft. Despite Lavallée's understandable concern that younger community members are "Canadianizing" and losing fluency in Michif and other Indigenous languages, his account builds a picture of Northwest Métis adaptability and persistence. In his cautious estimation, the younger generations may be different, yet they are still Métis.<sup>597</sup> It is as if, at first, Lavallée accepted the hegemonic notion that Northwest Métis communities were fading away or were already undone by the imposition of Canadian control over their lands. Then on further research and consideration, that notion began to lose its grip between his time at the University of British Columbia in the late 1980s and the turn of the century so he began to shift the tone of the book towards the theme of existence and persistence.

593 "Au temps de la Prairie," *La Liberté*, January 25, 1985, 5.

594 Marcien Ferland, "Au temps de la Prairie: Un raconteur se présente," *La Liberté*, February 1, 1985, 8.

595 Vermette *Au temps de la Prairie*, xi-xix.

596 Guy Lavallée, *The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba: Their Life and Stories, 1920-1988* (Winnipeg: Self-Published, 2003), v.

597 Lavallée, *The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba*, xiii-xv; 121-125.

While some Northwest Métis historians may have been feeling pessimism or at least concern about the future of their communities, others were busy working on a new explosion of community histories that began hitting bookstores in 2003. *The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch* conforms to the format and range of topics already established in the much earlier Alberta Métis settlement histories and the “told-to” narratives. Unlike those earlier examples, the Métis of Willow Bunch, through Rivard and Littlejohn, have a new program for this one: “Our purpose in this book is to tell the Metis side of the story. This has never been done before.”<sup>598</sup> Furthermore, they firmly declare, “Willow Bunch is a Metis community. Long before any white settlers moved into the area, the Metis were here.”<sup>599</sup> Rivard and Littlejohn go on to thoroughly document the social organization, mixed economy, and Roman Catholic religion of the Willow Bunch community prior to the intervention of the Canadian and United States governments in the region. Like the East Prairie research team, they present a narrative of perseverance. This book also differs in format and length from its 1980s predecessors, taking up 268 pages, including a full set of footnotes and index in an 8.5 x 11 layout, and most notably in publisher. Rivard and Littlejohn self-published the original edition to considerable acclaim in Northwest Métis circles. As noted earlier, the second edition came out in 2019 under the auspices of Gabriel Dumont Institute Press.<sup>600</sup>

Between 2004 and 2007, Northwest Métis communities in British Columbia began to win greater visibility, partly through the leadership of anthropologist Mike Evans, a rotating cast of undergraduate and graduate students, and the indefatigable Prince George Métis Elders Society

598 Rivard and Littlejohn, *The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch*, ix.

599 Rivard and Littlejohn, *The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch*, x.

600 Gabriel Dumont Institute Press, “Catalogue,” <https://gdins.org/me/uploads/2019/09/Catalog-2019-Low-Res-Sept-2019.pdf> (accessed December 31, 2021), 23.

(PGMES).<sup>601</sup> The PGMES played a significant role in the community research study led by Mike Evans to recover the history of the Island Cache Métis in 2004,<sup>602</sup> and then went on to work with him as principal investigator again for *What it is to be Métis: The Stories and Recollections of the Elders of the PGMES* (2007). In each case, the combination of elder interviews, document reproductions, and historical research trace the connections between these Northwest Métis communities and their origins in the fur trade. Written with minimal theoretical apparatus and simultaneously released in hard copy and open access pdf format, the emphasis is on accessibility to a wide audience. As Evans notes in the introduction to *What it is to be Métis*, “Other books are available about the history of the Métis Nation, but this book is a bit different. Collected here are the histories of lives lived, and lives told, by the Métis Elders of Prince George.... The book is the Elders’ gift to their children and grandchildren, and to the children of us all. The project was launched because the Elders wanted to document their own personal and collective histories.”<sup>603</sup> The elders are engaged with the theme of Northwest Métis existence and uniqueness as post-contact Indigenous peoples.

The insistence on continuity between the recent and deeper past in these community histories is reiterated in a new “told-to” style narrative that deserves some special attention here. Released in 2005, *mihkwâkamiwi sîpîsis – Stories and Pictures from Metis Elders in Fort McKay* returns to the Northwest Métis stomping grounds of northern Alberta in a former fur trade, now heavily tar sand-impacted region. The front cover unequivocally shows the difference between this and many other “told-to” narratives. The list of presenters of the memories and photographs inside

601 Mike Evans, Marcelle Gareau, Lisa Krebs, Leona Neilson, and Heidi Standeven, *What it is to be a Métis: The Stories and Recollections of the Elders of the Prince George Métis Elder Society* (Prince George: UNBC Press, 2007).

602 Mike Evans and Lisa Krebs with John Eagle, Bob Parris, and Heidi Standeven. *A Brief History of the Short Life of Island Cache* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2004).

603 Evans *et al.*, *What it is to be a Métis*, 2.

include the participating elders (Alice Boucher, Zachary Powder, Howard Lacorde, and Emma Faichney), researcher Craig Campbell, and advisor and contributor Mike Evans.<sup>604</sup> Unusually, as Craig Campbell explains in the photograph index, the pictures that frame each elder's comments deliberately lack captions.<sup>605</sup> Even the cover photographs are left to tell their own stories, and the index only indicates the source collection because, as Campbell notes, "Sometimes it is hard to say who is in the picture or even who took the picture."<sup>606</sup> The commentary on archival photographs of Indigenous people and places in which the photographers took care to document themselves, the date, and their understanding of the location but without recording the names of Indigenous persons or places is plain.

Returning to 2004 and Northwest Métis scholars and communities from further east, this is the year that Heather Devine's University of Alberta history dissertation went into print as *The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660 – 1900*.<sup>607</sup> This project shares an origin with Anderson's 1985 book in genealogical research that led her to ask questions about ethnogenesis in one very extended family and the role of its branches in the development of a range of industries and communities.<sup>608</sup> Devine had access to quite different resources, including a growing theoretical discussion of ethnogenesis led by such scholars as John E. Foster,<sup>609</sup> Jennifer S.H. Brown, and Jacqueline Peterson,<sup>610</sup> more accessible archives, and genealogical societies. In the early 1980s, scholars were still trying to explain how meetings and

604 Craig Campbell, Alice Boucher, Mike Evans, Emma Faichney, Howard La Corde, and Zachary Powder (Presenters), *Mihkwâkamiwi sîpîsis – Stories and Pictures from Metis Elders in Fort McKay* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2005).

605 Campbell *et al.*, *Mihkwâkamiwi sîpîsis*, 65.

606 *Ibid.*

607 Heather Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660-1900* (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004).

608 Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves*, xi-xiii; 2-4; 7-8; 16-17.

609 Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves*, 4-6; 102-103.

610 Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown, eds., *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985).

subsequent ongoing relationships between Indigenous and European peoples in the Americas led to the development of new, self-aware communities distinct from both based on evidence rather than mythology.<sup>611</sup> John E. Foster proposed an influential model of “Western Plains Métis” ethnogenesis in 1994, arguing that fur traders who spent winters in Indigenous communities where they built social ties through trade and marriage. The children of those marriages, with their distinct upbringing by bicultural parents, would eventually intermarry and produce the Western Plains Métis.<sup>612</sup>

Devine’s starting point in genealogy proved fruitful as she opted not just to explore ethnogenesis by testing Foster’s wintering free trader model, but also to look beyond company records to better reconstruct the lives of engagé men, women, and children.<sup>613</sup> Furthermore, she applies the method of “controlled speculation” for the first time in a Northwest Métis historiographic context. This approach involves using information from better documented ethnographic circumstances to deduce what probably happened in a similar, but poorly documented or undocumented case.<sup>614</sup> Her study represents a tour de force and a guide to researching Indigenous communities more generally as well as the complexities of how different branches of the same family may come to have different ethnicities. To do so, she combined: genealogical data from primary sources, professionally vetted secondary genealogical records, scrip records, Hudson’s Bay Company archival materials, and Indian Affairs documents,<sup>615</sup> with a careful analysis of French and Indigenous naming practices.<sup>616</sup>

611 Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown, “Introduction,” in *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*. eds. Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985), 3-6.

612 John E. Foster, “Wintering, the Outsider Adult Male and the Ethnogenesis of the Western Plains Métis,” *Prairie Forum* 10, no. 1 (1994): 1-13.

613 Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves*, 11-15.

614 Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves*, 15-16.

615 Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves*, 211-217; 297.

616 Devine, *The People Who Own Themselves*, 223-235.

Having worked out the Desjarlais family genealogy, then she was able to trace its branches and generations, including their ethnicities, over 240 years. Devine's is the first Northwest Métis-written study on the theme of Northwest Métis ethnogenesis.

The early 2000s were also, for better or worse, the decade of reckoning with the residential school system in Canada, as First Nations and Inuit survivors of the schools and their families succeeded in enforcing a reassessment of its purpose and impacts. While Northwest Métis were not targeted for deculturation in these schools in an explicit manner as First Nations and Inuit were, they were not left unscathed by the system either. In 2006 Chartrand et al. completed an account of *Métis History and Experience of Residential Schools* under the auspices of the Aboriginal Healing Foundation.<sup>617</sup> It consists of three related reports. The first was a literature review by Larry N. Chartrand, a Northwest Métis lawyer and historian at the University of Ottawa. The second, by Tricia E. Logan for the MMF-Southwest Region, was also meant to be a literature review. Finding the volume and availability of documentation lacking for her study region, Logan gathered oral histories from Manitoba Métis survivors, a slow and ongoing process.<sup>618</sup> The third report by Métis Nation of Alberta staff person Judy D. Daniels takes a somewhat different approach while sharing a Northwest Métis-centred perspective. Covering a different document base than Chartrand and Logan, she pieces together quotations and statistics to establish a picture of the number of Alberta Métis students who attended residential schools and the conditions they experienced.<sup>619</sup> Many of Daniels' sources are documents held in the Provincial Archives of Alberta, including provincially commissioned reports on "Métis Education in Alberta," and copies of statistical reports completed

617 Larry N. Chartrand, Tricia E. Logan, and Judy D. Daniels, *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools* (Ottawa: Aboriginal Healing Foundation, 2006).

618 Chartrand et al., *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools*, 58-59.

619 Chartrand et al., *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools*, 99-102.

by the Indian Affairs Department.<sup>620</sup> The Indian Affairs Department took regular count of students in order to ensure it did not provide funding for any “non-Treaty” child, to whom it deemed Canada had no obligation.<sup>621</sup>

The darker aspects of Northwest Métis history have dominated most media, emphatically so among the monographs. Yet the balance began to shift towards the end of this decade. Retired lawyer George Goulet, a member of the prominent Manitoba Métis family, and his partner Terry Goulet began publishing on topics in Northwest Métis history in 1999 with *The Trial of Louis Riel – Justice and Mercy Denied*.<sup>622</sup> Their 2008 publication, *The Métis in British Columbia: From Fur Trade Outposts to Colony*, is of particular interest here. The Goulets’ work epitomizes three trends: exploring survival and continuance, emphasizing Northwest Métis as nation-builders (of whose nation varies), and the shrinking role of avocational Northwest Métis historians. In general, the Goulets engage in a now somewhat old-fashioned type of “great personage” history, starting, unsurprisingly, with Louis Riel and continuing to such figures as Amelia Connolly Douglas and Jane Klyne McDonald.<sup>623</sup> As a result, they are able to base their publications almost exclusively on primary and secondary documentary sources. For *The Métis in British Columbia*, this is an especially strategic base to write from, as the Goulets joined a growing chorus reiterating the long-term presence of Northwest Métis in the province. Unlike other members of that chorus, the Goulets were funded on this project by the Métis Nation of BC, the province, and the Canadian government, which may have inspired the careful assertion in their acknowledgements of their independence and discretion in

620 Chartrand *et al.*, *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools*, 140-141; 143-146; 189-190.

621 Chartrand *et al.*, *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools*, 125.

622 George and Terry Goulet, *The Trial of Louis Riel – Justice and Mercy Denied* (Calgary: Tellwell Publishing, 1999).

623 George and Terry Goulet, *The Métis of British Columbia: From Fur Trade Outposts to Colony* (Calgary: Fabjob Inc., 2008).

composing and presenting their research.<sup>624</sup> The role of historians as expert witnesses in land claims litigation and staff researchers for other legally and socially sensitive topics ensures continued scrutiny of who holds the pen in Northwest Métis history.

The unfortunate controversy over how to spell and capitalize “Métis,” smouldering since the publication of *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America* in 1985, had reached not merely open flame but outright fire status as mainstream insistence on denying the Northwest Métis right to self-definition intensified. In 1984, the year-old political organization, the Métis National Council (MNC), stated that when spelled “metis,” the word meant any person of Indigenous and European ancestry, but when spelled “Metis,” it meant the Northwest Métis.<sup>625</sup> This had the accidental effect of suggesting the MNC endorsed this racializing definition, and led to a great deal of frustration because such terminology was certainly not agreed on by the many people who could be affected by it. Northwest Métis political and social leaders – including the MNC executive – were soon fed up with being told that any person of “mixed Indigenous and European descent” must *de facto* be Northwest Métis. Pushback against this claim grew substantially throughout the early 2000s.

The second volume chronicling his own work on land claims cases affecting Bear Island and Toronto from the mid 1970s to the late 1980s and their historical context in 2009 also marked David T. McNab’s open acknowledgement of himself as a Métis scholar.<sup>626</sup> In this text he also revisited some of his earliest research on the colonial policies and views of Herman Merivale, permanent undersecretary for the British colonies from 1847 to 1860.<sup>627</sup> Despite the influential

624 Goulet and Goulet, *The Métis of British Columbia*, 2.

625 Metis National Council, *The Metis Nation I* (Fall 1984), 6.

626 David T. McNab, *No Place for Fairness: Indigenous Land Rights and Policy in the Bear Island Case and Beyond* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2009), 3.

627 McNab, *No Place for Fairness*, 20-38.

role of documents, including his own appointment books and diaries from his tenure in land claims-related work, McNab insistently frames his book as “comprised of stories and storytelling” and “personal reflections.”<sup>628</sup> He refuses to let the reader forget that he is an active player in the events he records, and that he is far from simply recording them, stating, “This study is an act of storytelling about the resistance of aboriginal people to imperialism – to the nation-state of Canada and specifically to Ontario as it relates to aboriginal land and treaty rights, including all forms of resource gathering and harvesting.”<sup>629</sup> Although not rising to the polemical level of Adams, this is far more candid than is typical of university-trained Northwest Métis scholars of the period, especially those with work experience in the federal or provincial public service, such as Heather Devine.

This brings us back to Diane Payment, whose latest update to her study of the Métis community of Batoche also falls in 2009, a far different book than its first incarnation in 1983. Fully informed by Métis elders’ interviews and contributions, from documents to oral histories, it has accrued an apparatus of maps, an index, and additional relevant appendices. The page of testimonials includes not just Métis elders’ endorsements, but also an acknowledgement from Marcel Giraud of *Le Métis canadien: son rôle dans l’histoire des provinces de l’Ouest* fame.<sup>630</sup> The foreword by Darren Préfontaine openly discusses the pressure Payment faced from her employers at Parks Canada to toe their historiographic line, which held that Batoche was the site of the end of the Métis Nation, and how she built relationships of trust with the Batoche Métis community.<sup>631</sup> Any lingering doubts about Payment’s independence of thought and interpretation are laid to rest by her “Review of Major Literature and Interpretive Trends Since 1985” in

628 McNab, *No Place for Fairness*, ix-x; 3-5.

629 McNab, *No Place for Fairness*, 8.

630 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, xv.

631 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, xi-xiv.

Northwest Métis history.<sup>632</sup> She does not hesitate to criticize Northwest Métis historians whose approach she disagrees with, illustrating the diversity of views among historians on the subject generally, segueing into a discussion of social, political, and religious diversity among the Northwest Métis. Payment countered the influence of mainstream assumptions that the Northwest Métis were just one more “savage” people who socially disintegrated on contact with “civilized” newcomers. As summarized above on page 192 in the discussion of the 1990 edition of her study, there she presented evidence of an organized Northwest Métis society with a complex mixed economy and a determination to stay in Batoche. In the 2009 edition, Payment presented more detailed evidence, including maps to show Batoche Métis participation in surveys, resurveys, and homestead entries as they tried to enforce recognition of their land rights.<sup>633</sup> She has also made it much easier for Northwest Métis historians to study and document their own history based on their own ways of knowing.<sup>634</sup> From here on in, the first three Northwest Métis historiographic themes, which tend to be more defensive in nature, fall steadily out of use.

By the opening of the 2010s, new research and publications concerning Northwest Métis communities beyond Red River and southern Ontario proliferated in part due to an influx of funding related to proposals for new or expanded oil and gas facilities. Subarctic lands throughout the Deh Cho, Athabasca, and Peace River basins turned out to have deep Northwest Métis histories interleaved with the even deeper ones of First Nations and Inuit communities. As anthropologists and linguists began collecting new data in this vast region, and historians and consultants began combing the Hudson’s Bay Company and Revillon Frères archives for relevant

632 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 1-18.

633 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 207-237.

634 This will be discussed in more detail below in the “Batoche: A Case Study Within a Case Study” section.

business records, a new picture became visible. What for a short while had been referred to as the single Northwest Métis language of Michif turned out to be a family of interrelated languages akin to those spoken by neighbouring First Nations.<sup>635</sup> Clothing and accessories commonly labelled “Métis” or almost any Plains First Nation on further examination and provenance testing turned out to be made by Northwest Métis across their traditional lands.<sup>636</sup> Those lands, far from being limited to the southernmost prairies, stretched along the former river basins central to the fur trade through and around the Rocky Mountains and north to the Arctic.<sup>637</sup> This would not have surprised those familiar with Devine’s study of the Desjarlais family or *Métis Legacy, Volume One*. Surprised or not, Northwest Métis historians now had to face the challenge of making sense of such extraordinary diversity that is nevertheless cohesive. In 2010, Brenda MacDougall’s study on Île-à-la-Crosse, Saskatchewan, demonstrated just how Northwest Métis historians would solve this problem.<sup>638</sup>

*One of the Family* presents MacDougall’s reading of Sakitawak (Île-à-la-Crosse) Métis history through the Cree concept of *Wahkootowin*.<sup>639</sup> As MacDougall explains, Cree was the major shared language in the Sakitawak region in the nineteenth century, and Northwest Métis of the area had predominantly Cree maternal ancestry.<sup>640</sup> The term *Wahkootowin* expresses a

635 Peter Bakker, *A Language of Our Own: The Genesis of Michif, the Mixed Cree-French Language of the Canadian Métis* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), 122-130.

636 Sherry Farrell Racette, “Sewing for a Living: The Commodification of Métis Women’s Artistic Production,” in *Contact Zones: Aboriginal and Settler Women in Canada’s Colonial Past*, eds. Katie Pickles and Maya Rutherford (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005).

Sherry Farrell Racette, “My Grandmothers Loved to Trade: The Indigenization of European Trade Goods in Historic and Contemporary Canada,” *Journal of Museum Ethnography* 20 (2008): 69-81.

Sharon Blady, “The Flower Beadwork People: Factors Contributing to the Emergence of a Distinctive Métis Culture and Artistic Style at Red River From 1844 to 1869” (MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 1995).

637 Leah Dorion, “Are the Métis a Western Canadian Phenomenon? A Case Study of the Dorion Trading Family,” in *Métis Legacy*, eds. Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, (Pemmican Publications: Winnipeg, 2001), 115-117.

638 Brenda MacDougall, *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010).

639 This is the spelling MacDougall uses, and I will follow it while discussing her work here.

640 MacDougall, *One of the Family*, 3; 7-10.

worldview of relationship and interconnection expressed in myriad types of action along the lines of interpersonal connection.<sup>641</sup> Here is a different approach to answering the question of Northwest Métis ethnogenesis that troubles many non-Indigenous scholars. By not starting from a heavily racialized framework, MacDougall was able to trace how the Sakitawak Métis gradually developed as a community, differentiating in a positive way from related First Nations and remaining distinct despite assimilative pressure from Europeans and later Canadians.<sup>642</sup> That is, the Sakitawak Métis manifested themselves through their relationships and behaving as good relatives. This is an entirely different narrative form from those emphasizing military engagements or fur trade mergers. As she follows the various kin interconnections over time at Sakitawak, MacDougall demonstrates how the Sakitawak Métis became a people and then used their kinship networks to adapt to change and overcome adversity.

Of course, to apply the concept of *Wahkootowin* in this way, MacDougall needed to map the Sakitawak families, including what, in mainstream terms, are referred to as genetic and fictive kin. For this purpose, MacDougall turned to many of the same genealogical sources as Devine and Payment. She was also able to use the newly available Metis Aboriginal Title Research Initiative “X” (Matri-X)<sup>643</sup> databases developed under the leadership of Frank Tough at the Universities of Saskatchewan and Alberta.<sup>644</sup> Tough is a well-known historical geographer in Northwest Métis circles, and maps of place names play an important part in this book, thus providing direction for MacDougall’s future projects. Maps depict more than fur trade routes and

641 MacDougall, *One of the Family*, 8.

642 MacDougall, *One of the Family*, 7-11.

643 Now known as the Métis Archival Research Lab.

644 Linda Goyette, “The X Files: By Signing Applications for Land Grants, Were the Prairie Métis Drawn Into one of the Largest Property Swindles in Canadian History?” *Canadian Geographic* 123, no. 2 (March/April 2003), 72.

Frank Tough, “The Establishment of a Commercial Fishing Industry and the Demise of Native Fisheries in Northern Manitoba,” *Canadian Journal of Native Studies* IV, no. 2 (1984), 303.

basic geography in this study; they show social spaces in which *Wahkootowin* is lived and enacted.<sup>645</sup> MacDougall is also the first scholar I have found who taps into the interview recordings and transcripts gathered from Sakitawak Métis community members and made available via the Virtual Museum of Metis History and Culture.<sup>646</sup>

The second to last of the monographs considered for this project is Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935's history, *Mark of the Métis: Traditional Knowledge and Stories of the Métis of Northeastern Alberta*, released in 2012. Compiled from archival documents and testimony from over a hundred elders, it includes many items we have learned to expect from this type of publication. That something different is in store can be gauged from the acknowledgements, which reveal extensive funding from oil and gas companies together with expert assistance from environmental consultants.<sup>647</sup> As a result, this local history includes numerous maps detailing the lands and waters with which the Fort McMurray Métis maintain relationships via gathering, hunting, naming practices, and burials.<sup>648</sup> It would be easy to read *Mark of the Métis* as defensive, considering the nexus between historical and land use studies and proposals to build new oil and gas infrastructure likely to, at minimum, severely curtail established land uses. However, the closing summary of the first chapter suggests otherwise. "The sense of community felt by the Métis has changed over the past half-century as people have adapted to new circumstances in their homeland. The truth remains that Métis culture is a vibrant, living and evolving force in northeastern Alberta."<sup>649</sup>

645 See, for example, MacDougall, *One of the Family*, 27 and 89.

646 MacDougall, *One of the Family*, 263.

647 Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935, *Mark of the Métis: Traditional Knowledge and Stories of the Métis People of Northeastern Alberta* (Altona, MB: Friesens, 2012), v.

Jamie Malbeuf, "'Almost Like a Miracle': McMurray Métis Discover Elder Interviews Thought Lost in Fire," CBC News (July 5, 2020), <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/edmonton/mcmurray-metis-elder-tapes-1.5635250> (accessed May 7, 2021).

648 For example, see Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935, *Mark of the Métis*, 12; 26; 52; 93-96.

649 Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935, *Mark of the Métis*, 45.

The final book considered for this case study is Chris Andersen's 2014 *"Métis": Race, Recognition, and the Struggle for Indigenous Peoplehood*. It is a closely argued work setting out a major critique of outsider naming imposed upon all people perceived as "mixed" in Canada's colonial, racializing logics, and developing another vital contribution to the pushback against these logics and the actions they support. This task demands a distinct selection of tools from the previous publications, leading to a book structured quite differently from the other academic Northwest Métis monographs. Applying two modes of expert analysis, one sociological and one historical, Andersen presents his arguments and findings in a series of five interlaced chapters, capped as usual with an introduction and conclusion. Perhaps against expectations, he begins by tracing the "administrative concept" of "mixedness" or "hybridity" of Indigenous and European "races."<sup>650</sup> He demonstrates how this external, colonial idea impacts Northwest Métis individuals, Northwest Métis communities, and academic research touching on Northwest Métis history and culture.<sup>651</sup> To explicate the impacts of the racializing concept of "mixedness" in greater detail, Andersen switches to his more sociological mode in the next chapter and examines the Canadian Supreme Court decision in *R. v. Powley* and Statistics Canada's conflation of Métis as mixed with Métis as a nation.<sup>652</sup> The former is a widely celebrated result of "the only s. 35 Métis harvesting rights case to come before the Supreme Court of Canada,"<sup>653</sup> the latter another episode in the controversial history of the federal ways of counting Indigenous peoples in the census. To this point, Andersen centres his discussion on a dissection of the ideas and uses of "mixedness," but he is also intent on

650 Andersen, "Métis," 26-27.

651 Andersen, "Métis," 51-57.

652 Andersen, "Métis," 59-60.

653 Andersen, "Métis," 59.

presenting an alternative to reproducing narratives and practices that interfere with both Northwest Métis and wider Indigenous self-determination and peoplehood.

Andersen switches back to a mainly historiographic mode for his third chapter, an account of Northwest Métis “as a nation or people with specific roots and thus specific histories,”<sup>654</sup> not an amorphous category full of people with some claim to Indigenous and non-Indigenous ancestry. To label someone “Métis” merely because they have both Indigenous and non-Indigenous ancestors and therefore are “mixed-bloods” is a racializing tactic, as is claiming only “full-bloods” are “real Indians.” Through an Indigenous-style recounting of particular relationships and histories, he also takes up the issue of how organizations like the Métis National Council can resist colonial definitions of “Métis” that weaken Northwest Métis as a nation and in their relationships with other Indigenous peoples. In doing so, he applies Bonita Lawrence’s analysis of how Canadian authorities have taken advantage of “mixed-bloodness” as a means to interfere with the membership of First Nation communities and undermine their Indigenous rights.<sup>655</sup> Going back to sociological mode, Andersen reanalyzes the Canadian census and *R. v. Powley* again while applying his understanding of Northwest Métis in terms of places, relationships, and histories. He emphasizes that just because the Supreme Court and Statistics Canada try to impose a sharply limited and racialized view on Northwest Métis, that does not mean there is no evidence or means available for Northwest Métis to counter this imposition. Andersen repeatedly challenges legal and political tactics that, in seeking to fight colonial, racializing policies, reproduce them by using a community definition based on claims of “mixed-blood” rather than on its unique history and social relationships.

654 Andersen, “Métis,” 91.

655 Bonita Lawrence, *“Real Indians” and Others: Mixed-Blood Urban Native Peoples and Indigenous Nationhood* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2004), 14-15; 43-46.

For his final chapter, Andersen takes up a case of what he refers to as (mis)recognition by the NunatuKavut Community Council, who, under the influence of the colonial concept of “mixedness” referred to themselves as “Labrador Métis” until the late 2000s. The NunatuKavut Council found this was not the effective strategy for pursuing land claims and recognition they expected, and worse yet, it obscured their unique history and relationships to neighbouring Inuit communities. The strategy allowed the mainstream press and Canadian government officials to suggest that the NunatuKavut Council’s land claims undermined or confused those of their kin, the Labrador Inuit, an unintended and unwanted effect.<sup>656</sup> His sensitive and careful discussion demonstrates the destructive double-bind that racializing narratives create for other post-contact Indigenous communities, and how the alternative approach he advocates does not reproduce this double-bind but instead supports their future as distinct, self-determining peoples.

### ***A Closer View in Indigenous Critical Theory Mode***

Since the Northwest Métis are a post-contact Indigenous people, logically enough, the earliest examples of Northwest Métis historiography seem inchoate in nature. Even as Northwest Métis communities began forming and developing syntheses of Indigenous and European methods of encoding and transmitting their unique and interwoven histories, they were dealing with an exceptionally hostile environment. Colonial officialdom and a significant number of newcomers were firmly committed to euro-forming<sup>657</sup> the so-called “new world” and therefore inclined to discourage accounts that were in any way challenging to their narrative of progress and civilization. As the next chapter will show, Indigenous communities with an accepted historical tradition, access to the new printing press, and the ability to speak as experts in their own right

656 Andersen, “Métis,” 185-189; 189-196.

657 Barbara A. Mann, “Epilogue: Euro-Forming the Data,” in *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom*, eds. Donald E. Johansen, Donald A. Grinde and Barbara A. Mann (San Jose: Clearlight Publishers, 1998), 160-189.

could stand against these difficult conditions from the start. Northwest Métis had to start somewhat from the back foot in areas where their communities and economies had been disrupted by settler incursions. Although there were always Northwest Métis with sufficient formal education and fluency in English or French to write for themselves, this did not guarantee their participation in such burgeoning venues as periodical writing. Nor did Northwest Métis endowed with these advantages necessarily refer openly to themselves as “Halfbreed,” “Métis,” or even “country-born.” Yet Northwest Métis communities maintained internal oral histories, and the most politically active began consciously creating written archives almost immediately, especially if they were part of the resistance movements of the late nineteenth century.

Perhaps then, “inchoate” is too pessimistic a descriptor. Early Northwest Métis historiography, as received in published form, is certainly less organized and straightforward than its Haudenosaunee counterpart. The apparent trend from a lack of form, to cohesive stories, to more developed accounts is not a Northwest Métis product. This sequence describes the evolution of outsider accounts of Northwest Métis life prior to the imposition of British and later Canadian control. The general shift in the selected monographs from more individualized records with elements of personal memoir to community-based projects and studies of broader questions is real. However, this shift tracks access to non-Indigenous historiography methods most directly, rather than Northwest Métis historical sense and record of past events as such. With that caveat set out, the discussion below will be far less chronological in nature, considering the monographs in divisions in terms of form, place, and who guides the creation of the histories as ultimately published.

### *Early Style “Told-To” Narratives and Popular Histories*

In a Northwest Métis context, “told-to” narratives and popular histories are closely related. The former is most often the basis for the latter, with a secondary role played by the Hudson’s Bay Company Archives. By early style “told-to” narrative, I mean one constructed from answers to structured interview questions, then re-edited to fit under specific headings. Ferland’s version of Auguste Vermette’s memoirs is a perhaps extreme example, while Guillaume Charette’s treatment of Louis Goulet’s reflections is less interventionist, and the Ste. Madeleine elders firmly resisted Ken Zeilig’s efforts to apply the same technique. By popular history, I refer to a form and approach that also tends to favour reporting over interpretation, and seeks to represent a facet of Northwest Métis history in terms of the broader nation, rather than focusing on a specific community. This section considers two items of this type: Goulet and Goulet’s account of Northwest Métis in British Columbia and Chartrand, Logan, and Daniels’s composite grey literature publication *Métis History and Experience of Residential Schools*. While gathering and analyzing these items, I expected the instigators of each one to be an outsider with little, if any sense, of the Northwest Métis tradition as opposed to a romantic idea of the “old northwest.” There is no escape from idealized portraits of the past, whether the instigator or guiding editor and writer was Northwest Métis or not; however, my expectation about who started each project was, in fact, incorrect. Of the five examples considered in this section, only one is a product of outsider impetus, and that impetus was from a near neighbour outsider from the Franco-Manitoban community.

Extensive editing and rearrangement make it much more difficult to identify Northwest Métis-specific modes and traditions. Even preservation of references to the picturesque and exotic for non-Indigenous readers is less than forthcoming. Marvellous as the brief account of

kinnikinnick smoking by Auguste Vermette or a reference to the Cree term adopted for children related by marriage noted by Louis Goulet are,<sup>658</sup> these are rather superficial details. Conversely, even Louis Goulet, who repeatedly insists that he had nothing to do with the more political events of 1885, still has a pointed counter-story to more mainstream contemporary views of the “Frog Lake Massacre.”<sup>659</sup> Vermette is familiar with Louis Goulet’s memoirs, referring to them during one of his meetings with Marcien Ferland.<sup>660</sup> Yet even more tantalizing and indicative of an independently maintained Northwest Métis tradition is Vermette’s explanation of the low view of former Resistance leader turned Queen’s witness Charles Nolin that was held by many among his relatives and community, including his observation that his father did not much care for Didyme Lépine either.<sup>661</sup> Howard Adams, the great-grand-nephew of this same Didyme Lépine, independently reports a similar view of Charles Nolin with additional document-based arguments.<sup>662</sup> The indirect evidence of a shared oral tradition continues with the Ste. Madeleine elders. In the course of answering Ken Zeilig’s queries, Harry Pelletier mentions Auguste Vermette among the relatives of those who left the Red River area to build new homes in southern Saskatchewan.<sup>663</sup>

Another powerful indication of the use of *wahkôtowin*, relatedness, as a means of organizing and retelling Northwest Métis history is in a brief and stark episode from Louis Goulet’s description of life during a bison hunt expedition in his youth. It is also a rare example of an early reference to a specific Northwest Métis place encoded with stories. Until this moment in

658 Vermette, *Au temps de la Prairie*, 21.

Charette, *L’Espace de Louis Goulet*, 61.

659 Charette, *L’Espace de Louis Goulet*, 159-170.

660 Vermette, *Au temps de la Prairie*, 29.

661 Vermette, *Au temps de la Prairie*, 105; 128.

662 Adams, *Prison of Grass* (1989), 84-89; *Prison of Grass* (1975), dedication.

Ron Laliberté, “Adams, Howard (1921 – 2001),” Indigenous Saskatchewan Encyclopedia,

[https://teaching.usask.ca/indigenoussk/import/adams\\_howard\\_1921-2001.php](https://teaching.usask.ca/indigenoussk/import/adams_howard_1921-2001.php) (accessed September 21, 2021).

663 Zeilig and Zeilig, eds., *Ste. Madeleine*, 142.

the narrative, the outside reader might be almost lulled into expecting the rosy-tinted story to continue in the same vein because this is a scene from Goulet's childhood.

Avant d'arriver à ce dernier endroit [Beaver River] nous avons fait détour, par la Coquille Pilée pour faire plaisir aux vieux qui l'appelaient la Cotchille Pilée. C'était une plaine d'à peu près cent à cent milles carrés, tout couverte d'arbustes...

Les vieux tenaient à passer par là, parce qu'il y a soixante ou soixante-quinze ans c'était un lieu populaire d'hivernement. Une année, une groupe de cent à cent cinquante familles métisses de la Rivière-Rouge s'y étaient installées pour hiverner. À coté, se trouvaient un gros camp d'Indiens Cris fut attaqué durant l'hiver par une forte épidémie de grosse picote. Des chiens transportèrent des germes de la terrible maladie dans la camp d'hivernement métis, ce qui le décima totalement dans l'espace de quelques jours. Pas un seul Métis ne s'en réchappa. Il n'y a resta même personne pour donner la sépulture aux victimes...<sup>664</sup>

The most likely candidate for the smallpox epidemic that struck the two camps is the one that tore through the Great Plains region circa 1836 to 1840.<sup>665</sup> The place, Coquille Pilée, is near Oak Lake in southwest Manitoba, a regular stopping point for Northwest Métis buffalo brigades and families more generally on their way west to winter in the Cypress Hills.

Of course, *wahkôtowin* does not always appear in "told-to" narratives in this way. To his credit, Ken Zeilig included the questions he asked of the Ste. Madeleine elders in the final text of *Ste. Madeleine, Community Without a Town*, and they reveal his search for a very different story. The sought-for story is one in which one or perhaps two local villains oversee the destruction of the town in favour of a cow pasture. Although he also records that his main interviewee, Joe Venne is present at the only two interviews with women for the project, those with Agnes Boucher and Lena Fleury, Zeilig makes no other comment to explain why Venne should be there or his relationship to them, if any.<sup>666</sup> Yet the majority of his interviewees are related by birth, if not marriage, and the story they emphatically want to tell is about the Ste. Madeleine Church,

664 Charette, *L'Espace de Louis Goulet*, 78-89.

665 James Daschuk, *Clearing the Plains: Disease, Politics of Starvation, and the Loss of Aboriginal Life* (Regina: University of Regina Press, 2013), 66-70.

666 Zeilig and Zeilig, *Ste. Madeleine*, 80; 152.

which still defines the place for them, including shared ceremonies at Ste. Madeleine. All of this is not intended to find fault with Ken Zeilig, who was primed for a very different task when Yvon Dumont asked him to interview the Ste. Madeleine elders, but to acknowledge that the elders managed to tell a different story anyway.

Two features draw the two popular histories into relationship with these “told-to” narratives. First, they also make use of some transcribed oral testimony, especially in *Métis History and Experience of Residential Schools*, in which two of three contributors resorted to preliminary oral testimony collections to test and supplement problematic documentary evidence.<sup>667</sup> Second, these are also early in style, directed primarily to an outsider audience and intended to show how Northwest Métis were directly involved in the events and institutions discussed in the texts. The Goulets are not engaged in capturing a record of past events before they are lost so much as opposing a mainstream history tendency to revise away Northwest Métis action and presence in British Columbia. As a result, there are few references to transcribed speech or even the memoirs and letters of the literate Northwest Métis featured in their narrative. This shift in rhetorical tactics is quite striking across the group of works considered in this section. Direct quotes and elders’ statements feature most prominently when the story is inclined more towards a critique of colonial policies and actions. They are not nearly so evident when the author or editors construct a story that tends to extol Canada as a society blending many cultures. In the Goulets’ study, this construction is quite overt by the close of their text, when they declare Canada a multicultural haven. Their use of this concept is unique among Northwest Métis historians discussed here.<sup>668</sup> Ferland’s arrangement of Auguste Vermette’s memories is consistent with this multicultural

667 Chartrand *et al.*, *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools*, 78-80; 89-93; 155-156; 158-160.

668 Goulet and Goulet, *The Métis in British Columbia*, 191-193.

model of Canada in that his project began as part of a newspaper series primarily for a settler, especially Franco-Manitoban audience.

*Batoche: A Case Study Within a Case Study*

Having already considered “told-to narratives” and popular histories of an early style in the previous section, it is time to examine the product of Diane Payment’s long historiographic relationship with the Northwest Métis community of Batoche. I have already observed that her work on this project made it easier for Northwest Métis historians to base their historiographic writing in their own ways of knowing,<sup>669</sup> but I did not get more specific than mentioning direct community participation. This section will provide more detail. The controversial development of the history of the Métis community of Batoche versus that of the Canadian National Historic Site of Batoche<sup>670</sup> provides many examples of Northwest Métis historiographic adaptations and subversions. A deeper analysis using Indigenous critical theory upholds the growing role of *wahkôtowin* and its status as a Northwest Métis epistemological concept in her work. Further, it enforces important revisions to my original acceptance of buffalo hunt organization as having similar salience. That early acceptance is not wrong, but it is, at best, oversimplified: buffalo hunt organization is a practical application of the epistemological concept at hand rather than the best way of naming it.

Payment’s most recent edition of the Batoche community study, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, includes revealing and important reflections on her own work over thirty years in community, as well as her understanding and experience of engaging with oral histories. While acknowledging that “the understanding of Métis culture cannot be based on Euro-Canadian

669 At page 213.

670 Parks Canada. Batoche National Historic Site, <https://www.pc.gc.ca/en/lhn-nhs/sk/batoche> (accessed January 23, 2022).

theoretical models,”<sup>671</sup> it is a real challenge for her to escape them, as the continuation of the quote shows:

There is a requirement to describe the society from within or according to culturally based open and flexible frameworks and, in the case of oral history, stories rich in meaning but sometimes ambivalent and rarely definitive. There is a system of checks and balances in a community to ensure that the appropriate people are interviewed. Elders or spokespersons at Batoche identified the people who should be interviewed or who were respected for their integrity and knowledge. These “keepers and transmitters of knowledge” expressed different views and varying interpretations of events such as the 1885 Resistance and issues such as land claims. No oral history account and tradition remains intact over time. Each teller brought his or her own perspective to the account or emphasized certain facts depending on the time, the audience, and the purpose. Métis oral histories tend to stress family and genealogy, resistance to external or outside authority, mobility, homeland, and cultural values. Family and kinship ties shaped [sic] Métis society. Interpersonal alliances guided [sic] the strategic behaviour that ensured [sic] cultural continuity, community development, and external relations. In this inquiry, I have strived to be unbound by my own categories and open to discovery and challenge, with the realization that an unbiased or objective history is impossible.<sup>672</sup>

On the one hand, this is a brilliant encapsulation of Northwest Métis oral traditional history recording and transmission. On the other hand, although she is working with a living Northwest Métis community that is able to share oral history using its established mechanisms to this day, her description subtly undermines it. Nevertheless, her persistence and willingness to acknowledge that her views will inevitably inflect the text are exemplary in the politically fraught context of the contested history of Batoche. There is no question of her integrity and commitment as a historian in a sensitive political context within the Batoche Métis community as well as with her own employer, Parks Canada.

The 1990 edition of Payment’s study, based on a core of the original translated and revised four 1983 chapters plus a new chapter describing Batoche Métis society and culture, now seems

671 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 19-20.

672 *Ibid.*

somewhat awkward. Its cover suggests a different emphasis, turning from a landscape view that suggests an abandoned ghost town in 1983 to a powerful Arcand family photograph from the turn of the twentieth century. Payment herself remains a somewhat ghostly presence. By the 2009 edition, the Arcand family still graces the cover along with images suggesting Northwest Métis women's bead and embroidery work. There is yet another new chapter, this one to bring *a* – not *the* – history of the Batoche Métis community up to 2005, and it is very special. Not only does Payment give further information about her methodology and sources, but she also reveals her own family ties to the Northwest Métis.<sup>673</sup> Although she does not use the term, this new edition and this chapter, in particular, reinforce the ways in which *wahkôtowin* has helped her restructure and build upon the earlier work, including finding a means to reflect the existence of more than one story that may be impossible to bring into agreement with one another. Her longterm relationship with the Batoche Métis community and how she worked with the oral traditions shared by elders is discussed in the “Contested Sites and Provincial Anniversaries, 1980 – 2001” section of the Closer View in a Mainstream Mode.<sup>674</sup> It is through these very practices that her work was reshaped by *wahkôtowin*. She concludes the chapter with a brief overview of the origins and development of the Canadian National Historic Site of Batoche from the 1960s up to 2005, reinforcing the point that while the original village of Batoche is technically a ghost town, visitors have actually been interacting with the Batoche Métis there and learning some of its stories for decades.

This 2009 edition is also the one in which Payment is able to directly show her connections to what could be called the scholarly *wahkôtowin* of the Northwest Métis intellectual tradition.

Her reference in 1983, “Les sources manuscrites et dites traditionnelles peuvent aussi être ré-

673 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 249-252.

674 See page 193.

examinées dans une nouvelle perspective; c'est-à-dire du point de vue des Métis,"<sup>675</sup> evokes the subtitle of Howard Adams' first book *Prison of Grass*. Her discussion of the "dichotomy of savagery and civilization" suggests a serious engagement with Emma LaRocque's work on this very issue in the context of Northwest Métis people. Not only are they cited in the footnotes and the full bibliography, but Payment is able to give them both, among many other Northwest Métis scholars, overt recognition in the historiographic section of the 2009 Introduction.<sup>676</sup>

Accordingly, she also briefly comments on the purported ambiguity as to who the Métis were due to the lingering racialized definition of the term and its attendant weight on the historiography of many post-contact Indigenous peoples whose main communities are within Canada's borders today.<sup>677</sup> The challenges to that racialization, and related critiques of how it tends to support social disintegration via federal and provincial legislative and legal objectives appear in print mostly after 2010. Understandably, these challenges and critiques tend to come from scholars outside federal or provincial public services.

After considering the role of *wahkôtowin*, there seems little space for buffalo hunt organization to have any particular effect on the complex narrative Payment has developed with the Batoche Métis, some of their neighbours, and Parks Canada officials. This is not to say that this organizational mode is not important, as it is widely accepted that it provided the governance structures based on an elected hunt captain and lieutenants re-applied by the Saint Laurent council in 1873. Furthermore, Payment reiterates the observation of G.F. Stanley that the Batoche Métis were self-governing successfully using their own experience and customs.<sup>678</sup>

Buffalo hunt organization is by no means a Northwest Métis invention, of course. It is an

675 Payment, *Batoche (1870-1910)*, 4-5.

676 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 1-18.

677 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 21.

678 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 125.

adaptation of the techniques used by First Nations on the Great Plains, including the Plains Cree, Saulteaux, Nakota, and Dakota, to whom many Batoche Métis had and have ongoing family ties. Through the buffalo hunt organization, strong elements of direct democracy and openness allow adjustments to be made as it concerns the local conditions of the land and neighbouring peoples. There is flexibility and a willingness to make changes, but in terms of shared principles.

In wrestling with this, I found myself thinking back to Robert Alexander Innes' study of cultural kinship practices at Cowessess First Nation, *Elder Brother and the Law of the People*.<sup>679</sup> In this study, the "Law of the People" is a near-synonym to *wahkôtowin*, so it is not really available to reuse to refer to the ability to adjust to place that I have in mind here, even though this ability is inextricably related to it. Even the contemporary Michif term *kaa-tipeyimishoyaahk* "they own or govern themselves," applied by Adam Gaudry is a bit too specific, although it too is not separable from what I am trying to describe.<sup>680</sup> Within my own Northwest Métis community, most of us are not fluent Michif or Cree speakers, yet we often refer to knowing where we are and learning what that place calls for from us. That is, we adjust our governance structure to the land and the means necessary for survival there. Now let us return to the buffalo hunt example, in which the buffalo hunt leaders and lieutenants were elected, but once the community was on the move, decision-making was more hierarchical. When reshaped for a farming community, the elected leaders became a president and council whose decision-making was based on consensus and voting. But this type of adjustment to place affects not only governance, but also economic strategies. For now, at

679 Robert Alexander Innes, *Elder Brother and the Law of the People: Contemporary Kinship and Cowessess First Nation* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2013).

680 Adam Gaudry, "Kaa-tipeyimishoyaahk – 'We Are Those Who Own Ourselves': A Political History of Métis Self-Determination in the North-West, 1830-1870" (PhD Dissertation, University of Victoria, 2014), 1-3.

least, this aspect of Northwest Métis epistemology I am striving to describe is better labelled in English as “placedness.”

Now let us turn back to the complex history of the Métis community of Batoche. The place and the people go together, a notion that slips into even the most conservative of mainstream histories of Batoche or any other Northwest Métis community. In the case of Batoche, for many years, the mainstream interpretation was that “Batoche” was at best an empty place, the Métis all having abandoned it after their military defeat. But this is not true, and Payment determined to challenge this interpretation based on the written and early interview evidence she had already gathered before undertaking her graduate work.<sup>681</sup> Even in her master’s thesis, where she had to wisely pick her battles with conventional ideas, the story of how the Batoche Métis stayed in place comes through. For example, in Chapter 1, she comments, “Le ‘frétagé,’ comme on disait dans le Nord-Ouest, est une source de revenu au moins partielle d’environ le tiers de la population de Batoche jusqu’en 1890,” revealing ongoing Batoche Métis presence after 1885.<sup>682</sup> By the 2009 edition, it is easier to appreciate how the Batoche Métis, like the Northwest Métis more widely, have paradoxically stayed in place by moving to different parts of their traditional lands. These moves did not indicate abandonment but rather a practical response to temporarily impossible conditions. In Payment’s exploration of Batoche Métis history, it is possible to read how they maintained connections to their lands in Batoche, and indeed, by implication, also to Manitoba, Montana, and North Dakota. The result is not a simplistic history that sets up a hero-villain shoot-out, a reduction to just the 1885 armed conflict between Batoche Métis and Canadian federal forces. While mainstream historians until at least the late twentieth century may have held the view that “the Battle of Batoche” is a pivotal story for the Northwest Métis, it is

681 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 289-290.

682 Payment, *Batoche (1870-1910)*, 15.

quite clear from Payment's work that the first people to reject this claim are the Batoche Métis. The 1990 edition, with its revised title referring to 1870 to 1930, further displaces the battle from a central point in time, reflecting the updates and revisions contributed by the community. In 2009, year references are no longer a part of the title at all, and Payment's discussion of the "Batoche National Historic Site of Canada"<sup>683</sup> documents Batoche Métis impacts on its interpretation and their efforts to have the village site – not the battle site – further reconstructed.<sup>684</sup> Yes, obviously that battle was and remains important. But the pivotal Indigenous story is about how Batoche is and continues to be a Métis place and, therefore, that there are still Batoche Métis – and still a wider Northwest Métis Nation.

Overall, Payment's project developed over her career and relationship with the Batoche Métis into something much closer to a co-written work. Closer, though still an outsider's retelling and interpretation. As was perhaps overdetermined by the events of 1885 and the fact that Marcel Giraud's earlier two-volume study of the Northwest Métis more generally was so deeply inflected by his collection of data during the depths of the Great Depression,<sup>685</sup> Payment has dealt with public critiques of her work from very early on. On the settler side, these range from complaints that she has decentred the story of Batoche preferred by the Canadian federal government to suggestions riding on the edge of accusing her of "going native."<sup>686</sup> It is fair to describe her work's reception as warm among Northwest Métis scholars, even where they may disagree with aspects of her interpretations. The evidence of her respect for the Batoche Métis and neighbouring elders is clear. So is her use of ethnohistorical tools (e.g. documents,

683 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 282-299.

684 Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 291.

685 George Woodcock, Translator's Introduction to *The Métis in the Canadian West* by Marcel Giraud, trans.

George Woodcock (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1986), x.

686 *Ibid.*

archaeological materials, oral tradition) in order to write a history that better reflects their perspectives, which helped mitigate the personal and community risks for Batoche Métis participants in sharing their stories.

A question still left to consider is that of the audience and whether the Indigenous reader is favoured. The most conservative of scholars of nineteenth-century Canadian history would likely incline to argue that, at the least, Batoche Métis are the most favoured readers, especially in 2009's *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*. However, just because “The recording of Métis history has challenged traditional white concepts of history and brought to the fore their own values, issues, and experiences”<sup>687</sup> does not make them the central audience for the book. Payment's book is still one of the books and pamphlets made available to visitors at the Canadian National Historic Site of Batoche and is a go-to work for many scholars studying Canadian and Northwest Métis history. Incorporating *wahkôtowin* and placedness favours Indigenous readers, and especially Batoche Métis readers, who will be able to recognize and unpack all the relationships and references without *de facto* locking out non-Indigenous readers.

#### *Single Author Works by Northwest Métis Authors*

Following the lines of *wahkôtowin* from Batoche and its continuing role in defining and redefining Northwest Métis history, two authors come immediately to mind: Marie Delorme Smith and Howard Adams. Despite the separation of nearly a hundred years between their narratives, they shared a striking interest in challenging the accepted mainstream depictions of their relatives and the difficult years of the late nineteenth century on the northern plains. They even had in common a greater level of formal education relative to their congeners. For example, Delorme Smith was, like Louis Goulet, born into a wealthier family engaged in free trading;

<sup>687</sup> Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres*, 251.

unlike Goulet, Delorme Smith completed two to four years of formal schooling and had later clerical work experience.<sup>688</sup> Adams became the first Northwest Métis in Canada to complete a doctorate.<sup>689</sup> Nevertheless, the paths of their writing to publication were very different.

In Delorme Smith's case, her work did not reach book form directly, but through arrangement into chronological sequence, editing, and annotation by her granddaughter, Jock Carpenter. This adds one of many levels of questions for mainstream scholars such as Doris Jeanne MacKinnon, who seem particularly exercised by a desire to pin down Delorme Smith's "identity" or "identities." From a historiographical point of view, we will focus a bit more on why she opted to obscure her own family's complex involvement in the Northwest Métis resistance movements. Most likely, she simply had different priorities and the editing she undertook for publishing her memoirs in *Canadian Cattleman* altered what she opted to include. That in itself is consistent with Indigenous practices of adjusting the story to the audience. But that still is a more mainstream-lensed perspective. Let us push a bit harder.

In Northwest Métis culture, relatives are specifically taught not to hurt one another, and to make amends quickly if they do, including accidental harm. Using that lens, we can interpret Delorme Smith's choices as endeavouring not to cause any further breaches in her family beyond those already created by political differences. Furthermore, based on the materials presented in *Fifty Dollar Bride*, Delorme Smith could not say much about the events at Batoche because she was not there, and her narrative, as we have received it, sticks to events she saw and experienced herself. By 1885 she had already been based in southern Alberta for several years, dealing with a rapidly growing family and a busy ranch. Her exploration of how she came to be married to

688 Guillaume Charette, *Vanishing Spaces: Memoirs of Louis Goulet*, trans. Ray Ellenwood (Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 2004), 59.

689 Laliberté, "Adams, Howard (1921-2001)."

Charlie Smith, even in the third person and as edited by her granddaughter, expresses her resentment of her mother's actions, and emphasizes a reaffirmation of family ties.

Where we learn about aspects of Northwest Métis history indirectly from Delorme Smith, Adams bluntly challenges the received mainstream narratives about Northwest Métis resistance. But as we have already seen, he did not start with this topic. The stronger through-line of his work is a concern to unpack and counter how the colonial state controls Indigenous peoples without constant physical violence. Therefore except for *Prison of Grass*, neither *wahkôtoiwîn* nor placedness are organizing elements in his books. In *Prison of Grass*, these elements do impact the narrative due to Adams' use of examples from his own experience and his use of Northwest Métis credentialing practice. According to that practice then, even though he was not present at the historical events he recounts from "a native point of view," he insists on siting himself within his family lines that connect him to direct participants. He sets his narrative into the Northwest Métis archival record developed and maintained by L'Union Nationale Métisse, and emphasizes the necessity of critically examining mainstream primary sources.

Between the late 1960s and into the 1970 – 80s, for Adams, the first task was to reject racist and oversimplified narratives about Indigenous people in general, uprooting them from the education system at all levels. The short monographs by Harry W. Daniels and Duke Redbird share this rather instrumentalized approach to historiography, therefore making little overt use of Indigenous epistemology in these works.

With this in mind, we can now see a link between Olive Patricia Dickason's work and this broader thread of Indigenous intellectual tradition in the late twentieth and early twenty-first century, albeit its less polemical strand. By joining the movement to write Canadian history that properly includes Indigenous peoples as actors who have not vanished from the scene, she also

sought to understand how things had gone wrong. Dickason answered the question of how depictions of Indigenous peoples got distorted in first-hand accounts, and how those accounts became sources of more distorted representations in second-hand accounts.

There is a different way in which *wahkôtowin* may manifest in a Northwest Métis historian's work, by their rediscovery of or re-engagement with their own family heritage. In that case, Dickason is one important example, because exploring her heritage<sup>690</sup> led her to research "Canada's Aboriginal history,"<sup>691</sup> and another is David T. McNab. For McNab, the notion of "Metis, then and now, are mediators, facilitators, interpreters on [aboriginal land rights] issues"<sup>692</sup> is a way of understanding his own role as a former Ontario public servant and his overall career as a public historian. McNab, therefore, strives to apply an Indigenous epistemological framework to his twin analyses of relations between First Nations and Ontario governments in *Circles of Time* and *No Place for Fairness*.<sup>693</sup> He is especially interested in recounting events in cyclic time, as already detailed in the Closer View in Mainstream Mode,<sup>694</sup> and emphasizing that he is not able to tell the complete story on his own. This resonates with Brenda MacDougall's explanation of the intricate nature of Northwest Métis stories and traditions in the Île-à-la-Crosse region, which by nature cannot be "told in one voice or by one group."<sup>695</sup> Instead, MacDougall emphasizes that Northwest Métis communities consist of layers of overlapping and interconnected stories and relationships. These interconnections are, in part, overlain on the land literally through place names and traditionally used travel routes.

690 Dickason, "Out of the Bush." 15-17.

691 Dickason, "Out of the Bush." 17.

692 McNab, *No Place for Fairness*, 3.

693 McNab, *No Place for Fairness*, 5.

694 In "Contested Sites and Provincial Anniversaries, 1980 – 2001," starting at 200.

695 MacDougall, *One of the Family*, 2.

Each of these Northwest Métis historians refers to a framework of specific places, extending far beyond and not necessarily centred on Red River. Facing extensive socio-cultural disruption due to colonial schooling, social prejudice, and sheer poverty, Northwest Métis families and communities applied the entire range of recording methods available to them to minimize disruptions to cultural transmission as much as they could. Most remarkably, they have insisted on maintaining places, including Batoche, Ste. Madeleine, Wolf Lake, and Métis Crossing, even though three of these are officially ghost towns. There is a difference in how Daniels and Redbird invoke place in their versions of Northwest Métis history. The places they discuss are primarily distinguished by where and when the earliest potential progenitors and the Northwest Métis clashed with Europeans and settlers. European contact is the fundamental criterion for identification. A Northwest Métis sense of placedness derives from relationships with the land rather than transient Europeans or settlers.

One single author item still outstanding is Anderson's *The First Métis*. From a distant view, wearing only mainstream interpretive lenses, the form and content of this book is a riddle. It can not be explained away as a reflection of Anderson's lack of formal training as a historian. In fulfilling her promise to her mother to help preserve and pass on the Cree language, Anderson was not a trained lexicographer either.<sup>696</sup> Undaunted, she selected an English dictionary and translated it into Cree, self-publishing *Plains Cree Dictionary of the "Y" Dialect* in Edmonton in 1971. She then revised and expanded it, resulting in *Dr. Anne Anderson's Métis Cree Dictionary* in 1997.<sup>697</sup> Therefore we can reasonably conclude that Anderson did something analogous for her history book in the sense of not starting from nothing. What she started from is not a

696 Cheryl Petten, "Dr. Anne Anderson, Teacher, Author Makes Good on a Promise to Her Mother," *Windspeaker*, February 1, 2005, 26.

697 Anne Anderson, *Plains Cree Dictionary of the "Y" Dialect* (Edmonton: Self-Published, 1971).  
Anne Anderson, *Dr. Anne Anderson's Métis Cree Dictionary* (Edmonton: Duval House Press, 1997).

mainstream-style history book, of course, but the networks of story and meaning defined by *wahkôtowin* and placedness within her own family, including ties all the way back to Kahnawà:ke in Québec, in both the geographic and temporal senses.

Today it is widely understood that a significant number of Catholic, French-speaking men from Kahnawà:ke went west to work in the fur trade and a proportion of these men stayed permanently.<sup>698</sup> They intermarried so extensively with local Cree and Northwest Métis families throughout the Saskatchewan River basin that the first official map of the Treaty 8 region shows where they settled.<sup>699</sup> Anderson and her research team documented examples of Iroquoian migration and integration using the mainstream historical record and genealogy independently of *The New Peoples* anthology that came out the same year and includes one paper on the Northwest Métis community of Grande Cache.<sup>700</sup> With much more space to work with, Anderson provides an ironic and wryly humorous critique of repeated European claims to “firsts.” Whether writing about the founding of Fort Edmonton, Lac Ste. Anne, reputedly the first “white” settlements in their areas,<sup>701</sup> or many other places along the North Saskatchewan River and its valley, the entries start with an observation of who was already there, usually Cree or Nakota communities. As she traces the lines of *wahkôtowin* and travel, she gradually reveals that she has traced her own extended family and therefore provides her own credentials. Northwest Métis readers will pick up on this right away, as they catch on to the section of eight chapters on the Callihoo family,<sup>702</sup> first introduced nearly a hundred pages before in Anderson’s chapter on “The

698 Jean Barman, *The Iroquois in the West* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2019), 1-6.

699 Library and Archives Canada, “Archived – Treaty 8,” <https://www.collectionscanada.ca/treaty8/020006-1000-e.html> (accessed January 25, 2022).

700 Trudy Nicks and Kenneth Morgan, “Grande Cache: The Historic Development of an Indigenous Alberta Métis Population,” in *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*, eds. Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985), 163-181.

701 For example, Anderson, *The First Métis*, 137; 229; 372.

702 Anderson, *The First Métis*, 144-173.

Iroquois in the West – Names of the First Metis.”<sup>703</sup> Anderson’s mother was Elizabeth Callihoo, and her first husband was from a different branch of the extended family, William Callihoe. Her father was William Joseph Gairdner of the Scottish-descended Northwest Métis,<sup>704</sup> and his family and clan connections are detailed in two more chapters after the Callihoo section.<sup>705</sup> The selected photographs, line drawings, and other snippets now fall into place as additional information showing how people at the time lived as well as featuring important ancestors and political and religious leaders. Due to its size and format, *The First Métis* is well suited to reading from and holding up for examination in a study circle or family gathering, so much so it is hard not to draw parallels with the Haudenosaunee technique of history transmission known as telling or reciting the wampum.

The result of Anderson and her team’s work is a composite text that firmly privileges the needs and expectations of an Indigenous audience. Certainly, any Northwest Métis, Cree, Nakota, Blackfoot, or Kahnawà:ke Haudenosaunee person with ties to the lower North Saskatchewan River region working on their family genealogy will still find it an excellent sourcebook. The transcriptions of elder interviews and relevant entries from Hudson’s Bay Company journals, among other documents less accessible to the general public, let alone the Indigenous public at the time, filled a critical gap. Or rather, gaps, because in the 1980s, it was still difficult to find out much more about Northwest Métis history apart from the shaken settler consensus on the meaning and outcomes of the 1869 – 1870 and 1885 resistances. These events are covered in *The First Métis* in specific entries on Louis Riel<sup>706</sup> and an account of the Frog

703 Anderson, *The First Métis*, 70-72.

704 Lawrence Barkwell, “Anne Gairdner (Anderson, Irvine), C.M. LL.D. (1906-1997),” 1.

705 Anderson, *The First Métis*, 206-225.

706 Anderson, *The First Métis*, 400.

Lake Massacre.<sup>707</sup> Both essays take a distinctive view of their subjects. Yet they also are very brief because these are events with less immediate salience for families who built their base communities in the far Northwest before the 1850s. The familiar spaces where Northwest Métis women should have been but were not in more mainstream books and articles are also well filled in many places. The coverage of Northwest Métis women includes specific memories of elders,<sup>708</sup> episodes from daily life in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century,<sup>709</sup> and at least one transcription from an interview with an elder.<sup>710</sup> Having worked outside the home for much of her life as a nurse, teacher, and managing the Fishing Lake Alberta Metis Colony,<sup>711</sup> Anderson does not miss the chance to discuss the wider range of jobs and leadership roles of Northwest Métis women in the later twentieth century.<sup>712</sup>

From today's perspective, the difficulty with early Northwest Métis historiography of this type is that it is not always easy to read the evidence of division and internalized racism between different Northwest Métis communities. Anderson's discussion of Fishing Lake Colony (now Fishing Lake Métis Settlement), one of eight settlements that remained after the province unilaterally rescinded four others, is especially telling. When Anderson refers to Indigenous people as Indians, nomadic, or having superstitions rather than spiritual practices, these are immediately recognizable as commonplaces of the time. But descriptions like the following are consonant with the imagery that so publicly frustrated Howard Adams. He would probably have

707 Anderson, *The First Métis*, 353-352.

708 For example, Anderson, *The First Métis*, 94; 116; 144; 333-336.

709 Such as Anderson, *The First Métis*, 317-318; 319-320.

710 Anderson, *The First Métis*, 347-348.

711 Barkwell, "Anne Gairdner (Anderson, Irvine), C.M. LL.D. (1906-1997)."

Bruce Cinnamon, "The 'Grand Lady of the Métis': Dr. Anne Anderson's Mission to Preserve the Cree Language," Edmonton City as Museum Project – ECAMP (November 12, 2020), <https://citymuseumedmonton.ca/2020/11/10/the-grand-lady-of-the-metis-dr-anne-andersons-mission-to-preserve-the-cree-language/> (accessed January 10, 2022).

Anderson, *The First Métis*, 353; 387-399.

712 Anderson, *The First Métis*, 320.

been troubled by Anderson's role as one among the provincial government employees and their spouses administering provincially controlled programs at the Fishing Lake Settlement.

These people were always thought of as being lazy, but they were not for they had their own way of life, living in a very remote area. They were a happy carefree people and liked wandering about during the summer. Their lives were truly Indian, although they were mostly half-Breeds.

To change the life and environment of these people, who lived so free, became very difficult for them. They were very suspicious of the government, even with us, when introducing the suggested programs from headquarters.<sup>713</sup>

This also suggests that Anderson does not have family ties to the Northwest Métis who were making new homes at Fishing Lake since she speaks of them as strangers. It was still too early for much reckoning by Northwest Métis scholars generally or historians specifically with Northwest Métis participation in federal and provincial government jobs. Few Northwest Métis historians have confronted this issue by confirming Northwest Métis served in these roles apart from David T. McNab to date, even though it is not necessary to start from scratch. Cree scholar Winona Wheeler's excellent exemplar study of her great-great-grandfather Askenootow or Charles Pratt, who worked for many years as a Church Missionary Society catechist, has been in print since 2003.<sup>714</sup> That said, it is also true that Northwest Métis historians are just getting started on these matters, and that such sensitive work is best done in community.

