Empty Spaces in Epistemology: Perspectives of Persons Holding Doctorates on the
Future of Knowledge Creation

by

Odette Laramee

A Project Report Submitted in Partial Fulfilment

MASTER OF EDUCATION
in Leadership Studies

Department of Educational Psychology and Leadership Studies

This project is accepted as conforming
to the required standard

Project Supervisor: Darlene E. Clover, PhD

© Odette Laramee, 2006
University of Victoria

Dr. Darlene E. Clover

Abstract

Universities are sites of intensive formal adult education. The academic community is instrumental in the creation and dissemination of new knowledge. This study examines the perspectives of persons holding doctorates with regards to the future of knowledge creation. The methodology and methods employed are qualitative arts-based inquiry using a new media lens. The objective of this research is to explore, develop, and produce arts-based DVD(s) that foster dialogue and encourage thinking about the relationship between new sciences and contemplative practice/consciousness studies. The question is: in what ways can digital images provide a platform for dialogue regarding contemporary science and contemplative practice/consciousness studies? During the first phase of the study, an arts-based DVD was distributed and a questionnaire emailed to each participant. The second phase engaged participants in semi-structured in-person interviews. These major themes emerged from the data: 1) overview of knowledge creation in a Western, male dominated knowledge paradigm; 2) examination of the present day university community in an intellectually imperialist, ethnocentric, capitalist, rational/logical, objectivist, mechanistic, knowledge framework; 3) exploration of new sciences and practice based contemplative epistemologies and the potential institutional and socio-political shifts these knowledge(s) could engender amongst educators and peers in the research community. Findings are presented as an arts-based DVD entitled, *Virtual Conference: The Universe - The University* followed by discussion and conclusion.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

Introduction

Qualitative Study

Arts-Based Inquiry

New Media Lens

Project Setting and Participants

Data Collection Instruments

Data Analysis Methods

CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS

DVD enclosure The Universe - The University: Virtual Conference

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Introduction

The Knowledge and The Institution

The Empirical and The Spiritual

The Coda

Conclusion

REFERENCES

Appendix A   Participant Consent Form

Appendix B   Introduction Letter to Participants

Appendix C   Questionnaire, (Phase 1 data collection)

Appendix D   Cover Letter for DVD, (Phase 1 data collection)

Appendix E   Drama, "Not a Single Straight Line" (Phase 1 data analysis)

Appendix F   Still Images from Images DVD

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

During one of his visits, Carl Friedrich explained the fundamental ideas of his current attempt: 'All our thinking about nature must necessarily move in circles or spirals; for we can only understand nature if we think about her, and we can only think because our brain is built in accordance with nature's laws …. It is along these lines that I am trying to develop the group structure you have captured in your field equation - and with which the world is, in a sense, unfolded - by the superposition of alternatives' (Heisenberg, 1971, p.244).

'It won't do,' he continued animatedly, 'because that whole fabric of living things is not put together by logic. You see, when you get circular trains of causation, as you always do in the living world, the use of logic will make you walk into paradoxes …. metaphor. That's how this whole fabric of mental interconnections holds together. Metaphor is right at the bottom of being alive' (Bateson cited in Capra, 1988, p.76).

Don't be in such a hurry to believe next time - I'll tell you why - If you set to work to believe everything, you will tire out the muscles of your mind, and then you'll be so weak you won' t be able to believe the simplest true things (Carroll cited in Gardner, 1971, p.251).

In a report prepared for the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, a

questionnaire was sent to the heads of art departments in 175 universities and/or colleges.

Of the thirty-two returned, "several department heads reminded the researcher, the

primary mandate of these departments … was to prepare professionals, promote graduate

study, and conduct research" (McIntosh, 1993, p. 287). Aspects of the above do not differ

significantly from the definition of the term 'university' given in the Oxford dictionary:

"university n. educational institution instructing or examining students in many branches

of advanced learning, and conferring degrees; members of this collectively" (Allen, 1989,

p. 827). This study has sought to call into question, and expand upon, the above

definitions as regards the mandate, the practices, and the members of the institution.

Context of the Study

Perspectives presented by Denzin and Lincoln (1994) in the text, *Handbook of*

Qualitative Research set the background to this study,

> The West has become increasingly aware of the ecological disasters that
> massive industrialization and consumption have wrought. We have slowly
> begun to reconnect with the sense of conjoint destiny with Planet Earth.
> As these understandings increase, we are likely to see a reconsideration of
> whether science and religion are truly separate entities … concerns of the
> spirit are already returning to the human disciplines, and will be more
> important in the future. A sacred science is certain to make its effects felt
> within the emerging discourses of qualitative research (p. 582).

The study has also drawn upon the theoretical constructs of critical analysis outlined as,

"the belief that a politics of liberation must always begin with the perspectives, desires,

and dreams of those individuals and groups who have been oppressed by the larger

ideological, economic, and political forces of a society, or a historical moment" (p. 575).

Statement of the Problem

The problem probed in this study was the belief that 'reason', 'logic', 'rationality', 'empiricism', and 'objectivity', the historical cornerstones of the traditional scientific enterprise, are also the foundation of 'knowledge' within the university. The socio-political dimensions of this limited belief have been examined, and criticized, within the constructs of critical analysis and transformative learning theory. As Cranton (2005) explains, "The centrality of critical reflection to transformative learning theory is due in part to the theory and research being based almost exclusively in the North American [drawn primarily from European] culture, where rationality is strongly valued" (p. 631). She adds the perspective of Habermas in his criticism of,

> … instrumental rationality when it becomes such a pervasive ideology that we believe all knowledge is instrumental. In the Age of Enlightenment, the application of reason was seen as the way to solve the world's problems. As a result, empirical scientific method was viewed as superior to subjective, qualitative, or spiritual ways of knowing. Only recently has modernism (the reign of logic) been criticized in the social sciences and education as not allowing a deeper, more understanding human interaction (p. 633).

Cranton identifies this as one of the gaps in the literature of transformative learning theory and that of critical analysis, "Other learning styles, models or approaches to understand differences among people could also be used to explore alternative transformative processes, but this has not been addressed in this way very often in the literature" (p. 635). Cranton offers an example, of one possible alternative approach, as presented by Taylor, "it is not critical reflection that is at the centre of transformative learning, but discernment - a holistic orientation including receptivity, recognition, and grieving" (p. 635).

Purpose and Objectives

The purpose of the study was to explore knowledge creation within the university. The objective of the research was to engage three persons holding doctorates in an exploration of new science and contemplative practice/consciousness studies through the medium of arts-based DVD. Participants were invited to consider the practical and theoretical implications of alternative paradigms of knowledge creation for researchers, educators, adult learners, and those who have been variously termed, 'native', 'other', etc. The methodology and the methods selected for this study are the foundation on which the data collection instruments and the data analysis methods have been applied. These include: 1) the utilization of a qualitative research study methodological framework; 2) the implementation of arts-based inquiry methods such as the arts-based DVD and questionnaire that were distributed in Phase 1 of the research and the drama that provided the base on which themes for Phase 2 of the study were developed, 3) the analysis of Phase 2 data collection findings through a new media lens DVD, which was developed from Phase 2 semi-structured interviews, that incorporated the thematic responses of participants within the context of an image based analysis; 4) text based discussion and conclusions.

Research Question

The question addressed in this study was: in what ways can digital images, arts-based DVD, provide a platform for dialogue regarding contemporary science and contemplative practice/consciousness studies? The question invited discipline based and personal responses regarding potential future(s) of knowledge creation within the academy from scientific, faith-based studies, and adult education perspectives.

Assumptions and Significance of the Study

The assumption underlying this study, as aptly propounded by Fuller (1995), is that while scientific knowledge of the physical world, the philosophy of science, and the theological interpretations of religious text, have undergone some change in the 20th century, these revised notions have not become "common currency amongst the majority of people" (p. 5). Fuller allots a measure of the responsibility to the academy; "Partly, perhaps, it is due to academic scientists and theologians not 'popularising' these developments as much as they might; the pressures on them are rather to publish work in specialist journals, which are read principally by others from their own field of study" (p. 5). Hall (2002) elaborates on the problem as it relates to research practice in the academy and resultant policy and programme implementation,

> In extreme instances, researchers take up people's time with badly formulated questions and make interpretations based on little experience in the area or social class of the interviewees. The results of the research provide the basis for policies or programmes which are then expected to be useful and relevant to the interviewees … Control is left to those who by virtue of training and responsibility levels, are unfamiliar with the experiences within which change is sought (p. 13).

He goes on to say that this process is based upon an ethos built on, "the need and desire of administrators and policy makers to gather information from those who do not make decisions in order to make decisions for them" (p. 10). Odora Hoppers (2002) argues that on the global platform the top down, rational, results based approach to both knowledge creation and education on the part of the West re-enforce a the notion that some groups are less 'developed' than others,

> In order for the so-called underdeveloped to think of and comprehend 'development' as stipulated, expected or demanded by the West, they are assisted, by means of various statistical and other forms of written material emanating from the West, to form and internalise the perception of

themselves as underdeveloped, with the whole burden of connotation that
this carries (p. 4).

This research will contribute to evoking questions and discussions regarding
contemporary science, consciousness studies and contemplative practice within the
academy and lead to arts-based inquiry that promotes an examination of the practices of
the academy by the academy.

Conceptual Framework

During each step of the data collection phase three persons holding doctorates
were exposed to theories and practices from within their own disciplines, as well as those
from the disciplines examined in the study that are not their areas of expertise, and those
of arts-based new media. The intention has been to further the development, and promote
the integration, of transformative learning practice in the site of the most intensive arena
for the formal education of adults - the academy. "Transformative learning is a process by
which previously uncritically assimilated assumptions, beliefs, values, and perspectives
are questioned and thereby become more open, permeable, and better validated"
(Mezirow cited in Cranton, 2005, p. 630).

Literature Review

The literature reviewed has drawn from text that intersects one or more of the
following areas: new science, consciousness studies, contemplative practice, qualitative
research, transformative learning theory, arts-based inquiry, new media arts. More
specifically the review is focused on: non-scientific text based in conversations between
experts in new physics and scholars from various fields, text on the subject of

consciousness studies particularly as presented by Buddhist scholars, modern and

historical examples of works by contemplative practitioners from a wide range of faith-

based backgrounds as well as scholarly work on the subject. The qualitative research

model within the context of an arts-based inquiry is outlined by Finley as, "an action-

oriented worldview among qualitative researchers who value inquiry for its usefulness

within the community where it originates". In the case of this study the focus community

is the university. Transformative learning theory has been defined as, "a process by which

previously uncritically assimilated assumptions, beliefs, values, and perspectives are

questioned and thereby become more open, permeable, and better validated" (Cranton,

2000 & Mezirow, 2000 cited in Cranton 2005). Lastly, the definition of new media used

"is a catch-all term for all forms of electronic communication that have appeared or will

appear since the original mainly text-and-static picture … users of the term often

emphasize the visual and visual design aspect of the new digital technology experience"

(New Media, n/a).

The intention has not been to compare or to argue the greater value of one over

the other. Rather, the purpose of this most cursory exploration of these vast and complex

bodies of literature has been to glimpse into the beauty engendered when they are

juxtaposed and re-visioned. The words of Zojonc (2004) during a recent meeting of

scientists and contemplatives have encompassed the sentiment,

> First of all and at a minimum, the reductionist view of the human person
> has to go. A human being is not simply a rational animal. A human being
> is not simply a tool user. A human being is not simply a linguistic being.
> A human being is poetic and aesthetic, is capable of sensitive responses to
> an ever-expanding network of relationships within the human world and
> beyond, even with distant stars … Human beings are social beings, with
> an emphasis on relationships and connectedness. Human beings are

political; judicial but also historical and religious, searching for ultimate meaning; and philosophical, involved in continuous process of self-reflection. Human beings are not merely observers, or even experimenters, but also actors in the process - actors in this sense of co-creators (p. 192).

In order to provide an overview of a selection of possible associations between these expansive and overlapping considerations, the literature review has been presented in subsections: the knowledge, the institution, the empirical, the spiritual.

Methodology and Methods

The methodology of this study draws on numerous concepts that fall under the rubric of qualitative research,

> Qualitative research is an interdisciplinary, trans-disciplinary, and sometimes counter disciplinary field. It crosscuts the humanities and the social and physical sciences … it is multiparadigmatic in focus. Its practitioners are sensitive to the value of the multimethod approach … At the same time, the field is inherently political and shaped by multiple ethical and political positions (Denzin and Lincoln, 1994, p. 3).

The methods employed were the distribution of an arts-based DVD and email questionnaire for Phase 1 data collection and the writing of a dramatic narrative for Phase 1 data analysis. Pink (2004) explains the utility of this method, "There are many ways of introducing photography and video into qualitative projects. These might include: the analysis of existing photographs and videos … as prompts of topics for discussion in interviews" (p. 392). The methods employed during Phase 2 reflect Pink's proposal that the researcher produce photographs and video as tools of data analysis (p. 392). In this study, semi-structured interviews were conducted and an arts-based DVD was developed to analyse the findings. The DVD opens the way to a discussion that is linked to Densin and Lincoln's (1994) understanding that, "Many now are experimenting with form,

format, voice, shape, style" (p. 582). Each phase of this study has embraced Hill's

understanding of "time and the body as materials in art, the video image as language or

text; the image as conduit for ideas" (cited in Rush, 2003, p. 126). The phase one data

collection instrument, a DVD entitled *Image(s)*, is both feminine and ethereal in

presentation. A comparison with Rush's (2003) analysis of the works of Viola and

EXPORT is apt. Viola, "grapples with nothing less than the basic elements of eastern and

western spirituality (mystical solitude, egoless unity with nature, the life cycle) … the

technology is a means to an end, not an end in itself" (p.134). EXPORT has offered a

manifesto to women artists that served to gird the choice to use the *Image(s)* DVD as the

foundational piece for Phase 1 data collection. In 1972, she wrote,

> The history of woman is the history of man, for man has determined the
> image of woman for men and women. The social and communicative
> media such as science and art, word and image, clothing and architecture,
> social intercourse and division of labour are created and controlled by
> men. The men have imposed their image of woman upon the media, they
> have shaped women according to these media patterns and women have
> shaped themselves the same way. If reality is a social construct and men
> are its engineers we are faced with a male reality … it is a high time that
> we women use art as a means of expression to influence everybody's
> consciousness, to allow our ideas to enter the social construct of reality, in
> order to create a human reality (p. 9).

