Exploring the Work of Band Directors: An Institutional Ethnography

by

Sandra Melissa Edwards
B.S., Jacksonville State University, 1986
M.M., Georgia State University, 1997
Ed.S., Georgia State University, 2001

A Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in Interdisciplinary Studies

Supervisory Committee

Exploring the Work of Band Directors: An Institutional Ethnography

by

Sandra Melissa Edwards
B.S., Jacksonville State University, 1986
M.M., Georgia State University, 1997
Ed.S., Georgia State University, 2001

Supervisory Committee

Dr. Deborah Begoray, (Department of Curriculum and Instruction)
Supervisor

Dr. Dorothy E. Smith, (Department of Sociology)
Co-Supervisor or Departmental Member

Dr. Helga Hallgrimsdottir, (Department of Sociology)
Departmental Member

Dr. Roberta Lamb, (Queen's University)
Additional Member

Abstract

Supervisory Committee
Dr. Deborah Begoray (Department of Curriculum and Instruction)
Supervisor
Dr. Dorothy E. Smith (Department of Sociology)
Co-Supervisor or Departmental Member
Dr. Helga Hallgrimsdottir, (Department of Sociology)
Additional Member
Dr. Roberta Lamb, (Queen's University)

The purpose of this study was to examine the work band directors do in the course of their jobs. Specifically, I sought to understand more about the disjuncture between the balanced music education band directors want to deliver to their students and the need to prepare and present performances that bring positive notoriety to a band program. Using Institutional Ethnography (IE), I interviewed, observed, and explored the texts that directors create and/or refer to as they lead their band programs. Institutional Ethnography is a method of inquiry that allows a researcher to probe those immersed in situations that he or she finds problematic. The term problematic refers to something about which a researcher is interested in learning more.

It was found that the three band directors included in this study are granted much freedom when it comes to creating or referring to a music curriculum. The directors appreciate this freedom and have each chosen various forms of curricula, which range from an official curriculum document that is used specifically for music theory instruction across Canada to a poster designed by university music instructors. With regard to performances and the pressure to prepare them, each director had a different way in which they organized their instruction to teach both performance skills and music

literacy. One director relies heavily on a theory curriculum to supplement his work on performances while another works through various method books that include non-performance-based music instruction.

Through this study I was able to show the gap that occurs between a well-rounded music education and a primary focus on performance in a band program. The band directors I interviewed revealed a deep desire and belief that they were delivering a comprehensive music education to their band students. In the course of my research, the pressure to create outstanding performances could be seen in the band directors' talk and instructional organization. It is hoped that the results of this study will aid university instructors and curriculum writers in developing successful ways to deliver music instruction in a band program while remaining cognizant of performance.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments

I gratefully acknowledge the assistance and support given by the following people:

Dr. Dorothy E. Smith ~ My guiding scholar and advocate, whose patient guidance and honest feedback have kept me on course as I have navigated this research process. I am forever indebted to her for encouraging me and pushing me to grow and improve in my research endeavours.

My Committee ~ Through many trials and tribulations, my committee worked diligently to guide me in preparing this study. I appreciate the attention and work done by each member as they engaged with my work and helped me develop a sound document of which I am proud.

Rachel Franklin ~ My life partner who has endured this process and remained by my side. I am grateful for her patience and willingness to see this through with me.

My Mother, Sandra Edwards ~ who gave me consistent encouragement throughout this process. She is my biggest fan and for that I am eternally grateful.

My family and friends ~ whose support, encouragement when I was sure I could not continue, and ability to see the lighterside of this struggle has been irreplaceable. Their unconditional love for me, even during my times of overwork and over-analysis will forever be in my heart.

My Children, Grace and Lily ~ who have grown up only knowing their Mimmie as a grad student who is working hard on her doctorate. I am grateful for their patience with my work obligations as well as their constant ability to help me keep a proper perspective on what is important.

Dedication

I dedicate this thesis to my students in the Henry County, Marietta City, and Cobb County School Systems. I learned more than they could ever know through my work with them. Through my work with those students, I was inspired to further understand why I did what I did as an instructor and how I can help other music educators to know what I now know before they begin their careers.

Chapter One - Introduction

This dissertation explores the contradiction that emerges between band instructors' commitment to instrumental music instruction as a contribution to musical education in general and how the institutional pressures to put on band performances come to dominate planning and practice. The result is that more general aspects of music education, such as music theory and composition get displaced. Specifically, this dissertation shows the chasm between general music education rationales and teaching practices.

Although the literature offers much in the way of changing the philosophical basis of instrumental music education to be more inclusive and eclectic, in actual practice band directors teaching in the public school system are under pressure to focus on public performance to the exclusion of other forms of music education. This dissertation therefore offers an empirical account of how these performance pressures infiltrate the work of the band director. This may not reflect band directors' attitudes toward music education. Rather, as this dissertation makes evident, the predicament in which band directors may find themselves is one of being caught between educational theories in support of music education and the realities of concert performances. Pseudonyms are used in place of the names of respondents, schools, and the school system in which this study was conducted.

Methodology

The method of inquiry employed for this study was institutional ethnography or I.E. Institutional ethnography is a method of inquiry that enables the researcher to peer into the social relations within and between institutions that are invisible inside the

everyday/everynight lived experiences of individuals whose activities are organized by them. Respondents or informants in an institutional ethnography offer the researcher an entry-point into the institutionalized world in which those respondents work and live (Smith, 1989).The respondent is the authority and teaches the interviewer about the subject being explored (Smith, 2005).

Institutional ethnography was developed by Dorothy Smith (1987) in response to her experiences as a woman in academia in the 1950s. Smith was a doctoral student, wife, and mother at the University of California-Berkley. During her time as a doctoral student, and indeed as a university scholar after completion of her doctorate, Smith had to negotiate the various roles she occupied in her life. As a wife and later a single mother, Smith's embodied existence involved activities such as providing a stable home for her family, supporting the educational work of her sons, and nurturing the relationships in her life. She found, however, that academic literature and her work as an academic made invisible both her lived experiences and the lives of those included in sociological literature. In response to this lack of representation of the actual everyday/everynight lived experiences of people in sociological research and literature, Smith sought to explore the institutional relations—such as the academic institutional relations—that make such experiences invisible.

With the text *The Everyday World as Problematic: A Feminist Sociology* (1987), Smith began articulating this new way of doing sociological research. Using the struggles of the women's movement against masculine oppression, Smith defined what she saw as embodied knowing versus ruling relations. Embodied knowing is the knowledge that comes from the expert, the person living the experience. The ruling

relations are the “extraordinary yet ordinary complex of relations that are textually mediated, that connect us across space and time and organize our everyday lives (Smith, 2005, p. 10)”. It is for this reason that this method of inquiry is ideal for this study. Institutionalized education is a government organization that is ordered around written texts such as curricula, evaluation and assessment processes, and administrative records.

As Smith (2005) explains, “Texts are key to institutional coordinating, regulating the concerting of people’s work in institutional settings in the ways they impose accountability to the terms they establish (p. 118).” Texts occupy a space across localities: other schools, districts, provinces, private homes, and social agencies, to name a few. Griffith and Andre-Bechely (2008) explain, “As we engage with texts, we coordinate the local and the translocal, managing and smoothing over the disjunctures between our experience and the relations of power and knowledge that shape and are shaped by education policies (p. 46).”

Virtually every aspect of an institution such as a school or school district is organized around text. Teachers are expected to use the ministry curriculum to guide their instruction. This guide is uniform for that subject and grade level, regardless of school and teaching situation. Teachers are held accountable for their work with students through analysis of student scores on standardized tests, which are administered across the province. Teachers may write Individualized Education Plans (IEPs) for students who have special needs regarding their education. A copy of a student’s IEP goes to his or her teacher, the school administrator, and the parents (Yvette, 2008). Administrators in the district where this study was conducted perform assessments of teacher performance. After a teacher is observed, the principal completes a form that serves as an

official record of the assessment. Copies of that form are retained by the school, given to the teacher and can be forwarded to other parties should a performance issue arise. Further, the teacher may use the form as part of an application for another teaching job. The above examples are only a few of the many ways text is taken up by educators, parents, and administrators.

Institutional ethnography is a qualitative form of research. Qualitative research is by nature open and malleable. That is, researchers have great latitude in designing and conducting qualitative research. Purists believe that one should adhere to a single set of guidelines and philosophical view when designing and conducting qualitative research (Johnson et al, 2001). As Ayres (2007) describes this paradigm, “grounded theory studies” have “to adhere to the tenets of symbolic interaction” (p. 612) and the like. Pluralist qualitative researchers believe that well-rounded and thoroughly investigated research requires mixed methods of analysis and data collection.

Qualitative research method is influenced by a number of theories and methods from varied fields of study (Roulston, 2006). These include works by respected “anthropologists such as Margaret Mead, Edward Evans-Pritchard, Gregory Bateson, and Bronislaw Malinowsky (p. 155)”. Qualitative sociologists such as those from the Chicago School in the 1920’s and 1930’s have also influenced qualitative methods of research through their emphases on ethnographic investigation in urban settings.

One scholar suggests the purposes of qualitative studies typically fall into four categories: prediction, understanding, emancipation, and deconstruction (Roulston, 2006, p.160). Prediction research tends to focus on predicting outcomes, which could entail exploring participants’ responses to the application of certain teaching practices in music

classes. Using research designed for understanding, investigators seek to describe accounts of participants' perspectives using a variety of theoretical perspectives. Emancipatory research, or research for change, has been adopted by feminist researchers and theorists (Lamb et al, 2002). It involves an in depth and critical study of texts in an attempt to "lay bare their hidden allegiances and affiliations" (Kendall & Wickham, 1999, p.23).

This study can be classified into the categories of emancipatory and deconstructive. The purpose of this study is to explore the gap between the teaching model of comprehensive music education and performance demands faced by band directors, in the hope that understanding how this gap appears as an aspect of the work organization of band directors may be useful in pre-service music teacher training. Thus, this research is emancipatory. Further, as in a deconstructive study, texts are critically analysed for their connection to institutional process and its relation to those who are at work in institutional settings organized in that process and participating in its organization.

Ethnographers explore the topic for study through the perceptions of people within the context of their lives (Ryan, Coughlan, & Cronin, 2007). Ethnographic researchers learn about the ins and outs of people's lives and perspectives of their lives through in depth data collection. The researcher immerses himself or herself—often for extended periods of time —into the cultural and social context within which participants live and work (Dey, 2002). Culture can be defined as "webs of significance" (Eisenhart, 2001, p. 209),

Institutional ethnography is ethnographic in nature in that the methods of data collection are similar: interviews and observations. However, I.E. differs from ethnography with regard to the focus of study and how participant voices and perspectives are represented. Institutional ethnography seeks to explore institutional relations and how they remove agency from those who are taken up into the bureaucracies of the institutional regimes.

Conceptual Framework

Institutional ethnographers approach research as critical observers interested in how people's everyday lives are organized socially by institutions. This research approach is situated within a conceptual knowledge framework that takes the everyday of people's work as its starting point and then raises questions that the research seeks to answer: how institutional relations enter into and organize what people do and what happens. Taking up people's experience as a starting place does not limit the research into that experience. The institutional relations on which it focuses generalize beyond particular individuals; educational institutions, the focus of this study, are organized in each school, across localities within a school system, or between a university and a school system. According to Smith (1990), “the objectified forms, the rational procedures, and the abstracted conceptual organization create an appearance of neutrality and impersonality that conceals class, gender, and racial subtexts” (p. 65). In this study, I investigate the institutionalized relations that operate socially at the local school level and extra-locally and that create difficult situations for disadvantaged students and families.

Dorothy Smith began investigating what later became called 'institutional ethnography' more than 30 years ago as she explored her location as both an academic and single mother. She sought to narrow the chasm between the lived, bodily, emotional experiences of women and the “alienative intellectual practices of sociology” (Smith, 1987, p. 86). Central to understanding and traversing the line between academia and her embodied experience as a mother, Smith identified institutional (or ruling) relations as the central and powerful facet of organizations such as academic institutions and schools.

Marxist in her intellectual orientation, Smith seeks to understand the everyday/everynight lived actualities of one’s existence; about his or her work. What she learned through her exploration of people’s work was how ruling relations—“text-mediated and text-based systems of ‘communication’, ‘knowledge’, ‘information’, ‘regulation’, ‘control’ and the like” (Smith, 1989, p. 77) come to influence people’s work. These systems operate and communicate between institutions, providing information translocally and reducing an individual from a full, living and engaged person to an objectified, abstracted impression of a person.

Competition has long been considered a motivation for both band directors and students to work diligently, with the end-result being greater performance skills and musical knowledge. “Over the years, however, students’ educational needs have frequently taken a back seat to the pursuit of competitive treasures (money, awards, or notoriety), the standardization of performance practices, and the enhancement of music industry revenues” (Austin, 1990, p. 21). During the last two decades secondary music festivals have adopted non-competitive formats in hopes of enhancing the educational benefits of performance by relieving the stress of competing with other performing

groups for an award or prize. With this non-competitive structure of festivals, bands are awarded ratings such as Superior, Excellent, Good, Fair, or Poor—and yet competition remains. Festivals have also developed a sliding scale type of adjudication form in an attempt to make the rating process fair to all bands. Using this scale, bands that are undergoing restructuring or are in a developing stage are fairly judged alongside bands with long established, high quality performance histories (Edwards, 2004). Adjudicators refer to the scale when assigning marks for various headings in the form.

What continues to be challenging is that adjudicators are not required to use the sliding scale guidelines and hence may continue to judge based on their prior experience before the advent of sliding scales. In other words, non-competitive festivals may not be able to fairly adjudicate bands because adjudicators may not be relying on the guidance provided by the sliding scale adjudication form (Edwards, 2004).

Pressure on band directors to achieve the honour associated with earning a Superior rating or invitation to a more prestigious festival is still prevalent. Considering this, I argue that non-competitive festivals continue to operate within a competitive paradigm. Band directors compare their ratings and strive to have the best rating possible. Hence band directors continue to feel pressure to produce outstanding performances, which negatively affects their pedagogical work and the learning of their students.

Institutional Ethnography also draws attention to how ruling relations—in this case, the music association or body holding the festival, school systems and schools that are represented in the festivals, universities that train band directors, and school systems that employ band directors—have worked in ways that place undue emphasis on

performance in band classes. Thus, their methodologies exclude the diverse approaches to music instruction that are important to all music students, including band students.

The Problematic

In institutional ethnography, the problematic offers the researcher a way to learn and write about an area of interest. “It operates to position and stabilize how one is to think about the research, grounded in the actual activities of everyday people” (Rankin, 2004, p. 11).

The problematic for this study was the contradiction that emerges between band instructors’ commitment to instrumental music instruction as a contribution to musical education in general and how the institutional pressures to put on band performances come to dominate planning and practice. My interest in this problematic developed over a span of years while I was a middle school band director in Metropolitan Atlanta, Georgia. Over the last two years of my k-12 teaching career, I experienced a philosophical change in my approach to music education. Before these two years, I approached music education in very much the same way I was trained and educated as a musician: within the conservatory model. While my undergraduate institution admitted students based on the typical standardized test scores used by other universities, students were expected to meet very, very high standards of individual musicianship. This training instilled in me very high expectations of myself, which were passed on to my students when I started teaching. My instruction focused heavily on increasing the skill-oriented musicianship of my students and very little on the contextual and conceptual elements of music. As a result, I had little patience for my own students who did not meet these same rigourous expectations.

As I matured professionally, I became very uncomfortable with my philosophy and resulting approach to music education. I felt I had been too hard on my students and that I was not dealing with each student with compassion and understanding. I wanted to work with students and their families in such a way as to help them achieve goals in music rather than push them to meet my expectations. I wanted to create a more welcoming environment for all students, regardless of their skill level and/or ability to meet my expectations. I found that each student wanted to contribute in their way and when I offered assistance and understanding to students who were struggling, the result was an enriched experience for all involved. More students stayed in the program, the relations between the school and family were strengthened, and my experience as an educator was improved because I was working with students rather than music.

To clarify my thinking on this issue, I talked with colleagues, both in Georgia and in the Canadian community where I now live. I talked with my supervisor, over a period of years, to try to understand these issues and identify those that could be attended to through research. From those conversations, I was able to arrive at a clear notion of why I was going to conduct the study described in this dissertation. I sought to understand, from a place outside of the pressures of being a band director, the work band directors do and how performance may permeate each decision and/or action they take. This study aims at exploring and explicating the institutional pressures faced by band directors to produce high quality performances and how those pressures show up in their work and make it hard to give time and emphasis to other aspects of musical education. This dissertation explores the predicament in which band directors are caught between

educational theories in support of music education and the realities of the pressures of concert performances.

The Research

The participants.

The group selected for this study consisted of three middle school band directors, Lorraine, Juan and Steve***, from the Hazel Grove School District***. To adequately explore the phenomena that occur within the context of people's everyday/every night experiences. I needed to gather rich data through a variety of channels. My interest as an institutional ethnographer was not in representing a sample of a population of band directors, but in exploring through those who became my respondents something of the range of work situations and institutional pressures that shows up in how they go about organizing their work. In securing the participation of these three, I had wanted to make sure that I had access through them to a range of school populations. To explicate the institutional relations respondents have in common, it is useful to work with a respondents representing a range of situations. Hence, teachers were selected from a school that serves a student population that differed from the others demographically and socioeconomically. Two of the three schools were French Immersion schools.

Lorraine is the band director at Mount Genoa Middle School*** (M.G.M.S.). She has been teaching for approximately five years, all of which have been at Mount Genoa. During her tenure at M.G.M.S., the band program has grown in both reputation and size. She expects from her students quality participation in rehearsals, punctuality to rehearsals, and intense focus. When those expectations are not met, Lorraine is quick to call the class or student to task in an attempt to re-direct their energy and or focus into a

more productive stream. Currently Lorraine oversees several different musical offerings at M.G.M.S. including jazz band, concert band, and general music.

Juan is the band director at Holyoake Middle School*** (H.M.S.). Of the three, he has the most experience teaching instrumental music—approximately 20 years. He is highly respected as a band director and musician. Before coming to H.M.S., Juan implemented a magnet program in jazz studies at an area high school. His standards are high but he displays an attitude that reflects wisdom gained through years of teaching. When problems occur with students or parents, whether at the personal or musical level, Juan approaches the situation calmly, with the assurance that all will work out well. At H.M.S., Juan teaches courses in general music, jazz band, and concert band.

Steve teaches band at Apple Hollow Middle School*** (A.H.M.S.). Similarly to Lorraine, he has been teaching approximately five years. According to Steve, the band program has grown in quality since he took over the program. He inserts a very methodical and thoughtful process into his teaching. He is meticulous in the work he carries out in band rehearsals. Further, he follows a clearly delineated theory curriculum and uses it regularly in his band classes. Music offerings conducted by Steve include jazz band and concert band.

The settings.

Each middle school is situated in a neighbourhood that serves a different student population from the others. Apple Hollow Middle School is a French Immersion school located in a catchment area with heads-of-households who have primarily professional occupations (Stats Canada, 2006). Holyoake Middle School is located in a lower- to middle-class neighbourhood with primarily sales and service working heads-of-

households (Stats Canada, 2006). Mount Genoa Middle School serves perhaps the most diverse student population. The school is draws from neighbourhoods that contain both high income, professional heads-of-household and low to middle income, sales and service working heads-of-households (Stats Canada, 2006).

One respondent I worked with was a colleague, Steve, whom I had contacted both to ask him to participate and to assist me with contacting others. Apart from ensuring that different demographic and economic school catchments were represented, participants were selected based on their willingness to participate. My relationship with Steve gained me access to the other two. Specific procedures were as follows. Initial contact was made via email to Steve. My first inquiry was whether or not he would be willing to participate in my study. I also asked for contact information and assistance in the form of an introductory email to two of his colleagues, Lorraine and Juan. Steve sent an email to Lorraine and Juan introducing me, described my credentials, and explained that I wanted to conduct a research study that involved middle school band programs. After that, I contacted Lorraine and Juan personally to ask them to participate in my study.

Data Collection

Ethnographers employ a number of data gathering processes, including interviews, observations, collecting relevant texts (Denzin & Lincoln, 2008: 4) that coordinate and enable institutional regimes and relations. To ensure reliability of interpretation and increase rigour, I gathered data from a number of avenues. Through triangulation, a researcher gathers data through a number of avenues across different times and places (Seale, 1999). This study was conducted using several different

methods of data collection, which included interviews, observation, artifact collection and textual materials coming into play in respondents' work. Similarly to ethnographic case studies, interviewing and observation are also used to create institutional ethnographies. Interviews are loosely structured to allow for a dialogue in which the researcher is learning from respondents as they create broad and personal descriptions of subjects discussed. In addition, unstructured or semi-structured interviews provided an avenue through which I could ensure the subjects' voices were heard through the data rather than simply as answers to a series of questions. According to Smith (2005), adhering strictly to an interview script limits the institutional ethnographer to what she or he has already anticipated and hence forestalls the process of discovery. Information may become apparent during an interview which could be pursued by the interviewer who is not rigidly adhering to a script.

The interview narrative changes as it is conducted. The topics shift, expand, and become more focused (Griffith & Smith, 2005). Through interviews, the researcher discovers how the subjects included in the study are taken up into the institutional practices of ruling (Grahame, 1998), through the linking of other people's experiences, texts, and constant focus on the coordination of people in their everyday lives. Smith (1987) describes the practice of ruling as "the ongoing representation of the local actualities of our worlds in the standardized general forms of knowledge that enter them into relations of ruling" (p. 3). For purposes of this study, interview questions focused on how the band directors go about their daily work as instructors. The script used to loosely guide my interviews can be found in Appendix A. Participants were interviewed for one hour initially, with additional contact as required. I met with Steve and Juan for

an additional interview to clarify interview answers and pursue some subjects further. I also wanted to ask Juan some questions that arose during my observation of his class.

Interviews.

Interviewing was my first mode of data collection for this study. I met with each band director at their workplace during a time in which they had no teaching responsibilities. The purpose of scheduling the interview during the participants' work day was to make the interviewing process as easy as possible with regard to scheduling for the interviewees and to make it easier to access materials that could be pertinent to this study. Further, interviewing the participants at their places of work enabled me to record field notes that captured each participant's demeanour in the arena in which they work. While the term *work* is an "empirically empty term" (McCoy, 2006, p. 110) in that work encompasses more than the time we spend at a workplace earning a pay cheque, the work I refer to in this study is comprised of work done for institutionalized education by instructors.