### *Community Histories*

There is something of a bumper crop of items here, a group of twelve monographs of pamphlet length (except for two cases), eight dealing with communities in present-day Alberta. In terms of the angle taken on profiling each place, Guy Lavallée's anthropological study of St. Laurent, Manitoba and Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935's traditional knowledge and land use study are

<sup>713</sup> Anderson, *The First Métis*, 390.

<sup>714</sup> Winona Wheeler, "The Journals and Voices of a Church of England Native Catechist: Askenootow (Charles Pratt), 1851-1884," in *Reading Beyond Words: Contexts for Native History*, eds. Jennifer S.H. Brown and Elizabeth Vibert (Peterborough: Broadview Press, 2003), 304-329.

outliers. The others, from the history of the Willow Bunch Métis in Saskatchewan, the British Columbia Métis villages of Island Cache and within Prince George, and the six Alberta Métis Settlements, all follow the same basic format. They may include more elder interviews and genealogical tracings, as in the case of Prince George, East Prairie Metis Settlement and Elizabeth Settlement. Or they may have less personalized material of this type and more accounts of hard work with minimal or comparatively primitive farming and drilling equipment, which are central to the Caslan and Fishing Lake Settlement narratives. Besides the shared format of those ten examples, they emphasize that even when the general editor is not a Northwest Métis person, the place in question is a Northwest Métis place to which the people maintain connections. They may move away but return for regular visits or permanently, even when the village does not officially exist anymore, as in the case of Island Cache and Ste. Madeleine.<sup>715</sup> The almost anxious insistence on placedness, as reflected in the pointed titles of each community history, makes sense as a reflection of shared experiences of eviction from previously established homes, which Northwest Métis had particular difficulties avoiding. Yet they have managed to remain quite stably in place at St. Laurent and Fort McMurray, so much so in the latter that the elders were able to map an expanded network of satellite places.<sup>716</sup>

I write this about St. Laurent, yet in discussing Lavallée's book earlier in this chapter, I observed his pessimism about the future of St. Laurent as a Northwest Métis place. There is an important detail I have not yet drawn out about Lavalleyé personally, however, and that is his status as an ordained priest in the Catholic order of the Missionary Oblates of Mary

715 Ste. Madeleine has become a regular annual gathering place for Northwest Métis whose families lived there and where the community still buries its dead and tends their cemetery. Trevor Herriot provides an outsider account of this in *Towards a Prairie Atonement* (Regina: University of Regina Press, 2016).

716 Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935, *Mark of the Métis*, 80.

Immaculate.<sup>717</sup> This Order and the Grey Nuns, whose origins are with the Sisters of Charity of the Hôpital Général de Montréal founded by Marie-Marguerite d'Youville, were the première educators of Northwest Métis deep into the twentieth century. Lavallée's paradoxical pessimism-optimism in his history now makes better sense, as he was of the view that being practising Catholics and maintaining Catholic influence over daily life and ceremony is important to remaining more "Métis" than "Canadian."<sup>718</sup> While he traced the clergy serving St. Laurent in his study period, like the majority of his Northwest Métis historian colleagues, the community trace is nevertheless via its *wahkôtowin*. Hence he identifies the founding families, and his 34 interviewees are interrelated by blood and marriage, as inferred by their surnames.<sup>719</sup>

Each of these community histories was written for their places of origin, even when the circumstances and funding made it more difficult to maintain the Northwest Métis communities as the central audience. They tend to be somewhat dissociated from the broader Northwest Métis intellectual and historiographic tradition, even in the most recent examples, although this is changing rapidly. The new Metis Settlements General Council website hints at a possible combined history of the settlements to be published in the near future. Further, the alternative style of history based on traditional knowledge and land use studies has opened up entirely new risks in terms of potentially making sensitive places known to outsiders and, therefore, vulnerable to interference. We might expect that this type of history would be of special service to Northwest Métis organizations striving to assure harvesting rights and standing in land claims, but this is not a given. In documenting ongoing Northwest Métis mobility and showing that

717 Lawrence Barkwell, "Guy Lavallée, O.M.I (b. 1939)," Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture, <http://www.metismuseum.ca/resource.php/14327> (accessed September 21, 2021).

Lavallée, *The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba*, copyright page and vii.

718 Lavallée, *The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba*, 46-59.

719 Lavallée, *The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba*, xvi.

sometimes places remain unoccupied for long periods without the impetus of eviction, this is not necessarily read as evidence of a long-term, multigenerational land relationship pattern, even though it is.

### ***Stepping Back Again, Just A Little***

As suggested by this discussion, an Indigenous historiographic concept is conspicuous by its absence, that is, the historical agency of other than human beings. By contrast, in the Haudenosaunee case study, some of the monographs recount the deeds and experiences of Spirit Beings, animals, and plants who take an active part in the establishment of Haudenosaunee culture and politics. Northwest Métis do have historical narratives that include discussions of other than human beings. That they are not represented here is an accident of the sample of monographs, which in this case tends to pick up works aimed at a majority non-Indigenous audience. The shorter community histories found their way into settlement offices, where visitors might be encouraged to purchase a copy. The larger monographs were released by presses expecting to cover their production costs. Furthermore, due to the difficult relationship between the Northwest Métis and the Catholic Church, combined with the long ban on overt Indigenous ceremonies, Northwest Métis writers avoided mention of anything that could be construed as either “pagan” or illegal.<sup>720</sup> Louis Goulet’s memoirs include several anecdotes he labels “Indian superstitions,”<sup>721</sup> but otherwise, the silence is nearly complete. This reticence persisted into the early twenty-first century when Pemmican Publications released the first volume of *Métis Legacy*.

720 Chantal Fiola, *Rekindling the Sacred Fire: Métis Ancestry and Anishinaabe Spirituality* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2015), 6-7; 62-63; 66-67.

721 Charette, *L’Espace de Louis Goulet*, 20-27.

With *Métis Legacy*, Northwest Métis historians began to explore and document more of *les histoires*, the stories about long ago. To date, their results are captured mainly in articles and stories transcribed for projects like *Métis Legacy*, Volume II, dealing with “Michif Culture, Heritage, and Folkways.”<sup>722</sup> One section is of special note here, because it is part of the long Northwest Métis resistance to racialization, the translation of Marie-Louise Perron’s 1987 *Saskatchewan History* article “L’Origine des Canards Gris.”<sup>723</sup> Perron, then a folklorist working at Libraries and Archives Canada, shared the story from the oral tradition of her own family.<sup>724</sup> Before retelling “L’Origine des Canards Gris,” Perron frames it with an explanation of how she received the story, then provides two brief stories, one from Dene oral tradition, one from French folklore.<sup>725</sup> Only then does she present a polished transcription of the story, and her analysis of it using the other two stories and a comparison between Northwest Métis and fur trader mores.<sup>726</sup> In unpacking “L’Origine des Canards Gris,” Perron provides a wonderful example of Northwest Métis history, including a critique of European culture and behaviour in plain sight, with the full import of the story easy to miss because of its apparent fairy tale framing.<sup>727</sup>

### **Conclusion**

The trends touched on in the “Distant View” section are still in evidence throughout the sequence of these monographs. Two are especially prominent. First, the change from history about

722 Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah M. Dorion, and Audreen Hourie, eds., *Metis Legacy II: Michif Culture, Heritage and Folkways*. (Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2006).

723 Marie-Louise Perron, “‘L’Origine des Canards Gris’: Conte folklorique Métis et/ou étude en sociologie populaire,” *Saskatchewan History* XL, no. 3 (1987): 99-108.

Marie-Louise Perron, “The Origin of Grey Ducks,” in *Metis Legacy II: Michif Culture, Heritage and Folkways*, eds. Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah M. Dorion, and Audreen Hourie (Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2006), 46-54; 249-250.

724 Barkwell, Dorion, and Hourie, *Metis Legacy II*, v.

725 Marie-Louise Perron, “The Origin of Grey Ducks,” in *Metis Legacy II: Michif Culture, Heritage and Folkways*, eds. Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah M. Dorion, and Audreen Hourie (Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2006), 46-47; 47-48.

726 Perron, “The Origin of Grey Ducks,” 50-53.

727 Perron, “The Origin of Grey Ducks,” 48-50.

Northwest Métis or extracted from Northwest Métis elders to history by Northwest Métis communities. Second, the growing success of Northwest Métis historians wresting more control over their history away from outside parties. At a minimum, we see Northwest Métis communities like Batoche or Ste. Madeleine challenging the ways they have been presented as evidence for settler hegemony and Indigenous deficit. We can see this expressed through the changing shape and application of “told-to” narratives, in which historians and anthropologists work with Northwest Métis communities and respected community members and leaders, documenting how they met the concerns and protocol requirements that interaction entails. In the case of Diane Payment, who is Franco-Manitoban but not Northwest Métis, her own principled resistance to repeating accepted mainstream narratives about Batoche led her into similar relationships of respect. The early 1980s were a major turning point in Northwest Métis historiography.

Greater access to post-secondary education in history and related fields such as anthropology and Native/Indigenous studies has marked another powerful trend. The earliest Northwest Métis-initiated histories were corrective and, yes, defensive. L’Union Nationale Métisse initially focused on building an archive of materials on the Northwest Métis resistance movements independent of the Canadian state, and then producing a history from those materials. That archive is now valued by both mainstream and Indigenous historians for its trove of transcribed interviews, collected letters, books, and other materials. In their archival work, L’Union Nationale Métisse showed how important it was for Northwest Métis communities to document their history using multiple methods that helped preserve records that otherwise would have been lost. Formally trained Northwest Métis historians shifted from writing indirectly about their own people by focusing on aspects relevant to their ethnogenesis (e.g., Adams, Dickason, and McNab) to general Indigenous history (e.g., Dickason, and McNab) to exploring Northwest

Métis history and ethnogenesis directly (e.g., McNab and MacDougall). Howard Adams became somewhat of an outlier as he continued to work on corrective and bluntly polemical history after Redbird, Dunn, and Daniels had gone on to other types of writing and activism. He deemed this type of history writing absolutely necessary for politically, socially, and culturally restoring and strengthening Indigenous peoples as peoples and nations.

The continuing role of individual community history writing and communities participating in history writing in order to better understand Northwest Métis origins and progress has two main distributaries. One includes projects by or guided by Northwest Métis anthropologists and historians applying ethnohistorical methods (e.g., MacDougall and Evans). These have played an important role in challenging persistent racist constructions of Northwest Métis as not a people but a product of mixing between two supposed “races.” In parallel with this development, Northwest Métis are pursuing advanced training in other fields that complement historical approaches and support these challenges, including political science (e.g., Gaudry) and sociology (e.g., Andersen). The other distributary is via government and now more often corporate-funded community histories, creating what can be read as a successor genre to the more problematic “told-to” monographs. Northwest Métis communities such as that represented by Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935 have ensured that their historical perspective is at the forefront of their publication, but, notably, it is out of print and now only available as a download from Alberta Regional Professional Development Resources.<sup>728</sup>

Over time as we have seen, Northwest Métis historians have gradually increased their influence on their historiography. This influence ranges from creating historiographic works

728 Alberta Regional Professional Development Resources (ARPDR), “Mark of the Métis: Traditional Knowledge and Stories of the Métis Peoples of Northeastern Alberta,” Alberta Regional Professional Development, <https://arpcresources.ca/consortia/mark-metis-traditional-knowledge-stories-metis-peoples-northeastern-alberta/> (accessed January 30, 2022).

themselves and holding non-Indigenous historians to account for biased or incomplete portrayals to working with non-Indigenous historians and anthropologists to produce hybrid publications based on ethnohistorical methods. While some non-Indigenous historians are opposed to this development, many more have accepted that the Northwest Métis are as capable of calling them to account as anyone else. When faced with the challenge of how to counteract the negative impacts of dispossession, interference with family formation, and interaction within and between individual communities, Northwest Métis historians have adopted and adapted a range of techniques. From elder Indigenous kin such as the Haudenosaunee, Cree, and Dene come practices including organized memorization and transmission of oral history and encoding places with unique names and stories. These places are then systematically revisited so the stories may be retold. From French and English kin comes the use of encoding history in books directly or through an amanuensis. Eventually, Northwest Métis and Euro-Canadians adopted electronic media for these purposes as well.

*Mind the Gap!*

In closing this chapter, let us briefly turn our attention to Leah Dorion and Darren Préfontaine's gap analysis of Métis historiography, published in 2001 as part of the first volume of *Métis Legacy*.<sup>729</sup> In "Deconstructing Métis Historiography" they identified eight major areas where there was little to no coverage, or considerable coverage, but of a highly biased nature. These areas are, following Dorion and Préfontaine's terminology:

1. Heavy concentration on Louis Riel and Red River, including inaccurately conflating the Red River Métis community with the Métis Nation.<sup>730</sup>

729 Leah Dorion and Darren R. Préfontaine, "Deconstructing Métis Historiography," in *Métis Legacy*, eds.

Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001), 13-36.

730 Dorion and Préfontaine, "Deconstructing Métis Historiography," 14; 21.

2. Lack of research or publication on “the extensive historical experience and contributions of Métis women.”<sup>731</sup>
3. Lack of Métis oral tradition and spirituality, except insofar as it can be conflated with Catholicism.<sup>732</sup>
4. Lack of documentation of Métis languages and general multilingualism.<sup>733</sup>
5. Lack of more complex examinations of Métis resistance to colonialism without forcing it into a pre-existing mould taken from English or French Canadian experience.<sup>734</sup>
6. Minimal to no publications dealing with traditional land and resource use.<sup>735</sup>
7. Hyperfocus on the issue of Métis scrip, its distribution and loss.<sup>736</sup>
8. General lack of Métis-specific viewpoints.<sup>737</sup>

Dorion and Préfontaine take great care to demonstrate that Northwest Métis history is not simple or singular, and they give a sense of the diversity of Northwest Métis cultural expression and its origins. The Distant and Close View sections above indicate considerable changes in all these areas, including significant critical coverage of at least part of all these gaps.

Although Louis Riel and Red River still act as a bipolar strange attractor for non-Indigenous historians, their Northwest Métis counterparts worked hard to set these topic areas back into an Indigenous context. Both Louis Riel and the Red River community are part of a unique people who emerged in the Northwest of Turtle Island by at least the late eighteenth century. Perhaps this will also help open up space for a more productive study of the ways in which colonial

731 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 15-16.

732 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 20; 22.

733 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 22-24.

734 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 25-27.

735 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 30-31.

736 *Ibid.*

737 Dorion and Préfontaine, “Deconstructing Métis Historiography,” 19; 21; 24-29; 35.

authorities attempted to build Riel up in their newspapers and speeches into a figure reminiscent of the leader of the contemporary Mahdist rebellion in the Sudan. It has certainly helped make it easier for Northwest Métis historians to reframe Red River as a place of central importance in relations of *wahkôtowin* and placedness. In the process, the tenacious grip of racializing and racialized depictions and theories is also loosening with the availability of alternative explanations based on actual social, cultural, and political relationships.

Women are leading the way in all areas of research in Northwest Métis history, including improving understanding and knowledge about Northwest Métis women. Besides the items by Racette, Devine, MacDougall, Anderson, and Carpenter and “told-to” works such as Payment’s, there are others by non-Indigenous scholars not included in the study corpus, including a second study on St. Laurent by Nicole St. Onge and one on Métis women by Natalie Kermoal.<sup>738</sup> Their work tends to make greater use of analysis of material culture and mobility (e.g., Racette and MacDougall). Like their non-Indigenous counterparts, prior to the turn of the twentieth century, Northwest Métis women generally did not begin publishing until after their children were grown (e.g., Delorme Smith, Anderson, and Dickason). The growing recognition of the evidence of Northwest Métis women’s extensive and independent trading activities hints at some of the often unsuspected networks and camouflaged communities in the northern plains below the Medicine Line. I should also note a significant practical reason for the prominence of Northwest Métis women in this historiography: traditionally it is Northwest Métis women who keep track of *wahkôtowin* in all its facets.

738 Nicole St. Onge, *Saint-Laurent, Manitoba: Evolving Métis Identities, 1850-1915* (Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre, University of Regina, 2004).

Nathalie Kermoal, *Un passé métis au féminin* (Québec: Les Éditions GID, 2006).

There is still little published about Northwest Métis oral tradition and spirituality apart from the previously mentioned second volume of *Métis Legacy*, although MacDougall examines them both broadly and specifically with respect to the integration of Catholic ritual into Sakitawak relationship creation and recognition in her 2010 study.<sup>739</sup> Louis Riel and his sister Sara remain of special interest, with the most recent publication by Lesley Erickson focussing on Grey Nun Sara Riel in her role as missionary to Île-à-la-Crosse.<sup>740</sup> So far, little work has appeared that suggests an attempt to understand Indigenous prophetic traditions Louis Riel may have been involved in, such as those of the Dene, Sauteaux, and Cree. It will likely be some time before anyone attempts a study along the lines of, for example, Susan Neylan's *The Heavens Are Changing: Nineteenth-Century Protestant Missions and Tsimshian Christianity*.<sup>741</sup> In an important corrective to simplistic models of Indigenous-Christian syncretism, Neylan examines how north Pacific coast Tsimshian communities engaged with and reshaped the ideologies imparted by Protestant missionaries. She argues that "despite missionary agendas and objectives, conversion to Christianity did not constitute a replacement of preexisting spiritual beliefs. Rather, preexisting Aboriginal and Christian frameworks of understanding power complemented as much as they clashed with one another... Christianity is an aspect of Native history, not simply an external force acting upon it."<sup>742</sup> At least two well-documented Northwest Métis communities could be candidates for a similar historical study. One is Saint Paul de Métis, now Saint Paul in Alberta, established by Catholic missionaries in a precursor to the Alberta Métis settlements

739 MacDougall, *One of the Family*, 143-144; 191-192.

740 Lesley Erickson, "Repositioning the Missionary: Sara Riel, the Grey Nuns, and Aboriginal Women in Catholic Missions of the Northwest," in *Recollecting: Lives of Aboriginal Women of the Canadian Northwest and Borderlands*, eds. Sarah Carter and Patricia McConnel (Edmonton: AU Press, 2011), 115-134.

741 Susan Neylan, *The Heavens Are Changing: Nineteenth-Century Protestant Missions and Tsimshian Christianity* (Montréal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2003).

742 Neylan, *The Heavens Are Changing*, 6.

scheme.<sup>743</sup> The other is Saint Laurent, Manitoba, where not only did the Oblates found a mission, but they also ran a Novitiate to train new members of the order there until 1950.<sup>744</sup>

Northwest Métis languages have proved a far tougher nut to crack, as the question of what to call the admixtures of often, but not always, Cree and French has been a heated one. Whether these should be called Michif, Métis Cree, Métis French, or something else has caused almost as much stress and frustration as the difficulty of ending the use of labels such as “patois” or “jargon.” The first major study remains Peter Bakker’s 1997 book, including its proposed short historical reconstruction of the development of Michif.<sup>745</sup> Dictionaries are far more common, such as *Dr. Anne Anderson’s Métis Cree Dictionary*, already cited, or Patline Laverdure and Ida Rose Allard’s Michif dictionary published in 1983.<sup>746</sup> There are many more recent language learning publications through the Gabriel Dumont Institute, and terminology has begun to settle into the use of “Michif” as the overarching name for Northwest Métis languages. Rather than try to make any specific dialect “canonical,” authors and compilers have opted to specify which communities they have drawn their grammars and vocabularies from.<sup>747</sup>

The areas of Northwest Métis resistance to colonialism, traditional land and resource use, and scrip are as intertwined as they are unevenly covered. Written histories of Northwest Métis positive resistance in the form of maintaining independent culture and communities against the odds, and insisting on actively joining Confederation by negotiation are just beginning to reach print. Then again, this is still also true for most First Nations and Inuit. The demands of legal

743 Gerhard J. Ens and Joe Sawchuk, *From New Peoples to New Nations: Aspects of Métis History and Identity from the Eighteenth to Twenty-First Centuries*, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 243-255.

744 Lavallée, “The Métis People of St. Laurent, Manitoba,” 137-138.

745 Peter Bakker, *A Language of Our Own*, 39-50; 61-65; 72.

746 Patline Laverdure and Ida Rose Allard, *The Michif Dictionary: Turtle Mountain Chippewa Cree*, ed. John C. Crawford (Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications Inc., 1983).

747 For example, see Vince Ahenakew, *Nêhiyawêwin Masinahikan: Michif\*Cree Dictionary* (Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute Press, 2021) and *Nêhiyawêwin Mitâtaht: Michif ahci Cree* (Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute Press, 2021).

challenges to prove ongoing Indigenous rights and title and enforce respect for them have absorbed most historiographical attention through the twentieth century in these areas. On the other hand, the result of the many successful legal actions is the federal and provincial Crowns have a reinforced duty to consult. Combined with intensifying natural resource exploitation in non-urbanized parts of what is currently called Canada and the northern United States, funding and effort are now pouring into analyzing Northwest Métis traditional land use, especially in the most active oil and gas exploitation regions. Today's major challenge may be prising the historical materials out of the burgeoning mass of grey literature consisting of technical reports filed with regulators and museums but not formally published into more accessible and lasting archives. Meanwhile, the Supreme Court's decision in *Manitoba Metis Federation Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General)*, 2013 SCC14, released March 8, 2013, is an important landmark in scrip history, at least for Manitoba.<sup>748</sup>

Today Northwest Métis viewpoints are far better reflected in both historiography on and by Northwest Métis. It remains a struggle to ensure that those viewpoints are given due weight and consideration in such matters as racist definitions of "Métis" and subsequent appropriation of the term by other communities and organizations in present day Canada and the United States. Participants in Canada's French-English language debates still attempt to subsume Northwest Métis history into Québec's long clash with the Canadian federal government. This updated picture is certainly encouraging, but Northwest Métis historians have no time to rest on their laurels. There is plenty yet to do in supporting education at all levels in Northwest Métis history from a Northwest Métis point of view, applying Northwest Métis methods and epistemology.

<sup>748</sup> Manitoba Métis Federation, "Understanding Manitoba Métis Federation Land Claims." McLachlin, Beverley *et al.*, "Manitoba Metis Federation Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General) – SCC Cases," Supreme Court of Canada, <https://decisions.scc-csc.ca/scc-csc/scc-csc/en/item/12888/index.do> (accessed January 30, 2022).

## **Chapter 4: Haudenosaunee Confederacy Case Study**

### ***Introduction***

Now it is time to turn to the Haudenosaunee portion of the primary source corpus, with its earliest item dating to circa 1825. This is the earliest historiographic item I identified as of late 2021, but Haudenosaunee authors were certainly publishing in other genres earlier than this, most likely in periodicals. Nevertheless, despite having access to European-style printing much earlier, Haudenosaunee historians did not produce more published historical monographs than their Northwest Métis counterparts in raw numbers. In fact, they did not start publishing at a higher rate than their Northwest Métis counterparts until 2017. But as is often the case with raw data, looks are deceiving. The Northwest Métis subgenre of placedness narratives recognizable from the previous case study, which includes many pamphlet-length items, is not present in the Haudenosaunee materials. Since the Haudenosaunee were and indeed are a well-known and firmly established presence on the land, it makes sense that both Haudenosaunee and outsider scholars would not focus on this topic in the same way. Haudenosaunee historians have also been able to draw on an established independent record base in the form of deep oral tradition, wampum belts, and both broad and fine-drawn networks of storied places. Where bibliographic reconstruction and analysis of the Northwest Métis materials included several examples of a single author revising their own monograph, that phenomenon is not as much in evidence here. More representative is the remarkable saga of outsider attempts to recode the Great Law of Peace into a single, fixed narrative and claim authority over it, producing an especially entangled publication record in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Taking up the Haudenosaunee metaphor of twoness, there are two broad streams of historiography here: first, the expression of ongoing Haudenosaunee embodiment of the Great Law of Peace, and second, written documentation of how the Haudenosaunee Confederacy has continued to uphold its part in treaties made with the British Crown.

In broad strokes, this case study will follow the shape and major divisions of the Northwest Métis case study. Once again, I will begin in a more mainstream mode, using the change over time and key dates to provide a sense of the recently written Haudenosaunee intellectual tradition in historiography. It will be possible to engage in a more fulsome way with the earlier of Robert Warrior's broad temporal divisions, now including the era when "non-fiction" Indigenous publishing for outsiders was dominated by Christianized Indigenous men.

Haudenosaunee historiography has its own broad themes. Once again, a consideration of these together with place, still from a distant view, will allow a better understanding of their meaning and impact on the published works available to us today. Then knowing where we are, figuratively speaking, we concentrate once again on the monographs, first in a mainstream mode, which reveals Haudenosaunee scholars engaged in their own battles to maintain authority over their history. Now switching into an Indigenous critical theory mode to explore the role of Haudenosaunee epistemology and narrative genres and the widely shared Indigenous historiographic concepts will take centre stage. In the Northwest Métis monographs, placedness and the existence of many histories are most noticeable, and there is little sign of the other widely shared Indigenous historiographic concepts.

The Haudenosaunee monographs tend to bring all of these concepts into play to some degree, although, as always, there are exceptions. Overt descriptions of cyclic and linear time and their

interrelationships take longer to appear, while the agency of other than human beings is noted from the outset. The chapter will close with brief consideration of the still contested question of when the Haudenosaunee Confederacy was founded. Efforts to answer this question have fuelled interdisciplinary collaborations that challenge common settler assumptions about Indigenous tenure and capacity for self-government throughout northern North America.

***A Distant View in Time Part One: A First Hundred Years of Haudenosaunee Publishing Endeavour***

Haudenosaunee histories composed by Haudenosaunee people make their first published appearance in the early nineteenth century at the latest, with David Cusick's pamphlet, *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations*. The date of its first release is somewhat contested, ranging from 1825 to 1827,<sup>749</sup> but its status as among the first Indigenous-authored and printed books and pamphlets is not. First printed at Tuscarora Village in New York, Cusick oversaw a second revised and expanded edition released in 1828.<sup>750</sup> From a present-day perspective, it seems a remarkably bold project for a member of the Tuscarora Nation, which had been accepted into the Haudenosaunee Confederacy barely a century before. This publication falls firmly in the latter half of Warrior's first period of the written Indigenous intellectual tradition, and while Cusick attended a mission school, as we can interpret from the text, he was not a Christian convert. In fact, he challenged Christian claims to exclusive truth in the first edition mainly by reusing some familiar biblical phrasing, especially in Part I, which recounts the creation of the universe.<sup>751</sup> In the expanded second edition, he observes in a footnote to one episode in Part III, "By some this

749 Lisa Brooks, *The Common Pot: The Recovery of Native Space in the Northeast* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008), 243.

Gabriel Swift, "David Cusick's *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations*," Princeton Collections of the American West, <https://blogs.princeton.edu/westernamericana/2013/11/25/david-cusicks-sketches-of-ancient-history-of-the-six-nations/> (accessed January 30, 2022).

750 Swift, "David Cusick's *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations*."

751 David Cusick, *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations* (Lewiston: Printed for the Author, 1827), 6; 25.

may seem an incredible story. Why more so than that the Israelites should cross the Red Sea on dry land.”<sup>752</sup> Cusick even took care to provide a rough chronology relative to the infamous year of Columbus’ landfall as he went along, indicating that he intended the pamphlet for a non-Haudenosaunee audience. However, his work was not well-received, at least by the writers in that audience. Literary theorist Joshua David Bellin describes their responses as a remarkable amount of attention and hostility,<sup>753</sup> which is something of an understatement, as the hostile responses from other outside writers with interest in Indigenous history kept coming for nearly a hundred years.

Many factors were encouraging savvy Haudenosaunee authors who could get their work into print to do so, not the least of which was the ongoing depredations of land speculators in the aftermath of the War of 1812. For Haudenosaunee generally, this was a difficult time. In their core homelands in New York State, which includes the nucleus of the Haudenosaunee government, the struggle against land seizure and removal was especially symbolic. The United States federal government and its New York State counterpart worked intermittently together as the State strove to keep control of treaty-making within its boundaries.<sup>754</sup> Meanwhile, the Ogden Land Company, led by former congressman David Ogden, had rapidly developed into the special nemesis of Haudenosaunee reserve communities. From the Seneca at Tonawanda to the Mohawks at St. Regis, the company’s representatives readily funded those Haudenosaunee who favoured the sale of reserve lands.<sup>755</sup> Well aware of how important the printed word could be to

752 David Cusick, *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations* (Lockport, N.Y.: Turner and McCollum, 1848), 21.

753 Joshua David Bellin, *The Demon of the Continent: Indians and the Shaping of American Literature* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001), 183.

754 Daniel K. Richter, “The States, the United States and the Canandaigua Treaty,” in *Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794*, eds. G. Peter Jemison and Anna M. Schein (Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000), 76-83.

Lawrence M. Hauptman, “Who Owns Grand Island (Erie County, New York)?” in *Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794*, eds. G. Peter Jemison and Anna M. Schein (Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000), 127-148.

755 Society of Friends of Genesee, New York, Philadelphia and Baltimore, *A Further Illustration of the Case of the Seneca Indians in the State of New York, in a Review of a Pamphlet Entitled “An Appeal to the Christian*

winning non-Indigenous support for resistance or acquiescence to settler plans, Haudenosaunee did not hesitate to deploy it when they could. For example, Nathaniel T. Strong and Maris Bryant Pierce, Haudenosaunee speakers on opposite sides of the debate on whether the Seneca should give up and sell their reserve to the Ogden Land Company, had their speeches published in 1839.<sup>756</sup> This would not be the first time Haudenosaunee activists would invoke the same history in support of opposing policies.

The Haudenosaunee Confederacy struggled steadily against the onslaught of sharp dealers and antagonistic new neighbours. With open warfare no longer an option after 1812, and speechmaking and political debate not proving as effective as they had in the past, Haudenosaunee interest in new strategies grew. Based on a firsthand view of the machinations of the Ogden Land Company, a young Seneca whose English name was Ely S. Parker developed a keen interest in the settler legal system. Accordingly, he undertook studies at a law office in Cattaraugus County in New York, only to discover that he was blocked from practising as a lawyer.<sup>757</sup> This was a serious disappointment and may have indirectly sparked his collaboration with Lewis Henry Morgan to write *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*, published in 1851. This work appears to have garnered more of Morgan's interest and attention than fighting the Ogden Land Company, much as he opposed the company's attempt to expropriate the Tonawanda Reservation. Anthropologist Elizabeth Tooker noted in a 1984 article that Morgan

*Community, etc. by Nathaniel T. Strong, A Chief of the Seneca Tribe*" (Philadelphia: Merrihew and Thompson, 1841), 16-17.

Michael Leroy Oberg, *Professional Indian: The American Odyssey of Eleazar W. Williams* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015), 46; 50-51; 69.

756 Nathaniel T. Strong, *Appeal to the Christian Community on the Conditions and Prospects of the New York Indians* (Philadelphia: J. Richards, 1839).

Maris Bryant Pierce, *Address on the Present Condition and Prospects of the Aboriginal Inhabitants of North America, With Particular Reference to the Seneca Nation* (Philadelphia: J. Richards, Printer, 1839).

757 Arthur C. Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker: Last Grand Sachem of the Iroquois and General Grant's Military Secretary* (Buffalo: Buffalo Historical Society, 1919), 79.

supported the Tonawanda Seneca as a citizen activist rather than a lawyer, and his activism was restricted mostly to 1846. He did not serve as their retained legal counsel.<sup>758</sup> Quite unlike its pamphlet predecessor by David Cusick, this book was more than acceptable to settler sensibilities, so much so that it has rarely been out of print, and as recently as twenty years ago, might still be recommended as a standard reference.<sup>759</sup> It probably did not hurt that Morgan was in entire agreement with the “vanishing Indian” trope, describing the Haudenosaunee on the first page of the Preface as “Born to an unpropitious fate, the inheritors of many wrongs, they have been unable, of themselves, to escape from the complicated difficulties which accelerate their decline.”<sup>760</sup> In his view, the great question was, “Can the residue of the Iroquois be reclaimed and fully raised to the position of citizen of the State?”<sup>761</sup>

The repercussions of the Ogden Land Company’s siege on Haudenosaunee reserves continued in the form of a posthumous publication by the complex and troubling Mohawk Episcopalian minister Eleazer Williams. Born in 1788, he was descended from Eunice Williams, a famously “unredeemed captive,” who was adopted into a Kahnawà:ke-based Mohawk family. Eunice Williams never left her adoptive Mohawk kin, but she never left her birth family either, continuing to visit them until her death. Her son Thomas also maintained those connections, which led him to agree to send two of his sons to his New England kin for fostering. Eleazer was the elder of the two, and he ultimately converted from Catholicism and trained to become an Episcopalian missionary in New England.<sup>762</sup> His missionary career ran aground on the

758 Elisabeth Tooker, “Lewis Henry Morgan, the Myth and the Man,” *University of Rochester Library Bulletin* XXXVII, (1984): 23-48.

759 Barbara Alice Mann, *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas* (New York: Peter Lang, 2000), 67-68.

760 Lewis Henry Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois* (Rochester: Sage and Brother Publishers, 1851), i.

761 Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, x.

762 Oberg, *Professional Indian*, 15-17; 22-23; 28-29.

contradictory demands made on Indigenous missionaries,<sup>763</sup> not least those that led him, like his father, to take part in the sales of Haudenosaunee reserve lands in New York State. He worked on behalf of the Ogden Land Company and eventually wrote a brief biography of his father in hopes of using it in his efforts to extract compensation from the company for work completed by his father.<sup>764</sup> But he was perhaps most famous in his time for claiming to be the lost heir to the French throne, rather than for the *Life of Te-ho-ra-gwa-ne-gen: Alias Thomas Williams, a Chief of the Caughnawaga Tribe of Indians in Canada*, published in 1859.<sup>765</sup>

Just over twenty years later, the first monograph-length Haudenosaunee response to *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois* appeared. Elias Johnson makes it more than clear to the reader that *Legends, Traditions, and Laws, of the Iroquois, or Six Nations, and History of the Tuscarora Indians* challenged Morgan's framing of Haudenosaunee history. Starting with his ironic revision and paraphrase of Morgan's original preface and emphatic statement that he alone wrote the book,<sup>766</sup> Johnson makes a not-so-subtle critique of how his predecessor gathered his materials. He states, "As I do not profess that this work is based upon authorities, a question might arise in the breast of the reader, where these materials were derived, or what reliance is to be placed upon its contents. The credibility of a witness is known to depend chiefly upon his means of knowledge." Unlike Morgan, he was born into a Tuscarora family, was a fluent Tuscarora language speaker, and learned directly from elders as well as from extensive reading in English.<sup>767</sup> Furthermore, as the title page duly informed even the most casual reader, Johnson was

763 Oberg, *Professional Indian*, 198-202.

764 Oberg, *Professional Indian*, 45-46.

765 Eleazer Williams, *Life of Te-ho-ra-gwa-ne-gen: Alias Thomas Williams, a Chief of the Caughnawaga Tribe of Indians in Canada* (Albany: J. Munsell, 1859).

766 Elias Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois, or Six Nations, and History of the Tuscarora Indians* (Lockport: Union Printing and Publishing Company, 1881), 5-8.

767 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 6; 8.

also a chief. This meant that he was a participant in attempts to reclaim Haudenosaunee lands, including a high-stakes attempt to take possession of part of a farm entangled in debts and general legal process after the death of the recognized owner in 1888. The failed attempt led to his impeachment by the Six Nations Council, and the events were significant enough to settler observers that they made the *New York Times*.<sup>768</sup>

There is a looming question about the Haudenosaunee historians whose publications have been covered so far, however. By all accounts, the Onondaga Nation is the official holder of the Haudenosaunee wampum records. Nonetheless, there is no sign, as yet, of Onondaga participation in composing European-style articles or books. There is certainly little to no evidence of the wampum archive, which would begin to change in 1883 with Horatio Hale's *The Iroquois Book of Rites*.<sup>769</sup> In a project highly reminiscent of modern day ethnohistorical reports, Hale worked closely with the Six Nations Council at Grand River. He transcribed both from texts written and then transcribed by Haudenosaunee participants in the Condolence ceremony and from wampum belt recitations, including material from the portion of the wampum archive still held at Onondaga in New York. In his preface, Hale declares the book's contents are "As a record, if we accept the chronology of the custodians, – which there is no reason to question, – it carries back the authentic history of Northern America to a date anterior by fifty years to the arrival of Columbus." He then refers to further evidence verifying Haudenosaunee knowledge of their connections to the "Moundbuilders," a significant portion of whose great earthworks have survived to the present against all odds.<sup>770</sup> Having touched briefly on the difficult question of how long Indigenous peoples have been in the Americas, on

768 "Tuscarora Chiefs Suspended," *New York Times*, June 8, 1888, 6.

769 Horatio Hale, *The Iroquois Book of Rites* (Philadelphia: D.G. Brinton, 1883).

770 Hale, *The Iroquois Book of Rites*, iii.

top of acknowledging that Haudenosaunee actually have historical records, Hale seems to back off rather nervously. He quickly reassures the reader that, after all, the book is truly useful for what it tells about what the Haudenosaunee are like and how they are related to other Indigenous nations.<sup>771</sup>

David Cusick stands as the earliest known Indigenous writer who not only authored a text but registered his copyright to it in the State of New York.<sup>772</sup> A possible candidate for the first Indigenous written and registered text in Canada is Louis Jackson's pamphlet *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt*.<sup>773</sup> Its copyright page records, "Entered according to Act of Parliament, in the year one thousand eight hundred and eighty-five by LOUIS JACKSON, in the Office of the Minister of Agriculture and Statistics at Ottawa."<sup>774</sup> Jackson led a skilled team of fifty Mohawk voyageurs to Egypt in 1884 in order to test new boats designed to navigate the Nile cataracts. These boats were intended for use in the relief of General Charles Gordon, who was trapped in Khartoum while attempting to put down a rebellion against Ottoman rule in Sudan.<sup>775</sup> James D. Deer, a member of Jackson's crew, wrote and self-published a contrasting account that reveals the experience was not quite as easy for the crew as it was for their foreman, at least with respect to the voyages to and from Egypt. They dealt with crowded, and at times, dangerous conditions due to racist hostility from non-Indigenous participants in the expedition that Jackson

771 *Ibid.*

772 Phillip H. Round, *Removable Type: Histories of the Book in Indian Country, 1663-1880* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2010), 150.

David Cusick, *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations* (1827), copyright page.

773 Louis Jackson, *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt: A Narrative of What was Seen and Accomplished by the Contingent of North American Voyageurs Who Led the British Boat Expedition for the Relief of Khartoum up the Cataracts of the Nile*, (Montreal: W. Drysdale and Co., 1885).

774 Jackson, *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt*, copyright page.

775 Jackson, *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt*, title page.

C.P. Stacey, ed., *Records of the Nile Voyageurs, 1884-1885: The Canadian Voyageur Contingent in the Gordon Relief Expedition* (Toronto: Champlain Society, 1959), 1; 4-5.

did not. He does not appear to have registered copyright, and his pamphlet may have been intended only for private distribution within the Kahnawà:ke community.<sup>776</sup>

According to military historian C.P. Stacey, this episode was somewhat important in Canadian history because it was called upon as a self-governing dominion to contribute to a major British operation.<sup>777</sup> If so, then Jackson and Deer were making an important claim for the significance of Kahnawà:ke participation because they were sought after by the British for their skills. Considering what was happening for Indigenous nations, this is also the eve of Warrior's second identified period of Indigenous written tradition, when there is a resurgence of associative cohesion. The late nineteenth century was an era of expansion of Canadian military and economic control over what are now the western provinces, combined with a burst of treaty making and forcing First Nations onto newly defined reserves. It is notable here that the person who brings together and leads the Mohawks is a Mohawk himself, without the intervention of priests or missionaries.

The first identifiable academic historiographic publication of the late nineteenth century is by yet another Tuscarora, this time J.N.B. Hewitt, whose first long article, "Era of the Formation of the Historic League of the Iroquois," appeared in the journal *American Anthropologist* in 1894. In it, he sought to debunk any claims to an early date for the foundation of the Five Nations Confederacy, that members of those nations could or did have any true historical knowledge or that Cusick was a historian. Hewitt had joined the United States Bureau of Ethnology in 1886, and up to that point, engaged primarily in linguistic work, taking advantage of his fluency in Tuscarora and previous experience.<sup>778</sup> Unsurprisingly, the question of just how long the

<sup>776</sup> James D. Deer, *The Canadian Voyageurs in Egypt* (Montréal: John Lovell and Son, 1885).

<sup>777</sup> Stacey, *Records of the Nile Voyageurs*, 1.

<sup>778</sup> Elisabeth Tooker and Barbara Graymont, "5. J.N.B. Hewitt," *Histories of Anthropology Annual* 3 (2007), 8-9.

Haudenosaunee Confederacy existed before Europeans first entered their traditional lands was and is politically sensitive. A presumed shallower temporal depth of the Confederacy suited those inclined to deny its significance and governance capacity as well as Haudenosaunee historical memory. Such denials were quite helpful in the continuing drive to complete the dissolution of Haudenosaunee reserves and justify the ongoing efforts to disband the traditional Council. Nevertheless, it seems unlikely that Hewitt was attempting to make any sort of political intervention or commentary as such. His concern is with the reuse of Cusick's chronology by Hale and potentially other scholars. Hewitt reports that the linguistic evidence in Cusick's account shows Cusick did indeed report a Five Nations Confederacy-derived tradition, but Hewitt also argues that key events are telescoped together in ways that do not make sense.<sup>779</sup> This could not satisfy a scholar like Hewitt, who was engaged in mapping linguistic relationships through time and space in North America.

Haudenosaunee who found themselves on lands within the claimed settler state of Canada, be they part of their own lands (i.e., Kahnawà:ke, Ahkwesáhsne, or Kanehsatà:ke, for example) or as one of several communities founded on tracts of land assigned to them in Mississauga traditional territory (i.e., along the Grand River), had somewhat different dynamics to deal with compared to those Haudenosaunee who found themselves on lands within the claimed settler state of the United States. For the most part, the Canadian federal government was more successful at maintaining authority over relations with Indigenous nations and communities relative to the provinces of Ontario and Québec than its United States counterpart did relative to New York State. The New York State government turned a blind eye to the activities of the Ogden Land Company, which included imposing the Buffalo Creek Treaty in order to

<sup>779</sup> J.N.B. Hewitt, *Era of the Formation of the Historic League of the Iroquois*, Reprinted from the January 1894 volume of *American Anthropologist*, (Washington: Judd and Detweiler, Printers, 1894), 62-63.

expropriate the Seneca's Buffalo Creek reserve.<sup>780</sup> Unfortunately, this did not necessarily correlate with better results in the struggle to hang onto reserve lands and land use rights. These Haudenosaunee communities had another card to play as they had thrown in their lot with the British Crown by fighting against the Thirteen Colonies during their war for independence, and so could access at least some of the cachet of the United Empire Loyalists. The artificial split of the Confederacy after that war ended in 1783 led members of Six Nations of the Grand River to set up their own council, although this was perhaps less disruptive than colonial authorities anticipated. By the late 1890s, the Six Nations Council and individual Confederacy citizens alike were deeply engaged with the still very new province of Ontario's project of constructing its history. Cecilia Morgan's overview of this participation includes the Six Nations Confederacy's nearly twenty-year relationship with the Ontario Historical Society, which ran from the 1890s to 1911. Highlights of the period include the Six Nations Council's 1897 meeting held in the Niagara Court House to consider whether to form their own on-reserve historical society and speeches by Confederacy delegates to the Ontario Historical Society meetings. This effort was by no means unprecedented. Similar work in New York State goes back at least to 1847, when Wäowano'onk Peter Wilson gave a speech to the New York Historical Society.<sup>781</sup> In the Canadian example, Haudenosaunee men and women gave speeches and wrote for newspapers and journals to create a foothold on paper and in the public mind on their own terms.<sup>782</sup>

Among the earliest individual Haudenosaunee participants in this project was John Ojijatekha Brant-Sero, whose varied career included journalism, speaking tours, acting, and

780 Arthur C. Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, *Researches and Transactions of the New York State Archeological Association*, Volume 4, Numbers I-V (Rochester: Lewis H. Morgan Chapter of the New York State Archeological Association, 1926), 142-144.

781 Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, 441.

782 Cecilia Morgan, *Creating Colonial Pasts: History, Memory, and Commemoration in Southern Ontario* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2015), 49; 59; 61.

running machinery. He was one of many Haudenosaunee and Mississauga people who travelled to England, eventually moving there permanently.<sup>783</sup> A skilled speaker fluent in Mohawk and English, in 1899, he gave a speech on Six Nations history before the American Association for the Advancement of Science.<sup>784</sup> This was a busy and successful year in this aspect of his activities, as he was chosen vice-president of both the Wentworth Historical Society and the Ontario Historical Society, although he did not serve a full term for either.<sup>785</sup> He also published at least two articles in 1899, one in the transactions of each Society. In *Papers and Records of the Ontario Historical Society*, he wrote about the descendants of his maternal great-uncle Joseph Brant.<sup>786</sup> In *Transactions of the Wentworth Historical Society*, he documented the existence of a deed for the Haldimand Tract.<sup>787</sup> His speech about the “Law-Giver of the Caniengahakas” was republished in the journal *Man* in 1901, and his journalism included articles in suffragette papers like *Women’s Franchise*.<sup>788</sup> The growing visibility of literate Haudenosaunee who were trained in both Haudenosaunee and English rhetoric and participated in both the speaking circuits and the booming periodical trade of the turn of the century still left plenty of room for “told-to” productions.

In 1902, the city editor of the Utica Observer, William Walker Canfield,<sup>789</sup> published *The Legends of the Iroquois: Told by “The Cornplanter.”*<sup>790</sup> The original speaker of the legends is the

783 S. Penny Petrone, “Brant-Sero, John Ojijatekha,” Dictionary of Canadian Biography,

[http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/brant\\_sero\\_john\\_ojijatekha\\_14E.html](http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/brant_sero_john_ojijatekha_14E.html) (accessed January 30, 2021).

784 Penny Petrone, “Brant-Sero, John Ojijatekha.”

785 *Ibid.*

786 John O. Brant-Sero, “Some Descendants of Joseph Brant,” *Papers and Records of the Ontario Historical Society* 1 (1899): 113-117.

787 John O. Brant-Sero, “The Six Nations Indians in the Province of Ontario, Canada,” *Transactions of the Wentworth Historical Society*, 2 (1899): 62-73.

788 John O. Brant-Sero, “Dekanawidah: The Law-Giver of the Caniengahakas,” *Man* 1, no. 134 (1901): 166-170.  
John O. Brant-Sero, ““Six Nations Indians’ in Canada Under Woman Rule,” *Women’s Franchise*, August 22, 1907, London.

789 “William Canfield, Utica Editor, Dies,” *New York Times*, August 28, 1937, 6.

790 William W. Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois: Told By “The Cornplanter”* (New York: A. Wessels Company, 1902).

famous opponent of Red Jacket, Seneca Pine Tree Chief Cornplanter, who signed two contentious treaties giving up portions of Seneca lands and had friends among the staff of the Holland, later Ogden Land Company.<sup>791</sup> According to Canfield, Cornplanter's friend recorded the "legends" in several civil engineer field books, which eventually came into his possession. Canfield then carried out twenty-five years of work that he characterized as "further verification" with other Indigenous people in New York.<sup>792</sup> His descriptions are oddly circumspect here, between holding back the name of Cornplanter's friend and leaving the possibility open that some of his Indigenous informants were not Haudenosaunee. Still, the resulting text, although framed as "legends," includes some material recognizable from David Cusick and Elias Johnson's publications, the stories of the flying head and the hunter resurrected by the animals.<sup>793</sup>

Meanwhile, nearly ten years later, a patronage-appointed civil servant in the Canadian federal Department of Indian Affairs completed part of an ongoing settler effort to take control of Haudenosaunee history. Having already spent nearly thirty years labouring as an Indian agent on treaty negotiation junkets and administrative tasks in Ottawa, Duncan Campbell Scott may also have been looking for a professional break.<sup>794</sup> When the Council of the Six Nations at Grand River decided to strike a committee to transcribe a version of their early history in 1900, Scott was in an excellent position to learn about their project and apparently acquired a copy of its results. On May 16, 1911, Scott, who was also a Fellow of the prestigious Royal Society of Canada, presented *Traditional History of the Confederacy of the Six Nations* to his colleagues. In the Royal Society of Canada's subsequent published version, he declared, "it is printed as it came

791 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 53-54.

Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 15-16.

792 Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 16-17.

793 Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 125-126; 129-135.

794 Robert L. McDougall, "Duncan Campbell Scott," *The Canadian Encyclopedia*,

<https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/duncan-campbell-scott> (accessed January 30, 2021).

from their hands.”<sup>795</sup> Two years later, Scott finally reached the pinnacle of his civil service career by ascending to the position of deputy superintendent of the department.

At this point, the thread of Haudenosaunee historical publications becomes firmly united with the early career of Seneca anthropologist Arthur Caswell Parker. His articles and monographs cited here extend to the end of this period of the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition, representing a part of his life’s work. Parker’s work on Haudenosaunee history in monograph form begins with his 1913 study of the Gai’wiio or Code of Handsome Lake. Parker’s own family was closely associated with Handsome Lake and his Code. His great uncle Ely S. Parker was the grandson of Sose-ha’-wa (Sos’hēowǎ) Jemmy Johnson, the successor and grandson of Handsome Lake.<sup>796</sup>

In 1916 he weighed in on the question of Haudenosaunee origins based on an analysis of archaeological work, including his own.<sup>797</sup> He also took the controversial step of producing a consolidated version of the Great Law of Peace based on a transcription by Onondaga Chief Seth Newhouse in 1897 and the Grand River Council’s 1900 rendering. Part of the reason for controversy was his decision to ask Albert Cusick, who had worked extensively with Horatio Hale, to review and suggest changes to the Grand River document.<sup>798</sup> In 1919 Parker completed his great-uncle Ely S. Parker’s biography, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker: Last Grand Sachem of the Iroquois and General Grant’s Military Secretary*.<sup>799</sup> While today Ely S. Parker is best known for working with Lewis Henry Morgan, he was originally better known for his military exploits

795 Duncan C. Scott, ed., *Traditional History of the Confederacy of the Six Nations*, Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada (Ottawa: Royal Society of Canada, 1911), 195.

796 Arthur C. Parker, *The Code of Handsome Lake, the Seneca Prophet* (Albany: University of the State of New York, 1913), 12.

797 Arthur C. Parker, “The Origins of the Iroquois as Suggested by Their Archaeology,” *American Anthropologist* 18 (1916): 479-507.

798 Arthur C. Parker, *The Constitution of the Five Nations* (Albany: University of the State of New York, 1916), 12-13.

799 Buffalo, N.Y.: Buffalo Historical Society, 1919.

and for serving as the first Indigenous Commissioner of Indian Affairs in the United States.

Contrary to this subtitle declaring him “Last Grand Sachem of the Iroquois,” his great-nephew frames his life as part of a history of a still extant Indigenous people in the actual text.

In 1920 Parker partially returned to the topic of his early 1916 article on the question of Haudenosaunee origins, with the composition of an extended account of pre-European Haudenosaunee material culture in New York State.<sup>800</sup> Nearly half of the book is a catalogue of archaeological type site descriptions by several other authors. Its audience included professional archaeologists and people who today are called pot hunters. His first full chapter, “Origin of Material Culture and the Distribution of the Various Races of Man,” tackles the problem of the apparent lack of evidence for human occupation of the Americas beyond a shallow time depth relative to Asia. He then engages in a diplomatic debunking of several creative hypotheses connecting the local earthwork mounds to Europeans rather than people Indigenous to the Americas.<sup>801</sup>

The direct relationship between Haudenosaunee communities (on both sides of the Medicine Line) with southern Ontario historical societies was drawing to a close. Asa R. Hill, secretary of the Six Nations Council, addressed the Ontario Historical Society at its 1922 General Meeting. His speech on “The Historical Position of the Six Nations” soon appeared in the *Papers and Records of the Society*,<sup>802</sup> reiterating what should have been familiar history, yet apparently needed repeating. The double-barrelled title, implying the stance of the Six Nations Confederacy relative to the British Crown in both the past and the present, was and is a Haudenosaunee rhetorical masterstroke. Uncompromising in his presentation, Hill briefly recounted the history

800 Arthur C. Parker, *The Archaeological History of New York* (Albany: University of the State of New York, 1920).

801 Parker, *The Archaeological History of New York*, 19-21.

802 Asa R. Hill, “The Historical Position of the Six Nations,” *Papers and Records of the Ontario Historical Society* 19 (1922): 103-109.

of the Six Nations-British alliance, including a recital of letters and parts of treaties describing the duties of both parties. He closed his text with the firm statement that, “The Six Nations claim the exercise of their ancient right of self-government, and allege the faith and honour of the Crown is pledged for this object.”<sup>803</sup> Unfortunately, the Canadian federal government did not share this view, imposing an additional Indian Act band council on the Six Nations of the Grand River in 1924, going so far as to padlock the older Council’s long house shut.<sup>804</sup> Nevertheless, this did not dissolve the original Six Nations Council at Grand River.

There is still one more monograph by Arthur C. Parker before we leave the 1920s, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, published in 1926.<sup>805</sup> Parker relates a history of his own nation by calling upon the full range of his skills and contacts to draw together oral, written, and archaeological information. Against the tenor of the times, rather than write another seeming elegy to an Indigenous nation that has emphatically not vanished, he covers the successful Seneca resistance to multiple invasions and settler American attempts to force them out of their original homeland. Already firmly engaged in his new role as director of the Rochester Museum of Arts and Sciences, he maintained a busy schedule of speechmaking and journalism through the rest of the decade, focussed more on ethnographic topics and winning resources for his museum.<sup>806</sup>

803 Hill, “The Historical Position of the Six Nations,” 109.

804 Olive Patricia Dickason, *Canada’s First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992 [2002]), 345.

Alicia Elliott, “The Meaning of Elections for Six Nation,” (May 11, 2015) Briarpatch, <https://briarpatchmagazine.com/articles/view/the-meaning-of-elections-for-six-nations> (accessed January 30, 2021).

805 Arthur C. Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, Researches and Transactions of the New York State Archeological Association, Volume 4, Numbers I-V (Rochester: Lewis H. Morgan Chapter of the New York State Archeological Association, 1926).

806 River Campus Libraries, “Arthur Caswell Parker Papers Finding Aid,” University of Rochester River Campus Libraries, <https://rbscp.lib.rochester.edu/finding-aids/AP23> (accessed January 21, 2021).

New York State Library, “Arthur Caswell Parker Papers, 1915-1953,” New York State Library, <https://www.nysl.nysed.gov/msscfa/sc13604.htm> (accessed December 21, 2021).

***A Distant View in Time Part Two: Phase Shifts and Time Capsules of Haudenosaunee Historiography***

At this point, we reach not only the next period of reduced associative cohesion impacting the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition identified by Warrior but also a twenty-year gap in Haudenosaunee historiography. The gap is not strictly surprising since it falls within the 1925 – 1961 period, which includes the Great Depression, most of the United States Prohibition Era (1920 – 1933), the Second World War (1939 – 1945) and the Korean War (1950 – 1953). The pamphlets, books, and speeches discussed so far were all directed primarily at a settler audience. Even the sharpest toned of the examples, Elias Johnson’s riposte to Lewis Henry Morgan’s intervention in Haudenosaunee historiography, insists on framing settler misbehaviour as grounded in misinformation about Indigenous people and treaties. But speaking out to the wider settler communities around them would have to wait in the context of already difficult reserve conditions exacerbated by the added impact of a resurgence in settler lawlessness as their own circumstances worsened. The next book in the corpus of works considered for this project finally appeared in 1955, a biography of Joseph Brant by Harvey Chalmers in collaboration with Mohawk historian and Brant descendant Ethel Brant Monture.<sup>807</sup> It focusses on his political and military actions and the early history of the Mohawk community he founded in southern Ontario. An influential diplomat and war leader, Joseph Brant remains a fascinating figure, and the publication of his biography so soon after the end of the active portion of the Korean War is a striking coincidence considering his prominence during and after a previously awkwardly concluded war, the War of 1812. Ethel Brant Monture was a busy lecturer and public speaker on

807 Harvey Chalmers with Ethel B. Monture, *Joseph Brant: Mohawk* (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1955).

Haudenosaunee history in her own right and wrote a book of biographical sketches, *Famous Indians: Brant, Crowfoot, Oronhyatekha*.<sup>808</sup>

The publishing record falls silent again until Julia L. Jamieson released her pamphlet history of education at the Six Nations on the Grand River from 1784 to 1924.<sup>809</sup> She produced this work in a telltale year in the Canadian context, 1969, the year of the Canadian government's proposed "White Paper." A pronounced sense of associative cohesion characterizes this subsequent period of Indigenous intellectual tradition. Jamieson was part of an influential family, including many teachers, descended from another "white captive" taken in a mourning raid who chose to stay with the Haudenosaunee, Mary Jemison. Her career included teaching, work on Mohawk language retention, and long service as a community and church historian.<sup>810</sup> Jamieson was an active participant in the struggle at Grand River to maintain Haudenosaunee children's access to day schooling on reserve by Haudenosaunee teachers, so it is difficult not to impute some political intent to the pamphlet. However, Jamieson emphasizes her role as a community historian in it, disclosing that she wrote this history "In compliance with the requests of a number of the ex-students of the 'Old Thomas School House' now known as the 'David Thomas Memorial Hall'..."<sup>811</sup> She then presents a history of one of the oldest buildings on the Grand River Reserve and the community members' efforts to build and maintain their own school. In fact, she traces the

808 Cecilia Morgan, "Performing for 'Imperial Eyes': Bernice Loft and Ethel Brant Monture, Ontario, 1930s-60s," in *Contact Zones: Aboriginal and Settler Women in Canada's Colonial Past*, eds. Katie Pickles and Maya Rutherford (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005), 67-69; 72-73.

Ethel Brant Monture, *Famous Indians: Brant, Crowfoot, Oronhyatekha* (Toronto: Clarke, Irwin, 1960).

Brendan Frederick R. Edwards, "Ethel Brant Monture: 'A One-Woman Crusade'," McMaster University Library, <https://digitalcollections.mcmaster.ca/hpcanpub/case-study/ethel-brant-monture-one-woman-crusade> (accessed December 21, 2021).

809 Julia L. Jamieson, *Echoes of the Past: A History of Education from the Time of the Six Nations Settlement on the Banks of the Grand River in 1784 to 1924* (Brantford: Self-Published, 1969).

810 Alison Norman, "'True to My Own Noble Race': Six Nations Women Teachers at Grand River in the Early Twentieth Century," *Ontario History* 107, no. 1 (Spring 2015), 22.

811 Jamieson, *Echoes of the Past*, 2.

origins of European-style education to a 1649 ordinance passed by Oliver Cromwell's Long Parliament in England,<sup>812</sup> a clever reminder that the Canadian government was a late interloper in the centuries-long relationship of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy with Britain, persisting through remarkable changes in the British government.

The early 1970s represent a relatively rich period for Haudenosaunee history, although the number of works is still few. The decade begins with the Champlain Society's publication of Major John Norton's journal,<sup>813</sup> an inadvertent time capsule as this adopted nephew of Joseph Brant had intended to have it published during his own lifetime. In it, he describes his visit with the Cherokees, analyses the United States' war on Indigenous nations of the Old Northwest, describes and explores Six Nations culture and history, and recounts his own memoirs from 1807 to 1815. His adventurous life included at least one trip to England and inconclusive evidence that he died in Mexico in 1831.<sup>814</sup> The Toronto-based Champlain Society, founded in 1905 and specializing in publishing documents from Canadian history, might well have passed on the chance to distribute Norton's journal had he not been connected to Joseph Brant.<sup>815</sup> It must be acknowledged that this book is dissociated from the other items discussed here, as it lacks participation, even in the form of a preface or foreword, by a Haudenosaunee scholar or member of the Brant family. Despite the lingering boost in popular investment as well as interest in Canadian history after the 1967 Centennial, neither the Haudenosaunee nor southern Ontario historical societies sought the type of relationship like those extant from the 1890s to 1922.

812 *Ibid.*

813 John Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816*, eds. Carl F. Klinck and James J. Talman (Toronto: The Champlain Society, 1970 and 2011).

814 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, xvi.

815 The Champlain Society, "About the Champlain Society," The Champlain Society, <https://champlainsociety.utpjournals.press/about> (accessed December 31, 2021).

The earliest years of Haudenosaunee historical writing are dominated by Senecas and Tuscaroras, while in the twentieth century, the proportions shifted to Mohawks, with the Senecas a more distant second with fewer authors producing multiple works. The next Mohawk-authored book is by Alma Greene, published in 1972 and reissued in 1997 with forewords by her daughter Jeannette Y. Greene and granddaughters Lori M. And Marie H. Greene. This book has several apparent parallels with *Fifty Dollar Bride*, released three years later. Like Marie Delorme Smith, Alma Greene's autobiography begins in the third person, presenting key episodes. Unlike Delorme Smith, who needed to be more circumspect, Greene openly draws on Haudenosaunee-sourced narratives, including the actions of other than human beings. Yet she closes the book in the first person, not the third, and after this date, memoirs by Haudenosaunee women and Northwest Métis women alike stay firmly with the first person.

There are two quite different items for 1973, another addition to the Haudenosaunee pamphlet literature corpus, and one other autobiography. The first of these is Enos T. Montour's *The Feathered U.E.L's* (United Empire Loyalists), his episodic retelling of the history of the Six Nations at Grand River through the fictional Logan family and the local Delaware Chapel. Spanning the years from just after 1812 to the mid-1950s, Montour discusses religious conflict, treaties, and men's military service with the British. Montour, who lived from 1899 to 1984, was Lenâpé and served many years as a United Church minister. That is, he was part of the Lenâpé League communities, who had been gradually forced onto Haudenosaunee lands during the seventeenth century and adopted as Haudenosaunee citizens between 1661 and 1677.<sup>816</sup> Tragically this would contribute to the later religious strife between Christian denominations, especially between Catholics and Protestants (members of different Protestant sects also

816 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 172.

sometimes clashed) that Montour explores in his narrative. The autobiography is that of Tuscarora Chief and activist Clinton Rickard, narrated to his longtime friend and collaborator, historian and linguist Barbara Graymont.<sup>817</sup> In another example of intertwined autobiography and history, Rickard lays out the complex interrelations between the Haudenosaunee Confederacy and the two settler colonial governments of Canada and the United States. He emphasized Haudenosaunee and Tuscarora's shared ability to overcome interference from colonial officials, provided they worked together and pursued their goals steadily.

One of the earliest publications by another member of the Jamieson family, Keith Jamieson, is also an instalment in the history of education at Six Nations on the Grand River, printed and distributed by the Woodland Indian Cultural Centre.<sup>818</sup> This 1987 pamphlet takes up the story after 1924, chronicling Six Nations' struggle to maintain control over elementary education on reserve, including successful resistance to the harmful intentions of the revised Indian Act of 1951. Jamieson was just beginning his career as an ethnohistorian and museum curator, and so he will figure again in this section of the Distant View. His pamphlet was complemented by another released in the same year by the team of Olive Moses, Doris Henhawk, and Lloyd King, adding coverage of the infamous Mohawk Institute, the residential school referred to by former students as "the Mush Hole." This Woodland Indian Cultural Centre pamphlet also includes a reproduction of Julia L. Jamieson's original booklet.<sup>819</sup>

These pamphlets represent some of the Woodland Indian Culture Centre's (now called the Woodland Cultural Centre) first productions after its founding in 1972. Established by the

817 Clinton Rickard, *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*, ed. Barbara Graymont (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973).

818 Keith Jamieson, *History of Six Nations Education* (Brantford: The Woodland Indian Cultural Education Centre, 1987).

819 Olive Moses *et al.*, *History of Education on the Six Nations Reserve* (Brantford: Woodland Cultural Education Centre, 1987).

Association of Iroquois and Allied Indians after the long-desired closure of the Mohawk Institute, the Centre took over the former school's buildings in Brantford as part of its task of countering the school's impacts.<sup>820</sup> It represents a non-academic Indigenous-owned and run organization focussed on research materials and historical preservation in eastern Canada that includes publishing facilities, apart from offices of the Six Nations governments.

From 1972 Haudenosaunee historical works tend to appear at no more than five to six-year intervals, including an influx of dissertations. 1989 was a quietly important year for transcribed versions of the Great Law of Peace. Condoled Cayuga Chief<sup>821</sup> Jacob E. Thomas, fluent in the five major languages of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy and already a revered cultural leader and historian, returned to the version written down by Seth Newhouse in 1897. The result is a powerful update, including emended and modernized spellings of key terms in Cayuga, Mohawk, and Onondaga in a table in the pamphlet's front matter. Another feature of this pamphlet is the Sandpiper Press, itself a part of what has since become the Jake Thomas Learning Centre for the "Preservation and promotion of traditional Haudenosaunee ways through language and artisan workshops."<sup>822</sup> Thomas' work likely helped stimulate the effort to revisit and retranslate Condoled Seneca Chief John Arthur Gibson's recitation of the Great Law in Onondaga to Alexander A. Goldenweiser in 1912. Linguist Hanni Woodbury and Haudenosaunee elders Reg Henry and Harry Webster completed this work which appeared in an over 750-page

820 Woodland Cultural Centre, "About the Centre," Woodland Cultural Centre, <https://woodlandculturalcentre.ca/about-us/> (accessed December 21, 2021).