The phase two data analysis arts-based DVD entitled, *Virtual Conference: The Universe -*

The University, employs the voices of the research participants, image, and music to

explore Western, male dominated, capitalist, imperialist, rational/logical, monomodal,

paradigms of knowledge creation, and examine the potential for change within the

context of new science and consciousness studies/contemplative epistemologies. The

arts-based DVD work has continued to be feminine and ephemeral, but more linear

graphics have also been incorporated. The addition of an original musical sound track,

which juxtaposes the discussants fairly moderate tones against a primal cascade musical

and vocal modulations, has been added in order to bring to the surface the fairly recent

subversion of the scholarly slur in social science research circles of the term: 'going

native'. As Denzin and Lincoln explain,

> Throughout its twentieth-century history, up to a scant quarter century
> ago, qualitative researchers were still talking seriously about the problems
> of 'going native,' using the word that previously inscribed the Other in
> qualitative discourse … Today, no one takes seriously talk of 'going
> native'. In fact, its disappearance as a category of concern … is scarcely
> remarked, but, like silences between lovers, it is all the more significant
> for its absence (1994, p. 581).

An appropriate sub-title for this study, as will be noted in the following pages, would be

the 'significance of absences'

Participants, Data Collection, and Analysis

The participants in this research are three Caucasian, senior, male, academics

practicing in three diverse fields. Their individual areas of expertise are adult education,

science, and faith-based studies. The context of the study is the university at large with a

focus on the collective 'community' of persons holding doctorates who work as

researchers engaged in the creation and dissemination of knowledge and professors

charged with the formal education of adults. Phase 1 data collection questionnaires were

emailed to each participant. The DVD, entitled Images, was delivered or posted. Once

completed, the questionnaires were emailed back to the researcher. The data was printed,

colour coded, and cut into segments that were arranged thematically and developed into a

fictive dialogue (narrative drama) between participants. Phase 2 data was collected during

semi-structured interviews that were recorded on the audio track of a digital camera. The

audio data was transferred to a Final Cut Pro edit suite. Segments were sectioned

thematically into sound bits and reworked on the edit suite time line to create dialogue.

Still images created from video footage filmed on the university campus, and two Internet

based images, were transformed through digital transitions. The Comic Life software

suite was also used. Participants agreed to have their voices altered through the use of a

pitch editing function to ensure anonymity and confidentiality. Thematic points were

highlighted through the use of filters and effects functions in order to create a

metaphorically and textually rich image and sound analysis. Denzin (1994) explains the

significance of the narrative, "The researcher, as a writer, is a bricoleur. He or she

fashions meaning and interpretation out of ongoing experience" (p. 501). Harper (1994)

elaborates on the importance of image, "Most fundamentally, images allow us to make

kinds of statements that cannot be made by words; thus enlarge our consciousness" (p.

411).

<div align="center">Researcher/Artist</div>

As the researcher/artist for this project, I worked within the parameters of the

research paradigm defined by Pink (2004),

> As such I aimed the text to meet some of the demands currently put on
> visual and written publications in social science research: that the text
> should be reflexive (using video to reveal the research process through
> which visual and written knowledge was produced), ethical and
> collaborative (in the selection of the medium and requesting the
> informants' approval), and should engage with the theoretical and
> methodological concerns of its discipline (using written texts to discuss
> the theoretical issues and drawing from the concerns of recent debate … to
> inform the development of the whole hypermedia project (p. 404).

From a personnel perspective, this research is motivated by my experience as an artist

and HIV/AIDS awareness educator,

My primary area of paid employment for a number of years prior to and during my time at the university has been in the area of arts-based HIV/AIDS awareness education. I am a playwright, poet, videographer and editor, an adult educator, a project manager who has learnt to work within a results-based paradigm, and an individual who seeks to experience this life through each facet of knowing that I am invited to encounter. My work has enabled me to be engaged with individuals and communities in Canada and internationally. At the onset of my intention to undertake graduate studies, an image came into my mind in which I was working in an African village that was populated by solely grandmothers and children. In the image, I sat on a dusty street corner with only one tool - a small pile of little squares of shiny silver covered paper. I felt at an almost complete lose to understand a world in which an illness that has taken the lives of the greatest number of human beings in the history of humankind was preventable. I could barely maintain a connection with my intellectual understanding that the people in the countries that had colonized Africa etc. had not articulated a link between the more subtle impacts of their domination and the ability of nations of adults to make choices based in the preservation of their own well being. I felt confused about my place in the dominant society into which I had been born and all but hopelessly inadequate at explaining it to myself or to others.

Limitations and Delimitations

This study is subject to both limitations and delimitations. Delimitations imposed on the study included restricting the participants to a very specific group: Caucasian, male, senior, academics. Phase 1 and Phase 2 data collection and analysis were undertaken within a six-month period in late 2005 to early 2006.

Limitations include the focus on the academy as an institution that supports knowledge creation. Numerous roles undertaken by universities are outside of the constraints of this study. For example, Chomsky's (cited in Bell & Chomsky, 2005) overview on the role the universities play with regards to the military industrial complex has not been addressed. Also, other primary advocates of the scientific materialist model, industry and government, have not been directly covered. Not withstanding these caveats, a theme that has recurred numerous times during the course of this study is, "the logic of

hegemonic masculinity need[s] to be excavated in diverse contexts" (Banerjee, 2005, p.

156).

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

The constructs of Western knowledge frames have been juxtaposed throughout this study with perspectives that invite a re-visioning of the authority, validity, and verisimilitude of such claims - as well as an acknowledgement of the historical and present day impacts that these frameworks have fostered. The clash between political polarities, scientific materialism and spiritual perspectives has been bantered by Western scholars. Fuller (1995), author of *Atoms and Icons,* challenges his discursive opponent, Dawkins, who claims, "religious belief (and also patriotic and political beliefs) are responsible for atrocities like religious persecution, the crusades and the activities of contemporary terrorists" (p.7). Fuller questions, "Is it necessary to reiterate once again the point that this is true, if only in the sense that it is also true that science is similarly responsible for the uranium and hydrogen bombs, the economic and technological oppression of 'Third World' countries, and pollution in such a massive scale that the very ecosystem of our planet is threatened by it?" (p. 7). Almond (2004) weaves a comparative, from the intricate intellectual tapestries of Derrida and Arabi, into a more esoteric reading of the roles self/other - selves/others may play in this battle of the minds as they choose how to perceive their own constructions,

> The now familiar re-description of the self not as an autonomous source of self-presenting phenomena, but rather a focal space or opening where a variety of constantly differing discourses might congregate endlessly …
> an author who is no 'creator', but merely a carefully constructed subject artificially imposed upon the turbulence of the work itself (p. 127).

This turbulence is presently manifest in the arena of science as well - and the surprise is that the terminology of the arts that is being embraced. Heisenberg (1977) presents an argument that links metaphors of new science with those that are examined within the literatures of contemplative practice and new media arts,

> Quantum theory thus provides us with a striking illustration of the fact that we can fully understand a connection though we can only speak of it in images and parables. In this case, the images and parables are by and large the classical concepts, i.e. 'wave' and 'corpuscle.' They do not fully describe the real world and are, moreover, complementary in part, and hence contradictory. For all that, since we can only describe natural phenomena with our everyday language, we can only hope to grasp the real facts by means of the images (p. 246).

This literature review will provide glimpses into a plethora of competing, diverging, and coalescing knowledge claims. Those quoted range from researchers examining the impacts of neo-liberal policy on the academy to scientists speaking of mysticism. The review has been sub-sectioned as follows: the knowledge, the institution, the empirical, and the spiritual.

The Knowledge

Lkegami (2004) offers an overview of the most prevalent understanding of knowledge creation in the academy,

> Ninety percent of my colleagues in the social sciences, political science, sociology, economics, and so forth are still under the influence of the classical nineteenth-century scientific view, where the quantitative aspect of analysis is most important (cited in Zajonc, p. 215).

This perspective is quite different from that of transformative educator Sefa Dei (2001),

> What spiritual knowing shows is that in the politics of knowledge production, we as educators must recognize the limitations and possibilities in our pedagogical, communicative, and discursive practices. One such limitation can be the intellectual arrogance of thinking that we

know it all. It is important to work with the power of not knowing and
allowing oneself to be challenged by other knowledges (p. 131).

The afterward 'Notes', written by Araújo Freire (1994) in the text *Pedagogy of Hope:*

Reliving Pedagogy of the Oppressed, provide an incisive example of how knowledge can

be viewed from varying points of view. She quotes physicist Campos,

> Universal history, and geography, as understood by our Western society in
> its scientific tradition, mark out certain spaces and times, periods and eras,
> on the basis of internalistic, indeed ideological reference points very much
> to the taste of the central countries of the planet … Many are the examples
> of this state of affairs, which is imposed on the education of the peripheral
> countries - that is, the countries of the Third World - as a perfectly casual,
> textbook kind of thing, a matter of simple information … (cited in Friere,
> p. 217).

She elaborates on Campos' explanation of how even the cardinal points of the compass,

on which north is always "up", provide an example of intellectual imperialism,

> … one more form of alienation infecting our signs and symbols, by way of
> a knowledge developed to the point of producing a cognition that turns its
> back on itself, and turns, with open heart, gluttonous mouth, and head as
> hollow as a pot (waiting to be filled by signs and symbols from
> elsewhere), so that we end up as a continent of knowledge developed and
> produced by men and women of the North, the "summit," the "upper part,"
> the "top"? (p. 218).

African scholar Wangoola (2000) presents a second perspective regarding the

issue of intellectual imperialism. He introduces traditional African cosmology as, "a

closely intertwined trinity of forces, values and considerations" [that] "consisted of

spirituality, development, and politics, with spirituality forming the base and controlling

and informing everything that happened in the realm of development and politics" (p.

265). From his perspective, "Community means the living, the unborn, the dead, and

nature as a whole" (p. 271). He contrasts this with the vision offered by the West,

"whether of the capitalist or socialist variety, [they] regard comfort, well-being, and material and capital acquisition as the central goals of life" (p. 267).

Denis Donoghue (2005) rather poignantly, though perhaps unintentionally, points out one aspect of this perspective within both a contemporary and historical context in his paper, *Theory, theories, and principles*. He writes,

> We are moving toward Theory as an institution when the considerations we're offered are supposed to refer to large-scale entities and perhaps to life itself. But there are degrees of scale before we reach that extreme position. T.S. Eliot's theory of the "dissociation of sensibility" claims that something happened in the seventeenth century in England … as a result of which the English language from the later seventeenth to the nineteenth century no longer facilitated thinking as a development of feeling. Thinking became one activity, and feeling another. If that were true, it would be a point of interest to many people, but to more than those many it would make little or no difference (p. 110).

This notion of the 'dissociation of sensibility', in its manifold manifestations constituted a motif within the context of this study.

Shifts that are manifesting at the periphery of each of these perspectives on knowledge creation include an investigation of truth claims based on the perception that these are made on the basis of an 'objective reality'. Scientists Hayward and Varela (1992) explain, "We shall see how the firm belief in such an objective world as a foundation for certainty in science has begun to break down" (p. 6). For example, when these scientists examine neo-Darwinian theory, they propose that "the most well adapted species could well be understood to be not the most recent but the one that has existed the longest - in which case bacteria are by far the leaders in measures of fitness" (p. 246). Another aspect of the shift in points of view on knowledge creation has been termed 'identity politics'. Odora Hoppers (2002) offers an example of perspectives from Indigenous Knowledge Systems (IKS),

> As opposed to the linearity and reductionist impulses of the contemporary development approaches, paradigmative imperatives in an IKS conscious development emphasizes a people-centered approach and actively moves to shift the paradigm and discourse of development from one that is pre-occupied with what the people do not have, one that is trapped in a negative dependency orientation that it generates, to one in which people are the subject, and which motivates society to become constructively engage in moving forward. The endogenous development to emerge from this process begins at the point when people start to pride themselves as worthy human beings inferior to none; and where such pride is lost, development begins at the point at which this pride is restored, and history is recovered (p. 6)

Those in the academy who wish to maintain the status quo have not always met this call for equality and respect with open arms. In the introductory section of the text *Theories Empire: An Anthology of Dissent*, scholar Gitlin (2005) outlines his point of view as follows,

> All forms of identity politics … attempt to distinguish insiders from outsiders and draw political advantage from this distinction … Then, having claimed positive meaning for their beleaguered identities, identity groups move on to revel in separatism, engaging in defensive aggression, cultivating 'a rapture of marginality.' All this leads to an aggrandizement of 'difference,' which treats culture as politics and the university as a microcosm of the global struggle (p. 398).

Goodheart (2005) describes the divisiveness between the various proponents as "the current academic Balkanization in which one always seeks the comfort zone of the like-minded or prepares to do battle with the enemy" (p. 521). Editors Patai & Corral (2005) focus on the gendered aspect of the divisiveness,

> … identity politics for decades has been on a collision course with the serious study of literature. Perhaps the most expressive, and most familiar, emblem of this clash is the label 'Dead White Males' with which the entire Western tradition (always excluding, of course, the still fashionable French maîtres à penser) is now routinely dismissed (p. 397).

In his text, *The Taboo of Subjectivity: Toward a New Science of Consciousness*, Wallace

(2000) offers the argument that focuses on how scientific materialism in the academy,

coupled with the prior reign of the clergy, has prevented humankind from engaging in an

exploration of the consciousness which underlies the formation of conceptions of the self

and other,

> A distinguishing characteristic of science is that it has developed in close
> cooperation with the development of tools and methodologies for making
> ever more penetrating and reliable observations of physical phenomena …
> However, scientists have made no similar progress since the time of
> Aristotle in developing tools or methodologies for examining mental
> phenomena directly. In this regard, the present situation of scientific
> understanding of mental phenomena may be likened to the late medieval
> Scholastics' confrontation with the external world of nature. The chief
> obstacle that hindered their pursuit of understanding may have been not
> simply adherence to the mistaken theories of Aristotle, but the lack of
> alternative modes of empirical and theoretical inquiry. To put it more
> bluntly, the major problem may have been the active suppression of
> alternative modes of research by the dominant ideology of the time (p. 88).

During meetings with scientists and contemplatives the Dalai Lama proposed,

> Certainly one major obstacle is simply ignorance itself … not knowing the
> consequences that will ensue from one's actions. So here I always believe
> that education is very important … This is not a question of morals or
> religion, but simply a question of survival … This is care in a basic sense
> … we need love, we need human feeling, not regarding others as an
> enemy, as destroyers, but rather as helpers … In regard to the importance
> of love and kindness for survival, some people may feel: "Oh nonsense! I
> can mange very well without any sense of universal responsibility." But
> today it is manifest that in reality this is not the case … This business of
> 'us and them,' … is a division we humans created (cited in Hayward and
> Varela, 1992, p. 254).

These overlapping, conflicting, and coalescing knowledge claims form the bases on

which the data collection and data analysis segments of this study have been developed.