Each band director was interviewed once during the Spring Term of the 2006-2007 school year. Steve was contacted for follow-up meetings so I could further explore some material brought up in the initial interview as well as to gain access to artifacts to be analysed in the course of this study. Field notes were recorded immediately after the interviews in order to more fully represent the participants' behaviours during the interview process. Non-verbal information can provide a wealth of information that can enhance the verbal information gleaned through interviews (Ortiz, 2003).

Observation.

For this study, three band directors were observed on two occasions during their spring term. Through observation, one can learn how the band directors go about their daily work—without such knowledge being hindered by interpretation (either by myself or the participant) through description in the interview process. While institutional ethnography does not require a linear progression through the data collection process, typically the collection of observation data occurs after the interview process (McCoy, 2006). Observations in institutional ethnography are not treated as sources of data about the object being observed, but as a point of entry into the working of the institution of interest (Hammersley & Atkinson, 1983).

Texts/Documents.

The texts included in this study are those used in the course of work by the participants. I learned about them from participants in the course of interviews and observations. Specifically, the B.C. Music Curriculum for K-7 (1998) and 8-10 (1995) are taken up as official regulators of courses taught by participants. As already discussed, texts/documents used by band directors in the course of their work such as curriculum guides, student/parent handbooks, forms for various purposes, and applications for student funding from various agencies—play an integral role in coordinating classroom work among teachers and students and also with the institutional regime in which classroom work is embedded. While texts like curriculum documents designed for a specific course are re-written and adapted, there is also a governing curriculum document, the official document of a ministry of education, which in principle regulates and does not change. The latter is the same for all band directors

under the jurisdiction of this provincial government even though, of course, each may read and take it up differently. Considering the reader-text conversation that can occur over multiple locations and at indeterminate times in history, texts carry on the institutional work that is required to coordinate people's activities at the local level (Smith, 1987).

The B.C. Ministry of Education Fine Arts – K-7 (1998) and Music – 8-10 (1995) curriculum documents are integral to this study, as middle schools within a province use the same curriculum guide. An institutional ethnographer can discover how texts may be used to "transform the local particularities of people's experience into perspectiveless representations in which people disappear as subjects and agents"--Smith's notion of the extra-local qualities of a text (Smith, 2005, p.123).

Other sources.

In addition to research procedures specific to this study, I also drew on an earlier institutional ethnography I had developed out of a graduate course I had taken with Dorothy Smith in 2007. In that course I had explored the regional annual festival of bands at which band performances are, as I describe later, evaluated. In this research I had opportunities of interviewing one of those responsible for evaluating band performances, as well as some of the band directors and the students involved. I have also drawn on my own knowledge of and experience as a band director and as a pedagogue though, as I discuss below, this has had its problems as well as advantages.

Data Analysis

I began my data analysis (Auerbach & Silverstein, 2003) by reading through the interview transcripts. Since my study was not focussing in my respondents as

individuals, I did not use regular coding procedures organized around individuals as cases. I was interested in what I could discover about the institutional relations and contexts and how it entered into the organization of their work. But initial coding attempts were difficult due to the institutional nature of the discourse. With my previous occupation as a band director, I was taking for granted my understanding of the discourse and hence operating within the discourse.

I was experiencing institutional capture (Smith, 2006), which can best be described as where the researcher converts the participants' descriptions of their work experiences into the discourse of the institution being explored. This severely inhibits analyses of data as the researcher is unable to identify participants' voices and the stories of the actual lived experiences of those caught up in the institutional language. In my case, I was not able to identify my place as a pedagogue. Until I was able to step back, understand my social location as a fellow band director, and look at the data without using institutionalized discourse, I was unable to effectively analyse the transcript data. The work of analysing data and staying outside of the institutional discourse, so I could objectively explore the material, required an ongoing effort as I am well trained as an educator and have many years of experience as a teacher. In the end, I needed to step back from the data for a period of time then return to it at a later date. When I returned to the data, I attended to the themes in the data, being careful not to read into the data my notions of what should be there.

When I was ready to re-approach the data and begin analysing it in a manner that would be productive, I used the software application NVivo7, which is a qualitative data analysis software application. It is important to note the software applications such as

NVivo do not code and analyse the data for the researcher. Rather, these applications are vehicles through which researchers can save and manage large amounts of information, which are readily accessible for further analysis. The researcher must still analyse the data for pertinent categories and organize that data in a coherent manner that can later be analysed for information (Basit, 2003).

I worked with the transcripts and located recurrent themes (Auerbach & Silverstein, 2003) that I then assigned to various categories such as parent support or financial need, which were then organized under broader headings such as instruction. This is an effective way to begin organizing raw data into manageable chunks of data that start to come together to describe the topic being studied. Indeed, Ely et al (1991) claim that creating categories from raw data enables the researcher to establish very close relationship with the data, which is helpful for future processes such as theory building.

Initially, I chose themes based on my interest in the study and on my experience as a band director and the areas on which band directors focus when managing a band program. I returned to the data several times, further refining the data into topics that could guide my writing and effectively reveal information learned through the interviews, textual analysis, and observations. This last act of refining entailed reading through the data several times, stepping back and letting the topics rise out of the data (Auerbach & Silverstein, 2003). For this, I had to let go of my preconceived notions of what I wanted or thought I would find. To do this exercise, I used the Microsoft Word application software and created documents within folders with similar statements. This

final exercise was very helpful in that the data naturally fell into discreet categories, allowing me to see the delineations in a more objective manner.

Researcher's Stance

My social location as a past band director and researcher in this study plays a part both in the development of this study and the interpretation of gathered data. My experiences as band director have influenced my decision to conduct this research. Considering my previously shared story as a band director, I conducted this research in a reflexive manner. Reflexive research can best be described as the researcher constantly "taking stock of their actions and their role in the research process" and "subjecting these to the same critical scrutiny as the rest of their 'data'" (Mason, 2002, p. 7). Thus, in qualitative research reflexivity is another way of ensuring rigour (Rice & Ezzy, 1999).

Conclusion

In this chapter, I have introduced the basic tenets of my study. Instrumental music education in the form of band has been and continues to be analysed and critiqued for perceived over-emphasis on performance. Literature is easily found that either addresses this issue philosophically and theoretically. It is nothing new to say band directors over-focus on preparing performances rather than focus on providing an overall music education to their students.

I seek to explore how band directors work with their programs, planning and carry out instruction, selecting instructional materials, and administering their programs, as educators within the structure of institutionalized education. Specifically, I seek to learn more about how band directors negotiate the chasm between effective music education and over-emphasis on performance. By conducting an institutional

ethnography, I am better able to see how the work of the band director is taken up and organized by institutionalized education as well as other governing associations.

Institutional ethnography allows the researcher explore the institutional relations that influence the actions of individuals. Band directors may have a strong desire to provide students with a well-rounded music education free from the pressures of performance on a continuing basis, but they do not control the institutional pressures that are integral to the organization of their work. Institutionalized education seems to grant teachers the opportunity to organize their instruction as they see fit, so long as they meet the mandated prescribed learning outcomes. However, band directors also have to consider expectations of their peers, associations of which they are members, and local and national festival regulations. The translocal nature of governing that takes place in the field of school bands lends itself to institutional ethnography.

By exploring the actual daily/nightly work done by band directors in the following chapters, I have been able to investigate the continuing emphasis on performance experienced in school band programs, through the lens of institutionalized education rather than looking solely at the work of the director. Further, I was able to see through the learned dialectic around music education and into the actual practices of band directors, from planning curriculum, selecting instructional materials, and carrying out instruction.

Chapter Two presents a review of the literature describing various aspects of the band director's work. Among the themes found in this review are pressures on middle school band directors to produce outstanding performances and to provide high school directors with exceptional musicians. This chapter also discusses the history of the

school band movement as well as the influence of the western European art music tradition on school bands. Chapter Three sets the context by discussing my experience as a band director. Further, I describe the problematic of the study, which is the starting point, or point of entry into an institutional ethnography. Chapter Four examines how texts enter into the organization of band directors' classroom work, starting with the ministry of education's official curriculum and examining how the band directors I talked to work with curricula texts when designing and carrying out instruction. Chapter Five investigates the classroom organization developed by band directors in their work with students. Specifically, I explore the variety of ways in which these directors approach instruction. Chapter Six explicates the institutional relations the insert pressures to perform that limit the ability of these band directors to provide a well-rounded music education experience to band students. Specific attention is paid to the annual festival experience in which band performances are evaluated.

Chapter Two - Review of the Literature

Literature in the field of music education has always provided a great deal of insight into pedagogy and the role of the music educator. More recent contributions (Campbell, 2002; Reimer, 2002; Volk, 2004) have focused on the sociological aspects of music instruction, addressing the notions of world music and how to effectively incorporate music from other cultures into classroom experiences. Working with diverse student populations has also started to occupy a place in music education literature. The literature most relevant to this study is that concerning the importance of performance in school band programs in North America and how that may affect instruction, the history of the school band movement and how school band programs evolved to what they are today.

Band directors work with great numbers of students each day. The students come from a variety of backgrounds, home situations, and academic settings (Abramo, 2009). Further, directors must deal with the pressures of maintaining a high quality and large band program. Haack and Smith (2000) suggest that the band director's job is perhaps the most difficult position in K-12 education because of these pressures to perform well. They explain, "one's work is open to general evaluation at PTA meetings, concerts,…and community events—assessment circumstances far broader than a visit from the assistant principal every other month" (p. 24). Reimer (1989) adds, "The concert-after-concert steamroller buries us under the pressure to produce rather than teach" (p. 183).

In a study of job satisfaction and burnout amongst band directors, Heston et al (1996) found that the "the three variables reported as most stressful were negative

student attitudes, inappropriate student behaviours, and teaching load" (pp. 324-325). Additional pressures are placed on middle school band directors by high school band directors whose programs are fed by their middle school. High school directors –who face the same pressures of presenting performances and the inherent competition amongst instrumental music teachers— (Abramo, 2009) want high numbers of highly qualified and motivated students from their middle school feeder programs. Focusing on the need to provide high quality musicians to programs in which they feed, not all middle school directors see themselves as a band salesman as much as a gatekeeper. Berz (2007) reported a comment made to him by a middle school band director who said her goal was "to be a weeder not a feeder" (p. 16). In other words, this director views her role as one of gatekeeper who keeps out students who do not measure up. Berz (2007) made the comment, "Certainly, performance classes are not intended for everyone. Determining who should and who should not participate [in band] however is no easy task" (p. 16). Typically, the director considers the contributions the student makes to the overall goal of preparing quality performances. Such contributions may include having materials every day, practicing outside of school hours, and having an instrument that always is in good working order. Stoll's (2008) doctoral dissertation, *The Relationship of High School Band Directors' Assessment Practices to Ratings at a Large Group Adjudicated Event,* explores the presence of the high degree of variability and "individualistic values" (p. 7)

There has been much research on the social, emotional, and intellectual benefits of participation in music (see Adderly, Kennedy, & Berz, 2003; Gouzouasis et al, 2007). Students, who struggle in school with academic or social problems, including difficulties

that originate outside of school, are in need of the camaraderie that can come from being a part of a group, over a number of years, and achieving success in some area of their lives.

Western European Art Music as Tradition of Music Education

An understanding of the influence of the Western European Art Music aesthetic and the evolution of the school band is critical if we are to adequately explore the work of the band director as music program administrator and instructor. The following paragraphs discuss the early influence of the Western European musical tradition on North American music and the historical progression of school bands, from their inception to today.

The North American school band movement has been significantly influenced by the Western European Art Music tradition. Adherents to this tradition, which boasts the music of such composers as Bach, Beethoven, and others, believe in the *superiority* of this aesthetic form (Becker, 1986).

Many argue that the exclusivity of the Western European tradition in schools bands is a “form of aesthetic imperialism” (Lomax, 1977, 128). Indeed, the values associated with this tradition can also be likened to a form of aesthetic imperialism in that the band director’s values and aesthetic tastes are imposed on students, with little regard for the students’ values or tastes. Within the Western European music culture is a hierarchy of musical styles (Gonzo, 1993) that involve the ability to play written music in such a manner as to display expressive finesse and musical literacy. By examining the school band culture, one can easily see the inherent value placed on reading music.

Performances are typically scheduled early in the year requiring students to read literature in preparation for those performances.

The Evolution of the Wind Band in North America

The wind band movement is several centuries old. The following section presents a brief summary of the history of the wind band in the United States and Canada.

Beginning in 1633, when a group of drummers were paid to perform in Colonial Virginia, the advent of the professional band musician began (Hansen, 2005). Before this time, wind players and drummers often accompanied ceremonial events and the like. During the mid-17th century, the military band started to gain popularity. These bands played musical accompaniment to military personnel as they carried out drills or marched off to battle. Continuing through the history of the band, these groups were strictly utilitarian in nature, performing for ceremonies, cheering on militia and/or townsfolk, as well as providing entertainment at various other times. Performances are inherently utilitarian as they provide entertainment, patriotic rousing, and reflective contemplation—as in memorial ceremonies.

Upon the death of George Washington, the new President John Adams founded what is perhaps the finest and most well-known military band, “The President’s Own” United States Marine Band. Performances by this band are nearly flawless and set the standard to which many band directors strive when working with school bands. This link of the wind band to the military would set the manner in which wind bands were taught and conducted into modernity. In the school wind band, the director is the commander who sets the tone for rehearsals and makes decisions ranging from what repertoire will be performed to how, where, and when performances will take place. The number of

bands increased as immigrants from Europe began to come together to play Western European Art Music. Further, North American wind bands were heavily influenced by the British brass bands. With new interest in classical music from Europe came the presentation of concerts for public consumption.

In the early 19th century, purely Canadian bands began to appear (Kallmann, 1969). Similarly to the United States, these bands were used for mostly patriotic purposes and grew out of the British Regimental band tradition. Indeed, without the influence of the British Regimental bands, "the formation of orchestral societies in nineteenth-century Canada would have been delayed by decades or, in many towns, altogether" (p. 46). One of the earliest band leaders in Canada was Jean Chrysostome Brauneis, who came to Canada from his homeland of Germany. He was active for many years in the 70th Regiment Band. After this, he devoted himself to teaching and opened a musical instrument shop in Quebec. After a number of years in Quebec, Brauneis was chosen to head a band that would eventually be named *Musique Canadienne* and would be under the leadership of Charles Sauvageau after Braneis' death. Another German musician/educator in Quebec City by the name of Theodore Fredrick Molt returned to Europe to study music and "return to Canada to take up again teaching of the liberal art for which the natives show so much taste" (Kallmann, 1952). During his journey to Europe, he met Beethoven, who composed a piece of music for him.

Canadian community bands grew to become highly popular and larger than the British regimental bands that were the precursors (Kallmann, 1955). "The first local band in Upper Canada to achieve fame belonged not to a city, but to a little village south of Lake Simcoe" (p. 15). This band was organized by a religious group called *Children of*

Peace. In Halifax and Quebec, the Western European concert format was highly popular. Symphonies written by contemporary composers were performed at formal concerts rather than the more traditional military marches at community events. Further, compositions written specifically for bands began to surface at concerts.

The British brass band genre was highly popular in British Columbia as many of B.C.'s citizens were British settlers, workers, and colonists (McIntosh, 1989). While the larger cities featured orchestras and other ensembles, the brass band was often the only source of musical expression in most of the smaller communities. Along with the evolution of the British brass band into a highly popular form of musical expression in B.C. were the First Nations brass bands. One of the earliest First Nations brass bands was formed by the Shishalh peoples. Unfortunately, the history of the brass band movement coincides with the imposition of British culture on the First Nations people by British settlers and the Catholic Church (Mattison, 1981). Other brass bands soon followed suit. Many of the residential schools, from whose treatment the First Nations continue to struggle to recover, featured brass bands.

With the influx of settlers from different cultures came changes in brass band instrumentation, often featuring the introduction of woodwinds. This led brass bands to evolve into concert bands, ensembles made up of brass, woodwind, and percussion instruments. William Haynes was British Columbia's first bandmaster (McIntosh, 1989). He arrived from England in 1859 as leader of the "band of the Royal Engineers" (p. 19). The Royal Engineers were part of a contingent that had been sent to B.C. to survey and carry out construction work in the new colony. His band provided entertainment on the long ship journey from England to British Columbia. The Royal Engineers were based in

New Westminster, B.C. as it was originally thought New Westminster would be the capital of the new colony. “Almost the entire musical life of early New Westminster revolved around Haynes and the members of his band” (p. 20). When the Royal Engineers were recalled to Britain, Haynes remained in British Columbia. He moved to Victoria and became an important part of the musical life there. In Victoria, he was bandmaster of the Volunteer Band, which would eventually become the 5th Regiment Band. He also composed and arranged scores for band, including the “Grand Victoria March”, which he composed to honour the visit of the Marquis of Lorne and Princess Louise to Victoria.

In Canada, military band members were so disenchanted with their lives in the military that they withdrew from the militia. These band members formed important community bands such as the one sponsored by the Elks Club in Kamloops, British Columbia. This band was led by Archibald McMurdo, who would later be credited with introducing instrumental music into the school system in Kamloops in 1950 (McIntosh, 1989). The Kamloops school music programme grew to be one of the largest instrumental music programmes in British Columbia, featuring an 80-piece band. The band was so popular that in 1954 the group was able to raise $36,000 to compete in the International Musik Olympiad in Kerkrade, Holland where they won first place.

The first formal school for training band leaders in British Columbia was the Military School of Music at Naden, in Victoria, British Columbia (McIntosh, 1989). Until this time, bandleaders rose up through the ranks of the band and assumed leadership when the current leader retired. As bandleaders did not conduct at this time, the leader was usually an outstanding musician in the group.

Many arguments against the current nature of performance-based music classes reflect on the strictly Western focus on repertoire seen in these programs (see Roberts, 2004; Woodford, 2005; Lamb, 1996). Multiculturalism is a very worthy approach to instruction that is taken up for the improvement of music education for young people; however, it does not remove the hegemonic grip performance has on the discipline. Often, band directors consider the playing of compositions by a composer from an ethnic minority to be multicultural education. Campbell (2002) defines this as an exercise in musical diversity in that such endeavours are more about performance of a piece than about immersing oneself in the "cultural interfaces, contexts, and processes of the music" (p. 31).

Undergraduate Training

Potential instrumental music teachers for the public schools go through intense training to become band directors. The general complexion of this training is to develop rehearsal styles that are effective and to manage and organize successful band programs. This further strengthens the music education student's role of performer before entering a music education program (Teachout, 2001). Additionally, this approach can cement the more traditional, skills-based approach to teaching band through the increased validation of this aspect of instrumental music education. This is reinforced by the traditional methods of instruction students have before they come to university. Benedict (Allsup & Benedict, 2008) aptly describes this phenomenon when discussing her personal experience as a university instructor:

> Students enter teacher education programs certain there is very little to think about, discuss, or challenge throughout their pre-service education because,

> ‘Really’, they will tell me, ‘my band consistently won highest rankings at the state competitions, so why should I change my thinking about my own program and my wind band conductor?’ This unwillingness (inability) to confront their subjected role and to recognize their role in this community and to consider alternatives, including imagining or accepting a conductor who engages in practices that may be construed as not in control/abnormal, serves to reproduce the hegemony of the wind band program as a social institution. (p. 163)

Other forms of instruction include “music modeling, aural modeling, and physical modeling” (Kelly, 1997, p. 295). Kelly goes on to define physical modeling to include “facial and physical gestures often included in formal conducting gestures” (p. 295). Music modeling is the act of the director playing an instrument in an effort to teach students about the proper tone quality or playing style. Aural modeling can be guiding listening exercises where students learn what to listen for and so on, when listening to a piece of music.

Jim Froseth, a professor at the University of Michigan, published a revolutionary band method book titled *The Comprehensive Music Instructor: Listen, Move, Sing, and Play for Band* (1984). His method was to incorporate what had been traditionally general music instructional strategies into the instrumental music classroom. These strategies included movement, solfege and ear training exercises. Scruggs’ (2009) found that such teaching styles enhance the musical experience of the student without sacrificing performance quality.

Band directors are under constant pressure to prepare for performances. As soon as one performance is finished, another is approximately two months around the corner.

These directors have a “fear of wasting time with non-performance-oriented objectives” (Robinson, 1996, p. 17). School schedules afford a limited amount of time afforded to band directors to work with band classes, hence letting go of the more tradition form of rehearsing a band is a challenging notion. However, Cutietta (1979) suggests it is possible to incorporate non-performance instruction into performance-based classes without sacrificing the quality of performances.

Blocher, Greenwood, and Shellahamer (1997) found that middle school band directors engaged in the teaching of musical concepts “an average of 19 seconds out of the average teaching segment of 19’20” (p. 463).” The authors suggest the reason for the over-emphasis on performance to the exclusion of conceptual teaching could be the result of “an inclination to teach as one was taught, lack of appropriate role models, and the absence of conceptual teaching methodology in music teacher training programs” (p. 466). Stoll (2008) describes her initial teaching practice as having been “influenced by the images of flute teachers and band conductors after whom I modeled my first years of teaching, and images of exemplar band programs” (p. 3) that she hoped to recreate.

Band directors in the traditional sense are the experts who direct the ensemble. The position of power they occupy requires them to display a sense of absolute confidence and invulnerability. To willingly reveal errors and learning as a model for students would create a situation of the unknown. How would students respond to the director *not* being perfect? How can the students strive for perfection in a performance when the director is not perfect? To let go of that control can be terrifying when there is a performance on the horizon. Of course, this fear is short sighted. The benefits to

students that come from singing greatly improve the performance of individual students, thereby improving the overall band (Grunow, 2005).

Freire (1970) suggests, “The teacher presents the material to the students for their consideration, and re-considers her earlier considerations as the students express their own” (p. 62). Much of the educational literature suggests the importance of the teacher as learner and engaging in joint exploration with students. Putting this into practice can result in students perhaps feeling the instructor does not adequately know their material. Lamb (1996) describes this from a feminist perspective when she says,

> …for a woman to be in a position of authority, *and* to question, criticize, and contest that very musical authority in ways that invite multiple meanings and ambiguities, is to leave herself vulnerable to judgments of incompetence as well as student resistance to an emancipatory project. (p. 128)

According to the traditional music teaching method, the teacher knows everything and students are to learn from the teacher. Freire’s (1970) description of this kind of instruction uses a banking metaphor. The banking method of instruction is one where the teacher deposits information in narrative form to students. It is as if the teacher bestows that knowledge upon the student. Schafer (1975) explains that this top-down, teacher-as-expert, student-as-empty-vessels approach to education can be terribly damaging. Both Schafer and Freire argue that the teacher should always be learning alongside the students. When the teacher stops learning, “the philosophy of education is in trouble” (Schafer, 1975, p. 1).