Woodland Cultural Centre, "The Campaign," Woodland Cultural Centre, <https://woodlandculturalcentre.ca/the-campaign/> (accessed December 21, 2021).

821 A "condoled chief" is a man who has been chosen to carry the name of one of the founding chiefs of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, thereby taking up his seat and associated duties in the Confederacy Council.

822 Yvonne Thomas, "Our Centre and Founders," Jake Thomas Learning Centre, <https://jakethomaslearningcentre.ca/welcome> (accessed December 21, 2021).

edition in the Algonquian and Iroquoian Linguistics Memoir Series in 1992. Thomas himself contributed to the project.<sup>823</sup>

In 1989 the memoirs of Cornplanter's nephew Chainbreaker, also known as Governor Blacksnake, were released in hard cover under the editing aegis of anthropologist Thomas S. Abler.<sup>824</sup> The book is an unusual "told-to" narrative for one transcribed in the mid to late nineteenth century, in that both speaker and amanuensis were Indigenous. Seneca Chief Blacksnake dictated his memoirs to a literate Seneca who lived in the same community, Benjamin Williams. Although Abler emphasizes the American revolutionary war portions of Chainbreaker's autobiography, it also describes another key period, including Handsome Lake's life and teachings. Interest in Chainbreaker's memoirs remained important enough for them to be reissued in softcover with a new preface in 2005.

Now we return to Warrior's recent Indigenous intellectual periodization, starting in 1994, when, it is fair to say, associative cohesion was on the rise again, reflected in a resurgence of cultural and historical publications. Like many Indigenous nations, Haudenosaunee had entered post secondary education in greater numbers, expanding beyond the fields of law, education, and anthropology. The aftermath of what the settler media labelled the "Oka Crisis" continued to affect the Mohawk communities involved on a practical day-to-day level. This spurred considerable efforts to gather records, make archives, and produce books that presented specifically Mohawk perspectives from Kanehsatà:ke and Ahkwesáhsne. The earliest Mohawk-written account of the "Oka Crisis" is Donna Goodleaf's 1995 book, *Entering the War Zone: A*

823 John Arthur Gibson, *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser's Manuscript* (Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992).

824 Governor Blacksnake, *Chainbreaker: The Revolutionary War Memoirs of Governor Blacksnake as Told to Benjamin Williams*, ed. Thomas S. Abler (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989 [2005]).

*Mohawk Perspective on Resisting Invasions*.<sup>825</sup> Goodleaf's book is not the very earliest narrative of the crisis based on Mohawk statements and records created by and collected by Mohawk journalists, activists, and community members, however. That narrative is Chapter 6 in non-Haudenosaunee historian Bruce E. Johansen's *Life and Death in Mohawk Country*, which attempts to recount, to the extent possible, the verifiable facts of what happened.<sup>826</sup> After he lays out a very brief overview of Haudenosaunee history, the discussion moves to St. Regis-Ahkwesáhsne. In *Entering the War Zone*, Goodleaf begins with an in-depth historical overview followed by the history and social organization of Kanehsatà:ke. Goodleaf, who was born in Kahnawà:ke, adds a different perspective by exploring how these are expressed through the actions of the Women's and Men's Societies to block the proposed golf course and the aftermath of the Canadian military operation against them.

Today the assumption that Indigenous peoples would vanish via death or assimilation has lost much but, by no means all, of its grip on most mainstream imaginations. At a minimum, neither settler nor even the most pessimistic Indigenous commenters make a simple conflation between wearing blue jeans and sneakers and a loss of Indigenous identity and culture. It is an understandable, if lazy, conflation, since it is far easier to recognize material changes at a glance, compared to learning how a community adapts the elements of its epistemology to new conditions. Haudenosaunee historians have been among the first to resist and decry the conflation, even as they had to deal first with questions that, by nature, have obvious physical impacts and therefore impose changes to material culture. This is quite helpful for identifying and documenting social problems such as alcoholism and family

825 Donna K. Goodleaf, *Entering the War Zone: A Mohawk Perspective on Resisting Invasions* (Penticton: Theytus Books Ltd., 1995).

826 Bruce E. Johansen, *Life and Death in Mohawk Country* (Golden: North American Press, 1993), 133-158.

violence, but Indigenous scholars, in general, were more than losing patience with such “problem literature” in the 1990s. Obviously, Indigenous peoples had been solving problems long before Europeans arrived and have been solving them since. There were older Haudenosaunee histories recounting successful resistance to land grabs, such as Arthur C. Parker’s history of the Senecas, and Julia and later Keith Jamieson’s histories on re-establishing Mohawk control of Mohawk child education. Nevertheless, it took until 1996 for studies beyond these areas to appear, with Deborah Doxtator’s dissertation looking into the question of how the imposition of reserves impacted three Haudenosaunee communities.<sup>827</sup> Considering the examples of the Mohawk community of Tyendinaga, Six Nations of the Grand River, and the Tonawanda Seneca in New York State, she sought to understand how the Haudenosaunee clan system readjusted under the new conditions. Furthermore, Doxtator applied the “Rotinonhsyonni metaphor of two sides” to complete her analysis. In other words, Doxtator explicitly analysed her materials in terms of the Haudenosaunee epistemological theme of twoness, in this case two sides, of Haudenosaunee governance: internal community relations and interactions with external colonial authorities. Doxtator’s study, alas, still available only in the grey literature corpus, is the earliest academic project carried out using a Haudenosaunee analytical framework to explore a question in Haudenosaunee history I have found. It is evidence of an important breakthrough in Indigenous scholarship.

Another inadvertent time capsule besides John Norton’s diary reappeared in 1999. While its contents remain unpublished at the time of writing, it stands as important evidence of Haudenosaunee adapting European writing methods to support the continuity of their own

<sup>827</sup> Deborah Doxtator, “What Happened to the Iroquois Clans? A Study of Clans in Three Nineteenth Century Rotinonhsyonni Communities” (PhD Dissertation, University of Western Ontario, 1996).

records under difficult conditions. In 1940 – 1941 and 1966, some Oneidas who had relocated to Wisconsin as part of a controversial scheme advocated by, among others, Eleazer Williams,<sup>828</sup> filled 167 notebooks with notes on what their daily lives were like. Many, although not all, of the notebooks were written in Oneida as part of the larger Oneida Language and Folklore Project formally initiated by linguist and anthropologist Morris Swadesh. These notebooks were finally relocated and stored at the University of Wisconsin-Madison (UW-M), with copies repatriated to the Oneida Nation. A UW-M newspaper article recorded Oneida citizen and director of the American Indian Studies program Roberta Hill’s comments on the repatriation: “American Indians have experienced an intergenerational rift in the transference of knowledge, and this return of materials on our life and language will help heal that rift.”<sup>829</sup>

A momentous change is marked by the Haudenosaunee-led or authored historical works in 2000. Since this time, these authors have responded directly to the needs and concerns of Haudenosaunee audiences by writing to those audiences. They have returned deliberately to modes of writing that challenge or otherwise reshape the accepted mainstream forms of monographs, anthologies, and articles. The authors actively cite and engage with the established Haudenosaunee strand of Indigenous intellectual tradition, both ancient and recent. Most of all, these works are making it into print, although as for any published work, *staying* in print remains a challenge. Their publishers are now mainly universities rather than popular presses. This is a hallmark of more of these books coming from university-based or at least university-partnered projects, be they former theses or expansions of more ephemeral materials created for such media as museum exhibitions or documentaries.

828 Oberg, *Professional Indian*, 84-89.

829 “Rediscovered Native History Notebooks Donated to Oneida (3 June 1999),” University of Wisconsin-Madison News, <https://news.wisc.edu/rediscovered-native-history-notebooks-donated-to-oneida/> (accessed October 10, 2020).

Haudenosaunee observed the two hundredth anniversary of the Treaty of Canandaigua in 1994 with ceremony, speeches, and a colloquium of predominantly Haudenosaunee scholars discussing the treaty relationships of the Six Nations with the United States. Six years later, a collection of the articles, transcribed speeches, and selected document reproductions further marked the day and the ongoing relationships commemorated in the event, *Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794*.<sup>830</sup> The appendix of selected historical documents made materials more readily available to the public that remain challenging to access even today. This was the year of another major Haudenosaunee historical monograph, Seneca historian and literary scholar Barbara Alice Mann's *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas*.<sup>831</sup> Academically based at Jessup Scott Honors College at the University of Toledo, Mann detailed the many roles and duties of Haudenosaunee women by creating a written Haudenosaunee-European dialogue structured by the Haudenosaunee Four Epochs of Time. In doing so, Mann contends not only is it possible to reconstruct these aspects of Haudenosaunee women's lives and social importance prior to the arrival of Europeans, but also for the salience and accuracy of Haudenosaunee historical records. She also carried forward a style of Indigenous critical writing using overt humour and a hefty apparatus of what many mainstream readers might consider discursive endnotes. This is the first of three of Mann's books that fall within the scope of this project.

The next of Mann's books falls outside the scope of this project, in which she takes up a theme touched on by Arthur C. Parker in *The Archaeological History of New York State*, the major earthworks in that region and their builders.<sup>832</sup> Arguing for identifying the Seneca as one of several Indigenous nations descended from the "Moundbuilders," Mann carries out a major

830 G. Peter Jemison and Anna M. Schein, eds., *Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794* (Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000).

831 Barbara Alice Mann, *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas* (New York: Peter Lang, 2000).

832 Barbara Alice Mann, *Native Americans, Archaeologists, and the Mounds* (New York: Peter Lang, 2003).

analysis of the earliest surveys and destruction of the thousands of structures in the upper Ohio and Mississippi valleys. This 2003 book is somewhat easier to read in comparison to the more difficult material of *George Washington's War on Native America*.<sup>833</sup> Here is a new account of the 1779 – 1882 Sullivan-Clinton scorched earth campaign and subsequent attacks on the Haudenosaunee and their neighbours, centring Indigenous perspectives and experiences. While it is as thoroughly referenced as *Iroquoian Women*, there is no similar room for wry humour and startling juxtapositions in *George Washington's War on Native America*. It is also likely that this publication contributed to Mann's later invitation to join the international study project "Massacre and Colonization, 1780 – 1820."<sup>834</sup>

Mann's next 2006 monograph, *The Land of the Three Miamis*, is quite different in form and subject.<sup>835</sup> Taking a less academic bent, Mann eschews detailed footnotes or direct engagement with European narratives. Instead, she focusses on retelling Haudenosaunee history in Ohio through the Four Epochs of Time in a style meant to impart vital cultural narratives to her granddaughter, building on the specific task already undertaken in *Iroquoian Women*. Drawing on her previous work, including articles and other collaborations, she brings together a fast-moving narrative that is unsparing in its critique of colonialism and acknowledgement of when the Haudenosaunee struggled to maintain policies and actions consistent with the Great Law of Peace. The critique makes great use of paired comparisons and contrast, such as in the two chapters of Part II: The Second Epoch of Time. There Mann establishes a correlation between the ancient

833 Barbara Alice Mann, *George Washington's War on Native America* (Westport: Praeger, 2005).

Specific citations of this text are from the 2008 paperback edition, which has the same pagination.

834 Barbara Alice Mann, "Curriculum Vitae," University of Toledo: Jessup Scott Honors College, <https://www.utoledo.edu/honors/pdfs/Barbara%20Mann%20CV.pdf> (accessed May 19, 2021), 2.

Centre for Study of Violence, "Funded Research," University of Newcastle-Australia, <https://www.newcastle.edu.au/research/centre/csov/research> (accessed November 21, 2021).

835 Barbara Alice Mann, *The Land of the Three Miamis: A Traditional Narrative of the Iroquois in Ohio* (Toledo: Urban Affairs Centre Press, 2006).

Mound cultures the Haudenosaunee struggled to liberate themselves from via the Great Law of Peace with the newly United States as of 1783. She describes the Mound cultures as hierarchical, controlled by an elite that supported wars others fought for them, and oppressive.<sup>836</sup> Further on, she explains how George Washington, in his new role as president, claimed his people were now the Haudenosaunee's overlords. However, she adds the Haudenosaunee knew he was also desperate to seize their land "because he had promised it to his soldiers in return for fighting his Revolution."<sup>837</sup>

Five years later, Brian Rice's *The Rotinonshonni: A Traditional Iroquoian History Through the Eyes of Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera* brought yet another approach to presenting Rotinonshonni history from a Rotinonshonni perspective. Rice is being carefully specific due to his own relations, founded in the predominantly Mohawk-speaking communities in southern Ontario and Québec. He refers to the Rotinonshonni, the Mohawk language version of the Seneca word Hodínöhšö:ni:h, which is the origin of the less phonetically careful rendering, Haudenosaunee.<sup>838</sup> Seeking to understand the different versions and views of the Great Law of Peace, Rice undertook a rigorous plan of study, including ceremony, a PhD program, and a journey by foot to visit the major places referenced in the oral traditions he was engaging.<sup>839</sup> From the combination of these experiences and learnings, Rice narrates a history through the lives and actions of the Twin Sons of Sky Woman, showing how these past events continue to shape and change present-day Rotinonshonni experiences.

The very next year, Rick Monture presented his study of the philosophies, intellectual traditions, and assertions of sovereignty in the written record of the Six Nations at Grand River,

836 Mann, *The Land of the Three Miamis*, 39.

837 Mann, *The Land of the Three Miamis*, 81; 82.

838 Ives Goddard, "Synonymy," in *The Handbook of North American Indians: Northeast, Volume 15*, ed. Bruce G. Trigger (Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution, 1978), 320.

839 Brian Rice, *The Rotinonshonni: A Traditional Iroquoian History Through the Eyes of Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera* (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2013), 1-4.

integrating works by a range of scholars, leaders, and performers.<sup>840</sup> In *We Share Our Matters: Teionkwakhashion tsi niionkwariho:ten: Two Centuries of Writing and Resistance at Six Nations of the Grand River*, Monture joins his colleagues in reiterating the continuing life and relevance of these elements of the Six Nations at Grand River's records for them, and Haudenosaunee more widely. In fact, the Six Nations at Grand River are the most prolific in terms of publications in the early twenty-first century. Keith Jamieson adds to the items in print with *Dr. Oronhyatekha: Security, Justice, and Equality*,<sup>841</sup> co-written with Michelle A. Hamilton. This biography recounts the remarkable life of Mohawk Peter Oronhyateka Martin (1841 – 1907), one of the first Indigenous physicians in Canada, and a prominent politician and activist. Despite his international fame, he almost vanished from the historical record, perhaps because he managed to defy the racist structures of his time that prevented so many other Haudenosaunee from completing post-secondary education or running large organizations. Monture and Jamieson and Hamilton's books, despite their different foci, shed significant light on the ongoing impact of colonialism on Haudenosaunee governance and culture at Six Nations of the Grand River in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. For instance, in his discussion of E. Pauline Johnson, Monture argues she was part of the Grand River community, but excluded from its political life.<sup>842</sup> Jamieson and Hamilton show how Oronhyatekha's own gradual exclusion from direct participation in Haudenosaunee governance at Grand River redirected his career ambitions, which nevertheless centred on serving his people.<sup>843</sup>

840 Rick Monture, *We Share Our Matters = Teionkwakhashion tsi niionkwariho:ten: Two Centuries of Writing and Resistance at Six Nations of the Grand River* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2014).

841 Keith Jamieson, and Michelle A. Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha: Security, Justice, and Equality* (Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2016).

842 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 104.

843 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 119; 136-141; 157-160.

The last item within the study corpus for this project is the 2017 land tenure study of the Haldimand Tract along the southern Grand River by Susan M. Hill.<sup>844</sup> Or at least, that is what *The Clay We Are Made Of: Haudenosaunee Land Tenure on the Grand River* is in a surface sense, but it is, in fact, far more than this. In combining oral traditional and written sources, including materials written by Haudenosaunee participants in the struggle to maintain that land tenure, Hill presents a nuanced study and explication of Haudenosaunee historical consciousness and knowledge. Unlike a typical land tenure study based first in settler legal frameworks and starting from a selected moment of Haudenosaunee-European contact, in the very first pages, Hill sets out a Haudenosaunee historical legal framework. First, she describes Haudenosaunee historical consciousness, then the nature of Haudenosaunee land tenure and policy, and closes the section with a description of the questions and records she will examine throughout the following text.<sup>845</sup> In a manner resonating with Mann and Rice's presentations, her analysis begins by making the reader conscious that a shared understanding of these elements cannot be assumed, and that Haudenosaunee law and culture have not been subsumed or ended. Of course, this is not a study for the sake of a study, but part of Hill's contribution to the Haudenosaunee effort to maintain the security of their land tenure in the Haldimand Tract.

### ***A Distant View in Place and Theme***

Now let us turn to a distant view in order to ensure we understand where, and indeed when, we are. Once again, we can more easily turn to the four major themes identified in Haudenosaunee historiography described in Chapter One, reproduced for ease of reference below.

844 Susan M. Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of: Haudenosaunee Land Tenure on the Grand River* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2017).

845 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 1-11.

1. Instructing newcomers in the basics of Haudenosaunee history, politics, and geography, with a focus on the Great Law of Peace in order to facilitate treaty-making.
2. Demonstrating Haudenosaunee contributions to settler communities and governments and their survival in Haudenosaunee and neighbouring lands, and that settlers have not yet upheld their treaty relationships, to the detriment of all parties concerned.
3. Documenting successful Haudenosaunee resistance to settler interference and attempts to enforce Haudenosaunee disappearance as Indigenous peoples.
4. A turn of the twenty-first century shift to exploring and developing new modes of syncretic Haudenosaunee historiography and examining how Haudenosaunee society has changed and adapted to new conditions.

In this case, a person would be hard-pressed to enforce a temporal order on these themes because they run parallel from the earliest days of Haudenosaunee-settler relations.

Haudenosaunee scholars start from a proudly established historical and cultural tradition, and as recognized distinct peoples by the British Crown and the subsequent United States federal and state governments. Even the Canadian federal government recognized the existence of the Confederacy and the ongoing power and relevance of its governance structures by its continuing efforts to dissolve them. The fundamental geography of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy has not changed, although it has developed some notable extensions via important communities established outside its original boundaries. The two major examples already mentioned are the Wisconsin Oneidas and the Six Nations communities living along the Grand River. The Grand River community populations come from all six member Nations, although the Mohawks are the demographic majority. In the first half of the nineteenth century, it looked

like the Kahnawà:ke Mohawks might establish another extension in the Rocky Mountain Foothills, but their intermarriage with the local Cree, Anishinabeg, and later Northwest Métis communities has led to enduring family ties; Algonquian rather than Haudenosaunee-style governance predominates there.

Meanwhile, as the Haudenosaunee adapted to the physical and spiritual impacts of settler incursions on their lands combined with the imposition of multiple artificial borders, they continued encoding and sharing their history. In light of Haudenosaunee participation in the northeastern treaty system long before Europeans began arriving, it is clear that they were well-accustomed to communicating their history and laws both internally and externally to their own polities before then as well. In the case of wampum records, the traditional keepers were and by all accounts still are the Onondagas. Yet the Onondagas are conspicuously absent as collaborators or single authors in the sampling of Haudenosaunee historiography covered in the *Distant View in Time*. It may be that developments are paralleling the dynamic identified by Deborah Doxtator in her study of what happened to the Haudenosaunee clans after the imposition of reservations. By applying a model of clan history based on the balanced “sides” of the clearing and the forest, Doxtator argued that the clans whose leaders originally specialized in maintaining forest or “outside” connections took over clearing or “inside” replacement tasks.<sup>846</sup> Faced with enforced new relationships to the land, the Haudenosaunee reorganized the local system of clan organization and management in each of the communities that Doxtator studied.

In the case of record-keeping, the original system of wampum recording and maintenance by the Onondaga did not end, and although disrupted for much of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, it has remained in place. The Onondaga still keep the Fire and the

<sup>846</sup> Doxtator, “What Happened to the Iroquois Clans?” 1-5.

geographic centre of the Confederacy. The new forms of European-style encoding and sharing via paper and ink have augmented rather than replaced this older system. To date, the keepers of the Eastern and Western Doors of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy have taken particular ownership of this new form of record keeping, the Mohawks and the Senecas. Tuscarora participation is consistent with this as well because, in their immigration to Haudenosaunee lands, they joined mainly Mohawk and, to a lesser degree, Oneida communities. The publishing and early printing geography follow this as well, with establishments at Brantford, Montréal, and especially New York and Syracuse. All this said, it must also be acknowledged that language plays an important role in the adjustments to the wampum and paper and ink systems for ongoing Haudenosaunee use. Chief Jacob Thomas was Cayuga, and Chief John Arthur Gibson was Seneca. Both Chiefs could recite the Great Law of Peace in the Onondaga language and did so regularly.

With these details in mind, the four major themes observable in the Haudenosaunee historical works considered here become even more interesting. Due to the particular geography of European incursion, the Keepers of the Confederacy Doors were often literally the first to meet the newcomers, and were the accepted leaders and specialists in Haudenosaunee external diplomacy. Accordingly, it would fall to them to bring those newcomers up to speed with respect to geography and protocol, including providing “refresher courses” as required. They would be most in demand during periods of warfare, mass migration, and major reorganization of landholdings. Indeed, that is just what we see in the sequence of publications. There are two significant publication gaps between David Cusick’s pamphlet and the published speeches of Nathaniel T. Strong and Maris Bryant Pierce in the 1800s, and between Arthur C. Parker’s history of the Senecas and the Chalmers biography of Joseph Brant in the 1900s. Both

correspond to periods of relative quiet without war or raiding. There is a certain symmetry in the evidence of how Haudenosaunee engaged in cultural and political exchanges with Europeans from this view. The Europeans had to learn the basics of the Indigenous protocols, including the basics of wampum recording and recitation, style and structure of speechmaking appropriate to Indigenous gatherings and the like. Seneca and Mohawk representatives, among many other Haudenosaunee, soon learned the European ways of doing these things in order to translate and speak back for themselves rather than resorting to European translators.

When it came time to demonstrate or reiterate Haudenosaunee contributions to settler communities and governments, Haudenosaunee writers and speakers customarily took up the treaties, considering whether and how they had upheld their side of the treaty obligations. This came together well with the European propensity for emphasizing the outcomes of war rather than negotiation whenever Haudenosaunee fought with them as allies. By nature of the publishing dates covered here, this leads to various materials recounting alliances with the British Crown and later the United States. For those Haudenosaunee who fought on the American side, their memoirs of the American War of Independence and the War of 1812 make up a significant part of the nineteenth century items. “Loyalist” Haudenosaunee have a somewhat wider range of incidents to recount, such as the British Expedition for the Relief of Khartoum recounted by Louis Jackson in his 1885 pamphlet. Haudenosaunee in “British North America” took part in overseas military expeditions, the fur trade beaver wars, and royal visits, for example. Conversely, this also means that Seneca and Mohawk historians led critiques of the British Crown and United States federal government failures to uphold their treaty obligations. In the difficult conditions of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, this written criticism can be indirect, but is often surprisingly direct. In the late twentieth and early

twenty-first centuries, the critique is consistently direct. It may be retrospective in nature, as in much of Barbara Alice Mann's work on early United States-Haudenosaunee history, or a counterpoint to near-current events, as in the case of Goodleaf on the "Oka crisis" and the Jamiesons on Six Nations children's education.

None of this is to imply that all of these Haudenosaunee historians had nothing to say to other Haudenosaunee. That is far from true, and not just in the case of Haudenosaunee activists who republished their speeches weighing in on whether to accept a particular land deal or contribute to the proceedings of local settler historical societies. The Treaty of Canandaigua anthology and the new preface to the Chainbreaker memoir reissue reveal considerable community interest and participation in Haudenosaunee historiography. Admittedly, such interest is often easiest to recognize in newer publications and reissues because the authors and speakers reference the support they have received from their communities in the form of funding, ceremony, and access to archives. Older materials can still be revealing on this point, however, usually by naming contributing elders. In the case of Lewis Henry Morgan, the acknowledgements made but then dropped in the course of editing for publication have been restored in later editions from his field notes. Speakers, journalists, and pamphleteers like Brant-Sero, Enos Montour, or Louis Jackson, with their flair for self-promotion, are more visible than most, but they look to be the proverbial "tip of the iceberg." James Deer and Julia L. Jamieson's early pamphlets reveal distinct private printing and distribution lines within Haudenosaunee communities, at least into the mid-twentieth century. The active data collection and storage work taken advantage of by outside scholars like Johansen represents long-established practice.

On the theme of documenting settler interference, as we should expect, Haudenosaunee collaborators and authors achieve this via indirect and direct means. Though obviously

constrained by the filters applied by interlocutors in the case of “told-to” narratives and editors on the way to publication in the other works, it would be difficult to hide the result of missionizing, land seizure, warfare, and epidemics. The often-circumspect tone of many Haudenosaunee authors is remarkably consistent and cannot be explained away by age or sex. Rather, it seems best explained as a reflection of who the anticipated audience was and whether that audience was deemed an insider or outsider one by the author. From Cusick to Parker, Julia L. Jamieson to Greene, the general tone is typically one of reminder rather than overt challenge, although Jamieson pushes this technique as far as it can go before it bursts. Since her pamphlet has its origin in a community request for primarily community consumption, there was more room for a frank tone. Cusick takes a very subtle approach, reminding readers of Haudenosaunee self-governance long preceding European incursions by describing Haudenosaunee history in terms of “Atotarho reigns.”<sup>847</sup> Parker and Jamieson both reference specific treaties with governments and interactions with companies such as the Ogden Land Company or the New England Company to illustrate constructive versus destructive encounters.<sup>848</sup> Greene’s focus is on her own Haudenosaunee community, and so she repeatedly references the Great Law of Peace to help her people remember and prioritize their laws and culture. Even at his most querulous moments in the retelling of his father’s life, Eleazer Williams avoids broader questions that might suggest he has more than family-based issues to raise. This is consistent with his anomalous social position of presenting himself as a representative of people who had never chosen or endorsed him for the role, not least because he had become a missionary.

847 David Cusick, *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations* (1848), 34-35.

848 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 142-144.

Jamieson, *Echoes of the Past*, 2-3.

There is a strong sense from the sequence of publications that something important changed in Haudenosaunee country by the early 1990s, such that many Haudenosaunee decided it was time for direct action and more direct speech. The Haudenosaunee monographs released in the aftermath of the “Oka Crisis” express a change in the views of Haudenosaunee on both sides of the Medicine Line on whether to undertake direct action or more polemic writing. Goodleaf’s 1995 book is consistent with this notion, as she did both, but the more substantial evidence comes from a different book published the same year. Mohawk political scientist Gerald R. (Taiaiake) Alfred’s *Heeding the Voices of Our Ancestors: Kahnawake Mohawk Politics and the Rise of Native Nationalism* analyzed the contemporary political changes as related to the Mohawk community of Kahnawà:ke.<sup>849</sup> Keeping strictly to historiography, the more challenging style of Mann or Rickard enforce a modification of this perspective. Rickard’s autobiography was issued in 1973, and his tone is related to his political activism, which included legal actions and famous ceremonial border crossings.<sup>850</sup> For her part, Mann broke into academic publishing after completing her doctorate during an outburst of assertive Indigenous politics in the late 1990s.<sup>851</sup> Native/Indigenous/Native American Studies also underwent significant expansion in the aftermath of the infamous Columbus centennial, and many more Indigenous people across North America successfully completed advanced post-secondary degrees.

For the purposes of this study, the most interesting trend to follow is the one traced by the new-style, syncretic Haudenosaunee historiography. In the earliest days of intersection with European style print media, reasonably enough, this trend begins with transcriptions. Hence

849 Gerald R. Alfred, *Heeding the Voices of Our Ancestors: Kahnawake Mohawk Politics and the Rise of Native Nationalism* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1995).

850 Rickard, *Fighting Tuscarora*, 69-89.

851 Mann, “Curriculum Vitae,” 2

some of the earliest publications are Haudenosaunee men's speeches as part of fundraising for specific projects as well as their own living expenses. Other Haudenosaunee took part in the earliest stages of what would eventually become North American four-field anthropology and proto-ethnohistorical works. In fact, an entire line of performance, inquiry, and publishing developed in the bustling community of historical societies active in New York State and southern Ontario from the late nineteenth to early twentieth centuries. Haudenosaunee historians began to push the European-style forms harder because they could conform to them, more or less, but these are not particularly in evidence in the sampled corpus. Instead, speeches and pamphlets take a form more reminiscent of that revealed in the Seth Newhouse version of the Haudenosaunee constitution, revised and published by Chief Jacob Thomas. The writer composes a sequence of interrelated chapters based on reproducing quotes or summaries of relevant documents, framed by a narrative introduction and conclusion. This form can be seen in Elias Johnson's *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, although his frame is missing an overt conclusion. His single chapter most representative of the form is "Tuscaroras at North Carolina," in which he retells this history via a sequence of transcribed treaties with Britain and the United States. Johnson contextualizes and briefly comments on each treaty as he traces events from the early 1700s to 1835.<sup>852</sup>

It is fair to conclude that by the 1990s, many Indigenous people interested in writing were thoroughly frustrated with the forms pressed upon them by European-style education. Literary scholar Penny Petrone, discussing Indigenous literary activity between 1983 and 1996, stated, "This body of new writing is distinguished by a wide range of forms," and goes on to observe that publications proliferated from 1990 on. She noted that the need for texts at all levels of

<sup>852</sup> Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 78-103.

education played an important role in this increase.<sup>853</sup> Two key anthologies of Indigenous literary criticism roughly bookend the decade, *Looking at the Words of Our People: First Nations Analysis of Literature* (1993), edited by Jeanette C. Armstrong, and *(Ad)dressing Our Words: Aboriginal Perspectives on Aboriginal Literatures* (2001), edited by Armand Garnett Ruffo.<sup>854</sup> Leslie Marmon Silko and Paula Gunn Allen also released important anthologies in this decade critiquing mainstream writing forms and genres.<sup>855</sup> There was not much consolation in the fact that so many settlers of European background were frustrated in their own right. The advent of Indigenous critical theory proved to be part of an important drive to bring Indigenous interpretive frameworks and understandings into published work.

In turn of the twenty-first century Haudenosaunee historiography, some of the first effects of the use of these interpretive frameworks show in new anthologies on topics such as Haudenosaunee influence on the development of the government of the United States<sup>856</sup> and the already mentioned Treaty of Canandaigua.<sup>857</sup> The new approach used a combination of settler and Haudenosaunee participants in composing the anthologies and reproduction of speeches alongside selections from or complete treaties and related documents. Mann established an approach directly challenging and conversing with European records while replacing them within a Haudenosaunee written intellectual tradition. The result is more open to humour where

853 Penny Petrone, "Aboriginal Literature: 4. 1982 to 1996." in *The Oxford Companion to Canadian Literature*, eds. William Toye and Eugene Benson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997) <https://doi.org/10.1093/acref/9780195411676.001.0001> (accessed August 26, 2021).

854 Jeannette C. Armstrong, coll., *Looking at the Words of Our People: First Nations Analysis of Literature* (Penticton: Theytus Books, 1993).  
Armand Garnett Ruffo, ed., *(Ad)dressing Our Words: Aboriginal perspectives on Aboriginal Literatures* (Penticton: Theytus Books, 2001).

855 Leslie Marmon Silko, *Yellow Woman and a Beauty of Spirit: Essays on Native American Life Today* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1996).

Paula Gunn Allen, *Off the Reservation: Reflections on Boundary-Busting, Border-Crossing Loose Canons* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1998).

856 Bruce E. Johansen with Donald A. Grinde Jr. and Barbara A. Mann, eds., *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom* (San Jose: Clearlight Publishers, 1998).

857 Jemison and Schein, *Treaty of Canandaigua*, x.

the material allows, breaking a taboo in academic and formal history writing in general. Many recent Haudenosaunee publications take a more conversational tone that better integrates what would otherwise be oral citation practices together with European-style footnotes. Openness to a more conversational, humorous tone does not rule out a more formal mode, especially when the narratives involve spiritual beings and matters. Such a mode may be placed in a separate chapter or be the tone of an entire book, as in the case of Rice's traditional Iroquoian history.

Here, as also in the *Distant View in Time*, I have had to limit coverage of recent Haudenosaunee historiographic projects in online virtual spaces, conspicuously the will-o'-the-wisp of the Six Nations of the Grand River's circa 2000 compact disc interactive database project, *The Great Peace... The Gathering of Good Minds*.<sup>858</sup> To date, this is the earliest independent Indigenous CD-ROM project I have found in sampling materials for this thesis. Many more recent online projects combining work with communities, museum collections, and academic publishing involve Haudenosaunee, sometimes alongside members of other northeastern Confederacies, such as the "restorative research project" led by anthropologist Margaret Bruchac, "On the Wampum Trail."<sup>859</sup> To date, there are no Haudenosaunee-specific websites or online web archives comparable to the Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture or the Métis Archival Research Lab.<sup>860</sup> For now, it appears that Haudenosaunee communities are focussing on gradually digitizing and posting to their official websites as well as supporting renovations and digitization of material in their existing archival spaces.

858 Goodminds.com, "The Great Peace... The Gathering of Good Minds CD-ROM,"

<https://web.archive.org/web/20030213104529/http://greatpeace.org/> (accessed November 21, 2021).

859 Wampum Trail Research Team, "The Wampum Trail Research Team," On the Wampum Trail,

<https://wampumtrail.wordpress.com/> (accessed February 14, 2022).

860 Frank Tough, Métis Archival Research Lab, <https://www.ualberta.ca/native-studies/research/map-lab> (accessed December 18, 2021).

Gabriel Dumont Institute, Gabriel Dumont Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture, <http://www.metismuseum.ca/> (accessed December 18, 2021).

### ***A Closer View in a Mainstream Mode***

Based on the most conservative reading of the evidence from David Cusick's *Sketches*, Haudenosaunee historical pamphlet publishing can be traced to 1827. However, this is not strictly the beginning of Haudenosaunee historical monograph publishing as defined for this project, where "a monograph" is defined as a non-fiction book or pamphlet, with the latter having no less than 40 pages. Based on that definition, the proper first year is 1851, when the trade edition of *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee* arrived in New York bookstores. 1851 also stands as a founding year of sorts for "Iroquoian studies," tracking Lewis Henry Morgan's first contribution to ethnology. Elias Johnson's book went into print just thirty years later, suggesting that Haudenosaunee authors with good social and political connections had better chances of getting into print in their own right at the time. It also did not hurt that the commercial publishing sector in southeastern Canada and the northeastern United States was more diversified in this period, and hungry for manuscripts to publish. University and academic society presses already served as important outlets, as did self-publishing. Haudenosaunee communities began to establish their own presses by at least the late twentieth century.

Similar to the previous case study, the closer examination of the selected monographs begins still in a more mainstream mode but with a closer focus, analyzing the research questions, methods, and sources of each monograph. The citation and bibliographic analysis illustrate some of the latest episodes in the ongoing struggle for authority over Haudenosaunee history, from its definition to interpretation. It will not be possible to sidestep the issues of genre, myth, and history this time, not least because of the impact of the professionalization of ethnology and its transformation into anthropology during the nineteenth century. Lewis Henry Morgan and

Horatio Hale were at once important disciplinary founders and among the last of the gentleman amateurs in the field.

In her cogent study of Kahnawà:ke Mohawk resistance to settler colonialism, *Mohawk Interruptus {Political Life Across the Borders of Settler States}*, Audra Simpson examines the formative influence of the Ely S. Parker-Lewis Henry Morgan collaboration on “writing the Iroquois Confederacy.” She describes anthropology as “a practice of documentation, of theorization, of desire,”<sup>861</sup> and notes what the story of Parker and Morgan’s relationship

demonstrates is that the literature on the Iroquois is a realization of early anthropological desire – a desire for order, for purity, for fixity, and for cultural perfection that at once imagined an imminent disappearance immediately after or just within actual land dispossession. This realization is found in the *authenticating discourse* on culture and history that permeates the literature.<sup>862</sup>

In order to create a perfect anthropological object, the history of the people being made into it needs to be finished. Furthermore, that history must have a single version, properly defined and known to certain credentialed people. The tenacious hold of this anthropological desire on Haudenosaunee historiography finds particular expression in the present study corpus in the multiple published versions of the Haudenosaunee Constitution.

The following discussion consists of four sections, starting with an era that begins and ends on renditions of what is often framed by non-Indigenous specialists as “the” traditional history of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy. The second section covers the shortest time span, an extraordinary long decade defined by the monographic output of just one man, Arthur Caswell Parker. Then we move on to the sharply disjointed second half of the twentieth century when the monographic thread reappears after a nearly thirty year gap. The thread’s thickest strand is now

861 Audra Simpson, *Mohawk Interruptus {Political Life Across the Borders of Settler States}* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014), 69.

862 Simpson, *Mohawk Interruptus*, 70.

made up of accounts by and about United Empire Loyalists; the persistent thread of the Confederacy founding and constitution finally makes its way back into Haudenosaunee interpretive hands. The final section focusses on the new syncretic historiography that bursts into print, beginning in 2000 after a lengthy development in a matrix of critical articles and theses. Just as in the Northwest Métis case, the monographs are the product of a significant phase shift at the turn of the twenty-first century. That phase shift includes yet another return to the Confederacy constitution and history of its founding, crowning a resounding repudiation of the still lingering anthropological desire characterized so effectively by Audra Simpson.

*League History, League Governance, and a Unique Nile Episode, 1851-1911*

The day Ely S. Parker encountered a young white lawyer with an enthusiastic interest in “Indians” in 1844 is a common starting point for examining their eventual shared literary project, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*. However, rather than rehearse it here, I will cite Simpson’s nuanced retelling, in which she carefully sets each participant in the original encounter in their own cultural and historical context: Morgan, as a settler, displaced and wanting to be at home, yet, at the same time, yearning for ties to places that do not exist. Parker, as part of Seneca and wider Haudenosaunee communities dealing with land loss and enforced cultural change that settlers imagined should not just displace but de-place them, cutting their ties to the land for good. Yet, in fact, the ties remained, and Parker and Haudenosaunee more widely were striving to recast the principles of their own culture to meet the needs of the new times.<sup>863</sup> In terms of *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee* itself, Simpson also summarizes the minimal remnants of writing and overt evidence of Parker, his immediate family, and indeed other Senecas’ contributions.<sup>864</sup>

863 Simpson, *Mohawk Interruptus*, 76-82.

864 *Ibid.*

A contrasting description is enshrined in a 1984 biographical article about Morgan by Elisabeth Tooker that tends to minimize these contributions. Based on her examination of Morgan's surviving papers at the time, Tooker describes the materials Morgan compiled into the final book as notes and observations from roughly twelve one to two-week visits to Tonawanda and possibly Oneida and Onondaga reservations, plus conversations and correspondence with Ely S. Parker.<sup>865</sup> But as Simpson reminds us, Morgan himself dedicated the book to Parker, explicitly referring to "their joint researches."<sup>866</sup> Leaping forward again to 2018, Kayanesenh Paul Williams noted, "It has been suggested that the academic, speculative parts of the book are Morgan's ruminations on 'man's ascent to civilization,' while the more informative and factual parts are in a style different enough that it is most likely that they are actually Donehogowa Ely Parker's writing."<sup>867</sup> If nothing else, we can be reassured of Parker's real contributions to *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, even if a final answer to whether he literally wrote sections of it or influenced the line of Morgan's queries cannot be given.

We can see from the bibliographic record that the scholarly consensus is that Morgan saw *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee* as a rounding off and closure of his Iroquoian studies at the time. He never oversaw a revised or updated edition in his own lifetime, and its sales were no more than modest. The late anthropologist William N. Fenton (1908 – 2005)<sup>868</sup> summarized the book's fortunes in his introduction to the 1962 reproduction of the original text. There were three editions released under the editorship of Herbert M. Lloyd in 1901, 1904, and 1922. Lloyd's

865 Tooker, "Lewis Henry Morgan, the Myth and the Man," 31.

866 Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, unnumbered dedication page.

867 Kayanesenh Paul Williams, *Kayanesenkó:wa: The Great Law of Peace* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2018), 13.

868 "William N. Fenton, 96, Expert on Iroquois, is Dead," *New York Times*, June 23, 2005, <https://www.nytimes.com/2005/06/23/nyregion/william-n-fenton-96-expert-on-iroquois-is-dead.html> (accessed January 1, 2022).

annotations and additions from Morgan's other Haudenosaunee-related articles in the form of an additional appendix nearly doubled its length. Fenton records another 1954 reproduction of the Lloyd version by the Human Relations Area Files at Yale in a mid-twentieth-century example of academic print-on-demand.<sup>869</sup> The 1962 edition introduced by Fenton was reissued in 1996.<sup>870</sup> As of 2022, it is out of print. These editions all have a critical feature in common, so they are mentioned here rather than taken up in order through the Mainstream Closer View as a whole. That feature is a lack of further Haudenosaunee involvement in the life of the book. There is not even a preface or forward by Parker's great-nephew in the 1922 edition, even though he was an established professional anthropologist by then. Therefore for the purposes of this discussion, the only edition that is relevant is the first.

The next question, then, especially for anyone familiar with *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, is why it is being considered here. It is quite true that it is, at best, narrowly historical in its content, and the bulk of that is in Book I, Chapter 1. Morgan says in the preface concerning this chapter that it "has no necessary connection with the residue, but was introduced to give those unfamiliar with the civil history of the Iroquois, some preliminary information concerning the rise and decline of the league."<sup>871</sup> Morgan's ultimately greater interest in kinship systems is well foreshadowed throughout the book; episodes of Haudenosaunee history appear between long sections of

869 William N. Fenton, "Introduction," in *League of the Iroquois*, by Lewis Henry Morgan (Secaucus: The Citadel Press, 1962 [1851]), v-vi.

870 Scans of all of the rare pre-1962 editions are open access on the Internet Archive (<https://www.archive.org/>) and the Hathi Trust (<https://www.hathitrust.org/>). The citations for these editions are:

Lewis Henry Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*. In two volumes, edited by Herbert M. Lloyd. (New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1901, 1904, and 1922).

Lewis Henry Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*. In one volume, edited by Herbert M. Lloyd. (New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1904, and 1922).

Lewis Henry Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*. In one volume, edited by Herbert M. Lloyd. (New Haven: Human Relations Area Files Reprint, 1954).

Lewis Henry Morgan, *League of the Iroquois*. Reissue of the 1851 edition, introduced by William N. Fenton. (Secaucus: The Citadel Press, 1962, 1996).

871 Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, xi.

speculation and musings on analogies to Greek and Roman practices. Still Book I, Chapter 2 focusses on “Indian geography,” and Chapter 3 teases the very briefest glimpse of the origins of the League. Book II, Chapter 3 focuses on the spiritual work of Handsome Lake (Skanyiatari:io). For contemporary readers in the United States, this book likely provided a more fulsome read than it did in Canada, or than it does today, largely because Handsome Lake was related to both Cornplanter<sup>872</sup> and Blacksnake,<sup>873</sup> whose participation in the 1775 – 1783 war with the British was so important to the formation of the United States.

The role of this Morgan-Parker collaboration with respect to Haudenosaunee historiography is ironic because it is very much an *anti-history*. As the holder of the final editing pen on the work, Morgan works very hard to press Haudenosaunee history into the shapes he knows from his studies of the ancient Greeks and Romans. It’s an ingenious means to deny Haudenosaunee history as such, reducing it instead to a brief recapitulation of what has already happened elsewhere over a much longer period. In this, Morgan opted for a familiar and coherent explanation that did not challenge widely shared settler beliefs of his time. He intended to recognize and ennoble Haudenosaunee political sophistication in order to “encourage a kinder feeling towards the Indian, based on a truer knowledge of his civil and domestic institutions, and of his capabilities for future elevation.”<sup>874</sup> For settler historians, this familiar story contributed to an enduring interest in the seven stages of socio-cultural evolution that he briefly discussed in his later book *Ancient Society Or, Researches in the Lines of Human Progress From Savagery, Through Barbarism to Civilization*.<sup>875</sup> For Haudenosaunee

872 Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, 227.

873 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 190-191.

874 Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, ix.

875 Tooker, “Lewis Henry Morgan, the Myth and the Man,” 42-43.

Lewis Henry Morgan, *Ancient Society: Or, Researches in the Lines of Human Progress From Savagery, Through Barbarism to Civilization* (Chicago: C.K. Kerr, 1877), 1-18.

historians, the formidable influence of *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee* had to be faced each time they stepped forward with their own work, at least until the 1960s. The first who did this in a direct and uncompromising fashion was Elias Johnson.

Elias Johnson's life spanned yet another period of intense change, 1837 – 1913, and he remained a recognized authority on Haudenosaunee traditions and history. Reading through his book strongly suggests that he literally had *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee* open beside him as he drafted his text. His Introduction and Preface, by turns witty and sarcastic, and the main selected topics read in clear counterpoint to Morgan's. But this is not the only published source he used. An even more substantial influence on the sequence and details of his history is Cusick's 1827 pamphlet, including two illustrations based on his woodcuts.<sup>876</sup> In his brief introduction, Johnson identifies two major issues: "The Antiquarian, the Historian, and the Scholar, have been a long time studying Indian character, and have given plenty of information concerning the Indian, but it is all in ponderous volumes for State and College libraries, and quite inaccessible to the multitude,"<sup>877</sup> and "I have read many of the Histories, and have longed to see refuted the slanders, and blot out the dark pictures which historians have wont to spread abroad concerning us."<sup>878</sup> Johnson's concern with materials made inaccessible to a general audience is not the only aspect of his comments with powerful echoes to this day. Near the end of his Morgan-inspired Preface, he declares:

The time has come in which it is no more than right to cast away all ancient antipathies, all inherited opinions, and to take a nearer view of our social life, condition and wants, and to learn anew *your* duty concerning the Indians.<sup>879</sup>

876 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 54-55.

877 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 5.

878 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 6.

879 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 7. Italics added.

This brings to mind Sophie McCall's observation in the context of the erasure of second person references in the final report by the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1991 – 1996). McCall suggests that in their case, the Commissioners may have feared defensive reactions from readers or a perception of bias on their part if they included statements directed to "you."<sup>880</sup> Johnson was not as concerned with these things over a hundred years before, albeit in very different circumstances.

In his first chapter, "The Iroquois," Johnson traces well-known examples of European acts regularly decried as barbarism and savagery if carried out by Indigenous people, then praised when done by Europeans, and does not try to deny that Indigenous peoples may have done such things. Showing himself well-read by referencing the Bible, Herodotus, and the customs of ancient Europeans such as the Visigoths and Franks, he notes differences between Northern and Southern Indigenous peoples.<sup>881</sup> Johnson is careful to state that he is speaking mainly about the Six Nations, suggesting he is responding to Morgan's tendency to minimize diversity among Indigenous peoples, as in such summing up statements as "To this day Indian life is about the same over the whole republic."<sup>882</sup> Today we can point to *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee* as Morgan's earliest book-length publication put together from originally unintegrated early shorter pieces to explain such unfortunate general comments.

Johnson does not hesitate to critique the behaviour of European newcomers. He starts with the first New Englanders who turned against the Indigenous nations who initially welcomed them, then with a critique of the European practice of sexually assaulting captured women. The

880 Sophie McCall, *First Person Plural: Aboriginal Storytelling and the Ethics of Collaborative Authorship* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2011), 115.

881 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 12.

882 Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, 391.

topic that begins his next chapter is a recital of the life of Mary Jemison.<sup>883</sup> Here we can identify another specific book Johnson was familiar with, *Narrative of the Life of Mrs. Mary Jemison*.<sup>884</sup> Closing this section focussed on his vindication of Indigenous peoples with a discussion of Indigenous character, Johnson turns his attention to his next Indigenous historical source document, Cusick's *Sketches*.

Johnson does not explicitly cite Cusick, not even in his description of his sources, although he does say, "I have also read much of Indian history, and compared them with our LEGENDS and TRADITIONS."<sup>885</sup> The connection is revealed not only by the two illustrations already mentioned, but also by the selection of traditional stories Johnson recounts as he shifts from the subject of Creation and the origins of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy to Tuscarora history. He then adds considerable detail to Cusick's narrative, including a careful discussion of Tuscarora origins in North Carolina, how they joined the Confederacy, and the fate of the lands they strove to hold onto in their homeland after the arrival of Europeans.<sup>886</sup> In this section, Johnson carries out some very specific work on documentary accessibility. He integrates excerpts and full texts from relevant treaties, which he does again when discussing "Friendship of the Tuscaroras to the United States."<sup>887</sup>

Unlike Cusick, Johnson was a Christian, active in his Baptist church. He relates the influence of missionaries in his community, including the founding of the local school, incorporating excerpts from missionary teacher journals. He soon reveals a special personal interest in the Temperance movement, which leads him to incorporate Ely S. Parker's translation of

883 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois, or Six Nations, and History of the Tuscarora Indians*, 14-18; 22-23.

884 James Everett Seaver, *A Narrative of the Life of Mrs. Mary Jemison* (Canandaigua: J.D. Bemis and Co., 1824).

885 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 8. Capitalized as in the original.

886 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 61-103.

887 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 165-172.

Sose-ha'-wa Jemmy Johnson's 1844 recital of the Code of Handsome Lake as well as the constitution of the Tuscarora Temperance Society.<sup>888</sup> This leads him back to a discussion of the Condolence Ceremony, more of what he has learned about the workings of Haudenosaunee government, and his views on the role of women in general.<sup>889</sup> Then, like Cusick, he closes his narrative on a rather abrupt note created by a sharp change of topic. He challenges a claim by Henry Schoolcraft that a mass grave in Cambria, New York State, was the product of a massacre carried out by Indigenous people by citing Tuscarora tradition.<sup>890</sup> In fact, the ending is so abrupt that I checked other scanned copies of the original 1881 edition to be sure this was indeed the end of the book. There is no second edition, or Johnson might have made the same modification as Cusick did to the second edition of his pamphlet, closing with an explicit "The End."

*The Iroquois Book of Rites* takes us back to glimpses of Haudenosaunee history encoding and preservation in the years after the War of 1812 and the continuing reorganization of the Haudenosaunee after the imposition of reserves and the Medicine Line. Simpson observes how this book tracks the Native-anthropologist relationship, noting, "The register of identification and gratitude offered to the Iroquois mediators moves from 'collaborator' to 'author-informant'... In this book Hale is the editor, rather than the discoverer and author, of Iroquois texts that were used by chiefs at Six Nations and Onondaga for the condolence ceremony."<sup>891</sup> The specific information Hale provides about the texts and how he came to receive them provides mainstream-style evidence for an adaptation of new encoding methods. It would be easy to misconstrue the Haudenosaunee chiefs recognizing the advantages of using writing as admitting

888 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 152-164; 185-208.

889 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 209-231.

890 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 232-234.

891 Simpson, *Mohawk Interruptus*, 87-88.

“the superior advantages of a written record” along with Hale.<sup>892</sup> Like Morgan, Hale was an observant and honest reporter, documenting details that contradicted this conclusion. For instance, in summarizing the fate and quality of the earlier manuscripts, Hale reports how one was accidentally burned, and another copy had gaps refilled by another writer.<sup>893</sup> Ultimately, Hale resorted to interviewing the chiefs and attending a Condolence Ceremony in order to take advantage of the still-active recording system based on trained human memory combined with the wampum belt mnemonic system. Hale’s footnote in his chapter “The League and Its Founders” states, in reference to his attempt to determine the date of the founding as drawing on, “the most experienced councillors, and especially the ‘wampum-keepers,’ the official annalists of their people.”<sup>894</sup> While he refers to Cusick and Parker via Morgan in the main text, he relegates Cusick to providing “grotesque” details of Onondaga Chief Atotarho’s appearance before he was persuaded to join the League.<sup>895</sup>

Despite being one of seven texts that Simpson identifies as “the ‘canon’ of Iroquois studies,”<sup>896</sup> with so much historical and anthropological material captured in it, *The Iroquois Book of Rites* has still only had two editions. The second was released in 1963 when the University of Toronto Press reprinted it with an introduction by the Iroquois specialist William N. Fenton<sup>897</sup> and an excellent, fully annotated print of Hale’s photograph of the Six Nations chiefs reading the wampum in 1871.<sup>898</sup> This edition has had just one reprint, in 1978, perhaps prompted by a reprint of the original edition in 1972.<sup>899</sup> In and of itself, the book never did

892 Hale, *The Iroquois Book of Rites*, 42; 62.

893 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 43.

894 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 19.

895 Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois*, 20n.

896 Simpson, *Mohawk Interruptus*, 85.

897 William N. Fenton, “Introduction,” in *The Iroquois Book of Rites, by Horatio Hale* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963 [1831]), vii-xvii.

898 Hale, *The Iroquois Book of Rites* (1963), follows page 6.

899 Horatio Hale, *The Iroquois Book of Rites* (Toronto: Coles Publishers, 1881 [1972]).

become the sole repository of the memory of the Condolence Ceremony. The preliminary part of this Ceremony, “At the Wood’s Edge,” better known now as “A Thanksgiving Address,” was used to open the hearings of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1991 – 1996) in Winnipeg in April 1992.<sup>900</sup>

While Elias Johnson saw his book come into print in 1881, far to the east, a massive uprising broke out in the Ottoman province of Sudan. The religious and political movement led by Mohammed Ahmed ibn Seyyid Abdullah, also called the Mahdi, sought to win independence, ending ever increasing taxes, slavery, and forced labour. For a variety of economic and political reasons, the British opted to support the Egypt-based ruler of Sudan, the Khedive, by sending Major-General C.G. Gordon to lead the British forces in Sudan.<sup>901</sup> Gordon was a sort of popular hero with a reputation for religiosity and mental instability. By 1884 he was in desperate straits in Khartoum, besieged by the Mahdist forces, refusing to retreat. In Britain, popular demand led the government to approve a rescue mission led by General Garnet Wolseley,<sup>902</sup> who decided his best option for getting men and supplies up and down the Nile cataracts was a select crew of Canadian and Indigenous voyageurs. Recruitment went awry at the start when a significant number of men with no boating skills made it into the contingent alongside a strong team of Kahnawà:ke and Ojibwe voyageurs.<sup>903</sup> To make matters worse, another part of the contingent were French Canadians with an extraordinary hatred of their Indigenous counterparts, to the point that on their trip back to Canada, they had to be kept separated from them under guard.<sup>904</sup>

900 Kanatitio Allen Gabriel, “A Thanksgiving Address,” in *Looking Forward, Looking Back: Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples*, Volume 1 (Ottawa: Canada Communication Group, 1996).

901 Stacey, *Records of the Nile Voyageurs*, 9-10.

902 Robert Hamilton Vetch, “Gordon, Charles George,” in *Dictionary of National Biography: Volume 22*, eds. Leslie Stephen and Sidney Lee (London: Smith, Elder, and Co., 1890), 173-176.  
Stacey, *Records of the Nile Voyageurs*, 10-12.

903 Stacey, *Records of the Nile Voyageurs*, 9-10; 44-45.

904 Deer, *The Canadian Voyageurs in Egypt*, 28-30. I have found and verified references to Kahnawà:ke and Six Nations men called upon to participate in suppressing the 1837 rebellion in Upper Canada and Québec which may

The specific origins of the French Canadians' hostility is not clear from James Deer's account, although it is likely that the Mohawk contingent's association with the British was the primary cause. Then there was the problem of the rescue mission failing, followed by massive public mourning about the failure in Britain.<sup>905</sup> Back in Canada, writers in the press declared the voyageur contingent generally useless, although at least one writer publicly changed his views.<sup>906</sup>

Placed into this context, now both Louis Jackson and James Deer's rapidly written and printed pamphlets about their adventures in Egypt as part of the Gordon Relief Expedition make more sense. They had less to do with treaty obligations, as I hypothesized above, than with countering criticism levelled at the Mohawks on the expedition by the press. Accusations that their contingent was made up of incompetent and undisciplined drunkards would have been more than harmful to Indigenous men already dealing with racist preconceptions. Carl Benn carried out a demographic analysis of the Kahnawà:ke contingent in 2009, finding that the majority of the men were over twenty-five, indicating a group less likely to engage in rabble-rousing behaviour.<sup>907</sup> Certainly, the strategically placed woodcut illustrations in Jackson's pamphlet emphasize his respectable appearance, the boats he and his men worked with, and a few scenes representative of what a person would see from a boat or the train near Cairo.<sup>908</sup> Throughout his story, Jackson emphasizes how busy and time-constrained he and his men were. He and his crew were constantly on the move and travelling significant distances by water such that they missed opportunities to sightsee.<sup>909</sup> He also provides a technical assessment of the boats they

also have contributed to this hostility, but this possibility needs further research. Reproductions of the documents are included in Charles M. Johnston's edited collection, *The Valley of the Six Nations: A Collection of Documents on the Indian Lands of Grand River* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963 [2019]), 228-231.

905 Vetch, "Gordon, Charles George," 175.

906 Stacey, *Records of the Nile Voyageurs*, 44.

907 Carl Benn, *Mohawks on the Nile: Natives Among the Canadian Voyageurs in Egypt 1884-1885* (Dundurn: National Heritage Books, 2009), 31-32.

908 Jackson, *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt*, frontispiece. The other plates fall after pages 8, 10, 16, and 20.

909 Jackson, *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt*, 14; 16-17; 27.

manoeuvred through the cataracts.<sup>910</sup> Faced with an urgent need to counter denunciations by men who had never accompanied the expedition, neither Jackson nor Deer had time or space to rehearse details of the long alliance between the Haudenosaunee and British.

After this brief burst of publishing in the 1880s, all went quiet until 1902, and a newspaper editor mediated a collection of “Iroquois Legends,” ostensibly retold mainly by Cornplanter. Among William Canfield’s other cited persons are Blacksnake, and none other than Elias Johnson.<sup>911</sup> Barring the field notebooks he refers to in his introduction plus his own notes, Canfield does not refer to any texts until the end of the book in 15 pages of commentary on the stories. These reveal his careful reading of *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*,<sup>912</sup> and the results of gathering further commentary from his Haudenosaunee informants. Also hidden in these notes is Canfield’s attempt to identify the year of the founding of the Confederacy using details from the versions of the story he has learned and consultation with an astronomer at the Warner Observatory in Rochester, New York State.<sup>913</sup> However, this is very much the story of the front matter and endnotes. There are disturbing signs that something is awry in the main text.

The main named informants in the chapter Canfield labels “The Authority” are Cornplanter and Blacksnake, the famous 1775 – 1783 war participants who had already been dead for more than fifty years. Canfield provides a list of older male informants still alive at the time, listed as “Chief John Mountpleasant, Harrison Halftown, Elias Johnson, and John Kinjocity.” A probable editing hiccup leaves the reader to wonder if all these men were chiefs, especially if unaware that Elias Johnson had been impeached in 1888. There seems no reason to doubt that Canfield knew

910 Jackson, *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt*, 22-23; 27-28.

911 Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 15-16.

912 Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 206-211.

913 Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 197-199.

and worked with Simon Blackchief and his mother or the Indian agent B. Giles Casler.<sup>914</sup> This would all perhaps sit better if Canfield had been willing to name the person who was supposed to be the friend of Cornplanter and Blacksnake, whose field notebooks Canfield claims he received and transcribed. After delving deeper into the text, it soon becomes clear that something has gone tragically awry.

The stories presented are heavily romanticized, most barely recognizable and mixing together elements of Algonquian language speaking peoples' cultures with Haudenosaunee ones, all considerably distorted. Comparing the language and diction of Canfield's text to that of David Cusick, whose writing comes closest to Cornplanter and Blacksnake in time, shows little resemblance between Cusick and Canfield's prose. Nor is Canfield's florid prose much like Elias Johnson's, who had a more fluent writing style in English than Cusick. The least heavily rewritten stories in Canfield's book are those of "The Flying Head," "The Hunter," and parts of "Hiawatha." These three have a strong resemblance to Johnson's versions of these stories, while the majority of "The Happy Hunting Grounds" is a severely stripped-down series of sections drawn from Chapters 1 and 3 of Book II of *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*.<sup>915</sup> Canfield is at his best in his brief chapter discussing the "Sacred Stone of the Oneidas," which includes a photograph of the purported stone on its base in the Forest Hill Cemetery in Rochester, New York State.<sup>916</sup> Unfortunately, not much of the "told-to" content remains in Canfield's final text. This potentially well-meaning book designed to appeal to the growing nostalgia market for "Indian tales" of the time likely contributed to the near-complete end of collaborations between amateur historians, anthropologists, and professional journalists on

914 Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 16.

915 Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 125-126; 129-135; 137-148; 169-183.

916 Canfield, *The Legends of the Iroquois*, 187-193.

books of this type. Whether intended to be “books of fables” or an at least partial explication of Haudenosaunee history, there are no more such works.

A more productive area of performance and transcription continued at Six Nations, where the Grand River Council began a project to set down a copy of their history. The Distant View presentation of this publication took a viewpoint more or less defined by the career of the man who presented it to the Royal Society of Canada, Duncan Campbell Scott. According to the introduction of “Traditional History of the Confederacy of the Six Nations”:

For several hundred years the Five Nations (since 1715 called the Six Nations) have existed without a written history chronicled by themselves, of their ancient customs, rites and ceremonies, and the formation of the Iroquois League. Books have been written by white men in the past, but these have been found to be too voluminous and inaccurate in some instances.<sup>917</sup>

The resulting transcription was initiated and completed in mid to late 1900,<sup>918</sup> so the manuscript Scott used represented a text already at least a decade old. It covers more of the actions and historical information encoded in the Condolence Ceremony, setting the recitation of the origins of the Confederacy at the start and incorporating material familiar from *The Iroquois Book of Rites*. Just the year before, Chief John Arthur Gibson had dictated the story of the founding of the Haudenosaunee League in Onondaga to J.N.B. Hewitt, and the papers were subsequently left on file at the Smithsonian Institution.<sup>919</sup> The papers were on file, and even translated by William N. Fenton,<sup>920</sup> but it seems neither translation nor transcribed text was published, nor was a copy of the transcription returned to the Haudenosaunee. By this time, Henry Wadsworth Longfellow’s

917 Scott, *Traditional History of the Confederacy of the Six Nations*, 196.

918 Scott, *Traditional History of the Confederacy of the Six Nations*, 197.

919 J. N. B. Hewitt and John Arthur Gibson, “MS 3478 The Founding of the League of the Five Iroquois Tribes by Deganawida in the Sixteenth Century, According to the Official Tradition of it, dictated in Onondaga Text by the late Chief John Arthur Gibson, in March 1899,” Smithsonian Online Virtual Archives, <https://sova.si.edu/record/NAA.MS3478?s=0&n=10&t=C&q=john+arthur+gibson&i=0> (accessed January 2, 2021).

920 J. N. B. Hewitt and John Arthur Gibson, “MS 3689 The Founding of the League of the Five Nations by Deganawida,” Smithsonian Online Virtual Archives, <https://sova.si.edu/record/NAA.MS3689?s=0&n=10&t=C&q=john+arthur+gibson&i=1> (accessed January 2, 2021).

poem “The Song of Hiawatha” had been in print for nearly fifty years,<sup>921</sup> further confusing settler understandings of who was who in the founding of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy. Reducing the number of intermediaries between written transcription and making the results available to the community is reasonable under these conditions. That said, the introductory remarks to the Six Nations transcription do not directly suggest that the Confederacy Council was pursuing the project in order to eventually publish it.

*An Amazing Long Writing Decade in the Career of Arthur C. Parker, 1913 – 1926*

The period of Arthur C. Parker’s writing covered here spans the second half of his years as an ethnologist with the New York State Education Department and the beginning of his long tenure as director of the Rochester Museum of Arts and Sciences.<sup>922</sup> He was a prolific writer in multiple genres and literary forms, including poetry.<sup>923</sup> An abiding interest in Haudenosaunee history led him to pursue what we would now call ethnohistorical investigations to produce early written histories informed by archaeological and oral history evidence. However deep his sense of kinship with Indigenous peoples in general and Senecas in particular, Parker’s position was somewhat anomalous. The racializing perspectives of his time (as well as the present) tend to insist on his “white” heritage and that his genetic Seneca lineage came through the paternal line. That would certainly have made it difficult for him to be part of the Condoled Chiefs council without being adopted into a maternal clan. Nor did Parker openly embrace an Indigenous identity in the way of poet and performer E. Pauline Johnson, who apparently also was never adopted into a maternal clan. As a man, he had far better access to real opportunities for professional success, but Parker still had different variables to manage. Whatever his own views,

921 Henry Wadsworth Longfellow, *The Song of Hiawatha* (Boston: Ticknor and Fields, 1855).

922 William A. Ritchie, “Arthur Caswell Parker – 1881 – 1955,” *American Antiquity* 21, no. 3 (January 1956): 294.

923 Robert Dale Parker, *Changing is Not Vanishing: A Collection of American Indian Poetry to 1930* (Pittsburgh: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011), 283-284.

in his writing, he did not or could not avoid composing overt statements that the Haudenosaunee Confederacy was of the past along with Haudenosaunee culture and peoples. But he could allow his own publications to quietly contradict those statements through the information presented in his books, articles, and speeches.

