

Living on 'Scenery and Fresh Air': Land-use Planning and Environmental Regulation in
the Gulf Islands

by

Jonathan Weller
BA, University of Alberta, 2012

A Masters of Arts Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of

MASTERS OF ARTS

in the Department of History

© Jonathan Weller 2016
University of Victoria

All rights reserved. This thesis may not be reproduced in whole or in part, by photocopy
or other means, without the permission of the author.

Supervisory Committee

Living on ‘Scenery and Fresh Air’: History, Land-use Planning, and Environmental
Regulation in the Gulf Islands

by

Jonathan Weller
BA, University of Alberta, 2012

Supervisory Committee

Dr. Richard Rajala (Department of History)
Supervisor

Dr. Penny Bryden (Department of History)
Departmental Member

Abstract

Supervisory Committee

Dr. Richard Rajala (Department of History)

Supervisor

Dr. Penny Bryden (Department of History)

Departmental Member

This study examines changing conceptions of the Southern Gulf Islands, an archipelago on the coast of British Columbia, through the twentieth century. By drawing on ideas put forward by government officials, journalists, residents, and travellers it develops an explanation for how and why a conception of the Gulf Islands as a ‘special’ or ‘unique’ pastoral landscape emerged as a result of interactions between individuals and groups, and their political, social, economic, and physical environments. It then examines how these ideas in turn influenced the development of land-use policies and programs, and in particular how an innovative, overarching planning commission called the Islands Trust emerged in 1974 as a mechanism devoted to limiting development and defending the Islands as a pastoral landscape of leisure. More than reflecting such a pastoral depiction of the Islands, the initiatives undertaken by the newly formed Trust ascribed to the idea that a defining lifestyle, characterized by arcadian pursuits such as mixed farming, boutique logging, handicrafts, or the arts, was legitimate for such a landscape. By embracing such a conception of the Gulf Islands’ environment, the Islands Trust endeavoured to preserve and create this landscape through an agenda that supported farmland, forest, and open space retention, and encouraged those activities deemed to be in keeping with the unique ‘character’ of the Islands. The initial work of enshrining the pastoral ‘character’ of the Islands into land-use planning policies and programs by the Trust laid a framework for ongoing efforts to shape the landscape, economy, development, and identity of the region into the present day.

Table of Contents

Supervisory Committee	ii
Abstract	iii
Table of Contents	iv
List of Tables	v
List of Maps	vi
Acknowledgments.....	vii
Chapter 1: Introduction.....	1
Literature Review.....	5
Gulf Islands Literature Review.....	22
Thesis Summary.....	25
Chapter 2: ‘Islands of Enchantment’ - Early Conceptions of the Gulf Islands, 1900-1940	27
‘Jewels in a Backing of Silver’ - The Gulf Islands Environment.....	28
Early Settlement, 1855-1900	32
‘Contentment Reigns’ - the Development of the Arcadian Ideal, 1900-1940	35
‘It Was Nothing But Work’ - the Development of Agriculture and Industry, 1900-1940	40
Conclusion	49
Chapter 3: ‘Big City Hustle-Bustle in the Gulf Islands Eden,’ 1940-1969	50
‘The Invasion is on its Merry Way’ - Drivers of Change, 1945-1969.....	53
‘Paradise Found’ - the Gulf Islands in the Post-War Period, 1945-1969	59
‘Paradise Lost’ - Early Land-Use Management, 1965-1969	63
Conclusion	70
Chapter 4: Safeguarding the Pastoral - the Islands Trust, 1969-1976	72
‘Chartless in the Gulf’ - from the 10-acre freeze to the NDP, October 1969-September 1972.....	74
‘The New Democracy’ - the NDP and the Development of the Islands Trust, 1972-1974.....	88
‘Playboy Paradise Plucked by People’ - the Establishment of the Islands Trust, 1974-1976.....	97
Conclusion	108
Chapter 5: Conclusion.....	110
Review	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Moving Beyond ‘Islands’	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Bibliography	117
Primary Sources	117
Archival Material	117
Published Sources	117
Secondary Sources	123

List of Tables

Table 1: Gulf Islands Population Change, 1956-1976.....	61
Table 2: New Residential Lot Development, 1959-1968.....	61

List of Maps

Map 1: Gulf Islands, British Columbia.....	2
Map 2: An oblique stereographic projection of the Gulf Islands.....	30

Acknowledgments

It is a pleasure to thank those who have contributed to this work. That this thesis came together as it has is as much a reflection of the strength of those whose support and guidance I rely upon, as it is my own abilities. To my partner Emma, who has lived with this project from its beginnings, offering endless support, even when lying in a hammock with a book constituted my workday. To all of those friends who, though perhaps not anticipating it, willingly endured a long answer to a question about what I was studying. Your patience and interest was more help than you may realize. To Heather Waterlander, who deftly guided me through the intricacies of the University's administration, while I did my best to complicate the process. To SSHRC and the University of Victoria whose generous funding of my degree offered me the freedom to enjoy and explore the world of ideas. To Dr. Penny Bryden, whose humour and intelligence was a most welcome contribution to both my work as a graduate student and in the process of revising this thesis. But most of all, I am indebted to my supervisor Dr. Rick Rajala whose engagement, tireless editorial work, curiosity, and diligence helped transform this thesis into something far more sophisticated and refined than I could have originally hoped.

Chapter 1: Introduction

Islands are notorious shape changers. Because shores are fractal rather than linear, their exact dimensions are hard to pin down. They change with every tide, with major storms and earthquakes. Our ancestors were right in thinking of them as moving or floating, as alive, for, like shores, they are elusive and indefinable. In places of great seismic activity, they are known to rise suddenly and disappear just as quickly. Both the Atlantic and the Pacific are full of vanished islands, some quite real, others fanciful. – John Gillis¹

The difficulty of defining islands, which John Gillis articulates in the above passage, is a recurring theme in the history of the Southern Gulf Islands of British Columbia, an archipelago lying between Vancouver Island and the mainland of the province in the Strait of Georgia. In defining a geographic entity, one engages in the process of creating a place out of the physical world. Places are geographic spaces defined by the meanings, sentiments, stories, and shifting articulations that exist around them; by nature, they are dynamic and contested.² In the history of the Southern Gulf Islands there are, as with every space, ranges of such articulations of place. The name itself, the ‘Southern Gulf Islands,’ is in fact a useful place to start, as it is a misnomer. Originally, the term ‘Gulf Islands’ referred to the archipelago at the south end of the Strait of Georgia (the islands extending from Saturna Island in the southeast and D’Arcy Island in the southwest, north to and including Gabriola Island). However, due to shifts in the 1990s to speak of the waters between Vancouver Island and the mainland as a whole, the ‘Gulf Islands’ came to encompass all of the islands in the region. Thus, the term ‘Southern Gulf Islands’ came into use to distinguish those islands further north, including Quadra and Cortes, from the more southern ones.³ While this is simply one example of the shifting and elusive nature of the region’s definition, and a rather innocuous one at that, it is, for the sake of clarity, a beneficial place to begin this examination.

¹ John R. Gillis, “Not Continents in Miniature: Islands as Ecotones,” *Island Studies Journal* 9, no.1 (2014), 162.

² Charles W. J. Withers, “Place and the ‘Spatial Turn’ in Geography and in History,” *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 70, no.4, (2009), 637-658; James Opp & John C. Walsh, *Placing Memory and Remembering Place in Canada* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2010), 4-7.

³ BC Geological Services, “Gulf Islands,” *BC Geographic Names*, <http://apps.gov.bc.ca/pub/bcgnws/names/4119.html> (accessed 5, November, 2015)

The major focus of this study is the Southern Gulf Islands, however, due to the quirks of boundaries imposed upon the region by planners and decision makers over time, this study will also at times discuss the two main islands of Howe Sound, Bowen and Gambier. In order to remain consistent with the source material from which this work draws, which employs the older terminology, I will, throughout the text, refer to the region as the ‘Gulf Islands.’ Primarily though, this thesis narrows its focus further by looking in detail at the history of those islands that fell under the jurisdiction of the Capital Regional District: James, Sydney, Portland, Piers, Saltspring⁴, and the ‘Outer Islands’ - North and South Pender, Mayne, Saturna, and Galiano.⁵ (See Map 1)



Map 3: Gulf Islands, British Columbia

⁴ According to the BC Geographic Names Office, ‘Salt Spring’ Island was officially retitled Saltspring on March 1, 1910. But local usage remains divided equally between the one and two word options: Saltspring and Salt Spring. Throughout this study, both versions will be used on occasion. The unofficial two word option will, however, only be used when quoting from source materials that use it, otherwise preference given to the single word, ‘Saltspring.’ BC Geological Services, “Saltspring Island,” *BC Geographic Names* <http://apps.gov.bc.ca/pub/bcgnws/names/13666.html> (accessed 8, January, 2016)

⁵ These islands were chosen because their relatively denser population, proximity to the capital, and prominence in debates and controversies over time made them a focal point of broader ‘Gulf Islands’ trends. Speaking of the Gulf Islands as a unified entity is problematic and it is a tension that is dealt with throughout this thesis. While the internal dynamics of each regional district involved with islands that make up this area varied, by focusing on those within the Capital Regional District which was most active and covered the largest number of islands, a good impression of the issues at play can be developed.

In 1974, the provincial government of British Columbia established the Islands Trust to oversee and guide the development of the Gulf Islands. With its creation, the Islands Trust took on a broad mandate “to preserve and protect, in co-operation with municipalities and the Government of the Province, the trust area and its unique amenities and environment for the benefit of the residents of the trust area and of the Province generally.”⁶ Creation of the Trust marked only the beginning of a new phase in what had been an ongoing, and often controversial, process of land management in the Gulf Islands, which had begun in earnest in the mid-1960s with the establishment of the regional district system. Before the 1960s, management existed in the form of settlement programs and regulations for forestry, mining, and fishing, as it did in all areas falling within the province’s boundaries. But with rapid growth following the Second World War, a need for increased planning and the regulation of development emerged. This, in the 1960s, led to a concerted effort to implement plans and controls to manage changes on the land. Politicians, experts, and community members offered competing visions for the future and pushed to have them established through regulatory mechanisms. The result of this process was the mandate of the Islands Trust, which, along with the organization’s initial policy documents, enshrined a particular vision for the region. In order to understand both the controversy and challenges that came to define this process, as well as the choices politicians eventually made, it is necessary to trace the development of ideas and perceptions about the environment of the Islands through the twentieth century.

Individuals and groups form ideas about the environment, in part, through their interactions with physical space. The physical environment itself, then, is an agent shaping these ideas. Those European settlers, vacationers, travellers, part-time residents, and others who developed a relationship with the Gulf Islands over the nineteenth and twentieth centuries were responding to the landscape as they found it. Early settlers confronted a densely vegetated island archipelago dominated by tall coastal forests, interspersed with steep rocky outcrops and open meadows of grass, moss, and wildflowers. Those arriving after the turn of the century experienced a similarly rugged, lush territory, but settlers cleared land suitable for agriculture, carving the landscape into

⁶ Islands Trust Act, R.S.B.C ch. 239, s. 3.1 (1974)

one of small farms and pasture. The environmental aesthetic of rolling green hills, lush forests, and natural meadows, coupled with the temperate climate of the region, made the Gulf Islands easy to interpret as an idyllic pastoral world. But such an idea of the Islands as pastoral paradise did not result solely from interactions with the physical environment.

Beyond the role of the physical world in shaping perceptions of the Gulf Islands, individuals and groups came to their interactions with the environment embedded in a wider cultural fabric that constrained, shaped, and informed the ideas that they developed about their surroundings. Political, economic, and cultural discourses that valorized the moral worth of agriculture and agricultural lifestyles, anti-modern resistance to disruptions brought on by the modernization of society, or cultural associations with and metaphorical uses of islands, as examples, influenced the formation of perceptions of the physical environment. The idea of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral world, then, cannot be seen as merely a reflection of the environment, but rather needs to be understood as a manifestation of this complex interaction between humans and their physical and cultural environments. While it will be necessary to explore the development of this pastoral perspective of the Gulf Islands in its broad twentieth century context, this task is not the primary contribution this thesis seeks to make. Within the growing body of work published under the banner of environmental history, numerous scholars have skilfully addressed the issue of how individual and group perceptions of the environment form. Instead, what I hope to develop in this study is an understanding of how these perceptions in turn influence the physical environment through their application in land-use planning policy.

In embracing an idea of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral environment, individuals can act in a multitude of ways to shape the world to conform to their vision. Property owners may clear land, erect fences, put sheep out to pasture, or tend gardens. Alternatively, they may choose architectural styles or activities that recreate elements of their idealized vision. While these individual choices are part of a process that shapes the overall environment, communities, groups, and governments, as collectives, also work actively to give form to their shared perceptions. In the Gulf Islands, during the second half of the twentieth century, the primary method for this collective shaping of the physical landscape was through land-use planning and other environmental management

policies. It is these mechanisms that this study aims to explore and examine. I will argue that a perception of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral environment, one fit for an idyllic arcadian lifestyle, became increasingly predominant through the first half of the twentieth century. This pastoral perception, in turn, informed land-use debates and decisions that began in earnest in the mid-1960s, led to the specific formulation of the Islands Trust in 1974, and guided the policy choices this organization made during its first years of operation. While the impact that these choices had in subsequent years was certainly significant, this study will not go on to examine the impact that land-use planning policies and decisions had on the physical environment after the 1970s. Such a study would ask how the institutionalization of a pastoral depiction of the Gulf Islands into planning policies and programs altered the physical, cultural, social, and economic environments of the region. While this type of analysis is certainly necessary in order to provide a fuller understanding of the history of the Islands, it is unfortunately beyond the scope of this study. To begin, the current chapter will serve to introduce a number of the broad themes that inform this study through a review of the work of other scholars.

Literature Review

When we describe land - or, more frequently, remember events that occurred at particular points on it — the natural landscape becomes a centre of meaning, and its geographical features are constituted in relation to our experiences on it. The land is not simply a concrete physical location but a place, charged with personal significance, shaping the images we have of ourselves — Marlene Creates⁷

This thesis takes as a starting point the idea that the landscapes are the product of human intervention, both physical and conceptual. It ascribes to the holistic, ecological belief that the entire human and non-human world is deeply connected.⁸ But, living in the midst of this complexity, humans, past and present, have intervened, seeking to make

⁷ Marlene Creates, *Places of Presence: Newfoundland kin and Ancestral land, Newfoundland 1989-1991* (St. John's, NL: Killick's Press, 1997), 11.

⁸ Fritjof Capra, *The Web of Life: A New Scientific Understanding of Living Systems*, (New York: Anchor Books, 1996); Fritjof Capra, *The Hidden Connections: Integrating the Biological, Cognitive, and Social Dimensions of Life into a Science of Sustainability*, (New York: Doubleday, 2002)

order out of the perceived chaos of nature by superimposing meaning and relationships upon the land and between the organisms that survive on it. Such meanings are not, however, the ephemeral creations of a disembodied mind; rather, they are the product of lived experience in the world. It is an iterative cycle of cause and effect whereby perceptions are shaped by and shape the landscape. These experiences are deeply embedded in particular cultural and historical contexts. So, as much as these perceptions are at heart individual choices, broader human ideas and material structures also circumscribe them. Environmental historians seek to make sense of such relationships by exploring the role and place of nature in human life.⁹ In doing so, they challenge the cultural determinism of traditional historical practices, whereby humans predominately shape rather than are shaped by their environment.¹⁰ Environmental historians, in short, work to reinsert nature into the historical record. They argue that cultural and environmental systems interact, shaping and influencing each other. More than understanding how humans have changed the environment, environmental historians argue that it is important to recognize that the physical environment must be considered as an agent of change in the historical process to understand how human societies develop over time.

Understanding the Gulf Islands, and the Islanders themselves, demands recognition of a simple, yet unstudied point: that these are islands. Islands hold an important, but peculiar place in the western imagination, shaping the ways in which these spaces were developed, perceived, and used over time. This study, then, will rest on the premise that the Gulf Islands' history must be explored in a way that acknowledges the physical fact of their bounded geography. With a few notable exceptions,¹¹ environmental historians have not focused, specifically on islands. Fortunately, however, there is a growing body of literature that examines islands in both a contemporary and historical context. Much scientific interest in islands arises from the early successes of evolutionary biology, most notably with the studies undertaken by Charles Darwin in the

⁹ Donald Worster. "Doing Environmental History," in *Canadian Environmental History: Essential Readings*, ed. David Freeland Duke (Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press, 2006).

¹⁰ William Cronon "The Uses of Environmental History." *Environmental History Review* 17, no.3 (1993): 13.

¹¹ Richard White, *Land Use, Environment, and Social Change- The Shaping of Island County, Washington* (Seattle and London: University of Washington Press, 1980)

Galapagos Islands. As Godfrey Baldacchino explains, part of the lure of islands is that they “suggest themselves as *tabulae rasae*: potential laboratories for any conceivable human project, in thought or action... Something about the insular beckons alluringly. It inspires a greater malleability to grand designs and provides an opportunity for a more thorough control of intervening variables.”¹² It was this potential that drew physical scientists as well as those interested in the possibility of social experiments. Evolutionary anthropologists sought to study social groups in isolation on islands during much of the early twentieth century; the potential for natural laboratories is an alluring idea, and one that originally drew me to the study of the Gulf Islands. The notion of islands as isolated, contained entities remains powerful today; former United Nations Secretary General Kofi Annan has described islands, for example, as “front-line zones of environmental and development problems.”¹³ But, overall, by the 1950s researchers had moved away from the idea that islands, as “self-contained units,” were ideal as sites of analysis and instead, recognized that they needed to be understood in a wider context.¹⁴ Such an understanding led to studies of migration and connections between individuals, communities, and groups among islands.¹⁵ More recent scholarship focuses on the ways that islands are constructed and given meaning in regional, global, and local contexts.¹⁶ An interest in how individuals and groups imagine islands arises, Dennis Cosgrove explains, from the sheer metaphorical breadth that they can take on, becoming “the loci of imagination, desire, hopes, fears.”¹⁷

¹² Godfrey Baldacchino, “Islands as Novelty Sites,” *Geographical Review* 97, no.2 (April, 2007): 166.

¹³ United Nations Secretary-General, Mr Kofi Annan, New York, September 1999.

¹⁴ Karen F. Olwig, “Islands as Places of Being and Belonging,” *Geographical Review* 97, no.2 (April 2007): 261.

¹⁵ For cases of such studies in the Caribbean Islands see: Olwig, “Places of Being and Belonging,” 261. For a broader examination of island scholarship see: Baldacchino, “Islands as Novelty Sites.”

¹⁶ Godfrey Baldacchino, “Islands as Novelty Sites,” 165-174; John Gillis, *Islands of the Mind: How the Human Imagination Created the Atlantic World* (New York, NY: Palsgrave MacMillan, 2004); John R. Gillis and David Lowenthal, “Introduction,” *Geographical Review* 97, no.2 (April 2007): iii-vi; Suzanne Thomas, “Littoral Space(s) - Liquid Edges of Poetic Possibility,” *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies*, 5 no.1 (Spring/Summer 2007): 21-29; Gillis, “Not Continents in Miniature - Islands as Ecotones,” 155-166; Pete Hay, “The Poetics of Island Place - Articulating Particularity,” *Local Environment* 8, no.5 (October 2003): 553-558; Godfrey Baldacchino, “The Coming of Age of Island Studies,” *Tijdschrift Voor Economische En Sociale Geografie* 95 no.3 (July 2004): 272-83; Elaine Stratford, “Flows and Boundaries: Small Island Discourses and the Challenge of Sustainability, Community and Local Environments,” *Local Environment* 8 no.5 (October 2003): 495-499.

¹⁷ Dennis Cosgrove, review of *Islands of the Mind: How the Human Imagination Created the Atlantic World*, by John R. Gillis. *Geografis Annaler Series B: Human Geography* 7, no.4 (2005): 302.

John Gillis has examined this breadth in the greatest historical detail, going so far as to argue that the cultural history of “the West” is an island story. Western fascination with islands as imaginary spaces as well as physical entities, he contends, influenced expansion through the Atlantic region and shaped important ontological elements of the broader culture. While islands are no longer sought after as physical prizes, as they were during the colonial era, the island as a cognitive entity remains an important “symbolic resource” that helps the “West understand itself and its relations with the larger world.”¹⁸ Gillis sees the Western tendency to separate the world into discrete things, what he labels “islanding”, as one way we as individuals, nations, communities, and families construct meaning and navigate the world. In islands, Gillis finds a ready metaphor for these tendencies as well as a potential influence. It is that paradoxical element of islands, as both cause and effect, which he finds so intriguing:

Like all master metaphors, the island is capable of representing a multitude of things. It can symbolize fragmentation and vulnerability, but also wholeness and safety. Islands stand for loss but also recovery. They are figures for paradise and for hell. Islands are where we quarantine the pestilential and exile the subversive, but they are also where we welcome the immigrant and the asylum seeker. They can represent separation and continuity, isolation and connection. Over time, the island has been the West’s favourite location for visions of both the past and future. It is also there that we most readily imagine origins and extinctions.¹⁹

The island as a bounded geographic entity, therefore, is of great significance for how humans understand and use these spaces. Using such ideas as a framework for exploring the Gulf Islands offers useful insight due to the wide range of paradoxical understandings that can be identified in the region’s history. Competing perceptions and uses of space co-existed and developed together. During the first half of the twentieth century, for example, the Gulf Islands were many things to many people. They were seen as places of retreat and luxury for many upper-class English families who sought to recreate their idealized old-world countryside with tennis, lawn bowling, bridge clubs, and social events. At the same time, the Islands became places of penalization and imprisonment for Doukhobors under religious persecution, Chinese immigrants suffering from leprosy, and Penelakut children forced to attend residential school. One of the aims of this thesis is to

¹⁸ Gillis, *Islands of the Mind*, 3.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 3.

understand how these islands were constructed in the imagination of the varied users because Islanders and others, who perceived the Islands as retreats or prisons, did so within the context of wider cultural networks of ideas about the role and meaning of islands.

The focus on island environments is somewhat novel for environmental history, but it is not an entirely unstudied subject. Most prominently, Richard White, one of the earliest American environmental historians, undertook a now classic study of Whidbey and Camano Islands in Puget Sound, just to the south of the area treated in this thesis. White explored how humans changed the environment of the islands and how social change was, in turn, shaped by the physical world. Weaving a complex picture of settlement patterns, politics, and relationships with plant, animal, and landscape changes, White demonstrates the important role of the environment in shaping the economic, political, and cultural development of the region.²⁰ More recently, Canadian historian Claire Campbell examines the history of the Thirty Thousand Islands in Ontario's Georgian Bay, exploring "what happens when imported perspectives confront local conditions [and] what happens when people arrive in a new place with certain agendas and ideas about landscape in mind."²¹ Tracing the waves of newcomers to the region: geologists, surveyors, foresters, hunters, and finally cottagers, Campbell demonstrates the impact that a perception of a region can have on the activities that are promoted and deemed legitimate, as well as on the physical development of the landscape. However, despite both authors' focus on island environments, a recognition of the island as conceptual entity is largely absent from their analysis. White treats Whidbey and Camano's 'islandness' in much the same way as early anthropologists, as convenient laboratories for his study rather than as an influential geographic agent; whereas for Campbell, analysis of perceptions of the area as a wilderness environment overshadowed the importance of the region being an archipelago. Both studies, nevertheless, offer valuable insights into the ways that individuals and groups interact with their environment and form identities through these interactions. While the geographic character of the Gulf Islands was indeed an influential agent in their development, this

²⁰ Richard White, *Land Use, Environment, and Social Change*.

²¹ Claire Campbell, *Shaped by the West Wind: Nature and History in Georgian Bay* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005), 139.

study maintains that the physical environment was not the only agent shaping perceptions.

This study positions the story of the Gulf Islands at the intersection of perceptions derived from the physical environment of islands and broader cultural ideas of liberal agrarianism. Agrarianism is commonly understood as a set of doctrines that share an underlying, albeit vague, notion that “agriculture and those whose occupation involves agriculture, are especially important and valuable elements of society.”²² This moral valorization of agricultural pursuits, and by extension the rural areas where they existed, is a complex and pervasive set of ideas that played an important role in the development of Western Canada. The term ‘agrarianism’ is, however, too encompassing to be of great analytical value. Accordingly, David Demeritt identifies three distinct agrarian discourses that were of importance in British Columbia: arcadianism, agrarianism, and the Country Life Movement. All three of these visions celebrated rural life as the good life, framing it in opposition to the detrimental urban, industrial world that modernity had brought forward.²³

Arcadianism, Demeritt explains, “celebrated the moral virtues and personal benefits of country living.”²⁴ With roots in the ideals of the country gentry in England, this discourse reflected a romantic view of nature that focused on aesthetic and spiritual elements. For those who were refined enough to appreciate it, a rural agricultural life was the pinnacle of human endeavour. This discourse had little to say about the hard labour involved in frontier farming in North America, so when put into practice the largely upper-middle class devotees often faced a hard reality. In other works, particularly in aesthetically focused disciplines such as art history or literary analysis, this discourse overlaps with discussions of the pastoral. The pastoral, however, is best considered as a descriptor, celebrating a ‘pastoral English countryside,’ of rolling green hills, idyllic small agriculture, and tamed nature, rather than being understood as set of beliefs or a discussion about the proper activities one should undertake in the world. Given the moral value placed on this aesthetic in arcadianism, the tropes of pastoralism are important to

²² James A. Montmarquet, *The Idea of Agrarianism: From Hunter-Gatherer to Agrarian Radical in Western Culture* (Moscow, Idaho: University of Idaho Press, 1989): viii.

²³ David Demeritt, “Visions of Agriculture in British Columbia,” *BC Studies* 108, no.29 (December 1995): 29-59.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, 33.

recognize since they helped inform the mental perceptions of the environment that adherents subscribed to and sought to create in the world. Demeritt explores how the arcadian discourse influenced early agricultural settlement in British Columbia, particularly in the Okanagan region where commentators and government officials promoted orcharding as a dignified and gentlemanly agricultural pursuit. Although this class-based vision of leisurely country living often fell victim to its own internal contradictions in the arid Okanagan, the “moral virtues of country life” in British Columbia, “brought countless immigrants many thousands of miles... underwrote irrigation schemes and investment patterns as well as government policy, scientific research, picturesque architecture, flower gardens, boys’ schools, and duck-hunting parties.”²⁵ In short, arcadianism significantly altered not only the social, cultural, and economic environment of the area but the physical landscape as well. Work undertaken by a number of other scholars further supports the existence and lingering impact of arcadianism in the province.²⁶

Demeritt's second agricultural discourse – agrarianism – parallels arcadianism in many important ways but also offers important contrasts. Where arcadianism focuses on the rural bliss found in country life, agrarianism upholds the importance of the independent farmer “as the source of all wealth... [and the nation’s] freedom and democracy.” David Danbom, writing about agrarianism in the American context, goes on to distinguish between romantic and rational agrarians. The romantic agrarian, much like the arcadian, “emphasizes the moral, emotional, and spiritual benefits of agriculture” but differs in rooting these benefits in the independent nature of the agriculturalist’s work rather than the aesthetic and moral superiority of nature and country life.²⁷ Rational agrarians, in contrast, “stress the tangible contributions agriculture and rural people make

²⁵ Demeritt, “Visions of Agriculture,” 40.

²⁶ Marjory Harper, “Aristocratic Adventurers/ British Gentlemen Emigrants on the North American Frontier, ca. 1880-1920,” *Journal of the West* 36, no.2 (April 1997): 41-51. Paul M. Koroscil “A Gentleman Farmer in British Columbia’s British Garden of Eden” in *British Columbia: Settlement History*, ed. Paul M. Koroscil (Burnaby BC: Simon Fraser University, 2000); George Richard, “Price Ellison: A Gilded Man in British Columbia’s Gilded Age,” *BC Historical News* 31, no.3 (Summer 1998): 8-15; Patricia Badir, “Our Performance Careless of Praise- Loss, Recollection, and the Production of Space in Walhachin, British Columbia,” *BC Studies*, no.133 (Spring 2002).

²⁷ David B. Danbom, “Romantic Agrarianism in Twentieth-century America,” *Agricultural History* 65, no.4 (1991): 1.

to a nation's economic and political well being."²⁸ Unlike the wilderness or arcadian movements, agrarianism's spatial vision did not romanticize the natural world; wilderness would ideally yield to an idealized world of productive small family farms as a counter to the detriments of modernity.

Turning to the Canadian context, James Murton's book *Creating the Modern Countryside* explores how the provincial government in British Columbia employed this type of agrarian discourse in an effort to forge a landscape in keeping with the idealized agrarian form as an alternative to modern urban society.²⁹ Murton draws upon Ian McKay's political analysis of Canadian history to argue that the rise of "new liberalism," with its focus on the independent individual, was influential in determining the resettlement of British Columbia's agricultural regions.³⁰ This set of ideas led to "liberal land laws [which] were designed to cultivate an agrarian ideal of individually owned farms providing secure employment to a (male) farmer and his family."³¹ Those inventing and implementing the laws were not rejecting modernity outright, and pushing for a return to pre-modern agriculture; rather they were strongly guided by modern scientific and rational ways of thinking about space. Through expert management, it was believed, a thoroughly 'modern countryside' could be imposed upon the natural world. In many ways, Murton's study, in looking at attempts to improve rural areas, also addresses elements of Demeritt's third discourse.

The Country Life Movement, the final discourse identified by Demeritt, involved a "loosely affiliated group of urban progressives, church leaders, and social reformers who articulated concerns about the degeneration of the countryside."³² Sharing some of the romantic ideals put forward by arcadians, along with the agrarians, and concern over the economic decline of the countryside, Country Life reformers adopted a highly modern, social scientific approach to promote rural development. Using scientific surveys, expert planning, and training interventions, rural degeneration would be reversed with a focus on improving the home, schools, community, and the practice of

²⁸ Ibid., 1.

²⁹ James E. Murton, *Creating a Modern Countryside: Liberalism and Land Resettlement in British Columbia* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2007)

³⁰ Ian McKay, "The Liberal Order Framework: A Prospectus for a Reconnaissance of Canadian History," *Canadian Historical Review* 81, no.4 (December 2000): 617-651.

³¹ Murton, *Creating a Modern Countryside*, 27.

³² Demeritt, "Visions of Agriculture," 47.

agriculture.³³ Country Life reformers believed that the best way to preserve rural life was to “make it more organized, more efficient, and more modern so that it could advance as urban life had done.”³⁴ Again, though, while these discourses of rural life are influential cultural elements, they are also connected to wider societal currents. As noted by Murton, much of the moral associations tied to rural life through these varied discourses can be understood as the outgrowth of their connection to wider political frameworks that have dominated Canadian history.

Liberalism, as Ian McKay has argued, was “an extensive projection of liberal rule across a large territory and an intensive process of subjectification, whereby liberal assumptions are internalized and normalized within the dominion’s subjects.”³⁵ The order that liberalism promoted was one “in which liberty, equality, and private property are sanctified as the foundations of a civil society that valorizes individualism.”³⁶ Liberalism in Canada was integral to the widespread belief in the moral superiority of the rural life. Many late nineteenth and early twentieth century settlers arrived with a strong desire to acquire a farm and achieve self-sufficiency. But as Graeme Wynn explains, this widespread desire was “likely as much a reflection of experience, of long-remembered histories of insecurity, rising rents, evictions and oppression among migrant families, as it was of theoretical or abstract principles” concerning the moral value of the agricultural life. “Wherever its roots lay,” Wynn continued, “the desire to own land spawned a strong sense of private property rights and a lasting affection for the virtues of hard work and self-reliance — of an attachment to some of the central values of liberal individualism — among successful newcomers.”³⁷ Where the settlers Wynn describes found an attachment to the values of liberal individualism, cultural producers – journalists, government communications people, and artists – found a ready expression of the ideal vision of liberalism in the agriculturalist.

³³ Demeritt, “Visions of Agriculture,” 47-53.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, 48.

³⁵ McKay, “The Liberal Order Framework,” 624.