As a result of the training pre-service they experience, band directors may enter the field thinking of themselves more as a conductor than educator (Allsup & Benedict, 2008). Allsup (Allsup & Benedict, 2008) describes his initial years as a band director

> …conceiving myself as conductor more than music educator, I brought years of musical knowledge to a Bronx neighbourhood where I directed a high school band. My first few years of work there (some of it teaching, most of it training) made any number of students miserable. I taught the way I was taught and I certainly did *not* see my expertise as a problem...I believed in the value of what I was teaching and wanted to induct my students into a tradition that had enriched and liberated *my* life. (p. 158)

Roberts (2004) illustrates the very nature of how music students are schooled to teach as an example of the inherent competitive nature of school music when he cites the auditions a student must pass in order to earn entrance into a university music program. "…the ritual of auditions plays an important role in the construction of a school curriculum in music even though the majority of entrance seekers will have already sought out private instruction beyond the walls of their school and its program" (p. 7).

Froehlich and L'Roy (1985) found that respondents who were undergraduate music education majors demonstrated lessening commitment to music education and increasing commitment to professional performance. Most music education majors do not go on to become professional musicians as their sole career. There are those who have aspirations to perform or compose rather than teach, but they earn a degree in music education just in case. The emphasis on professional performance discovered by Froelich and L'Roy (1985) trickles down to these undergraduates' future students in that they will

most likely frame their position as band director more in line with that of a conductor, running band classes much like a conductor runs a symphony orchestra rehearsal.

Working with Students

Band directors work with students in a number of ways beyond the large group rehearsal. However, this work seems to be geared toward improving the overall large group performance. One of my informants in this study described organizing and assisting students to get private lessons. The practice of lining up private lessons for students is of great benefit to overall band programs. As Heston et al (1996) describe it, "Individual lessons may provide a unique source of job satisfaction in that these lessons strengthen larger group rehearsals and concert programs while serving as opportunities for tutorial lessons that may result in students' access to local and/or state contests " (p. 324).

Band instruction falls under the heading of problem-solving (Boardman, 1989). Labuta and Smith (1997) describe such forms of education as "education in the restricted sense" (p. 55) in that the "teacher is reactive, opportunistic, and corrective: The teacher waits until the need for teaching (or learning) presents itself" (p. 55). Indeed, undergraduate teacher training courses tend to focus on the problem-solving aspects of music education; for example, how to run efficient rehearsals and music programs. In a well-respected text that is used by many university music education instructors, Lynn Cooper (2004) suggests the following for effective rehearsal of a band,

- Be careful not to talk too much in the rehearsal. Use your conducting gestures to indicate your musical ideas. Avoid 'small talk'—rehearsal time is precious! Your students want to play—let them!

- Have a sense of humor and admit mistakes quickly. Be quick to laugh at yourself and *very* slow to blame others. *Never* humiliate them—you will destroy their courage.
- Make practice assignments and hold students accountable.
- Have a pencil in every folder (including yours) and teach students how and when to mark instructions in their music.
- Use full rehearsal time for large-group problems, not for individual or small group problems. Work on those in sectionals or in an individual session with students.
- Take attendance—and do other clerical duties—without wasting rehearsal time. Some people take attendance as students enter the room and then silently verify their record as the rehearsal progresses. Others have an assistant or secretary silently take attendance. Do remember, however, that your record of attendance is an official school record and must be accurate.
- Set high, but attainable, standards for your students and yourself.
- Be well prepared for every rehearsal—it is your professional responsibility.
- Know the score! (p.128)

Cooper also mentions the importance of selecting literature that "enables students to enjoy outstanding musical performance and learn about music (music theory, music history, listening skills, etc. (2004, p. 98)." However, the text offers little guidance as to how one might incorporate learning music concepts beyond teaching technical skills.

Working with challenged and challenging students.

Band directors are not immune to having special-needs students or students from difficult life situations in their programs. In BC, so-called 'designated students' are students who are identified as having special needs. A student with special needs "has a disability of an intellectual, physical, sensory, emotional, or behavioural nature, has a learning disability or has special gifts or talents" (B.C. Ministry of Education, 2010, p.1). Working with designated students in the band class can be challenging as their presence further diversifies the abilities of the students in the class (Darrow, 2003) already broad within the normal range of talents.

The B.C. School Act (1996) stipulates that all students be provided with educational services. Under that Act fall several Ministerial Orders related to students with special needs. The *Special Needs Students Order M150/89* (2007) states the following:

> 1. A board must ensure that a principal, vice principal, or director of instruction offers to consult with a parent of a student with special needs regarding the placement of that student in an education program.
> 2. A board must provide a student with special needs with an educational program in a classroom where that student is integrated with other students who do not have special needs, unless the educational needs of the student with special needs or other students indicate the educational program for the student with special needs should be provided otherwise. (p. E-97)

This statute and special order ensured students who had previously been taught in self-contained special education classrooms were able to spend as much time as possible in

the regular school program (Madden and Slaven, 1983). This practice was and continues to be called mainstreaming. Mainstreaming "is based on the principle of educating most children in regular classrooms and providing special education on the basis of learning needs rather than categories of handicaps" (Gilbert, 1977, p. 64). Nocera (1972) found that music teachers were not adequately prepared to deal with this change in the composition of their classrooms.

There has been much written to assist music teachers in working with students with special needs (for example Hardy, 1989; Ellis, 1996; Gilbert & Asmus, 1981). This literature offered techniques for working with mainstreamed students as well as articles focusing on the legal ramifications on the work of a music educator. Darrow (2003) cites two challenges to teachers working with designated students in a music classroom. The first challenge is "providing instruction that is sufficiently broad enough to address the needs of all students" (p. 45). Failure to meet this challenge can result in students inadvertently being excluded from the learning process.

Authors such as Dykman (1979) suggested that all children have the same basic needs. At issue was how music teachers, with little training in working with disabled students, could effectively educate a diverse student population. Literature from the early stages of the introduction of disabled students to the music classroom revealed the difficulties music educators were wrestling with when attempting to effectively serve their new, diverse groups of students. Aside from the obvious lack of pedagogical understanding of working with disabled students, music educators also displayed an unwillingness to work with disabled students as they felt less capable in working with them (Stuart & Gilbert, 1977).

In a study conducted two years after the passing of the United States law P.L. 94-142 pertaining to the education of students with special needs, Gilbert (1977) offered suggestions for those working with special education students who presented unique challenges to the music classroom. One of his many suggestions for effectively working with disabled students was specifically geared toward dealing with attention span difficulties. The author advises the music educator to frequently change songs and to spend little time on learning new, more difficult material. Maintain a highly structured classroom. Maintain a consistent manner of entering the room, have children sit in the same place each time they come to music class, and use a relatively unchanged opening and closing of class. While these adaptations to the music classroom may be effective for working with disabled students, they can also reduce the music experience for 'non-mainstreamed' students to a bland, uninteresting one. In fact, empirical evidence suggests that music studies designed for at-risk students are limited in design (Collett, 1991).

The isolation experienced by the music educator makes working with designated students particularly challenging in that receiving assistance and/or ideas from colleagues for how to effectively work with students from a variety of life situations can be difficult. Indeed, Lerner (1981) insists that the special education teacher at a school should be the person who works with non-special education teachers who are working with mainstreamed students. In one band program that has been very successful at integrating students with special needs into the program the band director worked closely with the special education teacher (Lapka, 2006). As a matter of fact, one of the concert bands at this high school contained an entire special education class in addition to other

band students. The secret to this band director's success was to modify classroom activities to accommodate each student's disability. Lapka (2006) suggests the following five signs of a model program that includes students with special needs: positive teacher attitudes, collaboration, curriculum modifications, accommodations, and peer tutoring. These signs are not unique or unorthodox. In 1986, the Music Educators National Conference (MENC) published the second edition of a text titled *The School Music Program: Descriptions and Standards*. This text offered music educators recommendations such as having the music educator actively involved in the placement of the designated child in the music class and using musical achievement as the primary deciding factor, providing in-service and pre-service opportunities as well as adequate planning for music educators, and ease of access to trained special education consultants.

As well as special needs students, another subgroup of students who challenge the abilities of a band director is at-risk students. Chipman (2004) defines at-risk students as "those individuals who are in debilitating social-emotional, socio-economic, physical, academic, or criminal difficulties, as well as those where circumstances may diminish their likelihood of graduating from school and/or becoming successful in society" (p.7).

Goolsby (1996) found that expert teachers spent considerably more time in performance, in nonverbal communication and modeling than novice teachers. Findings of this study can be interpreted as using nonverbal communication and modeling are the most effective modes of instruction. At-risk students require more variety of instructional methods from the director. Blocher, Greenwood, and Shellahamer (1997) focus on how band directors use time in rehearsal; in order to learn how band directors conduct rehearsals and how much focus is given to teaching concepts. All modes of teaching

were verbal with the exception of non-verbal conducting gestures. This study also shows the lack of variability in teaching styles amongst band directors.

Chipman (2004) suggests that the following strategies for band directors to employ to "increase their self-awareness when working with at-risk students" would include:

> taking proactive steps to identify students, paying attention to important matters regarding the student, using effective techniques to increase students' interest, using an appropriate sense of humor that is inviting, and regularly acknowledging the significant ways in which teachers can contribute to students' lives. (p. 101)

Band directors who incorporate the above measures into their instructional style and strategies may well be more successful with at-risk students than those who do not.

Working with Schools, Districts and Students

Working with school personnel and colleagues.

Band directors, as do other teachers in the arts, often feel alienated or isolated due to their specializations, which limit their peer group in terms of interests and abilities (Scheib, 2006). For new teachers, this can be disconcerting. It is a very different situation to what they experienced during their undergraduate career where they were part of a group of peers with similar interests. If a new teacher is hired to teach in a rural area of a province or state, the feeling of isolation can be exacerbated. Frierson-Campbell (2003) interviewed school administrators and music teachers in three different schools and revealed much about the isolation felt by many school music teachers and the apparent lack of understanding amongst school administrators with regard for the need for collegiality amongst band directors.

While those labelled academic teachers (those who teach math, science, and the like) receive coverage for their classes when attending in-service conferences or workshops, band directors are often expected to remain on site instead of having the same privileges. Aside from an implied lack of appreciation for the isolation experienced by band directors and the benefits gained from attending in-service events, many administrators feel it is difficult to get teachers-on-call to cover the large and less structured (compared to what is often the desk and chair, seat work type organization of a regular classroom) nature of band/music classes.

As with any other occupation, teachers desire respect for the job they do. Each discipline has a place in the school curriculum and each contribution is important. The relationship between instrumental music teachers such as band directors can be very intertwined in terms of how band is scheduled into the school day. At some schools, band classes are comprised of students who leave their regular class to attend band. In those situations, the regular classroom teacher schedules activities for students who remain in class. Because of this type of scheduling, it is important that band directors have a respectful and positive relationship with other teachers so as to produce a positive situation for students leaving class for band.

It is a very, very long process to change such an indoctrinated culture. Even today, as there have been for decades, there are university instructors who strive to teach pre-service music educators how to approach band instruction from a different, more educational perspective. Those instructors have met and continue to meet resistance from undergraduate students. One such instructor, Randall Allsup (Allsup & Benedict, 2008) recalls a conversation he had with a student named Luke:

> I asked Luke…what it meant when students and teacher collaborate. He replied: If you made a suggestion to us about doing something in the piece, I would consider whatever you said, think about what was going on in the song, and if I could see merit in it, incorporate it. I think I speak for most of us in my group when I say that we wouldn't do something just because you said it. If there's something we don't like, it won't happen, but if your suggestion shows us a new thing that we've never thought of yet, I'm all for it, and I'll be glad to have learned something new. (p. 167)

While Luke is obviously being exposed to new ideas about teaching music through performance and empowering students to take a more active role in their learning and the overall work that is being done, he still adheres to the old process of being a gatekeeper with regard to music and this influences his instructional practices. Luke decides what will work. His students are not permitted to explore. Rather, they are told what to do and how they will learn.

Heston et al (1996) suggest developing "high-quality interpersonal relationships" (p. 325), which would take precedence over instructional or performance goals. Indeed, Parker Palmer (2007) argues that every encounter between teacher and student contains dialectic of vulnerability. "The role of band director requires us to act without fear, to be invulnerable and resolute" (p. 165). To show vulnerability would be tantamount to saying, 'I have no idea what I am doing and I need your help to show me.' This black-and-white vision of vulnerability is self-limiting and it discredits the notion of authentically engaging with students.

As mentioned earlier, the battleground for change should no longer exist solely in the literature. The literature has been critical in changing the mindset of music educators with regard to performance-based classes. However, we seem to have only changed the way we talk about music education. Fear of change cannot be overemphasized in the practical alterations to music education that are occurring. Undergraduate students are being asked to step out into the world of band directing and teach differently. We are basically asking them to step off a cliff and trust there is something to land on.

It is incumbent upon music educators at the university level to enable these students to change their teaching practice to reflect change. We must give them ideas as to how they can still be successful conductors of performances as they change their instructional approaches. Information gained through this study will enable university music education programs to begin placing importance on these changes to pre-service teacher training.

Chapter Three - Setting the Context

Band directors operate as powerful influences on the lives of students, parents, and the general community. As teachers within the organization of institutionalized education, band directors bring to bear their knowledge and power as the primary decision-makers in a band program. Further, band directors must negotiate the many relationships that exist within the structure of institutionalized education. Students and parents are in an implied position of power as they can voice displeasure, to the band director or school and district administrators, when they are not happy with the quality of instruction in class. Students' and parents' notions of what is a quality music education may involve any number of factors—such as performance quality, whether or not the instruction is carried out in an interesting or motivating manner, or how justly the band director treats his or her students, to name a few. The band director must also negotiate the demands of the community in terms of how many performances should be given, where they should commit themselves to perform, and the quality of the performances. Institutional ethnography offers the researcher the opportunity to see how these relations come together to influence the work of a band director in that the band director provides the ground from which one can see up into the institutional relations that exist within their arena of work.

Historically, bands have been civic organizations, lending music to significant events such as holiday festivals, dedications of buildings and monuments, and the like. The school band continues this tradition as they present musical performances to local communities in addition to providing music to civic events. As such, the band director

can be located at the centre of school and community life in many instances. The following sections discuss the band director and the work he or she does as an educator.

All music teachers in B.C. public schools are Music Specialists. There is no designation as to whether that specialty is vocal, instrumental, or general. At my university, music education students graduate with a Bachelor of Education (Elementary Curriculum) or Bachelor of Education (Secondary Curriculum). However, all music education graduates from universities in B.C. are certified to teach music at the K-12 level. Individually, students adopt specialties within the music education program such as vocal or instrumental. Further, graduates usually have certain grade levels they would like to teach. The term band director is a colloquial term for one who teaches instrumental music in a band setting, usually at the middle or high school level.

Band directors have jobs that encompass much more than the teaching of music. In addition to teaching, band directors must create and manage budgets, plan and carry out trips with large numbers of students, and manage personnel from students to parent groups. When speaking with local band directors, I discovered there is no defined job description for band directors or music specialists in the local school district. Further, there is no formal job description for band directors with the local teachers' union. The following sections provide a glimpse into the work band directors do as they carry out their jobs.

Managing the Program

In addition to planning instruction, band directors work nearly year round, handling the logistics of managing a program that houses large, expensive instrument inventories and music inventories. After a school year is completed, school instruments

used by students are taken up, checked for damage and sent to a music store for cleaning and/or repair. The band director then either transports the instruments personally, which often requires more than one trip due to the size of the instruments/equipment, or arranges a time for a representative from the music store to pick them up. After this task is completed, the band director begins to focus on what instructional changes should take place for the following year. This is not done in a formal manner. Rather, it is a reflective exercise where the director contemplates the year from the perspective of a performer and assesses the quality of performances presented by the various groups in the program. Weaknesses are mentally noted and general plans are made for the next year for groups that may need changes in instructional approaches or materials. This process usually takes approximately two weeks to one month, after which the director usually takes at least one month of summer vacation time. Much of this time is spent participating in reading clinics to explore new repertoire for concert band.

Approximately one month before school begins, the band director will begin to plan concert programs for each performing group in the program. Further, they will begin planning trips and/or special performance opportunities such as outdoor festivals in the community or visits from dignitaries. Playing for visiting dignitaries or for community events such as outdoor festivals and so on provides great opportunities for advertising the group and/or the school to the local community and beyond. Notoriety is valuable in terms of building a school band's reputation and a band director's resume.

When band directors submit tapes in competition for acceptance to perform at parades or festivals, such as the Victoria Day Parade in Victoria, B.C., they must submit a performance tape as well as a type of resume, which includes important performances

presented by the group. The more performing opportunities a group has and the more invitations to and/or awards from smaller events that result from performances, the better a group's chances of being invited to a larger event such as the Rose Parade in Pasadena, California. For example, a director may look for performance opportunities at the local community centre, for their Spring Concert. From that performance, the group may be invited to perform at another community event, such as a Rotary Club meeting.

All of these performance opportunities strengthen the community in that the band is a source of pride. Further, the director's career is strengthened as he or she now has a reputation for creating outstanding performances and offering exciting performance opportunities to his or her students. Directors find out what events are occurring in the community that might hold performance opportunities for one of their groups. They search public announcements made at community centres or by community associations. They also ask around to learn about such opportunities from colleagues and others.

If there are opportunities, the director puts the dates on the calendar and makes plans to contact those in charge of those events so as to hopefully get a booking. Many band directors use a large calendar on which to write important dates and instructional plans. Juan and Lorraine both rely heavily on a calendar, mainly to plan concerts and trips. Juan states,

> [I] will take a calendar. Like next week I have to plan the concert dates for next year and our travel dates, because the school calendar wants to come out. When they do their transition day, they bring the students in from the elementary schools, they want to give the students a packet of material that will tell them how the year starts, how the year goes, where the pro D days are, where the travel

> days are for the classrooms, and concert dates, and special events, and that kind of stuff.

Lorraine relies on a calendar, in addition to lots of sticky notes and her Palm Pilot. She says,

> I use a lot of sticky notes in books and on pieces of paper and stick them on music or I write on them the score, or stuff like that. That is what I do. I forget if I don't. So I just keep a pencil behind my ear as we go along I circle things or I talk about it. And then on my calendar here I have stuff marked down that is coming up. I also use a Palm Pilot so that it rings at me every once in a while so I remember to do something. I program that in at the beginning of the year. For instance between May 7 – 11, I have to do my testing for band because report cards are at the end of May. I have to do my testing then, and then do a theory test..... that kind of stuff.

After informally making performance plans for the year, the band director considers the bands he or she will have for the coming year. Next, the director begins the task of selecting repertoire. Each director approached selects repertoire in different ways. Steve did not mention repertoire selection when discussing instructional planning. Rather, he focuses on improving theoretical understanding through performance, by relying heavily on the Royal Conservatory of Music Rudiments. Lorraine uses several resources to guide her in selecting repertoire, "I start looking at [the MusicFest Canada] site." MusicFest Canada is a national, by-invitation music festival. Bands are invited to perform based on earned ratings at local festivals. MusicFest Canada also has a required

music list from which directors must choose when performing at the festival. Lorraine continued,

> ...and I start talking with Stan and other people that left stuff to play next year and I do my musical room. I do stuff like this. When I hear something I go through that. Every concert I go to I keep the program, and I circle stuff. So I do that. That is how I plan my repertoire for next year. Sometimes in September I get surprised, and go 'this repertoire is not going to work' and I have to start again.

She finds selecting music, in addition to using the B.C. Curriculum to guide instruction, to be insufficient during her undergraduate training,

> It was really, really tough the first couple of years, for me. They didn't teach that at school at all, and the ones that I got there was never any sort of repertoire stuff. I didn't have a list that I could go to. I just talk and listen to things, figure out things, do a lot of guessing, I guess, and handing out. I find that really frustrating.

Juan participates in reading clinics. "I will go to some reading clinics in the summer time to find repertoire, and make some decisions that way." Reading clinics are opportunities for band directors to come together and perform various musical selections in order to ascertain what selections would be educationally beneficial to students and popular to audiences. Juan further organizes his instruction by setting up his music storage in the band room. "I buy the repertoire and usually organize my filing cabinet, so that the repertoire that I am going to be doing for the year, is in my current filing cabinet."

Each director approaches the beginning of the school year differently. For Steve, students do not start coming to his class until the second or third day of school “when their classroom teacher is comfortable”. He further states,

> The first band class, if it is Grade 6s, the whole school is separated into pods, so we have all the classrooms in that one pod come into the band room and we talk about the music program and what we do, and what type of opportunities that they will have, what type of instruments are available, and answer all their questions. That usually takes up the entire day with Grade 6s. With the Grade 7s and Grade 8s they usually have instruments and we just start off where we left off the first day.

Juan structures his instruction at the beginning of the year in such a way as to provide much well-organized instruction in a short period of time. This approach is especially important when working with beginners who require much individual attention when learning how to put instruments together, to properly hold them, and play them.

> I will say for the first month I will just have the clarinets come in one day, and flutes in one day, and then I will isolate them that way until I have gone through all the instrument families once. Then we are up and rolling in October and just doing our thing.

He describes in more detail how he incorporates guest instruction in initial lessons with his beginners,

> I will book the first Saturday back in September, I will find a music company in town that will contribute some money towards bringing in some clinicians, and

> have a start up day and bring clinicians in on that Saturday and use the whole school. A whole bunch of flute players will go to a room with a teacher, and get a head start. It usually takes care of my first three or four weeks of work, on that first day, just fostering some attitudes about how the whole instrument, how to put it together. That way I avoid repairing instruments for the first month.

Lorraine has a similar approach to the beginning of the school year as Juan except she includes bringing in students from other middle schools to join in the Saturday Clinic.