For the first book of this period, Parker's study of the Code of Handsome Lake, he was able to take advantage of the coincidence of his own family connections to what many of the authors whose monographs are discussed here called "the New Religion." As a result, he was able to create an account tracing at least the portion of Handsome Lake's life related most directly to his subsequent role as chief prophet and the succession of reciters who followed him.<sup>924</sup> Parker next provided a generalized description of a recitation of the Code, as well as ceremonies Handsome Lake declared acceptable.<sup>925</sup> He then presents a great deal of material on ceremonies persisting despite the influence of Christian missionaries and Handsome Lake himself from his own field notes, taking up much of the rest of the book.<sup>926</sup> Parker briefly explores how the new Code supported "the Iroquois," but from his descriptions and referenced locations, especially the westernmost Seneca and Tuscarora, in their efforts to rebuild their social order after the long nadir produced by settler warfare and land theft.<sup>927</sup> He is the first try explaining to a non-Indigenous audience why the Code of Handsome Lake should be more appealing than Christianity, a question he was uniquely suited to handle due to his earlier training for the Christian priesthood.<sup>928</sup>

924 Arthur C. Parker, *The Code of Handsome Lake, the Seneca Prophet* (Albany: University of the State of New York, 1913), 5-8.

925 Parker, *The Code of Handsome Lake*, 41-43.

926 Parker, *The Code of Handsome Lake*, 81-138.

927 Parker, *The Code of Handsome Lake*, 10-12.

928 Parker, *The Code of Handsome Lake*, 7-8.

Ritchie, "Arthur Caswell Parker – 1881 – 1955," 294.

Parker turned his attention to *The Constitution of the Five Nations* for his next, longer work. As a result, there is some missing detail between what he reports and what has been revealed by subsequent historical research by Haudenosaunee scholars and legal representatives working on wampum record repatriation. He begins on his very first page by declaring:

Many of the belts and strings became lost or destroyed, and fearing a total destruction of their ancient archives, the Six Nations of New York Indians in 1898 elected the University of the State of New York the official custodian of the wampums. The University accepted the charge and the Legislature passed suitable laws governing the custody of the wampums. In 1908 the Director of the State Museum was proclaimed the keeper of the wampums by Sa-ha-wha, the president of the Six Nations.<sup>929</sup>

Richard Hill, Sr., Haudenosaunee scholar and, in 2001, an instructor at State University of New York at Buffalo, wrote:

Chief [Thomas] Webster was removed from office in 1897 by the traditional chiefs for his actions [selling wampum belts to an Indian agent]. The Iroquois wanted their wampums back even then, but the collectors, who had a bill of sale, ignored the Chiefs. To strengthen their position, the Chiefs sought the assistance of anthropologists. The scholars convinced them that they needed the State University of New York to help them recover the wampum from the private collectors. In one of the strangest events in Iroquois history, the Regents of the State University of New York were appointed the Keepers of the Wampum in 1898 by a group of Onondaga. In the past, a traditional Onondaga Chief had always been the holder of that title. The University, with the implied endorsement of the Onondaga, began to acquire most of the remaining wampums in order to make a case for the cultural integrity of the belts.<sup>930</sup>

The point here is not to find fault with Parker but to acknowledge that he was in a difficult position when he wanted to write about the wampum records and their contents. He, like Hill, was working for the now conveniently legislated keeper of the wampum records that somehow “became lost or destroyed.” Regardless of his own views, Parker probably could not openly refer

929 Parker, *The Constitution of the Five Nations*, 7.

930 Richard Hill Sr., “Regenerating Identity: Repatriation and the Indian Frame of Mind,” in *The Future of the Past: Archaeologists, Native Americans, and Repatriation*, ed. Tamara L. Bray (New York: Garland Publishing, 2001), 135.

to the actions of Chief Thomas Webster, a member of the United States Bureau of Indian Affairs-imposed elected council, not the Council of Condoleed Chiefs. Although Webster was impeached, Hill noted that Webster might have been coerced to sell the belts he had.<sup>931</sup> The situation remained controversial, despite a roughly twenty-five years distance from the original contested sale and nearly fifteen years of his employer holding custody over any wampum records it could acquire. Therefore Parker's monograph could be taken as part of his employer's move to claim authority over the wampum records and declaim the end of the original Confederacy. Parker does not make either claim, leaving the first in silence and stating unequivocally, "Through the law as a guiding force and through the [culture] heroes as ideals the Iroquois have persisted as a people, preserved their national identity and much of their native culture and lore."<sup>932</sup> His assessment is far more positive in 1916 than in 1913.

As noted in the Distant View section, the two main documents Parker brought together for this publication include the 1897 Seth Newhouse Constitution and the 1900 Six Nations Council Constitution. He added photographic plates of relevant wampum belts and a drawing of a memory staff to the text at key points. There is also a third document, "The Hiawatha Tradition," as recounted by Sahawi Baptist Thomas from Oshowägö'na Thomas Commissary, followed by five appendices.<sup>933</sup> The fourth appendix, a copy of the minutes of an 1862 meeting of the Six Nations Council at Cattaraugus Reservation, reveals two conflicts of the time concerning the status and authority of the Six Nations Council at Grand River, and the position they all should take with respect to the newly begun United States Civil War.<sup>934</sup> Left unstated was the continuing existence of both Councils as of 1916.

931 Hill Sr., "Regenerating Identity," 132-133.

932 Parker, *The Constitution of the Five Nations*, 12.

933 Parker, *The Constitution of the Five Nations*, 114-118; appendices 119-155.

934 Parker, *The Constitution of the Five Nations*, 144-151.

So far, Parker's monographs have been, in effect, collections of related "told-to" narratives woven together by his introductions and annotations. His 1919 biography of his great-uncle Ely S. Parker is a notable exception, published by the Buffalo Historical Society (BHS), of which he was a life member.<sup>935</sup> Also, unlike his other monographs, the work of the editor is better recorded. The BHS secretary-treasurer Frank H. Severance provides a separate section of longer editorial notes as well as several footnotes on the main text.<sup>936</sup> This does not mean there are no transcribed or reproduced documents, far from it. Besides 80 pages of documents, the book includes a hallmark of most of Parker's publications, judiciously selected photographs, many of which he took himself.<sup>937</sup> A mainstream perspective might focus on the acculturated aspects of Ely S. Parker's life to the exclusion of such matters as Seneca politics and his family's close ties to the origins and continuance of the Code of Handsome Lake. After all, his great-uncle fought in the United States Civil War, earned the rank of general in the United States Army and became the first Indigenous Commissioner of Indian Affairs in the United States. He was a Condoled Chief, Donehogawa, Keeper of the Western Door, a position which also had a military aspect. The reader is reminded repeatedly from opening the book that Ely S. Parker served as Ulysses S. Grant's military secretary, and so might expect a military and civil service focussed story. These are prominent elements, but, in fact, Arthur C. Parker explicitly frames his great uncle's life and achievements as part of the ongoing history of a still extant Indigenous people, the Haudenosaunee in general, the Seneca in particular. Like Elias Johnson, he does not indulge in romanticizing or attempting to deny Haudenosaunee warfare and major actions like those impacting the Neutral Nation. And like Johnson, Parker rarely misses the chance to provide a

935 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, x.

936 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 313-335.

937 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 231-311.

carefully placed critique of settler behaviour each time he presents a critical view of Haudenosaunee conduct.

During the next year, 1920, Parker focussed on three related archaeological problems. The foremost problem was the need to somehow counter the incessant pot hunting that was annihilating Indigenous archaeological sites as well as recently occupied villages and cemeteries. Through his professional archaeological excavations and compiled information on numerous type sites in *The Archaeological History of New York*, Parker contributed to reconnecting Haudenosaunee to their archaeological history, at least in the mainstream eye. This addressed the second problem, even if a complete solution was impossible. He dryly observed, “To the early collector the curious implements of the Indians were simply ‘relics’ and no special effort was made to record anything about these ‘relics’ except to give the name of the collector and the date of finding, both facts relatively unimportant.”<sup>938</sup> Yet he was also creating a handbook that described type sites, gave names to common ‘relic’ types and directions on how to document them, alongside a 360-page catalogue detailing “Archeological Localities in the State of New York.” Critical as this work was to identifying dig sites, filling the State University of New York’s museum and eventually supporting moves to curb site destruction and grave robbing, it must also have served as an unwelcome adjunct to the pot hunters. Such dilemmas are stubbornly endemic to anthropology.

We return to Parker’s last publication defining this period within the Closer View in Time, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, reissued in 1967 by the New York publishing firm I.J. Friedman under the incautiously tweaked title *The History of the Seneca Indians*. Parker was now too careful as a scholar in mainstream or Indigenous terms to use words suggesting he knew

<sup>938</sup> Parker, *The Archaeological History of New York*, 7.

“the” history of any people. It is the earliest monograph that starts its narrative in the very deep past, taking full advantage of Parker’s considerable personal excavation experience and the research and synthesis entailed in producing *The Archaeological History of New York*. It also draws on Parker’s contributions of nearly two-thirds of the text to the first volume of the series *History of the Genesee Country (Western New York)*.<sup>939</sup>

While he may not have wished to imply he had any final version of Seneca history, Parker was not necessarily shy of controversy. He was still willing to weigh in on the question of the Mound Builders, declaring bluntly, based on the archaeological evidence, they “were no more than energetic Indian tribes, who during a period of peace were able to develop their native arts.”<sup>940</sup> Nor does he hesitate to present his own assessment of the status of the 1794 Canandaigua Treaty or to criticize the Buffalo Creek Treaty.<sup>941</sup> In the latter case, he even argues that the land fraud at Buffalo Creek directly contributed to the weakened position of Christianized Haudenosaunee in New York.<sup>942</sup> Parker does not fail to note the Seneca view of treaties as agreements to share the land, not sell it.<sup>943</sup>

Parker does not seem to engage with books or pamphlets by earlier Haudenosaunee historians, although he cites his own early earlier publications. Instead, he states, “The manuscript files of the author are filled with many obscure references, and his own notes, taken on the Indian reservations during the past quarter century, embrace facts never published.”<sup>944</sup> He often cites speeches by well-known Haudenosaunee leaders as well as quotes from treaties and

939 Lockwood R. Doty, ed., *History of the Genesee Country (Western New York)* (Chicago: S.J. Clarke Publishing Company, 1925), Chapters 2-9 and Chapter 16.

940 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 16.

941 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 142-144; 155-156.

942 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 144.

943 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 107.

944 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 7.

*The Jesuit Relations*. The closest he comes to the type of narratives his Haudenosaunee predecessors dictated or wrote is his précis of the origins, development, and laws of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy.<sup>945</sup> Nevertheless, he, like Elias Johnson, was in part responding to *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, which in the foreword he called

the principal guide, but its pages embrace more of ethnology than of history. Most of the shorter sketches that have appeared have failed to set forth the underlying causes of tribal action and to give the Seneca people a setting that would explain the phenomena of their folk-ways. There is, therefore, a need to be met and satisfied. This, we have attempted in this resume.<sup>946</sup>

Parker was not satisfied with resorting to claims about the “hunter state” or stereotypes of the ignoble savage to bridge gaps in explanation for Haudenosaunee political, military, and social action. This did not prevent him from applying the widely accepted cultural development stages Morgan referred to in *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*, then sketched in more detail in *Ancient Society*. He found them useful, but insufficient to explain “tribal action” on their own, as when he observes that the Seneca forced to move into Pennsylvania and Ohio from their established homes were also forced to give up agriculture for hunting and gathering to survive.<sup>947</sup>

The picture Parker built of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy is one of political and military power with certain key weaknesses it could not ameliorate in time to resist European incursions. He emphasized the Confederacy’s inability to impose absolute control over the actions of its constituent nations, and those nations in turn over their “young men,” whom he describes as constantly eager to go out on raids.<sup>948</sup> Parker was certainly seeking to correct dehumanizing and racist views of Haudenosaunee political and military actions held by many of the non-Indigenous people likely to read his book. Still, as always in a historical narrative, there is more happening

945 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 28-32.

946 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 7.

947 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 31; 35-39.

948 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 34-36.

than that. Having made these points, he turns his attention back to the consequences of what he understands to be the forced adoption of thousands of people from surrounding nations. Some of these were literally adopted within existing Haudenosaunee communities; others became villages of different peoples encompassed within Haudenosaunee-held lands.<sup>949</sup> Having recounted events, including the end of French hegemony in northern New France and the aftermath of Pontiac's attempt to bring together a concerted Indigenous resistance to further invasion, Parker began a new section titled, "12. The Savagery of the Border Whites."<sup>950</sup> Describing documented instances of white lawlessness, including a case where "the assailants were *thirty white men disguised as Indians*," he details Indigenous resistance.<sup>951</sup> Having provided many documented examples of how Haudenosaunee captives had been treated by the European military and settlers throughout the text, Parker turned his discussion to the treatment and fate of "white captives" near the close of the book, just before describing the Seneca reservations.<sup>952</sup>

There is indeed a critique at work here, and not just from the perspective of a present-day reading. Parker sets out his historical argument in his foreword that the United States owes a great deal to the Haudenosaunee, and the Seneca in particular:

We have shown herein that the partisanship of the Iroquois saved for an English-speaking race the control of the Middle-Atlantic area. There can be no question of this, for the power of France would have grown so naturally and so effectively, that had it not been for the hostility of the Iroquois, France would have controlled Canada, New York, and Ohio, and have established a route up the Mississippi, which would have tied together the two regions. With this penetration, the English would have been displaced, and even if their colonists had found small and protected locations, a well-established body of French colonists would have made

949 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 95-98.

950 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 112-114.

951 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, the quote is from 113, resistance discussion runs from 114-115. Emphasis in the original.

952 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 147-151.

difficult the consolidation of the British colonies, and therefore prevented the later rise of the United States.<sup>953</sup>

Parker is not just opposing stereotypes. He is striving to convince his readers that “the red man” has been a “peculiarly constructive factor in American history”<sup>954</sup> and that the Seneca, in particular, and Indigenous people, in general, have a right to attempt to maintain their own culture.<sup>955</sup> Of all the monographs considered so far, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians* is the first to have an ending that is both clearly defined *and* assumes that the Indigenous people in question have a future. Furthermore, the future Parker invokes is not just any future, but a future in which Senecas may maintain their own culture. However, he refers to the Senecas as if he was a complete outsider with no ties to them in this book.<sup>956</sup> Nevertheless, this is one of the first published recognitions of a Seneca past and a Seneca future.

*United Empire Loyalists, Late 20<sup>th</sup> Century Activism, and Reprinting the Great Law, 1955 – 1995*  
There is no obvious reason for United Empire Loyalists to be so prominent in the first half of this period, 1955 – 1995. Up to 1955, Six Nations-based Haudenosaunee collaborators and authors have focussed on the origins and laws of their Confederacy or on countering recent bad press. The Canadian Centennial plays no real role based on the publication dates at hand. Nevertheless, something seems to have boosted interest in those people, including Indigenous people, who literally opted to fight and potentially die rather than join the United States. Admittedly, not *all* of those people, however. Interest in Black Loyalists is noticeably absent in this period. The two most substantial monographs connect to this theme through the famous Mohawk Pine Tree Chief Joseph Brant, including a biography and his adopted son’s journal. While I have already referred

953 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 7-8.

954 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 8-9.

955 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 158.

956 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 13; 93; 151.

to *The Journal of Major John Norton* as an inadvertent time capsule, the Chalmers-Brant collaboration that became Joseph Brant's biography had its own unusual path to publication, starting with a novel.

By the early 1940s, Harvey Chalmers was firmly established in the United States after emigrating from the Netherlands, working his way up to president of a button factory in 1943.<sup>957</sup> That same year, he saw his first historical novel into print,<sup>958</sup> but not with a publisher in his own city of New York, but with the Canadian offshoot of the United States-based Macmillan Company, itself based in Toronto. *West to the Setting Sun* sold well, with reprints in 1944, 1946, and 1947, despite its substantial length (363 pages), and it had unusual endpapers, maps of New York State and Pennsylvania, adding to its price.<sup>959</sup> Furthermore, this novel had a foreword by New York State historian Arthur Pound, an endorsement letter from the Akwesasne Counselor Organization of New York, endnotes, a bibliography, and a chronology.<sup>960</sup> This all seems very strange for a novel. That is, until we learn from the foreword the novel is a fictionalized account of the life of Joseph Brant. In his acknowledgements, Chalmers begins with credit to his collaborator Ethel Brant, a direct descendant of Joseph Brant, and details the archivists, historians, and college professors who helped him find relevant documents and edit the manuscript. These details stand out in high relief when contrasted to his later, now non-fiction biography of Joseph Brant, marked on the cover as a collaboration with Ethel Brant. There are no maps, endorsements, or even a foreword, although the chapters have footnotes. This is the case even though the parallel publishers are Michigan State University Press and Ryerson Press, the

957 Syracuse University Libraries, "Harvey Chalmers Papers (Finding Aid)," Syracuse University Libraries Special Collections Research Center, [https://library.syr.edu/digital/guides/print/chalmers\\_h\\_prt.htm](https://library.syr.edu/digital/guides/print/chalmers_h_prt.htm) (accessed January 30, 2021).

958 "Harvey Chalmers 2d Dead; Industrialist and Novelist," *New York Times*, October 8, 1971, 46.

959 Harvey Chalmers, *West to the Setting Sun* (Toronto: Macmillan Company of Canada Limited, 1947).

960 Chalmers, *West to the Setting Sun*, vii-viii; xi-xii; 347-359; 361-362; 363.

now-defunct Canadian school text publisher. The biography did not fare as well as the novel; it was never reprinted and has never been reissued in a new edition.

This does speak to the qualities of the biography. Joseph Brant's life can help shed light on such matters as the Confederacy's political and military response to newcomers, how Haudenosaunee integrated new knowledge about Europeans into their views of the world, and of course, the effects of the rebellion of the thirteen British colonies. This is undoubtedly a minimal list. Chalmers was working at a significant disadvantage compared to the other biographers whose works fell within the scope of this study. He could not interview the man himself, although Brant did leave behind papers, including many relevant letters. He was acquainted with Ethel Brant, and she appears to have facilitated his introduction to some members of her community, but the evidence suggests brief interactions, not a longer-term relationship necessary to access oral traditions or local pen and ink archives.<sup>961</sup>

In terms of the texts themselves, the main difference between the biography and the novel is the removal of invented dialogue. Despite the nod on the front page to Ethel Brant as a collaborator, this seems more of a marketing and credibility ploy in lieu of the absent, proudly reproduced endorsement letter in the novel's front matter. By 1955, Ethel Brant had married, adding her husband's surname Monture after her own, and become a busy public speaker. Her public profile as an expert on Haudenosaunee history was on the rise,<sup>962</sup> and the earlier novel *West to the Setting Sun* was no longer in print.

But now let us turn to John Norton and his journal, edited and published in 1970, and eventually reissued in 2011 with a new introduction by historian Carl Benn. For this discussion, I will centre my comments on Norton's recital of recent Haudenosaunee history, which runs from

961 Chalmers, *West to the Setting Sun*, vii; xii.

962 Morgan, "Performing for 'Imperial Eyes'," 71-72.

pages 190 to 285 of 357, leaving aside the section that helped drive the memoir's reissue, Norton's depiction of the War of 1812. Interest in that part of his memoir held well enough to lead to its separate publication with an introduction, new maps and fresh annotations by Carl Benn in 2019.<sup>963</sup> In the new 2011 introduction of the complete memoir, Benn observes that Norton combines oral tradition, living memory, and Euro-American sources.<sup>964</sup> "Euro-American sources" include written treaties and early histories of Canada and the United States, such as George Heriot's *History of Canada*, first published in 1804 and Cadwallader Colden's *The History of the Five Indian Nations Depending Upon the Province of New York*, first published in 1727.<sup>965</sup> Unlike his closest writing contemporary, David Cusick, Norton begins with a brief catalogue of names, then dives into the story with the earliest Haudenosaunee experiences with the French.<sup>966</sup> Here is a practical reminder of Norton's dedicatee and representative audience member, Hugh Percy, Duke of Northumberland. He does narrate a capsule version of the founding of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy based on what he learned from Joseph Brant.

At the time that Norton began pulling together his materials for the full journal, he had been engaged for nearly twenty years in the Grand River Haudenosaunee struggle to win recognition and respect for their control of the lands encompassed in the 1784 Haldimand Grant. Already recognized as a Pine Tree Chief responsible for helping the Confederacy Council for several years, his efforts included a trip to England in an attempt to engage directly with the British

963 Carl Benn, ed., *A Mohawk Memoir from the War of 1812: John Norton – Teyoninhokarawen* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2019).

964 Carl Benn, "Introduction to the Reissue of *The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816*," in *The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816*, eds. Carl F. Klinck and James J. Talman (Toronto: Champlain Society, 2011), x.

965 George Heriot, *The History of Canada, from its First Discovery, Comprehending an Account of the Original Establishment of the Colony of Louisiana* (London: T.N. Longman and O. Rees, 1804).

Cadwallader Colden, *The History of the Five Indian Nations Depending on the Province of New York* (New York: W. Bradford, 1727).

966 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 190; 192.

Crown.<sup>967</sup> So it is not without significance that he begins his exposition of recent Haudenosaunee history with their understanding of the early relationship between the Wendat, the Five Nations, and the French. From there, he turns quickly to the Haudenosaunee's experiences, presenting a sharp critique of the French for being bad allies who always expected help but then gave their Indigenous allies none in return.<sup>968</sup> Norton showed himself firmly committed to the Anglican Church earlier in his life, and Northumberland would have been familiar with both his and Joseph Brant's membership in that Church.<sup>969</sup> That said, religious partisanship can not be taken as the only reason he would also critique the Catholic missionaries for preventing the Haudenosaunee and their neighbours from making peace during the war-ridden decades of the mid-1600s.<sup>970</sup> He does not lay the blame solely at their door, pointing also to French jealousy and attempts to monopolize the entire fur trade.<sup>971</sup> He states, "I have, however, been informed by the aged Chiefs, that the reason the Five Nations repeatedly relaxed their Wars with the French, when they had quite the Superiority, – was, – to unite their force to humble the Illinois and other Nations, the allies of Onontio,"<sup>972</sup> Onontio is the name given to the position of the French governor. Norton's account suggests that he strove to tap the sense of English rivalry with the French in hopes of improving the British Crown's treatment of the Haudenosaunee, to whom the British owed a debt of gratitude for military support. He does not try to deny that the

967 James J. Talman, "Historical Introduction," in *The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816*, eds. Carl F. Klinck and James J. Talman (Toronto: Champlain Society, 2011), xcix-c; cvi-cvii.

Susan M. Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of: Haudenosaunee Land Tenure on the Grand River* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2017), 152; 273n64.

968 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 190-210.

969 Carl F. Klinck, "Norton, John (Snipe, Teyoninhokarawen)," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, [http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/norton\\_john\\_6E.html](http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/norton_john_6E.html) (accessed January 30, 2021).

Barbara Graymont, "Thayendanagea," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, [http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/thayendanagea\\_5E.html](http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/thayendanagea_5E.html) (accessed January 30, 2021).

970 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 202.

971 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 208-209; 214.

972 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 204.

Haudenosaunee have faults, such as lack of unanimity, which severely impacted their ability to hold their lands and contribute to the War of 1812.<sup>973</sup> Speaking especially for his own adopted Nation, the Mohawks, he observes, “Although they had never lost any Territory from engaging in unsuccessful Wars against the English colonies, having always been their faithful Allies, – it would appear that Friendship had quite as effectually rid them of their Wide and fertile Domains as hostility could have done...”<sup>974</sup>

So far, this is all relatively recent material indeed. With Parker’s independent history of the Senecas available and Cusick and Johnson’s work, it is possible to better appreciate when Norton discusses much earlier events. For instance, Norton provides an independent account of what is referred to later as the Seneca Peace Town, its destruction, and the adoption of all its survivors by the Haudenosaunee between 1650 and 1652.<sup>975</sup> He soon adds another story from what he refers to as “Sometime about this period” of a battle between Haudenosaunee and Algonquian communities living on opposite sides of the Bay of Quinte.<sup>976</sup> Joseph Brant’s genealogical ties to this region suggest that he may have been one of Norton’s sources here. As it turns out, his purpose in telling this story is to provide the background behind the name of one of the principal Onondaga chiefs.<sup>977</sup> Then, for no immediately obvious reason, Norton also recounts the story of a Haudenosaunee expedition that provides much more of the history excerpted by David Cusick and Elias Johnson concerning a hunter who is restored to life by forest animals after his untimely death in a raid. Here again Norton is speaking from what ancient chiefs have told him. The expedition is against a people the Haudenosaunee called

973 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 205-207; 285.

974 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 260.

975 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 203-204.

976 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 210-212.

977 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 215.

Keaghtagerono, later referred to as Illinois.<sup>978</sup> Victorious and on their way home, one Chief tries to warn the other Chiefs of the expedition of trouble on its way, but they ignore him, only to be caught by an Illinois counterforce. One of the warriors falls in the battle and, after his death, is reanimated by friendly animals just as the hunter is in the more schematic versions of the history given by Cusick and Johnson.<sup>979</sup>

What would become known as the Haldimand Tract and the establishment of a Haudenosaunee Confederacy Council links many of the monographs in this publishing interval between 1955 and 1995. Besides the issue of how Indigenous allies to the British were treated between 1783 to 1815 in and of itself, Haudenosaunee communities struggled with intensified religious sectarianism in the mid to late twentieth century. The social strife was not helped at all by the Canadian and United States federal governments continuing to support, if not overtly encouraging, ongoing missionization. The Canadian federal government adopted rules in the 1876 Indian Act that imposed patrilineal inheritance and automatic loss of status on Indigenous women who married non-Indigenous men or Indigenous men without “status” under the Act. As a result not only Haudenosaunee citizenship but Haudenosaunee governance was directly affected. Then the Canadian federal government intensified its interference in Haudenosaunee self-governance as the communities north of the Medicine Line assessed the impact of the Onondagas establishing a new Confederacy Council in the south. Meanwhile Canadian Indian agents sought to conflate the Grand River Confederacy Council with adherents to the Code of Handsome Lake. This effort crescendoed around 1924 when the Canadian federal government imposed an elected band council. They took full advantage of the fact that the man whose visions form the basis

978 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 205-206.

979 Norton, *The Journal of Major John Norton*, 207-208.

of the “Code” was also a Condoled Chief, hence a carrier of the name Skanyiatar:io. All these issues came together in the writing and activism of Alma Greene (Gah-wonh-nos-doh).

Greene’s first and best-known book is her 1972 autobiography, titled *Forbidden Voice: Reflections of a Mohawk Indian*,<sup>980</sup> although she composed another collection of stories published three years later.<sup>981</sup> At least, that can be understood from her sole authorship being recognized on the front cover and copyright pages of her autobiography and the story collection. Rick Monture observes that “the book is essentially an ‘as told to’ autobiographical narrative, ghostwritten by a non-Native collaborator.” In his sensitive reading of this episodic narrative and its disjointed character, he also points out that the text incorporates several glaring mistakes that Greene herself would not have made. Conversely, Monture further acknowledges Greene’s definite presence in the book, even if her authorship could be questioned.<sup>982</sup> In my own reading, the two versions of the Foundation of the Confederacy stood out, one much shorter than the other and with wording parallels suggesting they were meant to be merged.<sup>983</sup> In light of Jock Carpenter’s preparation of Delorme Smith’s own writing for publication as *Fifty Dollar Bride*, I am not convinced that Greene did not write the text. However, I am convinced by Monture that a non-Native person made major editorial interventions intended to orient the book to an outside audience and probably to emphasize the “horror” elements in some of Greene’s stories.<sup>984</sup>

Considering that Ethel Brant’s book *Famous Indians* underwent a necessary full and more effective, careful edit prior to publication by another woman who remains anonymous,<sup>985</sup> it might

980 Alma Greene (Gah-wonh-nos-doh), *Forbidden Voice: Reflections of a Mohawk Indian* (New York: Hamlyn, 1972 [1997]).

981 Alma Greene (Gah-wonh-nos-doh), *Tales of the Mohawks* (Toronto: J.M. Dent and Sons (Canada) Limited, 1975).

982 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 166-167.

983 Greene (Gah-wonh-nos-doh), *Forbidden Voice*, 36-47; 47-52.

984 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 165-166.

985 Brendan Frederick R. Edwards, “Ethel Brant Monture: ‘A One-Woman Crusade’,” McMaster University Library, <https://digitalcollections.mcmaster.ca/hpcanpub/case-study/ethel-brant-monture-one-woman-crusade> (accessed December 21, 2021).

be reasoned that *Forbidden Voice* had similar treatment. But I should better explain why this alternative interpretation of Greene's book as a "told-to" autobiography is plausible.

Greene was a well-known yet controversial figure who did not hesitate to take full part in Haudenosaunee politics in her role as Clan Mother. Her activities included a steady stream of letters sent to local newspapers on internal community politics and broader urgent matters such as the 1969 White Paper. In the context of the early- to mid-1970s, Greene may be best known for her part in the court case to restore federal recognition to the Six Nations Confederacy Council.<sup>986</sup> Her intense belief that Haudenosaunee should maintain their original spirituality and governance systems, and that women should not marry outside of their communities, informs her description of Haudenosaunee history. Selecting specific episodes from her own life that provide a hook to each historical episode, Greene reveals more detail about how in her view, newer spiritual practices have contributed to community divisions, including her belief that Joseph Brant directly added to these divisions.<sup>987</sup> Her reflections on Brant's deeds and the implication that the term "loyalist" might not have a single positive meaning aside, Greene's emphasis is on the origins and legal code of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy prior to the arrival of Europeans. Recapitulating those materials takes up most of Chapters 3 and 6, with the latter focussing on the particular powers and responsibilities of Clan Mothers.<sup>988</sup> There is evidence available that Greene was a fluent letter and speech writer, and the topics of the book are consistent with her own interests. They do not seem to reflect a series of questions from an interlocutor and subsequent reordering into chronological sequence, although this lack of evidence for a basis in one or more interviews could be a product of the heavy editing.

986 Andrea Lucille Catapano, "The Rising of the Ongwehònwe: Sovereignty, Identity, and Representation at the Six Nations Reserve" (PhD Dissertation, Stony Brook University, New York, 2007), 451-454; 460-464.

987 Greene (Gah-wonh-nos-doh), *Forbidden Voice*, 101.

988 Greene (Gah-wonh-nos-doh), *Forbidden Voice*, 36-52; 85-91.

Based on the information at hand, there is one other detail that suggests it is plausible to lean towards Greene having written at least the original manuscript. From the 1970s to 1990s, non-Indigenous non-anthropologists were not shy to state that they took part in producing a “told-to” autobiography. If their name does not appear on the front cover, they may have written at least a preface or introduction, as in the examples of Marcien Ferland and Ken Zeilig. Nothing of the sort is added to the text of *Forbidden Voice*. Endorsements by Greene’s daughter and granddaughters are added to the reissue edition of 1997. I could not access a physical copy of the original edition, although I have been able to view the front cover and first copyright page, which do not reveal any other collaborators.

The development journey of the next publication is less obscure. Enos Montour’s *The Feathered U.E.L.’s* is an episodic narrative in which the issue of religious conflict competes with the theme of Haudenosaunee loyalty to the British Crown. Among all the items in the study corpus for this project, his narrative is quite unusual for a project undertaken by an Indigenous man. For one, it combines fiction with a history given shape and scope by tracing the lines of an idealized Lenâpé family. Rick Monture emphasizes that it is the first example of an anecdotal recounting of life at Grand River from a community perspective.<sup>989</sup> While the main characters are the fictional Logans, Enos Montour branches out rapidly to draw in famous Haudenosaunee men and women, from E. Pauline Johnson to Tom Longboat, the famous Onondaga runner of the early twentieth century.<sup>990</sup> This approach may partly reflect his original training as a journalist, as the chapters have the style and punch of “slice of life” articles so common in North American magazines. Another unusual element is that Montour starts post-1815, with only a brief nod to the War of 1812 itself and, before that, the actions of General Frederick Haldimand, including his

989 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 164.

990 Montour, *The Feathered U.E.L.’s*, 135-138; 101-105.

promise and grant to the Haudenosaunee. Like Greene, Montour is more interested in depicting Haudenosaunee as adapted to agriculture, although he takes their story up to the present in order to consider such issues as the advent of television and younger people choosing not to farm. Nearly a decade after this book, Montour published a pamphlet to honour another of his relatives, mining engineer Gilbert Monture,<sup>991</sup> and he contributed to Haudenosaunee historical works by other scholars until his death.<sup>992</sup> Other than that last pamphlet and his self-published memoir *Brown Tom's School Days*, cited in the 2015 *Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada*,<sup>993</sup> he did not publish other historical writing.

We now come back to the two “told-to” autobiographies released in 1989, those of Tuscarora Chief Clinton Rickard and Seneca Chief Chainbreaker. It would be difficult to find two more contrasting approaches to presenting a “told-to” narrative, even though, in both cases, the original amanuensis was in an excellent position to produce a transcribed account. Taking Chainbreaker’s autobiography first, since it is the earlier document, the amount of annotation provided by editor Thomas S. Abler is impressive. As is the common style of “told-to” narratives of the late twentieth century and beyond, the editor is up-front about actively presenting and shaping the document, seeking to provide the reader with all they need to understand the text properly. This is a tough remit: the 97 printed pages of Benjamin Williams’ translation of Chainbreaker’s original words in Seneca are nearly overwhelmed amid nearly two hundred pages of explanation. Still, Abler does manage the delicate balance in providing geographical and

991 Enos T. Montour, *The Rockhound of Jerusalem: Being the Saga of Dr. Gilbert Clarence Monture* (St. Catharine’s: Self-Published, 1981).

992 Donald B. Smith, “Opinion: Seen but Not Seen: Why Did Canada Fail to Respect Indigenous Societies and Culture?” *Calgary Herald*, May 29, 2011, <https://calgaryherald.com/opinion/columnists/opinion-seen-but-not-seen-why-did-canada-fail-to-respect-indigenous-societies-and-culture> (accessed June 14, 2021).

993 Enos T. Montour, *Brown Tom's School Days*, ed. Elizabeth Graham (Waterloo: Self-Published, 1985). Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, *The Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada Volume 4: Missing Children and Unmarked Burials* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2015), 2-3.

military data a reader may need to fully appreciate Chainbreaker's story. Those readers who opt to check the rest of Williams' introduction, which has been relegated to an appendix, are left to ponder if these almost two pages were part of an outline for his own planned explanatory notes to the text.<sup>994</sup> Certainly Williams hoped to see the Chainbreaker manuscript published. Abler explains how Williams came to sell it to Lyman C. Draper, the storied Wisconsin historical archivist, and how Draper found himself too caught up in data gathering to write or publish anything.<sup>995</sup> Nonetheless, there is no clear indication as to what Chainbreaker or Williams meant to provide through these memoirs. It could be that Chainbreaker wished to give a Haudenosaunee perspective, or at least a western Seneca one, on the fratricidal conflict between the Thirteen Colonies and the British Crown.

The conditions antecedent to the publication of Rickard's memoirs were much better for preserving a record of the motives and plans of the collaborators. In this case, these memoirs are a collaboration between Rickard and his longtime friend, historian Barbara Graymont. Rickard was fluently bilingual in both Tuscarora and English, and Graymont had already been learning and documenting the Tuscarora language with him for several years.<sup>996</sup> Presenting Rickard's memoirs between an Editor's introductory remarks and afterward plus end notes, Graymont documents her own motivations in the Editor's Preface:

My schedule permitted me to spend only a few days with Clinton Rickard during the summer of 1965; so, I used the time to fulfill my longstanding desire to record the stories I had heard him tell. We began with the history of the founding of the Indian Defense League of America and then proceeded to the later work of the

994 Benjamin Williams, "Appendix One: Introduction to the Williams Text," in *Chainbreaker: The Revolutionary War Memoirs of Governor Blacksnake as Told to Benjamin Williams*, ed. Thomas S. Abler (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989 [2005]), 227-228.

995 Thomas S. Abler, "Introduction 'Pretty Smart for His Age,'" in *Chainbreaker: The Revolutionary War Memoirs of Governor Blacksnake as Told to Benjamin Williams*, ed. Thomas S. Abler (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989 [2005]), 5-6.

996 Barbara Graymont, "Editor's Preface," in *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*, ed. Barbara Graymont (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973), xi-xii.

league. After this, he recorded some traditional Tuscarora history. Each tale was recorded first in English and then again in Tuscarora.<sup>997</sup>

A little further on, Graymont adds with a hint of speaking back to mainstream scholarly colleagues inclined to doubt Indigenous people have their own histories:

These many letters and documents so carefully preserved [by Rickard] were the record of his life's work. It was quite clear that Clinton Rickard had a deep sense of history. He knew the importance of his own work as well as the significance of his people's histories and traditions. He was as scrupulous in preserving these materials as any trained archivist.<sup>998</sup>

Graymont clearly describes how she edited the text and notes that Rickard reviewed each chapter until his passing in mid 1971.<sup>999</sup> She even documents which topics she sought more information on despite some resistance on Rickard's part.<sup>1000</sup> Having worked with many older "told-to" documents to write her most well-known book, *The Iroquois in the American Revolution*,<sup>1001</sup> Graymont fulfilled much of any contemporary researcher's desire for information on her role in Rickard's memoir in these few pages.

As for Rickard, his intentions in recording his memoirs come through unmistakably throughout the book, including many reflections and pieces of advice for other Indigenous activists based on his experience and observations.<sup>1002</sup> He provides only a brief summary of Tuscarora history and the nature of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, indicative of his understanding that Graymont was already familiar with this material. Rickard also sheds some possible light on the flurry of United Empire Loyalist-themed publications through his account

997 *Ibid.*

998 Graymont, "Editor's Preface," xiii.

999 Graymont, "Editor's Preface," xiv-xvi.

Barbara Graymont, "Editor's Afterword," in *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*, ed. Barbara Graymont (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973), 163.

1000 Barbara Graymont, "Editor's Introduction," in *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*, ed. Barbara Graymont (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973), xiv.

1001 Barbara Graymont, *The Iroquois in the American Revolution* (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1972).

1002 For example, see Rickard, *Fighting Tuscarora*, 123-125; 137; 149-150.

of the clash at Grand River between Haudenosaunee seeking to bring in an elected band council and their opponents. He refers to the former as “[a] small group of loyalists, so-called, were in favour of an elective council...”<sup>1003</sup> As described above, in this period between the World Wars, the Canadian federal government had opted to try a more aggressive approach to forcing Indigenous people to become Canadian citizens rather than citizens of Indigenous nations allied to the British Crown. It intensified the enforcement of involuntary enfranchisement clauses on all Indigenous communities. For the Haudenosaunee, this went further to include imposing a band council defined under the terms of the Indian Act. The meaning of being a “loyalist” was in question.

Now we come to another pair of texts, sharing a topic although not a publication year. The earlier is Jacob Thomas’ revision of Seth Newhouse’s recital of the Haudenosaunee Great Law of Peace. Pursuing his commitment to maintaining the established Grand River Confederacy Council and Haudenosaunee culture, Newhouse had undertaken his own transcription project, producing a manuscript that he expanded at least twice over a period of approximately thirty years in the late nineteenth century. Though he was fluent in both Onondaga and English, Newhouse could not win the endorsement of the Grand River Condoled Chiefs for his work, nor could he find a way to get it published, but he did send it to Arthur C. Parker.<sup>1004</sup> Thomas declared on the front page of his revised version that he was working with an 1897 version of this controversial text, and the introduction reveals his view of what needed changing.<sup>1005</sup> His

1003 Rickard, *Fighting Tuscarora*, 61.

1004 Scott Trevithick, “Newhouse, Seth (Dayodekane),” *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, [http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/newhouse\\_seth\\_15E.html](http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/newhouse_seth_15E.html) (accessed January 30, 2021).

1005 Seth Newhouse, *The Constitution of the Confederacy by the Peacemaker*, revised by Chief Jacob E. Thomas (Wilsonville: Sandpiper Press, 1989): front cover.

Brian Wiles-Heape, “Introduction: An Interview with Chief Jacob E. Thomas, Friday 14 April 1989,” in *The Constitution of the Confederacy by the Peacemaker*, by Seth Newhouse, Rev. Chief Jacob E. Thomas (Wilsonville: Sandpiper Press, 1989), i-ii.

specific concern is the translations of terms for young Haudenosaunee men of fighting age, the assistant Chiefs to the Condoled Chiefs, and the two Seneca Chiefs who, before the establishment of the Great Law of Peace, held authority specifically over war.<sup>1006</sup> Arguing that the Haudenosaunee-language words used do not refer to war at all based on his own linguistic and cultural expertise, including a consideration of the connotations of the English word “warrior,” Thomas casts a stern eye on a fairly new development as of 1989. That development was the creation of a modern “Warrior Society,” based on what its founder and members deemed a correct interpretation of the Great Law of Peace.<sup>1007</sup> Johansen’s book *Life and Death in Mohawk Country* gives a capsule history of the origins of this new “Warrior Society” and how Mohawk communities experienced its presence and actions from 1989 to 1992.<sup>1008</sup> Here was serious proof of the ongoing life and relevance of the Great Law of Peace to Haudenosaunee people.

Even as these writing projects reached publication, Haudenosaunee communities were struggling to counter the forces driving the loss of their languages. While Kanien’kéha (Mohawk) may be in the best position of the six Iroquoian languages of the Haudenosaunee, Onondaga is considered the most vulnerable. Beginning in the 1970s, linguist Hanni Woodbury worked with younger Onondaga speakers to document the language and build up teaching materials for instructing children and adults.<sup>1009</sup> This work led Woodbury to begin a “re-elicitation,” a new transcription, and thorough translation of an Onondaga language recital of the

1006 Wiles-Heape, “Introduction,” i-iii; vii.

1007 Wiles-Heape, “Introduction,” iv-v.

1008 Johansen, *Life and Death in Mohawk Country*, 73-99; 133-158.

1009 Hanni Woodbury, “Hanni Woodbury on Documenting an Endangered Language, 23 February 2018,” University of Toronto Press Blog, <https://utorontopress.com/blog/2018/02/23/hanni-woodbury-on-documenting-an-endangered-language/> (accessed December 21, 2021).

Hanni Woodbury, “Biography,” Hanni Woodbury Prints, <https://www.hanniwoodbury.com/bio> (accessed December 12, 2021).

Great Law of Peace published under the title “Concerning the League.” The recitalist who dictated the tradition was the revered Condoled Chief, ritualist, and lacrosse player-coach, John A. Gibson, Jr. He recited the narrative to the anthropologist Alexander A. Goldenweiser in 1912. Unfortunately, Gibson died only a few months after completing the recital,<sup>1010</sup> and Goldenweiser apparently lost his initial transcription.<sup>1011</sup> This meant that, in effect, Gibson’s text was lost, and what was left was an inconsistent transcription. Woodbury and her Haudenosaunee collaborators sought to recreate what Gibson said via a lengthy process in which she read the Gibson-Goldenweiser manuscript aloud in Onondaga, and her Onondaga-speaking colleagues repeated it back and helped with re-transcribing it more accurately.<sup>1012</sup> The result is a recreation of Gibson’s recounting of the early days just before the Peacemaker began the great project of founding the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, recital of the Great Law of Peace, and the Condolence Council up to when a new Condoled Chief is about to be installed.<sup>1013</sup> Woodbury describes the result: “The present work makes available a native text of the [League] Tradition in translation. It is the only complete version of the tradition published in an Iroquoian language.”<sup>1014</sup> Chief Jacob Thomas is among the contributors, and it is not coincidental that one of the tasks Woodbury undertook was making corrections to earlier English translations.<sup>1015</sup> Any claim to have created “the only

1010 Hanni Woodbury, “Introduction,” in *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson*. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser’s Manuscript (Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992), xi; xii.

1011 Woodbury, “Introduction,” xiii.

1012 Woodbury, “Introduction,” xv-xvii.

Hanni Woodbury, “Appendix 2: Relationship Between the Reelicited Text and the Manuscript,” in *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson*. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser’s Manuscript (Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992), 708-709.

1013 Hanni Woodbury, “The Gibson-Goldenweiser Text: Its Place in the Iroquoian Oral Tradition,” in *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson*. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser’s Manuscript (Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992), xix-xxxiii.

1014 Woodbury, “Introduction,” xi.

1015 Woodbury, “Introduction,” xvi-xvii.

complete version” of a Haudenosaunee tradition seems dangerous to make, but it is consistent with the ever-present mainstream pressure to exert control over Indigenous peoples and cultures by claiming authority over definitions of what is “complete” or “real” for them. More revealing of its quality is its standing as both a ritual text and a widely respected, detailed rendition of part of the earliest history of the origins and founding of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy. The Gibson-Woodbury edition would go on to supersede Arthur C. Parker’s 1916 version for many subsequent Haudenosaunee historians who preferred this newer, community-approved text. It did not completely replace Parker’s version, as we will see.

One more monograph closes out this period, Donna K. Goodleaf’s *Entering the War Zone*. Its origins and content foreshadow the new forms and style of Haudenosaunee historiography at the later turn of the twentieth century. It began as her University of Massachusetts-Amherst dissertation in education, “Kanienkehaka (Mohawk) Nation, State Policies, and Community Resistance: A Pedagogical Tool.”<sup>1016</sup> Unlike the theses by Dickason and Payment analyzed in the previous case study, there is no sign of depoliticizing the language or content of Goodleaf’s thesis between academia and the press. If anything, the book is more political, and its publisher is the oldest Indigenous press in what is currently known as Canada, Penticton-based Theytus Press. Having dropped most of the first two chapters of her original dissertation, Goodleaf focuses the published version on setting the stage and then recounting the “Oka Crisis” and its aftermath. Continuing her original emphasis on the role of Mohawk women during the crisis and in Haudenosaunee society and governance, Goodleaf added relevant cultural and linguistic detail about Clan Mothers,<sup>1017</sup> and poems by herself and two other Mohawk women.<sup>1018</sup> Three women’s

1016 Donna K. Goodleaf, “Kanienkehaka (Mohawk) Nation, State Policies, and Community Resistance: A Pedagogical Tool” (PhD Dissertation, University of Massachusetts-Amherst, 1992).

1017 Goodleaf, *Entering the War Zone*, 12-15.

1018 Goodleaf, *Entering the War Zone*, x-xi; 26; 94; 98; 115-116; 127; 184-186.

representatives from Kahnawà:ke provided an introduction.<sup>1019</sup> The main detail missing relative to her dissertation is Goodleaf's original description of her data collection methods and placement of herself as a participant-observer with accountabilities to her Mohawk community.<sup>1020</sup> She makes use of many of the same types of sources as Johansen, as well as interviews, and in a mode reminiscent of Howard Adams, incorporates much more autobiographical material. Goodleaf's monograph is also the first to include a brief glossary of Kanien'kéha terms used in the text.

*New Syncretic Haudenosaunee Historiography, 2000 – 2017*

I have already referred to the change in Haudenosaunee historiography as a phase shift, and connected this change to the impact not just of political actions but also of the maturing discipline of Indigenous/Native/Native American Studies, from here referred to as "Indigenous studies." Indigenous studies began as a highly interdisciplinary, creative field and has emerged as an independent discipline that applies its own sources and methods based in Indigenous knowledge. It is one of the major areas through which Indigenous elders are recognized for their expertise and brought into the academy as instructors, including Chief Jacob Thomas, who worked for nearly twenty years at Trent University.<sup>1021</sup> At the University of Alberta, where the School of Native Studies became a Faculty in 2006, Indigenous studies is defined as a discipline which "seeks to understand the experiences and lives of Indigenous people and communities, past, present, and into the future. It also studies how Indigenous communities and the countries in which they live influence and define each other."<sup>1022</sup> Establishing a foothold in the academy

1019 Goodleaf, *Entering the War Zone*, viii-ix.

1020 Goodleaf, "Kanienkehaka (Mohawk) Nation, State Policies, and Community Resistance," 10-15.

1021 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 190.

1022 Faculty of Native Studies, "What is Native Studies?" University of Alberta, <https://www.ualberta.ca/native-studies/about-us/what-is-native-studies.html> (accessed March 3, 2022).

has helped create and hold space for conceptualizing, composing, and presenting syncretic histories as evidenced by the growing role of university presses in publishing them. There are two precocious examples of Haudenosaunee syncretic histories before 2000, Elias Johnson's *Legends, Traditions and Laws of the Iroquois* and Arthur C. Parker's *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*. Understandably, sometimes their combinations of Indigenous and European-sourced material are awkward. For Johnson, those mixtures were between "pagan" and "Christian" materials. Parker struggled to both use the orally transmitted material and go along with the contemporary mainstream insistence that such stories were little better than folklore. Until scholars at least had the professional option of openly treating oral traditions seriously and publishing their work, the chances of bringing materials other than "told-to" accounts and revisions of the Great Law of Peace to print were low. From 2000 to 2017, the number of syncretic histories jumped to almost one every other year, and the minimum length exclusive of apparatus is 116 pages.

The first book of this era is Barbara Alice Mann's *Iroquoian Women*. In the opening of this work, she admits, "I did not intend to write in the historical vein when I first set about composing this book."<sup>1023</sup> Cross-over projects between English and History as academic fields are relatively common, although studies of written documents by or transcribed from the speeches of Indigenous persons much less so, and often fixated on a tiny number of "great man" figures even quite late in this period. At least, that was the case as long as the majority of scholars involved in such research were not Indigenous or were focussed on ethnohistorical land claims work.<sup>1024</sup> For

<sup>1023</sup> Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 3.

<sup>1024</sup> For example, see Margery Fee, *Literary Land Claims: The "Indian land Question" From Pontiac's War to Attawapiskat* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2015).

Rachel Bryant, *The Homing Place: Indigenous and Settler Histories of the Atlantic* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2017).

example, Mann's dissertation reinforces her point, as its title is "Forbidden Ground: Racial Politics and Hidden Identity in James Fenimore Cooper's Leather-Stocking Tales."<sup>1025</sup> Yet her abstract and table of contents soon reveal the seeds of *Iroquoian Women*, especially in its chapter headings, which correspond to the major topics in the later book.<sup>1026</sup> She also states unequivocally in her first chapter, "Literature is history."<sup>1027</sup>

Having identified a gap in the historical information available about Iroquoian women in her early doctoral research, Mann set out to rectify that absence. After publishing an article in *American Indian Quarterly* in 1997, and a chapter in the co-edited anthology *Debating Democracy* in 1998,<sup>1028</sup> she continued on to *Iroquoian Women*. With more space to work within the book format, Mann takes a carefully constructed, two-prong approach based on analytical readings of European sources combined with unabashed use of "oral tradition as history, for that is assuredly what it is."<sup>1029</sup> This does not make her an unquestioning echo of oral tradition by any means, and she comments, "Indeed, whenever I have actually tested the content of tradition, I have found it to accord remarkably well with the archeological, historical, astronomical, and primary sources at hand, albeit, with a decidedly Native twist to the interpretation."<sup>1030</sup>

Mann takes great care to give readers a full warning that they are not about to read the sort of history that they are used to and provides a thorough, often very funny, précis of how the pages ahead will be different. She explains that she will apply an Iroquoian-styled discourse

1025 Barbara Alice Mann, "Forbidden Ground: Racial Politics and Hidden Identity in James Fenimore Cooper's Leather-Stocking Tales" (PhD Dissertation, University of Toledo, 1997).

1026 Mann, "Forbidden Ground," viii-xi.

1027 Mann, "Forbidden Ground," 3.

1028 Barbara A. Mann, "The Lynx in Time: The Haudenosaunee Women's Tradition in History," *American Indian Quarterly* 21, no. 3 (1997): 423-449.

Barbara A. Mann, "Euro-Forming the Data," in *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom*, eds. Bruce E. Johansen *et al.* (San Jose: Clearlight Publishers, 1998), 160-189.

1029 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 6.

1030 *Ibid.*

that, despite not following the “Puritan thesis format,” is indeed organized. Furthermore, she did not hesitate to use the discourse tactic of “sacred clowning.”<sup>1031</sup> Each chapter begins with an episode from Iroquoian women’s oral tradition. She leaves it mainly to the reader to think through the details of how each episode explicates the main text, with a few hints and guide posts to help them along the way. Before going on to her first chapter, comprised of definitions, clarifications, and key terms, Mann reflects on how even some feminist scholars are misinformed about Indigenous women in general and Iroquoian women in particular. She makes special note of the early ties between the Seneca Clan Mothers and nineteenth century women’s rights activists. Although this first book and many of her other publications helped catalyze corrective research and republication, her assessment of how even the most well-meaning and well-trained could *still* be misinformed summarizes the weaknesses of academic research and publishing on Indigenous women:

Appearing as articles for the most part, even fine scholarship winds up scattered across journals of diverse disciplines, tucked obscurely in amidst other, unrelated articles in collections of history, law, anthropology, archeology, literature, feminism, and Native Studies that stretch across a divide of time at least as wide as the divide of discipline. The combined time and dispersal factors make research a true challenge, even for the accomplished scholar. In no area of Native Studies is a thoughtful assessment more needed, yet, in no area has it been less forthcoming. Clearly, an accessible work emphasizing a Native point of view on the *gantowisas* and insisting upon accuracy – not only in raw reporting, but in analysis – is long overdue.<sup>1032</sup>

This ambitious program makes for a long book, already nearly twice as long as typical for an author’s first historical monograph in this period, before taking account of endnotes or her extensive bibliography. *Iroquoian Women* remains in print, with reissues in 2004, 2006, and 2011.<sup>1033</sup>

1031 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 7-8.

1032 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 10.

1033 Mann, “Curriculum Vitae,” 2.

Peter Lang, “Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas,” Peter Lang Group AG, <https://www.peterlang.com/document/1101970> (accessed December 31, 2021).

For her next book, Mann did not reprise all the techniques she used in designing and presenting the history at hand. There is plenty of oral history in Mann's *George Washington's War on Native America*, as she recounts the attacks Washington ordered on Indigenous nations to the west of the Thirteen Colonies from 1775 to 1782, leaving little space for humour. Summing up her sources, Mann states, "I use not only American documents (to which all too many historians still confine themselves), but also British documents, Native American documents – yes, there were literate Natives writing reports and letters – and Native oral tradition."<sup>1034</sup> Identifying oral tradition each time it is used, Mann traces a harrowing campaign record, acknowledging that her coverage of neighbouring Indigenous nations to the Haudenosaunee, in the west and south, could not be included due to space constraints. Odd as this may sound, it makes sense to check the original hard cover edition, which is part of the ABC-CLIO Praeger imprint series *Native America: Yesterday and Today*. The texts in the series are generally held under the 300-page mark, including all front and back matter, with few to no illustrations or maps. In comparison, the American Indian Studies series at Peter Lang that *Iroquoian Women* is part of includes books ranging from 150 to over 500 pages. Overall, this book serves a similar purpose in principle to its predecessor: Mann uses it to begin bridging a gap in accessible narratives of these campaigns, as well as an uncompromising explanation with over 1500 endnotes of just why the Haudenosaunee names for Washington translate to "Town Destroyer."

In many ways this is a Haudenosaunee historiographic decade that can be defined by Mann's publications. Her next book, *Land of the Three Miamis*, reveals another gap of concern, this one where the western Seneca in Ohio should be in the record. In the second part of the *Distant View in Time*, I noted that this small text draws upon her entire oeuvre to that point, 2005 and early

<sup>1034</sup> Mann, *George Washington's War on Native America* (2008), 3.

2006, including five books and two articles just in her select bibliography for the book. Mann writes as if reciting Haudenosaunee history to her granddaughter, giving the text a more informal tone that is nevertheless rigorous in its detail and arrangement. As readers will have learned to expect, Mann weaves together oral history, Haudenosaunee toponymy, archaeological evidence, and political science in a narrative that in the telling seems to span several years in her granddaughter's life. She outlines the complex factors impacting the phenomenon of Indigenous people "hiding in plain sight" in the Northeast,<sup>1035</sup> acknowledges violence in war uncharacteristic of mainstream history writing directed at children and young adults in most of North America (Indigenous or non-Indigenous),<sup>1036</sup> and gives a clear-eyed description of the tactics and impacts of boarding schools.<sup>1037</sup>

Now the historiographic ball returns to the Northeast, where citizens of Six Nations of the Grand River have built an intellectual longhouse of no small size. They begin the second decade of the twenty-first century a bit late only in terms of monograph publishing, and, in this case, with a new rendition of early Haudenosaunee history by Brian Rice, *The Rotinonshonni: A Traditional Iroquoian History Through the Eyes of Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera*. From the perspective of analyzing and understanding Haudenosaunee historiography, it is well worth it to resist the urge to skip the brief Preface. Like Mann, he is concerned about the absence of Haudenosaunee/Rotinonshonni philosophy and understanding of the world in such histories.<sup>1038</sup> Rice's primary sources are oral traditions as recited by Chief John Arthur Gibson, Chief Jacob Thomas, and Abraham La Fort via Ely S. Parker's translation included in *League of the Ho-dé-*

1035 Mann, *Land of the Three Miamis*, 104-107.

1036 For example, Mann, *Land of the Three Miamis*, 69-71; 76-81.

1037 Mann, *Land of the Three Miamis*, 109-111.

1038 Rice, *The Rotinonshonni*, ix.

*no-sau-nee*.<sup>1039</sup> I have already mentioned that Gibson recited portions of Haudenosaunee history at least three times to scholars working with the Bureau of American Ethnology. The one Rice uses in his book is not the 1989 re-elicitation or the unpublished transcription and copy I referenced, but one made to and published by J.N.B. Hewitt in 1900.<sup>1040</sup> Combining academic and Rotinonshonni writing styles throughout the text, Rice takes a moment in his introduction to critique ethnohistorians, who are still mostly non-Indigenous and writing in established mainstream ways:

Other non-Indigenous ethnohistorians have attempted to understand the motivations of the cultures they were writing about by better interpreting the works of their predecessors. However, few have ever spoken to a traditional Elder or have been witnesses to contemporary expressions of North American Indigenous culture that still to some degree retain the worldview they are trying to reflect in their writings.... Even writings such as [those of William N. Fenton] offer little insight into the deeper spiritual insights of the culture and how from those traditions one may interpret the motivations of the people that represent that culture. They cannot do so, because they interpret things from their Euro-western understanding; therefore, the spirituality has no meaning for them. However, the writer believes that not writing from an insider's perspective means they cannot claim to be writing Indigenous history. Instead, they are trying to find a place for Indigenous people in their own cultural construct of what history is.

This is not to say that the writer believes that the histories and stories these people wrote down about the Rotinonshonni have no value. In fact, they make excellent secondary sources and can be used to enhance Indigenous history.<sup>1041</sup>

Rice scrupulously emphasizes that what he is presenting is his *interpretation* of Rotinonshonni oral history, where the interpretation belongs to him. He does not claim to own the stories themselves.<sup>1042</sup> This indicates that Rice would refer not to versions of oral tradition, but interpretations, such that we should always expect to see more of them. Different as his presentation style is from Mann's, his uncompromising intent is just as plain. His decision not to

1039 Rice, *The Rotinonshonni*, 16-19.

1040 J.N.B. Hewitt, "The Myth of the Earth-grasper of De'haen'hiyawa'khon," *Bureau of American Ethnology Annual Report* (1900): 1-130.

1041 Rice, *The Rotinonshonni*, 14-15.

1042 Rice, *The Rotinonshonni*, 18.

analyze European or other mainstream records makes it difficult to consider the text in a mainstream mode, as we should expect. Nevertheless, I will try to go some way into where it is rather slippery to tread because it illustrates so well Rice's determination not to allow mainstream linear chronology to dictate the shape of the narrative.

Rice takes up Rotinonshonni history encoded into three stories widely considered pivotal and spiritually potent by Haudenosaunee scholars, and two upon which there is still potential or confirmed disagreement. One or all of the first three are cited or presented in some fashion in the majority of the articles, pamphlets, speeches, and books sketched in the two parts of the Distant View in Time above. They are the Creation Story, the reception of the Clan System and Migration, and the Great Way of Peace. Rice refers to the other two under the chapter headings "Sawiskera Gains Control" and "The Kari:wio of Skanyiatar:io." It is easier to point to evidence that opinions about the Kari:wio, Gaiwi:io or "Code of Handsome Lake" vary among Haudenosaunee historians. Mann sets out a perspective grounded in the western Seneca communities in Ohio and western New York who neither converted to Christianity nor accepted the Kari:wio.<sup>1043</sup> Conversely, Arthur C. Parker gathered his materials on the Kari:wio from Haudenosaunee communities in New York and at Grand River, from people who accepted it.<sup>1044</sup> There is not as much evidence available in the primary source corpus in the case of the narrative explaining the next phase of the influence of the Twins Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera in "Sawiskera Gains Control," though not because there is not agreement that this has happened. It is because only Rice and Mann include a detailed account of it out of all the monographs considered here, and they seem to have slightly different ideas about when Sawiskera's control began. Based on the materials I have studied concerning Sawiskera and his relationship with

1043 Mann, *Land of the Three Miamis*, 94-95; 98.

1044 Parker, *The Code of Handsome Lake*, 5-6.

Europeans, there is probable consensus, with potential lingering disagreement on when he returned to a position of primary influence. Regardless of the level of consensus about the meaning and import of these stories, they are in the listed order above.

A concern raised by Jan Vansina in 1986 about histories based in part on orally transmitted records is that they are prone to being far more detailed the closer to the present their descriptions reach.<sup>1045</sup> This may even seem inevitable because time steadily erases evidence of the past unless effort, luck, or both come together to maintain some kind of archive using the most familiar European methods. However, Rice's traditional Rotinonshonni history does not work this way or make these assumptions. The lengthiest and most detailed chapters are those recounting the Creation Story and the Great Way of Peace, making up two-thirds of the main text. And between them, the Creation Story is much longer than the Great Way of Peace. In Rice's interpretation, the Rotinonshonni clans, migrations, contact with Europeans, and the Kari:wio are pivotal in their own right. Nothing he says suggests he intends any sort of ranking here, nor that he is stinting these other stories listed here for any reason. From a mainstream analytical framework, this creates an impasse. If these differences are not about chronology and not about importance, then we are left to declare the differences in length and detail between the stories simply arbitrary. That is not a satisfactory result, but the Closer View in Indigenous Critical Theory Mode is still to come, and this demonstrates Rice's point about Indigenous versus mainstream history.

Rick Monture pursues a different angle in *We Share Our Matters: Teionkwakhashion tsi niionkwariho:ten: Two Centuries of Writing and Resistance at Six Nations of the Grand River*,

<sup>1045</sup> Jan Vansina defined this concern as part of his discussion of the "floating gap" in oral tradition, the point at which specific dates and personal names are apparently no longer passed down over time, in *Oral Tradition as History* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1985), 23-24.

taking up a topic close to Robert Warrior's heart by composing a literary history of non-fiction by Six Nations authors, much of which is historiographic in its own right. Narrowing the focus, Monture describes his project as "an examination of the philosophies, intellectual traditions, and assertions of sovereignty that have long been part of the written record of one group of Haudenosaunee people, the Six Nations of the Grand River Territory in southern Ontario."<sup>1046</sup> He sets out his own Haudenosaunee-grounded interpretive framework, emphasizing change and meaningful objects and ideas carried from one place to another by the people undergoing the transformation, whether or not it includes a literal move on the land.<sup>1047</sup> We can already guess which story provides the foundation of Monture's framework; it is the same one that recurs time and again at the beginning of the majority of the monographs, Sky Woman's fall to Turtle Island. Only after these elements are in place does Monture begin investigating the literature he has selected, starting with Joseph Brant's speeches and surviving letters. Indeed, Brant is emblematic of the type of writer Monture is most interested in, Six Nations people with complicated, if not difficult, legacies left to the future in writing and oral tradition.

Among the writers considered, Monture includes familiar figures who have not made much, if any, appearance so far in this study, such as Deskaheh Levi General and E. Pauline Johnson. Chapter 4, "Displacement, Identity, and Resistance,"<sup>1048</sup> left me wondering how he would bring together four such wildly different people as Robbie Robertson, Enos Montour, Alma Greene, and Daniel David Moses, in a coherent way. Being least familiar with Robertson's work, which is primarily historical ballads, I was soon reminded of the interpretive framework Monture provided in his introduction, which did provide the coherent ties. This chapter also contributed

1046 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, xi.

1047 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 4-5; 28.