³⁶ Bryan D. Palmer, “Radical Reasoning,” *The Underhill Review* (Fall 2009)

³⁷ Graeme Wynn, foreword to *Wet Prairie: People, Land, and Water in Agricultural Manitoba*, by Shannon Stunden Bower (Vancouver, B.C: University of British Columbia Press, 2011): xvii.

With the rise of modern urban-industrial society, such idealized depictions of rural life became the antithesis and solution to the perceived ill effects of the city.³⁸ Rural areas, or the ‘countryside,’ the term more frequently used in European literature, became a place, like wilderness areas elsewhere, for reconnection with nature, where individuals could be freed from the drudgery of industrial work, and rejuvenated or recreated. Micheal Bunce sees a tendency among Americans and Canadians to “downplay the value of agricultural landscapes, preferring instead to turn to more natural settings for aesthetic and amenity appreciation.”³⁹ The vast ‘wilderness’ spaces that make up large portions of Canada have disproportionally defined the nation’s identity. Canadian environmental historiography has in turn focused heavily on subjects dealing with urban idealizations of wilderness and the efforts that arose from these concepts to conserve, preserve, and create such spaces.⁴⁰ Fortunately, there is a growing body of Canadian scholarship, and particularly among historians of British Columbia, that explores rural life, a topic that Ruth Sandwell extends to the Gulf Islands.⁴¹

³⁸ Raymond Williams, *The Country and the City* (London: Hogarth Press, 1985).

³⁹ Micheal F. Bunce, *The Countryside Ideal: Anglo-american Images of Landscape*. (New York; London: Routledge, 1994), 2.

⁴⁰ For literature on the parks movement see for example: Alan MacEachern, *Natural Selections: Natural Parks in Atlantic Canada, 1935-1970* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001); Ian S. MacLaren eds., *Culturing Wilderness in Jasper National Park: Studies in Two Centuries of Human History in the Upper Athabasca River Watershed* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2007); J. Keri Cronin, *Manufacturing National Park Nature: Photography, Ecology, and the Wilderness Industry of Jasper*, (Vancouver: UBC Press; 2011); Tina Loo, “Making a Modern Wilderness: Conserving Wildlife in Twentieth-century Canada,” *Canadian Historical Review* 82, no.1 (2001); For work on urban parks: Sean Kheraj, *Inventing Stanley Park: An Environmental History*, (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2013); Robert A.J. McDonald, “Holy Retreat' or 'Practical Breathing Spot'?: Class Perceptions of Vancouver's Stanley Park, 1910-1913,” *Canadian Historical Review* 45, no.2 (1984): 127-53; For work on tourism and wilderness see: Patricia Jasen, *Wild Things: Nature, Culture, and Tourism in Ontario, 1790-1914* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995); Jocelyn Thorpe, *Temagami's Tangled Wild: Race, Gender, and the Making of Canadian Nature* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012).

⁴¹ Ruth Sandwell makes a strong case for developing rural history in Canada, and particularly in British Columbia. As she argues, “most historians [of British Columbia] would still concur that evidence of a rural consciousness or even of a rural society has failed to emerge from a historiography that is dominated by mining, logging, and fishing, and theorized within the context of large-scale, laissez-fair capitalism and economic individualism.” By focusing “on social relations of place in areas of low population density,” she sees the potential for new ways of “seeing and understanding the interplay of modern capitalist formations with other social, economic, and cultural patterns.” While there is not yet the substantial rural historiography Sandwell has hoped for, a growing body of scholarship draws upon North American and European models in examining rural areas and perceptions toward the rural world in British Columbia. This thesis will engage these bodies of work to develop an understanding of depictions of the Gulf Islands as rural spaces; R.W. Sandwell, “Notes toward a History of Rural Canada, 1870-1940,” in *Social Transformation in Rural Canada - Community, Cultures, and Collective Action*, ed. Maureen Gail Reed,

In the Gulf Islands, attachment to the central values of liberal individualism gave rise to various forms of agrarian discourse. As Sandwell has demonstrated, the liberal agrarian discourse of the hard working, independent yeoman was prominent during the early settlement period. But, as her micro-historical examination of 19th century settlement on Saltspring Island argues, settlers were far from the idealized versions they were made out to be by government officials.⁴² Rather, Islanders made do through the innovation and diversity that is increasingly recognized as common for rural settlement areas.⁴³ Families survived by spreading their efforts across agriculture, forestry, fishing, mining, hunting, government work, and other seasonal endeavours. When one effort failed, others allowed families to survive. This working arrangement, coupled with the flexibility given by the pre-emption system of land settlement, allowed many small-scale farmers to pursue “security over risk, ease over hard work, and modest sufficiency over the accumulation of wealth.”⁴⁴ These goals were at odds with the official discourse of rural settlement as one of “commercially successful family farms run by sober and respectable men.”⁴⁵

Building upon Sandwell’s insights, this thesis aims to demonstrate that during the first half of the twentieth-century, the mixed economy of the Gulf Islands region continued to flourish, along with a wide range of uses and perceptions about the landscape. At the same time, the ‘official’ discourse put forward by the government, which articulated a liberal agrarian view of the Islands, while not necessarily reflective of the lifestyle of Islanders, remained influential. Islanders and outside decision makers

and John Parkins (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012), 21-42; R.W Sandwell. “Introduction,” in *Beyond the City Limits: Rural History in British Columbia*, ed. R.W Sandwell (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1999).

⁴² R. W. Sandwell, *Contesting Rural Space: Land Policy and the Practices of Resettlement on Saltspring Island, 1859-1891* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005).

⁴³ Sandwell, “Notes toward a History of Rural Canada, 1870-1940” 21-42; J.S. Little *Crofters and Habitants: Settler Society, Economy, and Culture in a Quebec Township, 1848-1881* (Montreal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1991); Graeme Wynn, *Timber Colony: A Historical Geography of Early Nineteenth Century New Brunswick* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981).

⁴⁴ Sandwell, *Contesting Rural Space*, 6; Cole Harris and David Demeritt identify mixed agricultural economies as a characteristic feature of early settlement in British Columbia. In contrast to Sandwell, however, this tendency is seen less as a conscious choice. They argue that uncertainty with regards to what can be grown in the region and how to do so, “coupled with the subsistence needs of farm households and the labour requirement of pioneering, tended to produce a highly diversified, mixed agriculture.” Cole Harris and David Demeritt, “Farming and Rural Life,” in *The Resettlement of British Columbia: Essays on Colonialism and Geographical Change*, ed. Cole Harris (Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press, 1997): 222.

⁴⁵ Sandwell, *Contesting Rural Space*, 6.

sought to develop a productive agricultural economy and pressed for progress based on individual enterprise and hard work. In these pursuits, one can identify elements of rational agrarianism and the Country Life movement. Nonetheless, an alternative depiction of the Islands as an arcadian paradise of leisurely agricultural production in an ideal pastoral setting came to overshadow these ideas. Starting in the twentieth century, middle-class English settlers, as well as external and internal cultural producers, sought to transplant this vision of a country lifestyle to the Islands. Neither depiction was simply and clearly defined; they were instead paradoxical negotiations of a rapidly changing social, economic, and physical environment. For the former view, the paradox lay in the desire to maintain the rural lifestyle but at the same time strive for progress and success as defined by the liberal order. The arcadian depiction offered a paradox as well in its desire for comfort, amenities, and convenience that allowed the leisured lifestyle to flourish unimpeded, but also for a desire to maintain the tranquility and solitude that comes from a lack of development. Beyond their relationship with liberal individualism, these paradoxical perspectives can also be understood as part of a widespread anti-modern tendency in the twentieth century.

Understood as an important element of the wider cultural context, many academic studies identify expressions of antimodernist sentiment.⁴⁶ Modernity is a term used to describe the result of a period of significant change in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Transformative changes associated with the capitalist revolution refashioned the economic and industrial character of North American society from primarily rural and agricultural to urban and industrial, in turn resulting in rapid social change. Behind this widespread change was the amorphous ideological thrust of modernism, a broad set of ideas typically traced to the Enlightenment that upheld a belief in progress, absolute truth, technocentrism, and the rational standardization of knowledge and production. As society moved toward a system built on modernist ideals of progress, changes in the social, economic, and cultural fabric of North American life provoked not

⁴⁶ Sharon Wall. *The Nurture of Nature: Childhood, Antimodernism and Ontario Summer Camps, 1920-55* (Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press, 2009); Keith Walden, *Becoming Modern in Toronto: The Industrial Exhibition and the Shaping of a Late Victorian Culture* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997); Loo, "Making a Modern Wilderness"; Ian McKay, *Quest of the Folk: Antimodernism and Cultural Selection in Twentieth-Century Nova Scotia* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994).

only pride, excitement, wonder, and optimism, but also profound anxiety, scepticism, and a rejection of progress. The concept of antimodernism, as defined by Jackson Lears, captures this broadly negative and reactionary response to the range of social and economic changes people faced in the modern world. Individuals felt that something was being lost with progress and this sense of loss was manifest in a yearning for more intense and authentic forms of physical and spiritual existence, which, it was believed, existed in the premodern world.⁴⁷ But, it too was a paradoxical desire. Despite their devotion to an idealized pre-modern world, twentieth century antimodernists were ambivalently tied to the modern world they sought to escape. It was, as Ian McKay argues, a process of “modernizing antimodernism,” whereby antimodern spaces, people, or traditions became valuable through their insertion into the modern economic and cultural world.⁴⁸ Antimodernists were at once deeply critical of the modern world and strongly attached to elements of an earlier time, but also enthusiastic about the material progress of their society. This tension emerges in the Gulf Islands during the 1950s when residents advocated for more modern and frequent ferries while at the same time resisting the degradation of the traditional rural character of the area that these improvements seemingly brought. As such, antimodernism cannot be understood as a simple rejection of modern life, but rather as one of the many complex ways that actors negotiated change in an effort to fashion an alternative that was different yet inevitably modern. Understood as a diverse cultural phenomenon, rather than a monolithic resistance to progress, individuals, government officials, politicians, cultural producers, and others enacted antimodernism in highly variable ways. Although an amorphous concept, antimodernism is, Jackson Lears maintains, a useful analytical categorization for a broad set of actions, a conclusion with which a number of scholars agree.⁴⁹

Ian McKay explains broad antimodern sentiments in terms of a range of “enabling frameworks”⁵⁰ in his study of the emergence of “the Folk” in mid-twentieth century Nova Scotia. Middle-class cultural producers — visual artists, folklorists, writers, advertisers, and government officials — constructed the ‘Folk’ through an idealized reading of the

⁴⁷ Jackson Lears, *No Place of Grace: Antimodernism and the Transformation of American Culture, 1880-1920* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1981).

⁴⁸ McKay, *Quest of the Folk*, 109-110.

⁴⁹ Lears, *No Place of Grace*.

⁵⁰ McKay, *Quest of the Folk*, xvi.

province's rural fishing communities. In the imagination of these cultural producers, McKay argues, the 'Folk' were hardy and independent fisherfolk who lived a simple subsistence life by the sea in tightly woven communities, passing down songs and stories from generation to generation along with traditional handicraft skills. While elements of the 'Folk' were certainly valid, folklorist Helen Creighton, for example, was able to build an entire career collecting stories and songs from rural Nova Scotians; through the process of cultural selection and invention, individuals like Creighton as much invented the 'Folk' as discovered and preserved them.⁵¹ McKay argues that the 'Folk' became the predominant enabling framework for a wide range of middle-class cultural producers in the province to think about the impacts of modernity.⁵² In response to the pressures and insecurities brought on by the social and economic changes of the twentieth century, many Nova Scotians began to adhere to this conception of their history that, while largely fabricated, offered an escape and politically acceptable defining identity. Although not as clearly articulated as the 'Folk' in Nova Scotia, the notion of a 'Gulf Islands character' was used extensively by residents, politicians, and policy makers as a similar 'enabling framework' to capture a broad set of ideas about the landscape, history, and identity of the region. As well, in a similar way as the 'Folk,' the 'Gulf Islands character' was both a conscious construction, developed to achieve certain objectives, as well as a genuine expression of a community's emerging sense of itself.

There is a pessimism to McKay's analysis, because for him, the 'Folk' was a construction of middle- and upper-class individuals who sought to promote tourism and engage in forms of identity politics. These ideas are a reflection of wider scholarship surrounding the formation of group identity at the time of McKay's writing. As Eric Hobsbawm and Terrance Ranger posit, group identity is the by-product of the elite and other powerful cultural producers who seek to establish certain perceptions for the sake

⁵¹ In British Columbia, Imbert Orchard took on a similar role to Creighton. As Robert Budd argues Orchard sought out a distinct British Columbian 'folk' character for his recordings and presented them as the authentic voice of early settlement in the province. Within this collection, the Gulf Islands are well represented with 35 of the 998 interviews conducted being from the islands. In addition, the produced collections from these recordings are clear depictions of the creation of a 'folk' culture in the province. Robert Budd. 'The Story of the Country: Imbert Orchard's Quest for Frontier Folk in British Columbia 1870-1914, (MA Thesis University of Victoria, 2000); Derek Reimer eds. "The Gulf Islanders," *Sound Heritage*, v. 5 no. 4. (Victoria, 1976).

⁵² McKay, *Quest of the Folk*, 8.

of normalizing and consolidating their socio-political authority.⁵³ In contrast, other scholars, such as Benedict Anderson, whose breakthrough concept of “imagined communities” offers insight far beyond its original moorings, and Michael Billig, have argued that identities are rooted in the everyday elements of the popular classes.⁵⁴ Instead of being created in performative spaces dominated by the elite, community and group identity finds grounding in popular forms of cultural transmission. Anderson, for example, highlighted the democratizing influence that the evolution of the printing press had on the development and widespread usage of print media for cultural production. Embracing these more nuanced treatments in his study of orcharding in British Columbia, Jason Bennett argues against the notion that depictions of rural life were entirely upper class anti-modern responses “steeped in hopeless idealism and a naive avoidance of modern life.”⁵⁵ Rather, Bennett’s protagonists, fruit farmers in the Okanagan, demonstrate that collective identities are not simply imposed upon individuals; they are actively resisted, embraced, evolved, and applied. In the Gulf Islands a similarly complex narrative can be observed as urban writers, visitors, seasonal residents, retirees, and long-time Islanders together participated in shaping the collective identity of the region over the twentieth century.

Complicating this dynamic further is the recognition of the role of heritage and history-making in the formation of collective identities and perceptions of the landscape. As many have argued, identities are deeply tied to the present use of individual and group memory.⁵⁶ As Zelizer argues, “the study of memory, then, is much more than the unidimensional study of the past. It represents a graphing of the past as it is used for present aims.”⁵⁷ Therefore, what we see in the Gulf Islands echoes that of McKay’s studies of the ‘Folk,’ where cultural producers use a selective reading of history to justify

⁵³ Eric Hobsbawm and Terrence Ranger, *The Invention of Tradition*, (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1983)

⁵⁴ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, Rev. and extend ed. (London, England: Verso, 1991); Michael Billig, *Banal Nationalism* (Thousand Oaks, California; London: Sage, 2012).

⁵⁵ Jason Patrick Bennett, “Blossoms and Borders: Cultivating Apples and a Modern Countryside in the Pacific Northwest, 1890-2001,” (PhD diss., University of Victoria, 2008): 19.

⁵⁶ David Glassberg, “Public History and the Study of Memory,” *The Public Historian*. 18, no.2, (1996): 7-23; Ian McKay, “History and the Tourist Gaze: The Politics of Commemoration in Nova Scotia, 1935-1964,” *Acadiensis* 22, no.2 (1993): 102-38.

⁵⁷ Barbie Zelizer, “Reading the Past Against the Grain: The Shape of Memory Studies,” *Critical Studies in Mass Communication* 12, no.2 (June 1995): 217.

and deepen the legitimacy of a preferred identity. The ‘Gulf Islander,’ that person who truly belongs on the Islands, develops as the authentic inhabitant and the leisured island lifestyle as the historically grounded existence. Institutions such as newspapers, social groups, and historical societies developed to create and preserve this identity using the written word. Through these means, and bolstered by the official discourse of the tourism industry, this arcadian island identity developed, but as with all place memory there is a totalizing and exclusionary power behind it. The islands of leisure and easy arcadian bliss neglected the back breaking work of Japanese labourers who cleared land for English settlers at the turn of the century or the co-operative Japanese farmers who toiled to build a large-scale collective agricultural operation before having their land and possessions expropriated and sold during the Second World War; the First Nations children forced to attend a residential school on Kuper Island; the histories of imprisonment on D’arcy Island; and the manufacture of dynamite on James Island.⁵⁸ Such a selective reading of the Islands’ history normalized a collective identity that was very much a construction, but it did not materialize immediately, nor was it entirely the conscious manipulation of elite cultural producers. In time though, this reading did become the accepted narrative and when the need for planning became apparent, it was this ‘true’ Gulf Islands’ identity and the associated perspective of what the region’s environment had been and should be that shaped land-use planning decisions in the Gulf Islands.

Emerging as a profession in the twentieth century, planning embodied a very modern belief in the revolutionary potential of human rationality. Not only could planners understand the complexities of social reality and, therefore, predict the effects of change, but they could also, in their own estimation, design “systems” — from transportation to sewage, or from housing to health care — that went beyond merely coping with change to shaping it to improve the quality of people’s lives.⁵⁹ As an arm of the state, one of the central goals of planning is control. The natural world and our

⁵⁸ For more information on these events see: Marie Elliot, “The Japanese of Mayne Island,” *British Columbia Historical News* 23, no.4 (Fall 1990): 15-16; Beryl Mildred Cryer and Chris Arnett, *Two Houses Half-buried in Sand: Oral Traditions of the Hul’q’umi’num’ Coast Salish of Kuper Island and Vancouver Island* (Vancouver: Talonbooks, 2007); C. J. Yorath, *A Measure of Value: The Story of the D’arcy Island Leper Colony* (Victoria, B.C: TouchWood Editions, 2000); Bea Bond, *Looking Back on James Island* (Sidney, BC: Porthole Press Ltd, 1991)

⁵⁹ Tina Loo, "People in the Way: Modernity, Environment, and Society on the Arrow Lakes," *BC Studies* no.142 (Summer 2004): 168.

interactions with it, however, are far from simple, and the ambiguity that is inherent in our relationship to the landscape cannot be easily and fully controlled. Responding to this complexity, James C. Scott has argued, the state has historically sought to make its “subject and terrain ‘legible’ through a process of simplification, abstraction, and standardization.”⁶⁰ Recognizing this process of simplification is necessary in understanding efforts to preserve and conserve territory. The dilemma is that preserved areas involve the preservation of something and that something must be defined. Western policy systems are ill-suited or unwilling to handle ambiguity. In the Gulf Islands during the post-war era, rapid change made obvious the need for planning, but this need also necessitated increasing conformity in identity and perspectives towards what the Islands were. The vision of the Islands as harboring an arcadian lifestyle in a pastoral setting became normalized, though not without contentions, as the ‘official’ version of the Gulf Islands. This was in part a response by new residents seeking to identify themselves as being of the place, outside cultural producers seeking to define the area, and a response by all interested parties to the perceived threats to these identities brought on by rapid social, economic, and ecological change in the 1950s and 60s.

Alongside these ideas, though, were tenets of liberal agrarian values and a wider liberal belief in the value of individual property rights and local control that had existed throughout the century. In the traditional liberal view, the state’s mandate is to facilitate and protect the wealth-generating activities of individuals, but in the 1970s, a growing recognition of the collective need for government intervention for the protection of natural and cultural resources emerged. These ideas presented new challenges to a provincial state traditionally devoted to upholding individual freedoms in pursuit of capital accumulation. In this context, the state was called upon to regulate and limit individual liberties and aspirations in the interest of planning for the common or collective good, as defined in more than monetary terms. The debate around the future of the region, therefore, became less about material progress and more about the development of individual lifestyles as the preservationist mandate became prominent. But strong undercurrents of belief in individual property rights, entrepreneurship, and

⁶⁰ Murton, “Creating Order,” 11; James Scott, *Seeing Like a State: Why Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998).

development remained predominant in the debate. Recognizing the origins and wider context of these varied ideas about the Gulf Islands is of some help in understanding conflicts that arose in the 1950s and debates that surrounded the planning processes through the 1960s and 70s. However, while the categories of agrarianism, arcadianism, liberalism, and anti-modernism are useful analytical frameworks, in the context of an acquisitive society permeated by the values of capitalism and private property rights, ideas and depictions of what the Gulf Islands were, are, and could be varied considerably over time, across the region, and among interested groups. Opposing ideas were not set against one another so much as they were in constant flux. The process of development in the Gulf Islands was, for Islanders, an ongoing negotiation that this study will seek to illuminate by applying the insights from the above bodies of work.

Gulf Islands Literature Review

Apart from seeking to contribute to an emerging body of scholarship on environmental and land-use management in Canada in the later half of the twentieth century,⁶¹ this thesis will also contribute to and draw upon the limited historical research of the Gulf Islands region. While numerous popular histories exist about the Islands, both collectively⁶² and individually,⁶³ as well as novels, poetry, and travel accounts,⁶⁴ to date

⁶¹ Tina Loo, "People in the Way," 161-97; Dean Bavington, *Managed Annihilation: An Unnatural History of the Newfoundland Cod Collapse* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2010); Paul Nadasdy, *Hunters and Bureaucrats: Power, Knowledge, and Aboriginal-State Relations in the Southwest Yukon* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2003)

⁶² See for example: Peter Murray, *Homesteads and Snug Harbours - The Gulf Islands* (Ganges, BC: Horsdal & Schubart, 1991); Marie Anne Elliott, *Mayne Island and the Outer Gulf Islands: a History*, (Ganges, BC: Gulf Islands Press, 1984); British Columbia Historical Association, Gulf Islands Branch, *A Gulf Islands Patchwork: Some Early Events on the Islands of Galiano, Mayne, Saturna, North and South Pender* (Sidney, B.C.: Peninsula Printing Co., 1961); Arthur Fielding Sweet, *Islands in Trust* (Lantzville: Oolichan, 1988)

⁶³ See for example: Marie Anne Elliott, "A History of Mayne Island," (MA Thesis, University of Victoria, BC, 1982); Charles Kahn, *Salt Spring: The Story of an Island* (Madeira Park, B.C.: Harbour Publishing, 1998); Neil Aitken, *Island Time: Gabriola, 1874-1879* (Gabriola, B.C.: Reflections, 1993); Margery Comgall, *The History of Hornby Island* (Courtenay: Comox District Free Press, 1969); A.F. Flucke, "Early Days on Saltspring Island," *B.C. Historical Quarterly* 15 no.3-4 (1951); Bea Hamilton, *Salt Spring Island* (Vancouver: Mitchell Press, 1969); June Harrison, *The People of Gabriola: A History of Our Pioneers* (Gabriola: privately printed, c. 1982); Irene Howard, *Bowen Island 1872-1972* (Bowen Island: Bowen Island Historians, 1973); Winnifred A. Isbister, *My Ain Folk: Denman Island 1875-1975* (Comox Valley: Bickle, 1976).

been there is relatively little scholarly work done on planning initiatives in the region. During the 1970s, in the context of heightened public interest in the fate of the Islands, there was some interest by planning and political science scholars in analyzing the success of the solutions put into place. The earliest study, a University of British Columbia (UBC) masters thesis submitted by Julia Glover for the School of Community and Regional Planning, explores the planning context in the region and puts forward a draft proposal for an Islands Trust in response to the 1973 report of the Legislative Committee on Municipal Matter's report which recommended such an agency.⁶⁵ The second study, a UBC PhD dissertation in Resource Management Sciences prepared by Laura Porcher, submitted six years after the formation of the Islands Trust, examines the Trust and assesses the agency's success.⁶⁶ A similar study, conducted over a decade later by David Jones in fulfilment of a Masters degree in Political Science at Simon Fraser University, develops a theoretical framework for assessing whether the Islands Trust could be considered a form of local government.⁶⁷ Together, these studies provide a strong institutional history of the Islands Trust from its inception to the mid-1990s. However, as none of these scholars examine the longer-term trends that led to the development of the Trust idea, there remains a significant gap in the literature that needs to be addressed in order to contextualize and fully understand the lessons of the Islands Trust.

Literary scholar Anne Rayner offers perhaps the strongest cultural history of the region, examining the emergence of a distinct regional literature produced by Islanders

⁶⁴ Michael Blades, *Day of Two Sunsets: Paddling Adventures on Canada's West Coast* (Victoria: Orca, 1993); M. Wylie. Blanchet, *The Curve of Time* (Sidney: Gray's, 1968); Nick Bantock, Iain T. Benson, Lisa Hobbs Birnie, Neil Boyd, Robert Bringhurst, Victor Chan, P. F. Clarke, et al., *Howe Sounds: Facts, Fiction and Fantasy from the Writers of Bowen Island* (Bowen Island, B.C: Bowen Island Arts Council, 1994); Phyllis Bultmann, *Border Boating: Twelve Cruises Through the San Juan and Gulf Islands* (Seattle: Pacific Search Press, 1979); David Conover, *Once Upon an Island* (Markham: PaperJacks, 1972); David Conover, *One Man's Island* (Markham: PaperJacks, 1972); David Conover, *Sitting on a Salt Spring* (Markham: PaperJacks, 1978); Al Cummings and Jo Cummings, *Gunkholing in the Gulf Islands*. Rev. ed. (Edmonds, WA: Nor'westing, 1989); Tim Lander, eds. *To an Inland Sea: Poems for the Strait of Georgia* (Nanaimo: Nanaimo Publisher's Collective, 1992)

⁶⁵ Julia M. Glover, "The Island Trust Concept: A Proposed Institutional Arrangement to Implement a Policy of Controlled Development for the Gulf Islands of British Columbia," (MSc Thesis, University of British Columbia, 1970)

⁶⁶ Laura Kathryn Porcher, "The Islands Trust: An Institutional Experiment in the Management of Scarce Natural and Social Resources," (Ph.D. dissertation, University of British Columbia, 1980)

⁶⁷ David Keith Jones, "British Columbia's Islands Trust On The Local Government Continuum-Administrative Agency Or Local Self-Government?" (MA Thesis, Simon Fraser University, 1994)

and others about the Gulf Islands.⁶⁸ In this body of literature, she argues, the Islands “function as objects of pastoral desire.” Tropes of pastoralism, “discovery, and settlement provide convenient, familiar frames for neo-colonial experiences of nature and representation of landscape.” Through her ten chapters, she examines the breadth of Islands literature and develops a strong chronicle of regional identity as expressed through the printed word. Rayner’s study provides this thesis with a depth of literary analysis that it could not have hoped to achieve otherwise. From this foundation, this thesis examines alternative sources: government publications, newspapers, and personal records, to confirm that these tropes and narratives were a reflection of wider regional attitudes, places their development in a socio-political context, and demonstrates how these depictions were embraced, challenged, and used by residents, visitors, and decision makers. Moreover, Rayner’s study takes notice of other ways of discussing the Islands that are not reflected in the regional literature. While the tropes of pastoralism are certainly prominent, there is also a strong adherence to rational agrarianism in regional identity through the first half of the century, reflected in the actions of pro-development organizations working in the Islands. Therefore, this thesis aims to build upon Rayner’s work to offer a more complete picture of the cultural identity of the Gulf Islands in the twentieth century.

Finally, a 2014 PhD dissertation by Howard Stewart provides an environmental history of the Strait of Georgia, the body of water within which the Gulf Islands are located.⁶⁹ Through five parallel histories, Stewart examines a range of environmental issues: transportation, resource extraction, pollution, indigenous dispossession, and recreation. Given the breadth of his subject, the Gulf Islands feature less prominently than do metropolitan Vancouver and Victoria, but he does offer a detailed examination of the Gulf Islands and the “Strait as an exceptionally valuable recreational space” through the twentieth century.⁷⁰ Stewart briefly describes the development of the Islands Trust, as “one of the most innovative and controversial responses to growing competition among

⁶⁸ Anne Patricia Rayner, “Everything Becomes an Island: Gulf Islands Writing and the Construction of Region,” (Ph.D dissertation, University of British Columbia, 1995).

⁶⁹ Howard Macdonald Stewart, “Five Easy Pieces On The Strait Of Georgia: Reflections On The Historical Geography Of The North Salish Sea,” (PhD Dissertation, University of British Columbia, 2014).

⁷⁰ Stewart, “Five Easy Pieces On The Strait Of Georgia,” 295.

recreational demands on the Strait.”⁷¹ While understandable, given the thrust of the narrative, this argument misrepresents the range of competing ideals that influenced the creation of the Trust. More than simply the demands of competing recreational uses, controversy around the Islands Trust centred on issues of local democratic control, economic viability of industry including agriculture, tourism, and forestry, property ownership and rights, and environmental conservation as an end in itself. This thesis hopes to offer a more complete explanation for the creation of the Trust by demonstrating the broader range of issues involved in its formation.

Thesis Summary

In the following three chapters, this thesis will explore the formation and changes in perceptions of the Gulf Islands environment and ask how they influenced the development of land-use planning structures and decisions, and contributed to the creation, mandate, and operations of the Islands Trust. Along with developing a brief review of early settlement, Chapter 1 provides an overview of the region’s development during the first half of the twentieth century, arguing that the Islands increasingly came to be seen as an idyllic pastoral environment, one reflective of the leisured agricultural lifestyle of the English countryside. While this depiction of the Islands drew upon realities in the physical and cultural environment, it did not, however, embrace the developing modern rural agricultural society that was predominate in the area during the period. Chapter 2 looks closely at the drivers of change that influenced post Second World War development in the Gulf Islands. The decline of the Islands’ agricultural economy and an aging settler population, along with provincial and nationwide increases in prosperity and disposable income, the emergence of the retirement phenomenon, increased vacationing and seasonal residency, growing environmental awareness, improved transportation networks, shifting industrial needs, and rising real estate values coalesced to substantially increase pressure for development on the Gulf Islands. This pressure, seen primarily in the rapid development of both seasonal and permanent residential properties, gave rise to an urgent desire to ‘preserve’ the Gulf Islands. In this

⁷¹ Ibid., 345.

context, the questions of what to preserve, why, for whom, and how, became the source of debate. Through these debates, the evolving conception of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral landscape became tied to a more articulate regional identity that emphasized leisured lifestyles of modest artisanal, agricultural, and contemplative pursuits. Finally, Chapter 3 looks at how planners and policy makers resolved the desire for preservation and instituted controls on development. After nearly a decade of unsuccessful attempts by planning departments in the various regional districts, the provincial government, administered by the newly elected New Democratic Party of Dave Barrett stepped in to reassess the issue of Gulf Islands preservation and determined a course of action that rested on establishing the Islands Trust, an overarching land management organization. The accepted depiction of the Gulf Islands as a unique and fragile pastoral environment became embedded in land-use planning and policy structures of the Islands Trust, thus ascribing legitimacy and a greater degree of permanence to this particular idea of the Islands, a result which has had lasting impact on the landscape and environment of the region.

Chapter 2: 'Islands of Enchantment' - Early Conceptions of the Gulf Islands, 1900-1940

Even today, arriving in the Gulf Islands, one is struck by a scene of tall dark forests extending down steep slopes to the water below; breaking the uniformity of water and forest are rolling green hills and meadows that reveal cottages and small farms. Confronted by this scene, it is understandable that commentators in the past perceived in this landscape the quintessence of the pastoral aesthetic. As this thesis argues, however, this scene is cultivated like the soil of the farms and, like a man-made garden, is neither entirely natural nor unnatural. This chapter will develop a foundation for understanding how a perception of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral environment arose during the first half of the twentieth century. European settlers developed a vibrant community, centered on small-scale mixed farming, tailored to meet subsistence needs and a range of seasonal wage-labour pursuits in forestry, fishing, mining, and other industries. Despite these developments, and the hard work necessary to achieve them, cultural producers, government officials, tourism promoters, and residents seeking to articulate a regional identity after the Second World War put forward a depiction of the Islands as a pastoral environment, created and maintained by leisured agricultural pursuits. The aesthetic these interests adopted was a response to both the natural environment of the Gulf Islands with its mild climate, rugged hills, fertile valleys, dense forests, and open meadows, and the landscape changes wrought on by agricultural settlement. As well, the pastoral depiction drew heavily upon a brief, but significant, period of settlement by middle and upper class English migrants on the Islands, whose lifestyles, values, and desires embodied broad arcadian ideals that valorized a leisured agricultural existence, legitimizing the pastoral idealization of landscape. Therefore, while such pastoral depictions did not reflect the entirety of life on the Islands, they were grounded in important aspects of the physical and cultural environment of the early twentieth century.