> The first thing we do with the band and we started this last year, and I am never not doing it, the head start program, it is on Saturday...We get everybody from [interested] middle schools in the District…All the grade 6 students must come. If they can't come to this, then they have to come and see me personally and I give them their first lesson. There have only been a few that haven't made it to that Saturday thing. I basically tell them that now, that it is September 22 next year, or whatever date it is. That eliminates all my start up stuff pretty much. I don't have to call individual instruments to the band room . . . It is all done there. The professionals, they know way more about the instruments that I will ever know. It is really cool, I am getting things like . . . and oboe and things that I don't play. And then for certain . . . they know how to put together.

Although Juan and Lorraine incorporate similar start-up instruction for their beginning musicians, they do not do these clinics together. Lorraine described working with other younger directors in organizing and carrying out this endeavour, while Juan organizes this event alone. Juan does not appear to work closely with other directors

beyond planning recruiting concerts and so on. His experience gives him a quiet confidence that guides his decisions and actions. The younger band directors in this study rely heavily on each other as they navigate their new careers as music educators.

Instruments.

Shortly after students begin attending classes; school instruments are assigned to students who play the larger, more expensive instruments, in addition to students who need to use a school instrument due to financial difficulties. Such instruments are tubas, baritones/euphoniums, French horns, bassoons, oboes, baritone saxophones, tenor saxophones, bass clarinets, alto clarinets, and piccolos. While these larger, more expensive instruments may be provided by the school, students are expected to rent or buy instruments such as trumpet, clarinet, trombone, saxophone, and flute. Additionally, percussion instruments of many types are kept on inventory. These are large instruments such as bass drums, xylophones, glockenspiels, marimbas, chimes, and tympani. Smaller percussion instruments, typically called auxiliary percussion, are also included in the inventory list for a school band program. Auxiliary percussion is usually stored in a cabinet in the band room.

To help students who need financial help to acquire an instrument, Juan and Lorraine use monies raised through fundraising to assist students in need. Juan explains,

> We have a music parents' association which we put together a few years ago, and we fundraise into a general pot as well as into an individual student accounts so that they can pay for certain things. I have that pot of money. The principal has a pot of money. We are not an inner city school so we don't get any special funding that way. But our parent advisory group, which is a parent group for the whole

> school as well as our music parents association, do have some money that we can help students out that [sic] really can't afford it.

Lorraine's instrument storage room is large and has shelves that are filled with large, aging instruments. It has a musty, oily smell that reflects the long history of usage these instruments have provided to her band program and the many band programs that came before. There are some unusual instruments that are rarely used at the middle school level, but most are instruments that can be assigned to and used by students. She says,

> I have lots of instruments. I wouldn't call them good. They are 1950's, 1960's. Most of them are . . . repair shop. They were quality instruments for the time they were at, but they have just worn out. But the stuff I need is the stuff that everybody needs. Three-quarter size tubas, baritones, bari saxes, bass clarinets, all the stuff that is being used a lot.

Juan's instrument storage is located on the stage in his band room. The band room at his middle school is part of the old auditorium. His instruments are old but in playable condition. He also has a sizeable inventory of donated instruments that can be loaned to students.

> We have had a number of instruments donated. We actually did instrument drives for a couple of years in the district. So families that had instruments sitting around in their closet would be sent in. So I have got maybe ten flutes, six or eight clarinets, four or five trumpets. I think I have got four trombones, Two French horns, two tubas, two bass clarinets, two tenor saxophones. I have got a school bass guitar and then all our percussion equipment. It is okay. We can help

> our kids who want to play smaller instruments as well. They are not great, but they function. I get them fixed up every year.

Local music stores assist the band directors in the district by loaning instruments to students, free-of-charge. As Lorraine says, “The music companies in town are very good about giving instruments, too.” Juan also has had experience where a music store helped out a student who couldn’t afford a band instrument, “I have never had any trouble talking to a music store and saying, ‘This kid can’t afford it, can you make an instrument available?’ And usually they are very supportive.”

Steve has a different approach to helping students that cannot afford instruments:

> Well, if a family can’t afford an instrument, they usually talk to me, or the principal. In this district, fortunately, but they didn’t have it in place this year, they have a bursary in place, the Michelle Jones Trust Fund where they just apply and then Larsen Music lends an instrument for that. And we have extra instruments that we have here that we lend out.

Instruction.

After starting the year off, focus moves to planning day-to-day lessons. Lorraine relies on mental notes, sticky notes, and notes jotted in music scores to guide her instruction.

> For band, in the morning when I get here, for Band 6, 7, 8, and Jazz band depending on what is going on for the day. Then I plan what we are doing there. And then I think of what is coming next. I put what we are doing on the board. And then I will make little notes to myself on the stand, on a piece of paper – ‘don’t forget this, this, or that.’ I also do that also. I will sit down with a piece of

paper and write it all out. I just don't have the time. I'd love to. There is no way that I could do that every day. I'd go insane.

Recruiting.

Each director begins planning for the coming year in the Spring. It is during this time that directors must wrap up the current year and look forward to the following year. Concerns during this time range from instrumentation to music selection to recruiting. Directors work to keep the instrumentation in their band balanced to ensure an aesthetically pleasing sound. The foundation for years of good instrumentation begins at the start, with the beginning band students and many directors organize their recruiting efforts around this issue. Although students withdraw from band or move away sometimes, the overall band balance is good if there is a good foundation.

Middle school band directors band often face the pressure of providing high school band directors, who receive middle school band students, with instrumentation that enhances the high school program. High school band directors often look at middle school bands as a type of farm team, providing them with a well-balanced instrumentation of quality players for their high school band. Butler (2002) illustrates this relationship aptly when he says, "High school directors have to rely on their middle school feeder patterns to achieve balanced instrumentation" [Msg. 5]. The perceived pressure placed on middle school directors by high school directors can be seen in literature and informal communications amongst band directors.

In an online forum, a high school director suggests a link for middle school band directors that offers "ideas on placement for students on instruments" (Doll, 2006, Msg. 7). In response to a band director's message on a message board asking for assistance in

dealing with extremely poor instrumentation in his high school, due to unusual instrumentation coming from the middle school feeder program, Kim L. (2002) commented, “It sounds like all of your feeder programs are bad. Middle school band directors should begin oboes, bassoon, and French horns at that level so this insanity does not happen” [Msg. 21]! These comments reflect a sort of paternalistic attitude amongst many high school directors when dealing with middle school feeder programs.

Many middle school band directors focus their recruiting efforts in the spring, when grade 5 students are making decisions about elective courses in middle school. However, Steve waits to recruit beginning band students until the fall, when grade 6 students arrive for the first time to middle school.

> We tried it at the end of the first year to have them fill out forms and it was so chaotic and it didn’t work because the instrumentation with the groups was terrible, because we couldn’t really tell them that “you are playing this, and you are playing this” that we didn’t want to deal with it. This year it was great. It worked out fine. And sometimes the kids when they sign up in the spring, “oh, we are moving, so we are going to a different school.” So it is just not worth it.

Steve explained his process for recruiting grade 6 students. “First we talk about the fundamentals of music. We tell them what rhythm is, what a melody is and we talk about the different instrument types and what the role is in the band.” He further shared how he tries to set up well-rounded instrumentation with his beginners.

> We demonstrate, as best as we can, each instrument. We play a recording. At the end, and actually this year, it turned out really well. The instrumentation wasn’t so bad. And then we ask them at the end, okay, “who would like to play flute, or

> clarinet, trumpet, baritone, trombone?" and they will put up their hand. And we usually get to pull out new, shiny, really new beautiful instruments, like the trombone, baritone and we get a crummy looking trumpet and clarinet and flute so that we try to deter them away and get them to play those. Percussion and bass and drumming you draw names out of a hat because usually half the class wants to play bass and percussion. But usually we have to ask percussionists if they have had any piano background, because then the instruments are easier for them to play.

When faced with what looks like poor instrumentation for his Grade 6 band, Steve does want to have balanced instrumentation, but generally he allows students to play the instrument they choose. He explains how he handled starting his beginners, who come from both the English and French Immersion populations of the school.

> It is funny, because the Grade 6 English, there is only 4 kids that wanted to play saxophone, two wanted to play tenor. Perfect. But the French, there was 8 or 9, all wanted to play sax. I just groaned. So I tried to persuade them to switch. We have 10 alto Sax players. But I had half of them promise to switch after December to a tenor sax or baritone sax. Now with that group I have 5 alto sax, 3 tenor sax, and 2 baritone saxes, which is alright. We try to persuade them to play something else.
>
> Well we have them try it out first, and if it really doesn't work then we will switch them. There is this one girl and I really didn't want her to play trumpet because she wouldn't be really successful because she has a big, bad overbite, but she was so insistent, and she practices, so I thought, "let's give it a

> shot and see." And she is getting braces. It made things more interesting. I might switch her to baritone next year when she gets her braces and then switch her back to trumpet if she wants too.

Juan deals with beginning band instrumentation in a different way. When observing Juan's band class, the instrumentation was well-balanced even though his philosophy about beginning band instrumentation is more relaxed than Steve's. The sound is pleasing with no instruments overpowering the others. As discussed earlier, sometimes instrumentation in a band can change due to attrition or physiological issues such as when a student gets braces. Juan works more diligently with his grade 7 and 8 bands to ensure those bands have well-balanced instrumentation. By this time, students have worked together for at least a year and they have developed more of a team mentality. Steve explains how he works with students to plan cooperatively.

> I have a bit of time in June where I try to get the Grade 6s who are just finishing beginning band and the Grade 7s who are finished their first year advanced band, together. The planning stuff that we [talk] about is instrumentation for the most part. What are we going to be missing when the Grade 8s leave? What are we going to need in our advanced band? Some students might be interested in switching instruments. What would they like to switch too and is that going to help the band out? Those kinds of talks. I have several kids who are multi-instrumentalists already. They are playing saxophone, flute and clarinet. I have got some playing tuba, trombone and piano. And I have people playing bass and guitar and clarinet. It all reinforces itself. As long as they stay excited they keep on progressing. So I encourage the kids. Maybe they can play

> this in jazz band, and that in concert band and what can you add to our group to make it more full and sounding like we want it to sound.
>
> I will encourage them to think of the team and do their thing, but if that is all they really want to do, I will let them go at it. It is not such a big deal at the middle school level. It is a beginning level group. If somebody has a passion to do something, I definitely want to encourage that, be very inclusive. I don't want to be denying anybody. We talk about the group needs. Usually it gets dealt with. I am not too worried about it.

One of the reasons band is a positive experience for students, especially middle school students, is because students develop a sense of belonging. Middle school students struggle with self-concept (Wenz-Gross et al, 1997). Being an important part of a group of peers is crucial to helping students feel they fit in and that their contributions are valued. Juan begins his recruiting each spring. He explains his recruiting process:

> With the beginning guys, we usually like to take a smaller group, about 30 to 35 piece group out to do some recruiting concerns. We only have one official feeder school for Holyoake Middle School, but we have three elementary schools that will potentially send kids here. So we will call them up and book some dates and we will go out and play our shows and at those times I will also distribute some application forms for students that might be interested in coming into our program the following year. On that sheet they will indicate a choice of three instruments that they might like to try and any kind of musical background they have…I have done some testing, where I have done an pseudo aptitude test…It was just a note recognition. This note is high, this note is low. I made it up

> myself. Recognizing this melody…There was a rhythm thing but I can't remember what it was. I'd have to dig through my files to find it. It was about 10 questions, pretty basic.
>
> The important thing is to get the kids to sign up and give it a try… I have just done a recruiting concert with our kids and hand out application forms. Then I will do some follow-up and encourage kids to come.

Juan continues:

> There was a movie that was put out by Yamaha, that was encouraging, "get involved in band" kind of thing. So I would distribute the aptitude test and the students would complete the thing and then they would watch the movie for 30 minutes and I would quickly mark all of these things, and say "I can't believe the class average, it is huge, this is amazing." At that point I would distribute my little letter that said, "Today your child received an aptitude test in music education or aptitude for band. This is what we found and we would like to encourage your son and daughter to get involved in our music program."

Lorraine explains her recruiting process, which, like Juan's, begins in the spring.

> [At] the end of the year…we do recruiting. One June 13th this year, we are going out and hitting four schools, and four different concerts. So we rent a bus and take all the kids around and I give out all the stuff that happens here for [students]. We talk to all the students about the instruments that they are going to play and I get a piece of paper back that says one of their three choices. Everybody chooses percussion and bass, which I am trying to get rid of in schools.

Directors guide students as to what instruments are the best choices for them. The reason students indicate which three instruments they would be interested in learning is to give the director some room to make changes, but at the same time ensure the student is able learn an instrument of their choice.

In their undergraduate training, band directors learn skills for guiding students in instrument selection. This process is especially crucial for middle school students. These students experience significant physiological changes during their adolescent years. Often, this is the time of life when students get braces, which can adversely affect how well a student can play certain instruments. For example, Steve was hesitant to allow a student to learn to play the trumpet because she would be getting braces soon (described above). Trumpets have small mouthpieces and they require very focused embouchures, more so than the other brass instruments. If a student wants to learn to play trumpet and they have braces or expect to get them, directors will often try to encourage the student to learn one of the lower pitched brass instruments with a larger mouthpiece, such as the euphonium. The euphonium has a similar fingering system to the trumpet and many directors will allow the student to switch to trumpet after their braces are removed.

Concentrating on creating balanced instrumentation beyond individual student concerns reflects the pressures directors feel to produce quality public performances. One aspect of a good performance is a nice overall band sound. The ensemble should produce a uniform sound, with no single player or section playing out over the ensemble, unless the score warrants. When instrumentation is out of balance, the band sound suffers in that students—especially younger ones—have to work especially hard to make up for overbalance in some sections. In my experience as a band director and in talking

with colleagues, some directors even go to the extent of having some students not play in certain sections, to ensure the overall band sound is uniform.

Middle school band directors must also consider the needs of the high school to which their band program feeds. As illustrated earlier from the online band directors' forum, high school band directors have expectations they receive large numbers of well-developed individual musicians and uniform instrumentation. Presumably middle school directors take into account the needs of the high school band directors when working with their students. It is good to have a forward thinking attitude with regard to planning and carrying out instruction. As Steve comments, he considers the needs of the high school band directors and places importance on ensuring his students are prepared for entering the high school band, "At least they have a good foundation of music theory and playing their instrument, regardless of what high school they go to".

Recruiting is important to middle school directors for more reasons than ensuring uniform instrumentation for a quality band sound. In an age where funding cuts to schools are a constant worry, arts classes are often the first to be eliminated when decisions are made to cut programs. Band directors are aware of this and they work diligently to show their programs are viable and necessary to the school (Newton, 2007). In an online discussion forum, Hodowanec (2006) laments the low enrolment in his middle school band program. He seeks advice from his fellow discussion group members:

> I'm teaching what is basically an instrumental recruiting class…Our numbers at our middle school are down this year…I'm asking for your suggestions for

making the class more interesting. The goal is to get them excited about playing an instrument in 6th grade.

Concern for professional reputation plays an integral part in recruiting efforts. As discussed earlier, high school band directors have high expectations in terms of the students they receive from middle school band programs.

The band directing community is an insular, tightly-bound network. Band directors talk to each other and critique performances and overall programs. Having a good reputation as a band director is important in that future career opportunities can be adversely affected by a poor reputation amongst peers. For example, when a band director leaves a position, the administrator will often ask for recommendations for a replacement. Band directors who are known for not presenting quality performances or having large programs are usually not on the list.

In addition to reputation amongst peers, reputation amongst administrators is important for a band director. To ensure a financially and professionally sponsored band program, directors must make the program appear to be worth supporting. This is reflected both in the size of the program and the notoriety the band's performances bring to the school and community. In spite of the most honourable intentions of a band director to focus on more than performance, the very nature of band in institutionalized education precludes a broader spectrum of education for band students.

Performing.

As a performance draws near, most directors will begin the work of teaching students about stage presence. Juan says he constantly addresses performance etiquette with his students, rather than waiting until a performance is near. He will say,

> You are performing from the time that you arrive at the school and until you are no longer at the school. So your deportment, your demeanor, your manners and everything are on display. People are looking at you. Because you are performers, you are in a different light. You need to be aware of that.

As a performance draws closer, he further addresses how performers should look on stage and move as a unit. He says, “We will talk about it days, weeks before, so that when they are sitting, and the hands go up, people go into their playing position. That whole business of moving unified as a group.”

Steve addresses the issue of concert etiquette in a very low-key fashion. He reminds the students about the importance of having a long attention span for a performance. He also addresses concert etiquette with parents in attendance at the concert:

> We just say, ‘these students have worked really, really hard and we would appreciate it if you stay for the whole concert. Just like to remind you that we would appreciate it if you need to leave the room, please do so in between pieces or in between groups. Refrain from talking during the performance.’

Trips.

Band directors have to register the bands and organize the other logistical needs for taking a group off campus. There are arrangements that need to be made for lodging, if necessary, transportation, and meals while the group is away from school.

Steve has a very methodical approach to planning for trips.

> First of all I have to go over costs. I have a breakdown on the different options that I can have. So I have how many students and how many chaperons I need.

> Because the hotel was also found through MusicFest, they found it for us, because of such short notice, that we got 10 rooms. They worked it all out and they paid for it. We have got festival fees and then I tried to come up with another event that they can do that is not music related. So we are going to the aquarium. We cover some of the food, the transportation, I just worked it out and that is about it. Then I write out an itinerary and what we can do.

Juan approaches planning trips in a more casual manner. He has 'dreaming' sessions with his more advanced students, to discuss whether or not certain trips are appealing to the students. For the most part, Juan takes short trips near the school district rather than taking trips to locations far from his school. Similarly, Lorraine takes shorter, more local field trips with her groups, with occasional longer trips to locations such as Seattle.

Conclusion

In this chapter, I described the work of the band director. This information provides the reader with background information as to what band directors do and how institutionalized education plays a part in instructional organization and program management. Teacher preparation is typically geared toward the more traditional mode of music education: planning and carrying out rehearsals and the like. However, music education professors at the universities and colleges also espouse a broader notion of musical understanding, beyond learning technical skills, which has been described as teaching comprehensive musicianship (O'Toole, 2003). Teaching comprehensive musicianship means teaching repertoire at a deeper level than only teaching musical skill. O'Toole (2003) suggests that "concerts will be better if students perform with understanding and that rehearsal time spent studying, debating, and exploring

composers' intent, style periods, and students' personal relationships to music can be efficient and balanced with improving performance skills" (p. 111). The fact remains that performances, trips, and organizing parent organizations can distract the band director from expanding their pedagogical work.

Chapter Four - Working with Curricula

Institutional ethnography incorporates the texts that coordinate institutional relations into its ethnographic practices. In education in general, the genres of texts that are of major importance in the planning of courses and of classroom practices are the curricula. This chapter examines how the band directors' course planning and classroom work was coordinated by curricula texts. Texts, as was pointed out in the introductory chapter, are viewed in institutional ethnography in terms of how they coordinate local work practices, such as the work organization of a classroom, with institutional relations that are generalized across particular local settings. The provincial government has produced an official music education curriculum, but, as we shall see, participants draw on a variety of texts to guide their instruction. Through institutional ethnography, the researcher can explore how the band director carries out her or his work and how the institutional relations may or may not be taken into account in the band director's design of the curriculum that is actually implemented in the course. Curricula are texts that coordinate the work of a course. Peering up into the relations of institutionalized education from the work carried out by the band director, we can discern many levels of textual regulation that may enter into the actual curriculum that a band director works with. At the district level, there may be curricular guidance from organizations such as local music educator groups, like the Local Specialists Association in this instance.

Another source of curriculum regulation is the official music curriculum provided by the provincial Ministry of Education. Though each band director has access to the B.C. music curricula (for the purposes of this study, only B.C.’s music curriculum for

grades 6-8 will be discussed), but, as will be shown, their course design does not necessarily conform to it closely.

Within the Fine Arts Curriculum, music K-7 is included in the Fine Arts K-7 curriculum and secondary music curricula are divided as the following: Music 8-10, Music 11 and 12 – Composition and Technology, and Music – Choral and Instrumental Music. Specific to this study is the Music K-7 curriculum and the Music 8-10 curriculum, as middle school band directors teach grades 6-8, ages 11-14. Both curricular guides—Instrumental Music 8-10 and Fine Arts/Music K-7 specify the following concepts for instructional focus: Structure – Elements of Rhythm and Melody; Thoughts, Images, and Feelings; Context – Self and Community, Historical and Cultural. Within the curriculum are Integrated Resource Packages (IRPs), which include Prescribed Learning Outcomes (PLOs or instructional objectives) and suggested instructional strategies.

The B.C. Curriculum Integrated Resource Package (IRP) is a document that provides music educators with the Prescribed Learning Outcomes (PLOs), a list of recommended instructional materials as well as suggested instructional and assessment strategies. Prescribed Learning Outcome statements are the content standards set forth by the Ministry. According to the Ministry, the PLOs are “clearly stated and expressed in measurable terms” (B.C. Ministry of Education, 1995, p. III). Suggested instructional strategies are available to teachers to adapt into their teaching, if they wish. These have been developed by music specialists (not necessarily band specialists) and are merely suggestions. The assessment strategies, also written by music specialists, are only suggestions. They provide assessment strategies from which teachers can choose when assessing student performance.

The B.C. music curriculum is purposely broad in order to grant teachers the opportunity to plan and execute instruction using their experience and professional knowledge. Both Steve and Lorraine feel that the document is too vague to be effective in guiding their instruction. In his advice to music teachers on how to work with a state (or provincial) music curriculum, Localizado (2009) takes its vagueness for granted:

> Consider how the curriculum guide fits with your hopes and plans for the program, and formulate a solid rationale for the decisions you make…Curriculum guides are intended to maintain a standard of learning across school and across teachers in a given school. Be sure to familiarize yourself with this important resource. (p. 6)

He suggests that rather than attempting to follow the official curriculum as written, the director form a syllabus for his or her unique program using the curriculum as a resource.