1048 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 141-178.

important material to the previous section of this Closer View in a Mainstream Mode. As he sets out the legacies of his authorial subjects, Monture gradually shifts to ask the broader question of what Grand River Haudenosaunee and their neighbours can or should do in response to a troubling past.<sup>1049</sup> Although the Canadian government has always denied Haudenosaunee assertions of sovereignty, it is still alive and active today. Monture demonstrates this using two outcomes of the “Caledonia occupation,” recognizing first and foremost that the Haudenosaunee have rightfully reclaimed Kanonhstaton, “the protected place.” Second, the Canadian federal government conceded that the Grand River Confederacy Council still exists and has the authority to carry out land negotiations.<sup>1050</sup>

Now we come again to what is only the second monograph-length biography of an Indigenous person authored by an Indigenous person, *Dr. Oronhyatekha: Security, Justice, and Equality*, by Keith Jamieson and Michelle A. Hamilton. The ambitious and flamboyant Oronhyatekha Peter Martin was a member of a powerful Grand River Haudenosaunee family, and like E. Pauline Johnson, was gravely impacted by the political manoeuvring that placed George Henry Martin Johnson on the Confederacy Council. George H.M. Johnson was Oronhyatekha’s cousin and Pauline’s father.<sup>1051</sup> For Oronhyatekha, these impacts came primarily through the influence of missionaries working for the New England Company. This is the same company whose role in early on-reserve education at Grand River was documented by both Julia L. and Keith Jamieson in the late 1960s and 1980s.<sup>1052</sup> There are parallels between Oronhyatekha’s life and that of Eleazer Williams, as they were both deemed high potential boys

1049 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 189-196.

1050 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 211-212; 216-217.

1051 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 70-71.

1052 Jamieson, *Echoes of the Past*, 2-3.

Jamieson, *History of Six Nations Education*, 7-14.

by missionaries, and, as teenagers, planned to become missionaries.<sup>1053</sup> Oronyatekha had better opportunities to take other directions when faced with obstacles and disappointments. He became the second Indigenous doctor in Canada trained in a European medical curriculum. He maintained a medical practice until, worn out by Haudenosaunee politics, he turned his attention to fraternal orders.<sup>1054</sup>

Through the first four chapters of this biography, Oronhyatekha's life tracks local Grand River and Tyendinaga history. The following three chapters describe the critical role he played in turn of the nineteenth century insurance business in Toronto via his leadership of the Independent Order of Foresters (IOF) and their insurance plan. It is in this period that Oronhyatekha completes the world travel and business activities that would usually guarantee a man's public legacy, including a very Haudenosaunee-style intervention in developing a museum collection.<sup>1055</sup> Housed originally in the first IOF Temple building and now in the Royal Ontario Museum, Jamieson and Hamilton suggest that "The objects collected from native individuals still make a statement about political sovereignty, as Dr. Oronyatekha intended, and in particular can assist in retrieving information about native participation in the War of 1812. The significance of the collection is best appreciated as a whole, representative of Dr. Oronhyatekha's experiences and accomplishments."<sup>1056</sup> Even with so much success against the odds and remaining a Mohawk person, adeptly navigating settler culture, and avoiding involuntary enfranchisement, Oronhyatekha's public legacy was nearly forgotten outside of Grand River.

1053 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 31; 35; 38-39; 60.  
Oberg, *Professional Indian*, 28-29.

1054 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 119; 136-141; 157-160.

1055 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 214-252.

1056 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 282.

What makes this biography a syncretic work is not as obvious as other books considered here. The oral histories are not overtly in evidence, until we remember that the existence and ongoing activities of the Clan Mothers and the Confederacy Council recounted in *Dr. Oronhyatekha*'s early chapters implicitly invokes the Great Law of Peace.<sup>1057</sup> Oronhyatekha's beautiful ceremonial suit for the 1860 Prince of Wales visit, described in detail in the book and illustrated with photographs, is redolent with potent imagery that retells the Creation Story to those who understand how to interpret them or who are lucky enough to read this biography.<sup>1058</sup> Rather than pretend to know Oronhyatekha's feelings or thoughts as Chalmers attempted to do in writing about Joseph Brant in the early 1940s, Jamieson and Hamilton make full use of an indirect record of his behaviour and concerns through the letters and documents left by his personal and professional contacts.<sup>1059</sup> Jamieson and Hamilton also thoroughly read his objects and monuments, from his museum collection to his home, a technique that Northwest Métis historians and biographers are very familiar with today. Yet this is not a "great man" biography either, from a mainstream and old-fashioned perspective. Oronhyatekha is significant to Haudenosaunee today in spite of not being a military hero or a major political figure. Oronhyatekha was a beloved doctor in general practice, and a successful insurance executive. However, insurance executives do not typically feature in "great businessmen" biographies.

Susan M. Hill's study of Haudenosaunee land tenure at Grand River takes a structure that is now familiar, with its parallel consideration of Haudenosaunee historical consciousness and knowledge. This time, I will begin from the "end," so to speak, by surveying the Indigenous-sourced elements Hill references and documents in her bibliography. Then I will discuss how

1057 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 70-71.

1058 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 82-84.

1059 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 33-34.

Hill brought together a unique compilation of oral tradition, colonial records, and the late nineteenth and early twentieth-century minutes of the Grand River Confederacy Council. This Council was set up after the Haudenosaunee moved from their lands in what is now mostly referred to as New York State. For a time after Joseph Brant led the people north, there was no Confederacy fire at Onondaga south of the Medicine Line, but the Onondagas soon founded another Confederacy Council there. Despite the best of intentions, it was simply beyond the capacity of the northern Council to respond in an effective or timely way to the needs of their kin to the south and further west under the new conditions. The Onondaga and Grand River Confederacy Councils soon began to work together after a period of friction, and continue to do so today.<sup>1060</sup>

Starting with Hill's secondary sources,<sup>1061</sup> the monographs for this project feature, including Haudenosaunee examples such as Chainbreaker and Rickard's memoirs, the Gibson-Woodbury collaboration, *Iroquoian Women*, two of Parker's books, *We Share Our Matters*, and Thomas' revision of Newhouse. Her work is informed by dissertations in history, law, anthropology, and some items from the growing catalogue of articles and pamphlets penned and published by the Six Nations Elected Council. On the question of Indigenous people in general and Haudenosaunee in particular, who take up the task of writing their own histories in the sphere of European-style publishing, Hill references an important Wendat scholar, Georges Sioui. His 1992 book *For an Amerindian Autohistory: An Essay on the Foundations of a Social Ethic*,<sup>1062</sup> also considered by Brian Rice, examines important theoretical and practical questions. Turning to

1060 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 3.

1061 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 292-300.

1062 Georges Sioui, *For an Amerindian Autohistory: An Essay on the Foundations of a Social Ethic* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1992).

Hill's primary sources,<sup>1063</sup> the Woodland Cultural Centre Archives were critical to Hill's work, holding a place alongside Library and Archives Canada and the D.B. Weldon Library at the University of Western Ontario. The latter holds the letter books of both Joseph Brant and John Norton. Hill's study is firmly grounded in the wider Haudenosaunee written and oral tradition, and many key archival resources are uniquely accessible at the Woodland Cultural Centre at Grand River. This includes the still imperilled yet resilient Haudenosaunee linguistic tradition, evidenced by the glossary which precedes the bibliography, many quotations, and at least four different dictionaries.

Like Rick Monture, Hill emphasizes the importance of what is constant in Haudenosaunee culture and history, thus enabling the Haudenosaunee at Grand River to survive severe disruption. Among those constants, Hill focusses on the land and the four epics that delineate the relationship between Haudenosaunee and their territory.<sup>1064</sup> The first two chapters of the book present a brief recital of those epics and a careful description of Haudenosaunee women's responsibilities in that relationship. These elements also reflect how Hill applies Sioui's conceptualization of Amerindian autohistory. To carry out her program throughout the book, Hill sets out a clear plan consisting of four basic steps, which I summarize here as follows:

- Place the research within Haudenosaunee epistemology.
- Use Haudenosaunee languages.
- Compare Haudenosaunee life before contact to understand the effects of contact based on Haudenosaunee statements.
- Consider the evidence of Haudenosaunee places and boundaries, including archaeological data.<sup>1065</sup>

1063 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 291-292.

1064 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 3-6.

1065 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 7-9.

The third bullet is of special note because it is an important reminder of how often non-Indigenous scholarly ideas about the Haudenosaunee world before Europeans begin to affect it are still heavily inflected by preconceptions. Morgan's stages of human development may be formally discredited, but their impact remains entangled with the product of excessive trust placed in missionary documents. Like Mann, Hill carefully sets out the critical approach she takes to the various types of evidence for her project, a practice that, from the 1990s on, has become more overt in Haudenosaunee historiography. Where in earlier days, critique and disagreement could be indirect or expressed only when a specific person or document was cited, the challenge is now regularly presented up front, literally and figuratively.

The resulting narrative carries out a great work of sense-making. To this day, Haudenosaunee insist upon the continuing relevance of and necessity to respect treaties and agreements. Clashes at sites including Kahnawà:ke and Kanonhstaton are often depicted as senseless or lawless in the mainstream media. Lacking a proper contextualization in Haudenosaunee epistemology, law, and history, whether or not other people agree with Haudenosaunee positions on the matter of land tenure at Grand River or elsewhere, it can be difficult to discuss it constructively. Hill makes this vividly apparent in her discussion of the responsibilities Haudenosaunee hold to their land, law, and treaties, together with the Haudenosaunee understanding of the parallel responsibilities of the British Crown and settler states. In closing this section, I quote a part of Hill's consideration of what "reconciliation" could mean between the Grand River Haudenosaunee and Canada, which ties together some of the earliest Haudenosaunee history writing:

In terms of land and land tenure at Grand River, there is a long history of interference by the Canadian state with the Haudenosaunee people. Residential schools did play a part, but they were not the central vehicle of dispossession of the Grand River Haudenosaunee. Instead, it was unscrupulous land thefts, policy

impositions, and governance interference that created an unreconciled relationship between the Crown and Haudenosaunee.<sup>1066</sup>

From the early 1990s, Haudenosaunee authors whose works have been discussed here have centred their efforts on correcting, nuancing, and expanding the historical record to properly include Haudenosaunee perspectives and evidence. *The Clay We Are Made Of* stands out as a project that reflects a growing shift towards a renewed focus on applying Haudenosaunee history writing to the challenge of present and future nation-to-nation relationships.

### ***A Closer View in Indigenous Critical Theory Mode***

To switch into Indigenous critical theory mode, the place to start is with a quick refresh of the elements from the relevant portions of the case study road map. Indigenous historiography understands that histories are multiple, time is both cyclic and linear, other than human beings have agency just as humans do, and place is more important than a specific date. On the last point, sharp-eyed readers will notice that I have made another adjustment from the more general “when.” This is because, as we have seen in the mainstream style investigation above, it does indeed matter when events happened; the most frequently recounted four epic stories happened in a specific order. There are several confused versions of what happened to “the peace town” Gayennogah<sup>1067</sup> recorded by non-Indigenous transcribers who tried to force it into the story of the origins of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy. The parallels between the town and who ruled it are understandable, but the confusion about when the great refuge in Seneca country was overrun is a newcomer issue, not a Haudenosaunee one. At various points, Haudenosaunee scholars have felt pressed to identify specific dates for distinct events, such as when the process of founding the Confederacy began. In that case, this was part of resisting attempts to minimize recognition

1066 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 240.

1067 Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, 19-21.

of independent development and existence of their governance systems. It is also a case with specific features that mainstream scientists can recognize.

Then there are the Haudenosaunee epistemological elements, twoness, clear thinking, and the importance of speech. All three were discussed in some detail in the Haudenosaunee Epistemology section of Chapter Two.<sup>1068</sup> Rather than repeat that material, I will add a bit more here on the more complex of them, twoness. We already have a sense of the pervasiveness of pairings and twins in Haudenosaunee oral tradition and rhetorical practice from the first Closer View section. From reading the selected monographs, the preponderance of evidence suggests that Steckley's observation that the dualic in Wendat words refers to dangerous uncertainty<sup>1069</sup> does capture an aspect of what twoness means on a broader Iroquoian basis. The many ways the Haudenosaunee struggled, caught first between the French and English colonizers, then between the British and their Thirteen Colonies, provide numerous vivid examples. A more direct example is the double wampum rhetorical technique described and applied by Mann<sup>1070</sup> and recognizable in many of the earliest Haudenosaunee-composed written histories. Mann insists that the pervasiveness of twoness reflects not an inevitable *competition* but an inevitable *necessity* if balance is to be achieved or maintained. Sometimes keeping or reaching balance is less than comfortable or tidy, as the Creation Story or more recent Haudenosaunee internecine political struggles show.

In Chapter Two, I summarized the basics of Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee narrative genres.<sup>1071</sup> The two broad categories in Haudenosaunee Keepings or oral tradition are those involving spirit beings and those recounting primarily human experiences. Each of these has two

1068 Pages 119-123.

1069 Steckley, *Words of the Huron*, 15-22.

1070 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 7.

1071 Pages 123-125.

subcategories, as we now know we can expect. In the former are what Mann refers to as Epochal Keepings of cosmic import and spirit stories. In the latter, “truly tales” deal with events that actually happened, and “walking tales” are fictional. The selected monographs do not include any “walking tales,” with the exception of the problematic Canfield collection. Chalmers’ biography of Joseph Brant can not be parsed in these terms at all. The Creation and Confederacy Foundation stories are definite examples of Keepings with cosmic import. Among the truly tales are multiple episodes recognizable to many settlers from their mainstream histories. Still others are far less known and recounted with unfamiliar detail to mainstream readers, especially in the books by Mann, Hill, Rice, and Norton. Spirit stories centred on a person whose name is not given are rare. There is a prominent recurrent example, though, the story of the hunter who was rewarded for his restraint and respect for animals such that they worked together to resurrect him after he was killed in a raid.

Altogether, we can be reasonably assured that leaving Chalmers and Canfield aside, the remaining monographs eschew fictional material in Haudenosaunee terms. Among the things that an Indigenous critical analysis will elucidate here are some rules and practices that maintain the integrity of Haudenosaunee oral tradition and discourage fighting over interpretation. I should also reiterate that not being Haudenosaunee myself, I am striving to engage with the Haudenosaunee historiographic works in a way that is respectful and as accurate as possible by applying the information and methods explored through this and the previous chapters.

#### *Making Better Sense of Haudenosaunee Content*

Today few mainstream commenters would openly respond to Haudenosaunee writing and publishing their own histories in the way many did for nearly a century to David Cusick’s *Sketches of the Ancient History of the Six Nations*. Many of the recorded responses are certainly a

sad product of the racism rampant at the time in both the still British colonies and the new United States. This pamphlet still gets somewhat short shrift to this day for just about everything but Cusick's artwork because he was a founder of a watercolour painting style called "Early Iroquois Realist" by aficionados.<sup>1072</sup> But the original pamphlet contained no illustrations apart from those Cusick drew, and these can thoroughly puzzle a modern reader without any racist axes to grind. I begin this section with a closer look at his pamphlet, intending to treat what Cusick wrote with more respect. The general shape of Cusick's work reappears not just in Elias Johnson's book, but also in those of independent Haudenosaunee historians who did not extensively cite him. The arrangement of the text and its topics suggest that Cusick is following an underlying rhetorical structure learned and used widely by Haudenosaunee speakers.

David Cusick was the elder son of Nicholas Cusick, who was famous for his efforts on the side of the New England colonists and his conversion to Christianity. This contributed to the access both David and his younger brother Dennis had to education, which in David's case included training to become a doctor as well as a skilled autodidact artist.<sup>1073</sup> In his discussion of David Cusick's life, art, and his *Sketches*, William C. Sturtevant surmises that "The booklet must have sold well – presumably mostly to early tourists visiting Niagara Falls after the Erie Canal to Albany opened in 1825. A second edition, of seven thousand copies, appeared in 1828 only a year after the first."<sup>1074</sup> Besides the addition of illustrations in the form of an uncut sheet, Cusick made some small revisions throughout the pamphlet and added another two pages of text to bring the account up to 1492, then a further half page of linguistic material. Using that edition, I provide a high-level summary of the events Cusick recounted in his pamphlet. I have directly

1072 William C. Sturtevant, "David and Dennis Cusick: Early Iroquois Realist Artists," *American Indian Art Magazine* 31, no. 3 (2006): 44.

1073 Sturtevant, "David and Dennis Cusick," 45.

1074 Sturtevant, "David and Dennis Cusick," 45-46.

quoted the section titles, and followed Cusick's spellings of names and Haudenosaunee-language words, as well as repeating his characterization of Sky Woman's twin sons.

1. A Tale of the Foundation of the Great Island, (Now North America,) the Two Infants Born, and Creation of the Universe. (Pages 13-15)
  - Moves quickly from a woman falling from the sky to her twin sons competing as they shape the world.
  - Among the twins' creations are two sorts of humans, the EA-GWE-HOWE by the good minded twin, and others by the bad minded twin with the help of his brother.
  - The twins compete for control over the world, the good minded twin wins and his brother sinks into the earth.
2. A Real Account of the Early Settlers of North America, and Their Dissensions. (Pages 16-19)
  - Early Eagwehoe settlements along the Kanawage River now called St. Lawrence, but tormented by invading giants from the north until they band together to drive them away.
  - Two confederacies are founded, one to the north and one to the south of the St. Lawrence; they go to war, and the northerners win with superior weapons and strategy.
  - Disease and war among the northern nations continues until there are almost no humans left.
3. Origin of the Kingdom of the Five Nations, Which was Called a Long House. (Pages 20-35)
  - Some Eagwehoe were saved by Tarenywagon, arranged by him into the Five Nations in their traditional lands with their different languages, then defends them from monsters.
  - After another period of warfare, the Five Nations Confederacy is founded, and a famous chief at Onondaga is named "Atotarho, King of the Five Nations."
  - A recounting of encounters with powerful and dangerous creatures and warfare via the "reigns" of Atotarhos II-XIII. (Pages 20-35)

Cusick describes the Tuscarora separation from the Five Nations at the beginning of Part III and follows their history parallel to the Five Nations until 1492. As a member of a related but relatively recently enrolled member to make the Five Nations into Six, Cusick's history reflects something more than translation challenges in his description of the government and organization. But this was not what he was originally upbraided for by mainstream writers.

First, Cusick broke the apparent mainstream taboo against Indigenous people daring to produce a printed history of their own. The presence of spirit beings and a very different Creation story, including an unmistakable hint that the bad minded twin had made Europeans, certainly did not help. Then he had the temerity to refer to the Firekeeper of the Confederacy, Atotarho, in the manner of a European king. Cusick referred to specific, identifiable places, giving Haudenosaunee and newer English and French names and sensible descriptions of the geography the colonists were only beginning to get to know. Worst of all, he described technological and cultural changes that the earliest colonial pot hunters, transitioning into archaeologists, could see in the materials they were digging and gave correct basic descriptions of deep linguistic linkages between Iroquoian peoples. In just a few pages, he defied practically every stereotype of the static, savage “Indian” with no real culture, government, technology, or relationship with the land.

Combining information about Haudenosaunee narrative genres, double wampum presentations, and the use of humour provides more food for thought. The genre aspect has already been covered in the introduction to this section, so I will simply note here that Cusick does not include any “walking” stories. A double wampum presentation is supposed to give all sides a hearing, and Cusick decided not to retell history that has a European side to it, at least not in this pamphlet. Part of what he is doing, perhaps, is reintroducing the Tuscarora side since, for a time, they were part of a separate Confederacy of their own to the south, and at this point, they were reintegrating with their northern kin. In his careful catalogue of places, he reiterates that the Tuscarora also know and belong to those lands, even if they had been away and had come back under duress. Then again, Cusick had taken some steps to make his pamphlet comprehensible to European or local colonist tourists by including estimated dates and creating a European-style

division by “Atotarho reigns” in Part 3. He covers many grim events, but there are sparks of humour, such as the Flying Head fooled into thinking humans eat coals.<sup>1075</sup> Although Cusick felt the Haudenosaunee materials were as respectable as the Christian ones he knew, he appears to be the originator of the mistranslation of Sky Woman’s twin sons’ names as the Good Minded and Bad/Evil Minded among English scholars.<sup>1076</sup>

Such cultural and linguistic translation mishaps aside, the stories Cusick includes in his pamphlet give a good overview of what the earliest ethnologists could most easily elicit from Haudenosaunee informants. These are pivotal stories that explain the arrangement and laws of the Haudenosaunee world, including such day-to-day basics as how to be a decent guest and the local food-stuffs in different regions. I have been struck by how often the first stories an anthropologist records when they begin work with an Indigenous community focus on guest-host behaviour. The Creation story is more about twoness and complementarity with its Sky and Water worlds, Twins and so on. Going on to the story of the Foundation of the Confederacy reveals more arrangements into dyads and challenges arising from conflicts between parties, and the key means of ending or avoiding them by condoling the grieving and making peace. The Haudenosaunee world was absolutely full of war when the earliest written Haudenosaunee histories were published, so it makes sense that these stories would be all the more important to share with the newcomers. But even in times of comparative peace, Haudenosaunee historians still begin with these stories, if only by brief summary as in Rick Monture’s *We Share Our Matters* or Jamieson and Hamilton’s biography of Oronhyatekha. It is a consistent

1075 David Cusick, *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations* (1827), 21.

1076 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 72-73. Like Mann, I found no earlier Haudenosaunee person writing in English other than David Cusick referring to the Twins in this way.

Haudenosaunee rhetorical practice in all monographs to start by setting out a Haudenosaunee framework for the rest of what will come.

This clarifies Brian Rice's reference to his retelling of traditional Haudenosaunee history as an interpretation, as opposed to a version or "the" history. The history of a whole people cannot be individually owned, and he is conscious of how his own circumstances lead him to emphasize some aspects that other Haudenosaunee would not. Accordingly, Mann brings forward the aspects relevant to Haudenosaunee women's responsibilities, and Hill brings forward these and additional elements specific to land tenure. Elias Johnson forefronts the Tuscarora, and Arthur C. Parker writes mostly Seneca-centred histories. Haudenosaunee leaders and ceremonialists willingly work with others to record their own interpretations for their own reasons. The Grand River Confederacy Council sought to increase its ability to resist Canadian federal interference by writing down its interpretation of early Haudenosaunee history, and Chief John Arthur Gibson made a record of the Great Law of Peace that could preserve an Onondaga-language recital of Haudenosaunee history through terrible linguistic and cultural disruption.

For history and geography not to dissolve into incoherence, there must be rules, and Mann speaks most clearly about this. She explains in the introduction to *Land of the Three Miamis*:

Natives traditionally describe places, and how to get there, in terms of three coinciding landmarks. Natives traveled far and wide before the Europeans ever stumbled across the Americas.... Oral directions prepared travelers to recognize when they had arrived in the right place. It is possible that two similar landmarks exist in one geographical location, but three identical features in one place are unlikely. Therefore, tradition always identifies three landmarks in one spot.<sup>1077</sup>

Native tradition may contain three, four, five, or fifty distinct versions, and all are viewed as correct. This is because Natives are communal people, who think that no story is complete until every last viewpoint on it has been aired. As a result, speaking the Keepings of any Epoch of Time can take a week, or longer. (...)

1077 Mann, *Land of the Three Miamis*, 11.

The only rule in the Keepings is that the key elements must never change – which requires the Speaker to know what the key elements are. For instance, depending on the Keeper, the Peacemaker, Ayonwatha, or The Jigonsaseh may be given the most credit for spreading the Word of Peace in the Second Epoch of Time, but it does not matter which historical figure gets the credit, just so long as the Word of Peace, itself, is there and intact.<sup>1078</sup>

This consistency often survives the most difficult conditions so long as the participants in making the written version are all working in good faith. Hence Lewis Henry Morgan did produce a useful early work on Haudenosaunee culture as he understood it from his collaboration with Ely S. Parker and his few weeks of fieldwork. The problems with Canfield's *The Legends of the Iroquois: Told By "The Cornplanter"* are not just revealed by the inconsistencies in his introductory chapters and notes, but also by garbled names, stories out of order, missing elements, and the addition of stories that are not Haudenosaunee in the first place. For anyone who, like myself, has read Sagoyawetha's famous 1805 speech in which he declared that Haudenosaunee never argued about religion and wondered how that could be achieved, Mann's description of how many interpretations of critical histories are considered acceptable so long as the key elements are present explains how. Then we can also better appreciate how newer traditions like the Gaiwi:io are understood not as overriding previous stories, but as adding to them by revealing more detail and stressing what is most needed at a given time and place.

By this somewhat circuitous route, we come back to the arguments made by the Indigenous scholars whose research and writing inform the form and application of Indigenous critical theory in this project. Haudenosaunee narratives provide interpretive frameworks for the listener or reader to use in making sense of and learning from the stories they hear. In the Haudenosaunee historiographic corpus for this project, the stories evoked most often in this role are five:

1078 Mann, *Land of the Three Miamis*, 12.

Creation, Foundation of the Confederacy, Clan Establishment, Gift of the Four Ceremonies, and the Gaiwi:io. They are frameworks meant to support contextualization and responsiveness to circumstances. Following Craig Womack's formulation, these specific narratives provide the necessary interpretive principles for reading the Haudenosaunee histories they introduce. The challenge is to catch when confusion in ideas has developed due to accidental resemblances such as the Manichean duality embedded in some formulations of Christian doctrine. Haudenosaunee have been protesting the imposition of European interpretations of their paired concepts as always about conflict such that one is violently subordinated and always seeking to rebel while the other is inherently violent and determined to dominate.

One final point to cover in this section is how Haudenosaunee histories, even in their most apparently westernized forms, defy efforts to give them the shape children can still learn by repetition from popular entertainment. I am just old enough to have been instructed in an extremely simplified version of Aristotle's principles of good drama from his *Poetics* in high school, in which the ideal play occurs in one place, in one day. The story starts with a run-up to introduce the antagonist, the protagonist, and what their conflict is about. Then things move on to a climax that ends the conflict and further on to the denouement that neatly ties up the remaining threads of the story. This shape is even visible in the dreaded five-paragraph essay that haunts the vast majority of students learning English rhetoric until they leave school. There is the introduction of the conflict, closing with the three-part thesis statement describing how the conflict will be resolved, then the evidence for each part of the thesis statement to do the resolving, and of course, the conclusion. In contrast, the Haudenosaunee monographs insist on leaving what may seem like "loose threads," a means to continue adding to the discussion or to encourage the reader to continue thinking about the points made in each text. Any of the

Haudenosaunee writers and speakers could have recast their narratives to have the three-part formula, which would have been especially familiar to nineteenth century Haudenosaunee like Cusick and Johnson, for example. Yet none of them do, and even the most apparently Europeanized writers like Parker or Norton, who were also writing for non-Haudenosaunee audiences, discuss how Haudenosaunee communities withstood episodes of adversity and/or intense change.

### *Countering Data Euro-(de)formation*

A major concern of all the Haudenosaunee knowledge keepers and scholars who contributed to the monographs and other works discussed in this chapter is to counter incomplete ideas and imagery about them. Some have done so by insisting on speaking back directly to specific books or other publications of concern. The best examples of this are Elias Johnson's retort to Lewis Henry Morgan and Chief Jacob Thomas' revision of Seth Newhouse's transcription of the Great Law of Peace. Others have opted to write or participate in producing counter-narratives, including Clinton Rickard about events throughout his life and Donna K. Goodleaf about the "Oka crisis."<sup>1079</sup> Arthur C. Parker repeatedly wrote about Haudenosaunee culture as having depth into the past and having changed over time both before and since the arrival of Europeans. While Indigenous peoples have always challenged biased sources, it took until the late twentieth century before they were able to both develop and publish Indigenous-specific critical reading strategies to work with these materials. Working independently, Barbara Alice Mann and Wendat ethnohistorian Georges E. Sioui developed and documented two widely cited approaches. Rice cites Sioui, while Hill cites them both, explicitly referring to Sioui's concept and methodology of

1079 There are many other narratives complementing Goodleaf's work. For just two examples, see: Ronald Cross and H el ene S evigny, *Lasagna: The Man Behind the Mask* (Vancouver: Talon Books Limited, 1994). Leanne Simpson and Kiera L. Ladner, eds. *This is an Honor Song: Twenty Years Since the Blockades* (Winnipeg: Arbeiter Ring Publishing, 2010).

Amerindian autohistory, first published in 1989 in French.<sup>1080</sup> Mann began by publishing about the impacts of “Euro-Forming the Data” in 1998<sup>1081</sup> and then on how to counter these impacts in 2000.<sup>1082</sup> Both have contributed to the major phase change in Haudenosaunee historiography over the turn of the twenty-first century.

Sioui is concerned with recovering a constructive approach to Indigenous historiography, briefly referring to Amerindian autohistory as “the study of correspondences between Amerindian and non-Amerindian sources.”<sup>1083</sup> Having read Mann’s 2000 book sometime prior to Sioui’s, I took note immediately that “correspondence” has an excellent double meaning we can take advantage of to appreciate this method. While the usual connotations invoked here would be similarities between the two types of source, the other meaning is also applicable, correspondence as communication between those sources.<sup>1084</sup> According to Sioui, Amerindian autohistory has “The goal... to assist history in its duty to repair the damage it has traditionally caused to the integrity of Amerindian cultures” and its methodology “should be based on a delimitation and recognition of its ideological territory and its particular philosophy.”<sup>1085</sup> It has two major premises:

First, in spite of European appropriation of Native territory, Amerindian cultural values have influenced the formation of the Euroamerican’s character more than the latter’s values have modified the Amerindian’s cultural code, since it was not the Amerindians who left their natural surroundings. Second, history is not yet aware that studying the persistence of essential Amerindian values, through testimony by the Amerindians themselves, is more important to the *social* nature

1080 Georges E. Sioui, *Pour une autohistoire amérindienne: essai sur les fondements d’une morale sociale* (Québec: Presses de l’Université Laval, 1989).

1081 Mann, “Euro-Forming the Data,” 160; 164-165.

1082 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 2-10.

1083 Georges E. Sioui, *For an Amerindian Autohistory: An Essay on the Foundations of a Social Ethic* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1992), xx.

1084 Angus Stevenson and Christine A. Lindberg, eds., *The New Oxford American Dictionary*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), “correspondence, n.”

1085 Sioui, *For an Amerindian Autohistory*, 37.

of historical science than are the frequent analyses of cultural transformations, which are technically interesting but too often of negligible social impact.<sup>1086</sup>

He then carries out an Amerindian autohistory-informed re-analysis of three episodes of Wendat history. As a descendant of Wendat referred to as “dispersed” to reoccupy their northern settlement at Lorette in what is currently called Québec, Sioui’s perspective on the Haudenosaunee role in Wendat history breaks sharply with those prevalent among mainstream scholars at the time. But he does far more than this. He frames the entire monograph as an enactment of condolence, consistent with the ceremony described in the Haudenosaunee Great Law of Peace and clearly of Pan-Iroquoian usage. Sioui makes a strong statement in this because, in doing so, he acts in the role of condoler to those who may read the book. Following the structure of the ceremony, the next step would be for readers to respond with their own monographs applying the ethics and methodology of Amerindian autohistory. This is indeed what we can see through the books by Rice and Hill.

When Mann wrote about her concept of Euro-forming the data and how to counter it in 1998, she was taking part in a resurgence in the acrimonious debate about the role of the Haudenosaunee in the founding of what became the United States federal government.<sup>1087</sup> She had also recently finished writing and defending a dissertation in which she had to tangle with the thicket of misinterpretation in and around Fenimore Cooper’s *Leatherstocking Tales*. Fenimore Cooper himself had taken part in the bitter disputes of his time about slavery and the colonial Indigenous land seizure policies.<sup>1088</sup> Accordingly, her framing is one of identifying a

1086 Sioui, *For an Amerindian Autohistory*, 21-22.

1087 Bruce E. Johansen, “Introduction,” in *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom*, eds. Bruce E. Johansen *et al.* (San Jose: Clearlight Publishers, 1998), 8-18.

1088 Mann, “Forbidden Ground,” iii-iv.

core issue fuelling the ongoing conflict between scholars on these subjects. She defines Euro-forming the data as

the distortion built into the data by scholars who, however unconsciously, impose their own Western norms and values on their study of “other” cultures.... forcing it into conformity with Western forms of reference, whether or not it fits. A full consideration of “influence” therefore requires an examination of the other side of influence – Euro-formation. Built in assumptions of Euro-forming include:

1. A predisposition to monotheism, yielding
2. A belief that “Truth” is unitary, leading to
3. A fixation on “Purity” of descent,
4. A Contempt for Native culture.<sup>1089</sup>

The habit of ignoring Indigenous women follows from assumption three since, according to Christianized Europeans, women are not pure. Concerning such matters, Mann contends that if primary sources are not evaluated, and their impact countered, “built-in notions of European bio-cultural supremacy will go on jerking the strings from behind the scenes.”<sup>1090</sup>

Mann closes with an overview of how to do the countering via learning about the historical context of the primary sources and the relevant Indigenous cultures these materials were attempting to represent. Here her methodology overlaps with Sioui’s, as we should expect. In both her dissertation and her contributions to the reader on the “Haudenosaunee influence controversy” over whether the structure of the Haudenosaunee government shaped that of the United States, *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom*, she challenges colonists with European heritage to follow their own scholarly rules. As an example, she notes that if Benjamin Franklin’s comments are accepted as valid on other topics, there is no reason to make a unique exception for what he says about Haudenosaunee influence on the design of the early United States federal government. She takes this theme up again in *Iroquoian Women*, wryly noting, “Yes, the same brilliant Europeans who can reconstruct the proto-language of

1089 Mann, “Euro-Forming the Data,” 160.

1090 Mann, “Euro-Forming the Data,” 164.

tongues that have been dead for millennia would have me believe that they cannot figure out where to start to reinstate the female official, the *gantowisas*, into the historical record of a living people who know her well.”<sup>1091</sup> But hewing to the Western rules that reflect a practice of honest and logical reading is not enough to undo Euro-formation, nor is adding a better understanding of historical context and Haudenosaunee culture, keeping to this example. There is still one more method Mann recommends:

I believe that the clearest indication of the authentic Iroquoian cultural trajectory can be found in the baffled logs of the first explorers and missionaries, *before* Europeans presumed to know all, see all, and worse, explain all about a people as foreign to them as night visitors from the Pleiades.<sup>1092</sup>

Lacking a ready mapping between what they saw for the first time and what they already knew, explorers and missionaries could not impose much interpretation or spin. It is even sometimes possible to find such documentation much later than this type of source generated by trained European interlopers. Mann does not discuss this since it is not relevant to her 2000 project as such. Other scholars have taken advantage of the original versions of travel memoirs by later explorers and other early tourists with less literary training, who, therefore, also lacked a framework to press their observations into.<sup>1093</sup>

There is a great deal to think about here, including a perspective not always given much consideration when disagreement over Indigenous history erupts due to contemporary developments. In Canada, for example, one of the outcomes resulting from the Truth and Reconciliation Commission has been challenges to celebratory commemorations of Canadian officials who oversaw and imposed the residential school system. One knee-jerk response to the

1091 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 6.

1092 Mann, “Euro-Forming the Data,” 5.

1093 For an examination of how editing of such memoirs for publication can impose frameworks the original traveller did not actually use, see I.S. MacLaren, “Exploration/Travel Literature and the Evolution of the Author,” *International Journal of Canadian Studies* 5 (1992), 56-63.

removal of celebratory commemorations is a claim that this is somehow “erasing” history when that is hardly the case. These officials can be remembered without publicly celebrating them. Treating Indigenous sources and interpretations with respect is sometimes also decried as somehow “erasing” history. Yet from Elias Johnson on, Haudenosaunee historians have not ignored European or European-style records, even though they could. Whereas non-Indigenous scholars sought to decry Indigenous modes of history encoding, such as wampum or oral tradition, as meaningless or inauthentic historical sources, this is not what Indigenous scholars have done to mainstream sources. To engage in the debate, rather than repeat flawed assumptions, Haudenosaunee writers speak back to the mainstream scholars and publishers. These techniques were available long before the turn of the twenty-first century, but access to education, publishing, and the opportunity to produce and share a program for their use had not previously come together.

It is possible to lay aside the idea that the earlier Haudenosaunee historical monographs must be mostly defensive in nature. Yes, Elias Johnson speaks back to Lewis Henry Morgan’s 1851 depiction of Haudenosaunee culture and history. However, in this important work, he also undoes the Euro-formation of the data, recounting Tuscarora oral tradition to explain how they came to rejoin their cousins in the north, incorporating transcriptions of many treaties and related documents. Here again, is an implied insistence that Europeans and their descendants play by what they say is their own rules. For example, Johnson reproduces treaties as interpreted and written down by settlers. Conversely, he shows what the Tuscaroras recount from oral tradition. Even the long controversy over Arthur C. Parker and Seth Newhouse’s interpretations of the account of the founding and laws of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy can be better appreciated by understanding them as taking part in a conversation with other historians. Their work helped

inspire the effort to transcribe interpretations more acceptable to Haudenosaunee and not distorted by Euro-forming lenses. The European-style encoding methods and European and Euro-descended participants could and still did participate. Bringing them in via constructive means allows their integration to be consistent with the Haudenosaunee practice of giving all parties and views a hearing.

Arthur C. Parker's biography of Ely S. Parker comes to mind again. He refers to an "Iroquois Empire," a European concept forced onto Haudenosaunee history and governance that even mainstream historians working on Haudenosaunee history have set aside. Nevertheless, it is possible he was engaging in a more specific and individualized task, countering current, if not incipient, "Euro-forming" of Ely S. Parker's life and career. Parker states that he collected material for the biography for twenty years. Therefore he must have gathered much of it after he was formally adopted into the Seneca Bear clan in 1903, properly naturalizing him as a Haudenosaunee citizen.<sup>1094</sup> According to further notes in the book's appendix, it was not until 1912 that he realized it was possible to write a biography of his great-uncle. Then he began searching for materials such as letters and other papers in earnest, including visits to Cattaraugus and Tonawanda, where he also interviewed relatives.<sup>1095</sup> Early in the book he reveals his concern lest his great uncle's memory be lost, emphasizing how unique it was at that time to be able to explore an Indigenous leader's life in such detail as Parker will give in this biography.<sup>1096</sup> Then he makes a specific point that may well have raised eyebrows with at least some members of his non-Indigenous audience:

1094 William N. Fenton, "Introduction," in *Parker on the Iroquois*, by Arthur C. Parker (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1968), 8.

Mann, "Euro-Forming the Data," 178.

1095 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 231.

1096 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 8.

Modesty is an attribute of true greatness, and General Parker in spite of his dislike of being “talked about” and his disavowal of having done exceptional things, is eminently deserving of the laurels of greatness. He was great because he was a man who labored unselfishly for his brother man. In this he was not unlike the great culture heroes of the famous Iroquois league, Ji-gon-sa-seh, De-ka-na-wi-da, and Hiawatha, who in the misty centuries before, had established the Iroquois Empire State and created a government that in its day ruled half of North America. Each of these great personages about whom have clustered many invented tales, was a living person and not a myth. Each was a great constructive force and each was modest and unassuming.<sup>1097</sup>

Primed by more recent Haudenosaunee historians and aware of the intermittent controversies over how much fact is contained in Haudenosaunee oral tradition, Parker’s firm identification of the trio of Peacemakers as living persons stands out. We can also see why he opted to refer to an Iroquois empire, as he cleverly invokes their ongoing relationship with the “Empire State.”

From this point, Parker shifts firmly into a tell-tale double strand narrative pattern. One strand is made up of Haudenosaunee history and culture and the specific place of the New York Seneca and the Parker family in Haudenosaunee history. The other is a critical comparison and contrast to “white” culture and history. Despite this technique, or because of it or because of his own ambivalence, Parker still repeats a range of what are today unacceptable racist terms and tropes. This is not unusual for Indigenous authors writing in this time period, who often had to walk a fine narrative line to get their works into print with mainstream publishers, even if those publishers were hungry for writing by and about “Indians.” Nor was this new, as the speeches and public letters by his great uncle that he transcribes into the text show in later chapters.<sup>1098</sup> In any case, Parker has a great deal of history and information to summarize, so much so that Ely Samuel Parker’s birth is not recounted until late in Chapter 4,<sup>1099</sup> when the Haudenosaunee strand begins to focus more on the New York Seneca and gradually on him. Contrary to what an outside

1097 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 3.

1098 For example, see *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 207-211 (speech); 212-213; and 218-220 (letters).

1099 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 47.

reader might expect from the later emphasis on his great uncle's first meeting with Lewis Henry Morgan, Arthur C. Parker reports a different event as particularly formative for him. That event is not an episode from the machinations of the Ogden Land Company,<sup>1100</sup> but one from his time at Grand River, training in traditional Haudenosaunee culture and learning the Haudenosaunee languages. During this Grand River period, Ely suffered an unpleasant encounter with Canadian militia men who took advantage of his poor language skills to torment him, increasing his determination to build his linguistic skills and education.<sup>1101</sup> More of the central chapters of the book focus on his life, especially his service in the United States Civil War and his time as Commissioner of Indian Affairs.<sup>1102</sup> Then the narrative expands out again to discuss the Parker family and trace the lines to Arthur C. Parker himself.

There are striking parallels in Arthur C. Parker's inclusions between this biography to the types selected by Elias Johnson for his Six Nations history. Both are concerned lest Haudenosaunee are forgotten. In Parker's case, he is concerned about the commemoration of his prominent Seneca family and his great uncle in particular. He repeatedly refers to the loss of documents, which others saw no reason to preserve, even as he provides detail based on an ongoing family oral tradition.<sup>1103</sup> Accordingly, much of the Appendix is devoted to reproductions of document clippings and photographs. Parker is also quite concerned about re-presenting Handsome Lake's story, visions, and settler-sourced credentials.<sup>1104</sup> Many other inclusions are in the main text, disrupting the two-stranded presentation at times.

1100 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 69-70.

1101 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 72-73.

1102 These are Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, Chapters X-XIV (105-161).

1103 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 5-8; 189; 231-232.

1104 For example, Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 236-238; 262; 286-296; and 304-305 regarding Ely S. Parker; 244-262 on Handsome Lake. The balance of the earlier pages pertains to Ely S. Parker's brother Nicholas, and other materials related to Ely's tenure as Commissioner of Indian Affairs.

If we focus more closely on the information on Ely S. Parker himself with the example of his twenty years younger counterpart Oronhyatekha in mind, we learn still more. As we would reasonably expect for a Haudenosaunee man who managed to attain a post-secondary education for the period, and very similar to Oronhyatekha, he attended missionary schools, the Yates Academy and Cayuga Academy, for secondary school and college preparation. Both were regular boarding schools, attended by any male student who could pay the tuition.<sup>1105</sup> But he did not attend these before his traditional Haudenosaunee education, for which Parker went to Grand River, where, as described above, he learned the Haudenosaunee governance system and languages as well as the ill manners of local English militia men.<sup>1106</sup> Then he spent three years articling to become a lawyer, only to discover he could not be called to the bar.<sup>1107</sup> Angling around the obstacle to a professional career so that could be useful to his people, he became a civil engineer, adding to his established training and practice as an interpreter and farmer. He became a mason, and after initially being rejected when he tried to volunteer to serve in the United States Civil War, Parker was finally called up to serve as a field engineer.<sup>1108</sup>

Unfortunately this was a bad move, ending his engineering career as he lost practical industry contacts while working on U.S. Grant's presidential campaign and serving as Commissioner of Indian Affairs.<sup>1109</sup> His great-nephew underscores this position, declaring, "In achieving the office of Commissioner of Indian Affairs, General Parker had reached the highest goal which his dreams of usefulness could bring to his mind. The great desire of his life – to serve his race – had reached its fulfillment."<sup>1110</sup> Parker had to cope with a congressional investigation after a series of

1105 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 58-59; 74-75.

1106 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 69-73.

1107 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 77-79.

1108 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 79; 93-94; 96-98.

1109 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 142-144; 146-149; 150-154; 157-160.

1110 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 154.

specious accusations of embezzlement and mismanagement, which likely did not help his future career prospects as he confronted continued racism.<sup>1111</sup> Then Parker struggled in business, where less scrupulous colleagues took advantage of him, and his losses finally forced him into his final job in the Manhattan police department.<sup>1112</sup> After his death, he was first buried in Manhattan, then reinterred in Haudenosaunee territory.<sup>1113</sup>

Jamieson and Hamilton noted that historians took until the 1980s “to see Dr. Oronhyatekha as an accomplished man who used, merged, and valued aspects from his native background *and* the surrounding non-native society to build a world that fit him best.”<sup>1114</sup> Although we might suspect a neoliberal tint to this type of 1980s-style reading with its emphasis on the individual, Jamieson and Hamilton foreground Rick Monture’s work on the matter. Monture explains how Haudenosaunee have learned and place value on bringing gifts and teachings from the past into their present and future from the examples of Sky Woman and their ancestors.<sup>1115</sup> Jamieson and Hamilton add further nuance that counters both a neoliberal misreading of Oronhyatekha’s life and reveals his intense commitment to his community and nation:

In his early life, Oronhyatekha repeatedly expressed his desire to be successful and a person of influence in order that he could help his people. Often when he faced a setback in his education, he became despondent and feared he would never be of any use to his community. Ultimately qualifying as a doctor and becoming head of the International Order of Foresters, he went to great lengths to meet these obligations.... His early career choices of missionary and physician were partly predicated on his aim to help his people.<sup>1116</sup>

1111 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 155-157.

1112 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 156-160.

1113 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 221-227.

1114 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 28.

1115 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 28.

1116 Jamieson and Hamilton, *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 31.

There are many parallels to what we learn of Ely S. Parker's life and career from his biography, although his great-nephew insists that he never lost heart and merely routed around obstacles, and that he never struggled significantly in school.<sup>1117</sup>

Although there is not nearly as much detail about Ely S. Parker in this early biography as in Oronhyatekha's, from both we develop an understanding of their role in their Haudenosaunee communities. By the accident of there being less documentary material for Arthur C. Parker to rely on, he provides a better sense of the dynamics of his great uncle's family and clan, including the re-established and developing relationships between the Grand River and New York Seneca communities. Nevertheless, as Mary Jane Logan McCallum comments in her review of *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, "The volume speaks to the value of Indigenous biography and life history as a method in Indigenous history, while avoiding some of the narrowness of the 'great man' theory of history."<sup>1118</sup> This is a remarkable achievement in spite of the much less congenial times Arthur C. Parker was writing in and his apparent leaning towards positioning his great uncle as a "great man" due to his being a United States federal official as well as a Condoled Chief. *The Life of General Ely S. Parker* is certainly a progenitor of books like Philip Deloria's *Indians in Unexpected Places*,<sup>1119</sup> also referenced by McCallum, and as she observes about *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, studies "on Indigenous urban history, mobility, and space."<sup>1120</sup> These things are present in Parker's biography even though in his quoted speeches and letters, Ely S. Parker speaks of Indigenous people as nearly or already extinct or "civilized," what today we would call assimilated. Having learned well the traditional Indigenous teaching not to challenge an elder in

1117 Parker, *The Life of General Ely S. Parker*, 160-161; 74-78.

1118 Mary Jane Logan McCallum, review of *Dr. Oronhyatekha: Security, Justice, and Equality*, by Keith Jamieson and Michelle A. Hamilton, *Canadian Historical Review* 99, no. 2 (June 2018), 323.

1119 Philip J. Deloria, *Indians in Unexpected Places* (Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 2004).

1120 McCallum, review of *Dr. Oronhyatekha*, 323.

a disrespectful way, Arthur C. Parker placed his great uncle in his clan, family, and wider Haudenosaunee context. There they are, persisting as Haudenosaunee in ever-expanding networks of descendants, as does the evidence that Ely S. Parker was a good and generous uncle who successfully upheld his duties in both cultural contexts.

There have been more recent biographies of Ely S. Parker, such as William H. Armstrong's *Warrior in Two Camps* or the young reader-oriented *One Real American* by Joseph Bruchac.<sup>1121</sup> Their titles and subtitles reflect Arthur C. Parker's influence on themes and coverage. So far, though, Ely S. Parker has not found his twenty-first-century Haudenosaunee biographer as Oronhyatekha has.

### *Recontextualizing Complex Legacies*

A shared project of Indigenous peoples in northern North America is recontextualizing the legacies of ancestors whose posthumous reputations among settlers may vary considerably from how they are remembered in their own nations and communities. Occasionally settler scholars have contributed to this work in striking ways. For example, Diane Rothenberg has written a thoughtful and both contextually and historically informed reassessment of the reputed “insanity of Cornplanter.”<sup>1122</sup> Bruce G. Trigger and John L. Steckley have won considerable respect from Wendat and Haudenosaunee communities for their ethnohistorical and linguistic research and support for Haudenosaunee and Wendat scholars. Still, the leaders and main actors in this

1121 William H. Armstrong, *Warrior in Two Camps: Ely S. Parker, Union General and Seneca Chief* (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1978).

Joseph Bruchac, *One Real American: The Life of Ely S. Parker, Seneca Sachem and Civil War General* (New York: Abrams Books for Young Readers, 2020).

1122 Diane Rothenberg, “On the Insanity of Cornplanter (Part One),” Jacket2, Commentary on Modern and Contemporary Poetry, <https://jacket2.org/commentary/diane-rothenberg-insanity-cornplanter-part-one> (accessed September 1, 2021).

Diane Rothenberg, “On the Insanity of Cornplanter (Part Two) [redux],” Jacket2, Commentary on Modern and Contemporary Poetry, <https://jacket2.org/commentary/diane-rothenberg-insanity-cornplanter-part-two-redux> (accessed September 1, 2021).

recontextualization work are Indigenous scholars, and all the Haudenosaunee scholars whose writing has been discussed in this chapter have engaged in it. Much of their most substantial and successful work had to wait until the late twentieth century when the confluence of access to education and cultural and political resurgence won opportunities for new studies and publications. In this final section of the Indigenous critical theory section, I focus on the monographs by Susan M. Hill, Barbara Alice Mann, Rick Monture, and Brian Rice. All four have taken part in more than one significant recontextualization project.

The role of Haudenosaunee individuals in the development of anthropology as a discipline has been both famous and fraught, including the much-storied Ely S. and Arthur C. Parker, and J.N.B. Hewitt. The latter two were trained and worked as anthropologists, Arthur C. Parker, in all four fields as defined in a Boasian mode. Hewitt focused primarily on linguistic work and cultural anthropology of Haudenosaunee and a few other Northeastern First Nations. Hewitt's linguistic bent led him to build one of the premiere bodies of collected transcriptions of Haudenosaunee traditional history in the original languages. This is the case even though his superiors at the Bureau of Ethnology of the Smithsonian Institution criticized him for not publishing enough by their standards.<sup>1123</sup> It is true that to this day, much of what he collected has not gone further than the Smithsonian Archives and so remains grey literature. Both his archival and published materials are used by Haudenosaunee scholars because of his intensive study of the Creation story, including all of the scholars referenced in this section. Seeking to nuance and caution those of us who may be inclined to simply take his interpretations as authorities because his mother was Tuscarora and he grew up in a Tuscarora family on their reservation in New York State,<sup>1124</sup> Susan Hill comments:

1123 Tooker and Graymont, "5. J.N.B. Hewitt," 85-87.

1124 Tooker and Graymont, "5. J.N.B. Hewitt," 73-74.

Hewitt is often represented as a Tuscarora who happened to be an anthropologist. I would argue, however, that through his writings it is clear that he was an anthropologist who happened to be of Haudenosaunee descent... While he did have a certain respect for the Haudenosaunee, he clearly did not see them as equals of American society – where he placed himself. Despite his own identification as an American (“Civilized”), his Tuscarora descent is often heralded as a mark of “insider authenticity,” glossing over the fact that his representations of culture are external to Haudenosaunee society and contain many of the pitfalls found in the work of non-Native anthropologists.<sup>1125</sup>

Hewitt also gathered and reported material that has helped scholars like Mann and Hill to reconstruct Haudenosaunee women’s traditions, including the role of the Jigonsaseh in the founding of the Great Peace and “tribe sisterhoods.”<sup>1126</sup> Still, Mann warns the careful reader in her footnotes that “[Hewitt] had a habit of speaking as though he, alone, had a grip on the truth, but, in fact, was wont to take a minor tradition – sometimes so minor that he was the only one ever to have encountered it – and exaggerate it into the dominant tradition.”<sup>1127</sup> Having already explained that sometimes ethnographic informants opted to thoroughly pull anthropologists’ legs rather than give a straight answer, Mann has primed the reader both to be careful and appreciate the challenges Hewitt shared with his colleagues.

Rick Monture’s literary history of the Grand River Haudenosaunee is very much a wholesale recontextualization of his subjects. He begins with the ever-present Joseph Brant, whom he argues did have a firm understanding of the Haudenosaunee as having a nation-to-nation relationship with Britain, pushing back against perceptions of him as too biddable to British officials.<sup>1128</sup> He goes on to provide the only re-evaluation of E. Pauline Johnson’s legacy I have found by a Haudenosaunee scholar published within the past forty years. This does not mean that she does not figure in other monographs considered in this study. Enos T.

1125 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 18.

1126 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 90; 97; 104; 125-126; 161-162.

1127 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 435.

1128 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 30.

Montour in *Feathered U.E.L.'s* includes a chapter recounting a fictional pilgrimage of thirty teachers from Grand River by train to Vancouver in order to pay their respects at Johnson's grave in Stanley Park. This gives him an opportunity to provide a capsule biography of Johnson and emphasize her skill with British poetic forms and her visits to England.<sup>1129</sup> Today, it is well known that Johnson took on her grandfather's name Tekahionwake "Double Wampum," when she began to perform her poetry for a living. In her excellent and sensitive 2002 biography of Johnson, Charlotte Gray states that she had "no legal claim" to the name.<sup>1130</sup> It is not quite clear what Gray means unless she is referring indirectly to the fact that neither Johnson, her sisters, nor her mother Emily Howells, were ever adopted and thereby integrated into the Haudenosaunee matrilineal clan system. As Monture points out, Johnson "has not been studied as a member of the Grand River community,"<sup>1131</sup> and her biographies tend to emphasize her English heritage and career away from Grand River. Tantalizing hints come from Barbara Alice Mann, who explains the nature of a double wampum presentation in such detail in her 2000 monograph. In the same book, she unpacks the difficulties Johnson faced due to her mother's unnaturalized status, using her own understanding of Haudenosaunee politics and how clans are integrated into them *and* Johnson's writing.<sup>1132</sup>

Monture is able to make a start on such a recontextualizing of Johnson into the Grand River community, going further than the widely held understanding that she "was a product of a particular Mixed-race family" and a person with "[m]ultiple and simultaneous identities."<sup>1133</sup> He

1129 Montour, *The Feathered U.E.L.'s*, 135-138.

1130 Charlotte Gray, *Flint and Feather: The Life and Times of E. Pauline Johnson, Tekahionwake* (Toronto: HarperCollins Publishers Ltd., 2002), 187.

1131 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 64-65.

1132 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 250-251; 448.

1133 Veronica Strong-Boag and Carole Gerson, *Paddling Her Own Canoe: The Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000), 10; 12.

notes that while Johnson was isolated, she was not separated from the community, but from its politics. As Mann explains, however, through her discussion of the dangerous and criminal behaviour of settler groups who engaged in land theft and illegal logging, Johnson was all too aware of international politics as reflected in economic warfare. In one episode of such warfare, thugs hired by logging companies beat and shot Johnson's father nearly to death.<sup>1134</sup> While it is no surprise then that she had complex ideas about Iroquois nationalism, as Monture observed, it may be surprising that Johnson's "conflicted opinions were both useful and damaging to Indigenous peoples in Canada."<sup>1135</sup> Monture shows in his profile of her that Johnson was well aware of the disputed nature of her ideas and work, although he does not discuss her chosen name or use of it.<sup>1136</sup> What he does say to recontextualize her work is striking:

As she confronted the social contradictions evident to her in the 'Dominion of Canada' during her life, Johnson constantly faced the arduous task of negotiating her hybrid identity within her Six Nations community, the literary world, and on the international stage.... Therefore, while her efforts were both sincere and valourous, Johnson's writing seems to strain at the edges of hypocrisy at times, as if she tried to do too much in an era when the methods, concepts, and language of resistance, gender, and decolonization that exist today were unavailable to her.<sup>1137</sup>

Johnson strove to apply the double wampum speech convention under conditions where she had few to no tools to win a true hearing from the majority of her audiences.

So far I have focussed on examples of recontextualized people, but there are also important examples of Haudenosaunee traditions given this nuanced treatment in the monographs. The complexity of reception and understanding of these traditions is not always appreciated in mainstream discussions. The first recent and heavily studied of the traditions, because it derives from the visions of a known person related to Cornplanter and Governor Blacksnake, is the

1134 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 54-55.

1135 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 64-65; 68.

1136 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 105.

1137 Monture, *We Share Our Matters*, 104.

Gaiwi:io of Sganyadai:yoh (Handsome Lake). I have already referred to Mann's critical views of this tradition in *Land of the Three Miamis* to illustrate the difference in views of this tradition between Ohio and New York State Senecas. Brian Rice details his own interpretation of the Gaiwi:io, recounting a lesser-known keeping in which another man receives the visions first, but tragically loses them in despair at what he sees happening around him.<sup>1138</sup> While Mann does not question that Sganyadai:yoh's experience heralded a significant change and renewal in Haudenosaunee communities, she had considered doubts about some of what was included in his collected teachings. Some saw Sganyadai:yoh as restoring the traditional ways, others as attacking them.<sup>1139</sup> Such contradictory views look impossible to reconcile, and neither Rice nor Mann tries to do so. Instead, Rice reminds us that he is presenting an interpretation and that he chose to engage with the oldest version he could find that, in his view, did not "serve to perpetuate various agendas."<sup>1140</sup> Mann may be critical of the interpretations of the Gaiwi:io she has encountered, but she is far from unaware or unsympathetic to Haudenosaunee who found it so important at the turn of the nineteenth century. She also sets out a fair appraisal of how it became a matter of contention between Haudenosaunee communities:

In 1824, settlers were only starting to reach the old League strongholds of Ohio, whereas by 1796, three years before Sganyadai:yoh had his first vision, the Society of Friends had already set up shop on the New York reservations, and by 1801, the U.S. government had begun taking control of the New York Iroquois. Geography therefore played a key role in whether older traditions remained viable, or whether the Gaiwi:yo was the only existing alternative to forced Christianization. Things remained possible in Ohio that quickly became impossible in New York.<sup>1141</sup>

1138 Rice, *The Rotinonshonni*, 19; 290-295.

1139 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 49-50.

1140 Rice, *The Rotinonshonni*, 19.

1141 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 312-313.

As Rice, Mann, and Monture all argue, the Gaiwi:io was an example of Haudenosaunee remaining themselves by adapting to their new conditions, bringing with them the gifts and knowledge they already had from deep in their past. Among the elements of Sganyadai:yoh's visions included consistently in the several interpretations among the monographs I read for this project, many mentioned his re-establishment of the Four Ceremonies gifted to the Onkwehonwe after Creation but before the division into different Iroquoian nations and confederacies (that is, into the Wendat, Tuscarora, Cherokee, and Five Nations).<sup>1142</sup> While different Haudenosaunee scholars had diverse views and interpretations of Sganyadai:yoh's visions and their meaning, they all insisted on respect for his experience and worked to share it with others. They also insisted on respect for the different understandings and experiences of others who had learned about them and shared them.

A part of the most powerful recontextualization of all may be that of correcting David Cusick's 1825 cultural and linguistic translation accident, when he rendered the names of the twins, Sapling and Flint, as the Good Mind and Bad Mind. The first part of the recontextualizing was reverting to calling them Sapling and Flint, and then to approaching the trickier problem of how to translate the names referring to the quality of their minds. Hill observes that the difference between Sapling and Flint at their birth is that the latter is impatient and unable to understand that his actions could kill their mother.<sup>1143</sup> In line with her emphasis on complementarity in *Iroquoian Women*, Mann recounts how Sapling was inclined to make things too easy, while Flint was inclined to make things too difficult, but between them, they created a harmonious whole.<sup>1144</sup> During times of imbalance, conditions can be terrible indeed, and it is

1142 The briefest recounting of the founding of the Four Ceremonies is in Hill, *The Clay We are Made Of*, 24-26.

1143 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 21.

1144 Mann, *Iroquoian Women*, 59-60.

these episodes of extremity that stand out in Rice's interpretation. In his telling, the grievous clashes between the brothers reach such an extent that they agree to live far apart, leading to Sapling's creation of separate continents in order to place an ocean between their lodges.<sup>1145</sup> Perhaps most discomfiting for some settler readers, in his second to last chapter, "Sawiskera [Flint] Gains Control," Rice reiterates the Haudenosaunee traditional understanding that Flint created Europeans who came to Turtle Island and went on to wreak such havoc on both themselves and Indigenous people already there. He refers to them as Salt Water Beings, who, like Flint, are impatient and have difficulties imagining the possible impacts of their actions on the land or anyone, even themselves.<sup>1146</sup>

To make things a bit clearer on the question of how the Twins think differently, let us return for a moment to Brooks' study, *The Common Pot*, in which she searched out what was going on behind the terms awkwardly translated for so long as the Good Mind and the Bad Mind. First, Brooks cites Onondaga linguist and language revitalization leader Kevin Connelly's unpacking of the terms as being "rooted in the relationship between thought and action."<sup>1147</sup> Then Brooks draws out a further point which adds to the poignancy of the translation mishap on the very first page of Cusick's *Sketches*, because the part she references is literally on the same page, just a few lines away from his mention of the Twins as Good and Bad Minds. She is discussing how Connelly and Oneida interpreters shared the view that the difference between the Twins is how one thinks about what would add to the land while the other acts on whatever they imagine without any such consideration.<sup>1148</sup>

1145 Rice, *The Rotinonshonni*, 142-150.

1146 Rice, *The Rotinonshonni*, 251-289.

1147 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 109.

1148 Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 110.

This distinction between “participant” [with concern for others] and “doer” [without concern for others] is also prominent in Tuscarora David Cusick’s telling in *Ancient History of the Six Nations*. He relates: “While she was in the limits of distress one of the infants in her womb was moved by an evil opinion and he was determined to pass out under the side of the parent’s arm, and the other infant in vain endeavored to prevent his design.” In Cusick’s version, Flint does not act out of inherent malice but is moved by “an evil opinion.” The distinction is critical. He is not thinking clearly, in concert with his relations, and thus he responds rashly to impulse. In contrast Skyholder’s behavior is participatory, with a clear concern for the effect of his brother’s actions on their mother.<sup>1149</sup>

Here we come back again to the importance of clear thinking and speech, although there is also a bittersweet recognition that speech does not always work in time to clarify thinking.

There is still a task waiting for attention, and that is the different lengths and detail Rice gives for each part of his presentation of a traditional Rotinonshonni history. He notes in his title and introductory remarks that he is looking at this history through the eyes of Teharonhia:wako (Sapling, Skyholder) and Sawiskera (Flint). One is patient and able to think ahead; the other prefers to leap and see what happens next. The longer chapters deal with events moving along at a steady pace while Sapling is in control, guiding the people to take thoughtful action. But when people forget to take thoughtful action or are fooled into leaping before they look, Flint takes control, and conditions become chaotic; the people even lose track of time – and understanding of when to carry out ceremony. To provide a specifically Haudenosaunee traditional history while bearing in mind a mixed audience, Rice provides the most detail for the stories and cultural elements that are likely to be least familiar to non-Haudenosaunee readers, and perhaps hardest to believe could have happened. The other elements of Haudenosaunee traditional history are not nearly as familiar to a general audience, except perhaps for the fragment of the story recounting Sky Woman’s fall and landing on Turtle Island.

1149 *Ibid.* For the Cusick quote, Brooks uses the first edition.

### **Conclusion**

Anthropologists have invested thousands of hours in collecting versions of the Great Law of Peace, transcribing by hand in real-time, later from audio-recordings. For political reasons as much as scholarly ones, the hunt was soon on for just when the Haudenosaunee Confederacy was founded. The shorter its history, the easier it would be to dismiss it as too fragile to last and the easier it would be to force Haudenosaunee culture and history into the rigid, unilinear framework enshrined in Morgan's book *Ancient Society*. The effort to define this date and shorten the time preceded Morgan, of course, if for no other reason than to ensure Indigenous histories of all sorts fit inside a biblical chronology of 6000 years. My purpose here is not to make an argument for one date or another, but to briefly consider how the European-inspired drive to find a date for the founding of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy wound up playing a constructive role in Haudenosaunee – and settler – historiography.

For Haudenosaunee tradition keepers and scholars, the vexed question of when the Confederacy began led to a critical engagement with early transcriptions of information about their government and the ceremonies opening its councils. Barbara Alice Mann published a significant early interdisciplinary collaboration with statistician and astronomer Jerry L. Fields in their 1997 article, "A Sign in the Sky: Dating the League of the Haudenosaunee."<sup>1150</sup> They argued for a Confederacy foundation date of 31 August, 1142 based on an analysis of archaeological, astronomical, agricultural, and socio-cultural data encoded in Haudenosaunee oral history. They boldly challenged mainstream preconceptions and tested Haudenosaunee sources. Besides wanting to challenge narratives they disagreed with, Haudenosaunee scholars and tradition keepers wanted to understand how the newcomers had become so confused. Their researches

1150 Barbara A. Mann and Jerry L. Fields, "A Sign in the Sky: Dating the League of the Haudenosaunee," *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 21, no. 2 (1997): 105-163.

revealed such issues as the European failure to understand when they were dealing with Condoled Chiefs who could not go to war unless they stepped down, versus Pine Tree Chiefs who might win influence through success in other areas. Pine Tree Chiefs might be major traders, successful war party leaders, even translators. Every twentieth-century Haudenosaunee historian who speaks of Joseph Brant carefully reiterates that he was not a Condoled Chief, but a Pine Tree Chief, for example. Then there were European preconceptions about “savagery” and “barbarism,” which encouraged their scholars to believe that the Confederacy’s foundation must have been somehow triggered by their arrival. After all, Indigenous people were supposed to be static and outside of history until Europeans arrived. The challenge of keeping correlation sorted out from causation is always there to catch the unwary scholar at the best of times, even more so when preconceptions get in the way.