The Institution

A commitment to investigating the expansive potential of the human mind, and the human spirit, has not been major component of the education and research agendas within the academy. The development of curriculum that explores, through experiential learning, and/or the contemplative practices of the cultures represented in a given community, has yet to be considered by the majority of scholars. An epistemological acknowledgement that the primary means of knowledge creation is that of subject(s) creating knowledge that is then filtered through and disseminated in accordance with the framework of those in positions of power within any given collective has yet to be conferred as the centre piece of understanding the present human condition. Well this may seem self-evident to some, the Western academy continues to fail to acknowledge that it is also self-serving. This argument is not intended as an indictment, but as an indication of the starting point for change. Hall (2002) presents the pragmatics of the situation,

> For a man (sic) working in a university or research institution, knowledge is the only commodity available to sell. He (sic) gathers or 'mines' ideas and information in order to survive. His (sic) priorities go to collecting data at a central point, summarizing it and then packaging it in such a way that journals, books, seminars, international conferences can consume it. Policy makers represent an obvious and major market for the ideas and information. The need to serve the people from and about whom the information has been gathered (the unemployed, the villagers, the students, the teachers), is of low priority. These groups will not buy the results - and perhaps they did not want the research in the first place (p.10).

The paradigm that is presently in the forefront is that of the neo-liberalist agenda. Farquhar (2002) presents the situation,

> Indeed, there is a wrenching transformation occurring in higher education that provokes a clash of cultures that could endanger the survival of some

institutions. This phenomenon is a worldwide consequence of extrinsic factors that are now familiar … Institutional managers are being forced to flog their products in the global marketplace through virtual classrooms, technology transfer, spin-off enterprises, strategic partnerships, and the like, causing vast disruptions in the conception and delivery of their traditional teaching, research, and service missions (p. 470).

In the review of *Creating Entrepreneurial Universities: Organizational Pathways for Transformation*, written by Clark, the term 'transformation' takes on a different connotation to that which it has had in this study. The five pathways by which universities are invited to transform themselves all focus on "entrepreneurial action" and entail the development of "a stimulated academic heartland, in which groups of individuals in the basic academic units 'buy into' cultural changes that modify traditional academic norms by blending them with institutionally promoted entrepreneurial values" and "an integrated entrepreneurial culture, reflected in new symbols and sagas that cultivate the entire institution's identity and reputation as an innovative enterprise" (cited in Farquhar, 2002, p. 476). Wallace (2000) focuses on one impact of the aforementioned situation as it pertains to the present climate within the academy,

> Especially in the fields of the philosophy of the mind and the philosophy of science, scientific materialism is the prevailing ideology; and anyone who seriously challenges this dogma may find it extremely difficult to be admitted as a graduate student; or if one makes it through graduate school, the prospects of academic employment may be very slim (p. 171).

The Empirical

Analysis of the limitations of the rational/logical/mechanistic/objectivist framework appear in many historical contexts. Afnan (1958) draws from the work Avicenna, an Islamic metaphysician writing a millennia ago, "it has been emphasized that

the problems he was confronted with resulted from the conflicting disciplines of two

separate cultures brought face to face" (p. 5). While at that time the interface between

worldviews focused on that of East and West, the emphasis on logic was not pivotal, "it

was metaphysics that concerned itself with ultimate realities. Logic, today of the essence

of philosophy, was for them only an instrument" (p. 107).

The emphasis on metaphysics is certainly not the focus in our present day

Western context. Hayward and Varela (1992) offer statistical estimations with regards to

the points of view of the majority of citizens and of scientists,

> The presumption is that, independent of the whole society of human
> perceivers, there is a world that exists and that has its own structure. This
> was the view at the end of the nineteenth century … and it remains the
> view of most people, certainly of 99 percent of the ordinary, non-
> scientific, public. It is also the view of perhaps 80 or 90 percent of
> practicing scientists. This is very important in that it provides for the
> Western world a sense of guarantee of a real world beyond personal bias
> and beliefs (p. 13).

Recent analysis of the limitations and implications of historical developments within the

Western scientific, rational, logical, materialistic paradigm are being voiced in the writing

of adult educators, scientists, faith-based leaders, contemplative practitioners, and artists

working in numerous media. (Arbuckle (2004); Aurobindo (1972); Capra (1988); Deloria

(1973); Klein (1995); Le Grice (2001); Moosa (2005); O'Connor (2002); O'Sullivan,

(1999), (2004); Shilling (2002); Tagore (1924); Wallace (2000); Weil (1968) point to

similar historical underpinnings with regards the development of the Western

construction of knowledge frameworks. Eisner and Powell (2002) offer an overview,

> Plato, Galileo, and Descartes represent efforts along our long cultural
> history in the West to define the conditions of knowledge, but more recent
> efforts emerge in the work of the positivists … These philosophers carried
> on the traditions of the Enlightenment by their interest in excising from

philosophy all forms of metaphysical language in order to advance a conception of scientific rationality free from forms of feeling that they believed had little or nothing to do with matters of truth (p. 132).

While this paradigm gained momentum within the historical framework of the mechanistic sciences, the metaphors it has engendered penetrate deeply into the Western psyche and manifest in the social, political, and educational institutions of our time. Western imperialist domination on a global scale for a number of centuries, most recently dominated by dichotomous Right wing and Left wing ideologies, (Wangoola, 2000; Zeitlin, 2004) institutions founded in scientific materialism, and paradoxically embraced by powerful religious institutions (Deloria, 1973), have nonchalantly undermined, been roused into internal and external oppositions, and/or vehemently tried to eradicate that which is/was not under their dominion. An acknowledgement of the objective implications, (i.e. changes in ecological, social, administrative/judicial and familial landscapes of individuals, communities and nations) that has resulted from the subjective, albeit collective, choices invoked as a result of the belief system framed as 'scientific materialism' is in order. Perhaps ironically, the call for acknowledgement and the impetus for change have manifest in the epoch when the solid paradigm of mechanistic science is undergoing a profound and radical change from within. The catch phrase for this is 'new science'. This change is born of the very science on which it was girded. But, there is no reason to assume that the metaphors engendered will be of necessity more inclusive, ethical, and/or cognisant of their effects on human relations or the environment. What is certain to date, is that the epicentres of political and economic power and influence have not been drastically altered. Clover (2001), an adult educator, argues, "The rapid rise of scientific discovery based on the ides of Bacon, Descartes, Kant, Linnaeus, Newton, and

Darwin and the emergence of capitalism have fundamentally changed how humans

interact with the rest of nature" (p. 161). The new sciences have not yet had a substantive

impact on the ethics of knowledge creation in the Western academy. Odora Hoppers

(2002) takes a strong position on the implications of the blanket dissemination of

Western understanding to non-western peoples,

> As the mental space in which people dream are occupied by Western
> imagery, the innumerable varieties of 'being human' is eliminated. On the
> other had, as the 'other' has vanished with the coming of development, the
> spreading of monoculture continues to erode viable alternatives to the
> reductionist, exploitative paradigm of society reified by science, and
> cripple humankind's capacity to meet an increasingly different future with
> creative responses (p. 4).

Two further arguments, presented by prominent Western scientists, offer a keen

perspective on their own understanding of the quagmire of the West's present situation as

it has emerged from both the dualist and the mechanistic models. Capra (1988) cites

Heisenberg, "The Cartesian partition … penetrated deeply into the human mind during

the three centuries following Descartes, and it will take a long time for it to be replaced

by a really different attitude toward the problem of reality" (p. 21). Laing (1988)

elaborates on the losses engendered by Galileo's perspectives,

> Galileo made the statement that only quantifiable phenomena were
> admitted to the domain of science … this came to mean: "What cannot be
> quantified is not real". This has been the most profound corruption from
> the Greek view of nature as physis, which is alive, always in
> transformation, and not divorced from us. Galileo's program offers us a
> dead world: out go sight, sound, taste, touch, and smell, and along with
> them have since gone esthetic and ethical sensibility, values, quality, soul,
> consciousness, spirit. Experience as such is cast out of the realm of
> scientific discourse. Hardly anything has changed our world more during
> the past four hundred years than Galileo's audacious program. We had to
> destroy the world in theory before we could destroy it in practice (cited in
> Capra, p.133).

Laing's words focus on the binary between theory and practice; Odora Hoppers' (2002)

offer a perspective on the 'fossilized' relationship between religion and science,

> Equally disturbing are the silences over the distasteful if not destructive
> role that science has played in legitimating the wanton destruction of
> nature, sanctioning and reifying our disconnectedness with nature, and the
> attendant consequences that have flowed from this. When the latter
> concern is taken into account, one can ask whether the question before us
> should still stand as fossilized as that of the battle between religion and
> science? (p. 2).

The dialectical and discursive model of scientific materialism has been the foundation on

which the academy has been constructed, and continues to gird knowledge creation

within the institution.

The contributions of new science have slowly begun to penetrate the institution

and influence the construction of images and metaphors within both scientific and non-

scientific frames. Experts in the arena of quantum physics (Bohm, 2003; Capra, 1988;

Zojonc, 2004) and the science of the mind (Hayward & Varela, 1992) have been meeting

with leaders in the area of consciousness studies (Dalai Lama, 2005; Wallace, 2000). A

researcher compares the deconstructive method of western philosopher, Jacques Derrida,

with the esoteric text of Sufi practitioner Arabi (Almond, 2004). A former scientist

becomes a minister and authors a book entitled, *Atoms and Icons* (Fuller, 1995). A pair of

engineers writes, "Ironically enough, it is in the most ancient of ancient, and terribly

obvious, knowledge of mysticism where the answer seems to lie" (Emplemsva & Bras,

2000, p. 636). A once Jesuit from Saskatchewan transliterates into a poet/philosopher and

emerges from a vacation near Dillberry Lake to a position at the University of Victoria …

writing, "I was slid under things and saw the dusky words engraved on their belowsides"

(Lilburn, 2003, p. 37). Only buildings away and two years later, a cosmologist from the

physics and astronomy department curates a gallery show entitled *The Art of Physics:*

Visualizing the Universe, Seeing the Unseen. He writes,

> Increasingly, research in Psychology into the role of visual imagery in science suggests that scientific imagery is key to insight, and that there is a close connection between visual imagery, cognition and "creative" scientific thinking … Imagery used by physical scientists truly straddles the boundary between science and art. Designing meaningful visual rendering of abstract ideas that have no direct manifestation in our sense experience is truly a challenge. Like the artist, this imagery gives expression to "where is there" and "what it might mean" … The works once observed and experienced can engender a multitude of responses, from curiosity to awe, from the obvious to the sublime (Babul & Fincke-Keeler, 2005).

In another Canadian university, a doctoral student receives blessings to do an adult

education dissertation - in part - in the format of a novel written in verse. She argues,

> It has been over 100 years already since the first theory-shattering proofs in physics forced some western thinkers to abandon cherished assumptions about the nature of scientific "proof" of truth in itself as well as assumptions about how scholarly work is done and what it can reasonably be expected to do. For those committed to empiricism and to the idea of scientific progress, it has been a bitter pill to swallow that the principal discoveries of the "new physics" so closely resemble the ancient discoveries of the pre-Socratic philosophers and of many even older wisdom traditions: namely, that the boundaries between subject and object are ambiguous, fluid, and mutually constituted, that causality explains far less than acausal connection; that processes and relationships offer more to understanding than products, reductive units or fixed entities (O'Connor, 2002, p. 241).

As the scientific understanding of the nature of matter changes, it appears that some of

the images and metaphors that are emerging are not so different from those traditionally

explored under the rubrics of religion and spirituality.

The Spiritual

While science claims centrality in the both the pragmatic and paradigmatic realms, the age-old question of religion has not lost its ominous stature (Arbuckle, 2004). But, much like scientific dominion, the revival of religious vigour appears to be void of reflecting on the atrocities of the past and the ongoing impact of these - unless of course that is the past of another force of equal but opposing power (Arbuckle). Two examples present themselves most emphatically in the literature. In his book, *God is Red: A Native View of Religion*, Doloria (2003) offers an academic, and a political, manifesto on the impact of Christianity on Native Americans. He examines both the historical roots and present-day implications of imperialist religious practice and the accompanying political campaign. The text spans from an overview of how notions of 'time' and 'space' in Aboriginal spirituality differ from those of the Christian colonizers to the complex motivations behind recent political and environmental standoffs. Doloria's closing remarks are chilling,

> We stand today at a series of crossroads. Rather than revolutionary movements we may have possibly lapsed onto a prolonged period of respectable boredom from which we will never recover (p. 295).

A somewhat parallel example of past and present discrimination presented itself within the context of an example from Islamic based literature. In a profound and sublimely sensitive book written by Moosa (2005), entitled *Ghazeli and the Poetics of Imagination*, aspects of Ghazeli's teaching and learning are both set into relief and highlighted by the insights of the author and those thinkers from many traditions upon whose work he draws. But, in framing the exemplariness of Ghazeli's work, Moosa does not choose to address aspects of patriarchal discrimination. For example, while Ghazeli's (1991)

historical text *The Alchemy Happiness* is referred to, there is no attempt at a modern

revisionist examination. In the chapter entitled, 'Marriage as a help or a hindrance to

religious life', perspectives that range from the sanctification of physical violence against

women to indications that a wife should be "beautiful" and "serve her husband" yet not be

"over-indulged" as "men should have the upper hand over women" (p. 53). Neither

Ghazali nor Moosa were/are radicals engaged in popular revival movements, they

were/are prominent scholars. As Hindu feminist Bannerjee (2000) points out,

> Issues of patriarchy and violence against women are disturbing in general,
> but they become even more so when considered in relation to our so-called
> own communities … I know that violence against women is a pervasively
> present phenomenon among us, in spite of much talk of honour and
> respect for women, including deification of the feminine principle (p.
> 151).

The Christian tradition has notable exemplars as regards patriarchal insolence, Fletcher

Marsh's (2002) work cites examples from historical figures as well as present-day

regulatory bodies that assume and enforce discriminatory practices. Also to be noted is

the fact that the scholarly examination of new science by Western academics engaged in

inquiry with Buddhist contemplatives appears to lack both acknowledgement and action

with regards to gender representation and equity. This is exemplified in the minimal

number of women, from either tradition, at the meetings that have been held for the past

decade and half to examine the confluence between these worldviews. Neither the Mind

and Life Institute meetings nor in the prestigious publications produced in the aftermath

of these meetings (Dalai Lama, 2005; Hayward & Varela, 1992; Wallace, 2000; Zojonc,

2004) consider the feminine except, perhaps, as an ethereal principle. In all of the above

examples, the words of Faure (2003), in *The Power of Denial: Buddhism, Purity and

Gender*, appear poignantly apropos. As in the past, women have to imagine that,

the back of the stage becomes the place where the main action takes place … Admittedly, these are symbolic victories, which failed to translate into social reality … It points to the fallacy of a purely descriptive history when all accounts of human agency are already prescriptive and or performative (p.327).

Left wing activists and intellectuals who bill religion as the 'opiate of the masses' are also addressed in the literature. Zeitlin (2004) presents arguments from Marx followed by a reflection on the substantive outcomes of the application of his theories,

Marx …regarded as key sociological questions: Why do people project their desires for perfection onto hypothetical beings, products of their imagination? What are the social conditions that prompt people to externalise their own powers and to attribute them to supernatural beings? Marx's reply to these questions was that religion is largely the consequence of social alienation - that, historically, humanity has been divided against itself by internal class cleavages. The domination, oppression, and exploitation of humans by humans have perpetuated the need for religion (p.50).