'Jewels in a Backing of Silver' - The Gulf Islands Environment

They are bewitching and bewitched: the home of golden dawns and crimson sunsets, of incredible mirages and the whistling flight of ducks, of a tranquility that is Nature's own recompense for grim upheavals in the long ago. – Victoria Daily Colonist¹

The landscape and environment of the Gulf Islands offer a consistently striking scene for those, both residents and visitors, who write about the region. As one turn of the century journalist wrote approvingly, the Islands, “large and small, set in the calm waters of the Gulf are like jewels in a backing of silver, while away in the distance the snow-clad mountain peaks rise.”² The environment of the Islands is for many the starting point of their discussions and so it is fitting to begin this study in a similar fashion.

Initiating a discussion of the environment with the climate of the Gulf Islands is to begin in the same spot as most who have lived, travelled, and written in the region. The much commented upon mild climate of the Gulf Islands is described as west coast summer dry, “characterized by a dry, warm summer and cool, mild, and wet winters.”³ In the winter, the Davidson Current, running north along the West coast of the United States from Baja California, brings a great quantity of warm water to the Pacific Northwest. The resulting transfer of heat and moisture into the atmosphere pushes this large mass of warm, wet air up into the mountains of Vancouver Island and Washington where it cools and deposits much of its moisture. As more warm air continues to rise, it pushes the drier cool air further east where it descends towards the Gulf Islands becoming warmer, but with little moisture remaining, the air mass tends to produce cloudy weather as opposed to the heavy rainfall found elsewhere on the coast.⁴ In other instances, this warm, moist air may be channelled through the Strait of Juan de Fuca, bringing heavy rains to the Gulf Islands. By contrast, during the summer cool water from deep in the Pacific Ocean rises up and lies off the coast of Vancouver Island and into the Strait of Juan de Fuca, dropping air temperature. Moving eastward overland, these air masses gradually warm but the weather in the Gulf Islands usually remains cool, clear, calm, and quite dry during this period. As these weather patterns would suggest, rainfall can vary considerably with the

¹ “The Enchanted Isles,” *Victoria Daily Colonist*, September 26, 1943, 4.

² “A Delightful holiday trip,” *Colonist*, August 20, 1901, 5.

³ S. Eis & D. Craigdallie, *Gulf Islands of British Columbia: A Landscape Analysis* (Victoria, B.C.: Environment Canada Forestry Service, December 1980), 11.

⁴ *Ibid.*, 11.

season. Approximately 75 per cent of the Gulf Islands' annual precipitation falls between the beginning of October and the end of March. The infrequent and usually light summer rain meets the rocky and steep topography of the Islands, exacerbating drought conditions by effectively shedding water and providing minimal freshwater storage. Cracks in the bedrock are the main location for limited groundwater storage, which some residents can access through wells. Otherwise, a very limited number of lakes and small ponds are scattered throughout the Islands. But it is not only the moderate climate, further tempered by the Islands' location in the rain shadow of the coastal mountains, that has drawn the attention of European commentators. The islands themselves – steep, rugged, and numerous – rising up from the blue waters of the Gulf, offer much upon which to remark.

In addition to the ten major islands considered within the study, the archipelago consists of hundreds of smaller islands and islets ranging from a few miles to a few meters wide. Large streams shaped the land of the islands before the last glacial period, developing a steep and rugged topography with ridges running generally in a west-northwest to east-southeast direction. (See Map 2) Valleys between these ridges extend into bays, which continue with steep walls and deep water extending close to shore on either side, framing beaches of fine sand at their mouth. During the last glacial period, 10 to 15 thousand years ago, a sheet of ice estimated to be approximately one kilometre thick covered the Gulf Islands.⁵ Pressure from this mass of ice scoured the land as it passed and with the release of downward pressure following the retreat of the ice sheet, the islands rose and tilted, giving the land a distinctly angular characteristic.⁶ At the same time, substantial melt water from the retreating glaciers revived earlier drainage and river channels that had been frozen over, in the process shifting sandy glacial deposits from the uplands to low-lying valley bottoms. This tilting of the landmass, coupled with the exposure of buried sedimentary rock layers, allowed for greater erosion on the southern shores of the islands, giving them their rugged topography of steep cliffs and shorelines without beaches. Slower erosion and the angle of the land resulted in the North shore having moderate and gentle slopes with flat rock surfaces extending out into the intertidal

⁵ S. Eis & D. Craigdallie, *Gulf Islands of British Columbia*, 7.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 17-19.

zone. While steep in some areas, the space between the southern and northern shorelines was made up of gently sloping or rolling hills, interspersed with narrow, lush valleys.

Despite the thinness of the soil in areas, vegetation on the islands, like much of the coast, flourished in the moderate climate. The landscape encountered by early settlers was one dominated by Douglas-fir, along with lodgepole pine, arbutus, and Garry oak on dry and disturbed sites and southern slopes. On moist and northern slopes, Douglas-fir forests were interspersed with western hemlock, red cedar, grand fir, red alder, and bigleaf maple. But, unlike other parts of the coast, the islands were not uniformly covered with dense coastal rainforest; climate, topography, and Aboriginal management worked together to create a seemingly natural pastoral environment. Shallow soil in places, coupled with the seasonality of rainfall, produced natural meadows of small, grassy clearings scattered throughout the forest, predominately at higher elevations where the soil is thinnest and rocky outcrops most numerous. Coast Salish residents further enhanced these meadows and created others with the regular use of fires set “to enhance fruit and root harvests and hunting opportunities in an intensively modified, culturally maintained landscape.”⁷ For those Euro-Canadians looking upon the Islands early in the twentieth century, these “sunny open spaces,” as one *Colonist* reporter described them in 1922, broke up the otherwise dense, dark coastal forest and presented a natural pastoral landscape where “sweet wild flowers and fruits bloomed and ripened in the soft salubrious air.”⁸ This pastoral picture of the Islands was only amplified by agricultural and residential clearing that opened the valleys in the late 19th century, dotting the shoreline with pleasant grassy slopes, rolling into the water. Relaying the story of a tour through the Islands at the turn of the century, a reporter for the *Colonist*, was pleased to note that numerous farms existed to “redeem the islands from the lonely savagery of unreclaimed nature.”⁹ Together, the climate, topography, vegetation, and human

⁷ Tara G Martin, Peter Arcese, and Nanda Scheerder, “Browsing Down Our Natural Heritage: Deer Impacts on Vegetation Structure and Songbird Populations Across an Island Archipelago,” *Biological Conservation* 144 no.1 (2011): 459.

⁸ “Gulf Islands of British Columbia,” *Colonist*, December 3, 1922, 27.

⁹ “A Delightful Holiday trip,” *Colonist*, August 20, 1901, 5.

intervention created a Gulf Islands environment that was unique for Canada, fostering a perception of the region as something akin to an “Eden” on the West Coast.¹⁰

Early Settlement, 1855-1900

Apart from the Vancouver Island and mainland colonies, the Gulf Islands were some of the first places to be settled in the province. John Tod, a Chief Factor of the Hudson’s Bay Company (HBC), became the first European property owner, purchasing a tract of land on Pender Island in 1855 to run a flock of sheep. Tod would commute several times a year by sailboat from Pender Island to conduct business with the HBC in Victoria and Vancouver.¹¹ Compared to the challenge of moving to, from, and within the rugged interior of the province, the interconnecting waterways provided the Gulf Islands with a relatively manageable transportation system. This ease of movement, along with proximity to the two major urban centres, Vancouver and Victoria, was a major driver for early settlement. When the gold rush on the Fraser River began in 1858, Mayne Island quickly developed as a hub, offering a stopping point for prospectors en route to the mainland. Of the Outer Islands, Mayne also boasted some of the largest tracts of quality agricultural land, which drew a number of prospectors to return following their often-unsuccessful forays into the gold fields.¹² While clearing the dense coastal forests was demanding work, often requiring the use of explosives to dislodge the stumps that remained, settlers found in the Islands a relatively well-connected and temperate opportunity to develop a homestead. Compared to the vast interior of British Columbia, the Gulf Islands, lying between the two major urban centres of the growing colony, were well positioned for early growth.

This is not to say that transportation and access to markets was entirely easy, rather it was simply much better than many of the alternatives. In the absence of commercial wharves, steamers making the route between Victoria and New Westminster, and Nanaimo and Victoria, would stop to take on or discharge passengers and supplies to

¹⁰ Pete Loudon “Big City Hustle-Bustle Serpent in Gulf ‘Eden,’” *Victoria Daily Times*, February 15, 1964, 18.

¹¹ S. Eis & D. Craigdallie, *Gulf Islands of British Columbia*, 8-9.

¹² Marie Anne Elliott, *Mayne Island & the Outer Gulf Islands: a History* (Mayne Island, B.C: Gulf Islands Press, 1984)

smaller boats. Otherwise, travel between homesteads and access to Vancouver Island and mainland centres largely involved row or sailboats which required great skill to navigate through the treacherous waters of the region, often beset with strong tides, dense fog, shallow shoals, and strong winds. Despite these difficulties in transportation and the hardship of clearing land for agriculture, Gulf Islanders were able to prosper. As Ruth Sandwell has shown, this living was not, as expected and promoted by government officials, an ideal agrarian paradise of hardworking, independent farmers devoted entirely to agricultural production. Rather, Islanders developed a mixed economy of agriculture, forestry, fishing, mining, hunting, government contracts, and other seasonal endeavours.¹³ This working arrangement, coupled with the flexibility allowed by the pre-emption system of land settlement, allowed small farmers to subsist off the land.¹⁴ By the end of the century, settlers had cleared and settled most of the land suitable for agriculture and developed small, but active rural communities. Saltspring, the largest island, offering the largest quantity of agricultural land and the best access to Vancouver Island, supported eighty farmers by the turn of the century.¹⁵

Natural pastures found throughout the region, as described above, made sheep raising the most important industry and in later years, the look of these meadows would contribute significantly to the pastoral depiction that became so prominent. Beyond tending sheep, farmers pastured small herds of dairy cattle and established poultry

¹³ R. W. Sandwell, *Contesting Rural Space: Land Policy and the Practices of Resettlement on Saltspring Island, 1859-1891* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005).

¹⁴ Under the pre-emption system a single man could pre-empt up to 150 acres if single, and 200 acres if married. "When the land was surveyed, the settler was required to pay the price of four shillings and two pence per acre and three years were allowed for full payment." In order to maintain ownership of the property the settler was required to occupy and improve the land. After two years, if it could be shown that improvements to the amount of \$2.50 per acre had been made, the settler could obtain a certificate of improvement. Improvements included fencing, clearing, and building of permanent dwellings. After receiving this certificate, the pre-emptor was allowed to mortgage, transfer, or purchase his land. The price to purchase the land was \$2.50 per acre for surveyed and unsurveyed agricultural land, and \$1 for pre-empted land. Only with the final payment of the purchase price was a crown grant provided thereby transferring title to the individual. Many settlers would acquire land by pre-emption and improve it to a state necessary to maintain ownership but would not hurry to officially purchase the land. Often land would be transferred among relatives to retain ownership without needing to gather the necessary funds for purchase. This flexibility allowed many families the security of owning land without the requirement of any significant initial capital. R.W. Sandwell, *Contesting Rural Space*, 29.

¹⁵ A. J. Green, J. P. van Vliet and E. A. Kenney, "Soils of the Gulf Islands of British Columbia: Volume 4 Soils of Gabriola and Lesser Islands," *Land Resource Research Centre Reports* no.43 (Vancouver, BC: 1990): 6. As Sandwell shows, nearly all of the farmers represented a household as well, which coupled with non-farm residents, brought the population to approximately 250 in 1891. Sandwell, *Contesting Rural Space*, 200.

operations to produce both broilers and eggs. The temperate climate also lent itself to small-scale fruit and vegetable production. The Gulf Islands were, in fact, the largest producer of apples in the province until the turn of the century when Okanagan ranchers began growing fruit and shipping it via rail to Vancouver.¹⁶ Most early agriculturists, however, focused on subsistence and thus developed small, mixed farming operations to meet household needs. Farmers derived additional income from other off-farm employment in small-scale logging and sawmill operations, which existed on all of the major Islands. Others found work in a few mining operations on the Islands; coal mining (1853-1883) and sandstone quarrying (1869-1932), for example, occurred on northern Newcastle Island and coal was also mined on Protection Island.¹⁷ Most settlers left the Islands seasonally to engage in wage labour.

Ruth Sandwell argues that during the early settlement period a dominant public discourse about country lands applied to the Gulf Islands. This official discourse, she explains, was “visible in land legislation, land regulations, government reports, and some settlers’ reflections and journalists’ musings,” which argued that the most beneficial land use was one that established independent farmers and their families on agricultural lands, thus providing “a moral and economic foundation for the new colony.”¹⁸ Throughout her book, however, Sandwell demonstrates that this ‘official’ discourse did not truly reflect the lived experience of settlers who preferred “security over risk, ease over hard work, and modest sufficiency over the accumulation of wealth.” Moreover, the land-use patterns favoured by this discourse were not uniformly visible across the Islands.¹⁹

On the major agricultural islands, as elsewhere in the province with perceived agricultural potential, the liberal agrarian ideology tended to shape decisions about land-use activities and development. Alternatively, on islands of limited agricultural potential, their bounded and isolated nature allowed other uses to emerge. Early on, in 1860 on Sidney Island, for example, the HBC saw potential for an urban subdivision and put up an ambitious 2000 residential lots for sale, but sold only one or two.²⁰ From 1891 to

¹⁶ Peter Murray, *Homesteads and Snug Harbours; The Gulf Islands* (Ganges, BC: Horsdal & Schubart, 1991): 11.

¹⁷ Green et al., *Soils of Saltspring Island*, 6.

¹⁸ Sandwell, *Contesting Rural Space*, 39.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 6.

²⁰ M. Gibbs, “Pearl of the Gulf Islands,” *Colonist*, April 8, 1973, Magazine Section, 4-5.

1924, D'Arcy Island assumed the role of island exile when the provincial government imprisoned Chinese lepers to prevent the spread of disease.²¹ James Island served a much different purpose as a private hunting reserve for a group of wealthy Victorians. In 1897, the syndicate imported a herd of fallow deer from Britain, as well as mountain sheep, pheasants, partridge, grouse, and quail.²² Conveniently demarcated by the edge of land, the islands were a blank slate for settlement along with a range of other objectives. It is understandable, then, that a broad stroke 'official discourse' that dealt with all agricultural land was not fully representative of regional patterns of development in a large, environmentally diverse province. In the Gulf Islands, these interactions gave rise to varied uses and perceptions of the environment. By the turn of the century, the pastoral perception that later came to dominate conceptions of the region had not yet become predominant. In the first half of the twentieth century, however, as settlement interest grew, conceptions of the Islands increasingly emphasized their pastoral character.

'Contentment Reigns' - the Development of the Arcadian Ideal, 1900-1940

During the next fifty years, local, national and international events challenged the optimism and enthusiasm with which the residents of Mayne Island faced the coming of the twentieth century. The community gradually set aside notions of prosperity and growth in favour of merely enjoying life in a pleasant environment, as they maintained their quiet backwater through two World Wars and a depression. - Marie Anne Elliott²³

While speaking directly of Mayne Island as an idyllic backwater, the narrative that Marie Elliott presents in this passage is the typical reading of Gulf Island's history. The idea that Islanders 'set aside notions of prosperity and growth' is both a misrepresentation of the aims and ambitions of settlers during the nineteenth century, as Sandwell argues, as well as an inaccurate depiction of the varied ways residents approached the twentieth. Such an idea though, of the Islands as pleasant arcadian retreats, had great currency in the economic and political climate after the Second World War. This was not merely a modern reading of the past, however; the idea is a reflection

²¹ C. J. Yorath, *A Measure of Value: The Story of the D'arcy Island Leper Colony* (Victoria, B.C: TouchWood Editions, 2000)

²² A. Dickson, "Boom Island," *Vancouver Sun*, June 4, 1949, Magazine Section, 6; Bea Bond, *Looking Back on James Island* (Sidney, BC, Porthole Press Ltd, 1991).

²³ Elliott, *Mayne Island & the Outer Gulf Islands: A History*, 39.

of the way the Islands were beginning to be depicted throughout the first half of the twentieth century.

The arcadian ideal that, in time, came to define the Islands was not without a basis in reality. As Sandwell shows, settlers were not driven solely by profit and a desire for progress, as the ‘official’ liberal agrarian discourse would have it. Their preference for “ease over hard work,” could be read as a validation of an arcadian belief, but in reality, their strategic approach to survival was similar to that followed by settlers in other parts of the North America. A preference for ease did not mean that hard work and a struggle for security were not important factors in their lives. Diverse, subsistence-based lifestyles associated with the mixed economies of nineteenth century settlers fluctuated in rhythm to the seasonality of work but demanded much of practitioners. When commentators looked back at the Islands’ past, this period of settlement was not without idealizable elements, but these were impossible to divorce from the aching labour that existed alongside. The primary basis for the arcadian depiction of the Islands, therefore, did not emerge primarily from a reading of early settlement. Rather, this depiction developed, most prominently, in the context of a brief but significant migration of English ‘gentlemen’ settlers to the region around the turn of the century.

English gentlemen and other wealthy newcomers were a prominent feature of settlement in British Columbia during the decades before the First World War. Unfortunately, because of inaccurate immigration records, the exact number of such settlers in the Gulf Islands is impossible to determine, but based on broader trends, newspaper reports, and reflections by residents, this population was sizeable. Marjory Harper estimates that between 1891 and 1921 approximately 24,000 of the 175,000 British settlers who came to British Columbia fell into this category. The explanations for why so many of these gentlemen emigrants moved to Canada are diverse. For those second and subsequent sons who were denied an inheritance of land, traditional career outlets in the clergy, as lawyers, doctors, and army officers became “either less popular, over-crowded, or too competitive.” As a result, Marjory Harper argues, “these redundant

products of the British public school system were... dispatched across the Atlantic to seek their fortunes” in the colonies.²⁴

More than just ‘push’ factors were at work, however; a range of ‘pull’ factors, such as the opening of the Canadian West, which provided many opportunities for land acquisition, business development, and adventure also motivated potential settlers.²⁵ Many young Britons grew up reading romantic adventure stories about life in Canada and the United States “in which, tales of the wild Indians and the intrepid hunter or cowboy... were set against the backdrop of a rugged, primitive landscape, beckoning those who could afford it to a lifestyle seemingly more exciting and unrestricted than they could expect to find at home.”²⁶ Important for the Gulf Islands in particular, romantic literature in the vein of the *Swiss Family Robinson* or *Robinson Crusoe* also regularly employed the trope of islands as places of adventure and freedom, creating an additional draw to the region for gentlemen emigrants. In addition to stories of adventure in the Canadian West, promotional literature geared toward prospective emigrants cited promising economic opportunities, a mild climate, strong ties to Britain, and “well-developed cultural and social amenities” as reasons to take up residence in the province.²⁷ Furthermore, the agricultural pursuits of dairying, fruit farming, and ranching, which predominated in the province, offered the hope of an arcadian lifestyle that many such migrants sought. In the Gulf Islands, with its rolling hills, open meadows, access to urban centres, and small diverse farm operations, gentlemen farmers found a perfect pastoral landscape upon which to project their desires. As early as 1902 newspaper articles commented on the growing “old country” element in the Gulf Islands. There was a “peculiar attraction for a certain class of settler,” one *Colonist* reporter noted, one who was seeking the most “pleasant and peaceful existence imaginable,” in an area where “he is out of the world altogether, and yet, when he wants, for a change, the stir and bustle of city life, he can get on board one of the steamers plying on the island route and be in Victoria in a few

²⁴ Marjory Harper, “Aristocratic Adventurers: British Gentlemen Emigrants on the North American Frontier, ca. 1880-1920,” *Journal of the West* 36, no.2 (April 199), 41.

²⁵ Patrick Dunae, *Gentlemen Emigrants: From the British Public Schools to the Canadian Frontier* (Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1981), 5-7.

²⁶ Harper, “Aristocratic Adventurers,” 42; While it is likely that such books were not the deciding factor for many to move overseas they certainly contributed to a wider desire for adventure that is difficult to quantify but certainly influential.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 48.

hours.”²⁸ Mixed agriculture, the reporter further observed, promised a reasonable profit with far less work than the “farmers in Ontario” endured.²⁹ But despite the lure of an arcadian paradise, many such English migrants would experience failures and bankruptcy in confronting the hardship and isolation of frontier life.

For those who had been disappointed, the outbreak of the First World War provided an escape; they and thousands of others driven by patriotism, ideas of adventure, or the desire to escape would respond to the call of duty and return to England. After four years of brutal war in Europe only a minority of English migrants returned “in an attempt to take up the threads of their old life,” but what they found was a “radically altered economic and social climate,” Harper argues.³⁰ Economically, the immediate postwar years were ones of depression and limited growth as the Western world struggled to return to normalcy. Canada was no longer so attractive to those young gentlemen migrants who survived. Nor was the institution of British colonialism as dominant after the war. In addition, the British government’s abolishment of primogeniture - the practice of granting first sons exclusive rights to family inheritance - in 1925 allowed second sons greater opportunity at home, further reducing the desire to go abroad.³¹ Finally, post-war British Columbia, Harper argues, was more “antagonistic than the gently mocking environment of the pre-war West.” Yet, despite the diminishing presence of gentlemen settlers on the Gulf Islands the ‘old-country’ atmosphere of leisured gentlemen immigrants proved durable. Although it is difficult to tie this impression to demographic realities, given the inadequacy of migration and settlement statistics, persistent beliefs that the Islands were the haunts of leisured English gentry had a significant impact on the long-term identity and conception of the region.

Journalistic accounts from the interwar period tended to emphasize the pastoral perception of the Gulf Islands as seen through an arcadian lens. Commenting in 1924, one *Province* correspondent noted, “these islands have attracted for the chief portion of their inhabitants people of good family and education, captivated by the spell of freedom

²⁸“Life on the Islands of British Columbia,” *Colonist*, February 2, 1902, 9.

²⁹ *Ibid.*

³⁰ Harper, “Aristocratic Adventurers,” 50.

³¹ Dunae, *Gentlemen Emigrants*, 225-226.

from the formalities of ordinary civilization.”³² The next year, another journalist, this one for the *Times*, highlighted the cultural ties this arcadian ideal evoked, explaining that:

... if you want to get a picture of the inhabitants of the Gulf Islands and the life they lead, you must take Washington Irving’s “Rural England” add a few papers from Addison’s *Spectator* on Sir Roger de Coverley, mix in the atmosphere of ‘Tom Brown’s School Days’ with a generous flavouring of W. H Kingston’s sea stories and Fennimore Cooper’s pioneer yarns and season with a garnish of G. A Henry. Certain it is that as a class the islanders lead an essentially English country life, living in the open as much as possible, keen on sports both land and marine, tilling the soil for a living and rearing their children after the best British tradition.³³

The same author goes on to link the choices of the Gulf Islanders he describes to wider anti-modern sentiments of the period, noting that they “wished to live away from the hurly-burly of modern existence.”³⁴ In contrast, by the late 1930s, according to Robert Connell the ‘old-country’ element only existed in “glimpses of pleasant valleys with winding roads,” which told the story of “settlements made long ago in the archipelago and of the attraction the charming islands have for the lovers of quiet but interesting country life.” These early settlers who had left their marks on the landscape were “not only sturdy farmers from the Old Land and Eastern Canada,” but upper-class English families and “adventurers of the wild like Warburton Pike and Phillips-Wolley,” two widely-known travel writers who had, for periods of time around the turn of the century, lived among the Gulf Islands.³⁵ These pastoral perceptions of the Gulf Islands, persisting through the first half of the century, continued after the Second World War when the emergence of a growing number of historical publications on the region celebrated the English migrants as a defining element of the region’s past. Publications such as *A Gulf Islands Patchwork*, the first of the postwar regional histories, highlighted a life of leisured pursuits by many well-to-do English migrants in narratives of regional

³² “Gulf Islands Form Paradise Whose Beauties are Little Known as Yet,” *Vancouver Province*, December 27, 1924, 5.

³³ “Islands of Enchantment,” *Times*, August 29, 1925, Magazine Section, 1.

³⁴ *Ibid.*,

³⁵ Robert Connell, “Among the Gulf Islands,” *Colonist*, September 25, 1938, Magazine Section, 3. For more on Warburton Pike and Phillips-Wooley see: Peter Murray, *Home From The Hill: Three Gentlemen Adventurers* (Victoria, B.C: Horsdal & Schubart, 1994).

development.³⁶ While this arcadian depiction of Gulf Islands' life was widespread and enduring, its ultimate hegemony should not obscure another, less romantic conception of the region.

'It Was Nothing But Work' - the Development of Agriculture and Industry, 1900-1940

An alternative way of understanding life in the Gulf Islands, as one made up of hard working, liberal agrarians toiling to develop and modernize the region, existed alongside arcadian depictions of English migrants throughout the first half of the century. This vision reflects an entirely different, and arguably more predominant development pattern, but one that ideas of the Islands as arcadian retreats progressively overshadowed later in the century. Such conceptions of the Gulf Islands, early on, created tension around the type of progress either could achieve, as well as what was desirable. As one correspondent for the *Sidney and Islands Review* complained in 1913, advertisements for settlers said that the Islands were particularly adapted for gentlemen types with capital who could engage in a leisured arcadian type of agriculture. But the correspondent argued, with a degree of animosity for those gentlemen types, that "if the idea is to develop island resources, then it needs men who must carve their way first to a living and then to whatever wealth they are capable of attaining."³⁷ In linking the destiny of the Islands to the hard labour of individuals wrestling a living from nature, the writer reflected the values and beliefs of liberal agrarianism. He was not alone in asserting the moral value of those diligent settlers who could not simply "live on scenery and fresh air."³⁸ Even as many commentators extolled the life of leisured English migrants in the Gulf Islands, others celebrated the success of the liberal agrarian. Writing for the *Colonist* in 1922, one reporter, in describing the many farms that settlers had cleared from bush, claimed that "though this meant years of hard work... the richness of the soil has brought adequate reward." Indeed, the reporter continued, "seeing these beautiful tracts of cleared

³⁶ British Columbia Historical Association, Gulf Islands Branch, *A Gulf Islands Patchwork: Some Early Events on the Islands of Galiano, Mayne, Saturna, North and South Pender* (Sidney, B.C: Peninsula Printing Co., 1961)

³⁷ Morton B. Stratton, "History of Agriculture on Salt Spring Island," (Unpublished report for Salt Spring Island Historical Society, 1991), 19.

³⁸ "Gulf Islands of British Columbia," *Colonist*, December 3, 1922, 27.

land yielding big crops and pasturing sleek cattle draws one's attention very much to the rewards of individual effort. While Nature has been good, the toil of hands has been the big factor."³⁹ This recognition of the grinding labour required to develop the Gulf is an element that many narratives of arcadian bliss, particularly historical accounts after the Second World War, neglect. Looking back during this time, Pender Island farmer Robert Roe recalled a different sort of life from the leisured arcadian existence depicted in historical accounts. For Roe, life was one of constant toil. "I could never get away from work," Roe recalled, "My gosh you can't take on a place like this and go around to picnics. It was nothing but work. No tennis-playing or anything else... If you read the *Gulf Islands Patchwork* you would think it was very nice: lots of picnics, lots of tennis-playing, but I don't know. We could never get off for anything like that. There was [sic] always too many stumps to get out."⁴⁰ Roe's and the reporters' alternative depiction of life in the Islands presents an important counter to many readings of the region's history. Far from a uniformly arcadian paradise, the Gulf Islands were, at least before the Second World War, a thriving, if modest, rural agricultural region, where producers understood the landscape less as one of leisure than as one of hard labour.

As noted above, an early competitive advantage, obtained by water access to the major markets, benefited rural agricultural producers in the Gulf Islands over those in less well-positioned areas during the nineteenth century. With the development of road and rail networks on the mainland, however, the same island geography that conferred initial advantage quickly became an obstacle, forcing Islanders to seek ways to adapt to changing market conditions. Island producers and promoters recognized that specialization, better transportation, more direct market access, and collective effort were essential for the progress of the area.⁴¹ Although most farmers retained diversified subsistence operations, specialization increasingly characterized commercially successful island farms before the First World War. At the same time, however, it should be noted that due to environmental constraints, primarily the limited availability of arable land, farming remained a small-scale industry and the amalgamation of small farms brought on by specialization elsewhere in the province did not occur. As Morton Stratton notes, there

³⁹ "Gulf Islands of British Columbia," *Colonist*, December 3, 1922, 27.

⁴⁰ Murray, *Homesteads and Snug Harbours*, 10.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*

were exceptions to this tendency; some wealthy farm families such as the Ruckles or Musgraves on Saltspring established larger holdings of up to a thousand acres, but most family farms were between 20 and 30 acres.⁴² Nevertheless, while specialization did not occur on the same scale as elsewhere in the province or on the prairies, those small-scale Gulf Island producers who sought commercial success did tend to specialize. Initially, specialization occurred in orcharding, but with the growth of Okanagan production, this sector fell off quickly around the turn of the century. After the opening of the Ganges Creamery, a cooperative dairy processing operation set up by Island producers, in 1904, the dairy industry became most prominent.⁴³ In a report to Deputy Minister of Agriculture William Scott in 1913, A. E. Keffer found dairying to be the principal aspect of the agricultural sector on Saltspring, Pender, and Mayne, with Pender home to one of the best, and very few, pure-bred Jersey cattle herds on the coast.⁴⁴ The creamery remained the most successful agricultural operation on the Islands until it closed in 1957. In 1922 the Ganges Creamery shipped an average of 2,200 pounds of butter a week to markets in Victoria and the mainland, and had a yearly output around 100,000 pounds.⁴⁵ Such heavy dairy production also helped support complementary industries such as poultry and hog raising, in which farmers used the skim from the milk as feed, and sent the cream to Ganges. However, neither industry truly took off due to ongoing problems with getting the meat to market. Other specialized operations such as seed-growing and flower production emerged throughout this period. Pender Island, for example, had developed a significant seed industry with a sizable acreage devoted to sweet peas by 1917.⁴⁶ The largest seed-growing operation, however, was that of the James Brothers Seed Co. which started operation in 1915 on Parker Island, but within two years the ambitious brothers sold the smaller Island and moved to Saltspring where they leased larger tracts of land. The company sold fruit and vegetable seeds worldwide and shipped large quantities of corn, broccoli, potatoes, and other vegetables to Vancouver. In 1930

⁴² Stratton, "History of Agriculture on Salt Spring," 23.

⁴³ *Ibid.*, 23-25.

⁴⁴ British Columbia Archives (hereafter BCA), Deputy Minister of Agriculture, GR 402 File 1/ 17, Reports, Gulf Islands Report of Itinerary to Valdez, Cortez, Saltspring, Pender and Mayne Island by A.E Keffer, 29 May 1913; BCA, Deputy Minister of Agriculture, GR 402 File 1/18 Deputy Minister of Agriculture Report of Institute Meetings on Salt Spring Island by D. McInnes, 29 May 1913.

⁴⁵ "Gulf Islands of British Columbia," *Colonist*, December 3, 1922, 27.

⁴⁶ "Gulf Islands Form Paradise Whose Beauties are Little Known as Yet," *Province*, December 27, 1924, 5.

the brothers had outgrown Saltspring, where infrequent mail and steamship service hindered the operation and they moved to Cowichan Bay, continuing operations until after the war.⁴⁷ As this example demonstrates, inadequacy of transportation and the resulting limited access to markets constrained success in Islands' agriculture.