While early mainstream approaches to Haudenosaunee oral history were often disrespectful, mainstream scholars have experienced a change in perspective due to the archaeological, geological, astronomical, and climatological evidence they have found consistent with it. Haudenosaunee scholars have readily accessed these types of mainstream-style collected data where it has been done in a good way (i.e., without interfering with burials or spiritually potent items) to help repair disruptions and breaks in the more recent encoding and transmission of Haudenosaunee histories. The overall result is a more constructive interaction between Haudenosaunee and non-Indigenous scholars.

## **Chapter 5: Braiding the Strands Together**

### ***Introduction***

With the Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee case studies now set out and having followed their specific threads in the recent written Indigenous intellectual tradition, we can recognize a remarkable amount of continuity. There is continuity within the study period of this project in each case study, and continuity with Indigenous historical knowledge from before the arrival of Europeans. At times the threads were frayed, but never broken, despite extraordinary disruption. Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis communities adapted and adopted various strategies to maintain their own historical records, including the application of European-style methods to overcome gaps enforced by colonial disruptions of knowledge sharing between and within generations. The results could be quite controversial, both within and outside of their own nations and in the view of settlers and, indeed, their own historians, especially after the eighteenth century. The controversies revolve around familiar questions about: the role and propriety of historiography deemed polemic in tone, the nature of its archival sources, who has the authority to write it, which topics are acceptable, and challenges to earlier narratives and interpretations. Many of the texts discussed were directed outward, addressing a settler audience and striving to bring about change in relationships between the historians' nation and the new settler state. Haudenosaunee emphasized bringing treaty relationships into a healthy state, underscoring the necessity for genuine reciprocity. Northwest Métis had to spend considerable effort just countering claims that they had vanished after 1885, with the issue of treaty relationships growing in importance after 1982. However, for Northwest Métis, the treaty

relationships tend to be more about connecting to their First Nations kin than the British Crown. Published materials directed primarily to a general Indigenous audience or to their own respective nations appeared intermittently through the 1960s, and increased into the 1990s. Among the hallmarks of the shift in audience is the growing use of Indigenous languages and rhetorical structures. Bringing the case studies together reveals parallels, divergences, and even crossings. There are examples where Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historians took up the same technique or topic, then went on to different outcomes.

The parallels may seem obvious enough, and as we would expect, they emanate from shared experiences of land loss and subsequent social and economic disruption. As a result, both Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis struggled to access opportunities to publish their histories, but the options available were very different. Overall, Haudenosaunee historians had more chances to compose their own texts, with a much lower prevalence of “told-to” narratives. This point holds even, for example, for monographs that likely underwent extensive unacknowledged editorial alteration, as in the case of Alma Greene’s book *Forbidden Voice: Reflections of a Mohawk Indian*.<sup>1151</sup> They also had much better access to the busy publishing centres of New York and Toronto. Haudenosaunee monographs appeared regularly in the catalogues of general-interest presses into the mid-twentieth century. The very earliest Northwest Métis publishing was in French, which sharply curtailed both publisher options and audience reach. In the end, Northwest Métis organizations began setting up their own presses, generally after a wider shift to a predominance of English in spoken and written use. These presses and a few cases of self-publishing were the main outlets of Northwest Métis works of all types until the early 1990s. Pemmican Press and the Gabriel Dumont Institute are still producing substantial numbers of

1151 Alma Greene (Gah-wonh-nos-doh), *Forbidden Voice: Reflections of a Mohawk Indian* (New York: Hamlyn, 1972 [1997]).

books, including many historical works. Nonetheless, both Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historiography currently reaches print mainly via academic presses, consistent with a change beginning in the 1990s.

Haudenosaunee historians continue to publish on the extensive Haudenosaunee treaty and military relationships with the Dutch, the British Crown, and the United States. For the moment, Northwest Métis historians have not written much about treaties and military relationships, because these were not the primary forms of interaction between Northwest Métis and settlers. As we have seen, they write far more about taking part in the fur trade, serving as translators, treaty negotiators, and guides. In fact, for Northwest Métis historiography to finally turn away from a fixation on the nineteenth-century Resistance movements and the travesty of the federal scrip policy that followed them, it was necessary to finally acknowledge and act upon *wahkôtowin*. The 1980s heralded a veritable explosion of research to correct the artificial near-absence of Northwest Métis women from the historiography as both subjects and authors, supported by developments in ethnohistorical methods and serious study of material culture more generally carried out by women. Despite the well-known social and political prominence of Haudenosaunee women and the greater access to speaking and publishing opportunities for Haudenosaunee-produced histories from at least the early nineteenth century, they remained little more than token historical presences until the 1970s. At least three factors contributed to this phenomenon:

1. the early prevalence of male Haudenosaunee Christian converts in Haudenosaunee historiography, from Cornplanter to Elias Johnson;

2. an emphasis on military activity and archaeology, both of which tended to favour tracing Haudenosaunee men's actions and material culture until the late twentieth century; and
3. an unforeseen synergy between male-biased anthropology and Haudenosaunee men following protocol by not attempting to speak about women's business or keepings.

Elements of these factors are recognizable in the Northwest Métis case, except for the role of Christian converts. Certainly, battles and large-scale bison hunts were featured regularly in a way that said no more than unavoidably necessary about Northwest Métis women's roles and work. It takes a careful reading of original sources and careful listening to elders to learn that Northwest Métis women did not just ride the Red River carts out to the bison hunts and then process the meat and hides after the men shot the animals, for example. In fact, Northwest Métis women ran their own cart trains and pursued their own trade interests in meat, hides,<sup>1152</sup> and as Racette and Blady have traced, beaded and embroidered leather goods.<sup>1153</sup>

A major divergence, and one still little studied as yet, is the phenomenon of Northwest Métis development as a people in place. It is a familiar truth that they are a people of the Northwest, yet neither historians nor anthropologists, whether settler or Indigenous, have addressed what made Northwest Métis ethnogenesis possible informed by an Indigenous perspective.

Algonquian-speaking peoples' trade and social networks span the Northeast, as did the earliest fur trade. Nevertheless, something different occurred in the region colloquially referred to as the "Northwest Angle" between present-day Manitoba and Ontario, which continued to re-echo well

1152 Frederick C. Jamieson, "The Edmonton Hunt," *Alberta Historical Review* 1, no. 1 (1953): 27-28.

Rhoda R. Gilman, Carolyn Gilman, and Deborah M. Schultz. *The Red River Trails: Ox Cart Routes Between St. Paul and the Selkirk Settlement, 1820 – 1870* (St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society, 1979), 15.

1153 Sharon Blady, "The Flower Beadwork People: Factors Contributing to the Emergence of a Distinctive Métis Culture and Artistic Style at Red River From 1844 to 1869" (MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 1995).

Sherry Farrell Racette, "Sewing for a Living: The Commodification of Métis Women's Artistic Production," in *Contact Zones: Aboriginal and Settler Women in Canada's Colonial Past*, eds. Katie Pickles and Maya Rutherford (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005): 17-46.

into the early twentieth century. The Kahnawà:ke Mohawks who went and stayed west in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, often joined or helped found new Northwest Métis communities. Accordingly, we see this social and economic crossing of paths reflected in Northwest Métis historiography that documents these connections, especially in the work completed to date by Brenda MacDougall and Adam Gaudry. This tracing is a powerful counter to attempts to impose racialized definitions on Northwest Métis.

Haudenosaunee historians have understandably been less engaged with this topic, not just due to being among the First Nations in northern North America. Equipped with a deeper archive of material in terms of wampum records, treaties, and later European-style publications, Haudenosaunee historians could point to documented alliances, adoptions, and naturalizations of adoptees that clearly did not follow a racialized model. Their lands were also mapped and labelled in European-style ways from the 1600s onwards, so settlers could not deny that Haudenosaunee were (and are) connected to specific places. On these topics, Northwest Métis historians have engaged in a major effort at catching up from the mid to late nineteenth century on, and by the twentieth century, had begun serious investment in what we now know as digital history. While partly an accident of timing and availability, it is also practical: Northwest Métis have an extended homeland of communities joined by Red River cart trails, rivers, and of course, *wahkôtowin*.<sup>1154</sup> The importance of geographic information systems, electronic databases, and web portals to digital archives and other online sources to modern Northwest Métis historiography is manifest.

1154 Jean Teillet, “The Boundaries of the Métis Nation,” Presentation on Métis Nation Constitutional Reform Portal, posted December 19, 2019, <http://www.metisportals.ca/cons/?p=1811> (accessed October 13, 2019), Slides 8-11 and 16-17.

I do not intend to romanticize or ignore how difficult the relationships between Indigenous communities and settlers could be and still are. Some of the best illustrations of the difficulties for Indigenous communities and their historians are among the most powerful monographs considered in the case studies. Consider, for instance, Arthur C. Parker and Barbara Alice Mann's careful studies of the impacts of land loss, missionization, and the attendant struggle to recreate harmonious relations within Haudenosaunee communities after the rebellion of the Thirteen Colonies. Analogous studies are not quite so evident in Northwest Métis historiography as yet, but the development and reshaping of Diane Payment's monograph in the course of her long relationship with the Batoche Métis comes very close. Northwest Métis historians still need to reckon with times when Northwest Métis leaders made decisions and behaved in ways that were not consistent with *wahkôtowin* in their effects on First Nations neighbours and kin. To date, Northwest Métis scholars are laying the groundwork for this under-developed aspect of Northwest Métis historiography. For example, Adam Gaudry's 2014 dissertation has already been cited in this study. Further, in 2015, Daniel Voth successfully defended his study of Northwest Métis relationships with and within colonialism through the life and work of Northwest Métis scholar and activist Howard Adams.<sup>1155</sup> I will briefly discuss some aspects of Voth's study below.

When it comes to historiographic crossings, they tend to arise from strategic participation in different political and intellectual venues to manage the challenges of producing and sharing Indigenous historiography under hostile conditions. Faced with newcomers who did not understand wampum records or place encoding, Haudenosaunee historians readily adopted and adapted European-style methods in order to advocate for their nation's interests and counter

1155 Daniel Jacob-Paul Voth, "The Devil's Northern Triangle: Howard Adams and Métis Multidimensional Relationships with and Within Colonialism" (PhD Dissertation, University of British Columbia, 2015).

inaccurate claims. Haudenosaunee communities strove to build and maintain their own schools and access to post-secondary education and, against all odds, maintained ceremony and practices integrated into distinctive approaches to historiography. Northwest Métis historians followed a similar path, albeit starting later, beginning in the late nineteenth century, when they opted to found and build archives. Then Northwest Métis scholars, like Haudenosaunee historians, entered university training beginning in the late 1960s. As noted above, Haudenosaunee focussed on treaties, while Northwest Métis concentrated on processing and countering the impacts of recent clashes over land with the Canadian settler governments. A critical crossing point is the changing role and prevalence of “told-to” narratives. Just as Haudenosaunee historians were departing firmly from the genre in the early 1970s, Northwest Métis historians pursued a wide-ranging series of projects within it, from the earliest Alberta Métis Settlement histories to more recent traditional land use studies.

These parallels, divergences, and crossings observable from the discussion of the corpus of monographs in the case studies are overall internal in nature. They derive from aspects of the texts explored and described in the case studies, combining highlights from their development. From here, it is possible to consider two more aspects of Indigenous historiography via the Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis cases: professionalization and place-relating versus space-taking historiography. My intention here is not to present “final answers” to the questions that arise around each aspect, but to further examine the strands of Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historiography considered in this project using these concepts as further “tools to think with.” The thinking suggests additional tantalizing possibilities for further work.

### ***The Professionalization of Indigenous History?***

In 2005 Donald Wright published *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*, an analysis of how history became “a profession, something one did for a living” between the late nineteenth to mid-twentieth centuries in the most anglophone provinces.<sup>1156</sup> It is important to note that it is not just any history that a small group of interested scholars are professionalizing in his study, but a self-conscious and rather new “Canadian” history. Wright traces how the historical practice was enclosed, in part, by bringing “history” into the university and defining it as a discipline entailing formal study with associated credentials, ethics, governance, and all-important boundaries.<sup>1157</sup> He also explores the impacts of these changes on history as a socially-embedded practice, not just in the form of privatization but also in the subject’s sometimes awkward perch between the humanities and social sciences.<sup>1158</sup> Furthermore, Wright’s discussion indicates that the ranks of influential lay historians in English Canadian history were at least temporarily and severely thinned by the combination of professionalization, the Great Depression, and two World Wars. In broad strokes, the temporal sequence of Wright’s exploration of these changes and impacts runs as follows:

- 1880s –1890s: Canadian history “had a vital and vibrant existence outside the university and only a tentative one inside it.”<sup>1159</sup>
- 1890s –1920: Canadian history shifts from avocation to vocation, and the redefinition of the “ideal historian” into a university-based, male scholar.<sup>1160</sup>

1156 Donald Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005), 3.

1157 Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*, 4-5.

1158 Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*, 7; 159-165.

1159 Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*, 8.

1160 Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*, 5; 32.

- 1920s: An expansion of historical research and Canadian history writing in textbooks and monographs, and the institutionalization of graduate studies.<sup>1161</sup>
- 1930s: Academic historians strive to maintain academic freedom and independence.<sup>1162</sup>
- 1940s – 1950s: An older generation of the first professionalized historians try to set the agenda for their successors.<sup>1163</sup>

As this summary shows, Wright’s study did not contemplate work by Indigenous historians *per se*, nor did he suggest that his description applied beyond the ranks of settler historians in English Canada. Nevertheless, comparisons and contrasts between his findings and the experiences of Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee historians encapsulated in the case studies are illuminating.

Taking the Haudenosaunee case first, we can recognize immediately from the Distant View sections in Chapter Four that Haudenosaunee historians were full participants in the vibrant amateur scene when “amateur” was a reputable label. Haudenosaunee representatives took part in meetings of historical societies in southern Ontario and northern New York. Moreover, Haudenosaunee individuals undertook speaking tours and wrote for magazines and newspapers on their history. They printed historical pamphlets on their own presses or published with firms based in Toronto, New York, and Montréal. By the turn of the twentieth century, history was not the only subject affected by its professionalization in English Canada. What is better known today as anthropology was also professionalizing. As the two subjects transformed into

1161 Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*, 52-53; 56-61; 76-79.

1162 Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*, 122-125.

1163 Wright, *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*, 147-152.

“disciplines,” history became the property of Europeans and their descendants. In contrast, Indigenous peoples were redefined as without history and thus the concern of anthropology. The “ideal historian” was certainly *not* an Indigenous one. Nevertheless, Haudenosaunee anthropologists could work their way into a position to write history anyway, though they might not agree they were doing any such thing. Where Arthur C. Parker explicitly wrote a history of the Senecas, J.N.B. Hewitt opted to criticize the one Haudenosaunee published history he discussed directly, David Cusick’s,<sup>1164</sup> and otherwise stuck to transcription and translation of “traditional stories.” In any case, Haudenosaunee historians did not become professionalized in Canadian settler terms at this time, instead finding the new institutional doors locked, keeping them outside the physical and intellectual spaces of academia. In Canada, there was the added barrier of involuntary enfranchisement to contend with for Indigenous people with status under the Indian Act, even if it was not always strictly enforced.

For Haudenosaunee historians, the adaptation of European-style qualifications into their training for some types of historiographic production did not begin until after history was professionalized as a discipline in Canada. The earliest Haudenosaunee scholar to complete a doctorate in history I found while researching this study is Deborah Doxtator, who completed her dissertation in 1996.<sup>1165</sup> Expanding the search terms reveals Wendat scholar Georges E. Sioui completed his doctoral degree in history five years earlier,<sup>1166</sup> and his publications went on to influence upcoming Haudenosaunee historians, including Brian Rice and Susan M. Hill, as described in the Haudenosaunee case study. By the 1990s, Haudenosaunee-qualified historians

1164 David Cusick, *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations* (Lewiston: Printed for the Author, 1827).

1165 Deborah Doxtator, “What Happened to the Iroquois Clans? A Study of Clans in Three Nineteenth Century Rotinonhsyonni Communities,” (PhD Dissertation, University of Western Ontario, 1996).

1166 Georges E. Sioui, “La civilisation wendate” (PhD Dissertation, Université Laval, 1991).

Georges Sioui, *Eatenonha: Native Roots of Modern Democracy* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2019), 20.

were hired into university positions as instructors and recognized scholars, as in the case of the late Chief Jacob Thomas. Chief Thomas' example is not one of professionalization in mainstream-defined terms, but it is certainly one that concerns the Indigenization of the academy. Pursuing similar qualifications and training as characteristic of the newly defined vocational historian did not entail reducing or denying the authority of Haudenosaunee historians. This is quite different from the impacts on the authority of anglophone settler historians. But by earning the professional qualifications, some Haudenosaunee historians pursued an additional strategy for gaining respect for their records and interpretations of their own histories in settler venues.

We can outline some elements of what it means to be Haudenosaunee-qualified as a historian in contrast to a person who has acquired mainstream academic qualifications based on the authors and works considered in the case study. From the examples of Chiefs John Arthur Gibson and Jacob Thomas, we can recognize fluency in all five original Haudenosaunee languages and an ability to recite historical narratives in a ceremonial context. Fluency in all five languages is certainly ideal; however, in light of the impacts of colonialism, the recent consensus among the Haudenosaunee historians is that they should be working with and learning at least one.<sup>1167</sup> The famous photograph of Haudenosaunee chiefs with select wampum belts added to the second edition of *The Iroquois Book of Rites*<sup>1168</sup> reflects the Onondaga Nation's continuing duty to

1167 Condoled Chief Jacob E. Thomas, Rick Monture, Susan M. Hill, among others, remark on the importance of learning and using Haudenosaunee languages to engage with Haudenosaunee culture and history in the introductions to their works. See:

Brian Wiles-Heape, "Introduction: An Interview with Chief Jacob E. Thomas, Friday 14 April 1989," in *The Constitution of the Confederacy by the Peacemaker*, by Seth Newhouse, Rev. Chief Jacob E. Thomas (Wilsonville: Sandpiper Press, 1989), i-iii; v.

Rick Monture, *We Share Our Matters = Teionkwakhashion tsi niionkwariho:ten: Two Centuries of Writing and Resistance at Six Nations of the Grand River* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2014), xi-xv.

Susan M. Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of: Haudenosaunee Land Tenure on the Grand River* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2017), 8-9.

1168 Horatio Hale, *The Iroquois Book of Rites* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963 [1831]), follows page 6.

maintain and recite from their Confederacy's wampum archive. Wampum keepers would logically have additional curation and preservation skills to develop and maintain for carrying out their responsibilities. Brian Rice and Susan M. Hill shared the significance and importance of knowing the land in order to understand and interpret Haudenosaunee history in a way that is accurate and consistent with cultural protocol. Familiarity and skill in Haudenosaunee rhetoric are critical, as Barbara Alice Mann emphasizes, along with a willingness and determination to counter Euro-formation of the data. Finally, the examples of Chief Gibson, Chief Thomas, Rice, Hill, and Mann indicate that a Haudenosaunee-qualified historian is recognized within and works with community.

Since Northwest Métis historiographic publishing was not carried out in a substantive fashion until 1935, L'Union Nationale Métisse faced the unenviable task of finding a way to bring their accounts of the 1869 and 1885 Resistances into print after the professionalization of English Canadian history. This likely contributed to the lengthy delay before the production of an English translation. Besides the language barrier, neither L'Union Nationale Métisse members nor their journalist amanuensis A.H. De Trémaudan had the newly defined credentials to qualify as "professional" historians. Northwest Métis scholars would complete doctoral research in history and break into the academy well after Wright's study period, beginning with Howard Adams and Olive Patricia Dickason in the late 1960s and early 1970s. But there were other options for intervening in the mainstream historical conversation for even the most modestly credentialed Northwest Métis historians by then, owing to the development of ethnohistorical methods under the pressure of land claims research.

In mainstream terms, Northwest Métis historians began, and remain somewhat unprofessionalized, although this is changing rapidly as more Northwest Métis scholars complete

graduate degrees in the field. From that perspective, after a terrible period of displacement and massive loss of access to the necessities of life, let alone basic education, Northwest Métis began building a vibrant amateur community of historians. Their work reached print mainly through community projects funded by small provincial and corporate grants. Yet, even pamphlets were generally published in hard cover, helping maximize the likelihood they would survive in library, archival, and hard-wearing family collections. With the advent of the internet and, subsequently, the world wide web, Northwest Métis organizations like the Gabriel Dumont Institute took advantage of the new technology to provide not only a rapidly growing digital archive, but thousands of pages of historical pamphlets and reports. Many of these were researched and written by Northwest Métis and settler scholars with at least undergraduate training and often a master's degree in a relevant field. That is, they were a part of the already significant sector of professionalized historians in what is today often referred to as the "alternative to academic stream." Academic stream participation by Northwest Métis historians did not take off until the turn of the twenty-first century when David T. McNab (1999) and Heather Devine's (2004) first monographs heralded its expansion.

At this point, there is not enough information available to sketch a version of what it is to be a Northwest Métis-qualified historian in as much detail as the Haudenosaunee case provides. There is definitely an expectation that a Northwest Métis-qualified historian should have a strong and respectful working relationship with community. Having wrested at least a part of the discussion away from racializing narratives, Northwest Métis historians who have responded partly to Dorion and Préfontaine's important 2001 gap analysis have had to develop new skills. Alongside relearning correct protocols for working with Northwest Métis and First Nations knowledge keepers and elders is the need to develop skills in working with geographic

information systems and genealogical databases. As already noted, a growing challenge for Northwest Métis historians to meet is the realization of *wahkôtowin* in their projects. The five major themes in Northwest Métis historiography express a mainly inward focus, or else a concentration on interactions and tough relationships with settlers and settler governments. As a result, retelling the stories of how Northwest Métis have related to First Nations kin, with an eye to how to enact *wahkôtowin* properly into the future, is still pending. The research in relevant disciplines such as sociology, political science, and Indigenous studies by scholars including Gaudry and Voth, suggest that a key expectation of Northwest Métis-qualified historians in future may be to write in a way that supports and strengthens Indigenous solidarity and refuses complicity with colonial practices.

The close of this section attempts to answer whether Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis historians have professionalized. On the one hand, yes, considering that a number of them are able to make a living by working on a range of historiographic and archival projects, teaching, and public speaking. On the other hand, if we were to make an oversimplified conflation between professionalization and participation in academia, the answer would have to be no. The growing recognition of an “alternative to academic stream” among settler historians is an important nuance here. However, for Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee communities, they have long been engaged in creating independent archives and ways of qualifying their own historians. This has not just been a response to mainstream forms of credentialing and professionalization being closed. Haudenosaunee are clearly continuing a process of adopting and adapting select European methods while firmly insisting on the continuing reality of their authority over their own history. Northwest Métis are still engaged in the process of attaining such authority and resisting the temptation to effectively delegate it away to settler scholars,

however skilled and sympathetic they may be. Based on the range of materials in the study corpus for this project, the sort of authority that Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee communities and individual historians have in mind is not the kind that demands that only they engage with or contribute to their historiographies. Rather, it is the sort of authority that means when they speak and write about their history, what they say and write is taken seriously and engaged with in good faith inside and outside their respective nations and communities.

### ***Place-Relating Histories Versus Space-Making Histories***

Encoding and transmitting historical information is a tricky, often controversial business. Even before the process really gets started, historians face difficulties with prioritization and the fact that historical narratives are sensitive socially and politically. Current and ongoing controversies around commemoration throughout northern North America and indeed Europe reinforce the social and political importance of what and whether communities remember or forget. Particular styles of history writing can support certain ways of remembering and relating to the world, both the social world and what is referred to in mainstream terms as “the environment.” The unique challenges of a given time and place, including all the social relationships accompanying them, contribute to what types of historiographies are of most interest to historians and society, more generally. The previous section touched on a notable example from the Canadian settler context, with the late nineteenth-century move towards the production of a self-conscious “Canadian” history by a cadre of academic professionals. There were loose parallels in general topics between Haudenosaunee and mainstream Canadian historians across this period, as they both engaged with primarily military and political history plus “great men” biographies. However, suppose we pause and reconsider the framing of these topics in terms of what they capture about

widely shared attitudes toward the land. In that case, we can observe contrasting modes of place-relating and space-making histories.

The means of achieving this reframing goes back to the ways of thinking and acting described in Haudenosaunee stories of Sky Woman's twin grandsons, Sapling and Flint. Returning to Lisa Brooks' analysis of the way each twin characteristically brings together thought and action reiterates that Sapling engages in participatory behaviour, while Flint is prone to acting without considering the possible consequences for others or even himself.<sup>1169</sup> In the Northwest Métis terms applied in this study, participatory thinking and acting could be described as being congruent with *wahkôtowin*. Nevertheless, even the most relationship-informed plans and actions may have unexpected or negative consequences. As today's social and environmental challenges illustrate all too well, such effects are nearly impossible to avoid and often far worse in scale and impact if relationships are ignored.

Applying this to ways of writing history then leads to the following definitions. Histories that reflect and reinforce ongoing relationships with and responsibilities to the land and humans and other than human relations are participatory in nature, and so resonate with Sapling's approach. They are place-relating. Histories emphasizing acquisition or exclusivity of occupation or use without consideration for impacts on the land or relationships with humans and other than human relations resonate with Flint's habit and support space-making. Both modes are available to any historian, Indigenous or settler, but since Europeans first came to the Americas, space-making histories have been more common among Europeans and their descendants, while place-relating histories have been more common among Indigenous peoples. The ambiguous connotations of the verb "to make" are important in the notion of

<sup>1169</sup> Lisa Brooks, *The Common Pot: The Recovery of Native Space in the Northeast* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008), 109-110.

“space-making” I intend here. It may refer to forcing someone to act in a certain way or something to happen. Alternatively, it may refer to a positive action of preparation or design, especially if what the actor is preparing or designing is ultimately meant to be shared with others. These are the definitions I will apply below, starting with the Haudenosaunee monographs, then turning to the Northwest Métis exemplars. Northwest Métis historians are still developing their own historiographic modes in greater detail, so it is not yet possible to provide a closer parallel discussion of *wahkôtowin*. While there is a broad Northwest Métis consensus developing around respectful learning and application of Plains Cree concepts and teachings, there is not yet a matching narrative matrix guiding Northwest Métis historiography to that of Sapling and Flint. Winona Wheeler eloquently describes that Cree histories

consist of many different kinds of overlapping and related stories. That *âtayôhkêwina* are *sacred stories* of the mystical past when the earth was shaped, animal peoples conversed, and Wisakejac transformed the earth and its inhabitants through misadventure, mischief, and love into the world we presently know. *Âtayôhkêwina* are the foundations of Cree spirituality/religion, philosophy, and worldview, and contain the laws given to the people to live by.<sup>1170</sup>

Therefore it is probable that in future, Northwest Métis historians will find themselves engaging with *âtayôhkêwina* detailing Wisakejac’s adventures because they carry the teachings specific to the Cree term *wahkôtowin*.

#### *Haudenosaunee Historiography: Place-Relating and Space-Making*

Although I have already characterized *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee*<sup>1171</sup> as an anti-history, Haudenosaunee history resists the shape that Lewis Henry Morgan sought to fit it in. There are provocative hints of place-relating narrative, especially in the “Indian geography” of Book I,

1170 Winona Wheeler, “Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories,” in *Walking a Tightrope: Aboriginal People and Their Representations*, eds. David T. McNab and Ute Lischke (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2005), 201-202.

1171 Lewis Henry Morgan, *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois* (Rochester: Sage and Brother Publishers, 1851).

Chapter 2 and of the ongoing relationship between present and past Haudenosaunee in Chapter 3. Admittedly, these are indications of future possibilities, not outright expressions as might be expected in a monograph with a Haudenosaunee person writing a historical narrative. Elias Johnson's riposte to *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee* provides an excellent example of a primarily place-relating narrative as described above.<sup>1172</sup> He emphatically replaced the Haudenosaunee Confederacy within a social fabric of many Indigenous nations firmly attached to specific lands, which had developed complex, not always satisfactory relationships with European newcomers. Johnson maintained a special interest in treaties, from those that integrated his own nation, the Tuscarora, into the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, to those between the Confederacy and the United States. From a more mainstream-oriented perspective, we might see this as mostly an effort on Johnson's part to persuade settlers not to take remaining reserve lands and provide promised annuities, goods, and services enumerated in the treaties. His efforts are also about attempting to bring settlers into a conscious relationship with Indigenous peoples and lands, taking a place-relating perspective, thereby opening the potential for an end to short-term, narrowly profitable, but long-term destructive and impoverishing actions. These actions harm Haudenosaunee and settler peoples alike.

By 1926 when Arthur C. Parker published his *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, his emphasis was different. For one thing, this work is particularly hybrid in nature, integrating Seneca sources into a tone and exposition more in line with mainstream expectations of form and arrangement. Place-relating falls mostly into the background in its most literal sense, as he focusses more on Seneca relationships with their neighbours within and outside the Confederacy and their unsatisfactory experiences to date with European newcomers and their

<sup>1172</sup> Elias Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois, or Six Nations, and History of the Tuscarora Indians* (Lockport: Union Printing and Publishing Company, 1881).

settler descendants. The discussion of his long writing decade in Chapter Four gave several examples of Parker's willingness to handle controversial material. Here it is notable that he carefully considers the impacts of Haudenosaunee Confederacy efforts to make a larger space in part to enforce a defensible border between themselves and lawless newcomers. It made sense to try to unify close neighbours and related nations to recreate conditions of stability and safety. Between incoming non-Indigenous people and displaced populations from other Indigenous nations, finding and applying strategies that would have predictably positive outcomes was no easy task.

Tantalizing as such retrospective readings of Haudenosaunee historiography can be, few of these works can be properly understood as written with the cultural and philosophical framework presented through the lives and deeds of Flint and Sapling. Many of them come from an era of adaptation of non-Haudenosaunee narrative forms, so the two modes of history writing in question remain awkwardly fitted in as best as the authors could manage. The firm outliers to this are the various published versions of the founding of the Confederacy and the Great Law of Peace. Even as outsiders sought to capture a "definitive" version of the story and determine fixed dates for each major episode, their commentaries rarely picked up on the place-relating elements. The 1992 Gibson-Goldenweiser version carefully sets out recognizable geography, including the places well-known today as Kahnawà:ke, Bay of Quinte, and other continuing Haudenosaunee communities. The narrative depicts contested lands and peoples struggling with the fall-out of rampant space-making as the separate Haudenosaunee nations strive to keep hold of the lands they have and survive incessant warfare. Recreating good relationships with the land by forgoing cannibalism and making peace, the Peacemaker leads a concurrent recreation of good relationships between the Haudenosaunee nations. This, in turn, restores mutual responsibilities

as expressed in ceremonies. The major phase change at the turn of the twentieth-century, when Haudenosaunee historians thoroughly adapted mainstream techniques is built on these original place-relating narratives. Four twenty-first century monographs provide especially clear illustrations of syncretic Haudenosaunee place-relating historiography: *Iroquoian Women* and *The Land of the Three Miamis* by Barbara Alice Mann, *The Rotinonshonni* by Brian Rice, and *The Clay We Are Made Of* by Susan M. Hill.<sup>1173</sup>

In each of these histories, the reader quickly learns there is an overt and important element of the personal. Each author places themselves as from a particular Haudenosaunee nation, community and/or clan, with ongoing relationships of respect with elders and knowledge-keepers. This is not just a matter of unique writing style or the deployment of techniques usually deemed verboten in mainstream histories even today, such as the use of humour or overt acknowledgement of spiritual practice and belief. All three authors spend time outside the paper archives, bringing together direct observations on the land with other types of now-familiar records, from paper to wampum. Besides diagrams, line drawings, and photographs, they strategically use Haudenosaunee language terms, unpacking meanings and using them to unfold the details of their stories. They take special care to reiterate that they are providing interpretations or versions of a stable historical tradition built on a recognized core according to Haudenosaunee protocols. This is quite a different context from that of mainstream historians who have recently won respect for documenting their working relationships in the main text of

1173 Barbara Alice Mann, *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas* (New York: Peter Lang, 2000).

Barbara Alice Mann, *The Land of the Three Miamis: A Traditional Narrative of the Iroquois in Ohio* (Toledo: Urban Affairs Centre Press, 2006).

Brian Rice, *The Rotinonshonni: A Traditional Iroquoian History Through the Eyes of Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera* (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2013).

Susan M. Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of: Haudenosaunee Land Tenure on the Grand River* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2017).

their monographs, not just in the acknowledgements. Those mainstream historians have been carrying out a constructive response to critiques of what had been accepted ways of writing history in their tradition. Haudenosaunee historians have been enacting a program already present in their own ways of encoding and transmitting history.

A trickier question is that of space-making historiography in Hill's monograph since it deals with the land tenure of the Six Nations of the Grand River. Is this study also a space-making one, in light of the resettlement of British-allied Haudenosaunee on Mississauga territory after they were forced out of their own territory in what is presently called New York State? After all, the space-making mode is available, and Haudenosaunee had to create a sense of connection to the new place. Nevertheless, Hill is not writing in a space-making mode in her study. For one thing, she explains using Joseph Brant's letters that the region the southeastern Haudenosaunee were moving to was one they had a long-term relationship with. The lands along the Grand River were part of "their former hunting grounds,"<sup>1174</sup> and they had longstanding relations with the Mississaugas. Shared "hunting grounds" between First Nations who had treaty relationships were a fact often ignored or denied by British and later Canadian officials. Hill observes:

It appears that Brant's public persona had a major impact on many people, even those belonging to other Indigenous nations. In fact, Brant was selected by the Mississaugas to negotiate on their behalf in May 1798.<sup>1175</sup>

Furthermore, nearly fifty years later, the Six Nations and Mississauga relations remained positive, such that when the Credit River Band needed to move to new lands, the Six Nations settled them on a part of the lands they still held on the Grand River. Subsequent relations with the Credit River Band were not always easy through the remainder of the period Hill discusses.

Hill goes on to unpack the Canadian Indian Department's failure to follow negotiated agreements

1174 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 159.

1175 *Ibid.*

between the Six Nations and New Credit Mississauga that added to the difficulties they experienced from the 1880s to 1920s.<sup>1176</sup> A space-making narrative would have elided these aspects and probably could not have achieved Hill's detailed treatment of the Haudenosaunee-Mississauga relationships.

*Northwest Métis Historiography: Space-Making and Place-Relating?*

The Northwest Métis first came to consciousness as a people within a land already full of nations and named places. Like any people in such circumstances, it was and is possible for Northwest Métis to pursue place-relating strategies or space-making ones, expressed in areas including political action, diplomacy, and of course, historiography. The Northwest Métis also came to consciousness in the middle of a major colonial operation that was wreaking havoc on the pre-existing social and political structures, including interfering with means to integrate newcomers in a good way. Under those conditions, Northwest Métis have developed relationships with First Nations' places, sometimes through treaty and kinship, at others through conflict, be it warfare or politics. Over time, Northwest Métis have begun to build their own network of places within the complex tapestry already present. Published mapping and recognition of a specifically Northwest Métis landscape, as opposed to two, perhaps three mainstream-defined settlements – the familiar pair of Batoche and Red River and sometimes Pembina or St. Joseph located in present-day Minnesota – has only just begun. This is not surprising since the 1869 and 1885 Resistance movements and related scrip issues served as powerful foci in the earliest Northwest Métis historiography. Following these attractors also encouraged the impulse towards space-making over place-relating in the subsequent narratives.

1176 Hill, *The Clay We Are Made Of*, 182-184; 224-226.

Northwest Métis political scientist Daniel Voth captures the nature of this attractor well in the introduction to his dissertation, “The Devil’s Northern Triangle: Howard Adams and Métis Multidimensional Relationships With and Within Colonialism.” He argues that:

On one hand, the Métis have sought to colonize shared Indigenous spaces and, on the other, have endured the ravages of colonialism as colonized subjects. The Métis asserted themselves politically and economically in relation to other Indigenous peoples also living in North America. In some cases, the act of asserting Métis political goals places Métis claims and actions in opposition to the aspirations and goals of other Indigenous peoples. As these conflicts unfold, Métis actors inadvertently lubricate the machinery of Indigenous land dispossession, while overtly seeking the dispossession of non-Métis Indigenous peoples to support the advancement of Métis claims. These dynamics manifest alongside dispossession of Métis lands and the broader colonization of Métis spaces by settler society. The result of these complex political relationships is that Métis political claims have become framed in zero-sum terms that pit Indigenous peoples against each other within colonial and settler colonial contexts.<sup>1177</sup>

Framing in zero-sum terms is also a powerful rhetorical technique, one of several Howard Adams freely applied in his history writing. Other scholars, both Indigenous and non-Indigenous, who challenge elements of Adams’ work may be misunderstood as taking issue with his use of polemic when it is actually the zero-sum approach that is in question. Even though Adams was clearly aware of the Batoche community’s ties and context within the local matrix of First Nations communities and later reserves, he hardly discussed such details.

Still, we should not simply equate the lack of overt discussion of such ties as an indication of zero-sum political and historical claims by Northwest Métis historians. As we saw in parsing Marie Delorme Smith’s memoirs, they could also be managing complex internal family dynamics and avoiding a display of them to an outsider audience. For some Northwest Métis historians, their choice was not to play the zero-sum game, even if they still wrote accounts that strove to make a space on top of another Indigenous homeland. For example, Delorme Smith

<sup>1177</sup> Voth, “The Devil’s Northern Triangle,” 4-5.

describes her Jughandle Ranch as near Pincher Creek, a name derived from a story of uninvited prospectors who lost tools in the nearby river. She makes no reference to nearby Ninastako “Chief Mountain,” an important Blackfoot landmark.<sup>1178</sup>

The various Alberta Métis settlement histories are, despite their frequent ties to provincial commemoration projects, very much documents for those communities. They express understandable pride and relief at the creation or recreation of community cohesion after forced removal and a coming together of a diverse group of people who were not solely Northwest Métis. Such diversity and connections to local First Nations are simply “what everyone knows” and so not expressed. While they are space-making, they are not setting up a claim to the exclusion of other Indigenous peoples. That said, making explicit links to surrounding and overlapping Indigenous communities may be a key step in historiographic terms. Those links can assist in the further recovery of information on the unilaterally disestablished Alberta Métis settlements as well as other still extant but rarely acknowledged Northwest Métis communities throughout the North Saskatchewan River valley.

A striking shift from a preponderance of space-making to place-relating narratives by Northwest Métis historians begins in the mid-1980s with Anne Anderson’s project, *The First Métis... A New Nation*.<sup>1179</sup> Although periodically caught up in the same racist tropes in reference to First Nations and Northwest Métis as other writers in the same period, she does not deny or elide kinship ties. Quite the opposite, Anderson documents the ties between her extended kin network and both local First Nations and the westward-venturing Kahnawà:ke fur traders. Anderson’s is one of the earliest English language delineations of a Northwest Métis landscape

1178 Blackfoot Confederacy and Glenbow Museum, “Our World,” Niitsitapiisinni: Our Way of Life, [https://www.glenbow.org/blackfoot/EN/html/our\\_world.htm](https://www.glenbow.org/blackfoot/EN/html/our_world.htm) (accessed June 5, 2022).

1179 Anne Anderson, *The First Métis... A New Nation* (Edmonton: Uvisco Press, 1985).

and network of trails and places spanning a region defined partly by the Red River and Saskatchewan River systems. It is not easy to appreciate this at a glance because this was long before access to options for generating unique maps was available outside government departments and corporations. Before that, the main example of Northwest Métis place mapping among the monographs considered in this study was reproduced on the fly leaves of the original French language edition of Louis Goulet's memoirs. A careful examination reveals that not all place names from the French version of the map are included on its 1980 translated counterpart.<sup>1180</sup> This is not to deny the presence of Victor Lytwyn's map captioned "The métis landscape" in the 1985 ethnohistorical anthology *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*.<sup>1181</sup> It includes much of the same geography but is defined from a different perspective based on a racialized definition of "métissage" rather than the more specific perspective of this project and the monographs in the Northwest Métis corpus.

Even as newer ethnohistorical projects extended documentation of Northwest Métis communities in northwestern Alberta and the Okanagan, more scholars were taking a second look at the new Métis scrip database at the Métis Archival Research Lab at the University of Alberta. Northwest Métis scholars were already moving onto research lines and forms of argument that refused the zero-sum and racializing tendencies that were more common before the mid-1980s. This takes us back to Brenda MacDougall's 2010 book *One of the Family*,<sup>1182</sup> a ground-breaking example of place-relating historiography. Its full impact is still unfolding as it

1180 Guillaume Charette, *Vanishing Spaces: Memoirs of Louis Goulet*, trans. Ray Ellenwood (Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 1980 [2004]).

1181 Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown, eds., *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985), this map is on the reverse of the third unnumbered page after the Acknowledgements.

1182 Brenda MacDougall, *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010).

contributes to new approaches to reading and bringing together existing Euro-style sources with Northwest Métis oral history. Still, other possibilities remain to be traced via the photographic records often excerpted but not yet fully integrated as means to trace Northwest Métis history. For instance, the Glenbow Archives hold a range of other striking studio photographs of Northwest Métis from the turn of the twentieth century besides Marie Delorme Smith. The portrait sitters' names are often recorded, providing another indirect means to trace trade and travel routes as well as kinship connections.

### ***Reading Indigenous Histories by Indigenous Authors and Contributors***

Now having brought the case study strands back together, it is time to revisit the question of reading and interpreting them. Applying an Indigenous critical theory guide to this task is effective: with it, a reader can appreciate the form of each work, which materials and details Indigenous authors and contributors include and which they do not. Unlike postcolonial theory, which is prone to explaining every adaptation of European techniques to present Indigenous narratives as a response to the colonial centre, the Indigenous critical theory mode guides the reader to engage with Indigenous histories with an open mind. Of course, these histories may be responses to the colonial centre, but the key is to approach them aware that this may be a possibility, not a presumed fact. Nevertheless, Indigenous critical theory does not lead a reader to read with an *unprepared* mind. As the groundwork necessary to undertake the case studies outlined in Chapter Two shows, it is necessary to be aware of basic context to effectively apply Indigenous critical theory. In order to respectfully and accurately read the Haudenosaunee histories, for example, I could not treat them as if they were Northwest Métis or mainstream histories. I had to take steps to learn and appreciate the raw basics of Haudenosaunee epistemology and historical information transmission practices.

For mainstream and non-Haudenosaunee Indigenous readers alike, I must concede that due to how poorly known recent Indigenous history is, let alone the recent Indigenous intellectual tradition, Indigenous critical theory will usually need a mainstream complement. The mainstream mode sections of Chapters Three and Four both engage with the primary sources in a way that prioritizes their linear sequence in order to help the general reader keep oriented. It is critical to learn the context of each of the primary sources, from Howard Adams and Duke Redbird writing in the peak years of the Red Power movement to Barbara Alice Mann and Brian Rice composing their books in the current Indigenous renaissance. Indigenous authors of and contributors to Indigenous histories have had to manage the impact of mainstream epistemologies and the catastrophic impacts of colonialism and socio-cultural disruption. For a deeper reading, we need to try to appreciate how that management affected the shape and content of the resulting histories.

Luckily, preparing our minds to read Indigenous histories does not require a massive project. If we are able to become “familiar with pivotal narratives ‘everybody knows’ about relationships among beings who share responsibility for maintaining the social order,”<sup>1183</sup> the geography of the Indigenous nation, and the context the Indigenous history was composed in, then we are ready to begin.

### ***Conclusion***

Bringing together the Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee case studies has drawn out further detail. After considering some basic comparisons and contrasts, perhaps the most intriguing are the questions of professionalization and place-relating versus space-making approaches to historiography. While it is true that over the period covered by this study, a proportion of

1183 Julie Cruikshank, *The Social Life of Stories: Narrative and Knowledge in the Yukon Territory* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998), 46.

Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis joined the ranks of professional historians in mainstream terms, this has typically been through community-based initiatives. Wright's study describes a top-down process as university-based scholars in English Canada sought to redefine "Canadian history" as narrative and practice into something they controlled. The process and outcomes have a non-coincidental resemblance to the appropriation of Indigenous sports in early nineteenth-century Montréal, analyzed by Gillian Poulter in *Becoming Native in a Foreign Land*. Lacrosse, snowshoeing, and hunting were all taken up by non-Indigenous promoters who took steps to redefine them with new rules, new equipment, and a new image of who the "ideal players" were. The "Canadianized" player or hunter was conspicuously non-Indigenous, requiring money and even social connections to participate.<sup>1184</sup> Certain people deemed "authorities" then sought to impose altered models on others. Of course, professionalizing did not shut down non-Indigenous amateur historians (or sportspeople) any more than Indigenous historians (or sportspeople). But it did make it more difficult for Indigenous historians, in general, to get their writing into print on their own terms and keep it there. Despite the forceful socio-cultural disruption, Haudenosaunee succeeded in maintaining their own systems of training and qualification of their historians. Likewise, Northwest Métis communities have continued building and implementing their own systems of training and qualification of their historians. Northwest Métis founded societies in order to collect and maintain their own archives from the late nineteenth century, initially to counter mainstream portrayals of the Resistance movements, and then to insist on their existence and uniqueness as a people.

The matter of place-relating versus space-making modes drew us to examine again what goes into writing history and what comes from it once released into public spheres. These are shared

1184 Gillian Poulter, *Becoming Native in a Foreign Land: Sport, Visual Culture and Identity in Montréal, 1840-85* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009), 117-162; 163-167.

concerns between Indigenous and non-Indigenous historians who seek to carry out their research and presentations in ethical ways. Indigenous ways of understanding, encoding, and transmitting history include considerable experience and information on accepting and balancing diverse views and interpretations of past events while maintaining the integrity of inherited knowledge.

## Conclusion

### *Revisiting the Main Issues*

With the strands of the Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis case studies drawn back together, it is time to consider at least some of their implications for Indigenous historiography, and the question of how Indigenous approaches to recording, passing down, and using their histories have changed since Europeans came to the Americas. In other words, it is time to return to the main purpose of this thesis and evaluate what the case studies have shown. The historiographic practices of these Indigenous nations have roots in spatialized writing traditions built from narratives of relationships. As Lisa Brooks notes, those relationships are between people, places, humans, and other than human beings.<sup>1185</sup> As the Distant View sections reveal, the original systems of recording and transmitting historical information were interrupted for Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis. In the Haudenosaunee case, this was a disruption to an established historiographic tradition. In the Northwest Métis case, it was a disruption of early development of a new historiographic tradition in an environment characterized by a predominance of Indigenous over European methods. The resulting differences in how they handled the disruptions are instructive. Haudenosaunee communities were able to re-encode portions of their records encoded in objects into European-style forms. Brooks observes that “Birchbark messages became letters and petitions, wampum records became treaties, and journey pictographs became written ‘journals’ that contained similar geographic and relational markers, while histories recorded on birchbark and wampum became written communal

<sup>1185</sup> Lisa Brooks, *The Common Pot: The Recovery of Native Space in the Northeast* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008), 12.

narratives.”<sup>1186</sup> Northwest Métis did not have such established externalized Indigenous records, but like the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, they had long-term close contact with Europeans and their descendants, such that they learned and applied Euro-style writing.

In many places across northern North America, knowledge keepers undertook what can only be called emergency measures to preserve the information they would usually have passed on orally because they could see a great risk of a break in transmission lines. Haudenosaunee knowledge keepers worked with their share of anthropologists on such measures. In Chapter Four, I highlighted examples involving J.N.B. Hewitt and Arthur C. Parker. Yet Haudenosaunee communities on both sides of the Medicine Line did not discontinue the older ways of passing on their history and other information. Individual families persevered in re-instructing youth forced to leave home for schooling or work after they returned home, while further transmission and instruction formed part of political organizing and regular visits for ceremony. Haudenosaunee also had in their favour an organized Confederacy governance structure and a readiness to capitalize on the influence of that government’s system on that of the subsequent United States federal government, as in the great “Haudenosaunee influence controversy,” also discussed in Chapter Four. Early efforts by invaders and later settlers to prove or disprove that influence, and to deny the longevity of Haudenosaunee self-governance before Europeans arrived helped fuel interest in recording and studying their oral traditions.

The situation was quite different for Northwest Métis, as they had to deal with the denial of their existence as a people and had specific desires to counter historical accounts that they could see would not include their perspectives. Prominent Northwest Métis families founded early socio-political organizations like the L’Union Nationale Métisse du Saint-Joseph du Manitoba. In

<sup>1186</sup> Brooks, *The Common Pot*, 13.

turn, this organization founded the earliest Northwest Métis-led archival projects, building a corpus of transcribed interviews from veterans of the Resistance movements of 1869 and 1885, as discussed in Chapter Three. This was the beginning of a trend, as generally, anthropologists had less interest in collecting material from Northwest Métis than from First Nations citizens. Nevertheless, Northwest Métis families who maintained their ties to First Nations kin and their languages successfully kept oral records throughout the early twentieth century when many families on the prairies lived in road allowance communities. An explosion of audio and video interviews of Northwest Métis knowledge keepers began in the later twentieth century, focussing first on people with some personal memory of the Resistance movements.

In both cases, Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis integrated literal representations and recordings of speech into their historiographic process. There has indeed been a shift from using Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis languages to European languages, especially English, for historiographic purposes. This shift to European languages has made it more difficult for younger Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee to access and understand both externalized Indigenous records, such as wampum, and the spoken records carried by knowledge keepers. However, this is hardly the whole story, as Haudenosaunee language revitalization efforts are ongoing, including the Onondaga language documentation project that led to the 1992 edition of the Gibson-Goldenweiser manuscript *Concerning the League* described in Chapter Four.<sup>1187</sup> Members of the Six Nations of the Grand River continue to develop the programs and archives held in the Woodland Cultural Centre. In line with their mandate to undo the harm done by the Mohawk Institute Residential School, they have literally transformed the residential school's

1187 John Arthur Gibson, *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser's Manuscript* (Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992).

former building and grounds. Northwest Métis foundations include the Gabriel Dumont and Louis Riel Institutes discussed in Chapter Three, as well as important projects in partnership with several prairie universities in Canada. Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis efforts to counter negative effects while learning and adapting what was positive and useful has helped fuel the re-expansion of their access to their respective historiographic records in original formats. They have developed new modes of writing historiography that respect and express their values and have won significant (though still contested) space to share their histories and interpretations both within and outside their communities.

These results are the product of significant struggle, and Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis debate their histories and historiography as seriously and fiercely as settlers do their own. Settlers often treat this process as unhealthy or wrong when they observe it, even though when settlers engage in the same types of debate about their histories, they view the process as a healthy necessity. Worse yet, a trend of actively misreading and misconstruing Indigenous histories is still entrenched in most mainstream scholarship. For the Northwest Métis case, some politically savvy settler groups have attempted to claim Northwest Métis identity as part of their efforts to challenge treaty negotiations in eastern Canada.<sup>1188</sup> Haudenosaunee communities have their own conflicts with government challenges to their history, particularly as it pertains to citizenship, governance, and land rights. Various Haudenosaunee scholars, including Audra Simpson and Donna K. Goodleaf,<sup>1189</sup> write about conflicts driven by contested interpretations of the meaning of Haudenosaunee history and culture. Six Nations of the Grand

1188 For an overview of this issue, see Darryl Leroux, *Distorted Descent: White Claims to Indigenous Identity* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2019), 135-176.

1189 Donna K. Goodleaf, *Entering the War Zone: A Mohawk Perspective on Resisting Invasions* (Penticton: Theytus Books Ltd., 1995).

Audra Simpson, *Mohawk Interruptus {Political Life Across the Borders of Settler States}* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014).

River continue the long struggle to win recognition of their land rights, now a three-century-long effort. Haudenosaunee communities affected by imposed provincial, state, and federal boundaries continue to strive for an end to rampant pollution of their lands and a just and sustainable local economy.

Through all of these challenges, Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis alike have known where they are in a vast network of places. For Haudenosaunee, their places are encoded with their history and culture. To travel through and care for those places, as Brian Rice's account of his preparations to write his traditional Rotinoshonni history illustrates so vividly, is to walk in the footsteps of their ancestors. When those Haudenosaunee who fought with the British had to move north, they were not going to unknown places. They were, in fact, returning to well-known hunting grounds, including lands at the Bay of Quinte, a former home of the Peacemaker. Nearly two hundred years prior, the Haudenosaunee who moved to Kahnawà:ke as part of a new Jesuit-run mission were not going to a strange place either – they were re-occupying a storied place. It is all too easy for settlers to underestimate how powerful these land relationships are.

For Northwest Métis emerging from a land already full of people and established places and integrating into pre-existing social networks, learning those places was critically important for subsistence, diplomacy, and trade. Europeans could depend on calling in military or para-military forces to impose their presence once they had strong enough supply lines. Northwest Métis could not behave similarly for reasons of kinship, their smaller numbers, and different expectations of their future with First Nations kin. Not expecting to replace First Nations in their lands nor assuming that Indigenous peoples were doomed to vanish, Northwest Métis needed to learn and maintain relationships and laws consistent with *wahkôtowin* to survive as a people. Knowing the places and the histories encoded in them supported this expectation and continues to do so.

Without those relationships to people, place, and other than human beings, Northwest Métis could not have survived the Road Allowance years of the early to mid-twentieth century.

Adapting Euro-style history-encoding to Indigenous needs is a challenging task that Haudenosaunee citizens first took up to counteract depictions of their nation and “Indians” more generally. It was easy for the earliest settler readers of their work to misunderstand Haudenosaunee history writers and find fault, claiming the Haudenosaunee accounts were mere myths or fables, not histories. Today it is possible to give these early works a much fairer reading, applying the lessons in Haudenosaunee epistemology and rhetoric shared so often by many leaders and knowledge keepers. David Cusick’s modest pamphlet, first described in Chapter Four, and then discussed in greater detail in Chapter Five, is now better appreciated as the pioneering work it was and is, from its status as an early work in English to the incorporation of woodcut illustrations in its later edition.<sup>1190</sup> He started the process of finding a way to make a very different historiographic mode and associated history comprehensible to European newcomers and to adapt the new Euro-style writing to tell Haudenosaunee stories. Table 4 below briefly reprises the key Indigenous and European historiographic concepts considered in this study, summarizing a part of what Cusick and later Elias Johnson had to find a way to harmonize in their publications. Besides carrying out a tremendous labour of translation into English, Cusick also sought to translate Haudenosaunee chronology into a form that Europeans and settler Canadians and Americans could understand. For his chronology translation, Cusick reframed the Haudenosaunee Confederacy’s history in terms of the succession of its Firekeepers, dated relative to the year 1492. Johnson would build on Cusick’s general example of chronological translation, while applying a somewhat different method. Rather than attempt to retroject dates

1190 David Cusick, *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations* (Lockport, N.Y.: Turner and McCollum, 1848).

into deeper Haudenosaunee or Tuscarora history, when his account considers events occurring after the arrival of Europeans, he cites dates from Euro-style written treaties and printed matter by giving the date of the document or else copying a passage from it that refers to a year.<sup>1191</sup>

**Table 4: Summary of key Indigenous and European historiographic concepts.**

<b>Key Indigenous Historiographic Concepts</b>	<b>Key European Historiographic Concepts</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• many histories</li> <li>• both cyclic and linear time</li> <li>• agency of human and other than human beings</li> <li>• where more important than date, chronological order important</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• there is only one overall human history</li> <li>• history has a direction and an end point in human perfection               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• when events happen is more important than where</li> <li>• psychic unity, all humans are basically the same differing only in talent and character</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

In his 1926 *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*,<sup>1192</sup> Arthur C. Parker employed another major transformation to the historical monograph format applied to an Indigenous nation. Whereas earlier authors often reproduced documents verbatim, such as written treaties or the program from a sports day and picnic in James Deer’s account of the Mohawk voyageur contingent’s trip to Egypt,<sup>1193</sup> Parker did not. Instead, he opted for references to written treaties followed by his own commentary on them. Nearly fifty years later, in 1972, an era of primarily “told-to” publications began, including memoirs and recitations from the Condolence Ceremony. Two outliers are by Alma Greene and Enos T. Montour,<sup>1194</sup> not being “told-to” narratives, and both suggesting a certain frustration with Haudenosaunee history as written in English up to the

1191 For example, see Elias Johnson, *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois, or Six Nations, and History of the Tuscarora Indians* (Lockport: Union Printing and Publishing Company, 1881), 23; 67-68; 73-77.

1192 Arthur C. Parker, *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*, *Researches and Transactions of the New York State Archeological Association*, Volume 4, Numbers I-V (Rochester: Lewis H. Morgan Chapter of the New York State Archeological Association, 1926).

1193 James D. Deer, *The Canadian Voyageurs in Egypt* (Montréal: John Lovell and Son, 1885), 25-27.

1194 Alma Greene (Gah-wonh-nos-doh), *Forbidden Voice: Reflections of a Mohawk Indian* (New York: Hamlyn, 1972 [1997]).

Enos T. Montour, *The Feathered U.E.L. ’s: An Account of the Life and Times of Certain Canadian Native People* (Toronto: Division of Communication, United Church of Canada, 1973).

early 1970s. Greene refused to provide a detailed chronology. Montour included years and dates, especially in his accounts of famous Haudenosaunee, while tracing major changes through the lives of a fictional Lenâpé family. By the time of Goodleaf's 1995 *Entering the War Zone*, there was a definite sense that the shape and demands of Euro-style historiography were about to be set into a new relationship to Haudenosaunee criteria. From 2000 to 2018, Haudenosaunee epistemology and understandings informed such historiography. Further, Haudenosaunee languages began to feature in epigraphs, and authors used Haudenosaunee terms to incorporate specific concepts into the narratives that can not be easily translated into English.

Beginning in the late 1960s, Northwest Métis writers pursued a different line of development, first dealing with the overwhelming edifice of mainstream historiography of the Resistance movements. Following the publication of Maria Campbell's 1973 autobiography, Northwest Métis writers turned to the historiography of the catastrophic poverty of not just Northwest Métis in the early twentieth century, but also of many other Indigenous people forced off-reserve by poverty or involuntary enfranchisement. This does not mean that Northwest Métis writers and scholars are not pursuing research and releasing publications on these topics. Rather, they have worked towards a more balanced perspective on those eras, returning them to a broader socio-political setting. By the early 1970s, older historical compositions by Northwest Métis, such as Marie Delorme Smith's memoirs,<sup>1195</sup> were finally reaching print, making a specific approach to historiography visible that follows the practice and teachings associated with *wahkôtownin*. This mode is understandably not yet as developed as its Haudenosaunee counterpart, although its actual and potential effectiveness are already unmistakable. From Diane Payment<sup>1196</sup> and the

1195 Jock Carpenter, *Fifty Dollar Bride: Marie Rose Smith – A Chronicle of Métis Life in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century* (Sidney: Gray's Publishing, 1977).

1196 Diane Paulette Payment, *The Free People – Li Gens Libres: A History of the Métis Community of Batoche, Saskatchewan* (Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2009).

community of Batoche working together from the late 1970s to 2009 to Brenda MacDougall<sup>1197</sup> and the community of Sakitawak (Île à la Crosse) in the early 2000s, tracing the lines of relationship helps unfold and retell complex Northwest Métis histories.

### ***Contributions of This Study***

Given such a broad founding research question, to carry out this project, it was necessary to apply a case study approach, focussing on history writing by Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis authors or contributors in the case of “told-to” narratives. Then the corpus of potential primary sources required further narrowing by considerations of length, accessibility, and respect for Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis cultural protocols. Yet this was, in fact, the second stage of preparation necessary for the eventual close reading and analysis of the primary source corpus. The actual foundation for the study is provided in Chapter Two, which offers an overview of Indigenous historiographic methods primarily in northern North America before the arrival of Europeans, complemented by an introduction to the recent written Indigenous intellectual tradition. Last but not least, it presented the theory and methods I used to support fair and accurate (but not final) readings of the primary sources. Yet all this work would merely be interesting if it did not contribute to the study of Indigenous history more generally.

The study of Indigenous history is vigorous and growing, with highly developed areas pertaining to treaties, traditional land use, traditional knowledge, and land claims, reflecting the urgent practical demands of Indigenous-newcomer relations since the sixteenth century. Other topics have matured more recently, such as examination of the impacts of missionization and new economic relations by Europeans and their descendants throughout the Americas. Indigenous historians have participated as collaborators, primary investigators, and authors in all of these

<sup>1197</sup> Brenda MacDougall, *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010).

themes. They have also provided important critiques and correctives to mainstream approaches to carrying out the research and presentation of the resulting work. However, to date, few scholars have set out to examine Indigenous historiography by Indigenous writers or narrators, or to contextualize them within the recent written Indigenous intellectual tradition. This is consistent with a more general lack of attention to Indigenous non-fiction identified by Robert Allen Warrior, despite its importance since the late eighteenth century.<sup>1198</sup> It is also consistent with the lingering impact of original mainstream assumptions that Indigenous peoples did not and even intellectually could not record, pass down, and interpret their own histories prior to the imposition of European modes of record-making and education. Therefore it was important to address these broader issues as well as the specific area of Indigenous historiography.

Hence this project has presented context, methods, and theory to help recognize Indigenous historiography even when it takes forms and includes materials that are unexpected or unrecognized in academic and mainstream forms of history writing. It has shown how Indigenous peoples already had the means to encode and transmit their histories, as well as an openness to adapting new methods introduced by Europeans in addition to their own, which is demonstrated in this thesis through the Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis case studies. The case studies presented an approach to respectfully reading and interpreting histories based in two representative Indigenous epistemologies. No doubt other approaches are available, but it was important to show that this is not just theoretically possible, but practically possible, fulfilling the secondary purpose of this project. In addition, the case studies provided a specific illustration of the recently written Indigenous history tradition, as Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis writers cited and responded to publications by their predecessors.

1198 Robert Allen Warrior, *The People and the Word: Reading and Native Nonfiction* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), xvi-xvii.

### ***Future Research Possibilities***

This study represents a modest contribution to examining and engaging with Indigenous historiography. From here, an obvious path to take is to carry out more case studies, particularly for Indigenous peoples outside of the primarily eastern and anglophone-impacted regions of northern North America. For many Indigenous peoples, their written and printed history is published primarily in French, and especially Spanish when considering lands to the south and west. If we turn further north, Inuit communities have dealt with a different range of European interlocutors, especially German and Russian traders and missionaries. Which European methods of history encoding different Indigenous peoples adapted varies by choice or necessity. From the Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee case studies alone, there are intriguing hints of how Indigenous epistemologies guide these adaptations. For example, the importance of *wahkôtowin* in Northwest Métis historiography suggests that European methods especially suited to tracing genealogy and the lives and actions of women are favoured over others. In fact, Chapter Three revealed promising hints that Northwest Métis women have played a much greater role in early Northwest Métis historiography than the early focus on famous men of the Resistances suggests.

Another path for future study with much potential is that of studying specifically Indigenous history encoding methods. In a remarkable number of cases, these methods have not been lost despite severe disruptions, and European methods adapted to supplement or translate, rather than replace such practices. Despite finding relevant research and methods for recognition and study of encoded objects and places, I could not pursue this line of inquiry due to space constraints.<sup>1199</sup> The importance of “history in objects” as both a new area of development in mainstream history

1199 See, for example, Lynne Kelly, *Knowledge and Power in Prehistoric Societies: Orality, Memory, and the Transmission of Culture* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2015) and Margo Neale and Lynne Kelly, *Songlines: The Power and the Promise* (Port Melbourne: Thames and Hudson, 2020).

and an Indigenous mode of historiography is further reinforced by the work of Northwest Métis scholars Sherry Farrell Racette and Sharon Blady.<sup>1200</sup> Their research has helped relocate and recognize Northwest Métis material culture items, differentiating beaded and embroidered clothing and footwear made for trade with outsiders from those made for use within home and community. The question of whether these items and analogous ones made by other Indigenous peoples may also encode historical information remains open. That they may in the Haudenosaunee case is shown by the example of Dr. Oronhyatekha's embroidered suit worn for the Prince of Wales' 1860 visit to Grand River.

This project has focussed on historiography encoded in European ways, those favouring words on the page with images and charts in a distant second place. The Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis scholars whose writings are covered here often expressed some level of frustration with the limitations of the medium. From the challenges of translation to recounting history through genres that mainstream mores deem inappropriate at best, fanciful at worst, each writer or collaborator had to find a way to push beyond the Euro-form to something more true to the history they were sharing. These efforts are ongoing, such that there is far more Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee historiography in multi-media formats that have yet to be brought together and studied in a systematic way. There is a remarkably long tradition of studio and home photography, for example, as well as participation in Wild West shows and the movie industry. The unique development of digital archives and portals by Indigenous communities and

1200 Sharon Blady, "The Flower Beadwork People: Factors Contributing to the Emergence of a Distinctive Métis Culture and Artistic Style at Red River From 1844 to 1869" (MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 1995).