The perspective Marx takes on the role of religion may or may not be correct, but it is by no means sublimated by atheism. As Durkheim (2004) argues, the application of ideology within Marxist regimes manifest itself in regalia not so different from that of the religion it viewed as oppressive,

… however rational and scientific societies might become, they would never be able to dispense with religious ceremony … The experience of the totalitarian regimes of the twentieth century tends to support Durkheim's proposition; for although those regimes were officially and militantly atheistic, they turned their ideologies into religions replete with 'sacred' texts, doctrines, rites, massive assemblies, and the deification of leaders in personality cults (cited in Zeitlin, p. 207).

Though religion continues to be a very significant force in so many of the socio-political realities of our day the term 'spirituality' has been embraced by many as an alternative that is understood by some as a word that embraces all traditional practices and by others as a term which is 'liberated' from institutional belief systems (O'Sullivan, 2001). This

popular reckoning, or lack thereof, with the historical underpinnings of institutional

religion can be noted in the work of adult educators writing within the rubric of

transformative adult education. For example, English and Gillen (2000) state, "For us,

spirituality ranges from an internal experience to an outward sense of commitment to

others and the natural order" (p. 86). While this definition may serve to facilitate a

comfortable exchange among adult students from varying backgrounds, it seems a pity to

dismiss the contributions of humanity's past and present sages simply as a result of a

burgeoning political ethos. Surely the depth of human affliction, the appreciation of

profound love or exquisite beauty, and the essence of spiritual liberation have been taped

into by a number of visionaries from each and every tradition in all ages.

Within the context of the Western academy Tisdell (2000), an adult educator,

examines the role of spirituality in the lives of sixteen adult educators from numerous

cultural and faith-based backgrounds. Her results point to an area of education in which

the educators felt restricted with regards to giving voice to their experience and/or

inviting an exploration of the experience of learners,

> People in higher education were indeed aware of the almost exclusive
> focus on rationality that has been the tradition of higher education, which
> made them hesitant to discuss or draw on spirituality to overtly. However,
> all of the participants recognized that the work of social transformation
> cannot be accomplished entirely through rational processes (p. 332).

Perhaps the lack of ease Tisdell's participants feel expressing their desire to explore their

'spirituality' is related to both the taboos engendered by scientific materialism and

theoretical Marxism.

The relationship between the arts and spirituality is examined in a very generous

study of the evolution of the Western mind written by Hindu activist/teacher/poet

Aurobindo (1972). Rather than negating the Western focus on rational pursuits, he celebrates the development of the Western intellect, and the honing of a mental penetration that has made the English language an exacting tool of exploration as regards the potentialities of poetry. But, he suggests that,

> … the liberation of the poetic power to do its highest work must arrive when the spiritual itself is the possession of the greatest minds and the age stands on the verge of its revelation. Therefore it is not sufficient for poetry to attain high intensities of word and rhythm; it must have, to fill them, an answering intensity of vision. And this does not depend only on the individual power of vision of the poet, but on the mind of his (sic) age and country, its level of thought and experience, the adequacy of its symbols, the depth of its spiritual attainment (p. 36).

Examples of more esoteric perspectives on spirituality are presented by Bachelor, (2000); Banks, (1995); Klein, (1995); Mackendrick (2001), Underhill (1956), and Hirshfield (1994); Weil, (1948); Wilson, (1970). Writing of Blanchot's work, Mackendrick (2001) cites from *The Step Not Beyond*. She describes how the work engages in an exploration of the limitations of language and speech in spiritual understanding, "Grace is the opening of spaces of possibility, an openness to the spaces of possibility which itself makes those spaces, a silence that draws language beyond speaking" … it is … "the transgression of the boundary keeping profane distinct from sacred, speech away from silence, time away from eternity" (p. 111).

The process of transfiguration, as described in Buddhist, Haddistic and Christian mysticism, as well as Shamanic initiation, is fundamentally similar. Within the mystic branches of traditional faiths this resides the belief that humankind can be in direct contact with the divine. The Shaman is also perceived to by in contact with the supra-natural world. According to Estelle Frankel (2001), the teachings and language of the Kabbalah run parallel to Western anthropological descriptions of all rites of passage.

Describing the work of Eliade, she outlines three stages of transcendent initiation: "a withdrawal from ordinary life (tzimtzum), a period of symbolic death and deconstruction (shevira), followed by a period of rebirth and reintegration back into society as the new being that one has become through the transition" (p. 65). Shilling (2001) examines the trials experienced by indigenous peoples within the context of spiritual attainment and social reintegration,

> … there is a need to acknowledge and appreciate the painful struggles of many people. Beck, Walters and Francisco (1996) looked at various journeys of spiritually gifted Indigenous peoples and found that 'these individuals are born with or develop special sensitivity and interest in the elements that make up the sacred. Often, these persons are exposed to greater hardship than most people: personal injury, fright, anxiety and loneliness. If they succeed in their journey or quest for knowledge and in their work as sacred practitioners, they then have greater responsibility than most people (p. 156).

This experience is reflected in Weil's (1968) elucidation of the word 'affliction',

> Affliction is inseparable from physical suffering and yet quite distinct … There is not real affliction unless the event which has gripped and uprooted a life attacks it, directly or indirectly in all its parts, social, psychological, and physical. The social factor is essential. There is not really affliction where there is not social degradation or the fear of it in some form or another … Among the people they meet, those who have never had contact with affliction in its true sense can have no idea of what it is, even though they may have known much suffering (pp. 170-172).

> The study of consciousness has been most assiduously portrayed in the literature and arts of the contemplatives from various traditions: Buddhist, Christian, Hindu, Indigenous, Judaic, Islamic, Taoist. These have provided insight into alternative forms of knowledge creation. Barnard (1997), describing the work of James writes,

> Even though James has just noted the similarity of mystical experiences to "states of feeling," he points out that they are also often described as "states of knowledge." For James, mystical experiences "are states of insight into depths of truth unplumbed by the discursive intellect" (p.14).

Both the theoretical reviews 'about' the nature of contemplative understanding and the practise based writing of poets and mystics echo this statement. Aguilar (2004); Almond (2004); Aurobindo (1972); Banks (1995); Capra (1988); Deloria (2003); Hirshfield (1994); Massoudi (2003); Moivoc (2004); Moosa (2005); Shilling (2002); Tagore (1924); Wallace (2000); Weil (1952); Wilson (1970); Zojonc (2004) explore the nature of contemplative knowledge though their own experience or through the study of the writing of others. Rose (2004) captures the nuance of the authors listed above rather emphatically, "the subject is impossible to engage with in depth using solely rational and academically sound measures. The nearest approaches to words on the subject are perhaps mostly found in mystical writings and in poetry" (p. 205). In a chapter entitled, 'The honesty of the perplexed: Derrida and Ibn 'Arabi on 'confusion', Almond (2004) suggests,

> To confuse, etymologically, is to make things flow. To remove the boundaries/borders/distinctions which separate things into categories, which enables differences to be … Confusion takes place when we realize that our rational faculties are not enough to understand what is happening. That something has taken place in a language our rational faculties do not speak. In a sense, confusion takes place because of our rationality, because we insist on clinging to something which is blinding us to the 'actual situation'. Words such as 'confusion' and 'bewilderment' enable us to glimpse a similar vein of thought in both Derrida and Ibn 'Arabi - that is, a similar affirmation of confusion as a difficult, courageous and desirable state (p. 39).

On a very different end of the spectrum of the exploration of spirituality is Miovic's (2002) discussion of neuropsychology and photon emission scans on Tibetan monks and Franciscan nuns practicing meditation and prayer, Miovic argues that scientific reductionism with regards to the experience of contemplatives may denote fallacy from a number of perspectives,

> Despite all this otherwise excellent work, however, they [the neuroscientists] have committed the logical error of assuming that because certain spiritual experiences are correlated with a particular neural substrate, the brain therefore causes (or creates) these states. It may, indeed, be the case that there is no soul or God independent of matter, and experiences of such are created solely by the brain. Nevertheless, it is equally possible that the brain is simply a substrate for perceiving spiritual truths that exist in their own right. In other words, the brain may transmit, rather than generate, consciousness - much as a radio or television transmits an invisible signal (p. 107).

Within the perimeters of this literature review, Odora Hoppers' (2002) political proposal can also be consider as a facet of the discussion of spirituality,

> … perhaps instead of focusing on the battle between the domains of religion and science, we aim at patterns behind the patterns and the processes beneath the processes; introduce history and culture and aim at socio-economic and spiritual upliftment within a project of the metacognition of all humanity … This may imply that certain cultures renounce their barbary in order to have the other renounce its own. In the meantime, the hope is to propagate willingness to tolerate contradiction, and to act generously in situations of *unresolved antagonisms* (p. 7).

It is evident that the term 'spirituality' has taken on many facets in the context of modern scholarly literature. Those discussed range from political arguments related to gender, ethnicity and race, to examinations of discussions within new science, adult education, and esoteric and not-so-esoteric practice.

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

Introduction

This study employs qualitative arts-based research methodology using a new media lens. The study was completed in two phases over a period of six months. Phase I data collection methods were: the distribution an arts-based DVD in conjunction with a structured questionnaire that was completed by participants independently of the researcher. The Phase 2 data collection method was semi-structured interviews. The Phase 1 data analysis method was grounded in arts based inquiry. The Phase 2 data analysis method has been based in new media analysis. The purpose of the study has been to explore knowledge creation in the university and to foster dialogue and encourage thinking about the relationship between new science and contemplative practice/consciousness studies. The theoretical underpinnings of the study are based in critical analysis and transformative education theory. Participants in the project were three Caucasian, senior, male, academics.

Qualitative Study

The qualitative methodology applied in this study is anchored in the critical analysis framework proposed by Denzin and Lincoln (2003),

> Western civilization … assumed that "truth" can transcend opinion and personal bias …. Qualitative research is seen as an assault on this tradition, whose adherents often retreat onto a "value-free objectivist science" … model to defend their position. They seldom attempt to make explicit, or to critique, the "moral and political commitment in their own contingent work" (p. 12).

The intention has been to invite participants to explore and expand upon traditional knowledge frameworks and to consider propositions and formats that operate outside of the "the artificial structures of conventional objectivity" (p. 582). The researcher, ostensibly the 'other' within the context of this study, has made an effort to "adapt to the world of the individuals studied and try to share their concerns and outlooks" as it is argued that, "Only by doing so can he or she learn anything at all" (Fontana & Frey, 1994, p. 371).

Arts-Based Inquiry

Slatterly (2003) conceptualises the importance of arts-based inquiry, "Historically, the arts have often challenged dominant political, religious, and aesthetic conventions while serving as a lightening rod for social change" (p. 193). Clover (forthcoming 2006) points out the perspectives of Shakatoko and Walker with regards to the potential impact of the use of images within the context of the critical qualitative study, "images do seem to have … remarkable abilities to particularize an abstract concept and provide a new platform for self and social reflection". Finley's (2003) words support the suggestion that arts-based research practices are useful and effective, "As a society, we benefit from educating our populace to construct meaning through artful practices" (p. 292). A choice on the part of the researcher to write a play using quotes from Phase 1 data collection responses parallels Denzin and Lincoln's (1994) notion that qualitative research does not, and can not, produce a factual analysis regarding participants within the confines of the traditional understanding that knowledge is produced about a segment of society based on extrapolations from field notes. They argue

that, "The methods of qualitative research … become the 'invention,' and the telling of

tales - the representation - become the art" (p. 584). The Phase I data analysis drama,

based solely in juxtaposing participant responses to the questionnaire, denotes that

"'Truth' is a variable constant, open for redefinition and investigation. It is a slippery

ideal, perhaps impossible … Words, images, sequences in motion, all propose a kind of

truth, whether explicit or implicit. All narrative is finally fiction - a construction of will,

desire, memory, fantasy - a serious business, yet an arena for play (Gale, 1995, p. 43).

New Media Lens

Examples of a confluence between discourses are emerging. As the 'science of art'

and the 'art of science' meet, arts-based new media technologies play a role in new

paradigm models of knowledge creation. As Filser (2003) explains, "Technology

transforms us into spiritual and physical nomads. Virtualization involves not a

disembodiment but a doubling of the self. The virtual body is a vehicle that allows one to

be simultaneously present in distant locations" (p. 238). Kress & Van Leeuwen (2001)

compare the new role of the arts and the traditional role of the text within both Western

culture and the academy,

> For some time now, there has been in Western culture, a distinct
> preference for monomodality. The most highly valued genres of writing
> (literary novels, academic treatises, official documents and reports, etc.)
> came entirely without illustration, and had graphically uniform dense
> pages of print … the specialized theoretical and critical disciplines which
> developed to speak of these arts became equally monomodal. More
> recently this dominance of monomodality has begun to reverse. Not only
> the mass media … documents produced by corporations and universities
> … cinema and the semiotically exuberant performances and videos of
> popular music, but also increasingly the avant-gardes … have begun to use
> an increasing variety of materials and to cross the boundaries between art,
> design and performance disciplines, towards multimodal

Gesamtkunstwerke, multi-media events, and so on … it is at least possible
that new technologies, increasingly ubiquitous, multi-purpose and 'natural'
in terms of their interfaces, will help create a fourth dimension of
communication in the same way that writing created a third - and this time
not at a cost of a decrease in multimodality (p. 3).

The new media based DVD, entitled *Virtual Conference: The Universe - The University*,
has been created from a weaving of sound clips of participants voices, video images
filmed on campus, two images from the Internet that have been altered, digitally
generated text, and an original musical sound tract. This juxtaposition has played into a
plethora of new concepts as presented by multimedia/video artists and theoreticians in the
publication, *The Cinematic Imaginary After Film*. In the collection the words of
numerous authors create a plethora of possibilities, "place begins to abandon its former
dependence on solidity and materiality [and moves into] a new consciousness with a
radically different ontology and epistemology (McQuire, 2003, p.135). These "shifts and
distortions of conventional parameters of space and time play a significant role in the new
narration (Youngblood, 2003, p. 123). "Texts and images do not identify each other;
instead they distinguish each other, floating alongside one another … in a network of
multiple relationships (Weibel, 2003, p. 121) "The widening of material and technical
parameters went hand-in-hand with the dissolution of social consensus" (Weibel, 2003, p.
118) … "in place of objects or states the emphasis is now on action or transformation"
(Wees, 2003, p. 51) … "cinema's ultimate aim should not be to mean but to reveal"
(Hamilton, 2003, p. 86). The DVD developed through Phase 2 data collection materials
in relationship to concepts and ideas presented in the literature review and this
methodologies section work to explore the shifts and openings it is now possible to
exemplify through the arts using digital technology.