In a well-respected book for band directors, it is suggested that they "make high quality" repertoire (Rush & Lautzenheizer, 2006, p. 63) the curriculum. Indeed, many directors do make repertoire and method book material the curriculum. This supports the tradition of emphasizing repertoire and repertoire preparation in school music. In a study conducted by Mercer (1972), the majority of band directors surveyed indicated the musical score is the curriculum. For the band directors I worked with the score remained the curriculum of choice, although Steve in his choice of music and score is also using regulatory texts beyond the provincial Ministry of Education curriculum. He prefers to work through method books and follow the *Royal Conservatory of Music (RCM) Theory Curriculum* (2008) when planning and delivering instruction beyond skills development. As Steve feels "there isn't much [to the music curriculum], unless you take a look at the

preliminary rudiments textbooks from the RCM". The *RCM Preliminary Rudiments* cover the basic components of music in the form of treble and bass clef, selected scales, simple time signatures, interval identification, and music terms and signs (Royal Conservatory of Music, 2008). The RCM conducts certification examinations three times a year in many communities throughout Canada.

Research reported by Blocher, Greenwood and Shellahamer (1997), however, indicates that middle school band directors are technically oriented and spend much of their time "running students through drill-type material" (p. 466). With the exception of teaching theoretical knowledge of music, working with supplementary materials such as method books merely serves to assist the students in developing skills they need to perform repertoire. This technical approach to band instruction is not unique to band. Indeed, it is not unusual for teachers in any field to include repetitive skills-building instructional strategies to their work at times when it is necessary. However, Allsup and Benedict (2008) argue that "band culture has a teaching tradition that goes beyond the normative concept of training or *tekné* to what behavioural psychologists call 'conditioning'" (p. 158). Conditioning of behaviour makes some sense considering that band directors may have to work with very large classes of students with potentially loud noisemakers in their hands. Indeed learning the skills necessary to play an instrument, from putting it together to actually playing, require physical conditioning and some behavioural conditioning. When instruction is limited to a behavioural conditioning approach, students lose the opportunity to learn concepts and participate in activities related to music in a creative, explorative way (see Blocher, Greenwood, &Shellahamer, 1997).

The B.C. Music Curriculum proposes cross-curricular instruction as one of the philosophical bases for middle schools' instructional organization. It offers suggestions for working collegially with other teachers in the school to create thematic units of instruction that can enhance learning in several disciplines. This supports Coffman's (1987) argument that the best situation for students is for all teachers involved in their education collaborate to support cross-curricular instruction. The benefits are many. One benefit is that students learn the skill of transfer. This skill is important in any field, but it is especially important to students. When students learn to transfer knowledge they have gained in one area, they are better able to progress and make sense of new material. For an example of cross-curricular instruction supporting music learning, imagine a team of teachers at a middle school who organize a thematic unit on Korea. While one teacher might explore Korean literature and another learn about the Korean history, the band director could choose to play repertoire related in some way to Korean culture such as a "Korean Folk Song". In this way, students would have a more enhanced music experience by drawing on what they learn about Korean culture, such as folk song traditions, in other classes.

Localizado (2009) suggests that connecting and working with other teachers in a school is helpful in other ways. Band directors develop relationships across school, alleviating their isolation, improving the notion that music is a relevant and integral component of the school curriculum, and making it easier to work with students and organize the program and/or instruction.

Creating one's own curriculum for a band program, whether within a formalized curriculum text or less formally, makes it more responsive to both instructor and students.

Swanwick (1999) suggests that instruction which is “broadly process-based” (p. 101) rather than performance-driven, should be organized more in connection with student processes and paces of learning rather than striving to meet pre-specified curriculum-driven objectives. However, with the freedom to create and carry out instruction of curricula individually designed comes responsibility to provide a well-rounded musical experience to all students.

In addition to the B.C. Music Curriculum (1995, 1998), band directors in Canada have access to another source of guidance in the Canadian Band Association's set of voluntary national standards for bands (2006). In introducing it, David Elliot clearly endorses the view that band courses should involve more than learning techniques:

> When we refer to learning *about* music we mean that students learn a wide range of facts and concepts about music including the following: historical and cultural facts about composers and their works; facts about reading and writing music (music is written and ‘spoken’ using a unique symbol system called musical ‘notation’); theoretical-mathematical concepts about the forms and structures of musical works (music theory includes knowing, analyzing, and being able perceive a multitude of sonic relationships); concepts about how to listen, sing, play, improvise, compose, arrange and conduct expressively in a variety of different musical styles. (p. 3)

These standards can be met at three different levels of proficiency: “Standard, Quality, and Proficient” (p. 4).The standards are quite involved and offer suggestions to school administrators as well as band directors and band directors are encouraged to share this document with their school administrator. As models for band directors to take

advantage of, the document also includes curriculum guidelines as well as organization guidelines with reference among other matters to the extra-curricular organization of a band program.

Steve's desire to include the *RCM Preliminary Rudiments* as an integral part of his curriculum reveals the importance he places on learning the terminology or vocabulary of music. He explains:

The goal is to [to do] one [theory worksheet] every week or every two weeks. Sometimes that is not really realistic, but that is our goal. My goal is that at the end of Grade 8 that they have a lot of their Royal Conservatory requirements, that they have their preliminary rudiments level by the end of Grade 8…We kind of spread out the preliminary rudiments during the course over three years. We break it down between Grade 6 and 8. So at the end of Grade 8 they should know key signatures, intervals, major/minor scales, that sort of thing.

He feels that the IRPs (of the BC Music Education curriculum) lack a structured focus on theory. Besides worksheets, he also uses textbooks based on his experience as a piano instructor. "We use some textbooks, just because I have been teaching piano theory and piano for 12 years now." He explains his rationale behind the importance he places on music theory along with performance:

> Well my rationale, at least they have a good foundation of music theory and playing their instrument, regardless of what high school they go to. Some high schools, for example, do a lot of music theory and so they would be prepared for that. But if they went to a place [that places much importance on skills], their playing skill [would be] quite high, but they [may not do] music

theory. So at least they will have a good foundation to carry on wherever they are going to afterwards.

As Steve illustrates when explaining the importance of music theory to his program, “At the end of Grade 8 they should know key signatures, intervals, major/minor scales, that sort of thing.” Knowing these concepts includes being able to speak the language of music and being able to accurately describe, identify, and/or work with aspects of music, which is musical literacy. Neves (2007) defines musical literacy as “music awareness, music performance, music appreciation, and the decoding of music as a form of communication” (p. 3).

Lorraine describes how she includes theory into her instruction:

> I try to do 2 [formal theory lessons] a month, where I give everybody a piece of paper and I get the pencils out and we write things down. I give them a sheet of paper. And then I will do it every day too. Just throw random questions…What key is 2 flats? I do that kind of thing too. I find that some of the books that I use are really good for that, for reminding me. I don’t really like *Standards of Excellence*. It is not my favourite choice, but it is really good for theory. It is laid out really nicely at the top of pretty much every page. I find that good.

It can be a challenge for band directors to organize instruction to include theory the understanding of music beyond key signatures and the like.

For Lorraine, a guiding text is a poster designed by two well-respected music educators at her undergraduate university. It is professionally produced, colourful, and highly-detailed outlining what students should know after each year of instruction. The

poster also provides guidance regarding repertoire choices and concert dates. She explained that although the two seasoned music educators were primarily responsible for the poster, they had had in-depth consultations with local music educators when deciding what information would be included in the poster. She feels the IRPs do not offer the same guidance as the poster. Over time and practice, she has come to find working with the poster more useful and effective than the IRPs of the BC Music Education curriculum. She states:

> I used to refer to the IRP's all the time, but now I sort of know them, so I don't really worry about it. But yes, that covers all of them and what I learned in school. IRP's were talked about for 4 days in all my five years. I think that somebody gave me a CD of it. "Here are the IRPs" I don't worry about them too much.
>
> [The poster] explains what students should have learned by the time they get to the end of first year band, the end of second year band, end of third year band and so on. I find that is very useful. Some of it is a little outdated, like the literature is pretty outdated, but I ignore that and look for pieces that work. It has things like at the end of the first year, the students should learn how to play quarter notes, eighth notes, sixteenth, scales, those kinds of things. That is really what I go by. As a general plan, I guess that is basically my general plan.
>
> It even has how many concerts a year you should do, and what type of concerts, and where students should play. It addresses everything from how they should look to how they should behave to how they should play. I don't believe there was ever IRP or anything. That is just what I do.

The B.C. Music Curriculum is not vague as much as it is irrelevant to Lorraine and Juan. Lorraine describes having been briefly shown the document in her university course, but had little guidance as to how best to use it to guide instruction. Juan also does not rely on the B.C. Music Curriculum when planning instruction, although his reasons are different. His focus is more on developing a repertoire and he does not appear to focus on teaching music theory as Steve and Lorraine do. Being a more experienced educator, Juan has a curriculum that has evolved out of years of teaching students. He states:

> I guess it is in my head. I don't know what is going on until people show up and I won't know who the people are until I see them. In terms of class to class, if that is what you after, the Grade 6s are going through a . . . book that is pretty laid out. There are certain places that I want to be. I have to get my Christmas repertoire happening. I have got to get some tunes where it sounds like we are playing something by November. And my concert dates dictate where my planning is going to go for each portion of it. Grade 7s and 8s are working out of *I Recommend Book* and there is a certain number of scales and patterns that I want them to know for grade 7 and certainly what I want for grade 8. I don't write those down anymore. I know what I am trying to do.

His ease and confidence in doing his job, due to his long experience as an educator, is obvious when considering how he goes about planning his yearly curriculum. He does not know what is going to happen until students arrive. Therefore, he is comfortable planning quickly and changing plans as needed whereas the younger instructors feel more comfortable receiving greater detail in their guiding documents.

Music Selection

In addition to the sources of curriculum guidance, other texts central to coordinating the work of band instruction in music selection are the instructional materials relevant to repertoire and method.

Method books.

Band directors in B.C. are allowed professional flexibility in choosing instructional materials by the province. While it is suggested that repertoire and method books support the PLOs of the music curriculum, The B.C Ministry of Education suggests that selection of repertoire and method books is accomplished at the district rather than provincial level to accommodate local demographics and needs. The *Music 8-10 Integrated Resource Package* (1995) makes the following suggestions with regard to selecting instructional materials:

> Content, instructional design, technical content, and social considerations may be included in the decision-making process, along with a number of other criteria…The selection of learning resources should be an ongoing process to ensure a constant flow of new materials into the classroom. It is most effective as an exercise in group decision making, co-ordinated at the school, district, and ministry levels. (B-5)

Method books are the primary instructional materials used in band. They are used to teach specific skills. They are often laid out in a prescriptive manner, which directors use as a guide when organizing instruction. “My students [progress] systematically through the method book” a band director told Abramo (2008, p. 99). Method books are usually organized in a series of three: Book 1 for beginners (Grade 6), Book 2 for

intermediate players (Grade 7), and Book 3 for advanced players. Often, however, directors will stick with books 1 and 2 from a series then use a different method book for the more advanced players.

Popular method books include, *Accent on Achievement* (n.d.), John O'Reilly and Mark Williams—Alfred Publishing; *Band Today* (1985), James D. Ployhar—Alfred Publishing.; *Best in Class* (n.d.), Bruce Pearson—Kjos West Publishers; *The Comprehensive Music Instructor* (n.d.), James Froseth—GIA Publications; and *Standard of Excellence* (n.d.), Bruce Pearson—Kjos West Music, to name a few. Authors of these method books are typically band directors who may be retired or presently teaching. Publishing companies often sponsor clinics held by the authors of method books at music conferences at the provincial and national levels. These clinics provide an opportunity to market these publications - especially new ones - to music teachers.

Steve, Lorraine, and Juan talked over with me how they go about choosing method books and why they made the particular choices they did for their grade 8 bands. Juan chooses books that are technically challenging to his students. He wants a well-rounded series of exercises with which students can develop performance skills.

> The Standards of Excellence, Book 1 [for beginners] I think is really quite good. Book 2 wasn't adequate. I tried using it with the Grade 7s and there isn't enough technique development in for me. So that is why I use *I Recommend* which is studies. And you can work on all different kinds of things. It is really well laid out. You bounce around a lot in the book, but it is all there. Rhythm studies and Chorales and lip slurs and intervals, blah….Grade 7s and 8s are

working out of *I Recommend* and there is a certain number of scales and patterns that I want them to know for grade 7 and certainly what I want for grade 8.

Lorraine makes a professional judgment of the quality of a method book before using it in the classroom. She has a large music library with many method books from which she can choose:

> I have a whole room full [of method books]. I was really, really lucky. I walked in the door and there were method books from the 1960s to now. Everything from *Standard of Excellence* thing. Everything. I try to use them all… Method books are great. Some do some things and some do other things.

As can be seen, Lorraine, Steve, and Juan work diligently to choose method books that will provide the best education to their students. Is it engaging and does it provide enough technical development and challenge are two criteria these three band directors use to assess method books.

- Is it engaging?

Steve shared, "[Standard of Excellence, Book 3] was all technique that was really super really super repetitive and it didn't engage me long enough. So I figure it is probably completely lost to the kids."

- Does it provide enough technical development and challenge?

Juan said, "[*I Recommend*] has a certain number of scales and patterns that I want them to know for grade 7 and certainly what I want for grade 8."

Repertoire.

Methods of repertoire selection vary somewhat between the three band directors in this study. Method books teach skills that enable students to learn performance

repertoire, which in turn produces high-quality performances. Steve, Lorraine, and Juan work collegially to ascertain which repertoire is best for their program for the coming year. They attend reading clinics, which are events held where band directors come together and play various band selections. Being able to play the selection as well as listen gives them greater criteria with which to choose repertoire.

The work of collegially assessing and choosing instructional materials can also be seen at music conferences, where directors either attend workshops sponsored by music publishers, attend clinics featuring discussion of currently available instructional materials, or informally get together and share their experiences and evaluations of materials they have used in their instruction. Juan also decides on selections for his first concert in November by getting input from his advanced band students in the spring.

> For the advanced guys, I like to have a theme for that one. And it has to be Canadian music– Canadian folk songs and that kind of thing. Something that has come up, and we have been discussing it, is sort of a Hollywood night, and do some movie themes. So that might be cool for picking repertoire...It is something where we can decorate the facilities as well, and have a theme for our program. It is something exciting. They are going to put on a show, not just a band concert. There is a theme around it.

Lorraine selects music by listening to CDs of band repertoire. These CDs may be recordings of wind band repertoire played by highly-respected bands or marketing CDs released by music publishers.

> I get listening CDs from everywhere. I get more mail here than the office knows what do with. CDs. I try to listen to them all. My wife hates it. “I hate that music. Why do we have to listen to band music in car trips?” She isn’t a band

> person…When I hear something [at a concert] I go to that. Every concert I go to I keep the program, and I circle stuff. So I do that. That is how I plan my repertoire for next year.

Further, she explains, “I start looking at Music Canada site and I start talking to other people that left stuff to play next year.” She has had to work diligently on developing an understanding and knowledge of available repertoire for middle school bands:

> It seems every year that the repertoire gets easier. It was really, really tough the first couple of years, for me. They didn’t teach that at school at all, and the ones that I got there was never any sort of repertoire stuff. I didn’t have a list that I could go to.

The band directors I talked to described trying to choose music that is challenging and pedagogically appropriate for students. Band repertoire is graded according to difficulty from 1 – Very Easy to 6 – Very Hard. Lorraine, however, says, “I don’t really choose music on the grade that comes on the right hand corner. I choose music based on what it is going to teach the kids.” She continues:

> My Grade 6’s are playing at a Grade 1 level. And I have just given them 1.5...My Grade 8’s played a 2.5 this year, which is pretty good. The Grade 7’s they play at Level 2. I’m not happy with the Grade 7s right now. But they are working on it. Grade 7’s are really tough. They are really out there. Everything is changing in their life. They are awesome in Grade 8. Grade 7 is almost a useless year. That is what I find. It may be different in other places, but that is my personal opinion.

Steve shared the challenges he offers his students in terms of the grade level of music. “This year, my Grade 8’s are playing at a B300 level which in some districts is a Grade 10 level playing. But I think that was overreaching a little bit.”

All three directors avoid the common practice of placing better players in the more challenging parts. In this way, all students get the benefits of playing challenging music. Lorraine explains,

I haven’t really done the sectional stuff – the 1st player, 2nd player, I try and mix it up a little bit. I am leaning towards that. Especially my Grade 8 band now, getting them into sections. They are in sections, they sit in sections, but they just sit there. There is the section head and more of that kind of stuff, I have thought of doing that… Because it is just commonplace that they play a different part all the time, it is not something they even think about. I don’t know if that is a good thing or bad thing… I really want to avoid the “the best person in the band.” I don’t like that.

Juan shared:

> I didn’t want to have a first trumpet player, a second trumpet player and fourth trumpet player, deciding that persona at this age. I am handing out parts. I’m spreading it around the sections. There are some natural leaders in sections who will be pointing out stuff, and that is good, but I don’t assign them a label. Again the philosophy here is you don’t want to have a hierarchy, you want to encourage everybody to be as good as they can be…I think it is a challenge, no doubt about it. It is your turn to do that. Everybody has to do that. Everybody has to take their turn, and see how far you get. You are never going to be alone. There

is always going to be crowd. That is one of the safe things about making the groups large and happy.

Using text and documents in planning

When I sat down to interview Steve, he shared with me a binder of documents he organizes before the year begins and he adds to as the year progresses. He is well organized and seems to have all materials at hand. He also shared a reflective planning practice in which writing and written texts coordinate a team-planning process:

> I guess throughout the year, the year before, the teacher I team-teach with…we plan the whole year together. We take mental notes of what we need to change for the next year. Then the last two weeks of June, we actually have a rough idea and write it out what we want to do for next year,. . . dates, concert dates, festivals we want to participate in. What….[theory] sheets we need to fix up and what didn't work, and what did work...Then the last week of August, that is when we also get together and just plan everything out. But mostly it is those two periods. The last two weeks of June and the last week of August, first week of September.

I asked him how he assessed what worked and what did not:

> Well if we were happy with the outcome and if we didn't find it too draining on us, if the kids really enjoyed it, and if the parents really enjoyed it. I guess that is it. . . .And we ask kids too. Every excursion we go on, or trip or festival, what did you like, what didn't you like. What would you like to do different? So we ask them every time after we have a trip.

Lorraine makes mental notes of changes she would like to change for the coming year as the present year progresses. “Throughout the year, I look at things that I might want to do next year. I have this big calendar on my desk that I mark things down on to plan for the next year, by using the old calendar.”

Juan, however, makes little if any use of texts in his planning process. He plans and carries out his instruction based on his experience as a veteran music educator. He says, “I know what I am trying to do.” He has been teaching for approximately twenty years and has a very casual approach to how he manages his program. When I met him for our interview, he was working in his office. His dress is casual as is his manner of conversation. In working with Juan to schedule an interview, he just asked for a phone call the day before to ensure he would be around school the next day. When we started our interview, we were interrupted by an announcement requesting him and other leader-teachers to the office for a meeting. He just shook off the interruption, apologized and asked if I would come back the next day. In our next meeting for our interview, he shared how he plans for the coming year. Thanks to a number of years teaching band, he does most of his planning in his head. He described his planning process:

> In the springtime, with the band students that are going to be coming back, we will do some kind of a tour, we will have some team meetings on that tour to discuss projects that we would like to do for the following. That includes the kinds of programs we might to do. I will play them some samples of some music or suggest some themes and that kind of thing, and we will decide on what kinds of programs we want to do. And then we will plan something for the springtime, something that will be fun. Whether that would be a festival involvement, or

whether we would be involved in more of an expensive fun trip to a place that we would like to go. Sort of like dreaming sessions with the kids and see what some of the things are that they would like to do.

At the same time, of course, he has to work with a calendar:

> We will take a calendar. Like next week I have to plan the concert dates for next year and our travel dates, because the school calendar wants to come out. I buy the repertoire and usually organize my filing cabinet, so that the repertoire that I am going to be doing for the year, is in my current filing cabinet.

And his planning has to keep track of the budget provided by the school:

> My school budget has to be spent by the end of June of this year, this calendar year. So I have to make sure that I am down to zero. If I need to get any replacement supplies, reed and stuff for the fall, I usually like to start spending my budget early. So when I do my reading clinics the summer time, I will say "I need early money." That is how I do it that way. So that is planning.

Pressures of public performances are incorporated into how these directors plan instruction for the coming year. All three directors discussed the process of scheduling performances and trips. This is not a conscious disregard for other aspects of music instruction. Rather this reflects the taken-for-granted placement of performance above other learning objectives when planning and carrying out instruction.

Many of the PLOs in the B.C. Music Curriculum support other aspects of music instruction such as composition. Composition can be easily addressed in a jazz program. Improvisation requires the player to create melodies spontaneously. This is because of the nature of jazz itself and the fact that jazz bands are smaller ensembles, which allow

for more creative work between director and students. Through jazz improvisation instruction, students learn to listen to harmonic progressions and create melodies that follow principles of rhythmic and melodic design. Ultimately, students learn to create and play melodies that incorporate the rhythmic and/or melodic aspects of the jazz chart as well as expressive qualities often found in written literature such as building to a climax and/or tension and release, to name a few. Improvisation is the act of creating and performing music in real-time.

Improvisation is a great activity that students really enjoy, when given a safe place to explore their music ideas. Aside from the musical experience of improvisation, jazz musicians enjoy a closer connection to both their immediate co-band members and the jazz community at large. Berliner (1994) describes jazz musicians and how they acquire improvisation skills. It is through working and communication with a constantly changing community of musicians.

Students also listen to quite a bit of music in a jazz setting. In his jazz combo, Juan has students listen to various recordings of jazz standards:

> I have tunes that they can listen to and I will transcribe things if they want to. I have material. I taught jazz combo stuff for many at [my previous school] so I have a huge library of stuff, suggestions and records and stuff.

Jazz was originally a strictly aural art form. Early jazz performers played by ear and songs were passed on aurally rather than in written form. In fact, it is only in recent decades notation was used to share jazz tunes. Many of today's school jazz combos continue to follow in the original footsteps of jazz in that much of the material is learned by ear or transcribed from recordings.

Steve shared how he worked with his jazz combo to create an interesting version of a traditional jazz tune. “Our piano player, his piano teacher made an arrangement for Killer Joe that we are doing, which we turned into a Samba. You should hear it…It is really cool. They really liked it at festival.” This aptly illustrates the opportunities to creatively explore music and performance in a jazz band or jazz combo setting.