While lying between the two major population centres of the province posed apparent advantages, the transportation issue defied easy solution. In 1901, the Canadian Pacific Railway (CPR) Company acquired control of the former Canadian Pacific Navigation fleet, which had serviced the Islands for the previous twenty years. From 1901 to 1911 the CPR steamer *S.S Iroquois* serviced the Gulf Islands, making round trips every Wednesday and Saturday. The service ran from Victoria via the Victoria and Sidney Railway to the North end of the Saanich Peninsula and then, via the *S.S Iroquois*, to the Gulf Islands.⁴⁸ This twice weekly route not only benefited Islanders, but also offered an added bonus of making tourist cruises through the Islands a possibility.⁴⁹ Still unsatisfied, Islanders petitioned for better service and lower freight rates over the next decade without success until 1911 when the *S.S Iroquois* hit a rock and sunk. When the CPR made no immediate effort to have it replaced, many felt the panic of their isolation.⁵⁰ The service recommenced in less than a month with the replacement of the *S.S Iroquois*, but the fear of isolation persisted. Islanders soon put their hopes of increased access on hold when war broke out in 1914. By 1917, however, frustration mounted among producers who saw the limited connection as hindering development and progress.

Numerous calls emerged for a subsidy on the Gulf Islands route but while Islanders agreed on the matter in principle, geography divided them.⁵¹ Islanders inhabiting the eastern most Outer Islands, Mayne, Galiano, and Saturna, favoured direct access to nearby Vancouver. The western islands, Saltspring and the Penders in contrast,

⁴⁷ Other, less prominent cases of specialized agriculture also existed including, for example, market gardens, fur farms, and two goat cheese factories. Morton, "History of Agriculture on Salt Spring," 58-59.

⁴⁸ Elliott, *Mayne Island & the Outer Gulf Islands: A History*, 39-43.

⁴⁹ "A Delightful Holiday Trip," *Colonist*, August 20, 1901, 5.

⁵⁰ "Through the Islands," *The Week*, 5 August 1905, 5; "Steamer Service Wanted," *Province*, April 5, 1905, 1; "Better Service Needed," *Colonist*, May 14, 1907, 4.

⁵¹ "Gulf Islands Service," *Colonist*, January 30, 1917, 4; "Province May Add to Gulf Island Subsidy," *Colonist*, March 3, 1917, 11; "The Gulf Islands Service," *Colonist*, March 16, 1917, 4; "\$17,500 Now Asked for Gulf Service," *Times*, March 14, 1917, 11; "Seek Larger Subsidy," *Colonist*, March 25, 1917, 14.

sought access to the much closer markets on Vancouver Island. In 1919, one of the first attempts to unite the various Islands for planning purposes emerged with the Gulf Islands Board of Trade. The Board grew out of a transportation committee appointed in 1917 by the Chambers of Commerce of various Islands, which sought to secure improved service to both Victoria and Vancouver. At the first meeting, members of the Board of Trade unanimously passed a resolution urging the CPR to install an adequate boat on a run connecting the Islands to both Victoria and the Mainland.⁵² An example of the trouble Islands producers faced can be seen in the challenge of selling fruit during the period. As early as 1910, one correspondent for *The Week* commented on the excellent fruit growing ability of the Islands, fruits such as raspberries, strawberries, pears, and apples doing particularly well, but much of the product languished in the field for lack of a market.⁵³ The issue persisted for years until 1922 when the Salt Spring Island Jam Factory began operating, handling around eleven tonnes of fruit in that first year.⁵⁴ Although the fruit was available, transport and access to markets remained problematic. A year after operations began, the Co-operative's director Mr. W. Sutherland petitioned Victoria business owners to purchase their product. Given the wealth of business that Islanders brought to Victoria, he argued, it was only fair that Victoria's merchants reciprocate. He noted that despite having a high quality product and large output, 500 cases in 1923, 125 remained on the Factory's shelves.⁵⁵ By 1929, despite concerted effort, the company's inability to get its product to market forced its closure and the property sold. While it was not enough to save the Jam Factory, the efforts of the Board of Trade and other advocates was, by the 1930s, successful in securing a five-day a week service from the C.P.R., which served the Islands relatively well over the next decade. The example of the Salt Spring Jam Factory and the Board of Trade demonstrate another method of adaptation prominent on the Islands during the first half of the century: cooperative effort in pursuit of economic development.

Realizing that success on the Islands meant collective effort farmers established cooperative processing operations such as the Salt Spring Jam Factory and the Ganges

⁵² "New Gulf Islands Board of Trade," *Times*, October 14, 1919, 2.

⁵³ "Among the Islands," *The Week*, 15 Oct. 1910, 4.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*

⁵⁵ "Asks Support for Islands' Products," *Colonist*, April 21, 1923, 5.

Creamery. Another notable example of this trend was on Mayne Island where a co-operative Japanese settlement emerged as that island's most successful agricultural operation during the interwar period. Together, the Japanese farmers formed a large poultry co-operative and a major hothouse tomato operation that supplied Victoria, and they branched out into small-scale sawmilling, fishing, and saltery operations. Despite involving less than a third of the island's population, this co-operative conducted more than 50 per cent of the island's commerce.⁵⁶ Beyond co-operative agricultural operations, island farmers developed a range of organizations and institutes to help promote material progress. Farmers Institutes, established on the main Islands with the support of the B.C. Department of Agriculture allowed members to buy essentials such as fertilizer, seed, explosives, and lime in bulk at reduced prices.⁵⁷ The Island Agricultural and Fruit Growers Association on Saltspring emerged to put on an annual agricultural fair, which ran until the 1940s.⁵⁸ Like many small settlements in the province, the Gulf Islands were rife with boosterism, the unfettered spirit of self-promotion undertaken by communities in pursuit of their own economic development that thrived during the period. Ascribing to the central tenets of agrarianism that promoted the moral value of rural life, island boosters sought, like those in the wider Country Life Movement, to foster social and economic well being and make the Islands more vibrant.

Alongside agricultural promotion, Islanders formed special purpose boards to bring hospitals, schools, water networks, fire protection, and policing to the Islands. As noted above, residents also formed island-specific chambers of commerce and boards of trade to press for better services, increased settlement, and most of all better transportation and access to markets. During the first half of the twentieth century, many Islands producers were bent on fulfilling the liberal agrarian ideal of progress. Residents worked hard to develop a thriving agriculturally based economy. Even in the midst of the Great Depression, Islands farmers were proud of weathering hard times without seeking relief.⁵⁹ The diversity inherent to small-scale farm operations afforded producers a high

⁵⁶ Elliott, *Mayne Island & the Outer Gulf Islands: A History*, 65; Marie Elliot, "The Japanese of Mayne Island," *British Columbia Historical News*, 23, no.4 (Fall 1990), 15-17.

⁵⁷ "District News: Salt Spring," *Cowichan Leader*, October 23, 1913, 10; Murray, *Homesteads and Snug Harbours*, 11.

⁵⁸ BCA, Island Agricultural and Fruit Growers Association, MS-1491, Minutes, 1897-1940.

⁵⁹ "Island Farmers Not Asking Aid," *Colonist*, September 20, 1931, 3.

degree of flexibility as well as fulfilling their subsistence needs, helping farmers during the Depression. But at the same time, agriculture did not fulfill all of the needs of Islanders. As Captain Macintosh, MLA for the Islands pointed out in 1931, “some farmers in the Gulf Islands as a whole depended in slack season on the usual amount of road work that was carried on by the Department of Public Works.”⁶⁰ Small-scale industry did exist throughout the Islands, providing added opportunity to residents and involving alternative ways of using the landscape.

Logging characterized much of the non-agricultural industry on the islands, as elsewhere in the coastal region. Given the size of the islands and extent of land settlement, large outfits were not generally attracted to the region. By 1901 various commercial logging operations were working on most of the islands. Shingle- and shake-cutters worked independently, while others supplied timber to small sawmills that emerged on most of the islands to cut dimension lumber, railroad ties, and other items. Others cut timber to provide cordwood or charcoal to fuel steam engines and fish canneries.⁶¹ By the mid-1930s, the various logging operations had removed most of the old growth timber, leaving mixed-age forests interspersed throughout the Islands, which small operators continued to log into the forties and fifties when high demand pushed prices for timber, as well as other raw materials, higher.⁶² Alongside logging, fishing and its associated canneries existed among the Islands. Japanese fishing operations were an important element of this industry, establishing a cannery and saltery on both Galiano and the Penders. The British Columbia Fish Salteries Ltd., for example, a Japanese business controlled by Matsuyama Co., established a herring saltery in Hayashi Cove in Otter Bay on North Pender Island in 1929. This and other Japanese operations were successful, but during the Second World War, the federal government interned Japanese residents, then confiscated and sold their businesses and property.⁶³ Apart from timber and fish, a few hopeful individuals continued to search intermittently for minerals. Mining was, however, largely unsuccessful on the Islands apart from the earlier coalmines that developed near Nanaimo. The most significant industrial operation in the Gulf Islands

⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁶¹ Judi Stevenson and Sheila Harrington, *Islands in The Salish Sea: A Community Atlas* (Surrey, B.C: TouchWood Editions, 2005).

⁶² Charles Kahn, *Salt Spring: The Story of an Island* (Madeira Park, B.C: Harbour Publishing, 1998), 211.

⁶³ “Old Island Saltery Site Resurrects Memories,” *Gulf Islands Driftwood*, June 14, 1989, 1.

involved the development of James Island, located a mile and a half off the Saanich Peninsula, as an explosives plant. Purchased in 1913 by Canadian Industries Limited, Company officials initially conceived the powder plant to supply demand from the railway boom, but with the outbreak of war in 1914 demand increased greatly. During the First World War, one-twelfth of all the TNT produced in the British Empire came from James Island and the operation continued to flourish into the 1970s.⁶⁴ Here again, the bounded geography of the island became an ideal means for isolating potentially catastrophic effects of an industrial accident.

Finally, while by no means a significant economic driver for the Islands, the development in 1932 of Piers Island as a penal colony for over 600 Doukhobors is an interesting example of an alternative use of geography that does not fit neatly into the generally agreed upon depictions of the region. The Doukhobor “Sons of Freedom” were a small, radical movement committed to restoring traditional Doukhobor values and to resisting the provincial state’s education, citizenship, and vital statistics requirements. During a protest in 1932, police arrested 600 of these individuals and a judge convicted them on charges of public nudity. Unable to handle such an increase of inmates, the B.C Penitentiary commissioned Piers Island and constructed a prison facility to house them.⁶⁵ Far from a uniform arcadian paradise, then, the Islands were many things to many people. Agriculturalists, residents, and promoters, informed by liberal agrarian values built and supported a modest but dynamic local economy based on small-scale and increasingly specialized agricultural operations, as well as some industrial pursuits during the first half of the twentieth century. In addition to traditional means of achieving ‘progress,’ though, Islands boosters also sought to capitalize on the scenic and conceptual value of the Gulf Islands to support the growth of the region.

Tourism existed in the Gulf Islands since the turn of the century when the CPR marketed steamer trips to Victoria residents as a pleasant weekend holiday. Seeking to increase the profitability of these supply runs, CPR representatives made frequent comparisons between the Gulf Islands and the Thousand Islands of the St. Lawrence

⁶⁴ Bond, *Looking Back on James Island*; A. Dickason, “Boom Island,” *Sun*, June 4, 1949, Magazine Section, 6.

⁶⁵ Gregory Cran, *Negotiating Buck Naked: Doukhobors, Public Policy, and Conflict Resolution* (Vancouver, B.C: UBC Press, 2006), 165.

River, a popular tourist attraction in the East. The Gulf Islands were, however, “on a scale of grandeur and magnificence before which the show-place of the St. Lawrence almost pales into commonplace.”⁶⁶ Vacation resorts and hotels, such as the Point Comfort Hotel at Miners Bay on Mayne Island, emerged to accommodate tourists. Following the First World War a shift, driven by the growth of the personal automobile and complimentary highway system, occurred in tourist travel.⁶⁷ Islanders who had struggled to obtain better steamer service during the first decades of the century now needed to attract car ferries in order to remain connected to the rest of the province and capitalize on the growing tourist industry. Anticipating tremendous growth in tourism, calls emerged from Islanders at the end of the 1920s to promote the sector as a means of economic development.⁶⁸ Alongside calls for better access to support tourism, a growing campaign to ‘sell’ the islands drew upon an idealization of the pastoral landscape of the islands to draw in visitors. Promoters praised the scenery, the rural charms, ‘old-country’ element, leisured pace, wild forests, and domesticated farms of the region to develop a depiction of the Islands as an arcadian retreat. As Robert Connell, writing for the *Colonist* describes:

But to the wonderment at this scenery of water, rock, and vegetation, which makes the Gulf Islands without parallel on either Atlantic or Pacific Coasts, is added a domestic charm by the farmhouses and more leisured homes that appear along the lower shores or crown the less formidable headlands.⁶⁹

Promoters increasingly put forward this pastoral depiction of the Islands environment to fulfill the needs of the tourism industry and in the process relegated the local agricultural and industrial economies to serving an aesthetic function, adding a “domestic charm” to the backdrop of scenery.

⁶⁶ “A Delightful holiday trip,” *Colonist*, August 20, 1901, 5; “Among the Gulf Islands,” *Colonist*, July 3, 1907, 7.

⁶⁷ Warren Belasco. *Americans on the Road: From Autocamp to Motel 1910-1945* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1979).

⁶⁸ Charles F.M Bultrum, “Bring Tourists to the Gulf Islands, Letter” *Province*, December 1, 1929, Magazine Section, 10; “A Paradise for Tourists: Says Gulf Island Member in Telling Legislature about His Constituency,” *Times*, February 19, 1931, 10. For a description of the rise of tourism and consumer culture in British Columbia during the 1930s and 40s see: Michael Dawson, *Selling British Columbia: Tourism and Consumer Culture, 1890-1970* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2004).

⁶⁹ Robert Connell, “Among the Gulf Islands,” *Colonist*, September 25, 1938, Magazine Section, 3.

Conclusion

The Gulf Islands through the first half of the twentieth century, like many rural areas in the province, developed a mixed economy based primarily on small-scale agriculture as well as logging, fishing, and tourism. For many, it was an economy garnered through dedicated, grinding labour, cooperative effort, and creativity. In popular depictions, however, writers, responding to the physical environment and drawing upon a period of upper-class English settlement, frequently characterized the Islands as pastoral landscapes and bastions of an arcadian lifestyle. As Frederick Marsh commented in characterizing what he called the “Leisure Islands,” these were places for:

... the carpenter with tools and a little money, the small farmer, the amateur gardener, the fisherman, the business man with stomach ulcers, the pensioner, the lover of earth and sea who had found a distraught world too much with him... an earthly heaven entirely surrounded by sea ... There, a man and his family can be close to all that grows and walks and swims and flies.⁷⁰

The growth of tourism only strengthened this pastoral sense of the region as the campaign to market the Islands to lifestyle-oriented residents gained momentum. Increased access from the expansion of the ferry service in the 1930s brought increasing numbers of tourists to the Islands and many who came, it seems, did not wish to leave.

⁷⁰ BCA, Frederick Marsh fonds, MS-1176, *Leisure Island Laughter* manuscript, 2, 259.

Chapter 3: 'Big City Hustle-Bustle in the Gulf Islands Eden,' 1940-1969

In 1972, when the New Democratic Party ousted WAC Bennett's long-governing Social Credit party in a political shift that contributed to the creation of the Islands Trust two years later, the cultural transformations of the 'sixties' era continued to flourish. A case could be made that the events surrounding the creation of the Trust in 1974 was the result of this decade of disturbance that led to dramatic shifts across Canadian society. Such reasoning would point to growing environmental awareness, youth looking to reconnect with nature, and the rise of various social movements to challenge the status quo as factors leading to the emergence of more stringent environmental regulation in the Gulf Islands. But, while such an approach would certainly embrace some of the debates occurring at the time, it would isolate the events of the 1960s from the longer historical and cultural contexts that influenced them. Many Canadian historians approach the period cautious about categorizing the postwar period as a monolithic unit of "domestic conformity and political quiescence in the 1950s and radical dissent in the 1960s," but at the same time continue to see the sixties as a transformative era.¹ A number of historians who have dealt with the decade prefer to integrate the 1960s within a broader political and economic post-war history, reflected in recent categorizations of the era as the 'long sixties.'²

Originally proposed by Arthur Marwick in his seminal survey of the period in four western countries, the long sixties approach encompasses a cultural transformation stretching from the mid-1950s to the mid-1970s.³ As Catherine Carstairs states, there is "a growing body of literature in both the United States and Canada that argues that the

¹ Magdalena Fahrni and Robert Rutherford, *Creating Postwar Canada: Community, Diversity, and Dissent, 1945-75* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2008); Lara Campbell, Gregory S. Kealey, and Dominique Clément, *Debating Dissent: Canada and the Sixties* (London; Toronto; Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 2012): 19.

² For example Bothwell et al.'s main chapter on the topic "The Sixties: Nationalism and Culture" deals primarily with political and economic development. Robert Bothwell, Ian Drummond, and John English. *Canada Since 1945: Power, Politics and Provincialism* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1989); Revisions and additions to this analysis have become abundant, for example: Alvin Finkel. *Our Lives: Canada After 1945* (Toronto: J. Lorimer, 1997); Fahrni and Rutherford. *Creating Postwar Canada*.

³ Arthur Marwick. *The Sixties: Cultural Revolution in Britain, France, Italy, and the United States, c.1958-c.1974* (New York; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998)

changes associated with the 1960s... often had their roots in the 1950s or earlier and frequently came to fruition only in the 1970s.”⁴ In applying the long sixties approach, scholars are seeking to challenge a number of tendencies that follow from a strict periodization of the era. For example, in their recent edited volume of essays, Lara Campbell, Dominique Clément, and Gregory Kealey endorse adoption of the concept, believing that “the idea of the ‘long sixties’ complicates the idea of a period as a ‘rupture’ from an earlier period... and challenges the assumption that there ever was a unified or cohesive 1960s.”⁵ Instead, they view the decade as “a social, political, cultural, and economic *phenomenon*” that a diversity of actors experienced in a range of ways.⁶

Another way of approaching the study of the 1960s has been to adopt a generational lens. Early testimonial accounts written by individuals who had lived through the time and sought to capture the passion of the period, self-identify with this ‘sixties generation’ in framing their narratives.⁷ This tendency is also evident in scholarly accounts such as Doug Owsram’s *Born at the Right Time* and François Ricard’s *La génération lyrique*, which use the baby boomers as their unit of analysis to explain the events of the 1960s.⁸ More recently, scholars are questioning the generational approach so prevalent in of first-person narratives and the work of activist scholars who come from that generation. Instead, scholars are highlighting the importance of an intergenerational understanding of the period and challenging the validity of first-person accounts.⁹

Developments in the Gulf Islands support these contemporary historiographical trends. The radical land-use planning initiatives undertaken in the 1970s to ‘preserve and protect’ the Gulf Islands cannot be understood solely as the outgrowth of a youthful movement. While the back-to-the-land movement in the 1960s did bring a number of

⁴ Catherine Carstairs, “Food, Fear and the Environment in the Long Sixties” in *Debating Dissent: Canada and the Sixties*. ed. Lara Campbell et. al. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2012); The author is not alone in her assessment, the editors and many of the contributors to the volume argue similarly.

⁵ Campbell et al., *Debating Dissent*, 6.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 3.

⁷ Myrna Kostash. *Long Way from Home: The Story of the Sixties Generation in Canada*. (Toronto: J. Lorimer, 1980)

⁸ Doug Owsram. *Born at the Right Time: A History of the Baby-boom Generation* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996); François Ricard. *La génération lyrique: Essai sur la vie et l'oeuvre des premiers-nés du baby-boom* (Montréal: Boréal, 1992).

⁹ Jean-Phillippe Warren’s 2008 book *Une douce anarchie: Les années au Québec* gives a good example of the challenge to first person narratives by arguing that students were far less radical than accounts of former activists suggest. Quoted in Campbell et al., *Debating Dissent*, 6; Gidney and Dawson, *Persistence and Inheritance*, 65.

young people to the Gulf Islands, initiatives to control development emerged as part of a broader cultural, political, economic, historic, and social context of the region and beyond, as well as from the participation of an inter-generational group of interested and concerned individuals. Therefore, in concurring with the ‘long-sixties’ concept, this chapter explores the post-war period in order to understand the varied drivers of change that led to the efforts to control land-use that will be discussed in the following chapter.

In the 1940s and beyond, promoters embraced the lifestyle-oriented depiction of the Gulf Islands captured by Frederick Marsh, seeing in the Islands an ideal place to retire or vacation. By the early 1940s, despite the pressures of war, retirees and members of the growing middle-class began purchasing waterfront land at an unprecedented rate. At the same time, original residents, unable to stay afloat with farming operations, left for the armed services or wartime industrial operations, resulting in a net population decline.¹⁰ At the end of the decade, large stretches of waterfront property had been sold and forests and farmlands were being sub-divided for sale, mostly as retirement or recreational properties. This wartime real estate boom marked the beginning of a demographic shift that affected the future of the region profoundly. The 1966 federal census showed that the Gulf Islands school district had the highest proportion of senior citizens in the entire province, with 24.6 per cent of the districts 3,151 residents being over 65 years of age.¹¹ It is safe to assume that many of these seniors had responded to depictions by tourism promotions and developers of the Islands as restful pastoral retreats from the demands of city life. Others were long-term residents who had built their lives on those islands, but with the declining viability of agriculture and lack of on-island options for making a living, many younger islanders had been forced to leave to seek opportunities elsewhere. These island-specific demographic patterns interacted with broad postwar trends of rising overall prosperity, improved and expanded transportation networks, and shifts in cultural attitudes towards nature and the environment. These drivers of change ushered in a period of rapid development for the Gulf Islands starting in the late 1950s. Full- and part-time residents met change with a range of responses, but with land at a premium and large

¹⁰ “Where to Quit Work in B.C.,” *Sun*, August 10, 1940, Magazine Section, 4; “Many People Buying Islands’ Waterfront,” *Times*, September 20, 1943, 11; “Gulf Islands in Demand for Homes,” *Colonist*, September 21, 1943, 7.

¹¹ “Gulf Islands Sanctuary of Seniors,” *Sun*, February 13, 1968, 8.

numbers of people seeking to buy property for homes or seasonal retreats, many would come to resist the development pressure that threatened to ruin not only the ecological integrity, but the cultural, aesthetic, and lifestyle characteristics of the Islands. That sense of crisis drew upon an emerging regional identity that ascribed to the depiction of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral landscape under threat from the unregulated forces of change.

'The Invasion is on its Merry Way' - Drivers of Change, 1945-1969

In November 1953, with British Columbia's resource industries enjoying a boom, a *Victoria Daily Times* reporter wrote that the Gulf Islands, "one of the most beautiful areas in Canada, have been hit by the worst economic slump in their 100 year history;" farming and small extractive industries had "mostly folded."¹² During the war, high commodity prices allowed many producers to survive but labour shortages were often too great to maintain earlier production levels.¹³ Loggers in particular did well during the war: as one Saltspring resident recalled there "were at least fifty-five log booms around the island in the forties and fifties," but by the early 1950s when large coastal firms increased production, smaller Gulf Islands operators struggled to remain profitable.¹⁴ A few fishermen remained, but the province's declining number of canneries were concentrated in Vancouver and Prince Rupert where, for those who traveled to sell their catch, the money earned would also end up being spent. Continuing to develop the picture of economic stagnation, the *Daily Times* reporter observed that, "bracken-covered acres produce hardly a dime's revenue. Meadows where sleek Jersey cattle once munched contently have gone to seed. Chicken-raising, which before the war was one of the main occupations, is virtually non-existent today... Fruit trees abound, but apart from preserves made by local housewives, fruit falls and rots."¹⁵ The reason for this decline, the *Daily Times* reporter argued, was a withering maritime transportation system. While

¹² "Gulf Islands' Trade Killed by Cost of reaching Markets," *Times*, November 14, 1953, 14.

¹³ On Mayne Island, after the forced disposing of Japanese along the coast, white farmers tried to raise the big tomato crop formerly grown by Japanese but labor shortages had interfered. "Many People Buying Islands' Waterfront," *Times*, September 20, 1943, 11; "B.C's Gulf Islands," *Province*, January 12, 1946, Magazine Section, 6.

¹⁴ Kahn, *Salt Spring: The Story of an Island*, 212; "Gulf Islands' Trade Killed by Cost of reaching Markets," *Times*, November 14, 1953, 14.

¹⁵ "Gulf Islands' Trade Killed by Cost of reaching Markets," *Times*, November 14, 1953, 14.

Islanders had been successful during the 1930s in securing more frequent ferry service, the CPR providing year-round service by the *Princess Mary*, supplemented in the summer months by the *Motor Princess*, the company struggled continually to make the run profitable. In 1949, in a bid to cut costs, the CPR eliminated Victoria from the *Princess Mary* run, meaning that residents on the Outer Islands would only have contact with Vancouver Island during the summertime or via Vancouver. Only Saltspring, with its larger population, enjoyed a regular twice-daily service. Elsewhere, residents and producers blamed the “infrequent boat service” and “the high cost of shipping products to markets in Vancouver and Victoria,” for economic decline. A one resident producer put it, the associated transportation costs “eat up our slim margin of profit.”¹⁶

Accordingly, during the early 1950s the issue of improving transportation links fixated Gulf Islanders.¹⁷ Advocates seeking better market access for agricultural products, convenient connections for seasonal and part-time residents, and a significant increase in tourist traffic converged to pressure the CPR to boost service on the Gulf Islands route.¹⁸ Negotiations reached a deadlock, however, the company taking the position that the Islands population was too small to justify more runs. Advocates for better service countered that until service improved the Islands could not grow. Further complicating the issue was the seasonality of travel to the Islands. During the summer months, the number of travellers to the Islands rose substantially over winter travel, but full and part-time residents desired the same level of service year-round. Moreover, Gulf Islanders remained divided on the transportation issue. Residents on the eastern Outer Islands, represented by the Gulf Islands Improvement Bureau, an organization that formed in 1948 to advocate for the economic improvement of the region primarily through increased ferry service, argued steadfastly for a direct connection to the mainland via

¹⁶ “Gulf Islands’ Trade Killed by Cost of reaching Markets,” *Times*, November 14, 1953, 14.

¹⁷ This was in part reflective of wider provincial trends at the time. As Morris explains, “the province – under the leadership of WAC Bennett – was in the midst of major industrial development. This included a system of modern roads and highways, constructed to support burgeoning resource industries and connect the province’s hinterland with metropolitan areas. The government’s philosophy of high modernity guided its policies towards extensive resource extraction and industrial development, which it justified by the pursuit of the ‘Good Life.’” Samantha Morris, “Mapping the Family Road Trip: The Automobile, the Family and Outdoor Recreation in Postwar British Columbia,” (MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 2008); See also: David Mitchell, *W.A.C. Bennett and the Rise of British Columbia* (Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1983), 270.

¹⁸ “Gulf Islands in Industrial Slump; now eye Tourists,” *Sun*, December 3, 1953, 46.

Vancouver. Given the proximity of the mainland and the fact that the majority of seasonal residents resided there, this stance is understandable. Alternatively, the Pender Island Farmers Institute insisted on a closer connection to the Saanich Peninsula, from which one could access the mainland.¹⁹ Debates, negotiations, agreements, and studies multiplied over the first half of the 1950s. Meanwhile, the CPR's frequent unannounced and unexplained cuts to service along with shifting schedules and new schemes introduced in an ongoing attempt to make the runs profitable, succeeded only in infuriating Islands residents who had been subject to years of uncertainty and confusion.²⁰ As Charles Kahn argues, widespread pessimism that transportation links would be terminated, along with recognition of islands-wide economic decline, motivated many to abandon Saltspring for better opportunities elsewhere.²¹ Desperation even bred such ambitious schemes as the creation of an inter-island monorail and bridges to link the Islands to the mainland, an idea that was to resurface every five years or so over the next two decades.²² Improvements came in 1955 when the WAC Bennett government finally agreed to provide a sizeable subsidy for operators servicing the Outer Islands, ensuring affordable and frequent service. Saltspring was to retain its year-round twice-daily route, and the Outer Islands would enjoy the same summer schedule, but reduced to daily wintertime sailings.²³

The solution brought forward in 1955 was seemingly long over due. Although operators continued to struggle, travel to and from the Islands picked up immediately. At the end of May 1956, holiday traffic to Saltspring Island was double that of the previous spring. Island promoters such as Gavin Mouat, a prominent local merchant and operator

¹⁹ "Transport Problems Splits Gulf Island Communities," *Times*, May 31, 1955, 12.

²⁰ "Chamber of Commerce Committee Will Seek Improved Ferry Service," *Colonist*, July 19, 1951, 24; "Ferry Run to Islands given Study," *Colonist*, November 11, 1951, 17; "Gulf Islands Ferry Link," *Colonist*, November 21, 1951, 4; "Wrathful Mayne Island Residents Condem C.P.R Steamship Service," *Colonist*, January 6, 1951, 15; "Federal Aid to Islands Brings High Praise," *Colonist*, March 21, 1952, 5; "Ferry Change Feared," *Colonist*, October 30, 1952, 1; "Better Service for Islands," *Colonist*, April 23, 1953, 4; "Long Awaited Ship Services Resumes Today," *Colonist*, April 26, 1953, 17; "Ship Service Cut Blow to Islands," *Colonist*, August 30, 1953, 17; "Gulf Islands to Protest Cut," *Colonist*, September 3, 1953, 17; "Constructive Ship Proposals," *Times*, September 8, 1953, 4; "Coast Ferries' Proposed Daily Service From Gulf Islands," *Colonist*, January 14, 1954, 15; "New Deal Pledged For Gulf Islands," *Colonist* July 23, 1954, 6.

²¹ Kahn, *Salt Spring: The Story of an Island*, 269.

²² "Funds Sought for Survey on Inter-Island Monorail," *Colonist*, February 10, 1954, 11; "Costly Bridge-Ferry Network Suggested for Gulf Islands," *Colonist*, October 27, 1954, 11.

²³ Elliott, *Mayne Island & the Outer Gulf Islands: A History*, 83; "Province Plans to Call for Tenders for Non-Subsidized Salt Spring Run," *Colonist*, October 5, 1955, 6.

of the Saltspring Ferry Company, were ecstatic about the potential the new ferry services offered. “We have been fighting a long time for transportation and now that we have it, the islands are really on the doorstep of rapid development,” Mouat announced.²⁴ His feeling of optimism was shared by many, but also accepted with a note of caution. Premier Bennett, on a tour in mid-summer to support the success of the government’s subsidy, “simultaneously delighted and alarmed the islanders by telling a... press conference that the islands would become ‘the Hawaii of Canada.’”²⁵ The sudden surge in tourist activity was not, however, solely caused by increased transportation links; the growth of the post-war economy and rising levels of prosperity were also important contributors.

War-related production had stifled the range and amount of consumer goods made available to the public. This period of rationing, following the Depression decade, had left many Canadians with a long list of desired goods. As wartime production shifted to the manufacture of consumer goods and new technologies were translated into peacetime applications after 1945, supply quickly rose to meet demand. These patterns were at the centre of a post-war boom that spread unprecedented prosperity throughout Canada. Large segments of the population enjoyed a rising standard of living brought on by greater disposable income, cheaper goods, and more leisure time. These improvements along with the changing structure of the workforce led to the growth of the middle-class. Meanwhile, strong union organizations negotiated greater benefits including higher wages, paid vacations, and reduced work hours. Together these changes supported the growth of tourism as more and more people had the funds and free time necessary to travel recreationally within the province. Despite this economic prosperity, urban centres in particular faced tremendous changes. Many Canadians had moved closer to cities to work in wartime industries and remained. Others, seeking to benefit from the post-war boom and escape declining prospects in rural areas migrated to these areas. As a result, cities grew into sprawling regional centres.²⁶ Suburban developments emerged in response to the growing need for a great deal of affordable housing in urban areas, leading, in turn, to the development of new building practices and development methods,

²⁴ “Gulf Islands Can’t Cope with Sudden Tourist Boom,” *Colonist*, May 27, 1956, 3.

²⁵ “A B.C Trade Secret,” *Province*, July 4, 1956, 6.

²⁶ Owram, *Born at the Right Time*, 61.

one by-product of which was the creation of inexpensive prefabricated cottages.²⁷ Prosperity also fed into the already steady increase in the practice of retirement.