Project Setting and Participants

The setting for this research is the university. The participants have been engaged in the academy as students, professors, and researchers in various parts of Canada, the United State, Europe, the Middle East, Asia, Africa, Latin America, and Africa. Each, of the three, is Caucasian, a senior scholar, and male. Their areas of expertise are adult education, science, and faith-based studies. The context of the study is the academy and the community of persons holding doctorates. The researcher is a graduate student and an artist whose life style, socio-economic status, level of educational attainment, gender, age, and personal affiliations place her within the category defined by qualitative researchers as 'Other'. Therefore, within the context of this study the following definition applies,

> it is the institutionalised Other who speaks, especially as the Other gains access to the knowledge-producing corridors of power and achieves entrée into the particular group of elites known as intellectuals and academics or faculty (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994, p. 577).

While the theoretical underpinnings of emancipatory education would hope to eradicate or dissolve this particular distinction, the framework of the institution continues to uphold traditional structures. In part, it has been the intention of the researcher to explore this particular defining of 'us' and 'them' in order to encourage opportunities to visit common and not-so-common ground.

Data Collection Instruments

In a recent collection on qualitative research Denzin (2003) reiterates, "Finally, this performative ethnography searches for new ways to locate and represent the gendered, sacred self in its ethical relationships to nature" (p. 489). This study is based in

the researcher's engagement with nature in as much as still images of the researcher's

shadow, taken on a day of 24 hours light on a riverbank in the North West Territories,

Canada, were the source material for the creation of the *Image(s)* DVD. [see Appendix

6]. Also, video footage filmed in the university campus courtyards and flower gardens,

and transposed into still images in the Final Cut Pro edit suite, constituted the basis on

which *Virtual Conference: The Universe - The University* [see Chapter 4 - Findings] was

designed. The questionnaire that accompanied the Phase I DVD [see Appendix 3]

consisted of five questions that invited participants to consider both new media arts and

the relationship between new science and contemplative practice/consciousness studies.

Phase 2 data collection was undertaken through semi-structured interviews. Rapley's

(2004) description of this process is aptly analogous to the tone of the interviews

undertaken with participants during this study,

> … the actual interview interactions are a space in which I seek to test 'my' analysis of … specific themes by asking interviewees to talk about them. Or to put it another way, interview interactions are inherently spaces in which both speakers are constantly 'doing analysis' - both speakers are engaged (and collaborating in 'making meaning' and 'producing knowledge' (In choosing those specific interviewees and in producing that specific topic guide (that is shaped for that specific interviewee), I am already making some specific analytic choices about what types of people, what voices or identities, are central to the research (and which ones will remain silenced) alongside what sorts of topics of discussion might be important … During the interview, I often try to raise some of the themes I've been thinking through either by asking interviewees specific questions … sometimes, telling them about my thoughts and letting the comment on them (p. 27).

Within the context of this study, the interviews were planned around: 1) an overview of

the background and objectives of the project; 2) reference to Phase 1 data collected from

both the interviewee and the other participants; 3) questions framed around quotes from

experts in the areas new science, contemplative practice, and consciousness studies; 4) an explanation regarding the setting and creation of the *Image(s)* DVD; 5) ideas and suggestions put forward by the interviewees.

Data Analysis Methods

As a result of a response by one of the participants to a question posed by the researcher, the data analysis phase(s) have been adapted into formats that are intended to be "evocative". The question to the participant focused on the need to engage and challenge an intellectual audience, which is accustomed to text based information, presented in a purportedly objective manner that is founded in rational, linear, logical argumentation. The respondent suggested that narrative; drama, etc. may be the key. The researcher has chosen to develop a drama, entitled *"Not a Single Straight Line"*, from the Phase 1 responses of the participants. Denzin and Lincoln (1994) offer an insight into this approach, "Authors can engage in dialogue with those studied. Authors may write through narrators, directly as character … or through multiple characters, or one character may speak in many voices" (p. 578). Phase 2 data analysis has been presented as an arts-based DVD, entitled *Virtual Conference: The Universe - The University*. This format employed the multi-faceted responses of the participants during the interview process. Rapley's (2004) discussion of the multiple ways the researcher engages with participants aptly parallels the numerous lenses through which the researcher engaged with study participants,

> A question remains, do we as researchers treat interviewees as just
> individuals? Or do we treat them, at one and the same time, as individuals-
> and-part-of-broader-story-of-the-whole-research? I think this second
> rendering is more in alignment with a lot of research practice … In a

sense, as researchers, we don't always orientate to interviewees as
'individuals'. Similarly, interviewees don't always speak 'as individuals';
they can speak, at various moments, as representatives of institutions or
organizations or professions, as members of specific (sub) cultural groups,
as members of specific gendered, racialized, sexualised categories,
as well as thoughtful individuals, feeling individuals, experiencing
individuals … Treating subject positions and their associated voices
seriously, we might find that an ostensibly single interview could actually
be, in practice, an interview with several subjects (p. 29).

The rendering of the findings into an arts-based DVD from "a cacophony of voices

speaking with varying agendas" (Lincoln & Denzin, 1994, p. 576) and a series of image

sequences "each image metamorphosing into the next" (Youngblood, 2003, p.158) has

fostered what Daloz describes as "a deeper immersion into the rough-and-tumble of

human relationship" (cited in Cranton, 2005, p. 636).

CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS

DVD enclosure   *The Universe - The University: Virtual Conference*

duration   45 minutes

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

This chapter contains a discussion of a selection of the findings as they relate to

thematic areas presented in the literature review and the outlined methodology. The

words of Fischman (2001), an arts-based researcher, underline the intent,

> If we dare to engage in the dynamic process of looking at the field of
> education using new tools and questioning those areas which have been
> uncharted and treacherous, we may enter insecure territory, but one that
> holds layers of meaning we may not have otherwise encountered (p. 32).

The invitation to embark on a journey into less charted territory holds the promise of a
fruitful quest, but like most calls to adventure, there is likely risk involved. Within the
context of transformative learning theory the challenged faced is both a challenge to
oneself and a multifaceted panoply of issues,

> When a person encounters something unexpected, he or she either rejects
> the new information or begins to question previously held assumptions.
> This has the potential to be transformative (English, 2005).

The format in which the findings have been presented, *The Universe - The University*:

Virtual Conference DVD, has been an effort to "bring the visual and visual media and

technologies to the fore in the research process" (Pink, 2004, p. 395). The structure used

to present the findings was a thematic analysis based in the themes: the knowledge, the

institution, the empirical, the spiritual. The methodology employed was a qualitative

with a focus on critical analysis. The purpose of this study, as presented in the

introduction, has been to probe the belief that 'reason', 'logic', 'rationality', 'empiricism',

'objectivity' etc., are the foundation of knowledge creation within the university. The

research question was: in what ways can digital images, arts-based DVD, provide a

platform for dialogue regarding contemporary science and contemplative

practice/consciousness studies? As the literature demonstrates, these subject areas are

now hovering around the peripheries. The statistics given denote just how peripheral the change is. Publications, and calibre of the publishers, suggest that a change may be emerging, but the 'the silences between lovers' continues. Worldviews that have been unexplored from the point of view of the peoples with the view, and/or dismissed, are now being lent an ear – or are taking the risk of speaking their truth.

One of the ironies examined in this study rests in the assumption that those in positions of relative social, economic and political power, and those in the universities who 'train' people for these same positions, are the beneficiaries of their own framework. Bourdieu argues that,

> A description of the logic of the process of internalization, at the end of which objective chances have become subjective hopes or lack of hope, would seem necessary … [Educators] are the products of a system whose aim is to transmit an aristocratic culture, and are likely to adopt its values with a greater ardor in proportion to the degree to which they owe it their own academic and social success (1974, p. 34-38).

While this argument may well be a fair description of how social inequity is maintained, it fails to ask the question: what will it take to for those who maintain the framework to become aware that they/we, also, are prisoners of their/our own limited construct, particularly when, as scientists Hayward and Varela (1992) acknowledge, "the fundamental belief today is that we, the scientists, are the ones who are open" (p. 21). The following discussion was designed around elements of the narrative, and the imagery, presented in the data analysis DVD, *The Universe - The University: Virtual Conference.* This chapter has the following subsections: the knowledge and the institution, the empirical and the spiritual, the coda, and conclusion.

The Knowledge

"With my PhD it was an aha."

        This statement serves to allow for an exploration of how/why the researcher, as artist, designed and developed the DVD, *The Universe - The University: Virtual Conference.* The participant notes that the idea for his doctoral research came to him in a "daydream" which he then developed into a proposal that was followed by the development of the product. The process for *The Universe - The University*: *Virtual Conference* was perhaps similar … and perhaps not. This section is presented in the format of vernacular stream of consciousness as an example how an arts-based inquiry DVD was developed and an illustration of how the process of non-linear thinking has produced a techno-rational analysis within the context of a thematic framework intended to represent numerous possible approaches to knowledge creation. This was it: while unsystematically choosing combinations of digital effects overlaid on video footage of grates and grids, doorways, windows, walls, sky, tree bark, flowers, a rash, and a shadow sequence - all filmed on the university campus - a combination of digital effects called 'bevel' and 'solarize' produced the possibility of the 'big picture' image of a *Virtual Conference.* An instant barrage of socio-political metaphors related to the study question, the literature review, and the responses provided by the participants began to emerge and did not stop for a number of days. Some would commence with a visual image, others with an auditory memory of words the participants had spoken during the interviews, some would be a concretisation of a theoretical hit, a detailed political rant, or a reflection on a personal experience that was relevant to the topic. One was practical: would the Doctors give their permission to have their 'pitch' changed? This question (re)set off a

whole succession of thoughts, and feelings, about the nature and purpose of the research

paradigm and what it meant to be mirroring it back to those who are experts in many

facets of its use ...... the "aha" … the digital format would now serve to allow for an

examination of the themes that a solely text based format could not provide … get

techno-rational, mystical, and political … numerous platforms for communication written

across the top of a page: voice segment themes, images (4 -5 levels … content, context,

colour, size, placement, opacity, movement) …. text A, text B, text C, sound/music,

effects, transitions, etc. For example: 1) voices of participants (separate into themes in

sound bite segments saved in 'bins' with one 'bin' for sound bits that provide linking

dialogue …. change the pitch of each segment …. each section has a different set of pitch

levels for each participant … this takes a long time ... 2) image … as commentary, as

idea, as vision … metaphor of framework …. use 'bevel' effect ... relates to Popper's,

Myth of the Framework …. where's that quote …. need an image of a keyboard …

universities are all about words and computers .. even digital video is done with a

keyboard and a mouse … an entire section could be developed with one image of a

keyboard … the 'Institution' section …. [who'd a thunk you could turn an image of a

keyboard into a caricature, women, moving drill bits, etc …… and then there's the poppy

to work with … digital alchemy … this feeling is decidedly familiar! … the work

becomes more politically biting yet there is the opposite sensation that the creation is

essentially a love poem …. this very notion of opposites co-existing is logically unsound

and decried as epistemologically impossible …. wonderful … next transition … where

was that drop menu to get the 'dissolution' effect?] … oh, there's an image that would

make for great cartoons …. guess that workshop in using the comic making software

could be useful …. lots of information in a few images w/ sound …. cover some of the

heavy stuff that is the background to the work …. yet send it up …. because there is not

much that is rational and reasonable about what human beings do …. if we could just

stop pretending that from the get go …… hyperbole,

> By simultaneously presenting at least two versions of a situation, the
> comic text … establishes its own verisimilitude, or relationship to reality
> and what is real … An incongruous, often ironic situation is produced,
> permitting the appearance of ludicrous, amusing sequences of action that
> build upon themselves, this incongruity complements comedy's unique
> version of verisimilitude. Together these processes introduce a new level
> or reflexivity to the text (Denzin, 1995, p. 66)

…. (funny the ethics review and confidentiality thing .... signing away for eternity the

right to engage in a conversation with the research participants on the subject of the

research in the company of any other human being ... whatever, I know how to keep my

mouth shut ... the same system exists re: HIV/AIDS clients ... you have to pretend you

don't know them when you are in public in case someone might ask them questions

afterwards about why they know you and the big secret that they system has encouraged

you to have will be out ... it was a purposeful play on the research model in order to

make a point …… ft you don't have a name, we don't have to engage you,

> Informed consent, which is intended to protect subjects from harm,
> deception, and invasions of privacy is a sham. The liberal solution to the
> voyeur's code protects the state researcher against the subject. The
> humanist code, which endorses pure deception, presumably protects the
> researcher against the state by turning the tables on those in power, while
> protecting the researchers sources … This is also a sham as the state
> inevitable has more power then the researcher, and in practice it leads to
> the study of marginalized groups (Denzin, 1995, p. 203).

…. that quote doesn't quite say it ..... let it go, it's not the focus of the study) ...

4) themes … highlighted in text segments … but two of the books are in French … so

leave it that way … they are Doctors … [that ritual to invite in all those muses from all

those book might be a bit much even for some of the Doctors] … they will do their

homework … and besides the metaphor is that language doesn't always get there, 5)

music …. what about the tape, in some box somewhere, that Tony did 10 years ago when

he was 19 … give it a listen … this will work ... call and ask for his permission to move

the bits around and incorporate them into the DVD ……… that young man is incredibly

brilliant ... keep reading … missing chunks in the literature …. *Looking at Class,*

> Obviously, representing someone's class through accent, demeanour or
> scene setting can be very problematic, particularly if you pick older kinds
> of signals or signifiers, because you can so easily become stereotypical.
> But that is fundamentally how it is done (Rowbotham & Beynon, (2001),
> p. 108)

... yeah, this happens some of the time … but … but … "There are no scientific laws

governing these communications - when we communicate with others, we interpret what

they say in our own way" (Cranton, 2005, p.633) […. this Johnny Cash CD collection

from the library sure helps keep your head on your shoulders and your heart in your hand

.. et al] …. they will just think the whole thing was "engaging, interesting, aesthetically

pleasing, intellectually stimulating, and *weird*" [italics in text] and they will probably not

"comment on … what [they] might have thought about the content of the …. discourse"

(Finley, 2003, p. 292) … anyways …

> Our informants tell us what they do because they are in a research
> situation with us as individuals; this encounter and the knowledge
> produced through it can never be objective. Therefore it is essential that
> we attempt to understand the subjectivities through which our research
> materials are produced. [*Didn't I once dance more and laugh with things
> other than sound bites? ... soon ... you are the one that choose to do this ...
> and it matters]* When doing research this means being aware of how our
> own experiences, knowledge and stand-points inform our behaviour with
> and interpretation of our informants (Pink, 2004, p. 397).