Sherry Farrell Racette, "My Grandmothers Loved to Trade: The Indigenization of European Trade Goods in Historic and Contemporary Canada," *Journal of Museum Ethnography* 20 (2008), 69-81.

Sherry Farrell Racette, "Sewing for a Living: The Commodification of Métis Women's Artistic Production," in *Contact Zones: Aboriginal and Settler Women in Canada's Colonial Past*, eds. Katie Pickles and Maya Rutherford (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005), 17-46.

organizations represent yet another area for follow up, not only as projects to document, but also to learn about the challenges of building and maintaining them. Digital assets are notoriously fragile and can be vulnerable to manipulation, similar to oral history. Another research question is whether, and if so, how Indigenous historians adapt techniques for maintaining the fidelity of oral history to digital formats.

### ***Closing Words***

Until recently, the mainstream common sense view held that Indigenous peoples in the Americas had no history prior to the European invasion. This held for centuries despite considerable evidence to the contrary provided by Indigenous representatives as they showed again and again that Indigenous peoples have long held their own robust histories, which they have forever encoded and transmitted. While at first, Europeans were understandably disoriented by the unfamiliar epistemologies and historiographic methods they encountered in Indigenous communities, they later fell back on ethnocentric beliefs that still influence their descendants. Nevertheless, it is possible to overcome the lingering effects of such beliefs because Indigenous historians have continued to encode and transmit Indigenous histories. Despite extreme cultural disruptions, Indigenous intellectual traditions have persisted, and Indigenous peoples have adapted Euro-style historiographic methods while maintaining their own. Furthermore, they have provided the means to recognize and read their histories. This was illustrated by the Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis case studies. Northwest Métis and Haudenosaunee historians found ways to translate their histories, first into European languages and media, then adding support to help non-Indigenous audiences with unfamiliar epistemologies. More recently, Haudenosaunee and Northwest Métis scholars have developed potent forms of syncretic historiography that challenge inaccurate mainstream accounts and encourage more balanced

perspectives. This work is representative of broader trends in history writing by Indigenous scholars throughout northern North America.

## Appendix: Annotated Select Bibliography

### *Haudenosaunee*

#### *Articles*

Brant-Sero, John O. "The Six Nations Indians in the Province of Ontario, Canada." *Transactions of the Wentworth Historical Society* 2 (1899): 62-73.

- An account of the history of the Haldimand Tract granted to the Six Nations, using extracts from written sources such as the Journals of the Assembly of Upper Canada and parliamentary blue books, all to reassure those who doubted there was any deed granting the tract.

— "Some Descendants of Joseph Brant." *Papers and Records of the Ontario Historical Society* 1 (1899): 113-117.

- A genealogical description beginning with Joseph Brant's children, then tracing the generations and children down to 1898, written and published due to their being left out of local histories despite their descent from a prominent British ally.

Hewitt, J.N.B. *Era of the Formation of the Historic League of the Iroquois*. Washington, D.C.: Judd and Detweiler, Printers, 1894. Reprinted from the January 1894 volume of *American Anthropologist*.

- A brief paper attempting to debunk any claims to an early date for the foundation of the Five Nations Confederacy, that members of those nations could or did have any true historical knowledge, or that David Cusick was a historian.

Jemison, G. Peter and Anna M. Schein, Editors. *Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794*. Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000.

- A collection of articles and transcribed speeches by predominantly Haudenosaunee scholars discussing the treaty relationships of the Six Nations with the United States. Includes an appendix reproducing selected documents pertaining to the titular treaty, from its negotiation to ratification.

Parker, Arthur C. "The Origins of the Iroquois as Suggested by Their Archaeology." *American Anthropologist* 18 (1916): 479-507.

- An attempt to reconstruct pre-European Haudenosaunee culture based on materials excavated by Parker himself as well as other archaeologists, followed by a hypothetical reconstruction of a presumed migration of Haudenosaunee ancestors from an area around the mouth of the Ohio River.

### Monographs

Chalmers, Harvey with Ethel B. Monture. *Joseph Brant: Mohawk*. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1955.

- Written in collaboration with Mohawk historian and Brant descendant Ethel Brant Monture, this account of Joseph Brant's life traces his political and military actions and the early history of the Mohawk community he founded in southern Ontario.

Goodleaf, Donna H. *Entering the War Zone: A Mohawk Perspective on Resisting Invasions*. Penticton: Theytus Books Ltd., 1995.

- The earliest Mohawk account of the "Oka Crisis," sketching Kahnesatake's history and social organization and its expression through the actions of the Women's and Men's Societies to block the proposed golf course and the aftermath of the Canadian military operation against them.

Greene, Alma (Gah-wonh-nos-doh). *Forbidden Voice: Reflections of a Mohawk Indian*. New York: Hamlyn, 1972 [1997].

- First published in 1972, Greene combines autobiography with an account of Six Nations history and culture with a view to improving understanding between Native and non-Native communities and maintaining Six Nations knowledge and culture.

Hill, Susan M. *The Clay We Are Made Of: Haudenosaunee Land Tenure on the Grand River*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2017.

- On the surface, a study of land tenure based on oral traditional and written sources, including materials written by Haudenosaunee participants in the struggle to maintain that land tenure. More subtly, a study and explication of Haudenosaunee historical consciousness and knowledge.

Jamieson, Keith and Michell A. Hamilton. *Dr. Oronhyatekha: Security, Justice, and Equality*. Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2016.

- Biography of Dr. Oronhyatekha (Peter Martin), among the first Indigenous physicians in Canada and a prominent Mohawk politician and activist, who, despite his international fame, almost vanished from the historical record.

Johnson, Elias. *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois, or Six Nations, and History of the Tuscarora Indians*. Lockport: Union Printing and Publishing Company, 1881.

- The title suggests a book along the lines of various books of "Indian legends" published in this time period. It is, in fact, Johnson's narrative of Haudenosaunee and Tuscarora history and culture, including reproductions of treaties and segments of relevant articles.

Mann, Barbara Alice. *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas*. New York: Peter Lang, 2000.

- This work details the many roles and duties of Haudenosaunee women by creating a written Haudenosaunee-European dialogue structured by the Haudenosaunee Four Epochs of Time.

— *The Land of the Three Miamis: A Traditional Narrative of the Iroquois in Ohio*. Toledo: Urban Affairs Centre Press, 2006.

- Retells Haudenosaunee history in Ohio through the Four Epochs of Time to impart vital cultural narratives to Mann's granddaughter. In contrast to her previous works, it eschews detailed footnotes or direct engagement with European narratives.

— *George Washington's War on Native America*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008.

- A new account of the 1879-1882 Sullivan-Clinton scorched earth campaign and subsequent attacks on the Six Nations and their neighbours, centring Indigenous perspectives and experiences.

Monture, Rick. *We Share Our Matters = Teionkwakhashion tsi niionkwariho:ten: Two Centuries of Writing and Resistance at Six Nations of the Grand River*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2014.

- A consideration of the philosophies, intellectual traditions, and assertions of sovereignty in the written record of the Six Nations at Grand River, contributing to a growing movement of Haudenosaunee scholars challenging mainstream depictions of their history.

Norton, John. *The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816*. Edited by Carl F. Klinck and James J. Talman. Toronto: The Champlain Society, 1970 and 2011.

- The work of the adopted son of Joseph Brant, in which he describes his trip to visit the Cherokees, analyses the United States' war on the Indigenous nations of the Old Northwest, describes and explores Six Nations culture and history, and recounts his own memoirs from 1807 to 1815.

Parker, Arthur C. *The Code of Handsome Lake, the Seneca Prophet*. Albany: University of the State of New York, 1913.

- The primary topic of this book is the early history and litany of the Handsome Lake, his code, and successors. The rest of the book is concerned with older ceremonies and beliefs that had been maintained despite missionization and Handsome Lake's hostility to many of them.

— *The Constitution of the Five Nations*. Albany: University of the State of New York, 1916a.

- A consolidated version of the Haudenosaunee Great Law, putting together parts from one version compiled and transcribed by Seth Newhouse, the other by the chiefs at Grand River. The result is a controversial retelling of the foundation of the Great Law and Haudenosaunee Confederacy.

— *The Life of General Ely S. Parker: Last Grand Sachem of the Iroquois and General Grant's Military Secretary*. Buffalo: Buffalo Historical Society, 1919.

- Parker's account of the life and times of his great-uncle, who, besides his military exploits, was the first Indigenous Commissioner of Indian Affairs in the United States. It is more than a biography, however, in that Parker explicitly frames it as part of a history of a still extant Indigenous people.

— *The Archaeological History of New York*. Albany: University of the State of New York, 1920.

- A much-extended account of pre-European Haudenosaunee material culture relative to Parker's 1916 article, including short accounts of archaeological type sites by several other

authors. Its audience includes professional archaeologists and people who today are called pot hunters.

— *The History of the Seneca Indians*. Port Washington: Ira J. Friedman, 1926 [1967].

- Drawing together oral, written, and archaeological information, Parker relates a history of his own nation, including the successful Seneca resistance to multiple invasions and the American attempt to force them out of their original homeland.

Rice, Brian. *The Rotinoshonni: A Traditional Iroquoian History Through the Eyes of Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2013.

- Writing from a basis in Rotinoshonni worldview and philosophy, Rice narrates a history through the lives and actions of the Twin Sons of Sky Woman, showing how these past events continue to shape and change present day Rotinoshonni experience.

*Pamphlets (Less than or equal to 100 pages in length.)*

Cusick, David. *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations*. Lewiston: Printed for the Author, 1825 [1827].

— *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations*. Lockport: Turner and McCollum, 1827 [1848].

- As Cusick notes in his short preface, a first written account of Six Nations history prior to the arrival of Europeans, composed from accounts he gathered and translated himself. The second edition has three pages of additional written material and eight woodcuts of his own drawings.

Deer, James D. *The Canadian Voyageurs in Egypt*. Montréal: John Lovell and Son, 1885.

- A contrasting account by one of the Mohawk voyageur crew, who reveals that the experience was not quite as easy for the crew as it was for their foreman Louis Jackson, at least with respect to the voyages to and from Egypt. It is notable that this is a self-published work, printed by John Lovell and Son for Deer.

Jackson, Louis. *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt: A Narrative of What was Seen and Accomplished by the Contingent of North American Voyageurs Who Led the British Boat Expedition for the Relief of Khartoum up the Cataracts of the Nile*. Montréal: W. Drysdale and Co., 1885.

- Jackson's brief account of the experiences of the team of fifty Mohawk voyageurs he led on a trip to Egypt in order to test new boats designed to navigate the Nile cataracts in 1884. The introductory preface by T.S. Brown is an exemplar of casual anti-Indigenous racism and misrecognition.

Jamieson, Julia L. *Echoes of the Past: A History of Education from the Time of the Six Nations Settlement on the Banks of the Grand River in 1784 to 1924*. Brantford: Self-Published, 1969.

- Jamieson documents the history of one of the oldest buildings on the Six Nations reserve, the Old Thomas School House, and summarizes the Grand River community's efforts to provide access to quality education for their children at home.

Jamieson, Keith. *History of Six Nations Education*. Brantford: The Woodland Indian Cultural Education Centre, 1987.

- In many ways an update to the previous entry on education at Six Nations. The post-1924 period chronicles the next phase in the Six Nations struggle to maintain control over elementary education on reserve, including successful resistance to the intentions of the 1951 Indian Act.

Montour, Enos T. *The Feathered U.E.L.'s: An Account of the Life and Times of Certain Canadian Native People*. Toronto: Division of Communication, United Church of Canada, 1973.

- An episodic recounting of the history of the Six Nations of the Grand River through the local Chapel of the Delawares and the fictional Logan family, spanning the years from just after 1812 to the mid 1950s. Focuses on religious conflict, treaties, and Haudenosaunee men's military service with the British.

Moses, Olive, Doris Henhawk, and Lloyd King. *History of Education on the Six Nations Reserve*. Brantford: Woodland Cultural Education Centre, 1987.

- A compilation of original research on children's education at Six Nations together with Julia L. Jamieson's 1969 booklet and an account of the infamous Mohawk Institute, the residential school referred to by former students as "the Mush Hole."

Williams, Eleazer. *Life of Te-ho-ra-gwa-ne-gen: alias Thomas Williams, a Chief of the Caughnawaga Tribe of Indians in Canada*. Albany: J. Munsell, 1859.

- Eleazar Williams is a troubled and troubling narrator, caught up in the contradictions of being selected by non-Indigenous family members to become their idealized Protestant missionary to "the Indians" but unable to counter the racist dynamics of his circumstances. While his narrative strives to recount his father's biography and his military exploits, he also strives to perform for a settler audience, leading his own biography and purported actions to dominate much of the text.

#### *Published Speeches*

Brant-Sero, John O. "Dekanawideh: The Law-Giver of the Caniengahakas." *Man* 1, no. 134(1901): 166-170.

- The transcript of a lecture originally delivered before the British Association for the Advancement of Science, in which after assuring the audience that the Mohawks are the most ancient and honourable of North American Aborigines, briefly describes the Haudenosaunee Great Law.

Hill, Asa R. "The Historical Position of the Six Nations." *Papers and Records of the Ontario Historical Society* 19 (1922): 103-109.

- Originally delivered before the Ontario Historical Society general meeting, Hill briefly recounts the history of the Six Nations-British alliance, including a recital of letters and parts of treaties describing the duties of both parties.

Pierce, Maris Bryant. *Address on the Present Condition and Prospects of the Aboriginal Inhabitants of North America, With Particular Reference to the Seneca Nation*. Philadelphia: J. Richards, Printer, 1839.

- Delivered in 1838 at a Buffalo Baptist church, Bryant used this speech to oppose the Buffalo Creek Treaty using Seneca history and mockery of racist ideas like the inevitable doom of his people and their supposed lack of civilization.

Strong, Nathaniel T. *Appeal to the Christian Community on the Conditions and Prospects of the New York Indians*. Philadelphia: J. Richards, 1839.

- Where Pierce opposed the Buffalo Creek Treaty and the Ogden Land Company pushing for it, Strong worked for the land company while also invoking history and challenging the “doomed Indian trope,” argued that the Senecas couldn't do anything about the treaty anyway.

#### *Theses and Dissertations*

Connelly, Kevin A. “The Textual Function of Onondaga Aspect, Mood, and Tense: A Journey Into Onondaga Conceptual Space.” PhD Dissertation, Cornell University, 1999.

- An in-depth study of his community’s language with a view to supporting language retention. It includes important discussions of Haudenosaunee epistemology and a careful linguistic and thematic analysis of the orally transmitted narrative *Tall Corn*.

Doxtator, Deborah. “What Happened to the Iroquois Clans? A Study of Clans in Three Nineteenth Century Rotinohsyonni Communities.” PhD Dissertation, University of Western Ontario, 1996.

- Examines the impact on the people of the imposition of reserves on the Mohawk community of Tyendinaga, Six Nations of the Grand River, and the Tonawanda Seneca in New York State. Doxtator carried out her analysis by applying the “Rotinohsyonni metaphor of two sides.”

#### *“Told-To” Narratives*

Blacksnake, Governor. *Chainbreaker: The Revolutionary War Memoirs of Governor Blacksnake as Told to Benjamin Williams*. Edited by Thomas S. Abler. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989 [2005].

- An unusual “told to” narrative for one transcribed in the mid to late 19<sup>th</sup> century in that both speaker and amanuensis were Indigenous. Seneca Chief Blacksnake dictated his memoirs to Benjamin Williams, describing a key period, including the founding of the Longhouse Religion.

Canfield, William W. *The Legends of the Iroquois: Told By “The Cornplanter.”* New York: A. Wessels Company, 1902.

- An example of marketing, romanticization, and garbling together of unrelated traditions in a “told-to” anthology gone wrong. It heralds a near-total end to collaborations between amateur historians and anthropologists.

Gibson, John Arthur. *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser’s Manuscript*. Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992.

- The Onondaga are the official wampum keepers, that is, historians of the Haudenosaunee, and this Onondaga language version of the founding of the Haudenosaunee confederacy was transcribed and finally published complete in that Iroquoian language in the 20<sup>th</sup> century.

Hale, Horatio. *The Iroquois Book of Rites*. Philadelphia: D.G. Brinton, 1883.

- The product of Hale's transcription of several books themselves transcribed from texts written by Haudenosaunee Condoled Chiefs by younger men in the community: J.S. Johnson (later a Condoled Chief himself), John Green, and Daniel La Fort. The introduction includes a précis of Six Nations history based on Morgan, noting their connections to the Moundbuilders.

Morgan, Lewis Henry. *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*. Rochester: Sage, 1851.

- The (in)famous first non-Indigenous account of the Six Nations, based on Morgan's work with Ely S. Parker, whose biography is referenced above. It is more ethnographic in emphasis than a typical history, and does not include a complete account of the Great Law.

Newhouse, Seth; revised by Chief Jacob Thomas. *The Constitution of the Confederacy by the Peacemaker*. Wilsonville: Sandpiper Press, 1989.

- An updated translation of Mohawk Seth Newhouse's account of the Haudenosaunee Great Law, originally collected by Arthur C. Parker. It focuses on the structure, ceremonies, and laws encompassed by the Great Law, illustrated by relevant wampum belts and strings.

Rickard, Clinton. *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973.

- Another example of intertwined autobiography and history recounted by prominent Chief and activist Clinton Rickard. He lays out the complex interrelations between the Tuscarora and the Haudenosaunee Confederacy and their ability to overcome interference from colonial officials.

Scott, Duncan C. (Editor). *Traditional History of the Confederacy of the Six Nations, Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada*. Ottawa: Royal Society of Canada, 1911.

- In 1900 the Six Nations council sat down to record the history of their Confederacy. The context of this telling is crucial: they were engaged in the late stages of a running fight to prevent the Canadian federal government from using force to try to shut down their government.

## Northwest Métis

### Articles

Devine, Heather. "New Light on the Plains Métis: The Buffalo Hunters of Pembina, 1870 – 1871." In *The Long Journey of a Forgotten People: Métis Identities and Family Histories*, edited by Ute Lischke and David T. McNab, 197-218. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2007.

- An account of the rediscovery and authentication of an account of the Pembina brigade known as the Keeney manuscript, potentially adding to a considerable collection of materials on Métis bison hunting. The authenticity of the Keeney manuscript remains in question.

Dickason, Olive Patricia. "Old World Laws and New World Political Realities." In *Expressions in Canadian Native Studies*, edited by Ron F. Laliberte, Priscilla Settee, James B. Waldram, Rob Innes, Brenda MacDougall, Lesley McBain, and F. Laurie Barron, 147-162. Saskatoon: University Extension Press, 2000.

- Traces how European powers redefined the terms of their own laws until the invasion of Indigenous lands and imposition of imperial control over them was no longer questionable but ostensibly legal and necessary.

Dorion, Leah. "Are the Métis a Western Canadian Phenomenon? A Case Study of the Dorion Trading Family." In *Metis Legacy*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, 115-126. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.

- A careful genealogy-based study of the author's family, at first to answer her own question about the origins of the name "Dorion," then to challenge the "conventional Métis family" model typically enshrouded in Canadian historical and anthropological writing to the time of writing.

Dorion, Leah and Darren R. Préfontaine. "Deconstructing Métis Historiography." In *Metis Legacy*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, 13-36. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.

- The first Métis-specific examination of historical works written about Métis, arguing that most of these have been, at best incomplete and often abusively biased. The authors then deconstruct the biases and outline the results of newer Métis historical writing, including by Métis themselves.

Dorion, Leah, R.D. (Dick) Garneau, Margaret Gross, and Lawrence Barkwell. "Alberta Métis Leaders." In *Metis Legacy*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, 105-114. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.

- A chronological series of biographies of male Alberta Métis leaders from the late nineteenth to the late twentieth centuries, emphasizing how they facilitated Métis self-government and improved living conditions for both Métis and "non-status Indians."

Dunn, Martin F. "All My Relations – The Other Métis." Discussion Paper for the Métis Circle Special Consultation of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (March 1994), posted to *The Other Metis*. <https://web.archive.org/web/20080305050630/http://www.othermetis.net/Papers/CircleTxt/CrcToc.html> (accessed October 14, 2019).

- In an early attempt to tease apart the confusion propagated by federal and provincial governments about who is “Métis” across Canada, Dunn brings together capsule histories of Northwest Métis and “Métis-like” communities to demonstrate their diversity and different ethnogeneses.

Evans, Mike, Jean Barman, and Gabrielle Legault with Erin Dolmage and Geoff Appleby. “Métis Networks in British Columbia: Examples from the Central Interior.” In *Contours of a People: Metis Family, Mobility, and History*, edited by Nicole St-Onge, Carolyn Podruchny, and Brenda MacDougall, 330-367. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2012.

- Another publication in an ongoing research project intended to document the existence of Métis communities in British Columbia, their histories, and their connections to the historic Métis Nation east of the Rocky Mountains.

Lamirande, Todd. “Resistance Activist Elzéar Goulet.” In *Metis Legacy*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, 79-92. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.

- An account of the death of Elzéar Goulet, lynched by a mob of Ontario Orangemen for his role in the tribunal that condemned Thomas Scott. Unlike the still regularly retold and contested story of the death of Thomas Scott, Goulet’s death is rarely discussed.

MacDougall, Brenda and Nicole St-Onge. “Rooted in Mobility: Metis Buffalo-Hunting Brigades.” *Manitoba History* 71 (2013): 21-32.

- A tracing of the development of the Northwest Métis sociocultural networks famous for the bison hunts and in time other political and economic movements. The analysis combines genealogy and mapping to reconstruct change that happened primarily away from European settlements.

McArthur, Patsy. “‘Where the White Dove Flew Up’: The Saguingue Métis Community and the Fur Trade at Southampton on Lake Huron.” In *The Long Journey of a Forgotten People: Métis Identities and Family Histories*, edited by Ute Lischke and David T. McNab, 329-348. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2007.

- A summary of Saguingue Métis community history in the fur trade by tracing major families and their persistence there and in the Northwest Métis homeland more generally to the present. Saguingue is an ancient meeting place that became a popular fur trade retirement place.

— “Some Historic Saugeen Métis Families and the Significance of Genealogy: Detroit River and Goderich Area.” In *Indigenous Voices and Spirit Memory*, by David T. McNab, Ute Lischke, Patsy McArthur, Paul-Emile A. McNab, Maureen Riche, Katie Peterson, and Stephanie McLachlan, 21-27. Winnipeg: Aboriginal Issues Press, 2013.

- Covers just what the title says, including showing that French and Halfbreeds were differentiated communities at Saugeen. Argues that genealogy is an important tool for challenging traditional histories that elide Métis communities in southern Ontario.

McNab, David T. “Voices and Spirit Memory in the Journals of Ezhaaswe (c. 1848 – 1929), Indian Missionary.” In *Indigenous Voices and Spirit Memory*, by David T. McNab, Ute

Lischke, Patsy McArthur, Paul-Emile A. McNab, Maureen Riche, Katie Peterson, and Stephanie McLachlan, 1-10. Winnipeg: Aboriginal Issues Press, 2013.

- Sketches in broad strokes the life and work of Indigenous missionary Ezhaaswe based on his journals, which he wrote in English, although he spoke and preached primarily in Ojibwa. An example of a major topic area for Métis historians when not writing their own history.

— “Some Reflections on the Making of Legend and Memory (2002): Indigenous Voices in Film.” In *Indigenous Voices and Spirit Memory*, by David T. McNab, Ute Lischke, Patsy McArthur, Paul-Emile A. McNab, Maureen Riche, Katie Peterson, and Stephanie McLachlan, 39-47. Winnipeg: Aboriginal Issues Press, 2013.

- A retrospective on the production of a one-hour documentary on Indigenous histories in Ontario, emphasizing the importance of exploring Indigenous histories in place with Indigenous authorities speaking in their own right.

McNab, Paul-Emile A. “The Memory of Miikaans: Little Roads, Paths Within the Bkejwanong First Nations Territory.” In *Indigenous Voices and Spirit Memory*, by David T. McNab, Ute Lischke, Patsy McArthur, Paul-Emile A. McNab, Maureen Riche, Katie Peterson, and Stephanie McLachlan, 29-38. Winnipeg: Aboriginal Issues Press, 2013.

- An ethnohistorical report on Indigenous trails and the effects of the imposition of colonial roads at the monetary and land expense of Bkejwanong, demonstrating a shift from allowing such documents to remain in the relatively inaccessible realm of “grey literature.”

North Slave Métis Alliance. “Strong Like Two People: North Slave Métis History.” In *Metis Legacy*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, 135-156. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.

- The coverage of Northwest Métis history in the North Slave region remains thin despite this article, which focuses on emphasizing that the North Slave Métis were and are not a static people, but are “characterized by change, adaptation, dispersal, consolidation, and cultural persistence.”

Racette, Sherry Farrell. “Beads, Silk, and Quills: The Clothing and Decorative Arts of the Metis.” In *Metis Legacy*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, 181-188. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.

- Effectively a starter’s guide in how to recognize Northwest Métis material culture items held in museums and private collections, then connect the goods used to make them back to Métis women. Then how to trace from the Métis women to their independent trade interests and their powerful influence on Métis and plains visual culture.

— “Sewing For a Living: The Commodification of Métis Women’s Artistic Production.” In *Contact Zones: Aboriginal and Settler Women in Canada’s Colonial Past*, edited by Katie Pickles and Maya Rutherford, 17-46. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005.

- Examines Northwest Métis women’s economic roles from the fur trade to the twentieth century, demonstrating how their labour was and is critical in supporting their families, creating a unique material record of their participation in a changing economy.

Teillet, Jean. "The Winds of Change: Métis Rights After *Powley*, *Taku*, and *Haida*." In *The Long Journey of a Forgotten People: Métis Identities and Family Histories*, edited by Ute Lischke and David T. McNab, 55-78. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2007.

- Paraphrasing Teillet's excellent summary, this article recounts the historical relationship between the Métis and the Crown up to 2003, then considers the implications of the judgements handed down by the Canadian Supreme Court in that year in *R. v. Powley* and *R. v. Blais*.

#### *Autobiography*

Campbell, Maria. *Halfbreed*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1973 [2019].

- Originally published in 1973 after severe editing to remove historical material, Maria Campbell's account of her early life from her childhood in a Saskatchewan road allowance community to struggling to survive on the streets of downtown Vancouver. This is the updated edition that restores three additional pages removed by the publisher because they showed the RCMP in a poor light.

#### *Monographs*

Adams, Howard. *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867: The Roots of Separatism*. Montreal: Harvest House, 1968.

- A narrative of the origins and early history of separate education systems in Upper and Lower Canada prior to Confederation, including criticism of religious influence on it. As uncompromisingly blunt as any of Adams' later publications, it is saddled with a racist and undermining forward.

— *Prison of Grass: Canada from the Native Point of View*. Toronto: New Press, 1975.

- An intertwining of autobiographical and Indigenous historical narrative tracing the advent and development of colonialism and racism in Canada, applying frameworks from Marx's analysis of capitalism and Fanon's analysis of racism.

— *Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization*. Penticton: Theytus Books, 1999.

- Applying his distinctive mode of historical description and critique with illustrations from his own experience, Adams sets out to narrate the history of colonization in Canada from an Indigenous point of view and break down the claims and structures of Eurocentric history.

Anderson, Dr. Anne. *The First Métis... A New Nation*. Edmonton: UvicSCO Press, 1985.

- A sketch in broad strokes of Northwestern Métis history, focussing on the region roughly circumscribed by Edmonton, Grande Cache, and the Red Deer River. Traces the familial and trade connections between Northwest Métis, Plains Cree, and Iroquois-Cree communities.

Carpenter, Jock. *Fifty Dollar Bride: Marie Rose Smith – A Chronicle of Métis Life in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century*. Sidney: Gray's Publishing, 1977.

- A biography built up from a combination of Marie Rose Smith's own writing in articles and her diary, together with materials drawn from stories recounted by Smith's children. She witnessed the shift in settler views of "mixed race marriages" and lived through the socioeconomic effects of it.

Chartrand, Larry N., Tricia E. Logan, and Judy D. Daniels. *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools*. Ottawa: Aboriginal Healing Foundation, 2006.

- A brief description of the experiences of Métis caught up in the residential school system, including the specifics of how they came to be there and the difficulties they experienced, from abuse within the schools to disbelief that they could have had such experiences.

Devine, Heather. *The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660-1900*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004.

- An account of Northwest Métis ethnogenesis and history via the example of a single family, based solely on written primary and secondary documents. Revised from Devine's dissertation, completed at the Department of History and Classics at the University of Alberta in 2001.

Dickason, Olive Patricia. *The Myth of the Savage and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1984 [1997].

- A study of French responses to the various Amerindian societies they encountered on coming to the Americas, while debunking the assumptions that those societies were crueller or less sophisticated than their European counterparts and such images as the "noble savage."

— *Canada's First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992 [2002].

- In many ways, this is the mirror image of Dickason's first book in that instead of tracing French or other European responses and histories, she traces their Amerindian counterparts. Ranging across all North America and then narrowing to Canada, her account combines oral and written sources.

Evans, Mike and Lisa Krebs with John Eagle, Bob Parris, and Heidi Standeven. *A Brief History of the Short Life of the Island Cache*. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2004.

- A project applying a community research model in order to reconstruct the lost physical community of Island Cache. It is based first on interviews with community members, plus interviews with non-Métis involved with the Island Cache, and archival documentation.

Evans, Mike, Marcelle Gareau, Lisa Krebs, Leona Neilson, and Heidi Standeven. *What It Is to Be a Métis: The Stories and Recollections of the Elders of the Prince George Métis Elder Society*. Prince George: UNBC Press, 2007.

- One of many recent publications documenting historic Métis communities in BC combining elder interviews and documentation from settler and Métis sources. They challenge claims that Métis had no long-term relationships with land and peoples west of the Rockies.

Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935. *Mark of the Métis: Traditional Knowledge and Stories of the Métis People of Northeastern Alberta*. Altona: Friesens, 2012.

- A publication carrying out three purposes: to record the history and culture of the Northeastern Alberta Métis, make the history visible to non-Métis, and facilitate the transmission of this information to the grandchildren and future descendants of the participating elders.

Goulet, George and Terry. *The Métis of British Columbia: From Fur Trade Outposts to Colony*. Calgary: Fabjob Inc., 2008.

- A popular history of emphasizing the presence over time of Northwest Métis in British Columbia, positioning them as nation- and province-builders in a form of “great personage history” based primarily on primary and secondary sources.

Lavallée, Guy. *The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba: Their Life and Stories, 1920-1988*. Winnipeg: Self-Published, 2003.

- Built up from Lavallée’s thesis, itself characterized as an introductory ethnography, completed at the Department of Anthropology at the University of Alberta in 1988. Combines oral and primary source materials.

MacDougall, Brenda. *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010.

- Applying a combination of digital tools to map complex Métis genealogies and the Métis-Cree concept of *wahkootowin*, MacDougall examines the development of the Métis community of Île-à la Crosse. This study complements Devine’s earlier study of the ethnogenesis of one Métis family.

McNab, David T. *Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario*. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1999.

- Documents the difficult relations between Indigenous peoples and the Ontario provincial government, starting with a chapter on the Métis who were recognized as Indigenous, denied, then recognized again. The rest of the book focuses on First Nations’ experiences.

— *No Place for Fairness: Indigenous Land Rights and Policy in the Bear Island Case and Beyond*. Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2009.

- A chronicle of the legal battles and negotiations impacting the Indigenous places of Bear Island and Toronto, based on McNab’s own experiences and related documentation from the Ontario department of Indigenous affairs between 1979 and 1991.

Payment, Diane Paulette. *Batoche (1870-1910)*. Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 1983.

- Payment’s first rendition of the early Northwest Métis history of Batoche, Saskatchewan. Revised from her 1982 thesis completed at the University of Ottawa, it lacks the tell-tale subtitle of its original, which in translation is “Profile of a Métis Community Birth – Expansion – Decline.”

Rivard, Ron and Catherine Littlejohn. *The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch*. Saskatoon: Self-Published, 2003.

- Siting Willow Bunch as one Northwest Métis community in a network of many throughout western Canada founded in the mid to late 19<sup>th</sup> century and surviving to the present, Rivard and Littlejohn describe its 20<sup>th</sup> century history using primary sources, mainly newspapers.

*Pamphlets (Less than or equal to 100 pages in length.)*

Daniels, Harry W. *We Are the New Nation: The Métis and National Native Policy*. Ottawa: Native Council of Canada, 1979.

- Presentations to various federal and Native organizations in which Daniels lays out a Métis counter-history of Canada and argues for the recognition of the Indigenous rights of both Métis and non-Status Indians.

Dumont, Gabriel. *Gabriel Dumont Speaks*, Revised Edition. Vancouver: Talonbooks, 2009.

- A version of Dumont's second set of memoirs, translated and restructured by Michael Barnholden. It is arranged such that it focuses on the aftermath of the nineteenth century Northwest Métis resistance movements.

Redbird, Duke. *We Are Métis: A Métis View of the Development of a Native Canadian People*. Toronto: Ontario Métis and Non Status Indian Association, 1980.

- Redbird outlines Northwest Métis history from the mid-1600s to 1980 with a view to demonstrating Métis indigeneity and role as founders of Canadian confederation. Revised from his 1978 interdisciplinary studies thesis completed at York University.

Verbicky, Eleanor, editor. *Life and Times of the Métis: A History of Caslan Métis Settlement*. Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Métis Settlement Associations, 1984.

- Another in the series of several Alberta Metis settlement histories written and compiled from elder interviews in the early 1980s, and partially funded by the provincial government as it prepared to commemorate the province's 80<sup>th</sup> year. Caslan is now called Buffalo Lake.

*Pamphlet "Told-To" Narratives (Less than or equal to 100 pages in length.)*

Brissenden, Constance, editor. *Memories of a Metis Settlement: Eighty Years of East Prairie Metis Settlement, With Firsthand Memories, 1939 to Today*. Penticton: Theytus Books, 2018.

- Among the latest of Alberta Métis Settlement histories composed from elder interviews under the direction of a community leader or professional hired by the community. Like its predecessors, focuses primarily on social and cultural history after a brief overview of the late 1800s – 1900s.

Supernault, Carol, Mary Auger, Marcella Cunningham, and Velma Bellerose. *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979: 40 Years of Determination*. Place of publication and publisher not indicated, 1979.

- The original account of East Prairie Settlement published for the settlement's 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary, focussing specifically on the founding and development of the settlement in terms of social and cultural change, with minor reference to political matters.

Campbell, Craig, Alice Boucher, Mike Evans, Emma Faichney, Howard La Corde, and Zachary Powder (Presenters). *Mihkwâkamiwi sîpîsis – Stories and Pictures from Metis Elders in Fort McKay*. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2005.

- Features the memories of four participating Metis elders whose words are presented with little direct editorial intervention. Instead, their words are framed but not necessarily directly illustrated by community photographs and brief historical comments by the presenters.

Gift Lake Settlement. *Mud Roads and Strong Backs: The History of the Métis Settlement of Gift Lake*. Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Métis Settlement Associations, 1984.

- One of several Alberta Metis settlement histories written and compiled from elder interviews in the early 1980s, and partially funded by the provincial government as it prepared to commemorate the province's 80<sup>th</sup> year.

Horstman, Louise and David May, eds. *Tired of Rambling: A History of Fishing Lake Metis Settlement*. Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Metis Settlement Associations, 1982.

- Another of several Alberta Metis settlement histories, written and compiled from elder interviews in the early 1980s, and partially funded by the provincial government as it prepared to commemorate the province's 80<sup>th</sup> year.

Jackknife, Albina. *Elizabeth Metis Settlement: A Local History*. Altona: Friesen Printers, 1977.

- An edited collection of interviews with Elizabeth Settlement Elders carried out by summer students Rosemarie Desjarlais, Kathy Jackknife, and Maureen Lepine. Their focus is a comparison and contrast of Métis life and culture between the settlement's foundation and its late 1970s present.

Miller, Bill. Editor. *Our Home: A History of Kikino Metis Settlement*. Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Metis Settlements, 1984.

- Yet another of the several Alberta Metis settlement histories written and compiled from elder interviews in the early 1980s, and partially funded by the provincial government as it prepared to commemorate the province's 80<sup>th</sup> year.

Supernault, Carol. *East Prairie Metis, 1939 to 1979, Forty Years of Determination*. Canada: Publisher Not Indicated, 1979.

- The original edition of the East Prairie Métis history edited by Brissenden, noted above. Like its updated counterpart, it combines a brief history with biographies and illustrations from oral history interviews, alongside a selection of photographs.

#### *Published Speeches*

Dickason, Olive Patricia. "Out of the Bush: A Journey to A Dream." In *The Long Journey of a Forgotten People: Métis Identities and Family Histories*, edited by Ute Lischke and David T. McNab, 1-13. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2007.

- The keynote speech for the 2003 Métis Symposium held at Carleton University titled "The Métis, Canada's Forgotten People: The Years of Achievement?" Dickason reflects on her personal and scholarly journey, paralleling it to that of Indigenous peoples in Canada.

Dunn, Martin F. "The Unwritten History of Métis Nationhood." Presentation to the Conference of the History of First Nations, University of Ottawa (1998), posted to *The Other Metis*. <https://web.archive.org/web/20051028040853/http://www.othermetis.net/Papers/Unwritten/UnwritTOC.html> (accessed October 14, 2019).

- Dunn's carefully argued and documented challenge to four assumptions "upon which the academic history of Canada has been based," with emphasis on his point that Confederation was a betrayal of Indigenous peoples overall and Métis in particular.

### *Theses and Dissertations*

Blady, Sharon. "The Flower Beadwork People: Factors Contributing to the Emergence of a Distinctive Métis Culture and Artistic Style at Red River From 1844 to 1869." MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 1995.

- A social history of the Red River Métis community, as traced through women's distinctive bead and other artwork. Now published as a monograph by Gabriel Dumont Institute Press with illustrations by Sherry Farrell Racette.

Chrétien, Anne. "'Mattawa, Where the Waters Meet': The Question of Identity In Métis Culture." MA Thesis, University of Ottawa, 1996.

- An early thesis considering the question of Métis identity in Ontario, in this case the Mattawa region in the furthest northeastern point of what is often considered Métis traditional lands. Since Métis in this region did not conflict militarily with settlers, Chrétien considers the role of music as a means of expressing Métis identity and community cohesion.

Denis, Chantal Roy. "Wolf Lake: The Importance of Métis Connection to Land and Place." MA Thesis, University of Alberta, 2017.

- Brings together written and graphic documents in an exploration of Métis territoriality through the example of the disbanded Métis settlement of Wolf Lake, Alberta. She traces its origins as a regular hivernant site, transformation into a permanent settlement under colonial pressure, and then official deletion in favour of the Primrose Weapons Range.

Gaudry, Adam. "*Kaa-tipeyimishoyaahk* – 'We Are Those Who Own Ourselves': A Political History of Métis Self-Determination in the North-West, 1830-1870." PhD Dissertation, University of Victoria, 2014.

- Applies the concepts of *kaa-tipeyimishoyaahk* and *wahkohtowin* in an analysis of the history of nineteenth century Métis political thought and how Métis applied this thinking to resisting colonial governance.

LeClair, Carol. "Métis Environmental Knowledge: *La Tayr Pi Tout Li Mond*." PhD Dissertation, York University, 2003.

- Analyses Métis concepts of ecological practice in order to create a model for their translation from Michif to English. Examines Métis identity and understandings of *kawayahshk*, the Michif term LeClair uses to refer to "the study of coherence in communities," including both human and other than human beings.

MacDougall, Brenda. "Socio-Cultural Development and Identity Formation of Métis Communities in Northwestern Saskatchewan, 1776-1907." PhD Dissertation, University of Saskatchewan, 2005.

- The precursor study to MacDougall's monograph *One of the Family*.

Pelletier, Jacqueline Margaret. "The First of All Things: The Significance of Place in Métis Histories and Communities in the Qu'Appelle Valley, Saskatchewan." MA Thesis, University of Alberta, 2006.

- Explores the ways in which Métis are connected to places via such means as elders retelling stories, direct experience via repeated visits, and sharing of such stories and places within kinship networks. Uses the example of her own extended family in the Qu'Appelle Valley, Saskatchewan.

Racette, Sherry Farrell. "Sewing Ourselves Together: Clothing, Decorative Arts, and the Expression of Metis and Half Breed Identity." PhD Dissertation, University of Manitoba, 2004.

- An interdisciplinary reconstruction of Métis clothing and decorative arts, differentiating them from articles created and traded by members of other Indigenous communities. Includes a reconstruction of Métis women's independent trade interests and labour commodification.

Troupe, Cheryl Lynn. "Métis Women: Social Structure, Urbanization and Political Activism, 1850-1980." MA Thesis, University of Saskatchewan, 2009.

- Combining interviews and written sources, Troupe reconstructs how Métis women in southern Saskatchewan brought nineteenth century Métis concepts of family and community into Saskatoon urban development, governance and organizing after 1930.

#### "Told-To" Narratives

Charette, Guillaume. *L'Espace de Louis Goulet*. Editions Bois Brûlés: Winnipeg, 1976.

— *Vanishing Spaces: Memoirs of Louis Goulet*. Translated by Ray Ellenwood. Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 2004.

- Goulet describes the mixed economy and daily life of Northwest Métis during the forced transition from a bison-hunting economy to his original interlocutor, Guillaume Charette. The translator has suggested that the result is Charette's novel, not Goulet's memoir.

Littlejohn, Catherine. *Métis Soldiers of Saskatchewan 1914-1953*. Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2012.

- A community-based history including extensive primary and secondary source research of Saskatchewan Métis who served in World Wars I and II and the Korean war. Besides summarizing their service, Littlejohn chronicles their struggles to access veterans' benefits and healthcare.

Payment, Diane Paulette. *Batoche (1870 – 1910)*. Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 1983.

- Revised from Payment's 1982 MA thesis, recounting the development and persistence of the southern Saskatchewan Métis centre of Batoche. She follows its economic changes, break with the Catholic church in favour of self-government, and recovery after the (in)famous battle in 1885.

— *"The Free People – Otipemisiwak" Batoche, Saskatchewan 1870-1930*. Ottawa: National Parks and Sites Park Service Environment Canada, 1990.

- Reconstructing the history of the Batoche community from its origins in Northwest Métis chain migration to the early twentieth century, Payment challenges conventional narratives of Northwest Métis as yet another dying race whose traditional culture is simply a form of poverty. The text is built around the translated chapters of 1983's *Batoche (1870-1910)*.

— *The Free People – Li Gens Libres: A History of the Métis Community of Batoche, Saskatchewan*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2009.

- The second edition of the 1990 publication significantly expanded with new documentation from oral histories and expanded sections on Métis historiography by both settler and Métis authors and a reconsideration of her methodology.

Vermette, Auguste. *Au temps de la Prairie: L’histoire des Métis l’Ouest canadien racontée par Auguste Vermette, neveu de Louis Riel*. Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 2000.

- An episodic account of Northwest Métis history collected by Marcien Ferland. Ferland’s preface emphasizes the philological and ethnographic value of Vermette’s memoirs, while suggesting that Vermette is truthful but partial.

Zeilig, Ken and Victoria Zeilig (Transcribers). *Ste Madeleine, Community Without a Town: Métis Elders in Interview*. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, Inc., 1997.

- The product of an oral history project, the title is appropriately ambiguous. The Elders weave together a narrative of a community’s persistence as such despite the literal loss of their place, their original houses and farms. But in the end, the Elders’ shared interest is in narrating the origins and fate of the Ste. Madeleine Church.

## Bibliography

### Primary Sources

- Adams, Howard. *The Education of Canadians 1800 – 1867: The Roots of Separatism*. Montreal: Harvest House, 1968.
- \_\_\_ *Prison of Grass: Canada from the Native Point of View*. Toronto: New Press, 1975.
- \_\_\_ *Prison of Grass: Canada from a Native Point of View*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition. Saskatoon: Fifth House Publishers, 1989.
- \_\_\_ *Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization*. Penticton: Theytus Books, 1995.
- \_\_\_ *Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition. Penticton: Theytus Books, 1999.
- Andersen, Chris. “Métis” Race, Recognition, and the Struggle for Indigenous Peoplehood. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014.
- Anderson, Dr. Anne. *The First Métis... A New Nation*. Edmonton: Uvisco Press, 1985.
- Blacksnake, Governor. *Chainbreaker: The Revolutionary War Memoirs of Governor Blacksnake as Told to Benjamin Williams*. Edited by Thomas S. Abler. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989 [2005].
- Brissenden, Constance, editor. *Memories of a Metis Settlement: Eighty Years of East Prairie Metis Settlement, with Firsthand Memories, 1939 to Today*. Penticton: Theytus Books, 2018.
- Campbell, Craig, Alice Boucher, Mike Evans, Emma Faichney, Howard La Corde, and Zachary Powder (Presenters). *Mihkwâkamiwi sîpîsis – Stories and Pictures from Metis Elders in Fort McKay*. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2005.
- Canfield, William W. *The Legends of the Iroquois: Told By “The Cornplanter.”* New York: A. Wessels Company, 1902.
- Carpenter, Jock. *Fifty Dollar Bride: Marie Rose Smith – A Chronicle of Métis Life in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century*. Sidney: Gray’s Publishing, 1977.
- Chalmers, Harvey with Ethel B. Monture. *Joseph Brant: Mohawk*. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1955.
- Charette, Guillaume. *L’Espace de Louis Goulet*. Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 1976.
- \_\_\_ *Vanishing Spaces: Memoirs of Louis Goulet*. Translated by Ray Ellenwood. Winnipeg: Editions Bois Brûlés, 1980 [2004].
- Chartrand, Larry N., Tricia E. Logan, and Judy D. Daniels. *Métis History and Experience and Residential Schools*. Ottawa: Aboriginal Healing Foundation, 2006.
- Daniels, Harry W. *We are the New Nation: The Metis and National Native Policy*. Ottawa: Native Council of Canada, 1979.

- Devine, Heather. *The People Who Own Themselves: Aboriginal Ethnogenesis in a Canadian Family, 1660-1900*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004.
- Dickason, Olive Patricia. *The Myth of the Savage and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1984 [1997].
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Canada's First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992 [2002].
- Evans, Mike and Lisa Krebs with John Eagle, Bob Parris, and Heidi Standeven. *A Brief History of the Short Life of Island Cache*. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2004.
- Evans, Mike, Marcelle Gareau, Lisa Krebs, Leona Neilson, and Heidi Standeven. *What it is to be a Métis: The Stories and Recollections of the Elders of the Prince George Métis Elder Society*. Prince George: UNBC Press, 2007.
- Fort McMurray Métis Local 1935. *Mark of the Métis: Traditional Knowledge and Stories of the Métis People of Northeastern Alberta*. Altona: Friesens, 2012.
- Gibson, John Arthur. *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser's Manuscript*. Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992.
- Gift Lake Settlement. *Mud Roads and Strong Backs: The History of the Métis Settlement of Gift Lake*. Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Métis Settlement Associations, 1984.
- Goodleaf, Donna K. *Entering the War Zone: A Mohawk Perspective on Resisting Invasions*. Penticton: Theytus Books Ltd., 1995.
- Goulet, George and Terry Goulet. *The Métis in British Columbia: From Fur Trade Outposts to Colony*. Calgary: Fabjob, Inc., 2008.
- Greene, Alma (Gah-wonh-nos-doh). *Forbidden Voice: Reflections of a Mohawk Indian*. New York: Hamlyn, 1972 [1997].
- Hale, Horatio. *The Iroquois Book of Rites*. Philadelphia: D.G. Brinton, 1883.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Iroquois Book of Rites*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963 [1831].
- Hill, Susan M. *The Clay We are Made Of: Haudenosaunee Land Tenure on the Grand River*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2017.
- Horstman, Louise and David May, eds. *Tired of Rambling: A History of Fishing Lake Metis Settlement*. Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Metis Settlement Associations, 1982.
- Jacknife, Albina. *Elizabeth Metis Settlement: A Local History*. Altona: Friesen Printers, 1977.
- Jackson, Louis. *Our Caughnawagas in Egypt: A Narrative of What was Seen and Accomplished by the Contingent of North American Voyageurs Who Led the British Boat Expedition for the Relief of Khartoum up the Cataracts of the Nile*. Montréal: W. Drysdale and Co., 1885.
- Jamieson, Keith. *History of Six Nations Education*. Brantford: The Woodland Indian Cultural Education Centre, 1987.

- Jamieson, Keith and Michelle A. Hamilton. *Dr. Oronhyatekha: Security, Justice, and Equality*. Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2016.
- Johnson, Elias. *Legends, Traditions and Laws, of the Iroquois, or Six Nations, and History of the Tuscarora Indians*. Lockport: Union Printing and Publishing Company, 1881.
- Lavallée, Guy. *The Métis of St. Laurent, Manitoba: Their Life and Stories, 1920-1988*. Winnipeg: Self-Published, 2003.
- MacDougall, Brenda. *One of the Family: Metis Culture in Nineteenth-Century Northwestern Saskatchewan*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010.
- Mann, Barbara Alice. *Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas*. New York: Peter Lang, 2000.
- \_\_\_ *George Washington's War on Native America*. Westport: Praeger, 2005.
- \_\_\_ *The Land of the Three Miamis: A Traditional Narrative of the Iroquois in Ohio*. Toledo: Urban Affairs Centre Press, 2006.
- \_\_\_ *George Washington's War on Native America*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2008.
- McNab, David T. *Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario*. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1999.
- \_\_\_ *No Place for Fairness: Indigenous Land Rights and Policy in the Bear Island Case and Beyond*. Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2009.
- Miller, Bill, editor. *Our Home: A History of Kikino Metis Settlement*. Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Metis Settlements, 1984.
- Montour, Enos T. *The Feathered U.E.L.'s: An Account of the Life and Times of Certain Canadian Native People*. Toronto: Division of Communication, United Church of Canada, 1973.
- Monture, Rick. *We Share Our Matters = Teionkwakhashion tsi niionkwariho:ten: Two Centuries of Writing and Resistance at Six Nations of the Grand River*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2014.
- Morgan, Lewis Henry. *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*. Rochester: Sage and Brother Publishers, 1851.
- Newhouse, Seth. *The Constitution of the Confederacy by the Peacemaker*. Revised by Chief Jacob E. Thomas. Wilsonville: Sandpiper Press, 1989.
- Norton, John. *The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816*. Edited by Carl F. Klinck and James J. Talman. Toronto: The Champlain Society, 1970 and 2011.
- Parker, Arthur C. *The Code of Handsome Lake, the Seneca Prophet*. Albany: University of the State of New York, 1913.
- \_\_\_ *The Constitution of the Five Nations*. Albany: University of the State of New York, 1916.
- \_\_\_ *The Life of General Ely S. Parker: Last Grand Sachem of the Iroquois and General Grant's Military Secretary*. Buffalo: Buffalo Historical Society, 1919.
- \_\_\_ *The Archaeological History of New York*. Albany: University of the State of New York, 1920.

- \_\_\_\_ *An Analytical History of the Seneca Indians*. Researches and Transactions of the New York State Archeological Association, Volume 4, Numbers I-V. Rochester: Lewis H. Morgan Chapter of the New York State Archeological Association, 1926.
- Payment, Diane Paulette. *Batoche (1870-1910)*. Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_ “*The Free People – Otipemisiwak*” *Batoche, Saskatchewan 1870-1930*. Ottawa: National Parks and Sites Park Service Environment Canada, 1990.
- \_\_\_\_ *The Free People – Li Gens Libres: A History of the Métis Community of Batoche, Saskatchewan*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2009.
- Redbird, Duke. *We Are Métis: A Métis View of the Development of a Native Canadian People*. Toronto: Ontario Métis and Non-Status Indian Association, 1980.
- Rice, Brian. *The Rotinonshonni: A Traditional Iroquoian History Through the Eyes of Teharonhia:wako and Sawiskera*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2013.
- Rickard, Clinton. *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*. Edited by Barbara Graymont. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973.
- Rivard, Ron and Catherine Littlejohn. *The History of the Metis of Willow Bunch*. Saskatoon: Rivard and Littlejohn, 2003.
- Scott, Duncan C., editor. *Traditional History of the Confederacy of the Six Nations*. Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada. Ottawa: Royal Society of Canada, 1911.
- Supernault, Carol, Mary Auger, Marcella Cunningham, and Velma Bellerose. *East Prairie Metis 1939 – 1979: 40 Years of Determination*. Place of publication and publisher not indicated, 1979.
- Verbicky, Eleanor, editor. *Life and Times of the Métis: A History of Caslan Métis Settlement*. Edmonton: Alberta Federation of Métis Settlement Associations, 1984.
- Vermette, Auguste. *Au temps de la Prairie: L’histoire des Métis l’Ouest canadien racontée par Auguste Vermette, neveu de Louis Riel*. Éditeur Marcien Ferland. Saint-Boniface: Les Éditions du Blé, 2000.
- Zeilig, Ken and Victoria Zeilig, editors. *Ste. Madeleine, Community Without a Town: Métis Elders in Interview*. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, Inc., 1997.

### **Secondary Sources**

- Abler, Thomas S. “Introduction ‘Pretty Smart for His Age.’” In *Chainbreaker: The Revolutionary War Memoirs of Governor Blacksnake as Told to Benjamin Williams*, 1-15. Edited by Thomas S. Abler. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989 [2005].
- Adams, Howard. “Challenging Eurocentric History.” In *Expressions in Canadian Native Studies*, edited by Ron F. Laliberte, Priscilla Settee, James B. Waldram, Rob Innes, Brenda MacDougall, Lesley McBain, and F. Laurie Barron, 40-53. Saskatoon: University Extension Press, 2000.
- Ahenakew, Vince. *Nêhiyawêwin Masinahikan: Michif Cree Dictionary*. Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute Press, 2021.

- \_\_\_ *Nêhiyawêwin Mitâtaht: Michif Ahci Cree*. Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute Press, 2021.
- Alberta Regional Professional Development Resources (ARPDR). "Mark of the Métis: Traditional Knowledge and Stories of the Métis Peoples of Northeastern Alberta." Alberta Regional Professional Development. <https://arpdcreources.ca/consortia/mark-metis-traditional-knowledge-stories-metis-peoples-northeastern-alberta/> (accessed January 30, 2022).
- Alfred, Gerald R. *Heeding the Voices of Our Ancestors: Kahnawake Mohawk Politics and the Rise of Native Nationalism*. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Alfred, Taiiaki and Jeff Cornassel. "Being Indigenous: Resurgences Against Contemporary Colonialism." *Government and Opposition* 4, no. 4 (2005): 597-614.
- Allen, Paula Gunn. *Off the Reservation: Reflections on Boundary-Busting, Border-Crossing Loose Canons*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1998.
- American Antiquarian Society. "The Early Nineteenth-Century Newspaper Boom," *The News Media and the Making of America, 1730 – 1865*, <https://americanantiquarian.org/earlyamericannewsmedia/exhibits/show/news-in-antebellum-america/the-newspaper-boom> (accessed February 22, 2023).
- ancestry.com. "Dr. James Everett Seaver (1787-1827)." ancestry.com. <https://www.ancestry.com/genealogy/records/dr-james-everett-seaver-24-22cl2nm> (accessed August 15, 2022).
- Anderson, Anne. *Plains Cree Dictionary of the "Y" Dialect*. Edmonton: Self-Published, 1971.
- \_\_\_ *Dr. Anne Anderson's Métis Cree Dictionary*. Edmonton: Duval House Press, 1997.
- Armstrong, Jeannette C., collector. *Looking at the Words of Our People: First Nations' Analysis of Literature*. Penticton: Theytus Books, 1993.
- \_\_\_ "Land Speaking." In *Speaking for the Generations: Native Writers on Writing*, edited by Simon J. Ortiz, 174-194. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1998.
- \_\_\_ "'Editor's Note' From Looking at the Words of Our People: First Nations Analysis of Literature." In *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*, edited by Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra, 229-230. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016.
- Armstrong William H. *Warrior in Two Camps: Ely S. Parker, Union General and Seneca Chief*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1978.
- Ashcroft, Bill. *On Post-Colonial Futures: Transformations of a Colonial Culture*. London: Continuum, 2001.
- Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin. *The Empire Writes Back: Theory and Practice in Post-Colonial Literatures*. London: Routledge, 1989.
- "Au temps de la Prairie." *La Liberté*, January 25, 1985, 5.
- Baillargeon, Morgan and Leslie Tepper, editors. *Legends of Our Times: Native Cowboy Life*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1998.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981.

- Bakker, Peter. *A Language of Our Own: The Genesis of Michif, the Mixed Cree-French Language of the Canadian Métis*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Barbeau, C.M. *Huron and Wyandot Mythology With an Appendix Containing Earlier Published Records*. Memoir 80, No. 11 Anthropological Series, Canada Department of Mines Geological Survey. Ottawa: Government Printers, 1915.
- Barkwell, Lawrence. “Anne Gairdner (Anderson, Irvine), C.M. LL.D. (1906-1997).” Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture. <http://www.metismuseum.ca/resource.php/10587> (accessed September 21, 2021).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Guy Lavallée, O.M.I (b. 1939).” Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture. <http://www.metismuseum.ca/resource.php/14327> (accessed September 21, 2021).
- Barkwell, Lawrence J. *The Early History of the Manitoba Métis Federation*. Winnipeg: Louis Riel Institute, 2014.
- Barkwell, Lawrence J., Leah Dorion and Darren R. Préfontaine, editors. *Métis Legacy*. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.
- Barkwell, Lawrence J., Leah M. Dorion, and Audreen Hourie, editors. *Metis Legacy II: Michif Culture, Heritage and Folkways*. Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2006.
- Barman, Jean. *The Iroquois in the West*. Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2019.
- Barthes, Roland. “The Death of the Author.” *Aspen* 5-6 (1967): Essay 1.
- Basso, Keith. *Western Apache Language and Culture: Essays in Linguistic Anthropology*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1990.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Wisdom Sits in Places: Landscape and Language Among the Western Apache*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996.
- Bellin, Joshua David. *The Demon of the Continent: Indians and the Shaping of American Literature*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001.
- Benn, Carl. *Mohawks on the Nile: Natives Among the Canadian Voyageurs in Egypt 1884-1885*. Dundurn: National Heritage Books, 2009.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Introduction to the Reissue of The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816.” In *The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816*, edited by Carl F. Klinck and James J. Talman, x-xii. Toronto: Champlain Society, 2011.
- \_\_\_\_\_. editor. *A Mohawk Memoir from the War of 1812: John Norton – Teyoninhokarawen*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2019.
- Berkhofer Jr., Robert F. *The White Man’s Indian: Images of the American Indian from Columbus to the Present*. New York: Vintage Books, 1979.
- Berman, Judith. “‘Some Mysterious Means of Fortune’: A Look at North Pacific Coast Oral History.” In *Coming to Shore: Northwest Coast Ethnology, Traditions, and Visions*, edited by Marie Mauze, Michael Harkin and Sergei Kan, 129-162. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2004.

- Bhabha, Homi K. "Front Lines, Border Posts." In *Displacements: Cultural Identities in Question*, edited by Angelika Bammer, 269-172. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994.
- Binnema, Theodore. "How Does a Map Mean? Old Swan's Map of 1801 and the Blackfoot World." In *From Rupert's Land to Canada*, edited by Theodore Binnema, Gerhard J. Ens, and R.C. McLeod, 201-211. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2001.
- Bird, Louis. *Telling Our Stories: Omushkego Legends and Histories from Hudson Bay*. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 2005.
- Bird, Louis and Susan Elaine Gray. *The Spirit Lives in the Mind: Omushkego Stories, Lives, and Dreams*. Edited by Roland Bohr, Anne Lindsay, and Donna G. Sutherland. Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2007.
- Bird, Traveler. *Tell Them They Lie: The Sequoyah Myth*. Los Angeles: Westernlore Publishers, 1971.
- Blackburn, Mark. "Manitoba Metis Federation Claims Victory After Supreme Court Ruling." APTN National News. <https://www.aptnnews.ca/national-news/manitoba-metis-federation-claims-victory-after-supreme-court-ruling/> (accessed August 17, 2022).
- Blackfoot Confederacy and Glenbow Museum. "Our World." Niitsitapiisinni: Our Way of Life. [https://www.glenbow.org/blackfoot/EN/html/our\\_world.htm](https://www.glenbow.org/blackfoot/EN/html/our_world.htm) (accessed June 5, 2022).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Traditional Stories." Niitsitapiisinni: Our Way of Life. [https://www.glenbow.org/blackfoot/EN/html/traditional\\_stories.htm](https://www.glenbow.org/blackfoot/EN/html/traditional_stories.htm) (accessed July 5, 2020).
- Blady, Sharon. "The Flower Beadwork People: Factors Contributing to the Emergence of a Distinctive Métis Culture and Artistic Style at Red River From 1844 to 1869." MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 1995.
- Blaeser, Kimberly M. "Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Centre." In *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*, edited by Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra, 231-238. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016.
- Bloomfield, Leonard. *Sacred Stories of the Sweet Grass Cree*. Bulletin No. 60 of the Anthropological Series No. 11 of the National Museum of Canada. Ottawa: F.A. Acland, King's Printer, 1930.
- Boas, Franz and George Hunt. *Kwakiutl Texts*. Lieden: E.J. Brill Ltd., 1902-1905.
- Boas, Franz. *Kwakiutl Ethnography*. Edited by Helene Cordere. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966.
- Bocquel, Bernard. "Qu'on donne au peuple métis ce qui lui revient." *La Liberté*, January 25, 1985, 5.
- Brant-Sero, John O. "The Six Nations Indians in the Province of Ontario, Canada." *Transactions of the Wentworth Historical Society* 2 (1899): 62-73.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Some Descendants of Joseph Brant." *Papers and Records of the Ontario Historical Society* 1 (1899): 113-117.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Dekanawidah: The Law-Giver of the Caniengahakas." *Man* 1, no. 134 (1901): 166-170.

- \_\_\_ “‘Six Nations Indians’ in Canada Under Woman Rule.” *Women’s Franchise*, August 22, 1907.
- Brightman, Robert A. *Grateful Prey: Rock Cree Human-Animal Relationships*. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre, 2003 (1973).
- Brooks, Lisa. *The Common Pot: The Recovery of Native Space in the Northeast*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008.
- \_\_\_ “Intellectual History.” In *The Oxford Handbook of American Indian History*, edited by Frederick E. Hoxie, 497-537. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016.
- Brown, Desmond and Samantha Craggs. “Year-long Six Nations Protest Forces Cancellation of Major Development in Caledonia, Ont.” CBC News. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/hamilton/caledonia-development-cancelled-protests-1.6088130> (accessed August 17, 2022).
- Brownlie, Robin Jarvis. “First Nations Perspectives and Historical Thinking in Canada.” In *First Nations, First Thoughts: The Impact of Indigenous Thought in Canada*, edited by Annis Mary Timpson, 21-50. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009.
- Bruchac Joseph. *One Real American: The Life of Ely S. Parker, Seneca Sachem and Civil War General*. New York: Abrams Books for Young Readers, 2020.
- Bryant, Rachel. *The Homing Place: Indigenous and Settler Histories of the Atlantic*. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2017.
- Buck, Wilfred. *Tipiskawi Kisik: Night Sky Star Stories*. Winnipeg: Manitoba First Nations Education Resource Centre, Inc., 2018.
- Cajete, Gregory. *Native Science: Natural Laws of Interdependence*. Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000.
- Callihoo, Victoria. “Early Life in Lac Ste. Anne and in St. Albert in the 1870’s.” *Alberta Historical Review* 1, no. 3 (1953): 21-26.
- Camp, Gregory S. “The Dispossessed: The Ojibwa and Métis of Northwest North Dakota.” *North Dakota History* 69, no. 2 (2002): 62-79.
- Campbell, Maria. *Halfbreed*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1973 [2019].
- Canada. *An Act Further to Amend ‘The Indian Act.’ 1895 Chapter 35 (57-58 Victoria)*.
- \_\_\_ *An Act to Amend ‘The Indian Act.’ 1927 Chapter 32 (17 George V)*.
- Canada, Department of Indian Affairs. *Indian Treaties and Surrenders, From 1680-1912*. In 3 Volumes. Ottawa: Queen’s Printer, 1912 [1971].
- Canada, Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development. *Statement of the Government of Canada on Indian Policy*. Department of Indian and Northern Affairs: Ottawa, 1969.
- Canada, Department of Justice. *An Act to amend ‘The Indian Act,’ c. I-5. (9-10 El.II)*.
- \_\_\_ *A Consolidation of the Constitution Acts 1867 to 1982, c. 3 (30-31 Vic) and c. 11 (30 El. II)*.
- \_\_\_ *Consolidated Indian Act R.S.C. 1985, c. I-5. Section 74: Elections of Chiefs and Band Councils*.