Retirement emerged as an important social, economic, and cultural phenomenon in the post-war period. The institution of retirement that supported the withdrawal of Canadians from “economic activity in advance of biological and physiological decline” was only fully realized following the Second World War.²⁸ Prior to this time, individuals relied primarily upon personal savings, the support of their children, and continued employment to survive during their senior years. Since the turn of the century, however, old-age pension advocates had pressed for a national system to deal with significant poverty among senior citizens. The system slowly evolved over the proceeding fifty years alongside wider social security measures, which were given an important boost due to economic hardship caused by the Great Depression. While some private pension schemes existed, they were generally tied to employment. It was not until economic expansion following the war “that universal pensions were instituted in Canada via the Old Age Security and Old Age Assistance Acts of 1951.”²⁹ These acts contributed to the declining labour force participation rate for men over 65, from 37.9 percent in 1951 to 29.3 percent in 1961. Furthermore, with the institutionalization of retirement, negative public attitudes towards this as a period of uselessness, poverty, boredom, poor health, and a general decline in quality of life faded. Instead, it became a period of ‘reward’ for a life of hard work and service. Coupled with the growth of personal income and savings, more and more individuals sought to retire and either move somewhere pleasant, or travel and enjoy their senior years. For those without pensions, or savings from a career of wage earning, such as farmers, the rising value of land in attractive real estate markets like the Gulf Islands became the means by which the growing dream of retirement could be fulfilled.

Finally, in cultural terms, the postwar period saw a growing desire for experiences of the simple life and connection with nature. As a sizeable body of scholarship demonstrates, “reverence for plain living, though never dominant, has been a

²⁷ Owram, *Born at the Right Time*, 63.

²⁸ Lynn McDonald and Richard Wanner, *Retirement in Canada* (Toronto: Butterworths, 1990): 24.

²⁹ *Ibid.*

persistent and influential tradition throughout North American history.”³⁰ As Peter Stevens explains, the perceived “decadence and emptiness” of modern urban life led to criticisms of “the benefits of technology, ‘progress,’ and materialism.”³¹ These ideas informed a number of movements throughout the twentieth century, including the wilderness and parks movement, summer camps for children, and modern agrarian initiatives like back-to-the-land enthusiasm.³² For Jackson Lears, these movements were all an outgrowth of the wider anti-modern tendency discussed in the introduction.³³ In the post-war period, these anti-modern criticisms and desires for reconnection responded to the growth of consumerism and expanding urban centres, which many saw to be negative trends. As Stevens has shown in a case that offers many parallels in the Gulf Islands, the rise of the cottaging movement in postwar Ontario reflected a desire by its adherents to ‘get away from it all’ and leave behind the consumerism, busyness, and stress of urban life.³⁴ In the Gulf Islands, broader cultural associations with islands as geographic entities fit for retreat, relaxation, and separation, amplified these anti-modern tendencies and the interest in the simple life.³⁵ The appeal of the simple life also found expression in a growing interest in outdoor recreation, which can be seen in the rising popularity of provincial campgrounds in British Columbia, where, between 1955 and 1970, the number

³⁰ Peter Stevens, “Roughing it in Comfort:” Family Cottaging and Consumer Culture in Postwar Ontario,” *Canadian Historical Review* 94 no.2 (2013), 235. For other work exploring the idea of simple living in Canadian history see: George Altmeyer, “Three Ideas of Nature in Canada, 1893–1914,” *Journal of Canadian Studies* 11 no.3 (August 1976): 21–36; Sharon Wall, “Totem Poles, Teepees, and Token Traditions: ‘Playing Indian’ at Ontario Summer Camps, 1920–1955,” *The Canadian Historical Review* 86, no.3 (September 2005): 513–546.

³¹ Stevens, “Roughing it in Comfort,” 236.

³² Alan MacEachern, *Natural Selections: Natural Parks in Atlantic Canada, 1935–1970*. (Montreal: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2001); I. S. MacLaren, ed. *Culturing Wilderness in Jasper National Park: Studies in Two Centuries of Human History in the Upper Athabasca River Watershed* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2007); Jocelyn Thorpe, *Temagami’s Tangled Wild: Race, Gender, and the Making of Canadian Nature* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012); Dona Brown, *Back to the Land: The Enduring Dream of Self-Sufficiency in Modern America* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011); Karen Wall. *The Nurture of Nature: Childhood, Antimodernism and Ontario Summer Camps, 1920–55* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2009)

³³ T.J. Jackson Lears, *No Place of Grace: Antimodernism and the Transformation of American Culture, 1880–1920* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981)

³⁴ Stevens, “Roughing it in Comfort,” 235.

³⁵ Premier Bennett, for example, by referring to the Gulf Islands as “Canada’s Hawaii” in 1956 employed this type of cultural connection to islands. The Hawaiian islands are, in most of Western cultural imagination, the quintessential example of leisure and island bliss; “Bennett Predicts Gulf Islands Canada’s Hawaii,” *Province*, June 29, 1956, 17; Another example comes from a 1970 Capital Regional District planning study, which stated that “buying an island or lot in the Gulf Islands has a *perpetual attraction* - and adds to the basic problem.” (my italics); Capital Regional District, *Gulf Islands Study*, (Victoria: Capital Regional District Planning Department, 1970): 4.

of nights spent camping in such facilities increased tenfold and the number of provincial camping units rose from 711 to 4674.³⁶ Taken together, these broad social, economic, and cultural trends began to shape the Gulf Islands and responses to development underway in the region over the twenty years following the war.

'Paradise Found' - the Gulf Islands in the Post-War Period, 1945-1969

With the establishment of a steady and convenient transportation network during the later 1950s, the Gulf Islands' popularity among travellers in southern British Columbia and the United States steadily increased. By 1960 the Islands were already a popular summer destination. In addition to the drivers noted above, this popularity was the result of pre-existing efforts by provincial authorities to sell the Gulf Islands to tourists, a campaign that increased in intensity during the 1950s. As in earlier publications, these promotions drew upon a pastoral depiction; for example, one Government Travel Bureau tourist brochure from 1950 noted the quaint beauty of the Islands as "one approaches close enough to see the blue smoke of the fishing villages or the colour of small settlements." As well, however, promotional materials worked with wider cultural ideas of 'island life' as an existence on relaxed, coastal paradises that everyone should want to experience. Invoking images of the Hawaiian Islands the brochure asked readers: "Who is there who has not dreamed of them [the Pacific Islands] at some time or another? Of visiting if not living on one?" The local and more accessible answer to this perceived desire, the brochure continues, is the Gulf Islands. There one could find a place where "the sun does shine, the climate is mild, and the atmosphere is such that many have retired to them." Linking this environment to long-established vacation isles in the Caribbean and Mediterranean, the writer describes travellers to the Gulf Islands as content to leave the more strenuous things to "mañana."³⁷ Such promotional materials, then, set out to sell not only the Islands' environment, but also the relaxed Islands lifestyle. The "leisure and contentment" available there, Islands MLA Earle Westwood told the House in 1961, constituted "the most important single

³⁶ T. O. Riordan, "An Analysis of the Use and Management of Campgrounds in British Columbia Provincial Parks," *Economic Geography* 49, no.4 (October 1973), 299.

³⁷ BCA British Columbia Government Travel Bureau, NWp 971.96 G971, *British Columbia's Enchanting Gulf Islands*, 1950

commodity we have to sell tourists.”³⁸ These efforts to sell the Islands were only bolstered in the early 1960s with WAC Bennett’s establishment of the B.C Ferry Corporation in 1958, which took over the Gulf Islands ferry service and instituted a determined promotional campaign that drew upon the same pastoral depiction and the leisured lifestyle it allowed.³⁹ As a result, “connections with the outside world improved dramatically,” Charles Kahn writes in his history of Saltspring.⁴⁰ More than just visitors, however, the Islands were attracting a growing number of seasonal and full-time residents.

Until 1966, the number of full-time residents departing the Islands tended to outweigh new arrivals. But as Table 1 shows, the population began to increase rapidly after 1966. Real estate firms were subdividing thousands of acres and individuals bought them up almost as quickly as they went on sale. Interest in the Islands was not limited to neighbouring urban centres either; across Canada, America, and internationally, would-be property investors, retirees, and vacationers were looking to the Gulf Islands.⁴¹ As Table 2 demonstrates there was a steady increase in developed lots across the Gulf Islands over the course of the 1960s, a trend that worried many Islanders.

³⁸ “Visiting British Columbia - a nice PACE to go,” *Gulf Islander*, February 25, 1961, 1.

³⁹ The BC Ferry Corporation emerged out of a labour dispute brought on by the Seafarers International Union who “struck the CPR ferry connection between Vancouver and Victoria and sympathetic work stoppages threatened the Black Ball Line, the only other ferry service” between the two. WAC Bennett, realizing the threat a coastal ferry shutdown held for the region’s economy, proclaimed the Civil Defence Act, taking over the Black Ball Line and subsequently forcing both sides to return to work. Coming out of the strike, however, Bennett recognized the importance of a the ferry system to provincial transportation networks and purchased Black Ball Ferries, going into competition with the CPR. The BC Ferry Corporation thrived and overtime pushed the CPR out of business. Mitchell, *W.A.C: Bennett and the Rise of British Columbia*, 269-272; For an example of the BC Ferry Corporation’s Gulf Islands promotional campaign see: BCA, British Columbia Ferry Authority, NWp 971.1 Gu B862cr, *Cruise British Columbia's Sunny Gulf Islands via B.C. Ferries*, 1963.

⁴⁰ Kahn, *Salt Spring: The Story of an Island*, 277.

⁴¹ “Tourists Flock to Gulf Islands,” *Colonist*, August 5, 1960, 23; A great deal of advertisement was directed at the prairie provinces where rising prosperity from the postwar oilfield boom created a large population looking to invest their money in a booming real estate market. “You Can Take a Boy Out of the Country...,” *Times*, September 6, 1967, 18; “German Family Owns 3,000 Island Acres,” *Times*, January 12, 1962, 11.

Table 1: Gulf Islands Population Change, 1956-1976

Year	Full-time Residents
1956	3,107
1961	3,220
1966	3,171
1971	4,538
1976	5,351

Source : Barbara Prescott, *Gulf Islands User Study*, Research Section, Planning Division, Parks Branch, Department of Recreation and Travel Industry, Victoria, British Columbia, 1976

Table 2: New Residential Lot Development, 1959-1968

Islands	1959	1960	1961	1962	1963	1964	1965	1966	1967	1968	Total 1959-68
Saltspring	122	144	103	15	57	197	74	118	129	168	1107
Saturna	84	64	6	-	6	5	1	17	52	21	256
Mayne	29	146	63	67	198	23	55	32	38	11	662
Galiano	30	29	23	10	30	28	25	51	46	48	320
N. Pender	2	28	16	6	61	169	67	10	145	229	733
S. Pender	1	37	4	-	4	-	11	-	5	4	66
Total	268	448	215	98	356	402	233	228	415	481	3144

Source: Capital Regional District, *Gulf Islands Study*, Planning Department, Victoria, B.C, 1970)

Uneasy about the impact such development would create, residents such as Jean Lockwood, editor of the *Gulf Islander*, lamented the “discovery” of the Islands by “day-trippers,” “litter-bugs,” and “speculators” who she saw as ruining the traditional way of life with their garbage and calls to “modernize” the region.⁴² “We like our black-topped roads,” Lockwood explained, “but we don’t want sidewalks. We like our country lanes and split rail fences — and our party lines. If we didn’t like the woods and bush and beaches, we wouldn’t be here.”⁴³ Even Premier Bennett, who eight years earlier had predicted that the Islands were on the doorstep of rapid development, began to express concern. During a 1963 speech inaugurating a new ferry, the *Queen of the Islands*, Bennett expressed hope that despite greater access, the ferry would not “accelerate the relaxed tempo” of Islanders lives.⁴⁴ The politician’s worries were not unfounded; as Table 2 shows, the new ferry services in the 1960s triggered a steady growth in the number of subdivisions. One reporter captured the situation in 1964, describing how “many properties held by original settler families since the end of the last century are being broken into cottage-size fragments... [and] new roads are being punched through former wilderness.” Fuelling these developments, the reporters notes, were real estate developers, “meeting every ferry and taking people over by fast cruiser or seaplane. They are setting up sales agencies at every boat and sportsmen’s show. They will even bring projectors into your home and sell you on the island with full colour pictures backgrounded by soft music and the beckoning call of rolling surf.”⁴⁵ Increased interest meant rising property values, in 1958 a buyer could find a lot with 100 feet of water frontage and 300 feet deep for only \$1,200 on Mayne Island. A decade later, a much smaller lot measuring 70 feet of waterfront and 120 feet deep cost around \$6,000.⁴⁶ On the one hand, failed farmers and others seeking to get off the Islands could now sell their

⁴² "For Lo, the Winter is Past, and the Time of the Litterbug is Come!," *Gulf Islander*, February 28, 1964, 1; "Notes and News," *Gulf Islander*, February 5, 1965, 1.

⁴³ Ibid.

⁴⁴ Terry Hammond, "Paradise Found by New Ferry Link but Islanders May Call it Paradise Lost," *Colonist*, July 5, 1963, 1.

⁴⁵ Pete Loudon, "Hawaii of Canada Taking Form in Sheltered Gulf Island of B.C.," *Times*, February 13, 1964, 21.

⁴⁶ Moira Farrow, "Gulf Islands Become a Gold Mine," *Sun*, August 29, 1968, 12; While the price of Gulf Islands real estate was increasing rapidly, it remained low in contrast to vacation destinations elsewhere in the province such as on the interior lakes or in the American San Juan Islands where prices were nearly double. Pete Loudon, "They'll Commute to Gulf Islands Via hovercraft," *Times*, February 14, 1964, 17.

property for a sizeable sum. Moreover, with rising property values, farmers and residents were increasingly burdened with rising property taxes, which were tied to the assessed value of the land, creating a further motivation to sell or subdivide property. For those dedicated to remaining in their relatively undeveloped island setting or who were moving to the Islands to escape urban congestion, the boom was far from ideal.⁴⁷

Even before the mid-1960s, when rapidly accelerating development drew the attention and ire of those interested in the future of the region, full- and part-time residents had become concerned with the preservation of the Gulf Islands. These early efforts focused primarily on threats to the aesthetic value of the natural environment rather than development or ecological pressures. As early as 1951, residents and tourists rallied against a proposal to cut 400 acres of timber from the Tsartlip Indian reserve at Helen Point on Mayne Island, because it was situated in Active Pass along the ferry route to the mainland. Anxious to preserve scenic values, many individuals wrote in protest to the federal Department of Indian Affairs. In the end, this effort succeeded in having the band chief agree to preserve a fringe of timber, thus minimizing the aesthetic impact.⁴⁸ A similar incident occurred in the summer of 1957 when oil companies sought permission to search for oil in the Strait of Georgia. Islanders joined other residents of the Strait in opposing such development.⁴⁹ These environmental concerns, however, remained minor. Throughout the 1950s, the majority of residents, preoccupied as they were with dealing with the ferry issue, continued to support the development and progress of the Islands as residential and tourist destinations. It was not until rapid and uncontrolled development in the mid-1960s began to seriously threaten the ecological health and the tenability of the pastoral character of the Islands environment that Islanders began to raise questions and concerns about the future of the region.

'Paradise Lost' - Early Land-Use Management, 1965-1969

⁴⁷ "Gulf Islanders Hopping Mad," *Colonist*, November 8, 1964, 39; "Pollution Ugliness Invades the Islands," *Colonist*, April 25, 1968, 4; "Gulf Islands Become a Gold Mine," *Sun*, August 29, 1968, 12.

⁴⁸ "Logging Operations threaten Beauty Spot in Active Pass," *Colonist*, August 10, 1951, 24; "Woodman May Skip Scenic Site," *Colonist*, August 18, 1951, 1.

⁴⁹ "Oil, Gas Search in Gulf Islands," *Colonist*, August 3, 1957, 17; "Progress Threatens a B.C Sanctuary," *Province*, August 24, 1957, 6.

Postwar growth and prosperity were not limited to the Gulf Islands. Across the province the population grew, industry expanded, and suburban spread beyond municipal boundaries intensified. Recognizing the need for controlled development of resources and land, the Bennett government passed legislation in 1965 providing for the creation of regional districts. The stated goal of the new system was “to provide a federated approach to local control over problems transcending municipal boundaries in either a metropolitan or non-metropolitan area.”⁵⁰ Ownership and legislative jurisdiction over public lands and resources, with the exception of fisheries, was delegated to the Province of British Columbia upon joining Confederation through the British North America Act of 1867. Unable to manage effectively all of the lands under their jurisdiction, the provincial government delegated a number of the powers given to them under the BNA Act to local government.⁵¹ Before regional district legislation the only form of local government that existed in the province were incorporated areas, called municipalities, such as cities, towns, and villages. In unorganized territory such as the Gulf Islands, which did not fall under municipal jurisdiction, services such as water and sewer systems, fire protection, and hospitals were provided by a variety of special purpose boards, often established by residents, and land management functions were carried out on an ad hoc basis by various provincial government departments.⁵² With no mechanism for comprehensive planning in these unorganized areas, residents received only minimal services and lacked control over development. Thus, in 1965 the B.C. Legislature created 28 regional districts to assume planning responsibility on these lands. The Gulf Islands were not, however, amalgamated within a single district. Instead, the Islands were included in no less than seven different districts. With the exception of two mandatory functions – regional planning and the administration and planning of community hospitals – Laura Porcher explains, the provincial government offered regional boards a “smorgasboard of functions,” from which to choose. These optional functions ranged from the supply of water, waste removal, regulation of tree cutting outside Tree Farm Licenses and forest reserves, to the

⁵⁰ Province of British Columbia Ministry of Municipal Affairs, Recreation, and Culture, *Statistics Relating to Regional and Municipal Government in British Columbia* (Victoria, Queen’s Bench Press, 1990): 1.

⁵¹ Laura Kathryn Porcher, “The Islands Trust: An Institutional Experiment in the Management of Scarce Natural and Social Resources,” (Ph.D. dissertation, University of British Columbia, 1980), 24-25

⁵² Porcher, “The Islands Trust,” 5.

establishment of parks.⁵³ Given these options, each of the seven regional districts overseeing the Gulf Islands ended up with different functions to attend to beyond the mandatory two imposed by the legislation.

The result was a varied level of services and regulations across the region, the only uniformity being the peripheral nature of the Islands within the regional district system. The southern islands, Saltspring and the Outer Islands, for example, fell within the Capital Regional District (CRD), which included Victoria, the Saanich Peninsula, and the western communities, Colwood, Langford, Metchosin, and Sooke. Each of the areas elected a number of representatives to a regional board based on their relative population. Thus, on the CRD Board consisting of 24 members, one elected member represented Saltspring and another the Outer Islands. Such a structure offered both advantages and disadvantages for the Islands. A higher level of services became feasible with the help of a wider regional tax base, but “communication with regional boards and staff was often difficult due to the remoteness of islands” and in some cases, as with minimum lot sizes, the goals of representatives from more predominately urban areas differed from those of Islanders.⁵⁴ Furthermore, the large number of regional districts separately managing the Gulf Islands did not promote any overall, coordinated planning among the Islands. Only the Greater Vancouver Regional District included any of the Islands in its regional plan.⁵⁵ As well, provincial resource departments such as the B.C Forest Service, B.C Ferry Authority, and the B.C Lands Services, retained their full and mutually exclusive “responsibilities of using, protecting, or maximizing the productivity of crown controlled land and resources.”⁵⁶ Finally, with a wide range of planning needs, systems, and processes to develop following each regional district’s creation, the Islands, with their minor population, were often a low priority, reflected in the lack of initiative taken by the districts towards the Gulf Islands in the first five years of their operation.

Minimal controls on land development, within the context of rapid growth in the demand for property resulted, by 1968, in Islanders, seasonal residents, and politicians raising loud concerns. One major subdivision, the Magic Lake Estates, a 1200-acre

⁵³ Ibid., 26-27.

⁵⁴ Porcher, “The Islands Trust,” 6.

⁵⁵ Ibid., 6.

⁵⁶ William Rees and Erik Karlsen, “The Regional Districts and Environmental Management in B.C.,” *Papers on Local Government*, 1 no.6 (Vancouver, BC: Centre for Continuing Education U.B.C, 1973), 6.

development, complete with man-made lake, on the western shore of North Pender Island, served as a major catalyst for action. Saanich Mayor and Regional Board director Hugh Curtis was the first prominent politician to voice concerns. Denouncing the development as a “shocking disgrace,” Curtis was careful not to denigrate the influx of people, but rather focused his concerns on the manner in which development was occurring. “There is no community planning and no general control of land use throughout the Islands,” he stated.⁵⁷ In the following months, Curtis went on to deplore the dumping of sewage into the ocean, the lack of garbage disposal leading to pollution, the increasingly small size of residential lots, and the lack of building inspections.⁵⁸ Islanders themselves organized against developers, taking particular aim at efforts to secure permits for the discharge of untreated sewage from new subdivisions into the ocean. Applying a detailed understanding of underwater geography and current patterns, residents put forward strong arguments for the defense of human and marine health.⁵⁹ However, despite the strength of these arguments, they were primarily negative in opposing a certain type of development. A positive counter argument articulating what was meant to be preserved awaited formulation.

Initial resistance to development focused on the threat of ecological degradation; advocates declared the Islands unique and special, but the ambiguity of such terms demanded a more articulate understanding of what it was about the Islands that deserved protection. By the late 1960s, Islanders responded to the perceived threat that unbridled development posed to the Gulf Islands’ ‘way of life’ with a more strongly articulated, and distinct, regional identity to act as a reference for opposition. As Alan Gordon has argued, “threats to the character of place often, paradoxically, involved an entrenchment of ‘distinctive’ cultural features.”⁶⁰ As well, by the 1960s many people living in the Islands possessed no family roots in the region. The Gulf Islanders’ idea of ‘community’ or ‘identity’ was therefore, as Rayner observers, much more “artificially constructed than in other rural regions, where historically-continuous social relations are assumed to be the

⁵⁷ “Gulf Islands Growth “Shocking Disgrace,” *Times*, May 16, 1968, 23.

⁵⁸ “We Are Destroying the Unique Gulf Islands,” *Province*, June 18, 1968, 4.

⁵⁹ “More Builders Waiting Gulf Islanders Warn,” *Colonist*, April 3, 1969, 39; “Pollution - Letter Ada Ryan,” *Times*, June 20, 1968, 4; “The Ganges Sewer (March 1962-?),” *Driftwood*, 26 August 1981, 2.

⁶⁰ Alan Gordon, *Making Public Pasts: The Contested Terrain of Montréal's Public Memories, 1891-1930* (Montréal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001): 13.

basis of community.” In turn, Gulf Islanders often invoked “the talisman of ‘community’ in order to establish authority and moral ownership of the land and to mount opposition to further development in the area.”⁶¹ In forging this community identity, Islanders drew upon those arcadian ideals and pastoral depictions that had been projected throughout the first half of the twentieth century. But this process of identity formation was not immediate, nor as simple as this may suggest; rather it was an ongoing negotiation among residents, new and old, who sought to make sense of, benefit from, or control the changes occurring around them.

A common rhetorical position adopted in the late 1960s defined the Gulf Islands in part as a site of fragile ecosystems that were under threat. Given the extensive history of material use, settlement, and resource exploitation, a case for the Islands as pristine was, however, hard to maintain, nor was it in keeping with the lifestyle elements so important to many residents. Accordingly, Islanders promoted a sense of the region’s special and unique lifestyle, one very much in keeping with the arcadian tradition. The landscape came to embody the arcadian ideal so overwhelmingly that, as Ann Rayner argues, “other characteristics of place — economics, social organization, government, and politics, for example — appear to fall inevitably into the category of pastoral.” Agriculture and the evidence of its land-use became less a means of improving the economic strength of the Islands and instead a means of bolstering “claims to the region’s ‘rural’ character.” In framing agriculture in this way, Rayner continues, “the pastoral becomes a charming illusion: the landscape that was once used for these purposes retains its visual integrity, but its persistence depends not on stable conditions but on deliberate steps taken to preserve it.”⁶² This is not to say that the creation of this identity was an entirely conscious or deliberate process undertaken to oppose development. Identity formation would serve this purpose, no doubt, but it was also a natural tendency among individuals, new to an environment, seeking to define their place and their attachments to the landscape. The creation of this regional identity, conscious or not, did, however, require a range of media to articulate and share ideas.

⁶¹ Anne Patricia Rayner, “Everything Becomes an Island: Gulf Islands Writing and the Construction of Region,” (Ph.D dissertation, University of British Columbia, 1995), 62.

⁶² Rayner, “Everything Becomes an Island,” 47.

In the Gulf Islands literary publications, local newspapers, and historical societies all served as forums for the creation and expression of regional identity. As Ann Rayner identifies, publications about the Islands were dominated by the local history, travelogue, and guidebook genres, all “conventionally considered sub-literary, and thus the legitimate territory of those with no more qualifications than enthusiasm.”⁶³ Similarly, local newspapers, such as the *Gulf Islander* on Galiano (established 1961) and the *Saltspring Driftwood* (established 1962), created a space for enthusiastic writers and passionate advocates of the ‘Gulf Islands lifestyle’ to articulate their sense of what it meant to be a ‘true Islander.’ Finally, historical societies, such as the branch of the B.C Historical Association established in the Outer Islands, came together with the express purpose of collecting, preserving, and celebrating stories from the past. As discussed in the introduction, the study of memory and the past is far more than the objective capture of past events. As Zelizer argues, “it represents a graphing of the past as it is used for present aims.”⁶⁴ The local histories, often self-published and produced by these passionate but untrained residents, are some of the clearest examples of the desire that Zelizer identifies to put the past to use to define the Islands’ identity for contemporary purposes.

In 1959 the Gulf Islands branch of the B.C Historical Association was established for the purpose of producing a historical book on the area.⁶⁵ Calls went out to island residents to submit stories for the resulting book, *A Gulf Islands Patchwork*, published in 1961.⁶⁶ As the title would suggest, the book draws a parallel to the dispersed geography of the region by treating the history of the Islands as a scattered ‘patchwork.’ While there is no straightforward structure to the story, the underlying narrative of the sketches is reflective of the arcadian ideal. Stories of leisure and recreation, tennis, swimming, and sunbathing, alongside stories of eccentric individuals pursuing a simple lifestyle, predominate the text. While accounts of hardship, toil, or agricultural production are

⁶³ Rayner, “Everything Becomes an Island,” 52.

⁶⁴ B. Zelizer, “Reading the Past Against the Grain: The Shape of Memory Studies,” *Critical Studies in Mass Communication* 12 no.2 (June 1995): 217. (214-39)

⁶⁵ BCA, British Columbia Historical Association, MS-2779 File 3/14, Gulf Islands Branch Reports.

⁶⁶ British Columbia Historical Association, Gulf Islands Branch, *A Gulf Islands Patchwork: Some Early Events on the Islands of Galiano, Mayne, Saturna, North and South Pender* (Sidney, B.C: Peninsula Printing Co., 1961); Margaret Shaw Walter, *Early Days Among the Gulf Islands of British Columbia, 2nd ed.* (Victoria: Hebden Print. Co., 1966).

present, the authors cast the actual work involved in a quaint manner. In one of the few examples where an author discusses labour, Captain J.T Hamilton described the scene that took place several times a year on North Pender Island when the sheep that had been let out to pasture were corralled onto farmers' property to be sheered or taken to market. In reference to the labour involved in this endeavour, Hamilton noted in passing that there was "always a pretty substantial lunch as the running of sheep was strenuous business."⁶⁷

Interestingly, regional histories like *A Gulf Islands Patchwork* are replaced after the early 1960s by histories of individual islands.⁶⁸ This tendency suggests that increasingly Islands residents abandoned a regional identity in favour of local connections. There is truth to this idea, but it was also not an entirely new trend, island-specific identities and communities existed throughout the twentieth century. But the growth of government highway and car ferry networks, which easily transported people to, from, and around individual Islands, coupled with the growth of island populations, increased the primacy of 'distinct' island-specific identities. However, what can also be seen within these local histories is that the authors at the same time as trying to define a community and create a local identity, fostered a strong connection to the broader conception of the 'Gulf Islands' as a special region with a defining character. Whether one identified as a Saltspring, Mayne, or Pender Islander all were 'Gulf Islanders.' In sum, local histories, along with travel accounts and guidebooks (which are beyond the scope of this brief review but are analyzed in detail in Ann Rayner's work), and newspaper publications, played an important role during the 1960s and beyond in establishing a regional identity in the face of the perceived threat posed by development.

Through these local histories, guidebooks, travel accounts, and newspapers the identity of 'Gulf Islanders' as living an arcadian lifestyle within a pastoral environment gained legitimacy. Locally produced cultural institutions emphasized this place identity, drawing upon the power of public memory to develop a totalizing and exclusionary

⁶⁷ British Columbia Historical Association, *A Gulf Islands Patchwork*, 127.

⁶⁸ Margery Congall, *The History of Hornby Island* (Courtenay: Comox District Free Press, 1969); A.F. Flucke, "Early Days on Saltspring Island," *B.C. Historical Quarterly* 15 no.3-4 (1951); Bea Hamilton, *Salt Spring Island* (Vancouver: Mitchell Press, 1969); June Harrison, *The People of Gabriola: A History of Our Pioneers*. Gabriola: privately printed, c. 1982); Irene Howard, *Bowen Island 1872-1972* (Bowen Island: Bowen Island Historians, 1973); Winnifred A. Isbister, *My Ain Folk: Denman Island 1875-1975*. (Comox Valley: Bickle, 1976).

reading of the Gulf Islands. Alternative histories of land-use in the Islands, such as the cases of imprisoned Doukhobours or Chinese Lepers, Aboriginal lifestyles and the colonial injustices imposed upon them, stories of Japanese co-operative farmers and fishers, and Europeans who struggled and toiled to scratch a living from the land, which did not fit the mould of a leisured arcadian tradition went untold. This regional identity was a powerful means of opposing developments, which by transforming the pastoral environment threatened the viability and legitimacy of an arcadian lifestyle. The 'true' pastoral landscape of the Gulf Islands needed to be protected, maintained, or created in order to preserve an arcadian lifestyle that was part historical reality and part cultural construction. By the end of the 1960s, uncontrolled development was far more than an affront to the ecological integrity of the Islands; it was a threat to a 'special' and 'unique' way of life rooted in this landscape. The work of planning organizations, such as the CRD Board, which, in the fall of 1969 finally responded to demands for planning in the Islands, was given moral weight and tasked with far more than simply land-use planning but the maintenance of a cherished 'way of life.'

Conclusion

During the immediate post-Second World War decades, the Gulf Islands faced a period of dramatic change. A wartime real estate boom, coupled with the emerging phenomenon of retirement across the country, an aging settler population, the out-migration of youth in part driven by the war, as well as the decline of the agriculture-based economy, led to a declining and increasingly aged population in the Gulf Islands. At the same time, widespread economic prosperity, more flexible work schedules, the rapid expansion of urban centres, improved and expanded transportation networks, and a prominent interest in reconnecting with nature or 'getting away from it all' created an increasing demand for the development of seasonal residences and tourist destinations. Despite this demand, challenges in establishing a regular and adequate ferry connection to all of the Islands hindered growth during the 1950s. With the commitment by the provincial government to support regular service by mid-decade, however, the potential for development in the Islands was quickly recognized. Improved access pushed land

prices to a premium and attracted large numbers of people seeking to buy homes or seasonal retreats on the Islands. This pressure, was not, however, controlled. As unorganized territory, the Gulf Islands lacked adequate land-use regulations and unrestrained growth quickly became, for many, a source of great concern. Early efforts to oppose development were vocal and largely negative in resisting change, but a clear articulation of what was to be preserved took more time to emerge. Over time a regional identity took shape that upheld the Gulf Islands as a pastoral landscape, within which a leisured arcadian lifestyle could be created, maintained, and supported.