"I am also impressed by the general observation that one person's liberation may be another's oppression, and the 'emancipatory' positions too often involve closed minds" (Clive, 2004, p. 410) .... "As valuable forms of nonverbal communication, symbol and metaphor make connections between things that are concrete and things that are abstract" Kazemaek, Shakatko, & Walker cited in Clover, 2006 forthcoming) …. the quotes are starting to talk to each other in future publications … *soon they'll be meeting at conferences* …… best to get back to the original structure of this study …. something about an 'aha' and a scientific paper written by one of the study participants.

The Institution

"There is really a one world university."

This statement, made by the adult education participant, invokes a more profound analysis of a theme that runs through this study: that of the 'other' as regards academic institutions. Three further examples will be given from the literature. These address race/ethnicity and gender as they relate to acknowledging, valuing, and respecting the 'other'. The examples look at instances of both the knowledges of the other being undervalued, the obvious need for presence of the 'other' in decision making positions being seemingly regarded as a non-issue, and one impact this can have.

First, an example from the sciences as regards publication in the arena of academia. Hayward and Varela (1992) describe a study conducted in the US whereby scientific articles, which had been published in respected journals, were re-sent to those same publications. But, the researchers had changed the name of the author and attributed

the work to an institution in a country that is not know for "scientific reliability" (p. 99).

"Out of a hundred papers resubmitted, 80 percent were rejected with comments saying

they were not good science, their method was bad, the interpretation was bad!" (p. 99).

As scientists Hayward and Varela note, "This phenomenon is a lot more subtle and

pervasive that one might think. It is part of this entire social context" (p. 99). As this is

the situation with information that has been decreed scientific by the community of

Western scientists, one might ask what the response would have been should the

submissions have been from the Indigenous Knowledge Systems of African or

Indigenous science - as has been a query of one research participant in this study with

regards to knowledge creation in the academy.

Second, an example from the domain of publishing but this time looking at the

area of qualitative research. Alasuutari (2004), a Finnish Social Science researcher,

conducted a study in 2002 through which he learn that of 217 books classified as

'qualitative methodology' on the Sage publications web site (as listed by country of origin

of authors based on their institutional affiliation), "English speaking countries held 91

percent of the 'market', and the United States and United Kingdom alone held 80 percent

market share" (p. 597). Alasuutari's comments are not so different from Araújo Freire's as

stated in *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. He writes, "the problem with Anglo-American

dominance is that such distancing is one-sided: only outsiders are required to take

another's perspective, whereas people located in the centre easily slip into ignorant

ethnocentrism" (p. 599). His discussion is taken one step further, and the result of this

move is a firm indictment of the purportedly emancipatory paradigm of critical

qualitative research. Refering to Denzin and Lincoln (2000 p. 1047) Alasuutari argues,

> … it is undeniable that their story, as an example of a progressive narrative, also functions as a way to argue implicitly that what they describe as the last moments are where up-to-date, well-informed researchers should now be going if they are not there yet. Likewise, researchers and studies mentioned as examples of the recent movements represent the avant-garde or cutting edge of present-day qualitative research. It is hardly a surprise that the authors of exemplary studies of these moments in qualitative research development are a very small and practically all-American group of people. And the closer to the present you get, the more frequent are the new stages, and the narrower is the group (p. 601).

Perhaps Denzin (1995) needs to revisit his own work [as ought the well-fed author of this high-tech Western based research project: myself]. He writes, "Our texts are never without political implications … Make politics a spectacle … Write works that collapse in upon themselves (see Rose, 1990: 10) … Write works which unmask our self-serving voyeuristic project" (p.210). Banerjee (2000) brings the point home,

> … this story of neo-colonialism, of exploitation, racism, discrimination and hierarchical citizenship never gains much credibility or publicity with the Canadian state, the public or the media. This reality is what the cultural language and politics of diversity obscures, displaces and erases. It is obvious that the third world or non-white immigrants are not the beneficiaries of the discourse of diversity (p. 47).

Odora Hoppers (2002) outlines one of the profound implications of these social, political and economic frameworks,

> The deculturation of the dominated societies is shown by the fact that increasingly, they exclusively voice their predicaments and aspiration in terms of the categories sanctioned by the invading culture. This entails, at the limit, the asphyziation of the recipient culture, and the loss of vitality and coherence of the indigenous cultural forms. The Third World societies are, under these conditions, made to feel that there is little or nothing they have ever given to others (p. 6).

Within the context of the data analysis DVD, *The Universe - The University: Virtual Conference,* it would seem prudent to ask if Odora Hopper's words are applicable within the context of the academy?

The third example of very concrete differences in leadership and representation is very straight forward and addresses the comment made by one of the study participants that suggested that "women are almost equal to men" in the academy. One pertinent example of inequitable gender representation exists with regards to the prestigious appointment of Canada Research Chairs (CRC). A 2002 document from Queens university reads, "Gender distribution in the CRC Program is a problem for every university" (Senate Report). Kondro (2002) writes, "A new report shows that women are seriously underrepresented in a fledgling program to help Canada retain its best academic talent". As the program has continued to develop, not only has gender been a issue with regards to the both the nomination and selection process within the universities, other forms of discriminatory practice have been noted and brought to the attention of the Canadian Human Rights Commission. In a complaint form registered in 2003 the opening sentence reads, "Industry Canada's Canada Research Chairs program discriminates against individuals (academics) who are members of the protected groups set out in s. 3 of the *CHRA,* in particular: sex, age, race, colour, national or ethnic origin, sexual orientation, disability and family status, contrary to Section 5 of the *Canada Human Rights Act.*

The list could well go on. It might include that which was set-aside as one subject area this study would not cover - the military industrial complex. One caveat would suffice to link this to the introduction of the researcher/artist. Bourgault (2003), in the closing section of her text entitled *Playing for life: Performance in Africa in the age of AIDS* proposes,

> … many fear that the preoccupation of the Western world, particularly that
> of the U.S. with homeland security, will distract the attention of the rich.
> The wealthy nations need to focus on this epidemic that is killing not
> 3, 000 in a one time attack, but more than 6,000 every day [*dated statistic*]
> in sub-Saharan Africa (p. 264). [italics mine]

But, perhaps this was not information that was necessary to include. As one participant

noted during Phase 11 data collection interviews, "You can use a lot of these quotes and

things that all these different people use .... we know that everybody knows that". True.

The Empirical and The Spiritual

"What are we fighting for?"

This question, posed by the participant whose study is faith-based, provides the

opportunity present three instances in which scholars are (re)establishing links between

the science and religion/spirituality. A definition based in semiotics reflects the

conclusion of the Phase 1 data analysis drama entitled, "*Not a Single Straight Line*". The

outcome of the play, which is a direct quote from Phase 1 data collection, reads, "The

meaning is the result, in part, of the context. The generation of meaning is an ongoing,

nearly infinite process". Manning & Cullum-Swan (1994) close their definition of

semiotics with, "The process of linking or connecting expression and content is social

and depends upon the perspective of the observer" (p. 463).

Weiming (2004) is the first Chinese participant at the Mind and Life Institute

(2006) meetings hosted by the Dalai Lama He has taught philosophy, religions studies,

and Asian languages in Eastern and American universities. He comments that,

> It is quite possible that this enterprise of a dialogue between civilizations
> will reintroduce some modes of thought that were rejected by scientific
> minds beginning in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries - modes that
> were rejected as unscientific because they related to religion or

metaphysics. It may be time now to bring many other kinds of vision -
artistic, religious, spiritual to bear on these very important questions
(Weiming cited in Zojonc, p. 36).

This suggestion parallels numerous examples forward by participants in the *Universe -*

University: Virtual Conference DVD. These include: the potential for learning from

dialogue across cultures and continents with regards to science and religion - and the

present barriers within the academy based in racism, the vestige of colonialism; neo-

liberal agendas, etc.; the dialogues held by scientists such as Capra (1988) with peers

from numerous scientific, spiritual and political backgrounds, which broach the gap

between new sciences and questions related to spiritual knowing; the fact that study

participants agreed to engage in an arts-based inquiry that juxtaposed the above

considerations.

A second point of view that serves to link worldviews, does so in part from an

epistemological perspective, but also from an ontological point of view. Massoudi (2003)

is an engineer writing for a technical magazine. His article is entitled, *Can Scientific*

Writing be Creative? He cites a plethora of both faith-based leaders from numerous

cultures and lands as well as many people who work in theoretical and/or applied

sciences. This example resonates with experiences encountered during both the Phase 1

and Phase 2 data collection processes, as any stereotypes the researcher may have had

about the 'temperaments' of scientist vs. faith-based scholar vs. adult educator were

challenged,

> The Noble prize winner, Sir Peter Medawar (1973, p.3), for example, says,
> "Scientists are people of very dissimilar temperaments doing different
> things in very different ways. Among scientist are collectors, classifiers
> and compulsive tidy up, many are detectives by temperament and many
> are explorers; some are artist and others artisans. There are poet-scientists
> and philosopher-scientists end even a few mystics (p. 127).

Examples have been provided of the need to overcome division and imbalance between gender, race, and ethnicity. The quote, above, demonstrates that prejudgements based on areas of scholarly engagement may be unsound. The final image in 'The Empirical' segment of the DVD alludes to a parallel but opposite analogy from the one above. The temperament of artists, and their work, has been stereotypically categorized as a set of general relatively unskilled abilities. The 'stop/clear' image, which is a button on a photocopy machine, exemplifies the need to consider that the temperaments of artists are as varied as that of scientists as our levels of precision, exploration, and complexity they bring to the work. Weil (1968) suggests that the purpose of advanced education is to hone the capacity for 'attention'. Like most scholars who embrace the mystical tradition, she then argues that the next step is to use this capacity of attention to empty the mind as this is considered the starting point. Each of the participants touched either directly or indirectly on this notion and one suggested that our society, and the university, had lost touch with this understanding.

In closing this section, the difficult situations encountered by participants, and others, who work to juxtapose belief systems and traditions deemed to be antithetical is addressed in the work of Moosa (2005). He speaks of "the idea of *dihliz* … meaning threshold position" as "straddled, agonized over, and negotiated antinomies" (p. 29). Moosa notes that like Gazali, "those who have approached the threshold have "combined the skills of an engineer and a bricoleur" (p. 30) they entered "the confluence of the cosmological and discursive skeins as they threaded the ambivalence of the threshold … of [the] self. Moosa notes that, "Ghazali introduced these mixtures knowingly, while his critics remorselessly charged him with irresponsibly mixing multiple discourses" but he

persisted, "giving priority to the body of the subject, and then went on to demonstrate the pervasive interchangeability of the semiotic and the somatic" (p. 105). "But it requires a particular agility of the mind and a particular style of self-reflexivity to hold such complex apparatus intact - characteristics that modern secular reasoning regrettably regards as antithetical to rationality" (p. 189).

The Coda

"It opens you up."

These are the words of one study participant in the moment after viewing the Universe - University: Virtual Conference DVD. No other words could have been more meaningful to me in that instant. Later, in a short flash, I saw in the eyes of my 'research subject' a boy 8 years old, a man 32, 55, 72, 327, 849, 1356 ..... These were not 'images' as such, but clear light that was somehow timeless. As the next stage of the agreed upon research protocol is the distribution of this text to the participants, the fact that the study had been designed within the scholarly framework of a rationally argued critical analysis presents me with a dilemma. I had chosen not to do research with HIV/AIDS clients as I felt the discursive model was not consistent with my commitment to that work. This internal conflict has returned. The introduction, literature review, methodology, findings/analysis, and discussion in this study fairly ruthlessly categorize, analyse, and criticize aspects of those things to which each of the participants has dedicated their lives. The fact that I had set out with an abstract set of digitally based images of my own shadow as part of an exploration into dissolving concepts of the 'self', has been of little relevance in the body of this socio-politically oriented paper. Nevertheless, I need to note

that the love in that clear light radiating from one being to another ought to serve as a counter-weight, a measurable thing, that may one day balance the fact that he closed with, "I still don't understand what it is that you are trying to do". My hope it that the facts, and metaphors, presented in this research provide an invitation to engage in a renewal of our understanding, and procedures, with regards to knowledge creation and dissemination in the university and the global community. This may require a profound engagement with grieving (Taylor cited in Cranton, 2005, p. 635) – grieving for the losses and injustices to the 'other' that have been perpetuated, in part, by the academy and the framework it has adopted and proliferated. Lastly, may I ask that each consider exploring, how the not-particularly-rationally-explainable light, emanating from somewhere behind the eyeball, may have something to do with it all?

Conclusion

The first comment by a participant in the *Universe - University: Virtual Conference* DVD that suggests that rationality may well have been adopted because, "it's one of the easier things to follow". The words of the participants, and the work of the artist/researcher have, ideally, hinted that there is so much more, and that we are both losing and missing a great deal, as a result of the limited constructs of 'rationality', 'logic', 'materialism' etc. The problem is not so much that the constructs are wrong, as that those in positions of power have maintained that that they are not 'constructs' and that are they are the epicentre of what is true, right and - knowledge. The objective of this research has been to explore, develop, and produce an arts-based DVD that fosters dialogue and encourages thinking about the relationship between new sciences and contemplative

practice/ consciousness studies. The question asked was: in what ways can digital images provide a platform for dialogue regarding contemporary science and contemplative practice/consciousness studies? An initial response to this question is provided in the literature review and data analyse DVD entitled *Virtual Conference: The Universe - The University.* Major themes include: the Western, Caucasian male dominated knowledge paradigm, the university community in an intellectually imperialist, ethnocentric, capitalist, rational/logical, objectivist, mechanistic, knowledge framework, and the exploration of new sciences and practice based contemplative epistemologies and the potential institutional and socio-political shifts these knowledge(s) could engender amongst educators and peers in the research community. Findings and analysis are presented in the DVD and a discussion of the perspectives of participants in relation to emergent in the literatures follows. A final coda provides a perspective from the point of view of the researcher.

REFERENCES

Afnan, S. (1958). *Avicenna: His life and his works*. London: Ruskin House.

Aguilar, A. (2004). ¿Es <relacional> un trasecendental? Desvelando una nueva faceta de la realidad. [Is the transcendental 'relational'? Unveiling a new facet of reality]. *Pensamiento. 60* (226), 87-114.

Alasuutari, P. (2004). The globalization of qualitative research. In C. Seale, G. Gobo, J. Gubrium, & D. Silverman (Eds.). *Qualitative research Practice*. (pp. 595-607) London: Sage.

Allen, R.E. (Ed). (1989). *The Oxford dictionary of current English*. (7th Edition). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Almond, I. (2004). *Sufism and deconstruction: A comparative study of Derrida and Ibn 'Arabi*. London: Routledge.

Arberry, A. (1961). *Discourses of Rumi.* London: Redwood Burn.

Arbuckle. (2004). *Violence, society, and the church: A cultural approach*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press.

Aurobindo, S. (1972). *The future poetry*. Pondicherry, India: Sri Aurobindo Ashram.

Babul, A. & Fincke-Keeler, M. (2005). *The art of physics: Visualizing the universe, seeing the unseen*. McPherson Library Gallery Exhibition: University of Victoria.