I was able to watch Steve work with his jazz band. The group meets at 7:45 AM, two days a week. Students who choose to be in this group are obviously quite dedicated to learning jazz. The atmosphere is very relaxed as students begin setting up. Students trickle in as Steve prepares for rehearsal by helping the bass player and drummer set up. He allows the rehearsal to start a bit late as arriving for such an early start time is a challenge for many students. The rehearsal progresses differently from the band class I saw Steve teach. His work with the students is more intimate in nature as the group is small, numbering approximately 10-15. He spends a bit more time at the rear of the group, to keep the bass players and drummer focused on rehearsal. They are excited about playing the music, but also a bit chatty. He also plays piano for the group until the piano player arrives approximately 20 minutes into rehearsal. The piano player is amazing. He has been studying privately for several years and is impressive in his playing skills and understanding of the genre. However, not all students are afforded the opportunity to participate in the extra opportunities, such as jazz band, offered to band students.

Students are expected to “evaluate choices of the elements of expression used in their compositions” (B.C. Ministry of Education, 1998, p. A-27). Band directors work diligently with students to develop self-evaluative skills, which can be used to refine

improvised melodies and general performance. However, considering the structure of many band classes, including to some extent jazz band, the director is often the one evaluating student/band performance—leaving little chance for meeting this PLO in most instances. The Ministry encourages providing students a safe place to *explore* music. “Much of the daily work in fine arts education should emphasize the process of evaluation. To enable students to move beyond the familiar and safe, teachers need to ensure that these explorations are valued as much as public performances” (1998, p. D-5). The very inclusion of this statement speaks to the understanding by those who wrote this document of the emphasis placed on public performances.

Conclusion

In this chapter I discussed the various forms of curriculum documents used by the directors in this study. None of the directors refer to the official Ministry of Education Curriculum and the reasons for this vary. Steve feels that the document is too vague to be helpful to him in planning and carrying out instruction, and would rather use the *Royal Conservatory Rudiments* (2000). Lorraine does not think she received enough guidance in her undergraduate training to adequately work with the document and instead refers to a poster created by two local university music educators. Juan has enough experience in the field that he does not feel a need to refer a curriculum document when planning instruction.

The official curriculum document of the B.C. Ministry of Education is purposely fluid in organization. That is to allow directors to use their professional expertise to work with the document. While some directors may appreciate the seeming vagueness of the Ministry’s curriculum, other may feel uncomfortable without a more prescriptive guide.

We further explored how each director selected method books and performance repertoire. Each director chose method books and repertoire for their challenge to students and the potential for maintaining student interest and motivation. Two of the three directors in this study incorporate theory into their instruction. One director uses a method book that includes a quality theory component. The other director uses a separate theory curriculum.

Finally, I outlined the work the band directors in this study did to plan for the coming year. All three directors tentatively scheduled performances using a calendar as the first step. One of the reasons this initial step was taken was to ensure performance/travel dates were reserved on the school calendar, to avoid conflicts with other school events. As can be seen in this chapter, Juan, Lorraine, and Steve thoughtfully plan instruction and select materials, although they may approach the steps from a different view of music education.

Chapter Five - The Performance Effect

This chapter explores the way directors conduct their work in performance-based programs. The manner in which band directors deliver instruction and administer their programs is an individual matter. Some directors create programs and instruction that is prescriptive in nature; others may deliver instruction in a much more student-centred format, where the director acts more as a guide than the sole expert. It can be scary to allow students to creatively explore music and work out problems on their own.

While there are PLOs which suggest working with standard and invented notation to create compositions, working with invented notation is a rarity in a band class. Rather, focus is placed on reading standard notation almost from the very beginning of band instruction. Juan, for example, presents concerts as early as November—even for his beginner band students. “Our first concert in November, it is really early for the beginning guys, but it is a goal that they have to work towards, so it helps to establish practice routines.” To read the repertoire, students must quickly learn to read notation. Indeed, this is what propels students to establish a practice routine and catch on to reading music and playing their instruments quickly. He explains to his students, “We have a concert that we are actually going to perform so you have to get on with it”.

Another PLO under the heading “Thoughts, Images, and Feelings” is, “use the elements of rhythm, melody, and expression to interpret a range of thoughts, images, and feelings in performance repertoire” (B.C. Ministry of Education, 1998, p. A-27). This PLO is met by all the participants in this study, but it is met in a modeling sense rather than in any way where students actually enjoy the experience of interpreting a piece of music individually or in a group. The director interprets the music and with regard to

rhythm, melody, and expression. While modeling is an excellent mode of instruction, the creative aspects of performing music are absent. The exercise is about skill development and not an opportunity for exploration. Performing solo or small ensemble material provides students with the opportunity to interpret music and perform those interpretations.

Several PLOs address audience and performer etiquette as well as being responsible to a group. As would be expected, a band rehearsal is a logical place to learn these PLOs. Each director in this study emphasizes performance etiquette and the importance of respecting other performers and performing groups. Steve explains,

> They know that is what is happening. We explain to them. This is a concert, this is what we need to do. We are going to practice performing aspect. You are sitting in front of the audience and how you act…

Lorraine said, "…when we go somewhere, we have got to look good, and we represent Mount Genoa Middle School and all that kind of stuff." She went on,

> The first year I was here, I would be putting on a concert and some kid would be talking on a cell phone in the front row. After that song was over, I reminded the whole crowd.
>
> It was totally alien for me. I had never talked about this stuff. It wasn't just a kid, it was parents, all kinds of people who didn't know [proper concert etiquette]. And people were leaving and coming back and the door slamming while we were trying to give this concert."

Juan seemed to focus a little more on concert etiquette, saying,

> Unified presentation. It has a huge impact on the audience. We reinforce [good stage etiquette]. This is the way it is done…They don't know [performance etiquette] in the beginning…You have to educate the parents as well. You can't come and go during rehearsal or concert. You are there until it is over. There will some parents who would grab their kids and take them out. That is not the way we do it...I sent home letters [re: performance etiquette].

He continues:

> This is a performance. You are performing from the time that you arrive at the school and until you are no longer at the school. So your deportment, your demeanor, your manners and everything are on display. People are looking at you. Because you are performers, you are in a different light. You need to be aware of that.

Each director has expectations of his or her students that reflect a focus on the PLO that states "demonstrate responsibility to themselves and the group while experiencing music" (B.C. Ministry of Education, 1998, p. 154). This can be seen in how the directors expect students to behave in rehearsals to how they deal with students forgetting instruments or missing rehearsals and how much they expect them to practice. Steve says,

> [We discuss rehearsal etiquette] every rehearsal. "Don't talk." Every three seconds, I have to ask them, "Don't talk, please stop talking. Don't talk." But they try. And they sit there. They try. They sit there for a good 5 seconds. Then all of a sudden they will turn. Their attention span is so short at this time of their life.

When discussing rehearsal etiquette, Juan focuses on teaching students the band room is as much a workroom as their other classrooms.

> A classroom is a classroom. I have to bring them into my class when they get here. That is one of the weird things with a middle school, this is an introduction of constantly going from teacher to teacher. They have their little thing at the beginning. It is a little loud and raucous. Then we get to know them a little bit, then we do warm up stuff, which sets the tone right away, now we are down to work.
>
> It takes them a long time to figure out, that my working area is down there…so just getting them to understand that this is another working area. It takes them a while.

All three directors also expect students to have their materials each day, for class. By meeting this responsibility, the students not only make it easier for the director to rehearse music but they also support their fellow band members in preparing strong performances through good cohesion in terms of group playing. Steve explains how he deals with students who forget their instrument for class:

> If it is one of those times that they just forgot, and it doesn't happen very often, and if it is an instrument that we have, then we ask them to finger along, or let them grab my saxophone. They wouldn't play it but they would finger along with the music, so at least they are doing something.
>
> Sometimes it is a habit and they always forget, so we give them a warning, the first time. The second time, we have them go to the opportunity room and call home.

> The same kids don't bring their instrument. They call home. We don't want to bombard the detention room, so we have them sit there, read a music text book, and write an essay. And then they have to hand that in and we quiz them on what they wrote out. So they are not just copying, they are trying to learn something.

Lorraine's approach is a bit different in that students are not provided with an instrument.

> I mean you phone home, email [the parents of students that don't bring materials to class], can I help you. Sometimes I just have an extra horn, extra music for them here.
>
> I try not to do [loan instruments or music], [unless it is] an extreme case. I have only done that once. I don't know if it helped anything. Because I think it doesn't teach them anything. I am not doing them a favour. I am just making things easier for them. I know they have challenges, but they have to get through those challenges too, right. That is the way I look at it.

She continues,

> I have [students who don't have their materials or are disrupting the rehearsal] go sort music. [They will ask] "Why?" I will answer, "You don't have it together, or you didn't bring your thing, or you are being a jerk."
>
> Juan has a plan in place for students who forget their instrument and/or lose their music.
>
> Students who forget instruments and lose music we do have a fine program. We charge them 25 cents for another piece of music and 25 cents to rent an

> instrument. They will put a little IOU or a quarter in our peanut butter jar [when they need a new piece of music] and we will do a 50/50 draw at the end of the year…They are always going to have an instrument in their hands when they are in there, but they will have one of the school instruments to do the fingerings or whatever.

If a student does not bring other materials necessary for contribution to a band practice, such as reeds or valve oil, Steve holds them solely responsible. “I don’t have reeds because they should be responsible for their own equipment. I am not a music store to sell it to them.” Juan’s approach to dealing with students who do not bring materials such as reeds or valve oil is to offer those materials to the student.

> I just give [reeds] to them, and tell them to replace it. When you get to the store and you buy your reeds, make sure you bring your reed back. The valve oil don’t worry about it. Make sure you have your own valve oil. I’ll help out when you are in trouble.

Attending rehearsal is a crucial part of preparing performances. Along with the importance of learning individual skills on an instrument and the importance of meeting the PLOs that address responsibility, students must learn to play together to produce an aesthetically pleasing sound and solid performance from a rhythmic, melodic, and expressive standpoint. Steve says that when students have not attended a rehearsal:

> We hunted them down. And we asked them to come. Or we emailed the home to remind them. Or, we have a newsletter that goes home, reminding parents that yes, we still have morning and after school rehearsals at this time, and attendance right now is very low, so we would appreciate your cooperation.

Sometimes missed attendance for a class is justified and directors must work with students rather than handing down consequences for not attending a rehearsal. The following excerpt from my interview with Steve shows how he works with coaches and/or directors of other programs to ensure students enjoy a wide range of opportunities in addition to band. He explains:

> A lot of the before and after school stuff, the kids are really involved, especially these music kids. They are in track, basketball, because this is a middle school, we want them to have the experience of everything that they possibly can, so what we do is that we have a deal with the coach in that if they have two conflicting rehearsal times with practicing times, we ask them to go one rehearsal for one day, and the other day go to the basketball practice.

Juan tries to work with students who cannot attend early morning rehearsals and need assistance in getting to school:

> We have students who sometimes have a problem getting in. I have offered to pick students up. I have picked students up in the morning on my way in. The parents appreciate that. There are days that they can't get them in. It is a little bit more difficult at this level.

Another PLO suggests using "established criteria to analyse the work of self and others" (B.C. Ministry of Education, 1998, p. A-29). Steve supports this PLO by using recordings of band rehearsals to give his students the opportunity to evaluate their current level of performance. He explains, "We play [rehearsal recordings] back for them after. And then we assess, re-assess, what went wrong, what didn't go well, what can be changed, how they can change it." This is an oft-used form of self-evaluation with band

groups. Using various guided techniques such as old adjudicator forms, students have the chance to listen to their performances or rehearsals and evaluate them based on a prescribed list of criteria.

The Ministry emphasizes the importance of teaching about the historical and cultural contexts of repertoire. Juan supports these PLOs through his insistence on using music by Canadian composers, "[We hold yearly concerts with a theme that] have to be done by Canadian music composers– Canadian folk songs and that kind of thing." Band directors are expected to identify music selections that are written for specific purposes. This PLO is easily addressed in band rehearsals in that students often perform music that has been written for specific purposes such as commemorations of battles or dedications of buildings.

Instructing

I had the opportunity to observe all three band directors over the span of several visits. Upon entering Steve's, Juan's, and Lorraine's classroom, I saw the common set up for a band room: The podium was located at the front of the room, providing the director with a raised platform from which to teach. Chairs and stands are arranged in a semi-circle around the podium so all students can see the director as he or she conducts. Items necessary for instruction are arranged at the front of the class. Those items range from instruments, materials such as reeds and valve oil, music and/or method books, as well as theory worksheets.

In one of Steve's classes, the order of class was written on the board before students arrived. He has set up a structure with his students, so they come into class and have a preparation routine that helps them to focus for the class,

> Usually when the kids come in, they set up their instrument and they are warming up and we have tuners. Some have their own tuners and they tune it after they have blown warm air. Sometimes you hear them practicing. But if you get that random blasting, then I will pull them aside and talk very sternly to them…The Grade 6s, because they don't have such control over their sound yet, we don't say anything, they just all of a sudden start doing it on their own.

The rehearsal began with a warm-up, which started with long tones. Warm-ups are typically the exercises played at the beginning of a class. Through a warm-up, students prepare embouchure, finger, and postural muscles for performing on their instruments. After the warm-up, Steve had the students play a scale—which was related to the repertoire to be rehearsed that day—using rhythmic patterns written on the board. This process of warm-up was obviously one the students were accustomed to as they easily moved from one exercise to another. After the exercises, the band students worked out of their method book. As students worked through material in the method book, Steve moved about the class. By moving around the room, Steve is able to work with individual students on developing the skills to be reviewed and/or learned that day. He uses a wireless microphone and a speaker at the front of the band room enables him to work with the group from any location without having to shout from the rear of the band. After working on method book material, the students began working on repertoire. Students received constant feedback. "Consistent feedback is particularly important to the successful development of the knowledge, skills, and positive and enthusiastic attitudes that will enable students' lifelong involvement in the fine arts" (B.C. Ministry, 1998, p. D-5).

During my observation, I was able to see how Steve works with designated students. He works patiently with the designated student who appears to be struggling in the class I am observing:

> Well we do the best we can. We try to pair them up with somebody who is more focused and that they get along with, but sometimes that just doesn't work. We also offer extra help time, if they want to come in during their advisory period, or at lunch, or after school. We ask them to come to get some extra help. Sometimes they just don't show up, so that is hard to do. Sometimes some of the kids, band isn't their thing, and you have to respect that. It is not for everybody.

Lorraine is also working with designated students. She discussed with me a particularly difficult situation she encountered when working with a student with severe special needs. Here is her story:

> I had one kid that joined band that was designations galore. He worked for a year and a bit and tried really hard, but he couldn't even keep the slide on the trombone, he was so out of it. Intensive behaviour disorder, ADHD, diabetic, so big highs, big lows. Couldn't sit in a chair or couldn't keep his eyes open. One or the other, like really really bad. He actually didn't make it in a regular classroom. They pulled him out after the first year.
>
> He actually came just for private lessons for me, just to have some sort of working relationship with it…We tried really hard. In the end his mom saw the writing on the wall, and said it wasn't going to work.

> Now he is in a special classroom, across town. It wasn't that I said, you can't be in band anymore, between mom and I was realized that this probably wasn't the thing that was going to change his life and make him a better person. He wanted to stay, he really did. He even saw that he should be working on other stuff before he was working on an instrument.

Lorraine worked closely with the mother of this student throughout his attempt to be in the band. It can be safely assumed that the decision to remove the student was a joint one.

Juan's instruction works with students in a way that recognizes their age and perhaps different level of dedication to his. He explains,

> They are not little machines, they are little people. If they had a good day you will get some positive stuff. If they had a bad day, you will get some negative stuff. You have to get everybody on your page. All in that short period of time.

It was clear that two students were designated when observing one of his classes. This was confirmed through discussions with Juan after class. One young woman was especially enthused about band class and often spoke out-of-turn, interrupting Juan. Also, she distracted students by attempting to help other students. Juan's method of dealing with her was to patiently redirect her focus to the lesson. In another class, Juan had a young man that had great difficulty paying attention. This resulted in him moving about the room for most of the class. Juan attempted to direct the young man back to where he should have been for class, which was in the percussion section. For most of the class, Juan allowed the young man to move about the room as it did not seem to be very distracting to the other students.

After the traditional warm-up activities and method book exercises, Juan began the process of rehearsing performance repertoire. Like the other directors, he has expectations of how a piece should be played and he hones the band's performance to meet those expectations. I spoke with Juan after this class to find out more about these students and his method of working with them. He explained that he lets those students participate in ways that work for them. Juan does sometimes grow impatient with the young man who moves about the room during instruction, prompting him to send that student out of class and asking him not to return until he can stay in his place a bit more. However, he most often works patiently with challenging students and maintains focus on what he believes is his primary task: to teach students about music in a way that encourages a love for music.

It is clear that all three directors have a strong appreciation of their responsibility to teach music to children and to grant each student the opportunity to participate in band. While the literature reports that band directors often do not feel adequately prepared to work with designated students, Juan, Lorraine, and Steve have worked hard to develop effective strategies for working with such students. When decisions have to be made that involve removing a student from band due to problems faced by a designated student, they do not make these decisions lightly.

Conclusion

In this chapter I discussed how band directors do their work as the leaders of performance-based programs. It is clear that there is no way of teaching that can be generalized to the overall population of any teaching group. However, it is not unusual to find some commonalities between various cases. Some directors may schedule beginning

band concerts early in the fall, after students have only been playing their instruments for a matter of months. The reasons for this may range from wanting to show parents the good work the students have been doing to motivating students to quickly learn to play their instruments. Juan believes that having a beginning band concert in November, after students have start playing their instruments in September, is a motivational endeavour. He reminds them as they work of the upcoming concert.

Concerts also offer the opportunity to work on the proper concert etiquette expected of performers and audiences in large group concerts in the Western Art Music tradition. All three directors in this study place much emphasis on performance etiquette in their instruction. Additionally, they address the audience and make specific requests at concerts. Juan, Steve, and Lorraine emphasized the importance of remaining seated and quiet when a group is performing. They ask that, should an audience member need to leave the performance venue, they do so in-between pieces. Lorraine also included some discussion of the need for silence from the audience during a performance.

Lorraine, Steve, and Juan deal with common problems, which can hinder performances and ensuring students receive a quality music education. Problems such as having all materials for class are not unique to band directors. Each director deals with it differently, but all three want the best for their students and that requires the student to be responsible for the process in a band class by having all necessary materials.

Finally, I explored how these band directors handle teaching designated students. Steve and Lorraine spoke of how they work very hard to help students who struggle. They want those students to stay and succeed, but sometimes, as Lorraine explained, a

decision must be made to remove a student from the band program. Steve commented that there is only so much time she can devote to designated students.

The effects of performance are evident in the work of the band director. All three directors direct their instruction toward a skills-based approach. However, some other aspects of music education such as the cultural traditions of Western European Art Music are also included in their instruction. Steve, Lorraine, and Juan devote much time to all of their students. But, in the end, the elective nature of some courses such as band enable some band directors—depending on the situation and expectations of school officials—to make decisions that remove students from the band program.

Chapter Six - Music Education and Performance

Performance-based music classes such as band are intended to give students the opportunity to develop as musicians and enjoy performing before an audience. Band directors who instruct such classes are trained to effectively rehearse performing groups, manage overall music programs, and organize their instruction to assist the students in producing the best performance possible. As we have seen, directors work diligently to cultivate bands that produce outstanding performances. During the preparation process for a performance one of the directors in this study confessed to letting go of the educational aspects of their work and subsequently focusing exclusively on the performance.

The Festival Movement

In the early days of music education in British Columbia, grade 8 students were required to pass a provincial exam in order to move up to high school. Music was not an examination subject, which meant that music instructors had to achieve success at competitive festivals to prove their worth in the school curriculum (Green & Vogan, 1991). School “inspectors congratulated winning schools in their reports and even noted the names of the successful teachers” (p. 188). The following material explores the festival experience for middle school bands.

In the earlier years of the music education profession, festivals and contests were basically not differentiated (Hamann et al, 1990; Mercer, 1972; Miller, 1994). The terms were used interchangeably. Festivals are now distinguished from contests in that contests are structured in a competitive format while festivals are intended to be non-competitive experiences for bands. In a contest format, a panel of adjudicators score band

performances and rank the bands in order of performance quality, often awarding first, second or third place. Larue (1986) defines contests as “organized events in which the participants, groups or individuals, are adjudicated or evaluated and ratings are given. These ratings might be ‘Superior’ or ‘Division I’, trophies or cash awards for placing in class or designations such as ‘Best of Class’ or ‘Grand Champion’" (p. 5).

In a festival format, adjudicators assign ratings for performances but do not place bands in an order of performance excellence. However, bands are evaluated but on the basis of a standardized adjudication form rather than in comparison to other bands. The concert band festival provides us with a “workable model of performance-based assessment that combines both quantitative and qualitative elements” (Miller & Coen, 1994, p. 13). The primary purpose of a festival is to offer educational opportunities to bands through receiving comments about their performances.

Non-competitive festivals feature a rubric for the adjudicator’s form. The rubric for Band Fest in Victoria, British Columbia provides the adjudicators with three major areas to attend to when listening and evaluating a band (Edwards, 2004). Within those three areas, the rubric contains a series of descriptors from which adjudicators can choose when evaluating a band’s performance. The purpose of this rubric is to provide a standardized process for evaluating bands that perform. It was hoped that this standardization would resolve any problems with lack of consistency due to varieties of attitudes and experiences of the adjudicators (Edwards, 2004).

Early Festivals

As early as 1914, a competitive festival was held in Vancouver, British Columbia (Green & Vogan, 1991). While other parts of B.C. did not embrace the competitive

festival movement until several years later, this festival provided impetus for other provinces to begin introducing both competitive and non-competitive festivals. While the western competition-festival movement was quite popular, there were those who grew concerned about the influence of competition on education within band programs.

In the late 1930s, the B.C. Department of Education suggested removing marks for festival performances, placing more of a focus on the educational aspects of performing (Green & Vogan, 1991). This suggestion was met with resistance due to the perceived benefits of improved motivation when performing competitively. Additionally, directors felt quite strongly that high marks earned at a festival could further solidify a band's place in the community and school by winning the approval of school/district administrators as well as parents and community members:

> [Ontario Provincial Music Director, 1935-59] G. Roy Fenwick used festivals as a means of stimulating music instruction in the rural districts. In pamphlets circulated by the Music Branch, he not only gave instructions for organizing festivals but also presented arguments in favour of competitive and non-competitive types. Fenwick revealed his own preference when he suggested that 'a non-competitive festival is about as exciting as a non-competitive baseball game'. (Green & Vogan, 1991, p. 250)

Those who were opposed to competitive festivals expressed concern that emphasis on competition "ultimately recognized the prowess of the teacher rather than the needs of the student" (Green & Vogan, 1991, p. 249). Indeed festival performances may be followed by invitations to larger, more elite festivals (Hamann et al, 1990; Miller, 1994) –the very foundation of hierarchy within the band directing community.