Chapter 4: Safeguarding the Pastoral - the Islands Trust, 1969-1976

Through the 1960s, full- and part-time residents and local politicians pressured the provincial government and regional planners for action to curb rapid residential development in the Gulf Islands. This call for action came not only as a response to perceived environmental degradation, but more importantly to the degradation of the ‘character’ of the Islands, an idea that encompassed the region’s physical, social, and cultural environments. Calls for control garnered attention from regional and provincial politicians but the regional district planning authorities were slow to act. In late October 1969, as pressure on the provincial government to respond to the perceived failure of regional districts mounted, Social Credit Minister of Municipal Affairs Dan Campbell imposed a new community planning area on the Islands. This measure put a halt to small-lot (under one acre) developments, which many saw as the source of the greatest pressure, by establishing a minimum lot size of 10 acres for all future subdivision in the Islands. This ‘10 acre freeze’ was presented by Campbell as a “crude” mechanism to limit residential density, but one that would provide the regional district planning boards with a “breathing spell” in which to prepare formal plans for the islands.¹ The implementation of the 10-acre freeze in 1969 marked a high-level acceptance of the argument that the Gulf Islands were in some way special and under threat, and thus needed to be preserved; how preservation was to be achieved, however, remained unclear. In contrast to the second half of the 1960s, the question of whether the Gulf Islands should be preserved featured less prominently than that of *how* they should be preserved. As such, the first half of the present chapter documents the debates, discussions, and planning projects undertaken to answer this question in the Islands of the Capital Regional District in the four years after the 10-acre freeze as a foundation for understanding the subsequent development of the Islands Trust.

Between 1969 and 1973 little tangible success was made in implementing planning and controls in the Gulf Islands. There was, however, a great deal of discussion.

¹ “Subdividing Halt Called,” *Colonist*, October 29, 1969, 19.

Academics, politicians, planners, and residents voiced their opinions and debated the relative merits of proposed solutions, but few concrete actions were taken to adopt land-use management mechanisms in the Islands. These discussions reflected a deep interest in the fate of the Gulf Islands. Calls to preserve the Islands had made excessive development more than just a regional issue; voices and concerns came from far beyond local communities. While for some of these external voices the concern was the potential loss of an environmentally fragile region, most joined local residents in arguing for the preservation of the ‘character’ of the Gulf Islands. The idea of a unique pastoral landscape as home to a particular ‘Gulf Islands lifestyle,’ as explored in the previous chapter, remained prevalent during this period. The debate around preservation, therefore, did not ponder what the ‘character’ of the Gulf Islands meant. Instead, the debate focused on structural planning issues, questions of individual versus collective property rights, and the correct role of government in land-use planning. Within these debates, however, the tensions and negotiations that emerged reflect the varied ways that the Islands had been defined through the twentieth century. Undercurrents of liberal agrarianism or the Country Life Movement that supported ‘progress’ on the Islands and the infallibility of personal property rights, which had been important agents shaping economic, social, and cultural elements of the region through the twentieth century, complicated depictions of the Islands as pastoral retreats to be preserved for the common good of the citizens of British Columbia.

The election of Dave Barrett’s New Democratic Party (NDP) government in 1972 ushered in what many at the time hoped and others feared would be a period of radical land-use management policies. Concerning the Gulf Islands issue, the NDP government opted to study the situation before developing a solution and in turn appointed the Legislature’s Standing Committee on Municipal Matters to the task. The report and recommendations that arose from the Committee’s study called for the establishment of an ‘Islands Trust’ to oversee and coordinate land-use on the Islands. Debates around and opposition to the idea of the Islands Trust, as with the other planning proposals submitted over the previous five years, remained focused on governance and property rights issues, with only a few voices questioning the underlying premise of the loosely-defined desire to preserve the special ‘character’ of the Islands. Despite opposition from many fronts, in

1974 the NDP passed the Islands Trust Act, making official the rather vague mandate of preserving and protecting the Islands’ “*unique amenities and environment* for the benefit of the residents of the trust area and of the Province generally.”² This idea of the Islands’ “unique amenities and environment” in the end, codified the varied and complex perceptions of the region that the previous two chapters have sought to understand. Given the ambiguity of this mandate the provincial government left to the initial Trustees and staff of the Islands Trust the job of interpreting what exactly the body was meant to preserve and protect. In its interpretation, the Trust embraced the underlying pastoral perception of the Gulf Islands by focusing on preserving a conception of the region’s unique ‘character’ or ‘rural atmosphere,’ ideas that would shape land-use planning and policy programs during the organization’s first years of operation.

‘Chartless in the Gulf’ - from the 10-acre freeze to the NDP, October 1969-September 1972

The implementation of the 10-acre freeze by Minister of Municipal Affairs Dan Campbell did not bring him the anticipated period of calm. Declaring the Gulf Islands a new community planning area where a minimum of 10-acres for each lot was required for future subdivisions, Campbell intended to provide members of the regional district planning boards with a “breathing spell,” during which they would be able to generate community plans for each of the Islands.³ There was, however, no official directive to the regional boards to undertake such planning. Rather, the Minister believed the freeze would be a drastic enough move to motivate the regional districts into action.⁴ For some boards this proved to be true; the Capital Regional Planning Board worked to establish regional and community plans for Saltspring Island and the Outer Islands. The efforts, however, did not proceed quickly. By September 1972, when the NDP took office, only four island plans and corresponding zoning bylaws had been generated and put forward for ministerial approval. While the regional districts endeavoured to establish a workable

² Emphasis added; *Islands Trust Act*, R.S.B.C ch. 239, s. 3.1 (1974).

³ “Subdividing Halt Called,” *Colonist*, October 29, 1969, 19.

⁴ Porcher, “The Islands Trust,” 7.

plan for the Islands many community members, experts, and politicians engaged in debating the process, creating a lively environment for new ideas and public discussion.

Days after the announcement of the ten-acre freeze, a report from a team of UBC researchers released the results of their computer-driven study of future Islands development. Led by C.S. Holling, professor of zoology and director of the Institute of Resource Ecology at UBC, the study offered a despairing picture of the future. Holling, trained as a forest entomologist, later gained international recognition for his work on the management of natural resources.⁵ His 1973 paper “Resilience and Stability of Ecological Systems,” for example, is considered one of the foundational pieces of contemporary ecology. In it, Holling is critical of static approaches to understanding ecological systems, whereby, in a perfect state, all organisms exist in equilibrium. Instead, he argues, ecosystems are continually changing, adapting, and responding to external influences. Such an understanding of ecosystem dynamics, Holling argued, demanded adaptive management solutions.⁶ Using modeling techniques reliant on new computer methods, Holling and his colleagues were among the first scholars to develop detailed models of ecosystem fluctuations and advocate for the application of these models in policy discussions. While international acclaim was still far off, Holling’s 1969 study, the first major research project undertaken by the Institute under his direction, provided a case to begin clarifying many of these thoughts and created a stir among those concerned about the Gulf Islands.

The study itself relied on the input of a range of data concerning development trends on the Gulf Islands over the preceding sixty-nine years, and its results were alarming. As Holling told a *Times* reporter, “Based on past and present land development and anticipating that those trends will not diminish, 80 per cent of all the first-class recreational land in the Gulf Islands will be intensively developed by 1980.” After this initial race to develop, “by 1990,” he continued, “the whole damn thing blows up. There will be no land left for recreation. I mean no land. It will all be gone to private owners.”⁷ Displaying an optimistic faith in computers, Holling told reporters “there is no doubt”

⁵ Peter Larkin, “Crawford Stanley Holling,” *The Canadian Encyclopedia*, 2008. <http://thecanadianencyclopedia.com/en/article/crawford-stanley-holling/> (accessed November 20, 2015).

⁶ C.S. Holling, “Resilience and stability of ecological systems,” *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 4 (1973), 1-23.

⁷ “Computer Tells Us Our Fate: Gulf Paradise Doomed,” *Times*, November 1, 1969, 1.

about the accuracy of his findings. More than simply providing the “cold, hard, frightening facts,” he said, the computer simulation offered a testing ground for new ideas by also telling the team “what would happen to some of the theoretical solutions to the overall problem.”⁸ Citing foreign investment interest as a major concern, Holling was passionate that something needed to be done about the Islands. While Holling saw the ten-acre freeze as a promising step, he promoted a more radical idea for adaptive management that would see residents give up individual property title and become part owners of a company devoted to managing the Islands in the common interest.⁹

With such bold solutions being proposed, and given the widespread interest in the fate of the Islands at the time, the media reported study’s findings as a damning condemnation of development patterns. An unimpressed Municipal Affairs Minister Dan Campbell, however, argued that the forecasts took no account of the work he had already undertaken. “Presumably a computer study can only get out of it what goes into it,” Campbell noted, “and if you examine the history of the last 65 years, presumably no one would suggest that we’re going to do the same thing during the course of the next 65 years.”¹⁰ The implementation of the ten-acre freeze, he said, totally upset any predictions the computer may have offered. Dr. Holling responded by downplaying his earlier doomsday prediction of the Islands’ future, arguing that the media had sensationalized the results of his study and drawn attention away from its main aims.¹¹ Holling argued that it was an “arbitrary” choice to study the Islands, one he made because the problems they faced were relatively simple compared to the complexity confronting urban areas. Thus the Islands provided a convenient opportunity to create a model to “test the workability of an integrated computer approach to ecology problems” as a basis for a “dramatic new approach to the environment.”¹² While it is difficult to assess the study’s impact on policy outcomes, it brought forward some of the earliest articulations of the inability of traditional governance structures to deal with the complexity of environmental problems. The study itself demonstrated growth in a more general

⁸ “Computer Tells Us Our Fate: Gulf Paradise Doomed,” *Times*, November 1, 1969, 1.

⁹ “Reservation System ‘Could Save Beauty,’” *Colonist*, November 2, 1969, 19.

¹⁰ “Land Development Curbs Upset Study by Computer,” *Colonist*, November 4, 1969, 28.

¹¹ “Island Study a Coincidence,” *Times*, November 1, 1969, 40; “Islands Study Hits Snag,” *Colonist*, February 21, 1970, 37.

¹² “Gulf Islands Blotted Out by Computer,” *Times*, February 21, 1970, 25.

awareness of the need for integrated solutions involving politicians, experts, and the public that in time would contribute to the innovative design of the Islands Trust.

More controversial than university involvement in the planning debate were the opinions of federal politicians. While land-use planning is largely a provincial jurisdiction, the waters that surround the Gulf Islands fall under federal jurisdiction. In late 1969, debate arose over proposed seismic tests by the Gulf Oil Company in the Gulf of Georgia.¹³ While a minority of local politicians saw no harm in testing for the sake of seeing what was on the ocean floor, many joined together to push for a ban on oil drilling in the waters between Vancouver Island and the mainland.¹⁴ This marked a significant shift in public tolerance for resource extraction in the region from only a decade prior. As one reporter for the *Province* had asked in 1957, “If there does turn out to be a substantial oil and gas field under the islands, there is no question that progress must win over the subtler, less easily measured values of sanctuary. But can you be blamed for hoping that it may not be necessary to make that judgment?”¹⁵ A decade later, however, it seems those “subtler, less easily measured values” had in fact become more important than claims of material progress. Indeed, sentiment favouring preserving the area was reflective of a shifting idea of what constituted progress. In response to public outcry over seismic testing in 1969, Liberal Federal Fisheries Minister Jack Davis, who represented North Vancouver and much of the coast up to Powell River, offered strong assurance that the federal government would not permit oil activity in the region. “No drilling permits will be granted as long as there is any danger, not only to the sports and commercial fisheries, but also to the entire ecology of that Gulf Islands area,” he declared.¹⁶ The danger of oil exploration to the commercial and sport fishery, valued at \$300 million, was simply too great to justify. The Gulf Islands, Davis maintained, in a telling example of how federal officials were coming to see the region, “are essentially a recreational or park area. Allowing inshore drilling is like having an oil well in Banff National Park. It makes no sense.”¹⁷ Early the next year Davis took this idea further with

¹³ Robert G. McCandless, “Postponed Decisions: Petroleum Exploration on Canada’s Western Continental Shelf,” *BC Studies* 178 (Summer 2013): 71-96.

¹⁴ “We’re Saying to Hell With the Future,” *Times*, November 12, 1969, 41.

¹⁵ “Progress Threatens a B.C Sanctuary,” *Province*, August 24, 1957, 6.

¹⁶ “Oil Drilling Ruled Out for Straits,” *Times*, November 26, 1969, 1.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*

a proposal to declare the waters of the Gulf a national marine park, thereby outlawing any exploration or drilling.¹⁸ While this grand ambition never came to fruition, Davis pursued the idea with excitement, establishing a task force in 1971 to study the feasibility of a marine park, which recommended the creation of parks in such areas as Gabriola Reef, Plumper Sound, and Race Rocks.¹⁹

While some municipal and regional politicians balked at the potential commercial and development limitations that the creation of a park would entail, the reaction was mild compared to the response to a proposal put forward by Davis' colleague David Anderson, Liberal MP for Esquimalt-Saanich, for some form of land trust based on limited property tenure. As reported in the *Colonist*, Anderson's scheme would "declare the Gulf Islands a national park" and have "all private property... expropriated," but allow residents to remain on their land until, following the owner's death, the property would revert to the federal government.²⁰ It would not be a park in the traditional sense, Anderson explained to a concerned constituent, as there would be "no need to remove houses and cottages and try to turn the islands back to what they were before settlement began." It was not the natural setting that required preservation, he explained, but rather the "character of the islands."²¹

Residents and politicians alike, however, rejected the idea outright. Response from regional politicians to the perceived federal government intrusion was cold at best. Saanich Mayor Hugh Curtis, who also served as the chairman of the Capital Regional District (CRD) Board said he was certainly "not prepared to endorse Mr. Anderson's position... Surely he must know of the region's position on the Gulf Islands and the fact that planning is a function of regional districts, and is underway." While some residents were interested to know more about the scheme, most were critical of the attack on their rights as property owners and the imposition of controls by government, be it federal or provincial.²² The concern over property rights even prompted federal NDP leader Tommy

¹⁸ "Officials Question Marine Park Plan," *Colonist*, May 5, 1970, 25.

¹⁹ Stewart, "Five Easy Pieces," 337.

²⁰ "Gulf Islands Should Become National Park," *Colonist*, October 27, 1970, 1.

²¹ BCA, David Anderson Fonds, MS 2042 Box 5, Undated letter from David Anderson to anonymous (name taped over in file) constituent.

²² Jim Money of Saturna, for example stated: "We have been plagued by Mr. Dan Campbell's 10-acre freeze, the fiasco of the regional planning boards, the building inspector, and all the other little department

Douglas to call the idea an “impossible venture.” Would Anderson deny Islanders “the right to pass their property on to their children,” he asked.²³

In a bid to ease the controversy, Anderson’s caucus colleague Jack Davis sought to reassure voters that Mr. Anderson could not turn the Islands into a national park alone. As Davis explained to reporters, the creation of a national park “would depend on the province acquiring the land and handing it over to Ottawa,” a series of events he saw as unlikely.²⁴ The provincial government saw the efforts of the federal government as an imposition and one more example of their unwillingness to work collaboratively with Bennett’s party.²⁵ In response to Davis and Anderson’s calls for large parks, the province called for the creation of an International Quality Marine Management Region in partnership with American officials in Washington State, a move that at least one high-ranking provincial bureaucrat saw as an attempt “to upstage the federal proposal.”²⁶ This effort would eventually lead to a series of public consultations on the proposal in the following years, but coupled with the advances and issues of regional planning in the Gulf Islands during this period these broader ambitions would lead nowhere. The

tyrants obstructing our Island’s progress.”; “Another One Out to Ruin Our Island,” *Colonist*, November 3, 1970, 2; “Gulf Islands Should Become National Park,” *Colonist*, October 27, 1970, 1.

²³ “Gulf Islands Idea Scorned,” *Colonist*, October 29, 1970, 17; While the scheme evidently seemed preposterous to Anderson’s critics, it was not the first time it had been proposed. Earlier in the year, provincial NDP MLA Robert Williams proposed a limited land tenure of 25 years in order to “prevent American land speculators from making Canadians ‘strangers in our own land.’” This proposal reflected a common myth put forward during this time about the increasing threat of foreign ownership on the Islands. It was a myth that A.M Brown, a retired provincial tax assessor, sought to dismiss. By his estimate no more than 5 percent of property on the Gulf Islands was held by Americans. Looking through assessment rolls, it was clear that, although there was variation across the region, largely resulting from proximity to the San Juan Islands, there were very few lots owned by Americans. The rolls show that on Saturna Island, with the closest proximity to the American San Juan Islands, of the 410 land parcels, 31 belong to Americans. On North and South Pender, of the 1865 parcels, only 42 belong to American addresses. There were however, a disproportionate number of American owned small islands. As the article says, the “bulk” of small islands “are owned by Americans and have been he’d by them for quite a few years”; “Restrict Land Tenure, MLA Urges,” *Colonist*, February 26, 1970, 1; “Gulf Islands U.S.-owned?” *Times*, June 21, 1971, 17.

²⁴ BCA, David Anderson Fonds, MS 2042 Box 6, Letter dated 24 November 1970 from Jack Davis to Mr. T. W. Cross, Port Credit, Ontario.

²⁵ “The province was particularly sensitive about federal initiatives to stop oil drilling and reduce marine pollution on the inland sea. From Victoria’s perspective, Ottawa’s proposals overlooked the province’s progress in developing its own system of marine parks and improving their Pollution Control Board.” Howard Macdonald Stewart, “Five Easy Pieces On The Strait Of Georgia – Reflections On The Historical Geography Of The North Salish Sea,” (PhD Dissertation, University of British Columbia, 2014), 337-338;

²⁶ BCA BC Marine Resources Branch GR-1118 Box 8/8, Letter of June 21, 1971 re: Strait of Georgia National Marine Park Proposal, from Lloyd Brooks, Acting Deputy Minister to the Hon. K Kiernan, Min of Recreation and Conservation, PB, Victoria; quoted in Stewart, “Five Easy Pieces, 338.

proposals do, however, demonstrate the growth of outside interests in the future of the region as a whole; no longer was the issue merely a question of regional development and threats to a regional identity. Increasingly, the development of the Gulf Islands became debated within regional, provincial, national, and international contexts. As David Anderson's comment about the need to "preserve the character of the islands" complete with houses and farms demonstrates, this debate was informed by a pervasive sense of the Islands as a valued pastoral landscape. Interest from federal politicians, academics, and other outside parties influenced the scope and language of the debate, further complicating an already challenging dilemma, but they held to the pastoral conception of the Gulf Islands much as local decision makers.

While outside parties were weighing in with schemes for the future of the Gulf Islands, the regional boards, holding jurisdiction over land-use regulation, continued to develop regional and island-specific plans and bylaws. A few months after the implementation of the ten-acre freeze, an impatient Dan Campbell complained about the slow rate at which regional districts were acting. If land-use plans were not drawn up within a few months, he threatened to evoke his ministerial power to act as mayor-in-council for unorganized territories of the province in order to impose such plans.²⁷ This was a step neither Campbell nor the Social Credit party, as traditional defenders of individual freedoms, wished to take. Adopting a somewhat conciliatory tone Campbell explained, "No one perhaps likes the implication involved in regulation, but we cannot on the one hand talk about open spaces and the control of pollution of environment without having some regard as to the use of our existing open space."²⁸ In part, the pressure Campbell laid on regional districts was a response to pressure from residents, developers, and critics concerned about the unspecified duration of the ten-acre freeze. Shortly after the imposition of the freeze, a group of Saltspring Island developers, residents, and construction workers had formed an association to oppose the move. The group claimed that by the end of the first month of the freeze 150 construction workers would be out of work.²⁹ Another opponent of the freeze expressed concern with what he viewed as the government's unilateral action, stating that "this would appear to be the first such edict in

²⁷ "Campbell Hardens Line on Gulf Island Land Use," *Times*, January 6, 1970, 13.

²⁸ *Ibid.*

²⁹ "No Subdivision Limit on Current Projects," *Colonist*, November 20, 1969, 22.

the province issued without local representation.”³⁰ Responding to the volley of criticism and seeking to reduce the negative impact of the freeze, Minister Campbell declared that all subdivisions for which approval had already been granted would be permitted to proceed. Furthermore, developers could submit final plans for large multi-phase subdivisions until March 31, 1970. The unintended consequence of this capitulation was to accelerate subdivision plans in a significant way. Seeing the freeze as the end of an easy run, developers pushed through plans for a total of 2,000 new lots between October 28, 1969 and March 31, 1970, four times the annual number in the previous few years.³¹

Dealing with this unprecedented increase in development, the Capital Regional Planning Department, which had jurisdiction over Saltspring and the Outer Islands and sought to regulate development during this period, faced a complicated set of issues and competing demands. Following the freeze, the department financed a feasibility study for planning in the Gulf Islands. The May 1970 report recommended an emergency-planning program to deal with immediate pressures, followed by the development of a long-term planning program. To accomplish the first measure the Planning Department set up a series of meetings over the following year to develop interim bylaws for the Outer Gulf Islands. Despite hard work by the Planning Department and relatively widespread consensus among residents, an ominous tone was set when the draft bylaws found their way to Municipal Affairs Minister Dan Campbell late in the summer of 1971. Saturna Island resident Jim Campbell, opposing the regulatory imposition he associated with the regional district planning process, headed a group of Saturna residents who brought the bylaws to Minister Campbell.³² According to Jim Campbell, the draft bylaws were inadequate because they “simply zone various lots for their present use,” while not designating areas for immediate development.³³ The Minister agreed with this criticism, announcing that he would approve no bylaws that did not designate at least some land for development. He went on to criticize the draft for being “excessively technical and arbitrary.”³⁴ The effort to go above the Planning Department by Jim Campbell drew a frosty response from CRD Board chairman Hugh Curtis, who remained dedicated to

³⁰ C.R. Horel, “It Is Expropriation Says Horel,” *Gulf Islands Driftwood*, 6 November 1969, 8.

³¹ “Island Checks Backfire,” *Colonist*, June 21, 1970, 13.

³² There is no relation between Dan and Jim Campbell.

³³ “Campbell Won’t Pass Capital Region Bylaw,” *Colonist*, August 20, 1971, 36.

³⁴ “Islands Zoning Opposed,” *Times*, January 27, 1972, 19.

regulations that would serve the “best interest of the Islands as a whole rather than... the interest of any individual landowner who is simply reeling against the imposition of control.”³⁵ The draft bylaws were, Curtis tried to make clear, not meant to control future development but to simply lay foundational zoning to reflect what already existed on the Islands. Despite objections from Saturna residents throughout the fall, and Minister Campbell’s own objections, the Planning Department voted to accept the seventh draft of the bylaws and send them for Ministerial approval in September 1971.³⁶

With the immediate need of developing interim bylaws for the Islands nearing its end, the CRD Board embarked on the next phase of its program, developing a long-term plan. The task of a long-term program involved “determining the supply of land and sea in relation to its suitability for various users, striking a balance between competing uses and needs, and ensuring the provision of a satisfactory level of services,” a process that would take another year of study to complete.³⁷ In early November 1971, the Planning Department announced an innovative effort to gain public feedback on the future direction for the Island. The ensuing public consultation process sought to address criticisms that the Regional Board did not represent the needs and desires of Islanders. The major complaint that Islands residents had was their minimal representation on the CRD Board, holding only 2 of 26 seats. In response to this perceived lack of representation, then, the Planning Department’s novel idea was to administer a survey, which presented a range of options for development. CRD Board chair Hugh Curtis explained, “this route is the first for British Columbia and possibly for Canada.”³⁸ The scheme may have been novel, but many Islanders found it unimpressive. During the Islands’ regional district directorship election in December, the option-choice survey form was a contentious point. Beth Wood, for example, ran against Hugh Curtis for the Saltspring directorship arguing that the effort was a “gimmick” and she wanted to see professionals and experts in charge of developing the plans, not residents.³⁹ Despite

³⁵ “Campbell Won’t Pass Capital Region Bylaw,” *Colonist*, August 20, 1971, 36.

³⁶ “Islands Study Zoning,” *Colonist*, September 5, 1971, 13; “Zoning Bylaw ‘acceptable,’” *Colonist*, October 28, 1971, 39; “Outer Island Zoning Goes to Hearing,” *Times*, October 28, 1971, 11.

³⁷ “Gulf Islands’ Future in Region’s Hands; Who Fixes ‘no-more’ line?” *Colonist*, June 26, 1970, 1-2; “Gulf to Get 4-Zone Plan,” *Times*, May 21, 1970, 2.

³⁸ “Gulf Islanders to Mould Own Future,” *Colonist*, November 9, 1971, 21; “Planning Options for Gulf Islands,” *Times*, November 9, 1971, 42.

³⁹ “Planning Big Issue in Gulf Islands Vote,” *Times*, December 4, 1971, 28.

opposition to the Planning Department's consultation plan, planners clearly saw value in public input, going ahead with the project in January 1972.

The Planning Department's stated aim with the survey was "to challenge and to stimulate debate and response in order that the C.R.D may shape a Regional Plan according to the desires of the people."⁴⁰ While the concept was sound, the execution suffered from lack of experience with such methods. In addition to considerable background information, the pamphlet presented three options for the region. The first proposed an ambitious network of roads and bridges to connect the Saanich Peninsula to the lower mainland via the Gulf Islands. The second involved a continuation of present trends in settlement including lifting the ten-acre freeze and greatly expanding ferry service. The final option called for a major parks creation program through the purchase of 35 square miles of land, at a cost of roughly \$15 million. As well, the survey offered a fourth, do-it-yourself option for respondents to create their own solution.⁴¹ All three options were clearly the extremes of possible scenarios and a vote in favour or against each option offered little space for meaningful public input on realistic choices. If anything, the survey served only to polarize the debate about the future of the Islands even further by giving formality to such ideas. Nonetheless, it was a genuine, if mishandled effort to gain understanding and engage with public opinion.

The year of effort that went into the development of the public consultation process, however, met vigorous opposition, primarily from Municipal Affairs Minister Dan Campbell. Shortly after the announcement of the consultation plan Campbell publicly lambasted the consultation process, calling it an example of "airy-fairy dreamer" planning. Citing what he perceived as the absurdity of the option for a network of bridges, Minister Campbell argued that the planners were destroying the credibility of the planning process.⁴² Chairman of the CRD Board Hugh Curtis responded defensively to the indictment, pointing out that the Minister deliberately overlooked "the other options which are set out for the residents" and chose to "ignore the fact that the possibility of a bridge system was raised by his own government, not by planners or

⁴⁰ Capital Regional District, *Gulf Islands Options* (Victoria, Capital Regional District Planning Department, 1971)

⁴¹ "Islanders choose future options," *Times*, January 14, 1972, 2.

⁴² "Campbell's Out of Touch: Curtis," *Times*, January 28, 1972, 10.

regional district people.”⁴³ Curtis’ comment referred to a revelation in September by reporters at the *Victoria Daily Times* that then Highways Minister P.A. Gaglardi commissioned a secret \$80,000 study in 1967 to examine the feasibility of a bridge network. Government opposition members hammered on Campbell for “misrepresenting” the planning process for political gain and his hypocrisy in deriding the bridging plan that his government developed.⁴⁴

Antagonism toward the public consultation process developed by the Planning Department, however, did not only come from the Minister. Residents on Saltspring Island coordinated by Ted Delmonico seized the opportunity to express their displeasure with the Capital Regional Board in general. The dissidents felt that the survey presented three options that no one really wanted, which demonstrated how disconnected the Regional District was from the desires of Islanders. Delmonico’s group sought to separate the Gulf Islands from the CRD and form a new regional district to take care of their own affairs. In the end, public opposition, coupled with the poor design of the survey itself, amounted to a disappointing result for the Planning Department. By April, only 8 per-cent of those to whom the survey was mail had responded. Of those, 368 were non-residents, 195 were residents, and of the three options, the only clear take away was that bridges had no support.⁴⁵ Despite the innovative concept and ambitious undertaking, the regional district’s efforts at community engagement and the development of bylaws had largely failed. But by the time the results of the survey were presented a greater controversy loomed, and with a provincial election scheduled for the fall, early legislative action seemed unlikely.

In March 1972, the forestry company MacMillan Bloedel announced plans to enter the real estate market in a big way. Throughout the Gulf Islands, the company held significant tracts of land in Certified Tree Farms, having begun buying up properties in the 1950s and organizing them into tree farms. Such status encouraged responsible management of privately owned land and in return the government reduced taxes on the

⁴³ “Campbell’s Out of Touch: Curtis,” *Times*, January 28, 1972, 10.

⁴⁴ “Islands Plan ‘misrepresented,’” *Colonist*, February 3, 1972, 47.

⁴⁵ “Gulf Islanders’ Replies Trickle,” *Colonist*, March 16, 1972, 17; “Islanders Oppose Links,” *Times*, April 20, 1972, 47; “Park Plan Favoured,” *Colonist*, April 20, 1972, 16; Capital Regional District Planning Department, *Summary of Gulf Islands Questionnaires Received to April 15, 1972* (Victoria, Capital Regional District Planning Department, April 1972)

land.⁴⁶ The issue that arose in 1972 was that no rules existed to stop the forest companies from withdrawing their land from tree-farm status for the purpose of developing it into residential lots. With property values soaring this was exactly what MacMillan Bloedel proposed to do on Galiano Island where the company owned approximately 79 per cent of the land base. The proposed plan would create up to 2,700 residential lots on 1,100 of the total 8,500 acres that the company owned.⁴⁷ Given the substantial scale of the proposed project and the significant change it would bring to one of the least densely populated of the Gulf Islands, widespread public opposition was unsurprising.

Opposition to the MacMillan Bloedel proposal was unanimous across the political spectrum but solutions to the issue varied.⁴⁸ For some, the biggest issue was in the long-term tax breaks that the company enjoyed on the property, which, they believed, should be reimbursed with interest before any sale could go forward.⁴⁹ Others believed that the government should expropriate the properties as public recreational land and have it remain as such in perpetuity.⁵⁰ Still others simply believed that the land should remain under tree farm status, thus minimizing the government's need to expropriate or to purchase the land, while ideally allowing it to remain open to the public for recreation. With the impending provincial election, the rhetoric from politicians in all parties opposed development of these forested lands. MacMillan Bloedel concluded that it was unlikely that any government would allow development on Galiano to proceed and dropped the proposal.⁵¹

The most significant change brought on by this controversy, however, was not in provincial forestry policy but rather in the policy of the Regional Board. For Board members, the issue on Galiano highlighted the differences among Islands. In the past, the Regional Board had favoured the preparation of a detailed over-all regional plan for the Gulf Islands, one that captured the essence of the Gulf Islands as a united entity. In creating this plan, residents would be consulted but only in an advisory capacity. The new proposal, pushed forward by Jim Campbell, now CRD director for the Outer Islands,

⁴⁶ "Island Proposal 'Madness,'" *Times*, March 27, 1972, 21.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*

⁴⁸ "'Public first' for Gulf Island lands," *Times*, March 17, 1972, 6.

⁴⁹ "Island Proposal 'Madness,'" *Times*, March 27, 1972, 21.

⁵⁰ "B.C. 'should buy up' Island forest lands," *Times*, March 23, 1972, 7.

⁵¹ "'Greed vs. beauty,'" *Times*, May 29, 1972, 21; "No One Fooled," *Times*, June 15, 1972, 4.

called for the creation of individual community plans to complement the regional plan, but tailored to the individual needs of the Islands. Such community plans, Islanders hoped, would eliminate much of the controversy that had dogged the board and slowed the planning process. Finally, the Planning Department would be able to put plans in place quickly to stop any unwanted development such as that proposed by MacMillan Bloedel.⁵²

In the months following the controversy over the MacMillan Bloedel proposal, the Social Credit government called an election for September 1972. After two decades of electoral success under the leadership of W.A.C Bennett, the New Democrats led by Dave Barrett defeated the Social Credit government. The NDP's campaign motto "Enough is Enough," captured the attention of voters who, since the previous election, were disillusioned with the Social Credit government's handling of three years of "inflation, labour strife, a slowing economy, automation in the extractive industries, unwise cabinet appointments," and Bennett's growing detachment from the general population.⁵³ During the campaign, questions surrounding land-use planning were hotly debated.⁵⁴ The New Democrats ran on a series of promises to stop excessive development, push back against big business interests, and maintain land for the good of the people. In the Gulf Islands, Dave Barrett was able to capitalize on the significant animosity of residents towards a number of hot-button development proposals including the MacMillan Bloedel proposal on Galiano and the Weldwood Estates project, a proposed 550-lot recreational development on Gabriola. Citing the Socred's lack of progress in forming strong planning regulations for the region, Barrett stoked fears that, if re-elected, a Bennett government would reveal itself as having simply bided its time until after the election before conceding to the desires of developers and approving these large-scale plans. Pushed to respond, the sitting Social Credit cabinet made an effort to reassure voters by officially rejecting Weldwood's Gabriola proposal, but the mood for change

⁵² Hubert Beyer, "Firm's Galiano Plan Prompts Policy Shift," *Colonist*, April 20, 1972, 25.