Bannerjee, H. (2000). *The dark side of the nation: Essays on multiculturalism, nationalism and gender.* Toronto: Canadian Scholars Press.

Bannerjee, S. (2005). *Make me a man! Masculinity, Hinduism, and nationalism in India*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Barnard, G. (1997). *Exploring unseen worlds: William James and the philosophy of mysticism.* Albany: State University of New York Press.

Batchelor, S. (2000). *Verses from the centre: A Buddhist vision of the sublime*. New York: Riverhead Books.

Bell, A. & Chomsky, N. (2005). *A hated political enemy: Allen Bell interviews Noam Chomsky*. Victoria, British Columbia: Flash.

Bohm, D. (2003). *The Essential David Bohm.* New York: Routledge.

Bourdieu, P. (1974). The school as a conservative force: Scholastic and cultural inequalities. (J.C. Whitehouse Trans.) In J. Eggleston (Ed.). *Contemporary research in the sociology of education.* (pp. 32-46) CITY: Methuen.

Bourgault, L.M. (2003). *Playing for life: Performance in Africa in the age of AIDS.* Durham, NC: Carolina Academic Press.

Bricmont, J. & Sokal, A. (2005). The furor over impostures intellectuelles: What is all the fuss about? In D. Patai, & W. Corral (Eds.). *Theory's empire: An anthology of dissent.* (pp. 537-540) New York: Columbia.

Canadian Human Rights Commission (2003). Complaint form - Industry Canada and Canadian Research Chairs program. Retrieved July 3, 2006 from http://www.google.ca/search?q=male+and+female+and+Canada+Research+Chairs+Tier+One&start=0&ie=utf-8&oe=utf-8&client=firefox-a&rls=org.mozilla:en-US:official

Capra, F. (1988). *Uncommon wisdom: Conversations with remarkable people.* New York: Simon and Schuster.

Clover, D. E. (2001). Toward transformative learning: Ecological perspectives for adult education. In E. O'Sullivan, A. Morrell, & M. O'Connor (Eds.). *Expanding the boundaries of transformative learning.* (pp. 159-172) New York: Pelgrave.

Clover, D. E. (forthcoming 2006). Out of the dark room: Participatory photography as a critical imaginative, and public aesthetic practice of transformative education. *Journal of Transformative Education.*

Cranton, P. (2005). Transformative learning. In L. English (Ed.). *International encyclopaedia of adult education.* (pp. 630-637) New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Culpepper, A. (1988). *Anatomy of the fourth gospel: A study in literary design.* Philadelphia: Fortress Press.

Dalai Lama. (2005). *The universe in a single atom: The convergence of science and spirituality.* New York: Morgan Road Books.

Davies, E. (2003). *Science in the looking glass.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Deloria, V. (2003). *God is red: A native view of religion.* New York: Putman.

Denzin, N. (1994). The art and politics of interpretation. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.). *Handbook of qualitative research.* (pp. 500-515) London: Sage.

Denzin, N. (1995). *The cinematic society: The voyeur's gaze*. London: Sage.

Denzin, N. & Lincoln, Y. (Eds.). (1994). *Handbook of qualitative research*. London: Sage.

Denzin, N. & Lincoln, Y. (Eds.). (2003). *Collecting and interpreting qualitative materials*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Donoghue, D. (2005). Theory, theories, and principles. In D. Patai, D. & W. Corral (Eds.). *Theory's empire: An anthology of dissent*. (pp. 109-120) New York: Columbia University Press.

Emblemsva, J. & Bras, B. (2000). Process thinking: A new paradigm for science and engineering. *Futures,* 32, 635-654.

Eisner, E. & Powell, K. (2002). Art in science? *Curriculum Inquiry*, *32* (2), 132-159.

English, L. & Gillen, M. (Ed.). (2000). *New directions for adult and continuing education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Farquhar, R. (2001). Transforming universities: Approaches to reconciling cultural differences. *Curriculum Inquiry*, *31*(4), 469-484.

Faure, B. (2003). *The power of denial: Buddhism, purity, and gender.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Filsner, B. (2003). Gilles Deleuze and a future cinema: Cinema 1, cinema 2 - and cinema 3? In J. Shaw & P. Weibel (Eds.). *Future Cinema: The cinematic imaginary after film.* (pp. 214-217) Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Finley, S. (2003). Arts-based inquiry in QI: Seven years from crisis to guerrilla warfare. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *9*(2), 281-296.

Fischman, G. (2001). Reflections about images, visual culture, and educational research. *Educational researcher. 30*(8), pp. 28-33.

Fletcher Marsh, W. (2002). *Like water on a rock: Gender integration in Canadian Anglicanism.* Guelph, Ontario: Artemis Enterprises.

Fontana, A. & Frey, J. (1994). Interviewing: The art of science. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.). *Handbook of qualitative research*. (pp. 361-376) London: Sage.

Frankel, E. (2001). Kabbalah as sacred psychology. *Women and therapy*, *24* (3/4), 55-73.

Freire, P. (1994). *Pedagogy of hope*. New York: Continuum.

Fuller, M. (1995). *Atom and icons*. London: Mowbray.

Gale, P. (1995). *Video texts.* Toronto: Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

Gardner, M. (Ed.). (1971). *The annotated Alice: Alice's adventures in wonderland and through the looking glass.* New York: The World Publishing Company.

Ghazali, A. (1991). *The alchemy of happiness*. (E. Claud Trans.). New York: M. E. Sharpe.

Goodheart, E. (2005). Casualties of the culture wars. In D. Patai & W. Corral (Eds.). *Theory's empire: An anthology of dissent.* (pp. 508-521) New York: Columbia University Press.

Hall, B. L. (2001). The right to a new utopia: Adult learning and the changing world of work in an era of global capitalism. In E. O'Sullivan, A. Morrell, & M. O'Connor (Eds.). *Expanding the boundaries of transformative learning.* (pp. 35-46) New York: Pelgrave.

Hall, B. L. (2002). Breaking the monopoly of knowledge: Research methods, participation and development. In R. Tandon (Ed.). *Participatory research: Revisiting the roots.* (pp. 9-21) New Delhi: Mosaic Books.

Hamilton, R. (2003). Glorious technicolor, breathtaking cinemascope and stereophonic sound. In J. Shaw & P. Weibel (Eds.). *Future cinema: The cinematic imaginary after film*. (pp. 88-95) Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Harper, D. (1994). On the authority of the image: visual method at a crossroads.   In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.). *Handbook of qualitative research*. (pp. 403-412) London: Sage.

Hayward, J. & Varela, F. (1992). *Gentle Bridges: Conversations with the Dalai Lama on the sciences of the mind*. Boston: Shambhala.

Heisenberg, W. (1971). *Physics and beyond: Encounters and conversation*. New York: Harper & Row.

Hirshfield, J. (Ed.). (1994). *Women in praise of the sacred: 43 centuries of spiritual poetry by women*. New York: HarperCollins.

Klein, A. (1995). *Meeting the great bliss queen: Buddhists, feminists, and the art of the self*. Boston: Beacon Press.

Kondro, W. (2002) *Few women win new academic chairs.* Retrieved July 2, 2006 from http://www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/summary/296/5577/2319

Kress, G. & Van Leeuwen, T. (2001). *Multimodal discourse: The modes and media of contemporary communication*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Le Grice, M. (2001). *Experimental cinema in the digital age*. London: British Film Institute.

Lilburn, T. (2003). *Kill-site*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart.

Lispett, L. (2001). On speaking terms again: Transformation of the human-earth relationship through spontaneous painting. In E. O'Sullivan, A. Morrell, & M. O'Connor (Eds.). *Expanding the boundaries of transformative learning*. (pp. 215-228) New York: Pelgrave.

Manning, P. & Cullum-Swan, B. (1994). Narrative, content, and semiotic analysis. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.). *Handbook of qualitative research*. (pp. 463-478) London: Sage.

Massoudi, M. (2003). Can scientific writing be creative? *Journal of Sciences and Technology, 12*(2), 115-128.

McIntosh, R. (Ed.). (1993). *The state of the art: Arts literacy in Canada*. Victoria, British Columbia: Beach Holme Publishers.

McKendrick, K. (2001). *Immemorial silence*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

McQuire, S. (2003) The Cathedral of Fictions. In J. Shaw & P. Weibel (Eds.). *Future cinema: The cinematic imaginary after film*. (pp. 168-175) Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Mind and Life Institute. (2006). Overview of program partipants. Retrieved July 7, 2006 from http://www.mindandlife.org/

Miovic, M. (2004 March/April). An introduction to spiritual psychology: overview of the literature, east and west. *Harvard review of psychiatry*, pp.105-115.

Moosa, E. (2005). *Ghazali and the poetics of imagination.* London: University of North Carolina Press.

Nichol, L. (Ed.). (2003). *The essential David Bohm*. London: Routledge.

O'Connor, M. (2001). Transformative learning and new paradigm scholarship. In E. O'Sullivan, A. Morrell, & M. O'Connor (Eds.). *Expanding the boundaries of transformative learning*. (pp. 241-256) New York: Pelgrave.

Odora Hoppers, C. (2002). The evolution/creationism debate: Insight and implication from the Indigenous knowledge systems perspective. Retrieved December 3, 2006 from http://www.transcend.org/t_database/articles.php?ida=279

O'Neill, E. (2004). Holding flames: Women illuminating knowledge of s/Self-transformation. In E. O'Sullivan & M. Taylor (Eds.). *Learning toward an ecological consciousness*. (pp. 183-199) New York: Palgrave.

O'Sullivan, E. (1999). *Transformative learning: Educational vision for the 21st century*. Toronto: ZED.

Pink, S. (2004). Visual method. In C. Seale, G. Gobo, J. Gubrium, & D. Silverman (Eds.). *Qualitative research Practice*. (pp. 391-406) London: Sage.

Popper, K. (1994). *The myth of the framework: In defence of science and rationality*. London: Routledge.

Queens University Senate Meeting (2002 May). Gender distribution in CRC program. Retrieved July 15, 2005 from http://www.google.ca/search?q=male+and+female+and+Canada+Research+Chair sTier+One&start=0&ie=utf-8&oe=utf-8&client=firefox-a&rls=org.mozilla:en-US:official

Rapley, T. (2004). Interviews. In C. Seale, G. Gobo, J. Gubrium, & D. Silverman (Eds.). *Qualitative research practice*. (pp. 15-33) London: Sage.

Rose, S. (2004). Spiritual love: Questioning the unquestionable. *Journal of Contemporary Religion, 19*(2) 205-217.

Rowbotham, S. & Beynon, H. (Eds.). (2001). *Looking at class: Film, television and the working class in Briton*. London: Rivers Oram Press.

Rumi, M. (1995). *The Essential Rumi*. (C. Banks, J. Moyne, A.J. Arberry, R. Nicholson, Trans.). San Francisco: HarperCollins.

Rush, M. (2003). *Video art*. London: Thames and Hudson

Sefa Dei, G. (2001). Spiritual knowing and transformative learning. In E. O'Sullivan, A. Morrell, & M. O'Connor (Eds.). *Expanding the boundaries of transformative learning*. (pp. 121-134) New York: Pelgrave.

Shaw, J. & Weibel, P. (Eds.). (2003). *Future cinema: The cinematic imaginary after film*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Shilling, R. (2002). Journey of our spirits: Challenges for adult Indigenous learners. In E. O'Sullivan, A. Morrell, & M. O'Connor (Eds.). *Expanding the boundaries of transformative learning*. (pp. 151-158) New York: Pelgrave.

Slattery, P. (2003). Troubling the contours of arts-based educational research. *Qualitative Inquiry, 9*(2), 192-197.

Steale, C. (2004). Quality in qualitative research. In C. Seale, G. Gobo, J. Gubrium, & D. Silverman (Eds.). *Qualitative research Practice*. (pp. 409-419) London: Sage.

Talbut, G.S. in Singh, W. (2003). *Focus on religion and Sikh thought*. Delhi: National Book Shop.

Tisdell, E. (2000). Spirituality and emancipatory adult education in women adult educators for social change. *Adult Education Quarterly, 50*(4), 308-335.

Tagore, R. (1924). *La religion du poète.* [The religion of the poet]. Paris: Payot.

Underhill, E. (Ed.). (1956). *Cloud of unknowing*. Bath: Pitman Press.

Wallace, B. (2000). *The taboo of subjectivity: Toward a new science of consciousness*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Wangoola, P. (2000). Mpambo, the African multiversity: A philosophy to rekindle the African spirit. In G. J. Sefa Dei, B. L. Hall, & D. Goldin Rosenberg (Eds.). *Indigenous knowledges in global contexts*. (pp. 264-277) Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Wees, W. (2003). The camera-eye: Dialectics of a metaphor. In J. Shaw & P. Weibel, (Eds.). *Future Cinema: The cinematic imaginary after film.* (pp. 48-55) Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Weibel, P. (Ed.). (2003). Expanded cinema, video and virtual environments. In J. Shaw & P. Weibel (E. Todd, Trans.). *Future cinema: The cinematic imaginary after film.* (pp. 440-441). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Weil, S. (1948). *La pesanteur et la grace*. [Gravity and grace]. Paris: Librairie Plon.

Weil, S. (1968). *On science, necessity, and the love of God*. London: Oxford University Press.

Wilson, C. (1970). *Poetry and mysticism*. London: Hutchison & Co. Ltd.

Youngblood, G. (2003). *Cinema* and the code. In J. Shaw & P. Weibel (Eds.). *Future cinema: The cinematic imaginary after film.* (pp. 156-161) Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Zajonc, A. (2004). *The new physics and cosmology: Dialogues with the Dalai Lama.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Zeitlin, I. (2004). *The religious experience: Classical philosophical and social theories.* Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Appendix A Participant Consent Form

Empty spaces in epistemology: PhD perspectives on the future of knowledge creation

You are invited to participate in a study entitled Empty spaces in epistemology: PhD perspectives on the future of knowledge creation. My name is Odette Laramee. I am a graduate student in the department of Educational Psychology and Leadership Studies at the University of Victoria. You may contact me if you have further questions by phone at (250) 388-3005 or by e-mail at olaramee@uvic.ca.

As a graduate student, I am required to conduct this research project as part of the requirements for a Masters of Education degree in Leadership Studies. This research is being conducted under the supervision of Dr. Darlene Clover. You may contact her by phone at (250) 721-7785 or by fax at (250) 721-6190.

The objective of the research is to engage persons holding PhDs in the exploration of an artistic medium (video/DVD) which fosters dialogue and encourages thinking about the relationship between contemplative epistemologies, discoveries being made in the sciences, and the impacts these could have on paradigms of knowledge creation for educators and adult learners.

Research of this type is important because it has the potential to contribute to dialogue between scientific, consciousness studies, and faith-based leaders. There is also the possibility that publication, which results from the study, will support the incorporation of adult education - transformative learning theories and artistic practice in other faculties, and in classrooms.