- Canadian Press. "Priest Apologizes." *The Globe and Mail*. February 11, 1991, A3.
- Cardinal, Harold. *The Unjust Society: The Tragedy of Canada's Indians*. Edmonton: M.G. Hurtig, 1969.
- Carlson, Hans M. *Home is the Hunter: The James Bay Cree and Their Land*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2008.
- Carlson, Keith Thor. "Reflections on Indigenous History and Memory." In *Myth and Memory: Stories of Indigenous-European Contact*, edited by John Sutton Lutz, 46-68. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2007.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Power of Place, the Problem of Time: Aboriginal Identity and Historical Consciousness in the Cauldron of Colonialism*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010.
- Catapano, Andrea Lucille. "The Rising of the Ongwehònwe: Sovereignty, Identity, and Representation at the Six Nations Reserve." PhD Dissertation, Stony Brook University, 2007.
- Cebula, Larry. *Plateau Indians and the Quest for Spiritual Power, 1700-1850*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2003.
- Centre de patrimoine. "La Société historique de Saint-Boniface (SHSB)." <https://shsb.mb.ca/societe-historique-de-saint-boniface/> (accessed December 30, 2021).
- Centre for Study of Violence. "Funded Research." University of Newcastle-Australia. <https://www.newcastle.edu.au/research/centre/csov/research> (accessed November 21, 2021).
- Chalmers, Harvey. *West to the Setting Sun*. Toronto: Macmillan Company of Canada Limited, 1947.
- Champlain Society, The. "About the Champlain Society." The Champlain Society. <https://champlainsociety.utpjournals.press/about> (accessed December 31, 2021).
- Chrétien, Anne. "'Mattawa, Where the Waters Meet': The Question of Identity In Métis Culture." MA Thesis, University of Ottawa, 1996.
- Cinnamon, Bruce. "The 'Grand Lady of the Métis': Dr. Anne Anderson's Mission to Preserve the Cree Language." Edmonton City as Museum Project – ECAMP, November 10, 2020. <https://citymuseumedmonton.ca/2020/11/10/the-grand-lady-of-the-metis-dr-anne-andersons-mission-to-preserve-the-cree-language/> (accessed January 10, 2022).
- Clarke, Margaret L. "Reconstituting the Fur Trade Community of the Assiniboine Basin, 1793 to 1872." MA Thesis, University of Winnipeg/University of Manitoba, 1997.
- Coe, Michael D. *Breaking the Maya Code*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. London: Thames and Hudson, 2012.
- Coe, Michael D. and Justin Kerr. *The Art of the Maya Scribe*. New York: Harry N. Abrams, 1998.
- Colden, Cadwallader. *The History of the Five Indian Nations Depending on the Province of New York*. New York: W. Bradford, 1727.
- Collin, Yvette Running Horse. "The Relationship Between the Indigenous Peoples of the Americas and the Horse: Deconstructing a Eurocentric Myth." PhD Dissertation, University of Alaska Fairbanks, 2017.

- Costo, Rupert. "A Statement of Policy: Indian Journal to Study History and Development of Native Races." *The Indian Historian: Official Publication of the American Indian Historical Society* 1, no. 1 (October 1964): reverse of cover page.
- Coulter, Diana. "Before Sex Began Teen Saw Priest 'Like a Savior'." *Edmonton Journal*. November 3, 1990, A7.
- \_\_\_ "Priest Ordered Into Sex Offender's Program." *Edmonton Journal*. March 2, 1991, C1.
- Coulthard, Glen Sean. *Red Skin White Masks: Rejecting the Colonial Politics of Recognition*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2014.
- Cross, Ronald and Hélène Sévigny. *Lasagna: The Man Behind the Mask*. Vancouver: Talon Books Limited, 1994.
- Cruikshank, Julie. *Life Lived Like a Story: Life Stories of Three Yukon Native Elders*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1990.
- \_\_\_ *The Social Life of Stories: Narrative and Knowledge in the Yukon Territory*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998.
- Curtis, Bruce. *The Politics of Population: State Formation, Statistics, and the Census of Canada, 1840 – 1875*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001.
- Cusick, David. *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations*. Lewiston: Printed for the Author, 1827.
- \_\_\_ *Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations*. Lockport, N.Y.: Turner and McCollum, 1848.
- Daschuk, James. *Clearing the Plains: Disease, Politics of Starvation, and the Loss of Aboriginal Life*. Regina: University of Regina Press, 2013.
- Dauenhauer, Nora Marks and Richard Dauenhauer. *Haa Shuká, Our Ancestors: Tlingit Oral Narratives. Classics of Tlingit Oral Literature Volume One*. Seattle and Juno: University of Washington Press and Sealaska Heritage Foundation, 1987.
- \_\_\_ *Haa Tuwunáagu Yís, For Healing Our Spirit: Tlingit Oratory. Classics of Tlingit Oral Literature Volume Two*. Seattle and Juno: University of Washington Press and Sealaska Heritage Foundation, 1990.
- Dean, Carolyn J. *A Culture of Stone: Inka Perspectives on Rock*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2010.
- Deer, James D. *The Canadian Voyageurs in Egypt*. Montréal: John Lovell and Son, 1885.
- Deloria Jr., Vine. *Custer Died for Your Sins: An Indian Manifesto*. Toronto: MacMillan Company, 1969.
- Deloria, Philip J. *Indians in Unexpected Places*. Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 2004.
- Denis, Chantal Roy. "Wolf Lake: The Importance of Métis Connection to Land and Place." MA Thesis, University of Alberta, 2017.

- Desveaux, Michelle, Patrick Chassé, Glenn Icton, Anne Janhunen, and Omeasoo Wāhpāsiw, "Twenty-First Century Indigenous Historiography: Twenty-Two Must-Read Books." *Canadian Journal of History* 50, no. 3 (2015): 524-548.
- Devine, Marina, editor. *Picking Up the Threads: Métis History in the Mackenzie Basin*. Yellowknife: Métis Heritage Association of the Northwest Territories and Parks Canada-Canadian Heritage, 1998.
- Dickason, Olive Patricia. "The Myth of the Savage and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas." PhD Dissertation, University of Ottawa, 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Old World Laws and New World Political Realities." In *Expressions in Canadian Native Studies*, edited by Ron F. Laliberte, Priscilla Settee, James B. Waldram, Rob Innes, Brenda MacDougall, Lesley McBain, and F. Laurie Barron, 147-162. Saskatoon: University Extension Press, 2000.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Out of the Bush: A Journey to A Dream." In *The Long Journey of a Forgotten People: Métis Identities and Family Histories*, edited by Ute Lischke and David T. McNab, 1-13. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2007.
- Donald, Dwayne Trevor. "Edmonton Pentimento: Re-Reading the Story in the Case of the Papaschase Cree." *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies* 2, no. 1 (2004): 21-54.
- Dorion, Leah. "Are the Métis a Western Canadian Phenomenon? A Case Study of the Dorion Trading Family." In *Metis Legacy*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, 115-126. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.
- Dorion, Leah and Darren R. Préfontaine. "Deconstructing Métis Historiography." In *Metis Legacy*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah Dorion, and Darren R. Préfontaine, 13-36. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 2001.
- Doty, Lockwood R., editor. *History of the Genesee Country (Western New York)*. Chicago: S.J. Clarke Publishing Company, 1925.
- Doxtator, Deborah. "What Happened to the Iroquois Clans? A Study of Clans in Three Nineteenth Century Rotinonhsyonni Communities." PhD Dissertation, University of Western Ontario, 1996.
- Driben, Paul. "We Are Métis: The Ethnography of a Halfbreed Community in Northern Alberta." PhD Dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1975.
- Dunn, Martin F. "The Unwritten History of Métis Nationhood. Presentation to the Conference of the History of First Nations, University of Ottawa (1988)." *The Other Metis*. <https://web.archive.org/web/20051028040853/http://www.othermetis.net/Papers/Unwritten/UnwritTOC.html> (accessed November 14, 2021).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "All My Relations – The Other Métis. Discussion Paper for the Métis Circle Special Consultation of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (March 1994)." *The Other Metis*. <https://web.archive.org/web/20080305050630/http://www.othermetis.net/Papers/CircleTxt/CrcToc.html> (accessed November 14, 2021).

- Dusenbury, Verne. *The Montana Cree: A Study in Religious Persistence*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1998.
- Edwards, Brendan Frederick R. "Ethel Brant Monture: 'A One-Woman Crusade'." McMaster University Library. <https://digitalcollections.mcmaster.ca/hpcanpub/case-study/ethel-brant-monture-one-woman-crusade> (accessed December 21, 2021).
- Ellenwood, Ray. "Voices of Louis Goulet." In *Reflections: Autobiography and Canadian Literature*, edited by K.P. Stich, 103-113. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1988.
- Elliott, Alicia. "The Meaning of Elections for Six Nations." Briarpatch (May 11, 2015). <https://briarpatchmagazine.com/articles/view/the-meaning-of-elections-for-six-nations> (accessed January 30, 2021).
- Ens, Gerhard J. and Joe Sawchuk. *From New Peoples to New Nations: Aspects of Métis History and Identity from the Eighteenth to Twenty-First Centuries*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016.
- Erickson, Lesley. "Repositioning the Missionary: Sara Riel, the Grey Nuns, and Aboriginal Women in Catholic Missions of the Northwest." In *Recollecting: Lives of Aboriginal Women of the Canadian Northwest and Borderlands*, edited by Sarah Carter and Patricia McConnel, 115-134. Edmonton: AU Press, 2011.
- Eskildsen, Kasper Risbjerg. "Leopold Ranke's Archival Turn: Location and Evidence in Modern Historiography." *Modern Intellectual History* 5, no. 3 (2008): 425-453.
- Faculty of Native Studies. "What is Native Studies?" University of Alberta. <https://www.ualberta.ca/native-studies/about-us/what-is-native-studies.html> (accessed March 3, 2022).
- Fee, Margery. *Literary Land Claims: The "Indian Land Question" From Pontiac's War to Attawapiskat*. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2015.
- Fenton, William N. "Introduction." In *League of the Iroquois*, by Lewis Henry Morgan, v-xviii. Secaucus: The Citadel Press, 1962 [1851].
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Introduction." In *The Iroquois Book of Rites*, by Horatio Hale, vii-xvii. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963 [1831].
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Introduction." In *Parker on the Iroquois*, by Arthur C. Parker, 7-47. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1968.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Return of Eleven Wampum Belts to the Six Nations Confederacy on Grand River, Canada." *Ethnohistory* 36, no. 4 (1989): 392-410.
- Ferland, Marcien. "Au temps de la Prairie: Un raconteur se présente." *La Liberté*, February 1, 1985, 8.
- Fido, Martin. *The World of Agatha Christie: The Facts and Figures Behind the World's Greatest Crime Writer*. Vancouver: Adams Media, 1997.
- Fiola, Chantal. *Rekindling the Sacred Fire: Métis Ancestry and Anishinaabe Spirituality*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2018.

- Fleury, Norman and the Gabriel Dumont Institute. "Story." Heritage Michif Dictionary. [http://www.metismuseum.ca/michif\\_dictionary.php](http://www.metismuseum.ca/michif_dictionary.php) (accessed August 20, 2021).
- Fleury, Norman, Gilbert Pelletier, Jeanne Pelletier, Joe Welsh, Norma Welsh, Janice DePeel, and Carrie Saganace. *Stories of Our People/Lii Zistwayr Di La Naasyoon Di Michif: A Métis Graphic Novel Anthology*. Regina: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2008.
- Foreman, Grant. *The Five Civilized Tribes*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1934.
- Foster, John E. "Some Questions and Perspectives on the Problem of Métis Roots." In *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*, edited by Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown, 73-91. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Wintering, the Outsider Adult Male and the Ethnogenesis of the Western Plains Métis." *Prairie Forum* 19, no. 1 (1994): 1-13.
- Foster, Martha Harroun. *We Know Who We Are: Métis Identity in a Montana Community*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2006.
- Foster, Michael K. *From the Earth to Beyond the Sky: An Ethnographic Approach to Four Longhouse Speech Events*. National Museum of Man Mercury Series, Canadian Ethnology Service Paper No. 20. Ottawa: National Museums of Canada, 1974.
- Gabriel Dumont Institute of Native Studies and Applied Research. "History." Gabriel Dumont Institute of Native Studies and Applied Research. <https://gdins.org/about/overview/history> (accessed December 30, 2021).
- Gabriel Dumont Institute Press. "Catalogue." <https://gdins.org/me/uploads/2019/09/Catalog-2019-Low-Res-Sept-2019.pdf> (accessed December 31, 2021).
- Gabriel Dumont Institute. Gabriel Dumont Institute of Native Studies and Applied Research. <https://gdins.org/> (accessed December 18, 2021).
- Gabriel Dumont Institute. Gabriel Dumont Virtual Museum of Métis History and Culture. <http://www.metismuseum.ca/> (accessed December 18, 2021).
- Gabriel, Kanatiio Allen. "A Thanksgiving Address." In *Looking Forward, Looking Back: Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples*, Volume 1, 1-5. Ottawa: Canada Communication Group, 1996.
- Gaffield, Chad. *Language, Schooling, and Cultural Conflict: The Origins of the French-Language Controversy in Ontario*. Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1987.
- Gardiner, Juliet. *Wartime Britain 1939 – 1945*. London: Headline Book Publishing, 2004.
- Garneau, Dick. "Objective and Motivation for This Site." Canadian History, A Distinct View Point. <https://web.archive.org/web/20150219165041/http://metis-history.info/author.shtml> (accessed December 17, 2021).
- Gaudry, Adam. "Kaa-tipeyimishoyaahk – 'We Are Those Who Own Ourselves': A Political History of Métis Self-Determination in the North-West, 1830-1870." PhD Dissertation, University of Victoria, 2014.

- Gilman, Rhoda R., Carolyn Gilman and Deborah M. Schultz. *The Red River Trails: Ox Cart Routes Between St. Paul and the Selkirk Settlement, 1820 – 1870*. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society, 1979.
- Giraud, Marcel. *Le métis canadien: son rôle dans l'histoire des provinces de l'Ouest*. Paris: Institut d'Ethnologie, Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle, 1945.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Métis in the Canadian West*. Translated by George Woodcock. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1986.
- Gleach, Frederic W. "Controlled Speculation: Interpreting the Saga of Pocahontas and Captain John Smith." In *Reading Beyond Words: Contexts for Native History*, edited by Jennifer S.H. Brown and Elizabeth Vibert, 21-42. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 1998.
- Goddard, Ives. "Synonymy." In *The Handbook of North American Indians: Northeast*, Volume 15, edited by Bruce G. Trigger, 319-321. Washington: Smithsonian Institution, 1978.
- Goodleaf, Donna K. "Kanienkehaka (Mohawk) Nation, State Policies, and Community Resistance: A Pedagogical Tool." PhD Dissertation, University of Massachusetts-Amherst, 1992.
- Goulet, George and Terry. *The Trial of Louis Riel – Justice and Mercy Denied*. Calgary: Tellwell Publishing, 1999.
- Gowriluk, Caitlyn. "Long-Lost John Lennon Interviews from Winnipeg-Born Journalist Go Up for Auction." CBC News (September 27, 2021).  
<https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/manitoba/ken-zeilig-tapes-john-lennon-yoko-ono-auction-wfpcbc-cbc-1.6190333> (accessed December, 31 2021).
- Goyette, Linda. "The X Files: By Signing Applications for Land Grants, Were the Prairie Métis Drawn Into one of the Largest Property Swindles in Canadian History?" *Canadian Geographic* (March/April 2003): 70-80.
- Grafton, Anthony. *The Footnote: A Curious History*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999.
- Gray, Charlotte. *Flint and Feather: The Life and Times of E. Pauline Johnson, Tekahionwake*. Toronto: HarperCollins Publishers Ltd., 2002.
- Graymont, Barbara. *The Iroquois in the American Revolution*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1972.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Editor's Preface." In *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*, xi-xvi. Edited by Barbara Graymont. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Editor's Introduction." In *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*, xvii-xxviii. Edited by Barbara Graymont. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Editor's Afterword." In *Fighting Tuscarora: The Autobiography of Chief Clinton Rickard*, 163-168. Edited by Barbara Graymont. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1973.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Thayendanagea." *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*.  
[http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/thayendanagea\\_5E.html](http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/thayendanagea_5E.html) (accessed January 30, 2021).
- Green, Rayna. "The Tribe Called Wannabe: Playing Indian in America and Europe." *Folklore* 99, no. 1 (1988): 30-55.

- \_\_\_\_ “Rosebuds of the Plateau: Frank Matsura and the Fainting Couch Aesthetic.” In *Partial Recall*, edited by Lucy Lippard, 46-53. New York: New Press, 1992.
- Greene, Alma (Gah-wonh-nos-doh). *Tales of the Mohawks*. Toronto: J.M. Dent and Sons (Canada) Limited, 1975.
- Grinde Jr., Donald A. *The Iroquois and the Founding of the American Nation*. San Francisco: Indian Historian Press, 1977.
- Guéno, Michael P. “Native Americans, Law, and Religion.” In *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Religion*, edited by John Barton. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780199340378.013.140> (accessed August 26, 2021).
- Handler, Richard. “Of Cannibals and Custom: Montaigne’s Cultural Relativism.” *Anthropology Today* 2, no. 5 (1986): 12-14.
- Harkin, Michael E. “Ethnohistory’s Ethnohistory: Creating a Discipline from the Ground Up.” *Social Science History* 34, no. 2 (Summer 2010): 113-128.
- “Harvey Chalmers 2d Dead; Industrialist and Novelist.” *New York Times*, October 8, 1971, 46.
- Hauptman, Lawrence M. “Who Owns Grand Island (Erie County, New York)?” In *Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794*, edited by G. Peter Jemison and Anna M. Schein, 127-148. Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000.
- Helm, June. *The People of Denendeh: Ethnohistory of the Indians of Canada’s Northwest Territories*. Montréal: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2000.
- Heriot, George. *The History of Canada, from its First Discovery, Comprehending an Account of the Original Establishment of the Colony of Louisiana*. London: T.N. Longman and O. Rees, 1804.
- Herriot, Trevor. *Towards a Prairie Atonement*. Regina: University of Regina Press, 2016.
- Hewitt, J.N.B. *Era of the Formation of the Historic League of the Iroquois*. Reprinted from the January 1894 volume of *American Anthropologist*. Washington: Judd and Detweiler, Printers, 1894.
- \_\_\_\_ “The Myth of the Earth-grasper of De’haen’hiyawa’khon.” *Bureau of American Ethnology Annual Report* (1900): 1-130.
- Hewitt, J. N. B. and John Arthur Gibson. “MS 3478 The Founding of the League of the Five Iroquois Tribes by Deganawida in the Sixteenth Century, According to the Official Tradition of it, dictated in Onondaga Text by the late Chief John Arthur Gibson, in March 1899.” Smithsonian Online Virtual Archives. <https://sova.si.edu/record/NAA.MS3478?s=0&n=10&t=C&q=john+arthur+gibson&i=0> (accessed January 2, 2021).
- Hewitt, J. N. B. and John Arthur Gibson. “MS 3689 The Founding of the League of the Five Nations by Deganawida.” Smithsonian Online Virtual Archives. <https://sova.si.edu/record/NAA.MS3689?s=0&n=10&t=C&q=john+arthur+gibson&i=1> (accessed January 2, 2021).
- Hill, Asa R. “The Historical Position of the Six Nations.” *Papers and Records of the Ontario Historical Society* 19 (1922): 103-109.

- Hill, Jonathan D. "Introduction: Myth and History." In *Rethinking History and Myth: Indigenous South American Perspectives on the Past*, edited by Jonathan D. Hill, 1-18. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1988.
- Hill Sr., Richard. "Regenerating Identity: Repatriation and the Indian Frame of Mind." In *The Future of the Past: Archaeologists, Native Americans, and Repatriation*, edited by Tamara L. Bray, 127-138. New York: Garland Publishing, 2001.
- Hill Boone, Elizabeth. "Introduction: Writing and Recording Knowledge." In *Writing Without Words: Alternative Literacies in Mesoamerica and the Andes*, edited by Elizabeth Hill Boone and Walter D. Mignolo, 3-26. Durham: Duke University Press, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Aztec Pictorial Histories: Records Without Words." In *Writing Without Words: Alternate Literacies in Mesoamerica and the Andes*, edited by Elizabeth Hill Boone and Walter D. Mignolo, 50-76. Durham: Duke University Press, 1994.
- Hind, Henry Youle. *Narrative of the Canadian Red River Exploring Expedition of 1857, and of the Assiniboine and Saskatchewan Exploring Expedition of 1858*. London: Longman, Green, Longman and Roberts, 1860.
- Hogue, Michel. *Metis and the Medicine Line: Creating a Border and Dividing a People*. Regina: University of Regina Press, 2015.
- Howard, Joseph Kinsey. *Strange Empire: A Narrative of the Northwest*. New York: Morrow, 1952.
- Igartua, José E. *The Other Quiet Revolution: National Identities in English Canada, 1945-71*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2006.
- Innes, Robert Alexander. *Elder Brother and the Law of the People: Contemporary Kinship and Cowessess First Nation*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2013.
- Jamieson, Elizabeth and Sheila McManus, editors. *One Step Over the Line: Toward a History of Women in the North American Wests*. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press and AU Press, 2008.
- Jamieson, Frederick C. "The Edmonton Hunt." *Alberta Historical Review* 1, no. 1 (1953): 21-33.
- Jamieson, Julia L. *Echoes of the Past: A History of Education from the Time of the Six Nations Settlement on the Banks of the Grand River in 1784 to 1924*. Brantford: Self-Published, 1969.
- Jemison, G. Peter and Anna M. Schein, editors. *Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794*. Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000.
- Johansen, Bruce E. *Life and Death in Mohawk Country*. Golden: North American Press, 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Introduction." In *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom*, edited by Donald E. Johansen with Donald A. Grinde Jr. and Barbara A. Mann, 8-18. San Jose: Clearlight Publishers, 1998.
- Johansen, Bruce E. With Donald A. Grinde Jr. and Barbara A. Mann, editors. *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom*. San Jose: Clearlight Publishers, 1998.
- Johnston, Charles M., editor. *The Valley of the Six Nations: A Collection of Documents on the Indian Lands of the Grand River*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1963 [2019].

- Jones, Peter Kahkewaquinaby. *History of the Ojebway Indians with Especial Reference to Their Conversion to Christianity*. London: A.W. Bennett, 1861.
- Kehoe, Alice Beck. *Humans: An Introduction to Four-Field Anthropology*. New York: Routledge, 1998.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Land of Prehistory: A Critical History of American Archaeology*. New York and London: Routledge, 1998.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Traveling Prehistoric Seas: Critical Thinking on Ancient Transoceanic Voyages*. Walnut Creek: Left Coast Press, 2016.
- Kelly, Lynne. *Knowledge and Power in Prehistoric Societies: Orality, Memory, and the Transmission of Culture*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2015.
- Kennedy, Dorothy and Randy Bouchard. *The Lil'wat World of Charlie Mack*. Vancouver: Talonbooks, 2010.
- Kermoal, Nathalie. *Un passé métis au féminin*. Québec: Les Éditions GID, 2006.
- King, Thomas. "Godzilla vs. Post-Colonial." In *New Contexts of Canadian Criticism*, edited by Ajay Heble, Donna Palmateer Pennee, and J.R. Struthers, 241-248. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 1997.
- Klinck, Carl F. "Norton, John (Snipe, Teyoninhokarawen)." *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*. [http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/norton\\_john\\_6E.html](http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/norton_john_6E.html) (accessed January 30, 2021).
- Kovach, Margaret. *Indigenous Methodologies: Characteristics, Conversations, and Contexts*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010.
- Kramer, Samuel Noah. *History Begins at Sumer*. London: Thames and Hudson, 1961.
- Lahontan, Baron Charles de. *Mémoires de L'Amérique Septentrionale, ou la Suite Voyages de Mr. Le Baron de la Hontan*, Tome Second. Paris: Charles Delo, 1706.
- Laliberté, Ron. "Adams, Howard (1921-2001)." *Indigenous Saskatchewan Encyclopedia*. [https://teaching.usask.ca/indigenoussk/import/adams\\_howard\\_1921-2001.php](https://teaching.usask.ca/indigenoussk/import/adams_howard_1921-2001.php) (accessed September 21, 2021).
- LaRocque, Emma. "Native Writers Resisting Colonizing Practices in Canadian Historiography and Literature." PhD Dissertation, University of Manitoba, 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Native Identity and the Metis: Otehpayimsuak Peoples." In *A Passion for Identity: Canadian Studies for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, 4<sup>th</sup> Edition, edited by David Taras and Beverly Raspovich, 381-399. Scarborough: Nelson Thomson Learning, 2001.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Teaching Aboriginal Literature: The Discourse of Margins and Mainstreams." In *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*, edited by Deanna Reder and Linda M. Morra, 55-72. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016.
- Lavallée, Guy. "The Métis People of St. Laurent, Manitoba: An Introductory Ethnography." MA Thesis, University of British Columbia, 1988.
- Laverdure, Patline and Ida Rose Allard. *The Michif Dictionary: Turtle Mountain Chippewa Cree*. Edited by John C. Crawford. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications Inc., 1983.

- Lawrence, Bonita. *“Real Indians” and Others: Mixed-Blood Urban Native Peoples and Indigenous Nationhood*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2004.
- Leon-Portilla, Miguel. *Time and Reality in the Thought of the Maya*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1988.
- Leroux, Darryl. *Distorted Descent: White Claims to Indigenous Identity*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2019.
- Library and Archives Canada – Theses Canada. “Search Result: 461758126 – Redbird, Duke.” <https://www.bac-lac.gc.ca/eng/services/theses/Pages/item.aspx?idNumber=461758126> (accessed December 30, 2021).
- \_\_\_ “Archived – Treaty 8.” <https://www.collectionscanada.ca/treaty8/020006-1000-e.html> (accessed January 25, 2022).
- Littlejohn, Catherine. *Métis Soldiers of Saskatchewan 1914-1943*. Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2012.
- Longfellow, Henry Wadsworth. *The Song of Hiawatha*. Boston: Ticknor and Fields, 1855.
- Louis Riel Institute. “Research, Archives, and Special Collections.” Louis Riel Institute. <https://www.louisrielinstitute.ca/research-archives> (accessed December 30, 2021).
- Lutz, John Sutton, editor. *Myth and Memory: Stories of Indigenous-European Contact*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2007.
- \_\_\_ *Makúk: A New History of Aboriginal-White Relations*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2008.
- \_\_\_ History 526: Topical Field in Ethnohistory. University of Victoria, Winter 2016.
- MacDougall, Brenda. “The Comforts of Married Life: Metis Family Life, Labour, and the Hudson’s Bay Company.” *Labour/Le Travail* 61 (2008): 19-39.
- \_\_\_ “Naming and Renaming: Confronting Canada’s Past.” Shekon Neechie (August 1, 2018). <https://shekonneeche.ca/2018/08/01/naming-and-renaming-confronting-canadas-past/> (accessed February 19, 2023).
- MacDougall, Brenda and Nicole St-Onge. “Rooted in Mobility: Metis Buffalo-Hunting Brigades.” *Manitoba History* 71 (2013): 21-32.
- MacKinnon, Doris Jeanne. *The Identities of Marie Rose Delorme Smith: Portrait of a Métis Woman 1861-1960*. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre Press, 2012.
- MacLaren, I.S. “Exploration/Travel Literature and the Evolution of the Author.” *International Journal of Canadian Studies* 5 (1992): 39-67.
- Macpherson, Elizabeth. *The Sun Traveller: The Story of the Callihoos in Alberta*. St. Albert: Musée Héritage Museum, 1988.
- Maggio, J. “‘Can the Subaltern be Heard?’: Political Theory, Translation, Representation, and Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak.” *Alternatives: Social Transformation and Humane Governance* 32, no. 4 (2007): 419-443.

- Mair, Charles and Roderick MacFarlane. *Through the Mackenzie Basin: A Narrative of the Athabasca and Peace River Treaty Expedition of 1899 and Notes on the Mammals and Birds of Northern Canada*. Toronto: William Briggs, 1908.
- Malbeuf, Jamie. “‘Almost Like a Miracle’: McMurray Métis Discover Elder Interviews Thought Lost in Fire.” CBC News (July 5, 2020).  
<https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/edmonton/mcmurray-metis-elder-tapes-1.5635250> (accessed July 5, 2020).
- Manitoba Métis Federation. “Louis Riel Institute.” Manitoba Métis Federation.  
<https://www.mmf.mb.ca/louis-riel-institute> (accessed December 30, 2021).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Understanding Manitoba Métis Federation Land Claims.” Manitoba Métis Federation.  
[http://www.mmf.mb.ca/land\\_claims\\_landing\\_page.php](http://www.mmf.mb.ca/land_claims_landing_page.php) (accessed December 30, 2021).
- Mann, Barbara Alice. “Forbidden Ground: Racial Politics and Hidden Identity in James Fennimore Cooper’s Leather-Stocking Tales.” PhD Dissertation, University of Toledo, 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “The Fire at Onondaga: Wampum as Proto-Writing.” *Akwesasne Notes* 1, no. 1 (1995): 40-48.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “The Lynx in Time: The Haudenosaunee Women’s Tradition in History.” *American Indian Quarterly* 21, no. 3 (1997): 423-449.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Epilogue: Euro-Forming the Data.” In *Debating Democracy: Native American Legacy of Freedom*, edited by Bruce E. Johansen, Donald A. Grinde and Barbara A. Mann, 160-189. San Jose: Clearlight Publishers, 1998.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Native Americans, Archaeologists, and the Mounds*. New York: Peter Lang, 2003.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Curriculum Vitae.” University of Toledo: Jessup Scott Honors College.  
<https://www.utoledo.edu/honors/pdfs/Barbara%20Mann%20CV.pdf> (accessed May 19, 2021).
- Mann, Barbara A. and Jerry L. Fields. “A Sign in the Sky: Dating the League of the Haudenosaunee.” *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 21, no. 2 (1997): 105-163.
- Maracle, Lee. *Bobbi Lee, Indian Rebel*. Toronto: Women’s Press, 1990.
- Marie Rose Smith Fonds. “Series S0001 – Textual Records,” *Glenbow Archives Online Catalogue Search*, <https://searcharchives.ucalgary.ca/textual-records-36> (accessed February 27, 2023).
- Martinez Cobo, J.R. *Study of the Problem of Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations, Volume 5: Conclusions, Proposals, and Recommendations*. New York: United Nations, 1987.
- McCall, Sophie. *First Person Plural: Aboriginal Storytelling and the Ethics of Collaborative Authorship*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2011.
- McCallum, Mary Jane Logan. Review of Dr. Oronhyatekha: Security, Justice, and Equality, by Keith Jamieson and Michelle A. Hamilton. *Canadian Historical Review* 99, no. 2 (June 2018): 322-323.
- McDougall, Robert L. “Duncan Campbell Scott.” The Canadian Encyclopedia.  
<https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/duncan-campbell-scott> (accessed January 30, 2021).

- McElwain, Thomas. *Mythological Tales and the Allegany Seneca: A Study of Socio-Religious Context of Traditional Oral Phenomena in an Iroquois Community*. Stockholm: Almqvists and Wiskell International, 1978.
- McGreevey, Nora. “751 Unmarked Graves Discovered Near Former Indigenous School in Canada.” *Smithsonian Magazine* (June 28, 2021). <https://www.smithsonianmag.com/smart-news/751-unmarked-graves-discovered-near-former-indigenous-school-canada-180978064/> (accessed February 19, 2023).
- McLachlin, Beverley, Louis LeBel, Morris J. Fish, Rosalie Silberman Abella, Marshall Rothstein, Thomas Albert Cromwell, Michael J. Moldaver, and Andromache Karakatsanis. “Manitoba Metis Federation Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General) – SCC Cases.” Supreme Court of Canada. <https://decisions.scc-csc.ca/scc-csc/scc-csc/en/item/12888/index.do> (accessed January 30, 2022).
- McLeod, Neal. *Cree Narrative Memory: From Treaties to Contemporary Times*. Saskatoon: Purich Publishing Limited, 2007.
- McNab, David T. “Hearty Co-operation and Efficient Aid: The Métis and Treaty #3.” *Canadian Journal of Native Studies* III, no. 2 (1983): 131-149.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Landscape and Mindscape Conjoined: The Empire of Nature and the Nature of Empires in the Journals of Ezhaaswe (William A. Elias) (c. 1848–1929).” In *The Nature of Empires and Empires of Nature: Indigenous Peoples and the Great Lakes Environment*, edited by Karl S. Hele, 221-238. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2013.
- McNeil, Paul, L.V. Hills, B. Kooyman, and M. Shayne Tolman. “Late Pleistocene Geology and Fauna of the Wally’s Beach Site (DhPg-8) Alberta, Canada.” In *Archaeology on the Edge: New Perspectives from the Northern Plains*, edited by Brian Kooyman and Jane H. Kelley, 79-94. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004.
- Metis Association of Alberta, Joe Sawchuk, Patricia Sawchuk, and Theresa Ferguson. *Metis Land Rights in Alberta: A Political History*. Edmonton: Metis Association of Alberta, 1981.
- Métis Heritage Association of the Northwest Territories and Parks Canada. *Picking Up the Threads: Métis History in the Mackenzie Basin*. Winnipeg: Métis Heritage Association of the Northwest Territories, 1998.
- Métis Nation British Columbia. BC Métis Mapping Research Project. <http://document.bcmetiscitizen.ca/> (accessed December 18, 2021).
- Métis Nation of Alberta. “Métis in Alberta: Timeline.” Métis Nation of Alberta. <https://albertametis.com/metis-in-alberta/timeline/> (accessed August 31, 2021).
- Metis National Council, *The Metis Nation* I (Fall 1984).
- Metis Settlements General Council. “Metis Settlements of Alberta: Our People.” <https://msgc.ca/#ourpeople> (accessed October 1, 2022).
- Mignolo, Walter D. *Local Histories/Global Designs: Coloniality, Subaltern Knowledges, and Border Thinking*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009.

- \_\_\_ *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global Futures, Decolonial Options*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2011.
- Miller, Susan A. "Native America Writes Back: The Origin of the Indigenous Paradigm in Historiography." *Wicazo Sa Review* 23, no. 2 (2009): 9-28.
- \_\_\_ "Native Historians Write Back: The Indigenous Paradigm in American Indian Historiography." *Wicazo Sa Review* 24, no. 1 (2009): 25-45.
- Miller, Susan A. and James Riding In. *Native Historians Write Back: Decolonizing American Indian History*. Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 2011.
- Mississaugas of the New Credit First Nation. "Mississaugas of the New Credit First Nation: Traditional Territory, Revised 2014." Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation. <http://www.newcreditfirstnation2015.com/wp-content/uploads/MNCFN-Traditional-Map.pdf> (accessed July 7, 2021).
- Mohawk, John. "Clear Thinking: A Positive Solitary View of Nature." In *Original Instructions: Indigenous Teachings for a Sustainable Future*, edited by Melissa K. Nelson, 48-52. Rochester: Bear and Company, 2008.
- Montaigne, Michel de. *The Complete Essays*. Translated by M.A. Screech. London: Penguin Books, 2003.
- Montour, Enos T. *The Rockhound of Jerusalem: Being the Saga of Dr. Gilbert Clarence Monture*. St. Catharine's: Self-Published, 1981.
- \_\_\_ *Brown Tom's School Days*. Edited by Elizabeth Graham. Waterloo: Self-Published, 1985.
- Monture, Ethel Brant. *Famous Indians: Brant, Crowfoot, Oronhyatekha*. Toronto: Clarke, Irwin, 1960.
- Morgan, Cecilia. "Performing for 'Imperial Eyes': Bernice Loft and Ethel Brant Monture, Ontario, 1930s-60s." In *Contact Zones: Aboriginal and Settler Women in Canada's Colonial Past*, edited by Katie Pickles and Maya Rutherford, 67-89. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005.
- \_\_\_ *Creating Colonial Pasts: History, Memory, and Commemoration in Southern Ontario*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2015.
- Morgan, Lewis Henry. *Ancient Society: Or Researches in the Lines of Human Progress from Savagery, Through Barbarism to Civilization*. Chicago: C.K. Kerr, 1877.
- \_\_\_ *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*, in two volumes. Edited by Herbert M. Lloyd. New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1901, 1904, and 1922.
- \_\_\_ *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*. Edited by Herbert M. Lloyd. New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1904, and 1922.
- \_\_\_ *League of the Ho-dé-no-sau-nee, or, Iroquois*. Edited by Herbert M. Lloyd. New Haven: Human Relations Area Files Reprint, 1954.
- \_\_\_ *League of the Iroquois*, reissue of the 1851 edition. Secaucus: The Citadel Press, 1962, 1996.
- Moses, Olive, Doris Henhawk, and Lloyd King. *History of Education on the Six Nations Reserve*. Brantford: Woodland Cultural Education Centre, 1987.

- Murray, David. *Forked Tongues: Speech, Writing, and Representation in North American Indian Texts*. London: Pinter, 1991.
- Neale, Margo and Lynne Kelly. *Songlines: The Power and the Promise*. Port Melbourne: Thames and Hudson, 2020.
- New York State Library. "Arthur Caswell Parker Papers, 1915-1953." New York State Library. <https://www.nysl.nysed.gov/msscfa/sc13604.htm> (accessed December 21, 2021).
- Neylan, Susan. *The Heavens Are Changing: Nineteenth-Century Protestant Missions and Tsimshian Christianity*. Montréal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2003.
- Nicks, Trudy and Kenneth Morgan. "Grande Cache: The Historic Development of an Indigenous Alberta Métis Population." In *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*, editors Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown, 163-181. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985.
- Norman, Alison. "'True to My Own Noble Race' Six Nations Women Teachers at Grand River in the Early Twentieth Century." *Ontario History* 107, no. 1 (Spring 2015): 5-34.
- O'Brien, Jean M. *Firsting and Lasting: Writing Indians Out of Existence in New England*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010.
- Oberg, Michael Leroy. *Professional Indian: The American Odyssey of Eleazar W. Williams*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015.
- Oetelaar, Gerald A. "Beyond Activity Areas: Structure and Symbolism in the Organization and Use of Space Inside Tipis." *Plains Archaeologist* 45, no. 71 (2000): 35-61.
- Oetelaar, Gerald A. and D. Joy Oetelaar. "The Landscape as Historical Archive Among Hunter-Gatherers of the Northern Plains." In *Structured Worlds: The Archaeology of Hunter-Gatherer Thought and Action*, edited by Aubrey Cannon, 69-94. Sheffield: Equinox Publishing Ltd., 2011.
- Osborn, G. "A Brief Sketch of the Life of Author." In *History of the Ojebway Indians with Especial Reference to Their Conversion to Christianity* by Peter Jones, 1-23. London: A.W. Bennett, 1861.
- Osborne, Carla. "A Métis Palimpsest: Being an Exploration of Métis Identity Through Places, Stories, and Personal Reflection." *Anthropology* 503: Advanced Ethnography of the Métis, Instructor Mike Evans. Final Class Project, University of British Columbia – Okanagan, September 2010.
- Parker, Arthur C. "The Origins of the Iroquois as Suggested by Their Archaeology." *American Anthropologist* 18 (1916): 479-507.
- Parker, Robert Dale. *Changing is Not Vanishing: A Collection of American Indian Poetry to 1930*. Pittsburgh: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011.
- Parks Canada. Batoche National Historic Site. <https://www.pc.gc.ca/en/lhn-nhs/sk/batoche> (accessed January 23, 2022).
- Parry, Milman. "Studies in the Epic Technique of Oral Verse-Making I: Homer and the Homeric Style." *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 41 (1930): 73-147.

- \_\_\_\_ “Studies in the Epic Technique of Oral Verse-Making II: The Homeric Language as the Language of an Oral Poetry.” *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 43 (1932): 1-50.
- Paul, Daniel N. *We Were Not the Savages: A Micmac Perspective on the Collision of European and Aboriginal Civilizations*. Halifax: Nimbus, 1993.
- Paul, Elsie in collaboration with Paige Raibmon and Harmony Johnson. *Written as I Remember It: Teachings (ᑭᐱᓄᓐ ᓐᓂᐱᓐ)* From the Life of a Sliammon Elder. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2014.
- Payment, Diane. “Batoche (1870-1910): Profil d’une communauté métisse, Naissance-Expansion-Déclin.” Thèse de maîtrise ès arts, l’Université d’Ottawa, 1982.
- Peel’s Prairie Provinces. “Hit List – Query: metis rebellion.” Newspaper archive search result, February 23, 2023. <http://peel.library.ualberta.ca/search/?search=raw&pageNumber=1&index=newspapers&field=body&digstatus=&rawQuery=metis+rebellion>.
- Pelletier, Émile. *A Social History of the Manitoba Metis: The Development and Loss of Aboriginal Rights*. Winnipeg: Métis Federation Press, 1974.
- \_\_\_\_ *The Exploitation of Métis Land*. Winnipeg: Manitoba Métis Federation Press, 1975.
- \_\_\_\_ “A Glimpse of the Manitoba Métis Federation.” In *The Other Natives, The – Les Métis: Volume Two – Tome Deux, 1885 – 1978*, edited by Antoine S. Lussier and D. Bruce Sealey, 155-169. Winnipeg: Manitoba Métis Federation Press and Éditions Bois-Brûlés, 1978.
- Pemmican Publications. “About Us.” Pemmican Publications. <http://pemmican.websites.ca/About-Pemmican-Publications.page> (accessed December 30, 2021).
- Perron, Marie-Louise. “‘L’Origine des Canards Gris’: Conte folklorique Métis et/ou étude en sociologie populaire.” *Saskatchewan History* XL, no. 3 (1987): 99-108.
- Perron, Marie-Louise. “The Origin of Grey Ducks.” In *Metis Legacy II: Michif Culture, Heritage and Folkways*, edited by Lawrence J. Barkwell, Leah M. Dorion, and Audreen Hourie, 48-50. Saskatoon: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 2006.
- Peter Lang. “Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas.” Peter Land Group AG. <https://www.peterlang.com/document/1101970> (accessed December 31, 2021).
- Peters, Evelyn, Matthew Stock, and Adrian Werner. *Rooster Town: The History of an Urban Métis Community, 1901 – 1961*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2018.
- Peterson, Jacqueline and Jennifer S.H. Brown, eds. *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985.
- \_\_\_\_ “Introduction.” In *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*, eds. Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown, 3-16. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985.
- Petrone, Penny. “Aboriginal Literature: 4. 1982 to 1996.” In *The Oxford Companion to Canadian Literature*, edited by William Toye and Eugene Benson. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acref/9780195411676.001.0001> (accessed August 26, 2021).

- Petrone, S. Penny. "Brant-Sero, John Ojijatekha." Dictionary of Canadian Biography.  
[http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/brant\\_sero\\_john\\_ojijatekha\\_14E.html](http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/brant_sero_john_ojijatekha_14E.html) (accessed January 30, 2021).
- Petten, Cheryl. "Dr. Anne Anderson, Teacher, Author Makes Good on a Promise to Her Mother." *Windspeaker*, February 1, 2005, Footprints, 26.
- Pierce, Maris Bryant. *Address on the Present Condition and Prospects of the Aboriginal Inhabitants of North America, With Particular Reference to the Seneca Nation*. Philadelphia: J. Richards, Printer, 1839.
- Poulter, Gillian. *Becoming Native in a Foreign Land: Sport, Visual Culture and Identity in Montréal, 1840-85*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009.
- Poussart, Annick. "Marcien Ferland." The Canadian Encyclopedia.  
<https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/marcien-ferland-emc> (accessed December 31, 2021).
- Pratt, Mary Louise. *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Quijano, Aníbal. "Coloniality and Modernity/Rationality." *Cultural Studies* 21, nos. 2-3 (2007): 168-178.
- Quintana, Elizabeth / Akwe:kon Press. "Haudenosaunee Homelands, c. 1500." In *Encyclopedia of the Haudenosaunee (Iroquois)*, edited by Bruce Elliott Johansen and Barbara Alice Mann, vii. Westport: Greenwood Press, 2000.
- Racette, Sherry Farrell. "Sewing Ourselves Together: Clothing, Decorative Arts, and the Expression of Metis and Half Breed Identity." PhD Dissertation, University of Manitoba, 2004.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Sewing For a Living: The Commodification of Métis Women's Artistic Production." In *Contact Zones: Aboriginal and Settler Women in Canada's Colonial Past*, edited by Katie Pickles and Maya Rutherford, 17-46. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "My Grandmothers Loved to Trade: The Indigenization of European Trade Goods in Historic and Contemporary Canada." *Journal of Museum Ethnography* 20 (2008): 69-81.
- Reder, Deanna and Linda M. Morra, editors. *Learn, Teach, Challenge: Approaching Indigenous Literatures*. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2016.
- "Rediscovered Native History Notebooks Donated to Oneida (June 3, 1999)." University of Wisconsin-Madison News. <https://news.wisc.edu/rediscovered-native-history-notebooks-donated-to-oneida/> (accessed October 10, 2020).
- Ritchie, William A. "Arthur Caswell Parker – 1881 – 1955." *American Antiquity* 21, no. 3 (January 1956): 293-295.
- River Campus Libraries. "Arthur Caswell Parker Papers Finding Aid." University of Rochester River Campus Libraries. <https://rbscp.lib.rochester.edu/finding-aids/AP23> (accessed January 21, 2021).
- Rochter, Daniel K. "The States, the United States and the Canandaigua Treaty." In *Treaty of Canandaigua, 1794*, edited by G. Peter Jemison and Anna M. Schein, 76-83. Santa Fe: Clear Light Publishers, 2000.

- Rogers, Dorothy. "Bonnin, Gertrude Simmons." In *The Dictionary of Modern American Philosophers*, edited by John R. Shook. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. <https://www-oxfordreference-com.ezproxy.library.uvic.ca/view/10.1093/acref/9780199754663.001.0001/acref-9780199754663-e-116> (accessed August 26, 2021).
- Rothenberg, Diane. "On the Insanity of Cornplanter (Part One)." Jacket2, Commentary on Modern and Contemporary Poetry. <https://jacket2.org/commentary/diane-rothenberg-insanity-cornplanter-part-one> (accessed September 1, 2021).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "On the Insanity of Cornplanter (Part Two) [redux]." Jacket2, Commentary on Modern and Contemporary Poetry. <https://jacket2.org/commentary/diane-rothenberg-insanity-cornplanter-part-two-redux> (accessed September 1, 2021).
- Round, Phillip H. *Removable Type: Histories of the Book in Indian Country, 1663-1880*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2010.
- Ruffo, Armand Garnett, editor. *(Ad)dressing Our Words: Aboriginal Perspectives on Aboriginal Literatures*. Penticton: Theytus Books, 2001.
- Ruoff, A. LaVonne Brown and Donald B. Smith, editors. *Life, Letters, and Speeches, George Copway (Kahgegahbowh)*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1997.
- Rupertsland Institute. *Strategic Plan 2022 – 2027*. Edmonton: Rupertsland Institute, 2022.
- Ruppert, James. *Mediation in Contemporary Native American Fiction*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995.
- Rutherford, Paul. *A Victorian Authority: The Daily Press in Late Nineteenth-Century Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1982.
- Said, Edward. *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1978.
- Sampson, Geoffrey. *Writing Systems: A Linguistic Introduction*. London: Hutchinson, 1985.
- Santos-Granero, Fernando. "Writing History into the Landscape: Space, Myth, and Ritual in Contemporary Amazonia." *American Ethnologist* 25, no. 2 (May 1998): 128-148.
- Sarris, Greg. *Keeping Slug Woman Alive: A Holistic Approach to American Indian Texts*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.
- Saskatchewan Indigenous Cultural Centre. "Library and Information Services." <https://www.sicc.sk.ca/library-information-services> (accessed February 19, 2023).
- Sealey, D. Bruce. *Statutory Land Rights of the Manitoba Métis*. Winnipeg: Manitoba Métis Federation Press, 1975.
- Seaver, James E. *Life of Mary Jemison: Deh-he-wä-mis*, 4<sup>th</sup> Edition. New York: Miller, Orton, and Mulligan, 1856.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *A Narrative of the Life of Mrs. Mary Jemison*. Canandaigua: J.D. Bemis and Co., 1824.
- Silko, Leslie Marmon. *Almanac of the Dead: A Novel*. New York: Penguin Books, 1991.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Yellow Woman and a Beauty of Spirit: Essays on Native American Life Today*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1996.

- Simmons, Deborah. "In Tribute to Howard Adams." *Political Economy* 68 (2002): 5-12.
- Simpson, Audra. *Mohawk Interruptus {Political Life Across the Borders of Settler States}*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2014.
- Simpson, Leanne and Kiera L. Ladner, editors. *This is an Honor Song: Twenty Years Since the Blockades*. Winnipeg: Arbeiter Ring Publishing, 2010.
- Sioui, Georges E. *Pour une autohistoire amérindienne: essai sur les fondements d'une morale sociale*. Québec: Presses de l'Université Laval, 1989.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "La civilisation wendate." PhD Dissertation, Université Laval, 1991.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *For an Amerindian Autohistory: An Essay on the Foundations of a Social Ethic*. Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1992.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Huron-Wendat: The Heritage of the Circle*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Eatenonha: Native Roots of Modern Democracy*. Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2019.
- Six Nations of the Grand River. *Land Rights: A Global Solution for the Six Nations of the Grand River*. Ohsweken: Six Nations Lands and Resources Department, 2019.
- Smith, Adam. *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations*. London: T. Nelson and Sons, 1887.
- Smith, Donald B. "Opinion: Seen but Not Seen: Why Did Canada Fail to Respect Indigenous Societies and Culture?" *Calgary Herald*, May 29, 2011.  
<https://calgaryherald.com/opinion/columnists/opinion-seen-but-not-seen-why-did-canada-fail-to-respect-indigenous-societies-and-culture> (accessed June 14, 2021).
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Sacred Feathers: The Reverend Peter Jones (Kahkewaquonaby) and the Mississauga Indians*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2013.
- Smith, Linda Tuhiwai. *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*. London: Zed Books, 1999.
- Smith, Marie Rose. "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, June 1948, Volume 11, 19, 30-31, 34.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, September 1948, Volume 11, 72-73, 76-77.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, December 1948, Volume 11, 144-145, 148-149.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, March 1949, Volume 12, 212-213, 216-217, 220-221, 224-225.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, June 1949, Volume 12, 12-13, 40-41.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, September 1949, Volume 12, 16-17, 36-37.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, October 1949, Volume 12, 15, 18-19, 30.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, November 1949, Volume 12, 15, 18-19.

- \_\_\_ "Eighty Years on the Plains." *Canadian Cattlemen*, December 1949, Volume 12, 4-5, 48-49.
- Society of Friends of Genesee, New York, Philadelphia and Baltimore. *A Further Illustration of the Case of the Seneca Indians in the State of New York, in a Review of a Pamphlet Entitled "An Appeal to the Christian Community, etc. by Nathaniel T. Strong, A Chief of the Seneca Tribe."* Philadelphia: Merrihew and Thompson, 1841.
- Southesk, James Carnegie. *Saskatchewan and the Rocky Mountains: A Diary and Narrative of Travel, Sport, and Adventure Through the Hudson's Bay Company's Territories in 1859 and 1869.* Toronto: J. Campbell, 1875.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. "Can the Subaltern Speak?" In *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*, edited by Cary Nelson and Lawrence Grossberg, 66-111. London: Macmillan, 1988.
- \_\_\_ *A Critique of Postcolonial Reason: Toward a History of the Vanishing Present.* Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1999.
- Spry, Irene M. "The Métis and Mixed-Bloods of Rupert's Land Before 1870." In *The New Peoples: Being and Becoming Métis in North America*, edited by Jacqueline Peterson and Jennifer S.H. Brown, 95-118. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 1985.
- St-Onge, Nicole J.M. "Race, Class and Marginality: A Métis Settlement in the Manitoba Interlake, 1850-1914." PhD Thesis, University of Manitoba, 1990.
- St. Onge, Nicole. *Saint-Laurent, Manitoba: Evolving Métis Identities, 1850-1915.* Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre, University of Regina, 2004.
- Stacey, C.P., editor. *Records of the Nile Voyageurs, 1884-1885: The Canadian Voyageur Contingent in the Gordon Relief Expedition.* Toronto: Champlain Society, 1959.
- Stamper, Ed, Helen Windy Boy, and Ken Morsette Jr., eds. *The History of the Chippewa Cree of Rocky Boy's Indian Reservation.* Box Elder: Stone Child College, 2008.
- Stanley, George F.G. *The Birth of Western Canada: A History of the Riel Rebellions.* London: Longmans, Green, 1936.
- Steckley, John L. *Words of the Huron.* Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2007.
- Steen-McIntyre, Virginia, Roald Fryxell, and Harold E. Malde. "Geologic Evidence for Age of Deposits at Hueyatlaco Archaeological Site, Valsequillo, Mexico." *Quaternary Research* 16, no. 1 (1981): 1-17.
- Stevenson, Angus and Christine A. Lindberg, editors. *The New Oxford American Dictionary*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Stevenson, Winona. "Calling Badger and the Symbols of the Spirit Language: The Cree Origins of the Syllabic System." *Oral History Forum* 19-20 (1999): 19-24.
- Stonechild, Blair. *The New Buffalo: The Struggle for Aboriginal Post-Secondary Education.* Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2006.
- Strong-Boag, Veronica and Carole Gerson. *Paddling Her Own Canoe: The Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000.

- Strong, Nathaniel T. *Appeal to the Christian Community on the Conditions and Prospects of the New York Indians*. Philadelphia: J. Richards, 1839.
- Sturtevant, William C. "David and Dennis Cusick: Early Iroquois Realist Artists." *American Indian Art Magazine* 31, no. 3 (2006): 44-55.
- Sullivan, Paul. "Anthropology and Ethnohistory of the Maya." *Reviews in Anthropology* 43, no. 4 (2014): 260-281.
- Sutherland, R.J., Gretchen Albers and Zach Parrott. "Jay's Treaty." The Canadian Encyclopedia. <https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/jays-treaty> (accessed August 15, 2022).
- Swift, Gabriel. "David Cusick's Sketches of Ancient History of the Six Nations." Princeton Collections of the American West. <https://blogs.princeton.edu/westernamericana/2013/11/25/david-cusicks-sketches-of-ancient-history-of-the-six-nations/> (accessed January 30, 2022).
- Syracuse University Libraries. "Harvey Chalmers Papers (Finding Aid)." Syracuse University Libraries Special Collections Research Center. [https://library.syr.edu/digital/guides/print/chalmers\\_h\\_prt.htm](https://library.syr.edu/digital/guides/print/chalmers_h_prt.htm) (accessed January 30, 2021).
- Talman, James J. "Historical Introduction." In *The Journal of Major John Norton, 1816*, edited by Carl F. Klinck and James J. Talman, xcix-cxx. Toronto: Champlain Society, 2011.
- Tedlock, Dennis. Introduction to *Popul Vuh: The Mayan Book of the Dawn of Life*, Revised Edition. Translated by Dennis Tedlock. New York: Touchstone, 1996.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *2000 Years of Mayan Literature*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2015.
- Teillet, Jean. "The Boundaries of the Métis Nation." Presentation on Métis Nation Constitutional Reform Portal, posted December 19, 2019. <http://www.metisportals.ca/cons/?p=1811> (accessed October 13, 2020).
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The North-West is Our Mother: The Story of Louis Riel's People, The Métis Nation*. Toronto: HarperCollins Publishers Ltd., 2019a.
- Thomas, Yvonne. "Our Centre and Founders." Jake Thomas Learning Centre. <https://jakethomaslearningcentre.ca/welcome> (accessed December 21, 2021).
- Tillett, Rebecca. *Contemporary Native American Literature*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007.
- Todd, Zoe. "From a Fishy Place: Examining Canadian State Law Applied in the Daniels Decision from the Perspective of Métis Legal Orders." *Topia* 36 (2016): 43-57.
- Tooker, Elisabeth. "Lewis Henry Morgan, the Myth and the Man." *University of Rochester Library Bulletin* XXXVII (1984): 23-48.
- Tooker, Elisabeth and Barbara Graymont. "5. J.N.B. Hewitt." *Histories of Anthropology Annual* 3 (2007): 70-98.
- Tough, Frank. "The Establishment of a Commercial Fishing Industry and the Demise of Native Fisheries in Northern Manitoba." *Canadian Journal of Native Studies* IV, no. 2 (1984): 303-319.

- \_\_\_\_ Métis Archival Research Lab. <https://www.ualberta.ca/native-studies/research/map-lab> (accessed December 18, 2021).
- Tough, Frank and Véronique Boisvert. “‘I am a Half-breed Head of a Family...’: A Database Approach to Affidavits Completed by the Métis of Manitoba, ca. 1875 – 1877.” In *Histoires et identités métisses: A Tribute to Gabriel Dumont*, edited by Denis Gagnon, Denis Combet, and Lise Gabourg-Diallo, 141-184. Winnipeg: Presses Universitaires de Saint-Boniface, 2006.
- Tough, Frank and Erin McGregor. “‘The Rights to the Land May be Transferred’: Archival Records as Colonial Texts – A Narrative of Métis Scrip.” In *Natives and Settlers Now and Then: Historical Issues and Current Perspectives on Treaties and Land Claims*, edited by Paul W. DePasquale, 33-63. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2007.
- Trémaudan, A.H. de. *Histoire de la Nation Métisse Dans L’Ouest Canadien*. Montréal: Éditions Albert Lévesque, 1935.
- \_\_\_\_ *Hold High Your Heads (History of the Métis Nation in Western Canada)*. Translated by Elizabeth Maguet. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 1982.
- Trevithick, Scott. “Newhouse, Seth (Dayodekane).” Dictionary of Canadian Biography. [http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/newhouse\\_seth\\_15E.html](http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/newhouse_seth_15E.html) (accessed January 30, 2021).
- Trigger, Bruce G. *A History of Archaeological Thought*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada. *The Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada Volume 4: Missing Children and Unmarked Burials*. Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2015.
- Tsianina, K. “The Society of American Indians.” In *The Oxford Research Encyclopedia of American History*, edited by Jon Butler. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780199329175.013.31> (accessed August 26, 2021).
- Turtle Island Productions LLC. “The Story,” Searching for Sequoyah. <https://searchingforsequoyah.com/the-story/> (accessed February 17, 2023).
- “Tuscarora Chiefs Suspended.” *New York Times*, June 8, 1888, 6.
- U’mista Cultural Centre. “About Us.” <https://www.umista.ca/pages/about-us> (accessed February 19, 2023).
- United States of America, United States Department of State. *The Indian Reorganization Act*, June 18, 1934.
- Urton, Gary. *Inka History in Knots: Reading Khipus as Primary Sources*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2017.
- Vansina, Jan. *Oral Tradition as History*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1985.
- Vetch, Robert Hamilton. “Gordon, Charles George.” In *Dictionary of National Biography: Volume 22*, edited by Leslie Stephen and Sidney Lee, 169-176. London: Smith, Elder, and Co., 1890.

- Vivanco, Luis A. *A Dictionary of Cultural Anthropology*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018. <https://www-oxfordreference-com.ezproxy.library.uvic.ca/view/10.1093/acref/9780191836688.001.0001/acref-9780191836688-miscMatter-1-div1-10> (accessed August 5, 2022).
- Voth, Daniel Jacob-Paul. "The Devil's Northern Triangle: Howard Adams and Métis Multidimensional Relationships With and Within Colonialism." PhD Dissertation, University of British Columbia, 2015.
- Walsh, Susan. "'With Them Was My Home': Native American Autobiography and a Narrative of the Life of Mrs. Mary Jemison." *American Literature* 64, no. 1 (1992): 49-70.
- Wampum Trail Research Team. "The Wampum Trail Research Team." On the Wampum Trail. <https://wampumtrail.wordpress.com/> (accessed February 14, 2022).
- Warren, William Whipple. *History of the Ojibways, Based Upon Traditions and Oral Statements*. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society, 1885.
- Warrior, Robert Allen. *Tribal Secrets: Recovering American Indian Intellectual Traditions*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The People and the Word: Reading and Native Nonfiction*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005.
- Weaver, Jace. *Other Words: American Indian Literature, Law and Culture*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2001.
- Weaver, Jace, Craig S. Womack and Robert Warrior. *American Indian Literary Nationalism*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2006.
- Weekes, Mary. *The Last Buffalo Hunter*. Saskatoon: Fifth House, 1939 [1994].
- Wheeler, Winona. "The Journals and Voices of a Church of England Native Catechist: Askenootow (Charles Pratt), 1851-1884." In *Reading Beyond Words: Contexts for Native History*, editors Jennifer S.H. Brown and Elizabeth Vibert, 304-329. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 2003.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Reflections on the Social Relations of Indigenous Oral Histories." In *Walking a Tightrope: Aboriginal People and Their Representations*, edited by David T. McNab and Ute Lischke, 189-213. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press, 2005.
- Wickwire, Wendy. "Stories from the Margins: Toward a More Inclusive BC Historiography." *Journal of American Folklore* 118, no. 470 (Fall 2005): 453-474.
- Wiles-Heape, Brian. "Introduction: An Interview With Chief Jacob E. Thomas, Friday 14 April 1989." In *The Constitution of the Confederacy by the Peacemaker* by Seth Newhouse, i-viii. Revised by Chief Jacob E. Thomas. Wilsonville: Sandpiper Press, 1989.
- Wilkes, Barbara. "Introduction." *Anthropology 355: An Ethnographic Survey of Native North America*. Class lecture, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, January 15, 2005.
- "William Canfield, Utica Editor, Dies." *New York Times*, August 28, 1937, 6.

- “William N. Fenton, 96, Expert on Iroquois, is Dead.” *New York Times*, June 23, 2005. <https://www.nytimes.com/2005/06/23/nyregion/william-n-fenton-96-expert-on-iroquois-is-dead.html> (accessed January 1, 2022).
- Williams, Benjamin. “Appendix One: Introduction to the Williams Text.” In *Chainbreaker: The Revolutionary War Memoirs of Governor Blacksnake as Told to Benjamin Williams*, 227-228. Edited by Thomas S. Abler. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1989 [2005].
- Williams, Eleazer. *Life of Te-ho-ra-gwa-ne-gen: Alias Thomas Williams, a Chief of the Caughnawaga Tribe of Indians in Canada*. Albany: J. Munsell, 1859.
- Williams, Kayanesenh Paul. *Kayanesenkó:wa: The Great Law of Peace*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2018.
- Wilson, Michael C. “Editing the Cultural Landscape: A Taphonomic Perspective on the Destruction of Aboriginal Sites on the Northwestern Plains.” In *Archaeology on the Edge: New Perspectives from the Northern Plains*, edited by Bryan Kooyman and Jane H. Kelley, 53-77. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2004.
- Wolf, Eric R. *Europe and the People Without History*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997 [1982].
- Wolfe, Patrick. *Settler Colonialism and the Transformation of Anthropology: The Politics and Poetics of an Ethnographic Event*. London: Cassell, 1999.
- Womack, Craig S. *Red on Red: Native Literary Separatism*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1999.
- Woodbury, Hanni. “Appendix 2: Relationship Between the Reelicited Text and the Manuscript.” In *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser’s Manuscript*, 708-714. Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Biography.” Hanni Woodbury Prints. <https://www.hanniwoodbury.com/bio> (accessed December 12, 2021).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Hanni Woodbury on Documenting an Endangered Language, 23 February 2018.” University of Toronto Press Blog. <https://utorontopress.com/blog/2018/02/23/hanni-woodbury-on-documenting-an-endangered-language/> (accessed December 21, 2021).
- \_\_\_\_\_. “Introduction.” In *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser’s Manuscript*, xi-xviii. Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992.
- \_\_\_\_\_. “The Gibson-Goldenweiser Text: Its Place in the Iroquoian Oral Tradition.” In *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga by John Arthur Gibson. Newly Elicited, Edited and Translated by Hanni Woodbury in Collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the Basis of Goldenweiser’s Manuscript*, xix-lxi. Winnipeg: Algonquin and Iroquoian Linguistics, 1992.

Woodcock, George. Translator's Introduction to *The Métis in the Canadian West*, by Marcel Giraud. Translated by George Woodcock. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1986.

Woodland Cultural Centre. "About the Centre." Woodland Cultural Centre. <https://woodlandculturalcentre.ca/about-us/> (accessed December 21, 2021).

\_\_\_\_\_. "The Campaign." Woodland Cultural Centre. <https://woodlandculturalcentre.ca/the-campaign/> (accessed December 21, 2021).

Wright, Donald. *The Professionalization of History in English Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005.

Yates, Frances A. *The Art of Memory*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966.

Zumwalt, Rosemary Lévy. *Franz Boas: The Emergence of the Anthropologist*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska, 2019.

### ***Multimedia***

For Seven Generations: An Information Legacy of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples. CD-ROM. Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples. Ottawa: Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1997.

Goodminds.com. "The Great Peace... The Gathering of Good Minds CD-ROM." <https://web.archive.org/web/20030213104529/http://greatpeace.org/> (accessed November 21, 2021).

*High Steel*. DVD. Directed by Don Owen. National Film Board, 1965.

*Mohawk Ironworkers*. Series. Directed by Paul Rickard, Courtney Montour, Michelle Smith, Margaret Horn, and Jeff Dorn. Mushkeg Media, 2014.