⁵³ Richard Rajala summarizing George Woodcock, *British Columbia: A History of the Province* (Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1990), 246-47, 266; Richard Rajala, "Forests And Fish: The 1972 Coast Logging Guidelines And British Columbia's First NDP Government." *BC Studies* 159 no.81 (2008): 82.

⁵⁴ Debates around land-use issues were largely focused on the loss of farmland. During the campaign all three parties promised some solution to the issue. Geoff Meggs and Rod Mickleburgh, *The Art of the Impossible: Dave Barrett and the NDP in Power, 1972-1975* (Madeira, B.C: Harbour Pub, 2012), 74.

was too great.⁵⁵ In the Naniamo electoral district, which included Gabriola and a number of nearby islands, voters resoundingly rejected Bennett's Social Credit party, electing NDP David Stupich with over 52 per cent support. The Saanich and the Islands district, on the other hand, was more conflicted. Hugh Curtis, the popular Saanich Mayor, CRD Board chairman, and vocal advocate for the Islands won the seat running as a Progressive Conservative, but he did so with only 35 per cent of the popular vote. The Social Credit, NDP, and Liberal candidates all performed reasonably well, acquiring 25, 23, and 15 per cent of the vote respectively.⁵⁶ Due to the inclusion of Saanich in the electoral district, the vote can not be seen as a referendum on Gulf Islands issues, but the vote splitting does highlight the varied opinions held across the region.

Despite winning only 39.6 per cent of the popular vote province-wide, the NDP won a substantial majority by capitalizing on the fragmentation of the right-wing vote.⁵⁷ With their rise to power they brought an enthusiasm for change and an appetite for innovative land management programs. Under the leadership of Dave Barrett, an energetic politician with a desire for big change, the new government was, as Barrett recalled, "free and unfettered to roam in new directions."⁵⁸ Sensing an historic and unlikely to be repeated opportunity, Barrett and his colleagues moved quickly to implement the changes they felt the province needed.⁵⁹ Whereas the WAC Bennett government passed about forty bills during a typical legislative session, the new NDP government enacted ten times as many in its first year.⁶⁰ The flurry of legislation would not include a quick solution to the Gulf Islands issue, but the willingness of the new

⁵⁵ "Gulf Islands Autonomy Urged," *Colonist*, August 12, 1972, 16; "NDP would 'freeze' land," *Colonist*, August 17, 1972, 21; "Gabriola headache cure offered," *Colonist*, August 18, 1972, 26; "Now Dan has a new plan," *Province*, August 21, 1972, 4.

⁵⁶ Elections British Columbia, *An Electoral History of British Columbia, 1871-1986* (Victoria, BC: Legislative Library, 1988), 315-316.

⁵⁷ Elections British Columbia, *An Electoral History of British Columbia*, 311.

⁵⁸ Dave Barrett and William Miller, *Barrett: A Passionate Political Life* (Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1995), 61.

⁵⁹ For further reading on the 1972-1975 NDP government see: Geoff Meggs and Rod Mickleburgh, *The Art of the Impossible*; Barrett and Miller, *Barrett: A Passionate Political Life*; Paul Hurmuses, *Power Without Glory: The Rise and Fall of the NDP Government in British Columbia* (Vancouver: Balsam Press, 1976); Lorne Kavic and Garry Nixon, *The 1200 Days: A Shattered Dream: Dave Barrett and the NDP in BC 1972-75* (Coquitlam, B.C: Kaen, 1978).

⁶⁰ Jean Barman, *The West Beyond the West: A History of British Columbia* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 323.

government to experiment with novel ways of dealing with complex land and environmental issues would ultimately produce the Islands Trust.

‘The New Democracy’ - the NDP and the Development of the Islands Trust, 1972-1974

With the arrival of the new NDP government, the Capital Regional District Board, kept busy despite the election, reengaged in their effort to implement plans for the region. In October 1972, the Planning Department brought forward two new planning proposals for Gulf Islanders to consider: a set of regional bylaws for all of the Islands under CRD jurisdiction and the first individualized community plan in the region, for Saltspring Island. These documents are interesting as some of the earliest examples of attempts to inscribe a pastoral depiction of the Gulf Islands into planning mechanisms. The goal of planning, the regional bylaws explained, would be to retain the Islands “as quiet retreats” with minimal disturbance to the natural surroundings and the limitation of “commercial or industrial activities,” other than home-based occupations such as agriculture and craft work that enhanced the desired regional character.⁶¹ These two proposals presented broad guidelines for the development of the Islands as a first step. Once residents and cabinet approved the regional bylaws and community plans, the next step would be to develop a further layer of more specific regulating bylaws in accordance with these overarching guidelines. However, despite widespread acceptance of the Planning Department’s proposals by Islands residents, as determined by feedback in public consultation processes, the new NDP government declined to go forward.⁶²

The refusal by the new Minister of Municipal Affairs Jim Lorimer was in keeping with the party’s electoral promise of imposing a full freeze on development in the Islands pending a new study. Lorimer’s announcement of this new study in mid-February 1973 met with criticism from opposition parties in the legislature and the CRD Board.⁶³ Recently elected MLA Hugh Curtis called out the Minister for “stalling.” The regional and community plans, Curtis argued, “had been given near unanimous approval” by

⁶¹ “Islands Seen as Quiet Retreats,” *Times*, October 23, 1972, 17.

⁶² “New Plan to Guide Gulf Islands,” *Times*, October 30, 1972, 6.

⁶³ “Gulf Islands Study Set,” *Sun*, February 23, 1973, 12.

Islands residents.⁶⁴ Members of the CRD Board, such as Outer Islands representative Jim Campbell, were generally concerned about the lack of representative governance for the Islands. Campbell claimed that the refusal to proceed with plans produced under the Planning Department's approach was a means of "second guessing" the work of a duly elected local government.⁶⁵ Minister Lorimer rejected these criticisms on the grounds that while the CRD Board may well have brought forward strong proposals, there were a number of Islands beyond that district's jurisdiction that still needed attention. Moreover, with a wider network of provincial and national interests concerned with the future of the Gulf Islands, the region had become a public resource that needed to be managed for the good of all, not just those who lived on the islands. Implementing this understanding, Lorimer pushed ahead with a study, assigning the Legislature's Select Standing Committee on Municipal Matters to the job, but also reassured residents that those plans developed by the regional district would in the end be a valuable contribution.⁶⁶

Two months later, at the end of April 1973, the newly-appointed Committee began a whirlwind three-day tour of the Gulf Islands in what would serve as their main avenue of research into the issues facing the region. The committee invited interested parties to present their concerns, opinions, and potential solutions over the course of a series of meetings held on the various Islands. At these meetings residents referred to "transients, fire danger, youngsters away at school, difficulties with ferries," and "above all their fears for the future if too much development" occurred.⁶⁷ Speaking to the issue of ferries, Ione Guthrie of Saltspring aptly characterized the dilemma facing residents saying: "We are torn by our desire for a certain amount of isolation, privacy, and controlled population and our own greedy desire to get off the island to see the big city." Others, like North Pender resident Nick Laberto, argued in favour of development. "Did God provide these islands for goats?" he asked; "I think they are for people." Similarly, at the same meeting farmer Bill Mundy was concerned that if he found himself unable to make ends meet regulations would not allow him to sell a small piece of property to pull

⁶⁴ "'Last Chance' Study for All Gulf Islands," *Times*, February 28, 1973, 13.

⁶⁵ Jim Campbell, chair of CRD said there was a good chance the committee would duplicate work done by residents on the islands where community development plans are already being formulated; "Second-guessing' feared," *Sun*, February 27, 1973, 14.

⁶⁶ "'Last Chance' Study for All Gulf Islands," *Times*, February 28, 1973, 13.

⁶⁷ Jes Odam, "Problems of Paradise Aired," *Sun*, May 3, 1973, 11.

him through.⁶⁸ A number of people also brought forward the idea of a trust organization, similar to that of the National Trust in Britain.⁶⁹

Throughout these proceedings, skeptics remained unconvinced by the government's assurances that the plans the regional district had proposed would in fact be used. The independent actions of other cabinet ministers amplified distrust among residents, stoking concern that the NDP would impose a 'solution' upon the Islands. During the Committee's study, Highways Minister Robert Strachan, for one, began proposing a major ferry terminal on Gabriola Island as the stopping point for the ferry from Horseshoe Bay, which would then be connected to Vancouver Island by a four-lane highway and a bridge across the water. Resource Minister Robert Williams also weighed in, saying he personally supported a proposal to consider subdivision on MacMillan Bloedel Certified Tree Farm properties if they paid all back taxes. By the end of the Committee's tour, Lorimer was still talking about making "use of islanders' plans" but added a strong qualification that "the islands are part of B.C and there are more people involved than the residents themselves and other interests as well as those of the islanders to be protected."⁷⁰ Lorimer clearly felt that the issue of the Gulf Islands was more than a local planning concern and previous efforts to control development had not taken into account the broad range of interests necessary for an adequate solution. Over the following months, while the committee deliberated, Lorimer continued to speculate publicly about various findings and potential solutions, which served only to feed growing confusion and frustration that the fate of the Islands lay in the hands of provincial government officials. Additional fuel for the fire came from Select Standing Committee members, indicating that the Islands were not "exclusively private," and the

⁶⁸ "Problems of paradise aired," *Sun*, May 3, 1973, 11; Jes Odam, "Gulf Islander proposes provincial recreation trust," *Sun*, May 4, 1973, 6; Jes Odam, "Some Gulf Islands need protection soon," *Sun*, May 5, 1973, 12; "Lorimer Rebuffs Islands Pressure," *Times*, May 5, 1973, 41.

⁶⁹ Founded in 1895, the National Trust in Britain was a non-profit organization dedicated to the preservation of historical spaces and places including heritage houses, historic gardens, monuments, and castles through acquisition and active management. Jes Odam, "Problems of Paradise Aired," *Sun*, May 3, 1973, 11; "They suggested establishing an island trust commission for implementing provincial policy on islands, a proposal advanced by an Opportunities for Youth group at a public meeting on Bowen Island Monday;" Sandi Shreve, "Gulf Islands to Stay Rural," *Sun*, July 27, 1973, 13

⁷⁰ Jes Odam, "Gulf Islanders begin to fear cruel hoax," *Sun*, May 31, 1973, 6.

needs of the wider public would be given strong consideration in recommendations for the proper management of the region.⁷¹

At the end of September 1973, the Committee reported to the legislature with a recommendation for the creation of an Islands Trust designed to prevent land hoarding, over-development, and sloppy subdivisions. Much as the earlier regional plan proposed by the Planning Department, the Committee embraced an idea of the Islands as a pastoral retreat as the foundational objective of planning policy. As the report concluded, “though strictly controlled limited commercial development, light industry, and agricultural activity compatible with the life style of the islands can continue,” all future development would emphasize “recreation, moderate residential use, and the preservation of a rural atmosphere.”⁷² Despite the close similarity between the goals of the Committee’s report and that of the CRD Board, it is clear from the report’s dismissal of regional districts as a solution that there was dissatisfaction with how those bodies had dealt with planning in the Gulf Islands.⁷³ This dissatisfaction was directed less at the CRD, which as noted above had been the most active Gulf Islands planning agency, than at the inaction of the other regional boards. While the Committee considered the possibility of creating a single Islands regional district to provide uniform planning control across the region, the disadvantages outweighed the benefits.⁷⁴ As the Committee report explained, the regional

⁷¹ Sandi Shreve, “Gulf Islands Solutions Tricky,” *Sun*, July 30, 1973, 26: “Committee chairman Alf Nunweiler (NDP - Ft George) in a later interview expressed another consensus of members — that the islands “are not exclusively private. We should make them available to the public at every opportunity;” “A Central Control for Islands Sought,” *Province*, September 6, 1973, 6: “Liberal MLA David Brousson wants all planning, loaning and transportation matters affecting the Gulf Islands handed over to the jurisdiction of the municipal affairs department. Made the suggestion in a personal submission to the legislative committee on municipal matters.”

⁷² Province of British Columbia, *Hansard*, 25 September 1973, 216.

⁷³ Laura Kathryn Porcher, “The Islands Trust: An Institutional Experiment in the Management of Scarce Natural and Social Resources,” (Ph.D. dissertation, University of British Columbia, 1980), 7-8.

⁷⁴ “Regions May Lose Islands,” *Times*, July 27, 1973, 6; The disadvantages, as summarized by Glover were:

- The available powers would still be limited to those outlined in the Municipal Act unless amendments were made to increase the powers of all regional districts (which from the provincial viewpoint is likely to be politically undesirable).
- The regional tax base would be inadequate in providing any functions over and above rudimentary services. If a subsidy was provided to the Gulf Islands Regional District the problem of equity would be raised by the other regional districts.
- The technical capability would be limited to regional staff and the Technical Planning Committee.
- Co-ordination with provincial departments would likely not improve over the existing situation.
- Provincial interests would not be directly represented.

districts did not have the powers necessary to take on the responsibilities “expected of them relative to the future of the Coastal Islands of British Columbia,” although they could still serve “administrative purposes including hospitals, schools, local improvements, special projects, health, building inspection, etc.”⁷⁵ The proposed Trust was needed to “coordinate government’s responsibility in the areas of land use, future growth patterns, control of development, industrial, recreational, commercial activity as well as parks and open space.” Like similar trust organizations around the world, the new body was imagined as a means of preserving a valuable resource for future generations, but unlike these other organizations it would not actually hold land in trust. The confusion created in labelling the organizing a trust influenced largely negative reactions to the idea by raising concerns about the loss of autonomous control of land-use functions.

Given the widespread acceptance of the idea of the Gulf Islands as possessing a special rural environment, opponents of the Islands Trust idea did not criticize this ambiguous pastoral depiction. Rather, critics railed against the structure of the organization and the perceived threat it posed to local governance. Jim Campbell, now Chair of the CRD Board, was quick to condemn the legislative report for adopting a “highly paternalistic” and “missionary approach to the savages of the Gulf Islands.” Islanders who had “given up many of the amenities of urban life to live in a quiet place” were now being “told that we can’t be trusted with its management and we have to be governed by a commission rather than ourselves.”⁷⁶ Rejecting the notion of the Islands as a common resource, belonging to all citizens of the province, Campbell and like-minded critics asserted the infallibility of individual property ownership. Rather than a common resource in which all members of the society had a stake, the Islands were an amalgam of

-
- Some services such as hospitals and ambulance services could not be efficiently provided by a Gulf Islands Regional District due to existing transportation routes.
 - It appears that considerably more time would be required to establish a new regional district than to establish a special purpose Trust Commission. Time is an important factor due to the temporary nature of the ten-acre freeze and the increasing demand for lots on the islands.

Julia M. Glover, “The Island Trust Concept; A Proposed Institutional Arrangement to Implement a Policy of Controlled Development for the Gulf Islands of British Columbia,” (MSc Thesis, University of British Columbia, 1970), 34-35.

⁷⁵ Province of British Columbia, *Hansard*, 25 September 1973, 256.

⁷⁶ “Campbell Tees Off on Island Report,” *Times*, September 25, 1973, 2.

individual properties whose owners, as per their constitutional right to self-government, should control without interference.⁷⁷

For some critics the defence of local control and self-government was tied to their historical association with the land. In a letter to the *Times* Gulf Islands resident G.S Humphreys argued that the Committee's recommendations were an "insult to the pioneers of these Islands, and to the more recently arrived." The provincial government, Humphreys continued, should recognize that the 'special rural character' of the Islands was not innate; they were "only charming because the people on them have made them that way and when it comes to controlling our Islands' destinies, we are 100 per cent for doing it ourselves."⁷⁸ In an increasingly contentious atmosphere critics expressed fears of "colonialism," or becoming "wards of the state," as part of a rhetorical strategy to oppose the idea of the Islands Trust.⁷⁹ While the critics were certainly vocal, not everyone opposed the idea. In a letter to the *Sun*, one commentator gave cautious support to the Islands Trust idea, stating that they were "glad to hear the jewels are not left unguarded" and an effort was being made to strike a balance between "over-all public interest and the narrower interest of island residents."⁸⁰ Whether the Islands Trust idea was a progressive step in stewardship or a radical threat to property rights, it was not until April 1974 when the Islands Trust Act was tabled in the legislature that critics were able to see how the organization would work, and what they found did little to quell their concerns.

'Playboy Paradise Plucked by People' - the Establishment of the Islands Trust, 1974

Standing in the Legislature on April 24, 1974, Minister of Municipal Affairs James Lorimer presented Bill 112, the Islands Trust Act. The object of the Trust, the bill stated, was "to preserve and protect the trust area and its unique amenities and environment for the benefit of the residents of the trust area and of British Columbia generally, in cooperation with municipalities, regional districts, improvement districts,

⁷⁷ "Islanders Want no Trust Here," *Driftwood*, 9 May 1974, 1.

⁷⁸ "Island Voice - letter from GS Humphreys," *Times*, November 16, 1973, 4.

⁷⁹ "Reconsider Islands, Campbell asks MLAs," *Times*, October 3, 1973, 24; "Colonialism in the Gulf Islands - Letter from TA Toynbee," *Sun*, October 15, 1973, 5; Jes Odam, "How the Gulf Islanders Were Hoaxed," *Sun* October 16, 1973, 6; "Confusion in the Gulf," *Sun*, October 17, 1973, 4.

⁸⁰ "Safeguarding Precious Jewels," *Sun*, April 26, 1974, 4.

other persons and organizations and the government of British Columbia.”⁸¹ To accomplish this rather ambitious and ill-defined task, the Trust was to consist of three general trustees appointed by Cabinet and twenty-six local trustees, two elected from each of thirteen designated islands. Sitting for a period of two years, the trustees held differing responsibilities. General trustees were appointed to represent wider provincial interests, whereas local trustees brought the diverse opinions of the individual islands to the table. Issues pertaining to the Islands were determined as either general (affecting more than one of the islands) or local (affecting only one island) affairs, a designation determined by the chairman who would be chosen by the Minister from among the general trustees. The collection of twenty-nine trustees formed the Islands Trust Council, which was to discuss matters of general concern and make recommendations to the General Trust Council (consisting of the three general trustees and two local trustees, elected by their peers).⁸²

The original powers given to the Islands Trust, however, were limited considering the scope of its mandate. The Act, as Porcher explains, “gave the Trust no powers to systematically plan or regulate development on the Islands.” That jurisdiction remained with regional districts “through community plans and zoning and subdivision bylaws.”⁸³ Rather, the Trust was meant to encourage and assist the planning process and “coordinate the activities of the different departments of government and the Crown corporations as they dealt with the islands,” yet beyond the power to veto plans and bylaws put forward, the Trust had no representation from these other departments nor any power to impose coordination.⁸⁴ The duties of the Trust, therefore, included such tasks as the recommendation to Cabinet of preservation and protection policies for the Trust area, as well as the coordination of and input into the development and implementation of these policies. Most significantly, the Act gave the Trust veto powers for all community plans, regional plans, zoning and subdivision bylaws, and land-use contracts within the Trust area, as well as power of approval over construction and alteration of buildings and other improvements. Finally, the Act required the province to give notice to the Islands Trust

⁸¹ Islands Trust Act, R.S.B.C ch. 239, s. 3.1 (1974)

⁸² Islands Trust Act, R.S.B.C (1974); Porcher, “The Islands Trust,” 30-31.

⁸³ Porcher, “The Islands Trust,” 31.

⁸⁴ Province of British Columbia, *Hansard*, James Lorimer, May 21, 1974, 3259.

before developing or disposing of any crown land in the trust area.⁸⁵ The debate that emerged immediately after the government presented the Act to the legislature did little to question the general thrust of preserving the Islands' "unique amenities and environment," and instead focused primarily on the structural issue of the make-up of the Trust Council.

Critics believed that Ministerial appointment of the three general trustees, whose veto power could overrule the desires of the twenty-six duly elected representatives, verified their original fears of provincial domination. Many MLA's, regional directors, and local residents felt the structure of the Trust Council overshadowed the desires of residents. In a series of public meetings sponsored by MLA Hugh Curtis and Islands chambers of commerce, Islanders complained that the Trust was being given too much power.⁸⁶ At one such meeting, a local resident presented a copy of an NDP caucus newsletter titled "MLA's at Work" as evidence of the 'true' intentions of the government. In the newsletter, an article entitled "Playboy Paradise Plucked by People" commended the success of the NDP at bringing to an end the "development of the Gulf Islands in the limited interest of Islanders and landowners... the rip-off development in the islands by greedy speculators and fast-buck recreation lot developers... [and] the end of the influence of rich foreign landowners who range from German barons to Hong Kong sweatshop bosses and California surgeons."⁸⁷ Given such crass allusions, it is little wonder that Islands residents felt they were coming under the control of a provincial government that failed to respect their right to control their own affairs. Hugh Curtis, despite having originally endorsed the idea of the Trust, embraced the controversy as a vehicle to drive home a message that the Islands Trust Act would undermine local democracy. Defending the Act as being in fact a boon to regional control, Municipal Affairs Minister Lorimer argued that "local governments have not fulfilled their responsibilities concerning the Islands."⁸⁸ Under the Trust, Lorimer insisted, Islanders would have greater input than under the jurisdiction of the CRD where they held only

⁸⁵ Porcher, "The Islands Trust," 32-33.

⁸⁶ "Will Trust Make them Coney Islands?" *Sun*, May 4, 1974, 49; Randy Glover, "Gulf Islands Trust Bill Labelled as "a catastrophe," *Sun*, May 7, 1974, 31.

⁸⁷ "NDP Letters to Islanders Called Insult," *Province*, May 11, 1974, 10; Province of British Columbia, *Hansard*, Hugh Curtis, 21 May 1974, 3260

⁸⁸ "Island Trust Act Carries Big 'Stick,'" *Province*, April 25, 1974, 31.

two of forty-seven seats.⁸⁹ Lorimer's rebuttal did little to quell the critics. Even Liberal David Anderson who, five years previously, had put forward a proposal for an even more radical kind of Islands Trust, was dissatisfied⁹⁰ with "a bill which brings out the worst in the centralizing tendencies of this government."⁹¹ References to the 'centralizing tendencies' of the NDP government must be understood within the context of more general criticisms of the social democratic agenda undertaken by the NDP.⁹² As one editorial in the *Colonist* argued, the NDP government had moved fast to push forward its leftist agenda and the author lamented the proliferation of unelected commissions such as "the Insurance Commission, Land Commission, Liquor Commission, Gulf Islands Trust Commission, Provincial Police Commission, Universities Council, [and the] Energy Commission."⁹³ While this perceived threat to local democracy remained the focal point of the Islands Trust Act debate, at least one MLA saw fit to question the underlying premise of the Trust.

Louis Williams, Liberal MLA for Vancouver-Howe Sound, agreed with Hugh Curtis' criticisms of the Act and deplored the "insult" of the NDP caucus newsletter, which misrepresented his Bowen Island constituents. But more importantly, he took issue with the depiction of the Gulf Islands as 'unique' places. Williams took this position in an exchange with NDP Comox MLA Karen Sanford, who recalled in a House speech supportive of the Islands Trust Act that during their research trip to the Gulf Islands members of the Standing Committee would very often comment "that the islands were unique." So frequently did members make this comment, Sanford noted, that they "often smiled when we used that term because we used it so often." "But it's true," she persisted, "they are unique. They are different and they are special. And they need the special

⁸⁹ Province of British Columbia, *Hansard*, James Lorimer, 21 May 1974, 3258.

⁹⁰ David Anderson initially entered federal politics when he was elected as a Liberal MP for the constituency of Esquimalt—Saanich on Vancouver Island in the 1968 federal election. He moved into provincial politics four years later for the 1972 election where he won a seat representing the Victoria constituency and was elected leader of the provincial Liberal Party, then the third party in the provincial legislature with 5 out of 55 seats.

⁹¹ Province of British Columbia, *Hansard*, David Anderson, 21 May 1974, 3266.

⁹² For an analysis of the social democratic policies implemented by the NDP see: Philip Resnick, "Social Democracy in Power: The Case of British Columbia," *BC Studies* no.34 (1977): 3-20; For further reading on the Barrett's tenure as premier see: Geoff Meggs and Rod Mickleburgh, *The Art of the Impossible*.

⁹³ "The New Democracy," *Colonist*, June 14, 1974, 4.

protection that an island trust will provide them with.⁹⁴ Williams, however, did not agree. “To suggest that the islands are unique,” he reasoned, “is to deny that the Cariboo is unique, that the Kootenays is [sic] unique, that the Queen Charlottes are unique. And to suggest that this paternal legislation — or maybe I should say maternal legislation — is going to be the solution for these islands and their uniqueness, is absolutely beyond belief.”⁹⁵ Williams’ Liberal Party colleague David Anderson agreed that labelling the Gulf Islands as unique set a dangerous precedent. If such overriding of local democracy, as embodied in the Islands Trust could be achieved in this context, he warned, similar draconian action could be taken anywhere in the province.

The mere questioning of the entrenched presumption that the Gulf Islands constituted some kind of unique rural landscape is telling, if for no other reason than for its lack of traction. So firmly embedded in the collective imagination had the depiction of the Islands as a special pastoral environment become, that few even thought or desired to question it. While the Liberals raised the question, the concern found little purchase among the public or with the Official Opposition, and as such the debate around the Islands Trust remained focused on the perceived undemocratic process of appointing General Trustees rather than having them elected by Islanders.⁹⁶ In response to widespread criticism, the NDP government did soften the Islands Trust Act in small ways, such as by removing a section from the original bill that made any ruling by the Trust “final and binding and not subject to appeal to, or review by, any court.”⁹⁷ With this concession the government pushed through the creation of the Islands Trust.

‘To Preserve and Protect?’ - Land-use Planning and Policy of the Islands Trust, 1974 - 1976

With its majority, the NDP government passed the Islands Trust Act through the legislature in June 1974. While residents were still uneasy, the government’s announcement of the general trustee appointments in early September quelled some fears.

⁹⁴ Province of British Columbia, *Hansard*, 21 May 1974, 3264-3265.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, 3265.

⁹⁶ “Plan for Islands Trust Paternalism - Campbell,” *Province*, April 26, 1974, 9; “Islands Bill: Well Intended but Bad,” *Sun*, May 23, 1974, 5; “Gulf Islanders ‘worried sick’ by New Act,” *Colonist*, August 27, 1974, 1.

⁹⁷ “Island Trust Softened,” *Province*, April 27, 1974, 33.

Hilary Brown, a long-time resident of Hornby Island and former member of that island's advisory planning commission, was appointed as chair of the Islands Trust. In addition to Brown, Marc Holmes, a much-respected Saltspring Island resident and former CRD director for the island and former Liberal MLA David Brousson, a part-time resident of Bowen Island, filled the remaining two general trustee positions.⁹⁸ With the Trust in place, residents and critics settled into a new reality and allowed the Trust to do the work it was meant to do, albeit amidst uncertainty about what that work would be. As David Jones argues, the ill-defined "preserve and protect mandate" of the Trust, which was unusual for a local decision-making body, "allowed the Trust to establish its own agenda and to develop policies to promote its philosophy."⁹⁹ While there was flexibility in what could be done, the pervasive and near uniformly accepted vision of the unique rural character of the Islands led to a set of policies and projects designed to preserve, protect, and promote the pastoral Gulf Islands environment. The policy of the Trust, put forward in a 1975 policy document, reiterated the common tropes that defined the region and proposed an ambitious agenda to "regulate the rate and extent of development taking place in the Trust area and encourage types of development that will maintain the essentially rural nature of the islands."¹⁰⁰

The most pressing concern the Trust tackled was that which brought it into existence — uncontrolled development. But as the responsibility for planning remained the jurisdiction of the regional districts, the Trust was somewhat limited in its powers. It supported the development of community plans for each island, believing them to be the most effective mechanism for controlling land-use patterns in a way that was responsive to individual island desires. But an issue arose because even though the Islands Trust had the power to approve final plans, there was no obligation on the part of regional districts to consult the Trust during the planning process. As well, because of years of uncontrolled development, the Islands Trust was utterly powerless to reverse what had already occurred. While conducted a few years later, a 1978 study identified 16,388 parcels of land in the trust area, a number that had not grown significantly since 1974. Of these parcels, 55% were vacant, 24% were seasonal dwellings, and 21% had permanent

⁹⁸ "Island Trust Proclaimed, Board Named," *Colonist*, September 7, 1974, 17.

⁹⁹ Jones, "British Columbia's Islands Trust," 89.

¹⁰⁰ BCA Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/13, Policy of the Islands Trust, 2-3.

residences. Therefore, regardless of action taken by the Trust, subdivision on the Islands *already* allowed for more than double the number of residences than existed in 1974. According to the study, the population of the trust area, without any further subdivision, could in the most extreme case increase from 9490, according to the 1976 census, to 40,000 people if every parcel was the site of a dwelling with an average of 2.8 occupants.¹⁰¹ There were no agencies, including the Islands Trust, which could control the development of homes on privately owned residential lots. As such, the Islands Trust was somewhat hamstrung in its ability to influence property development patterns on the Islands. This inability to control such a significant aspect of landscape change was a major challenge for an organization tasked to preserve the pastoral character of the Islands. While the Trust was limited in its ability to influence property development, it did have a great deal of power to control the discourse surrounding the Islands, push for changes from and support the work of other government departments, and use these mechanisms to achieve its preservationist mandate.

One of the most important areas of focus for preserving the pastoral character of the Islands had to do with the use of agricultural land.¹⁰² In the original policy document, the Trust committed to support the aims of the Land Commission, which oversaw the Agricultural Land Reserve system. The Land Commission, established only months after the 1972 election, was a province-wide initiative by the NDP government to put a stop to the loss of limited farmland to residential and commercial development through the Land Reserve, described as “a form of zoning that protects the land from the encroachment of non-agricultural development and limits the use of land within the Reserve to agricultural and other uses that do not diminish the capability of the land to produce crops.”¹⁰³ The goal of protecting farmland that was at the core of the Land Commission paralleled and supported the broader ‘character’ preservation goals of the Islands Trust. As the Islands Trust policy documents claimed, “farming activity is a land use that is essential to the character of the islands.”¹⁰⁴ The Islands Trust was not solely concerned with the

¹⁰¹ Lorna Barr, *Land of the Trust Islands: A Review of Subdivision, Housing, and Ownership* (Victoria, Islands Trust, 1978)

¹⁰² Christopher Garrish, “Unscrambling the Omelette: Understanding British Columbia's Agricultural Land Reserve,” *BC Studies* 136 no.25 (2002): 25-55.

¹⁰³ BCA Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/13, Policy of the Islands Trust, 6.

¹⁰⁴ BCA Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/13, Policy of the Islands Trust, 6.

preservation of devoted to farming, then, but also the activity of farming that served to enhance the overall ‘character’ of the Islands.

The major initiative taken in support of agricultural activity in the initial years of the Islands Trust involved a study to determine “what special action and programs could be initiated to revive and encourage farming.”¹⁰⁵ The Trust hired retired agriculturalist and former director of the provincial crop insurance program, Shirley Preston, to study the question. In an interview with the *Times*, Islands Trust chair Hilary Brown made it clear that while the Islands had been extensively farmed in the past, the idea was not to return to the “old type of farming.” Instead, Brown explained “the committee is looking at the possibilities of establishing production on small holdings — especially for young people who are settling on the islands.”¹⁰⁶ The young people Brown referred to were part of a growing back-to-the-land movement in the 1970s, which drew a number of migrants to the Islands.¹⁰⁷ As the contemporary iteration of arcadian and agrarian traditions, the back-to-the-land movement promoted a return to agricultural occupations as a rejection of consumer culture. Depictions of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral landscape drew in these would-be agriculturalists and the Islands Trust embraced their migration as a means of achieving preservation goals.