The target population for participant selection for this study is persons holding PhD's living in British Columbia and/or affiliated with the University of Victoria. This choice has been made as universities are the site of intensive adult education and academic research faculty is instrumental in the creation and dissemination of new knowledge.

If you agree to voluntarily participate in this research, you will be emailed the questionnaire and delivered/mailed the video/DV D. You will watch the video and complete the questionnaire at your convenience. You may decline to answer questions on the questionnaire at your discretion. The completed questionnaire will be emailed back to me. If there is the need to clarify responses I will contact you to arrange an email/in-person meeting. The location and/or mode of follow-up communication will be chosen by you. The estimated time to view the video/DVD (12 minutes) and complete the questionnaire is one hour. A follow-up clarification email/in-person meeting, as required, would take up to one hour.

This is a minimal risk study. There are no known or anticipated risks to you by participating in this research. The possibility of harm as a result of participation is less than or equal to that of participants regular ongoing involvement within her/his professional engagements. Anonymity and confidentiality will be maintained as names

will not be used during data analysis or in the final report. The names of the participants will not be disclosed during or after the study at any time.

The potential benefits of your participation include engagement with, and reflection upon, an arts-based educational tool and consideration of the epistemological and practical implications of future applications of contemplative knowledge claims and modern scientific discoveries. With respect to society and to the state of knowledge the intersections of the discourses between faith based, scientific and adult education leaders will be fostered.

Your participation in this research is to be completely voluntary. Should you decide that you do not want to participate, you may withdraw at any time without any consequences or explanation. If you choose to withdraw, you may choose whether the data collected can be used in this study, or if you would like to have all data deleted from all data bases and all print copies shredded.

To ensure ongoing consent participants who are asked for points of clarification, with whom an in-person meeting has been agreed to, will be asked to initial their original consent form as proof of on-going consent. For those with whom email clarification is agreed to, their email response will constitute ongoing consent.

With respect to your anonymity, your name will not be used anywhere in this study. In order to protect confidentiality all communications and data will be designated pseudonyms, and original emails will be immediately and permanently deleted from the computer. All of the data collected and any copies of it will be kept in a locked filing cabinet at the home of the researcher.

It is anticipated that the results of this study will be shared with others in the following ways: the analysis of the data will be presented as a thesis project and a copy of the analysis will be presented directly to participants. When possible, presentations will be made at scholarly events and/or in published articles.

Data from this study will be stored for up to five years. At this time, I am requesting your permission for further data use as part of this consent. The data will be deleted and/or shredded on or before the end of the five year period.

You are invited to contact me or my supervisor at the above phone numbers. You may verify the ethical approval of this study, or raise any concerns you might have, by contacting the Associate Vice-President, Research at the University of Victoria (250-472-4545).

Your signature below indicates that you understand the above conditions of participation in this study and that you have had the opportunity to have your questions answered by the researchers.

A copy of this consent will be left with you, and a copy will be taken by the researcher.

Appendix B Letter of Introduction to Participants

(To be sent in the body of an email.)

Request for your participation - letter of introduction

[attachment: Participant Consent Form]

Greetings Dr.

I am sending this letter of introduction to invite you to participate in the study 'Empty spaces in epistemology: PhD perspectives on the future of knowledge creation'.

My name is Odette Laramee. I am a graduate student completing a Masters of Education: Leadership Studies.

The objective of my research is to engage persons holding PhDs in the exploration of an artistic medium (video/DVD) which fosters dialogue and encourages thinking about the relationship between contemplative epistemologies, discoveries being made in the sciences, and the impacts these could have on paradigms of knowledge creation for educators and adult learners.

You are being invited to participate in this study because I am familiar with you and your work and/or you have stated on the UVIC website that you've expertise in sciences, religious studies and/or adult education.

Please see the attached 'Participant Consent Form' for further information.

You may contact me at this email address or by telephone at 250-388-3005. I look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely,
Odette Laramee

Appendix C Questionnaire (Phase 1 data collection)

The objective of the research is to engage persons holding PhDs in the exploration of an artistic medium (video/DVD) which fosters dialogue and encourages thinking about the relationship between contemplative epistemologies, discoveries being made in the sciences, and the impacts these could have on paradigms of knowledge creation for educators and adult learners.

Questionnaire:

1. Please provide a response to the Image(s), from the perspective of your field of professional expertise, through a medium of your choice (e.g. illustration, quotation, poem, analysis, story, drawing, design, lesson plan, formula, script, proposal outline, research question, model, etc.).

2. Please name a book/article that explores a developing discourse between two or more of the following: contemporary science, consciousness studies, contemplatives from faith based traditions, transformative learning, art as an educational tool, the arts (poetry/music/etc.) as a medium for expressing that which is difficult to qualify and/or quantify? Discuss your choice.

3. What relationship can you see between the Image(s) and the following quote by physicist, Arthur Zajonc? How could these relationships affect your research and/or teaching in the future?

> "It literally breaks you up. It breaks up your ideas and leaves a kind of
> humor. Nonlocality, randomness, interdependence - these are like
> quantum koans. If you try to think them out in a conventional way, you
> will fail. Sometimes I think one needs a new level of insight to be able
> to put your mind around them. Furthermore, our technological advancement far
> outstrips our ethical development, our capacity to make sound judgments about
> what we've unleashed".

4. What relationship can you see between the Image(s) and the following faith-based quote by Dr. G.S. Talib? How could these relationships affect your research and/or teaching in the future?

> Our need "'Seems to be cross-cultural, a need to explore the trans-empirical.'
> The life of spirit is not exclusive, it takes into account the temporal concerns".

5. Could you use these Image(s) as a teaching tool in your classes? Why or why not?

6. Within the language of your discipline, can you offer a possible explanation of how these Image(s) were created?   Hint: I started each with a picture of nothing …

Appendix D Cover Letter for DVD, (Phase 1 data collection)

Empty spaces in epistemology: Perspectives of persons holding doctorates on the future of knowledge creation

The objective of the research is to engage persons holding PhDs in the exploration of an artistic medium (video/DVD) which fosters dialogue and encourages thinking about the relationship between contemplative epistemologies, discoveries being made in the sciences, and the impacts these could have on paradigms of knowledge creation for educators and adult learners.

Dear Dr.

Thank you for agreeing to participate in this study. Your willingness to take part is dearly appreciated.

Included in this package is a DVD entitled: Images. I will send you an email copy of the questionnaire that is to be answered when you view the DVD. (The ethics committee members suggested that I ask you to have pencil/pen and paper on hand). It is your choice whether you read the questions first or watch the DVD first. If your responses are all in text format, please email them to me at olaramee@uvic.ca. Should you choose to develop materials that are not text based, let me know and we can discuss how to work with that which you have created.

As stated in the Consent Form, I may contact you at a future date for a one hour in person meeting, or email based exchange, in order to clarify my understanding of your responses.

The completed study will take the form of a text based overview and an art-based DVD. I will be pleased to share this work with each of the participants as I have a heart-felt belief that we each have so much to learn from one another.

Sincerely,

Odette Laramee

Educational Psychology and Leadership Studies

Email: olaramee@uvic.ca

Telephone: 250-388-3005

Appendix E Drama, "Not a Single Straight Line" (Phase I data analysis)

"Not a Single Straight Line"

[Setting: A meeting room at a university. Three Doctors have gathered. They are from diverse disciplines: Faith-Based Studies, Adult Education, and Science. They have been the participants in a research project.]

[All text has been quoted directly from the responses to the Phase I questionnaire that was emailed to participants in conjunction with the arts-based video/DVD entitled, "Images". The pronouns {she} and {her} have been substituted for the pronoun {you}, as the researcher is not present at this fictive meeting. The branch of science practiced by the scientist has been made generic.]

Faith

I had a series of responses to those images.

Adult Education

I guess that is the reason for the study.

Science

I've answered the questionnaire as thoroughly and completely as I can at this point in time. I don't see how the images might affect my research and/or teaching.

Adult Education

… the images most resemble some of the screen savers that I see. I expect that {she} was hoping for a more profound link of some kind, but I was not able to enter that space through these images.

Faith

My initial reaction to the video was extreme perplexity. The image proposed in this case is presented for purpose I am not sure of, except that I am supposed to respond to it. In the preface to {her} questionnaire {she} call{s} it an artistic medium. I don't know if it helps, since {her} understanding of art might not be the same as mine. It is clear that this image-text is an open one. Being non-referential, more suggestive than representative, it is extremely polysemic and, I

Faith (continued)

suppose, intentionally so. But then it is also perplexing. Here is a message
without handles of meaning. It does not help the receiver of the message. It relies
entirely on the evocative. If I had not been asked to say something
about it, I would have received it as mere esthetic object. In the end, I am left with the
obligation (from my contract with {her}, a factor extrinsic to the object under study).
[Pause] Am I supposed to view the image more than once? That also influences the
reading. In fact I have gone through it many times.

Science

I'm intrigued, curious how {she} made them.

Adult Education

They appear to be computer generated … generated from mathematic formulae? … not
sure really.

Science

I think the images were created either by an artist working creatively with various
substances/devices, or else through using fractal mathematics.

Faith

I have no idea how the images were generated. I suppose it was done through graphic
software, of which I know nothing. I would like to know if clearly representative images
were intentionally transformed to become ambiguous in meaning, or the transformation
of random designs accidentally produces recognizable images.

Science

They're beautiful, pleasant to look at.

Faith

My first reaction was of the kind one has in responding to a Rorschach test. I saw in the
first images a pregnant belly and that led to looking for similar images evoking perhaps
an x-ray image of ovaries and womb. Somewhere I saw a penis at rest. [Pause] This
immediate response probably came from the symmetrical nature of many images which is
characteristic of Rorschach.

Adult Education

The one I liked best resembled a kind of landscape something like Victoria Falls in Africa folding into the earth.

Faith

My second response to the images was an esthetic one. I did not like the beginning because it was red and raw, and liked most of the rest. The part where the centre of the images begins to move as a dancer I found particularly attractive.

Adult Education

They would work best --- as a stimulus to writing.

Faith

I could use the image as a medium to stir up basic feelings of physical pulsions etc. … because the images suggest body and include elements like circles and volumes. It would provide a kind of psychedelic experience.

Science

{The science I do} is pretty well straight-on concrete/linear/rational. The only overlap I see between the images and {the science I do} is that while {science} uses mathematics extensively, images somewhat similar to those presented can also be developed by mathematics. Would I use the images to teach the mathematical component … - No. I'd start with the mathematics concepts I wanted to teach and then show any images that might result; i.e. - I wouldn't work the other way around.

Faith

I could ask a class to react to the video and make it a case of polysemic interpretation of an image. They would not be asked to find what the image means, but to examine what meaning they fabricate out of it. As the generation of meaning involves both an object and the viewer of it, this would be a case of under determination of the object and maximum involvement of the viewer.

Adult Education

[Picks up his papers] The quote is a fair description of the images, "It literally breaks you up. It breaks up your ideas and leaves a kind of humor. Nonlocality, randomness, interdependence - these are like quantum koans. If you try to think

Adult Education (continued)

them out in a conventional way, you will fail. Sometimes I think one needs a new level of insight to be able to put your mind around them. Furthermore, our technological advancement far outstrips our ethical development, our capacity to make sound judgements about what we've unleashed".

Faith

I am not sure Zajonc's quote applies, because I don't perceive those images as related to any "idea", in the usual sense of the word. As a result they don't compete with ideas or intellectual constructs. They just are. They don't break me up at all. That is because I see a serious difference between being faced with the mysteries of nature or overwhelmed by a mystical experience, on the one hand, and being faced with an artistic human artefact one does not understand, on the other. I would not call the latter a mystery in the same sense. Not understanding a person's pronouncement or artistic production does not challenge my perception of the world, only my perception of that person or the artistic milieu from which the artwork comes.

Adult Education

I was not sure how to understand the Talib quote actually, so it is difficult to know how to relate the text to the images, "Our need 'Seems to be cross-cultural, a need to explore the trans-empirical. The life of spirit is not exclusive, it takes into account the temporal concerns'".

Faith

Frankly, I cannot see any connection between the images and the quote by Dr. G.S. Talib. I agree with the quote entirely, but I don't see the images relating to it. [Pause] I will have to think about this insight, however: why is the mystery of a person or a person's production not equivalent to the mysterious behaviour of atomic particles? It would have to do with the validity of the common distinction between art and nature …

Adult Education

Edmund O'Sullivan Extending the Boundaries of Transformative Learning. Interdisciplinary exploration of transformative learning and social action …

Science

… Uncommon Wisdom by Capra … because it opened my eyes to non-linear science, its author has good credibility to me (Capra's a physicist), and because it's pretty well the only book I've read related to {her} list of topics.

Faith

Very New Age? … I have been impressed by the use of literary criticism on the Bible. One book among many is that of Richard A. Culpepper, Anatomy of the fourth gospel: a study in literary design. It is already old but it was a seminal book. A traditional reader of the gospel of John would read it as a report of the sayings and deeds of Jesus, or as a theological treatise. Here it is read as a piece of literature. It changes the perspective. Paying attention to the human author of the gospel as the creator of a story, with particular goals etc. breaks a traditional pattern of reading it as oracle from above. It undermines the "divinity" of the gospel and relocates the features that constitute meaning.

Science

Other than that the images are abstract, I don't see and/or feel any relationship between them and this, 'Talab', quote. [Pause] I agree the images are like quantum koans, that if one tries to figure them out in conventional ways one will fail, and that a new level of insight is needed in order to put ones mind around them. I agree with the last sentence, [Reads] "Furthermore, our technological advancement far outstrips our ethical development, our capacity to make sound judgements about what we have unleashed" … but don't see how it relates to the images.

Adult Education

I feel particularly illiterate from an image perspective … not sure how to read and/or understand them in relation to other forms of knowledge or meaning making.

Faith

The old Indian woman is a code for wisdom in some circles.

Science

They serve to remind me of the great mystery of the universe (what's it all about? how does it all work?), particularly as related to the mathematics of the universe, Chaos Theory, Fractals, etc.

Faith

[Pause] Maybe it is not meant to be read as a story but intended to be suggestive of states of the body or the mind. A semiotic analysis of this image as a text to be interpreted would take us too far, but some of the questions I would have to answer are … who the sender of this message is? {She} has sent it to me, but is {she} the author of the video? Did {she} compose it with this questionnaire in mind, for the particular audience of this thesis, or was it something {she} composed independently of any particular usage? Is the video a message to me or a piece of art {she} want{s} me to use so I can send {her} a message? … The image acquires a meaning through my discourse that it did not have inherently. The meaning is the result, in part, of the context. The generation of meaning is an ongoing, nearly infinite, process.

When asked by a young woman filmmaker what he would ask a philosopher from the past, Derrida responded, "I would ask him (sic) how he loved".