Beginning with these early competitive festivals and continuing to today, contests and the notion of competition as a motivator for concert bands has been brought into question by music educators (Schouten et al, 1983; Mercer, 1972). Music educators in favour of the contest format have written of its virtues.

> They provided publicity for the school band and motivation for students and helped achieve a standardized instrumentation. They offered a means of critical evaluation and constructive criticism that fostered growth in students and their teachers. They helped weed out inefficient teachers, and they encouraged composers and publishers to produce higher quality band literature. (Schouten et al, 1983, p. 28)

In 1938, the contest format was changed to a competition-festival format in order to have a more educational focus.

> A rating (rather than a ranking) system was instituted, allowing all the bands the opportunity to win with an exemplary performance. Sightreading was included to encourage groups to work on fundamentals throughout the year rather than exclusively drill the contest music. (Schouten et al, 1983, p. 29)

This was seen as a "natural development, as it brought into play the larger aspect of groups coming together in a festive manner to share the experience of music, while yet retaining the competitive factor which so many felt was a necessary stimulant to participation—and preparation" (p. 20).

Changing from a contest to a festival format was intended to remove the competitive element from the performance experience and enable directors and students to develop musically, without focusing on winning a contest (Edwards, 2004). An

educational dimension is introduced by making clinicians available to work with individual bands on key issues identified during a band's performance. Even with the change in festival format from competitive to non-competitive, the level of their ratings remains consequential for directors. According to the directors in this study, the ratings earned are readily available to others. Earning a low rating from an adjudicator does not serve a band director's general reputation whereas, of course, a high rating is something to be broadcast. My own experience as a band director at band festivals suggests that there are unwritten codes of communication and conclusions drawn by the band directing community. There are directors who prefer comments only, which would mean that performances would not be rated. This would remove any aspect of competition from the festival experience. However so long as this is not a general rule an individual director who goes for comments only is in itself an informal indicator of ranking. Either he or she is such a strong director that a rating is irrelevant or so weak that a rating would be embarrassing and would most likely negatively affect the band director's reputation.

Considering the historical development of the festival format—from contests to competition-festivals to festivals—it is obvious that festivals remain unwritten competitive experiences for band directors and bands. Stress is placed on the director to ensure the band he or she is conducting presents a performance worthy of a Superior or Excellent rating (Temple, 1973). Ultimately, the pressure is passed on to the students in that they are the performers on which the band director's reputation depends.

The festival experience—with the high ratings for which everyone works—can be likened to the importance placed on standardized tests held in schools each year. While the students are the test takers, it is the teachers and principals that come under

public scrutiny for either high scores or middle to low scores. The pressures the teachers and principals feel about the results of the standardized tests are passed on to the students. As two of the three directors explained in this study, earning an invitation to a larger, more prestigious festival such as MusicFest Canada, is an achievement of which a director can be proud. Steve explains this invitation as a goal he strives for each year.

> So we do the regional festivals, and my goal for them is to try and get a superior mark at whatever level they enter in, and get their invitation to nationals…Whether we go [to nationals] or not, but at least then I know where they stand, and they get some feedback from an adjudicator [at a festival]. And they get the experience of getting adjudication and performing at a good venue.

It is a great honour to earn an invitation to perform at MusicFest Canada. According to Juan, "There are going to be sixty groups performing at the regional festival and they will have fifteen recommendations to national—based on your grades and based on the recommendations from the adjudicators."

In B.C., festivals are conducted using a format featuring a panel of adjudicators. The adjudicators offer comments in a tape recorded fashion as well as a comments/ratings form. Often, very few comments are written. The majority are recorded. Each band is given a rating out of four: I – Superior, II – Excellent, III – Good, IV – Poor. Bands are invited to the prestigious MusicFest Canada based on earned ratings at choice local festivals.

MusicFest Canada (2008) is a national festival that features instrumental, choral, and jazz ensembles. Bands perform at affiliate festivals throughout Canada to earn invitations to MusicFest Canada based on their ratings. If a band cannot perform at an

affiliate festival, they may submit an audition tape. Even though festivals are non-competitive in format in that there are no awards given for a performance or placement according to performance quality, the goal of earning an invitation to MusicFest Canada out of a large pool of performing groups creates a competitive element to the festival experience. That is, bands are competing for invitations by performing at non-competitive festivals. Further, the opportunity to submit an audition tape for bands that cannot attend an affiliate festival also emphasizes the competitive nature of the process of earning an invitation to MusicFest Canada. Similarly at MusicFest Canada, scholarships and awards are given for outstanding performances. Additionally, "Participants are invited to audition for certain scholarships and bursaries" (MusicFest Canada, 2008, n.p.). As has been stated, much of a band director's reputation is dependent on earned awards or marks at contests and ratings at festivals. As such, and their careers can be either helped or hindered by those reputations. Raybauld and Feldpausch (2008) suggest that "when your group gets a superior rating at the state festival, don't just tell your principal. Tell your music supervisor, your division superintendent and the school board" (p. 61). The authors suggest this because these are the people who "ultimately control your fate and the fate of the program" (p. 61). This illustrates the pressures still facing band directors, even with the competitive aspects of awards at contests removed.

Indeed, the reputation that comes with providing high quality performances over high quality music education can be witnessed in the local school district. The three directors included in this study are well-respected for their outstanding public performances. They are the directors invited to present clinics, lectures, organize band

events, and the like. However, there are band directors in this district who work with students who face life challenges that sometimes hinder their performance in a band class. Perhaps they cannot afford to have materials for class or their instrument needs repair but their parents cannot afford to have it repaired. These students need support and understanding and their band directors provide it to them. But, because of these outside difficulties, sometimes performances suffer. Because these music educators are not able to regularly churn out high quality performances, it is assumed they are not effective at their job.

Band directors who work in economically disadvantaged schools, who struggle to come up with the outstanding public performance because half of their clarinet section cannot get their instruments repaired may indeed be outstanding educators. They may be providing a caring, supportive, and quality music education for their students but they are unlikely to be invited to conduct guest clinics or honour bands.

Recent literature discusses the negative aspects of music competition on middle school students.

> At this age, children are going through tremendous emotional stress, and competition is emphasized in everything. It can be a shattering experience to not come in first in a contest, no matter how trivial a contest it might be, and can cause the child to drop music and permanently have a sour taste in his or her mouth regarding music. (Schouten et al, 1983, p. 29)

The authors also point out that the intrinsic value of music as an art form is lost when competition becomes the main focus of a band program.

Perhaps as a result of a developing music education literature that discussed the negative effects of competition on musical performance and student experience, music educators began to move toward the notion of focusing on musicianship, fostering a love of music, and the benefits of performance in and of itself rather than earning awards in competitions. However, the change to a purely festival format took decades to take hold. It has been hoped that changing to a festival format would remove the competitive element from this performance experience and would enable directors and students to develop musically, without focusing on winning a contest. However, D.—a band festival adjudicator I interviewed for a previous study—remarked about the importance of the festival rating.

> Well you hope….it would be the primary achievement of the year. Pearls of wisdom had…..befallen this ensemble [laughter] from above, but. . . it-it again depends on the group-if they worked on three or four pieces since last October, for the festival, then…it probably will mean a great deal to them. . .whether it's been of educational worth or not is-is another question of course. But, I would think just as people, teachers, vary from person to person I think their attitude of the amount of that's put on them will definitely vary. . .They might not value festivals particularly at all, … they might feel that, judgments, even though it's non-competitive, shouldn't be made on a single performance, when perhaps some of the best players are away at a volleyball tournament. and all of those factors would either lessen or just give the value of the festival less. (Edwards, 2004, Appendix B: 415-27)

It should also be noted that music educators may be required to provide reasons their programs should continue to receive funding by local school districts. These reasons may be supported by outstanding performances—both at contests and around the community—which have brought positive attention to the school and school system (Elliott, 1983).

Performances are often the only method of evaluation used to assess the quality of a band director's work. It is almost like a band is a sports team. Many consider teams that win are coached by good coaches and teams that lose are not. Regardless of difficulties faced by the coaches in terms of parental support or having players who can afford the best equipment, when the team wins or loses the focus settles on the coach. The same can be said for the band director. Public performances and festivals are the bands games. These events are where bands earn their reputation. Solid work done in the classroom that does not always culminate in a good performance is not visible to those to judge.

The world of band directors is a competitive one. As musicians, we are indoctrinated in the culture of competition—for scholarships, placement in honour bands, and entry into schools of music. We cannot help but carry that sense of competition into our professional lives as teachers. All three band directors included in this study revealed a true love of music and children. They were dedicated to helping students come to know and love music as they do.

Performance is the most enjoyable part of music for most band directors. Lorraine, Steve, and Juan believe that students join band to perform music. However, due to the historic and continued emphasis on performance excellence placed on band

directors, goals to teach more than performance are often unattainable. The historical need for bands to prove their worth in the school system through providing musical entertainment to the school and community, as well as to bring esteem to the school through the earning of awards and the like, continues to permeate the work of the band director. This can be seen through the current discourse used in the band directing community, which is heavily influenced by the notion of comprehensive music education in performance-based classes.

The comprehensive musicianship approach to teaching music in band class has been around for approximately twenty-five years (Froseth, 1984). Its influence on the band profession can be seen in a more concerted effort to include more music theory, composition, and music history in band classes. For example, Steve has a deliberate method of including theory in his instruction by using the RCM Music Theory Curriculum (2008) with his band curriculum. Another example of comprehensive musicianship is the cross-curricular approach to band instruction. In a previous study, a band director explained the importance she placed on providing students with meaningful learning experiences by "extending units in band into studies of culture, geography, or history" (Edwards, 2004).

Conclusion

In this chapter I examined the history and modern festival movement in instrumental music education in North America and the way directors balance the need for an outstanding performance at festival and the desire to provide students with a well-rounded music education experience. Despite band directors' sincere intentions to improve band instruction to include more than performance preparation, they continue to

work within an institutional structure that places performance at the centre. Band directors who are concerned about avoiding exclusive focus on performance in their approach to instruction and organization of their programs are confronted with powerful pressures of working toward performance after performance to attract and keep students as well as justify their programs to administration.

The festival experience is intended as an opportunity for students and directors alike to receive constructive feedback aimed at enhancing music education beyond the festival. However, the influence of ratings on a director's reputation as a director can almost negate the educational benefits as the performance becomes the focus of the year's instruction—similarly to standardized tests in other disciplines such as math, language arts, and the like. In spite of these pressures, Steve, Juan, and Lorraine work diligently to maintain a focus on the bigger picture of a quality education beyond performing well at festival.

Chapter Seven - Conclusion

The ethnography compiled in this dissertation explored the work of band directors as teachers of musical concepts and performance skills. Through this study, I examined, ethnographically, the institutional relations that intersect with the work done in the classroom by band directors as well as how programs are organized at three schools in a city in British Columbia.

The ethnography revealed the planning and administration involved in running a band program. Band directors must plan instruction and manage program inventory and schedules in which public performances play a large part. As educators in the institutionalized education system of British Columbia, the band directors who participated in this study are the band experts at their respective schools and they operate from positions of power in making decisions that affect all players involved in the program. Further, as these directors must negotiate the many relationships that exist within educational institution. This ethnography is of the institution and how band directors work within it to organize and run their programs.

Institutional ethnography investigates the work organization of people's everyday lives from the point of view of how they are an active part of institutional relations that influences what they say and do in various ways. This ethnography was based on interviews and observations of instructional practices of three middle school band directors in a school system in British Columbia. I also drew on an earlier study of how a local band festival is organized and how performances are implicitly competitive even though efforts to remove elements of competition have been carried out. I have also

drawn on my own experience as a band director teaching classes and managing programs.

Through the data collection methods employed in this study, I am able to describe the work band directors do in the course of their work. Instruments have to be inventoried and maintained as well as music. Performances for the year must be planned and added to the school calendar. As well, plans must be made to ensure performances are adequately advertised to ensure maximum attendance. Important to performance planning, serious attention must be paid to preparations for any large group festivals the band may attend. Further, logistical plans must be made for concert tours that may involve extended stays at venues for multiple concerts, which includes reserving hotel rooms, securing transportation, ensuring all documentation is accumulated such as permission slips, medical information, and the like for students. Fundraising must occur throughout the year for basic running of the program and any away-from-home concert tours or performances.

From this account of the daily practices of the band directors, attention shifts to a topic that is more relevant to issues arising from the general commitment of band classes to music education beyond the development of performance skills. It is at this point that the ethnography taps into one level of institutional relations by examining how band directors worked with various texts in guiding their work. This aspect of the ethnography shows that there is an official curriculum document for band directors in British Columbia, *The B.C. Music Curriculum* (1995, 1998). Although this document exists, the band directors have quite a bit if discretion as to what texts will organize his or her

practice. While two of the directors included in this study relied heavily on method books to guide their instruction, the other chose to use repertoire.

An important dimension to what happens in a classroom and what comes out of a course is how students contribute and are involved in a class. In a school situation, the directors explained that students often deal with conflicting obligations. As the leaders of programs negotiate student absences from rehearsals and practices, the leaders must deal with the challenges that accompany having certain players absent. Students also differ in terms of the amount of parent support they have. As well, economic situations can limit a student's ability to either rent or purchase an instrument, keep that instrument in good order, and have all materials necessary to play that instrument with them at each practice and performance. Student motivation, or course, also affects a student's contribution and involvement in a class.

For many band programs in British Columbia, and for all three of the band programs explored in this ethnography, spring festival is the culminating performance of the year. Whatever else the band director has accomplished with regard to music education becomes subordinate to the pressures of performance. The festival experience has evolved throughout its history, progressing to what is considered a non-competitive format. At one time, band directors were evaluated against each other and awards were given to bands that excelled in their performances. As time has progressed and education has changed, the contest format of festivals has shifted to a procedure where bands are evaluated against a set of criteria and comparison of bands is removed from the experience. The festival experience is meant to be an educational one for both the

directors and the students. Adjudicators offer comments to directors and students in an effort to help them improve their future performances.

This ethnography, locating the work of band directors in middle school in its various contexts, provides the reader with a picture of the complexities of the work a band instruction in institutionalized education. There can be few teaching situations in which the instructor confronts the multiple demands and tensions that have become visible in this study. Student commitment and motivation must be acquired and maintained as well as parental involvement and support. Demands are made on the directors for performances throughout the year and the spring festival. The potential implications for the director's reputation are considerable. At the same time, there appears to lack of institutional provision for attention to music education beyond the performance experience.

In deciding what to emphasize, we have seen that band directors have considerable discretion as to how they take up the official ministry curriculum document. When we consider the varied practical issues such as motivation and commitment that make student involvement variable, it is hardly surprising to find a considerable range of texts used to structure instruction used—even among the three directors who were respondents in this study.

I do not pretend that this ethnography can offer blanket, practical solutions to how music education can be more comprehensive in a band program. The section on jazz improvisation suggests that music educators could begin devising ways to successfully include improvisation into band instruction. However, this suggestion can be very difficult to carry out in practice. This ethnography illustrates that in spite of the progress

we have seen in music education and music educator training, band directors continue to struggle with providing their students with a music education beyond skills development. Therefore, it is suggested that universities revisit their curricula in general and university instructors revisit their instructional practices to more thoroughly explore how music education can be a more comprehensive experience for band students. The Comprehensive Music Project, which originated in Wisconsin in 1978, has decades of experience helping music educators to grow and change in how they teach. However, this ethnography offers evidence that directors continue to struggle with the performance pressures they face in their programs.

Recommendations for future research include exploring the relationship between how band directors teach and the training they received in their undergraduate training. It is clear from the literature explored in this study that more student-centred methods of instruction have become more mainstream in music teacher training curricula. In spite of this however, the band directing community still adheres to the more traditional teacher-centred mode of instruction, even though there is evidence that incorporating a more student-centred approach to instruction does not adversely affect the quality of performance in most band programs (Stoll, 2008). Further, investigating the actual practices incorporated by successful band directors who work within a more student-centred paradigm can inform university curricula, therefore improving band director undergraduate training.

Information gained through this study can inform those who instruct pre-service band directors. By acknowledging the performance-centric nature of instrumental music education, in spite of the popular discourse in current literature and in university

classrooms, concrete changes can be made to the work carried out by band directors. Equipping band directors with knowledge of comprehensive musicianship as it exists in band programs, but failing to guide them in developing teaching skills to hone performances and letting go of the performance-centricity that exists in band directing communities does little to improve present-day music education. This study has shown that more is required to make significant changes to a work place culture. “The culture of a workplace is “a function of the relations of power in that organizational setting” (McIlwee & Robinson, 1992, p. 21). The unique nature of institutional ethnography makes visible how power coordinates the work of the band directors, in this case. This study can show the need to continue to understand how performance-centricity is embedded in the band directing culture, thereby enabling music educators to create a more all-encompassing way of teach music in a band class. By understanding the continued over emphasis on performance that is represented in the work band directors do, university instructors can begin to offer band directors another way of looking at their roles as educators. Further, specific guidance can be inserted into university instruction to help band directors navigate the gap between the intention to provide a well-rounded music education and the pressures to produce performance after performance.

Though few solutions are offered, it is hoped that making visible the work organization of teaching band at this level and the institutional relations and pressures that the band director confront may yield for music educators a sense of what ordinary difficulties and problems band directors face when trying to complement performance preparations and skills-based instruction with other aspects of music education.

Bibliography

Abramo, M.N. (2008). Music educator as change agent: A personal narrative. In L.K. Thompson & M.R. Campbell (Eds.), *Diverse Methodologies in the Study of Music Teaching and Learning* (pp. 91-136). Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.

Abramo, M.N. (2009). The construction of instrumental music teacher identity (Doctoral dissertation, Columbia College, 2009). ProQuest Dissertations and Theses, AAT 3348563.

Adderly, C., Kennedy, M., & Berz, W. (2003). "A home away from home": The world of the high school music classroom. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 51*(3), 190-205.

Allsup, R.E., & Benedict, C. (2008). The problems of band: An enquiry into the future of instrumental music education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review, 16*(2), 156-173.

Auerbach, C.F. & Silverstein, L.B. (2003). *Qualitative data: An introduction to coding and analysis.* New York: New York University Press.

Austin, J.R. (1990). Competition: Is music education the loser? *Music Educators Journal, 76*(6), 21-25.

Ayres, L. (2007). Qualitative research proposals-Part II: Conceptual models and methodological options. *Journal of Wound, Ostomy and Continence Nursing, 34*(2), 131-133.

Basit, T.N. (2003). Manual or electronic? The role of coding in qualitative data analysis.

Educational Research, 45(2), 143-154.

B.C. Ministry of Education. (1995). *Music 8-10 Integrated Resource Package.* Victoria, B.C.: Author.

B.C. Ministry of Education. (1996). Revised statutes of British Columbia. *School Act.* Victoria, B.C.: Queen's Printer. Retrieved August 12, 2009 from http://www.bced.gov.bc.ca/legislation/schoollaw/revisedstatutescontents.pdf

B.C. Ministry of Education. (1998). *Fine Arts Kindergarten to Grade 7 Integrated Resource Package.* Victoria, B.C.: Author.

B.C. Ministry of Education. (2007). *Special needs student order, M150/89*. Victoria, B.C.: Queen's Printer. Retrieved August 12, 2009 from http://www.bced.gov.bc.ca/legislation/schoollaw/e/m150-89.pdf

B.C. Ministry of Education. (2010). *Special education services: A manual of policies, procedures, and guidelines.* Retrieved September 29, 2010 from http://www.bced.gov.bc.ca/specialed/special_ed_policy_manual.pdf#page=9

B.C. Music Educators Association. (2009). About the B.C.M.E.A. Retrieved June 26, 2009 from http://bctf.ca/BCMEA/About.html.

Bahktin, M.M. (1981). (ed. M. Holquist) *The dialogic imagination: Four essays*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Battisti, F.L. (1995). Growing excellence in band literature. *The Instrumentalist, 49*(7), 16-20, 77.

Bauer, W. (2001). Classroom management for ensembles. *Music Educators Journal, 87*(6), 27-32.

Becker, J. (1986). Is Western Art Music superior ? *The Musical Quarterly*, *72*(3), 341-

359.

Bergee, M.J. (1989). Reform for the band program. *Music Educators Journal, 75*(9), 18-22.

Berz, W.L. (2007). Weeder not a feeder. *Tempo, 62*(1), 16-17.

Blocher, L., Greenwood, R., & Shellahamer, B. (1997). Teaching behaviours of middle school and high school band directors in the rehearsal setting. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 45*(3), 457-469.

Boardman, E. (1989). *Dimensions of musical thinking.* Lanham, MD : Rowman & Littlefield Education.

Butler, J. (2002). The clarinet bboard [Msg. 5]. Message posted to http://test.woodwind.org/clarinet/BBoard/read.html?f=1&i=77743&t=77743

Caelli, K, Ray, L., & Mill, J. (2003). 'Clear as mud': Toward greater clarity in generic qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 2*(2), Retrieved June 13, 2010 from: http://www.ualberta.ca/~iiqm/backissues/2_2/pdf/caellietal.pdf

Campbell, M. (2003). Dorothy Smith and knowing the world we live in. *Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare, 30*(1), 3-23.

Campbell, M. & Gregor, F. (2002). *Mapping social relations: A primer in doing Institutional Ethnography.* Aurora, ON: Garamond Press.

Campbell, P.S. (2002). Music education in a time of cultural transformation. *Music Educators Journal, 89*(1) , 27-32, 54.

Camphouse, M. (2003). *Composers on composing for band.* Chicago: GIA Publications.

Cavitt, M.E. (2003). A descriptive analysis of error correction in instrumental music

rehearsals. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 51*(3), 218-230.

Chipman, S.R. (2004). A survey of perceptions of at-risk students by Florida secondary school band directors. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Florida State University, Tallahassee.

Coffman, D.D. (1987). Vocal music and the classroom teacher, 1885-1905. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 35*, 92-102.

Collett, M.J. (1991). Resource and protective factors in children at low and high risk for the development of psychopathology. University of California, Los Angeles. *UMI Pro Quest Dissertation,* AAT 9725321.

Conway, G.M. (2003). *Great beginnings for music teachers: A guide to mentoring and induction.* Reston, VA: Music Educators National Conference.

Conway, G.M. (2006). Navigating through induction: How a mentor can help. *Music Educators Journal, 92*(5), 56-60.

Cooper, L.G. (2004). *Teaching band and orchestra.* Chicago: GIA Publications.

Cutietta, R.A. (1979). The effects of systematized sight-singing drill in the middle school choral rehearsal. *Contributions to Music Education*, 7, 12-20.

Darrow, A.A. (2003). Dealing with diversity: The inclusion of students with disabilities in music. *Research Studies in Music Education, 21*, 45-57.

Denzin, N.K., & Lincoln, Y.S. (Eds.) (2008). *Collecting and interpreting qualitative materials.*Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Dey, C. (2002). Methodological issues: The use of critical ethnography as an active research methodology. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, 15*(1), 106-121.

Doll, M. (2006, August 14). Director's announcements [Msg. 7]. Message posted to http://www.bandlink.org/discus/messages/28/37.html?1156950037

Dykman, R.A. (1979). In step with 94-142, two by two. *Music Educators Journal, 65*(5), 58-63.

Edwards, M. (2004). *Band festival adjudicator forms: Text as a social influence.* Unpublished manuscript.

Eisenhart, M. (2001). Changing conceptions of culture and ethnographic methodology: Recent thematic shifts and their implications for research on teaching. In V. Richardson (Ed.) *Handbook of Research on Teaching, 4th Edition,* (pp. 209-225). Washington, DC: American Educational Research Association.

Eisner, E. (1996). Why standards may not improve our schools. *Recorder, 38*(2). 64.

Elliott, C.A. (1983). Behind the budget crisis, a crisis of philosophy. *Music Educators Journal, 70*(2), 38-44.

Elliott, D. (1995). *Music matters: A new philosophy of music education.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Ely, M., Anzul, M., Friedman, T., Garner, D., & Steinmetz, A. (1991). *Doing qualitative research: Circles within circles.* London: Falmer.

Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed.* New York: Continuum.

Frierson-Campbell, C. (2003). Professional need and the contexts of in-service music teacher identity. *Third Symposium of A Sociology of Music Education, 3*(3). Retrieved July 16, 2009 from http://www.siue.edu/MUSIC/ACTPAPERS/v3/Frierson04.pdf.

Froehlich, H., & L'Roy, D. (1985). An investigation of occupancy identity in

undergraduate music education majors. *Bulletin for the Council for Research in Music Education, 85,* 65-75.

Froseth, J.O. (1984). *The comprehensive music instructor: Listen, move, sing, and play for band.* Chicago: GIA Publications.

Froseth, J.O. (1985). *The comprehensive music instructor: Solfege training and intonation studies*. [Audiocassette}. Chicago: GIA Publications.

Garofalo, R. (1985). *Blueprint for band: A guide to teaching comprehensive musicianship through school band performance.* Ft. Lauderdale, FL: Meredith Music Publications.

Gilbert, J.P. (1977). Mainstreaming in your classroom: What to expect. *Music Educators Journal, 63*(6), 64-68.

Gilbert, J.P. & Asmus, Jr., E.P. (1981). Mainstreaming: Music educators'participation and professional needs. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 29*(1), 31-37.

Gonzo, C. (1993). Multicultural issues in music education. *Music Educators Journal, 79*(6), 49-52.

Gooch, S. (1972). *Total Man: Towards an Evolutionary Theory of Personality*. London: Penguin Press.

Goolsby, T.W. (1996). Time use in instrumental rehearsals: A comparison of experienced, novice, and student teachers. *Journal of Research of Music Education, 44*(4), 286-303.

Goolsby, T.W. (1999a). A comparison of expert and novice music teachers' preparing identical band compositions: An operational replication. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 47*(2), 174-187.

Goolsby, T.W. (1999b). Assessment in instrumental music. *Music Educators Journal, 86*(2), 31-35, 50.

Gouzouasis, P., Gunn, M., & Kishor, N. (2007). The predictive relationship between achievement and participation in music and achievement in core grade 12 academic subjects. *Music Education Research, 9*(1), 81-92.

Grahame, P. (1998). Ethnography, institutions, and the problematic of the everyday world. *Human Studies*, 21, 347-360.

Green, L. (1999). Research in the sociology of music education: Some introductory Concepts. *Music Education Research, 1*(2), 159-69.

Green, J.P., & Vogan, N.F. (1991). *Music education in Canada: A historical account.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Griffith, A.I., & Smith, D.E. (2005). *Mothering for schooling.* New York: RoutledgeFalmer.

Griffith, A.I. & Andre-Bechely, L. (2008). Institutional technologies: Coordinating families and schools, bodies and texts. In McCoy (Ed.), *People at Work: Life, Power, and Social Inclusion in the New Economy.* New York: NYU Press.

Grunow, R. F. (2005). Music Learning Theory: A catalyst for change in beginning instrumental music instruction. In M. Runfola and C.C. Taggart (Eds.), *The Development and Practical Application of Music Learning Theory*. Chicago: GIA.

Haack, P. (1997). Toward a socio/functional music education. In *On the Sociology of Music Education* (Roger Rideout, Ed.). Normal, OK: Oklahoma University Press.

Haines, H. (1997). *The band director's companion*. San Antonio, TX: Southern Music

Company.

Hamann, D.L., Mills, C., Bell, J., Daugherty, E., & Kooser, R. (1990). Classroom environment as related to contest ratings among high school performing ensembles. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 38*(3), 215-224.

Hammersley, M., & Atkinson, P. (1983) *Ethnography: Principles in practice*. London: Routledge.

Hansen, R. K. (2005). *The American Wind Band.* Chicago: GIA Publications, Inc.

Hardy, D. (1989). Learning disabilities: A look at some music education alternatives. *British Columbia Music Educator, 31*(2), 26-28.

Harker, R., (1990) Education and Cultural Capital in Harker, R., Mahar, C., & Wilkes, C. (Eds.). (1990). *An Introduction to the Work of Pierre Bourdieu: the Practice of Theory.* , London: Macmillan Press.

Heston, M.L., Dedrick, C., Raschke, D., & Whitehead, J. (1996). Job satisfaction and stress among band directors. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 44*(4), 319-327.

Hickey, M. (1997). Teaching ensembles to compose and improvise: Here are some practical ideas for incorporating creative activities of composing and improvising into instrumental ensemble rehearsals. *Music Educators Journal, 83*(6), 17-21.

Hitchcock, G., & Hughes, D. (1989). *Research and the teacher: A qualitative introduction to school-based research.* London: Routledge.

Hodowanec, M.N. (2006). Band director's announcements [Msg.10]. Message posted to http://www.bandlink.org/discus/messages/28/37.html?1156950037

Johnson, M., Long, T., & White, A. (2001). Arguments for British pluralism in

qualitative health research. *Methodological Issues in Nursing Research, 33*(2), 243-249.

Kallmann, H., Ed. (1952). *Catalogue of Canadian composers.* Toronto: Canadian Broadcasting Corporation.

Kallmann, H. (1955). Historical background. In E. MacMillan (Ed.), *Music in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Kallmann, H. (1969). *A history of music in Canada, 1534-1914.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Kendall, G., & Wickham, G. (1999). *Using Foucalt's methods.* London: Sage Publications.

L., Kim (2002). The clarinet bboard [Msg. 21]. Message posted to http://test.woodwind.org/clarinet/BBoard/read.html?f=1&i=77743&t=77743

Labuta, J.A., & Smith, D.A. (1997). *Music education: Historical contexts and perspectives.* Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Lamb, R. (1996). Discords: Feminist pedagogy in music education. *Theory into Practice, 35*(2), 124-131.

Lamb, T. & Reinders, H. (2008). *Learner and teacher autonomy: Concepts, realities, and responses.* Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Lamb, R., Dolloff, L.A., & Howe, S.W. (2002). Feminism, feminist research, and gender research in music education. In R. Colwell & C. Richardson (Eds.) *The new handbook of research on music teaching and learning* (Oxford: Oxford University Press), 648-674.

Lapka, C. (2006). Students with disabilities in a high school band: "We can do it!".

Music Educators Journal, 92 (4), 54-59.

Lareau, A. (2002). Invisible inequality: Social class and childrearing in Black families and White families. *American Sociological Review, 67*, 747-776.

Larue, P.J. (1986). A study to determine the degree of consensus regarding outcomes of band participation and the competitive elements in band programs among band directors, and members of parent booster groups. Dissertation Abstracts International, 47, 2497. (UMI No. 86-23347)

Lerner, J. (1981). *Children with learning disabilities* (3rd ed.). Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Localizado, A. N., & Ryan, C. (2009). *Building strong music programs: A handbook for preservice and novice music teachers.* Lanham, MI: R & L Education.

Lomax, A. (1977). Appeal for cultural identity. *The Journal of Communication, 27*(2), 125-138.

Lynch, K. & Baker, J. (2005). Equality in education: An equality of condition perspective. *Theory and Research in Education, 3*(2), 131-64.

Madden, N.A. & Slaven, R.E. (1983). Mainstreaming students with mild handicaps: Academic and social outcomes. *Review of Educational Research, 53*(4), 519-569.

Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative researching.* London: Sage.

Mattison, D. (1981). On the march. Indian brass bands, 1866-1915. *British Columbia Historical News, 15*(1), 6-14.

McCoy, L. (2006). Keeping the institution in view: Working with interview accounts in everyday practice. In D.E. Smith (Ed.) *Institutional Ethnography in Practice* (pp. 109-126). Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

McIlwee, J.S. & Robinson, J.G. (1992). *Women in engineering: Gender, power, and workplace culture.* Albany, NY: SUNY Press.

McIntosh, D. (1989). *History of music in British Columbia.* Victoria, BC: Sono Nis Press.

Mercer, R.J. (1972). Is the curriculum the score—or more? *Music Educators Journal, 58*(6), 50-53.

Miller, A. and Coen, D. (1994). The case for music in the schools. *Phi Delta Kappan, 75*(6). Retrieved April 21, 2009, from http://web.ebscohost.com.ezproxy.library.uvic.ca/ehost/detail?vid=2&hid=101&sid=e2f3b025-1b6e-4bd4-a548-22a275752713%40sessionmgr103&bdata=JmxvZ2lucGFnZT1Mb2dpbi5hc3Amc2l0ZT1laG9zdC1saXZlJnNjb3BlPXNpdGU%3d#db=tfh&AN=9403303565

Miller, R.E. (1994). A dysfunctional culture. *Music Educators Journal, 81*(3), 29-34.

MusicFest Canada (2008). *Rules and regulations.* Retrieved September, 3, 2009 from http://www.musicfest.ca/rulesregs_e.shtml

Neves, V.R.T. (2007). Instrumental music as content literacy education: An instructional framework based on the continuous improvement process. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Brigham Young University. Retrieved June 14, 2010 from http://bandtek.com/music-literacy/music_literacy.pdf.

Newton, J.L. (2007). *Teacher practice in instrumental music programs in four small senior secondary schools in Alberta: An ethnographic study.* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta.

O'Reilly, J. & Williams, M. (1997). *Accent on achievement.* Van Nuys, CA: Alfred

Publishing Co., Inc.

Ortiz, A.M. (2003). The ethnographic interview. In F.K. Stage & K. Manning (Eds.) *Research in the College Context: Approaches and Methods.* New York: Brunner-Routledge.

O'Toole, P. (2003). *Shaping sound musicians.* Chicago: Gia Publications.

Patton, M.Q. (1999). Enhancing the quality and credibility of qualitative analysis. *Health Services Research, 34*(5), 1189-1208.

Pearson, B. (1982). *Best in class*. San Diego: Kjos West Publishers.

Pearson, B. (n.d.). *Standard of excellence.* San Diego: Kjos West Publishers.

Pearson, L.C. (2005). The relationship between teacher autonomy and stress, work satisfaction, empowerment and professionalism. *Educational Research Quarterly, 29*(1), 37-53.

Ployhar, J.D. (n.d.). *I recommend*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred Publishing Co., Inc.

Ployhar, J.D. (1985). *Band today*. Van Nuys, CA: Alfred Publishing Co., Inc.

Rankin, J.M. (2004). How nurses practice health care reform: An institutional ethnography. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Victoria, BC: University of Victoria.

Raybauld, S., & Feldpausch, K. (2008). *Teaching band and chorus in the 21st century.* Richmond, VA: BNC Education, LLC.

Reimer, B. (1989). *A philosophy of music education* (2nd Ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Reimer, B. (2002). *World musics and music education: Facing the issues.* Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education.

Rice, P., & Ezzy, D. (1999). *Qualitative research methods: A health focus.* Melbourne, Australia: Oxford University Press.

Roberts, B. (2004). The social construction of music as a school subject. *Third Symposium of A Sociology of Music Education, 3*(3). Retrieved July 16, 2009 from http://www.siue.edu/MUSIC/ACTPAPERS/v3/Roberts04v3_3.pdf.

Robinson, M. (1996). To sing or not to sing in instrumental class: Introducing vocalization techniques at the beginning of band or orchestra rehearsals can improve musical and critical-thinking skills of young performers. *Music Educators Journal, 83*(1), 17-47.

Rose, A.M. (1990). *Music Education in Culture: A Critical Analysis of Reproduction, Production, and Hegemony.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press.

Roulston, K. (2006). Mapping the possibilities of qualitative research in music education: A primer. *Music Education Research, 8*(1), 153-173.

Royal Conservatory of Music. (2000). *Official syllabi of the Royal Conservatory of Music: Theory syllabus*. Mississauga, ON: The Fredrick Harris Music Co., Limited.

Royal Conservatory of Music Examinations. (2008). *Academic Information.* Retrieved May 22, 2009 from http://www.rcmexaminations.org/acadinfo/accreditation.htm.

Rush, S., & Lautzenheiser, T. (2006). *Habits of a successful band director: Pitfalls and solutions*. Chicago: GIA Publications.

Ryan, F., Coughlan, M., & Cronin, P. (2007). Step-by-step guide to critiquing research. Part 2: Qualitative research. *British Journal of Nursing, 16*(12), 738-744.

Schafer, R.M. (1975). *Rhinoceros in the classroom.* London: Universal Edition Ltd.

Scheib, J.W. (2006). Policy implications for teacher retention: Meeting the needs of the dual identities of arts educators. *Arts Education Policy Review, 107*(6), 5-10.

Schouten, F., Bauer, W.I., Sicks, L., Gifford, R.M., Griffith, O., Caldwell, B., Melillo, S., Gomes, M., Bendell, C.J., Moore, Jr., W.A., Hutchinson, J.L., Gobeen, S., & Goolsby, T. (1983). Winners and losers: Point of view on competition. *Music Educators Journal, 79*(2), 28-33.

Scruggs, B.B. (2009). Learning outcomes in two divergent middle school string orchestra classroom environments: A comparison of a learner-centered and a teacher-centered approach (Doctoral dissertation, Georgia State University, 2009). ProQuest Dissertations and Theses, AAT 3371516.

Seale, C. (1999). *The quality of qualitative research: Introducing qualitative methods.* London: Sage.

Sell-Lenzini, C. (1996). Emerging band classics. *The Instrumentalist, 51*(4), 17.

Sloboda, J. (2001). Emotion, functionality and the everyday experience of music: Where does music education fit? *Music Education Research, 3*(2), 243-253.

Smith, D.E. (1987). *The everyday world as problematic: A feminist sociology of knowledge.* Boston: Northeastern University Press.

Smith, D.E. (1990). *The conceptual practices of power*. Boston, MA: Northeastern University Press.

Smith, D.E. (2005). *Institutional ethnography: A sociology for people.* Lanham: AltaMira Press.

Smith, D.E. (Ed.) (2006). *Institutional ethnography as practice.* Lanham, MD: Rowman

& Littlefield.

Smith, G.W. (1995). “Accessing treatments: Managing the AIDS epidemic in Ontario”.

Stats B.C. (2004). *2001 Census Profile of British Columbia’s Provincial Electoral Districts*. Retrieved May 12, 2009 from: http://www.bcstats.gov.bc.ca/data/cen01/profiles/PED_54.pdf

Statistics Canada. (2006). City of Victoria Profile. *2006 Census Data.* Retrieved May 12, 2009 from: http://www.victoria.ca/common/pdfs/profiles_neigh_jamesb_01.pdf.

Statistics Canada. (2006). Municipality of Saanich Profile. *2006 Census Data.* Retrieved May 13, 2009 from: http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/92591/details/Page.cfm?Lang=E&Geo1=CSD&Code1=5917021&Geo2=PR&Code2=59&Data=Count&SearchText=saanich&SearchType=Begins&SearchPR=01&B1=All&Custom=

Stoll, J.L. (2008). *The relationship of high school band directors’ assessment practices to ratings at a large group adjudicated event*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Kent State University, Kent, Ohio.

Stuart, M. & Gilbert, J.P. (1977). Mainstreaming: Needs assessment through a videotape visual scale. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 25*, 283-289.

Stuber, J. (2006). “Talk of class: The discursive repertoires of White working- and upper-middle-class college students”. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography, 35*(3), 285-318.

Swain, M. (2000). French Immersion research in Canada: Recent contributions to SLA and applied linguistics. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics, 20,* 1999-212.

Swanwick, K. (1999). *Teaching music musically.* New York: Routledge.

Teachout, D.J. (2001). The relationship between personality and the teaching effectiveness of music student teachers. *Psychology of Music, 29*(2), 179-192.

Temple, C.P. (1973). *A study of the effectiveness of competition festivals in the music education process.* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio.

Volk, T.M. (2004). *Music, education, and multiculturalism: Foundations and principles.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Walby, K. (2005). Institutional ethnography and surveillance studies: An outline for inquiry. *Surveillance and Society, 3*(2/3), 158-172.

Wenz-Gross, M., Siperstein, G.N., Untch, A.S., & Widaman, K.F. (1997). Stress, social support, and adjustment of adolescents in middle school. *Journal of Early Adolescence, 17*(2), 129-151.

Williams, D.A. (2007). What are music educators doing and how well are we doing it? *Music Educators Journal, 94*(1), 18-23.

Woodford, P. (2005). *Democracy and music education: Liberalism, ethics, and the politics of practice.* Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Wright, C.N. (2008). Assessment and grading practices of exemplary high school concert band directors. Unpublished master's thesis, Bowling Green, OH: Bowling Green University. Retrieved July 30, 2009 from http://www.ohiolink.edu/etd/send-pdf.cgi/Wright%20Courtney%20Nicole.pdf?acc_num=bgsu1205897167

Yvette, D. (2008). The "textualized" student: An institutional ethnography of a funding

policy for students with special needs in Ontario. In M. Devault (Ed.), *People at Work: Life, Power, and Social Inclusion in the New Economy.* New York: NYU Press.

Appendix A Interview Script

Sample interview questions asked of participants:

Can we begin with a step-by-step description of how you begin your workday?

How do you conduct your work throughout the day? How is it planned? Carried out? Organized?

Do you have non-instructional responsibilities in your job? What are they?

Do these non-instructional responsibilities influence your instructional planning or work?

Appendix B Consent

University of Victoria

Participant Consent Form

Office of the Vice-President, Research

Human Research Ethics Committee

Exploring Symbolic Violence in Music Education: An Institutional Ethnography

Melissa Edwards, 514-9353, sme@uvic.ca

You are being invited to participate in a study entitled Exploring Symbolic Violence in Music Education: An Institutional Ethnography that is being conducted by Melissa Edwards who is an interdisciplinary doctoral student in the Departments of Sociology and Curriculum and Instruction, University of Victoria. Ms. Edwards is conducting this research as part of the requirements for a PhD. You may contact Ms. Edwards if you have questions by email at sme@uvic.ca or by phone at 514-9353.

The purpose of this research project is to explore how band directors coordinate their everyday instruction and management of the band program, which constructs the educational and social character of the program.

Research of this type is important because music education is a valuable curricular experience that provides benefits to all students, regardless of economic condition. It is essential that knowledge of the social construction of music education grow so as to provide the most effective educational experience to music students.

You are being asked to participate in this study because your own knowledge and experience are especially relevant to this project.

If you agree to voluntarily participate in this research, your participation will include being interviewed and observed by the researcher. Additionally, the researcher may request to see texts particular to your work. Such texts will not include personal information of either the director or his or her students.

Though there are no known or anticipated risks to you by participating in this research, you are asked to let the researcher know before you are interviewed whether participating may have problems, risks to you, or inconvenience of which s/he is unaware of. This is to enable steps to be taken to deal with problems, risks, or inconvenience. If this isn't possible, the interview or discussion will not proceed.

The potential benefits of your participation in this research include receiving any part of your interview or group discussion that has been transcribed and gaining greater understanding of the social implications of the construction of a band program. The researcher will also be willing to give you feedback on the findings of the research.

Your participation in this research must be completely voluntary. YOU SHOULD NOT FEEL COMPELLED TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS STUDY DUE TO ANY PROFESSIONAL AFFLIATIONS YOU MAY HAVE. If you do decide to participate, you may withdraw at any time without any consequences or any explanation. If you do

withdraw from the study your data will be included in the study unless you prefer it also to be withdrawn.

In terms of protecting your anonymity, a pseudonym will be substituted for your name on all the written or electronic materials that you have provided and any descriptive particulars that might identify you will be changed. You might like to choose your own pseudonym. Additionally, the locality of the school and the school name will be fictional.

Your confidentiality and the confidentiality of the data will be protected by: 1) by keeping it secure at all times; (2) by restricting access to data to the instructor and the supervisor and graduate supervisory committee, if applicable; (3) by committing to destroy any audio tapes after their use as data is completed.

The data that you have contributed to may be used to write a paper for a conference or publication, or included in a thesis.

Audio-tapes of interviews or discussion groups will be destroyed electronically after the data has been used.

In addition to being able to contact the researcher at the above phone numbers, you may verify the ethical approval of this study, or raise any concerns you might have,

by contacting the Associate Vice-President, Research at the University of Victoria (250-472-4362).

Your signature below indicates that you understand the above conditions of participation in this study and that you have had the opportunity to have your questions answered by the researchers.

_____	_____	_____
Name of Participant	*Signature*	*Date*

A copy of this consent will be left with you, and a copy will be taken by the researcher.