In her 1976 report, Preston embraced the vision of the Islands as presented by popular histories and cultural producers. She drew direct ties to the “desires” that brought original settlers to the Islands and those that continued to draw people there. “Despite the move away from farming on the Gulf Islands and the rapid increase in population,” Preston explained, “the desire for a rural and independent type of lifestyle has changed little.”¹⁰⁸ The report was not, however, glowingly supportive of the back-to-the-land movement or other iterations of arcadian idealism. Preston took an especially pessimistic

¹⁰⁵ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/4, Briefing Notes for the Minister, Dec 22 1975.

¹⁰⁶ “Gulf Islands Studies for Agricultural Renewal,” *Times*, April 12, 1975, 17.

¹⁰⁷ For greater details on the back-to-the-lander movement see: Sharon Weaver, “First Encounters: 1970s Back-to-the-land Cape Breton, NS and Denman, Hornby and Lasqueti Islands, BC,” *Oral History Forum* 30 (2010): 1-30; Terry Allen Simmons, “But We Must Cultivate Our Garden: 20th Century Pioneering in Rural British Columbia,” (Ph.D. Dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1979); Jeffrey Jacob, *New Pioneers: The Back-to-the-land Movement and the Search for a Sustainable Future* (University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1997); Rebecca Kneale Gould, *At Home in Nature: Modern Homesteading and Spiritual Practice in America* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005)

¹⁰⁸ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/20, Preston, L., A Study of the Agricultural Resources and Potentials of the British Columbia Gulf Islands, 8.

view of those who “prefer to incorporate other philosophies into their farm or garden practices,” referring to alternatives such as the production of “natural foods,” “organic farming,” or “refraining from all use of pesticides and commercial fertilizers.”¹⁰⁹ Instead, she presented a conservative assessment of how best to produce maximum yields and the challenges that faced producers. The most pressing concerns Preston identified included the shortage of water and the lack of storage options, low soil fertility, inflated land prices, “costly and time-consuming transportation facilities,” inadequate training and research services, an aging land-owner population, challenges in obtaining financing, and “inexperience, lack of ‘know-how’ and/or a lethargic attitude concerning modern methods of agricultural economics, production, grading, packaging, and sales.”¹¹⁰ For many of these issues, caused as they were by environmental limitations or broader trends in agribusiness, the Islands Trust was powerless to act.

Despite these challenges, however, the Trust did devote considerable time in its first years of operation to upholding the perceived value of agriculture in fulfilling its preservationist objectives. Adopting the position that education was an essential first step, the Islands Trust began by offering a series of agricultural seminars on various islands.¹¹¹ Education, however, was of little use if land was not available. To address the issue of farmland preservation, the Trust supported the work of the Land Commission and pressured that organization for reviews of the Islands so that land could be brought under the Agricultural Land Reserve. Apart from land preservation, the Trust worked to make farmland, the price of which had increased dramatically over the previous decades, more accessible. In a brief to the B.C Commission of Inquiry on Property Assessment and Taxation, the Trust argued that the land-use controls presently available such as zoning and bylaws were effective forms of negative planning. But while, these methods might restrain development and “consequently preserve open space,” they also tended to create clusters of residential density as opposed to more dispersed, low-impact settlement.¹¹² Instead, there was an increasing need for “positive inducements” to reduce the incentive

¹⁰⁹ Ibid., 23.

¹¹⁰ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/20, Preston, L., A Study of the Agricultural Resources and Potentials of the British Columbia Gulf Islands, 22-23.

¹¹¹ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/14, Report to the Islands, September 2, 1976, 6.

¹¹² BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/5, Brief from the Islands Trust to the Commission of Inquiry on Property Assessment and Taxation, January 14, 1975, 2.

to subdivide land by rewarding preservation. The Trust argued that a taxation system based on the assessed real estate value of the land was challenging for many who sought to keep their land as open space, rather than subdividing the property. The existing system, the Trust argued, favoured landholding by wealthy individuals who could afford to pay high taxes, exposing the Islands to a future where they “become a rich man’s preserve or a shelter for foreign or other capital willing to pay high prices to buy and to hold land.”¹¹³ Asserting the unique ‘character’ of the Islands and therefore the need for special treatment, the Trust’s brief states that the “objectives of any taxation policy then must be different in the Trust Area.”¹¹⁴ A solution, the brief argued, was to have tax assessments take into account covenants, easements, reserves, and ecological uniqueness or fragility of a site, when determining market value, thus reducing the tax burden for those who retained open space and placed preservationist restrictions on their property.

The Islands Trust’s concern for open space was not, however, limited to agricultural land. While retaining farmland and promoting agricultural activity as a means of preserving and creating the unique ‘character’ of the Islands was a priority, preservation of forest lands, as a means of controlling subdivision, providing recreational space, and fostering a light industry in keeping with the ‘character’ of the Islands also had importance. In a 1975 brief to the Royal Commission on Forest Resources, the Islands Trust expressed concern over the retention of forested lands in the region. In order to achieve the preservation of forests, the Trust supported in principle the Certified Tree Farm system. Such status, the brief argued, ensured “the timber resource on some privately owned land is under sound management techniques,” as well as allowing it to be “used by the public for recreation.”¹¹⁵ The concern, however, related to the ability of the owner to withdraw lands for development, as the controversy surrounding the MacMillan Bloedel proposal in the late 1960s demonstrated. In order to dissuade property owners from developing forestlands, the Trust supported a tax recapture provision that would require property owners to pay back taxes not imposed while the land was under Certified Tree Farm status.

¹¹³ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/5, Brief from the Islands Trust to the Commission of Inquiry on Property Assessment and Taxation, January 14, 1975, 5.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 7.

¹¹⁵ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/5, Brief of the Islands Trust to the Royal Commission on Forest Resources, October 17, 1975, 9.

In addition to the large forestry companies such as MacMillan Bloedel, small-scale logging operators, who worked by acquiring cutting rights on smaller sections of land held by private property owners, presented both a benefit and concern to the aims of the Islands Trust. As a benefit, small-scale logging operations produced materials for use by Islanders and brought wealth to the region. But for privately owned property little regulatory power was available, either to the Trust or to other agencies, to limit the extent of clear cutting.¹¹⁶ Given these concerns, the Trust promoted a kind of “boutique logging” that would enhance the rural character of the islands if conducted “on a scale appropriate for the island concerned.”¹¹⁷ Operators would move and gather logs “in a manner that is the least damaging to the environment and in areas that will not conflict with other shoreline uses.” As well, the Trust hoped to see local sawmilling continue, restricted to “small mills supplying mostly local markets.” But since milling would not enhance the pastoral imagery the Trust sought to preserve, the mills would need to be “screened from public view.”¹¹⁸ Interestingly, the Islands Trust did not perceive extractive industries other than forestry, such as mining, quarrying, and drilling, to have a benefit for the Islands and disallowed such operations. Rather than such industrial and commercial development, which was not “generally in keeping with the Islands’ character,” the Trust saw the local economy being grown by craftspeople pursuing “artistic occupations, small businesses, and workshops which serve local needs and provide employment” while representing “important elements of a rural environment.”¹¹⁹ The Trust successfully inserted this vision into planning documents by insisting on controls around what land zoned for industrial or commercial development would entail. The 1976 Official Community Plan for Saturna Island, defined industrial use as all “non-

¹¹⁶ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/5, Brief of the Islands Trust to the Royal Commission on Forest Resources, October 17, 1975, 11- 12; The main problem was lack of control. The Deputy Minister offered three possible routes, which the Islands Trust could take through the Islands Trust Act. “That perhaps section 6 of the Islands Trust Act could be interpreted to allow the planning authority to limit tree-cutting through land use contracts (now replaced by bylaws and development permits), plans, or bylaws, to preserve the aesthetic appeal of any existing trees and shrubs or other vegetation. Alternatively it was suggested that the Islands Trust prepare regulations under s.11 (Islands Trust Act), which could then be approved through Order-in-Council procedure. A third option suggested was that the Islands Trust could present an amendment to the Islands Trust Act through the Attorney-General's Department; Porcher, “The Islands Trust,” 267-68.

¹¹⁷ Stewart, “Five Easy Pieces,” 349.

¹¹⁸ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/13, The Policy of the Islands Trust, August 1975, 7.

¹¹⁹ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/13, The Policy of the Islands Trust, August 1975, 12.

noxious and non-offensive use providing for the” manufacture, storage, and transportation of goods and services.¹²⁰ Moreover, any use deemed by planners “to have a deleterious impact on adjacent land use, the natural environment, and the socio-economic structure of the community” would be subject to closure or denial.¹²¹ In addition to efforts to preserve agricultural and forested lands, and encourage certain types of activities in order to maintain the unique pastoral character of the Islands, the Trust was also concerned with the connective tissue that linked these lands and activities together.

Transportation networks figured prominently in the Trust’s strategy of maintaining the rural character of the region. The Department of Highways established standardized roadway allowances and applied them uniformly across British Columbia, regulating road widths, required clearing on either side of roadways, and grade limitations. For the Islands Trust, however, these broad stroke standards ran counter to the organization’s objectives, requiring excessive “tree clearing and unsightly cuts and fills which destroy the pastoral nature of the islands.”¹²² As a response, Trust officials met with the Department of Highways and succeeded in negotiating special standards for the Islands. In November 1976, the province announced new road designs for the Islands that would “reduce the number of fills required, allow for reduced road widths, permit increases in the maximum allowable grades and establish limits on maximum distances a road can run without a curve,” thus helping to conserve the “natural beauty and maintain a rural environment.”¹²³ Beyond changes to the physical infrastructure though, the Trust also sought to address transportation activity. As the Trust saw the issue, excessive automobility undermined the character of the Islands. While it was certainly no small task to try to influence the transportation choices of residents and visitors, the Trust attempted to have an impact by advocating B.C Ferries and the Bureau of Transit to shift their emphasis from car ferry service to foot traffic. Both organizations agreed and while they did little to reduce car traffic, they did work to make foot traffic more efficient.¹²⁴

¹²⁰ Capital Regional District, Planning Department. *Capital Regional District by-law No. 250, A by-law to designate the community plan for Saturna Island (contained within the Outer Gulf Islands Electoral Area) as the official community plan for the said area*, (Victoria, B.C: 1975), 6.4.

¹²¹ *Ibid.*, 6.4.2.

¹²² BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/4, Briefing Notes for the Minister, Dec 22 1975

¹²³ “Islands Keep Winding Roads,” *Times*, November 27, 1976, 1.

¹²⁴ BCA, Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246 Box 1/4, Briefing Notes for the Minister, Dec 22 1975

While the above is not a comprehensive examination of all of the activities undertaken by the Islands Trust during its first two years of operation, the themes presented demonstrate that the land-use vision put forward focused on preserving the unique rural ‘character’ of the Islands. This ‘character’ referred to both the tangible functions and forms, such as farmland, forests, roads, and clusters of development, and to the intangible but equally significant ingredients of Islands life such as individuals’ methods of transportation, occupations, and land-use activities. Accomplishing the Trust’s preservationist aim was not a simple task and it was unable to create immediate and drastic changes to the environment. The initiatives discussed above, with the exception of work to develop special roadways standards, largely did not result in immediate or obvious changes to land-use or provincial policies. But by espousing a pastoral depiction of the Islands, along with the related ideas of the lifestyles deemed legitimate in such a space, the Islands Trust was able to embed these associations in land-use planning structures that would have long-term impacts.

Due to the requirement that the Islands Trust give final approval to all regional plans and bylaws, the Official Community Plan (OCP) became the most effective means of implementing the organization’s ideas. As the Municipal Act describes them, OCPs are “a general statement of the broad objectives and policies of the local government respecting the form and character of existing and proposed land use and servicing requirements in the area covered by the plan.”¹²⁵ While an OCP did not commit the Regional District to any particular undertaking, it did ensure that no land-use practices could occur contrary to the guidelines set out in the plan. As the Trust was committed to seeing these OCPs developed through community consultation and consensus, progress was slow. Beginning work in 1972, regional planners worked with the various Islands to create island-specific community plans. Most of the large southern Gulf Islands, Saltspring, Galiano, South Pender, and Saturna, along with the Howe Sound Islands, Gambier and Bowen, passed plans relatively quickly, completing work between 1974 and 1976. Others such as Denman, Hornby, and North Pender, embroiled in contentious

¹²⁵ Municipal Act, R.S.C.B, 1987, ss. 945.

public debate around the perceived merits and detriments of residential development, took longer, only having their plans approved at the end of the decade.

While the timing and final details varied, the codification of the Islands' 'unique rural character' was uniform throughout the documents. In the 1976 OCP for Saturna Island, a main overarching objective was "to preserve and protect the unique rural environment for future generations."¹²⁶ Similarly, on Galiano Island the first criteria for determining land-use decisions was an acceptance that the "rural nature of the area shall be preserved."¹²⁷ Such loosely defined objectives were prominent in all of the plans and are further reflected in the regulations that control specific land-uses. But what may have seemed obvious and useful at the time of creation later became a source of contention, because as a number of scholars note, defining rural is notoriously difficult. The Canadian census uses the type of local government to determine whether an area is rural; incorporated cities, towns, and even villages are considered urban, while everything else is rural. As Robert Swierenga notes the "standard operational definition of rurality" employs the term to describe all areas outside of urban areas over a certain size.¹²⁸ But rural classification, Ruth Sandwell argues, relates to more than population size, density, and distance from urban centres; it is also a "cultural classification, relating to a particular culture or way of life" that is tied to particular land uses, predominantly agriculture.¹²⁹ In the Gulf Islands the insertion of such ideas into the OCPs, which would be the primary guiding documents for land-use management over the following forty years, was an important and impactful decision. A striking example of how the conceptions that shaped the OCPs continued to impact land-use on the Islands in the years after their creation came in 1994, when the Gabriola Island Trust council voted to remove the term 'rural'

¹²⁶ Capital Regional District, Planning Department. *Capital Regional District by-law No. 250, 2.2.3, A by-law to designate the community plan for Saturna Island (contained within the Outer Gulf Islands Electoral Area) as the official community plan for the said area*, (Victoria, B.C: 1975).

¹²⁷ Capital Regional District, Planning Department, *Capital regional district by-law No. 218: A by-law to designate the community plan for North Pender Island (contained within the outer gulf islands electoral area) as the official community plan for the said area* (Victoria, B.C: 1975), 5.

¹²⁸ Robert P. Swierenga, "Theoretical Perspectives on the New Rural History: From Environmentalism to Modernism," *Agricultural History* 56, no.3 (1982): 6.

¹²⁹ R.W. Sandwell, "Notes toward a History of Rural Canada, 1870-1940," in *Social Transformation in Rural Canada - Community, Cultures, and Collective Action*, ed. Maureen Gail Reed, and John Parkins (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012), 24.

from its OCP because the planning documents did not clearly articulate what a ‘rural character’ meant, thus creating contention over potential development.

On Gabriola, the vote to remove the word rural from planning documents arose as a result of a proposal that had come before the council from Weldwood, an international forestry company, to transfer a large portion of forested land that they owned in the interior of the island to the Trust in exchange for more lenient rules on waterfront property development. Issues with the Weldwood property stretched back to 1971 when the company proposed a 550-lot subdivision on the interior lands, which met significant public protest. In the spring of 1971, the Nanaimo Regional District turned down the application and Weldwood appealed to Dan Campbell, Social Credit Minister of Municipal Affairs, who after a public hearing that exhibited the extent of public opposition and pressure from the NDP Opposition finally rejected the proposal in 1972. Unable to develop the land as they wished, the company continued to seek a profitable solution. The proposal put forward in 1994 to donate the land in the interior to the community became a difficult issue for the Advisory Planning Commission of the Gabriola Trust Council. Commissioners could not come to a decision as to whether ‘rural’ could describe forested lands or whether it meant land used for agriculture and sparse residential development. The distinction was critical because if it were the latter, development of the interior lands for dispersed residential and agricultural use was, in fact, preferable to maintaining it as forest. As a solution, the commissioners recommended to the council that the ambiguity be corrected by simply removing the word ‘rural’ from the Community Plan.¹³⁰ While Gabriola Island is outside of the specific focus area of this study, the example is a good demonstration of how deeply ingrained in the collective planning structures the pastoral conception of the Islands became in the 1970s. Widespread adoption of the idea of a ‘rural’ character in the work of the Islands Trust influenced the content of land-use planning documents, programs, and policies throughout the region, thus cementing a particular pastoral depiction of the Islands into the legal framework for land-use management, as well as shaping the physical

¹³⁰ Anne Patricia Rayner, “Everything Becomes an Island: Gulf Islands Writing and the Construction of Region,” (Ph.D dissertation, University of British Columbia, 1995), 54; For further reading on the controversy over the Weldwood property as it evolved over the 1990s see: Dyan Dunsmoor-Farley, *Weldwood on Gabriola: Dancing With the Giant* (MA Thesis, Athabasca University, 2013)

environment. Unfortunately, it is beyond the scope of this study to examine the OCPs in detail or to explore the ways in which they were reviewed and revised since their formation. However, given their guiding role in land-use management, it is safe to say that they have influenced the physical, social, and cultural environment of the Gulf Islands in ongoing and significant ways.

Conclusion

In passing the Islands Trust Act in 1974, the NDP ushered in a new period of land-use planning in the Gulf Islands. After over a decade of calls from residents, local, provincial, and federal politicians, and conservationists to preserve the Islands, the provincial government established an organization with the mandate of doing just that. While an increasing range of actors became interested in the future of the region, the focus of debates centered on structural issues pertaining to topics such as local governance and individual property rights. However, throughout this process the question that remained less clearly articulated by policy-makers was what exactly it was about the Gulf Islands that merited preservation. Calls throughout the 1960s targeted the ‘special’ and ‘unique’ environment or character of the Gulf Islands as reasons for their preservation. As the previous chapters explored, these labels were means of articulating pastoral conceptions of the landscape, and associated lifestyles that developed over the twentieth century through the interaction of cultural, social, economic, and environmental features of the Gulf Islands. The eventual mandate of the newly formed Islands Trust, to “preserve and protect... the unique amenities and environment” of the region, captured an ambiguity in calls for preservation. But despite the lack of clarity inherent in this mandate, the early work of the Islands Trust offered a clear and well-defined interpretation of these amenities and environments. The Trustees and staff embraced the pastoral conception of the region that had gained increasing traction during the decades before the Trust’s creation. The Trust then set about preserving and creating such an environment through a policy program that supported farmland, forest, open space retention, and winding rural roads, and encouraged activities such as small-scale

agriculture, forestry, and handicrafts deemed to be in keeping with the unique ‘character’ of the Islands. Through the initial work of enshrining the pastoral ‘character’ of the Islands into land-use planning policies and programs, the Islands Trust had an ongoing and significant impact on shaping the landscape and features of the region to match this depiction.

Chapter 5: Conclusion

In the contemporary world, approaches to land conservation and environmental preservation that aim to preserve and protect ‘special’ or ‘unique’ places are being challenged by thinkers who are seeking to adopt programs that avoid, as John Gillis would label the practice, ‘islanding.’ Here, Gillis draws attention to the tendency of segmenting the world into distinct spaces for distinct functions, with territory set aside as wilderness, for agriculture, for urban centres, and transportation corridors, each separate and subject to their own standards and regulations. This zoning approach is inherent to land-use planning, at the heart of which is a desire for control. But spaces such as wilderness areas are not truly wild, and agricultural areas are not entirely unnatural. The natural world and our interactions with it are far from simple, and the ambiguity that is inherent in our relationship to the landscape cannot easily and fully be translated into such plans.

As a counter to this propensity for separation, academics, advocates, and policy-makers are increasingly embracing an idea of the ‘whole landscape’ that extends beyond the natural environment to include the cultural and social relationships that are deeply embedded in and layered upon the physical world. Landscape, then, needs to be understood as a “multifunctional and dynamic system, that through its natural and cultural layers, delivers a range of services.”¹ These services — cultural, physical, and biological — all contribute to human and ecological well-being. Developing a land-use management approach capable of embracing such a wide range of services and relationships is a great challenge, but one for which a number of innovative intellectual frameworks have emerged in the past two decades in order to provide a more unified approach. Undertaking such an integrated or holistic approach must begin with an understanding of how conceptions of the environment have developed over time, shaped the landscape, and continue to inform decisions in the contemporary world. Due to the varied interactions between the environment and economic, social, political, and cultural elements, the challenges and management solutions of land-use in the Gulf Islands over

¹ Paul H. Selman, *Sustainable Landscape Planning: The Reconnection Agenda*, (New York, NY: Routledge, 2012), 40.

the twentieth century offer an informative case for how such complex issues evolve. This study has undertaken this initial task of understanding the conceptions of the Gulf Islands and how they have shaped land-use management.

In so doing, I have argued that the idea of the Gulf Islands as a ‘special’ or ‘unique’ rural environment needs to be understood as the outgrowth of an interaction between humans and their physical and cultural environments throughout the century. During the first half of the twentieth century, the Gulf Islands had much in common with other rural regions in British Columbia that were home to a mixed economy. Due to environmental and transport limitations, large-scale commercial operations did not flourish, maintaining a diverse economy based on small-scale agriculture, logging, fishing, and tourism. Despite the realities of hard labour as settlers engaged the landscape and its resources in the pursuit of independence, depictions of the region from reporters, tourism promoters, travel writers, and Islanders themselves increasingly characterized the Islands as pastoral bastions of a leisured, arcadian lifestyle. These depictions were not without a basis in reality. Apart from being expressions of appreciation for the physical environment, these depictions focused on a small population of well-to-do English migrants drawn to the Islands in pursuit of a romantic, arcadian lifestyle. The pastoral depiction of the Islands became increasingly hegemonic with the growth of the tourist industry in the region during the interwar period, which sought a means to sell the Islands.

The effort to sell the Islands was quite successful, so much so that by the end of the 1960s residents, politicians, developers, and preservationists consistently painted the Gulf Islands as ‘special’ and ‘unique’ in the province. Such conceptions of the region came in part from the interactions of individuals and groups with the landscape. While islands, in general, hold a particular allure in the Western imagination, the Gulf Islands, with their lush vegetation, open meadows, moderate climate, fertile valleys, and rugged terrain had become a special environment for British Columbians. The novelty of the environment in a province so wedded to large-scale resource extraction, made the Islands easy for early observers to interpret as an idyllic pastoral world. But such ideas were also deeply rooted in the cultural fabric that constrained, shaped, and informed the impressions of individuals and groups interacting with space. Political, economic, and

cultural discourses that valorized the moral worth of agriculture and agricultural lifestyles, anti-modern resistance to disruptions brought on by the modernization of society, and cultural associations with and metaphorical uses of island environments all worked together to shape perceptions of the Gulf Islands' physical environment. Understanding how such conceptions took shape over the first half of the twentieth century, this thesis then aimed to explain how ideas of the Gulf Islands as a 'special' or 'unique' pastoral rural environment, in turn, influenced the development of land-use policies and programs.

The need for land-use planning emerged in the context of the immediate post-Second World War decades, which witnessed dramatic change on the Gulf Islands. The Islands' market for homes, seasonal residences, and tourist facilities boomed, driven by widespread postwar prosperity, greater employment flexibility, urban and transport network expansion, a declining Islands economy, broad growth in retirement, an aging population, and a swelling interest in escaping from a harried urban life. Although to a degree constrained in the 1950s by transport limitations, this boom truly took off in the early 1960s. Falling within unorganized territory, development in the Gulf Islands was not, however, controlled. Unrestrained, unregulated, and unsightly development became the focal point for advocates seeking to limit growth on the Islands. While most Islanders were strident in their opposition to the rapid pace of development, a clear articulation of what was to be preserved took more time to develop.

Calls to preserve and control development on the Islands drew upon an increasingly predominant regional identity that subscribed to conceptions of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral landscape, within which a leisured arcadian lifestyle could be created, maintained, and supported. These calls for control gained attention from regional and provincial politicians, but the regional district planning authorities were slow to respond. Pressure on the provincial government to respond to the perceived failure of districts mounted. In late October 1969, Social Credit Minister of Municipal Affairs Dan Campbell responded to public protests by imposing a '10 acre freeze' in order to provide the regional district planning boards with time to address the emerging issues.

The implementation of the 10-acre freeze marked the beginning of a concerted effort on the part of regional planning authorities to find a solution to land-use

management issues in the Gulf Islands. Land-use planning, however, is not a rapid process and the degree of commitment exhibited by regional authorities varied across districts. Even for the Capital Regional District, the most active of any of the planning authorities, three years of studies, consultations, drafts, and revisions did not bring about ministerial approval of any substantial regulations. It was not until 1972, when the NDP took control of the provincial government, that innovative efforts to address issues in the Gulf Islands emerged. With the passage of the Islands Trust Act in 1974, the NDP government responded to calls from residents, local, provincial, and federal politicians, and conservationists to preserve the character of the Gulf Islands through the establishment of an organization mandated to achieve that goal. The land-use policies and programs undertaken by the newly formed Islands Trust reflected the conception of the Gulf Islands as a pastoral landscape. In addition, they ascribed to the idea that a defining lifestyle, characterized by arcadian pursuits such as mixed farming, boutique logging, handicrafts, or the arts, was legitimate for such a landscape. By embracing such a conception of the Gulf Islands' environment, the Islands Trust endeavoured to preserve and perpetuate this landscape through policies and programs that supported farmland, forest, and open space retention, encouraging those activities deemed to be in keeping with the unique 'character' of the Islands.

While a mandate of preserving the 'special and unique character' of a region is fraught with challenges, it enabled the Islands Trust to engage in a complex array of preservationist programs that encompassed more than just land or ecosystem preservation by including efforts to uphold and sustain the lifestyle characteristics that were understood to be integral to the sustainable existence of the character of the Gulf Islands. The initial work of enshrining this sense of the Islands into land-use planning policies and programs by the Trust laid a framework for ongoing efforts towards integrated management that have shaped the landscape, economy, development, and identity of the region into the present day. Building upon this foundation, over the past forty years the Islands Trust has functioned as an innovative, albeit imperfect example of an integrated approach to management that dealt with both the human and natural worlds and their relationship to one another.

Epilogue

In the decades after 1976, the Islands Trust became firmly rooted in the political structures of the region. While governments and politicians have adopted differing views on the value of the Trust, the powers and scope of the organization expanded over the following years. The future of the Trust seemed in doubt when the NDP government lost power in 1975 after its leader Dave Barrett called a snap election in the hopes of capitalizing on what was left of steadily declining popular support for his party. The Social Credit party of Bill Bennett, which regained the reins of power, had been adamant in its criticism of the Islands Trust since its inception. Hugh Curtis, who had left the Progressive Conservative party to join the Social Credit party during this election, subsequently taking on the Municipal Affairs portfolio for the new government, had long been involved in the struggle and in the past offered some of the liveliest opposition. Yet, despite these ominous signs, the Islands Trust did more than just survive; its power and reach expanded considerably.

Shortly after taking power, critics were calling on the Social Credit government to disband the Trust, labelling it a “\$236,000 error that should be abolished.”² Opponents argued that the Trust had done little but interfere with regional government, delayed bylaw implementation by up to eight months, and grossly overpaid Trustees.³ Curtis, however, was noncommittal about the future of the agency. After spending a large part of his political life dealing with the issue of Islands development, Curtis was perhaps satisfied to have decisions regarding the region delegated to another agency. Now that his power extended to all municipal matters in the province he felt, in a surprising dismissal of an issue that had consumed so much of his career, that “there were more important things on my desk... [and] the future of the Island Trust is not a matter of urgent,

² Jon Ferry “Islands Trust Fighting for Life,” *Colonist*, January 22, 1976, 11.

³ *Ibid.*,

pressing priority.”⁴ Even the day before the term of the general trustees was set to expire, government officials had not announced a decision on whether to disband the Trust or not, resorting instead to vague comments noting that “some restructuring needed to take place.”⁵ When the day came, little changed as Curtis announced new trustees with Marc Holmes, one of the former trustees, taking on the chairmanship and two new appointees, George Boulton, a Gabriola Island businessman and John Gaines, an airline pilot from Saturna Island, filling the remaining spots.

In February of 1977, Curtis surprised everyone when he announced that planning and zoning functions for the Gulf Islands would be taken away from regional districts, and the Islands Trust would take authority over the preparation and enforcement of settlement or community plans, zoning bylaws, subdivision bylaws, and regional plans. Arguing that “one of the major complaints since the Trust was established is that the Islands have become ‘over governed,’” Curtis sought to streamline government services by removing what he saw as duplication of function.⁶ This amendment also served to reinforce the idea of the Gulf Islands as a regional entity. Previously, the community plan and island-specific bylaws were the primary avenues for land management. The shift to regional control by the Islands Trust, as well as sections within the amendment that strengthened regional planning and broader collective goals, signalled an entrenchment of the ‘Gulf Islands’ as a special place.

Backlash over this announcement was swift and seemingly unanimous. Establishing the Trust as the sole provider of planning and zoning services to the Islands reawakened residents’ resentment over the appointment of general trustees. Critics and opposition members pressured Curtis heavily over the following months, reading back *Hansard* excerpts where he himself had criticized the NDP government’s disrespect for local representative government. In the end, Curtis relented to pressure and agreed to amend the Islands Trust Act to enable trustees to elect their own chairman and vice-chairman.⁷ Doing so quieted the strongest opposition the Islands Trust faced, apparently

⁴ “Curtis Won’t Say Yes or No on Disbanding Island Trust,” *Colonist*, February 19, 1976, 13.

⁵ “Island Trustees in Doubt,” *Times*, September 4, 1976, 14.

⁶ “Region gets the Boot on Islands,” *Times*, February 25, 1977, 1.

⁷ “Islands Trust Power,” *Times*, February 28, 1977, 4; “Islanders Want Trust Action Delayed,” *Colonist*, March 10, 1977, 10; “Gulf Islands Power Shift ‘unconstitutional,’” *Colonist*, March 12, 1977, 1; “Campbell

satisfying most residents. An opinion poll that accompanied the 1977 Capital Regional District elections asked residents of the Islands whether they would prefer the district or the Islands Trust to handle land-use and subdivision regulations; the response was overwhelming in favour of the Trust.⁸ In a sense, it was a symbolic end to a prolonged period of uncertainty surrounding land-use management on the Islands. The 1977 opinion poll and amendments signalled that the Islands Trust would be around for a long time. So too would the deeply entrenched idea of the Gulf Islands as having a ‘special’ rural character deserving of distinctive land-use management structures. Appreciating where such ideas came from demands an understanding of historical trends in the human relationship to the environment and the cultural dynamics that legitimized defence of the Islands as pastoral enclaves.

, demanding an understanding of historical trends in the human relationship to the environment and the cultural dynamics that legitimized defence of the Islands as pastoral enclaves.

the Islands Trust present an innovative, albeit imperfect, example of how to develop an integrated approach to managing the whole landscape

Hits Trust Charges,” *Times*, May 28, 1977, 19; “Opposition Hardens Over Trust Changes,” *Colonist*, June 10, 1977, 14; “Curtis Agrees to Overhaul Islands Trust,” *Colonist*, August 26, 1977, 19.

⁸ “Salt Spring Opinion Poll Part of Vote,” *Colonist*, November 18, 1977, 33; “Salt Spring Votes Faith in Trust,” *Colonist*, November 20, 1977, 15.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Archival Material

British Columbia Archives

- British Columbia Ferry Authority, NWp 971.1Gu B862cr, *Cruise British Columbia's Sunny Gulf Islands via B.C. Ferries*, 1963.
- British Columbia Government Travel Bureau, NWp 971.96 G971, *British Columbia's Enchanting Gulf Islands*, 1950.
- British Columbia Historical Association Records, MS-2779
- British Columbia Marine Resources Branch Records, GR-1118
- David Anderson Fonds, MS 2042
- Deputy Minister of Agriculture Records, GR 402
- Frederick Marsh Fonds, MS-1176
- Hilary Brown Papers, MS 1246
- Island Agricultural and Fruit Growers Association Records MS-1491

Published Sources

- “Greed vs. beauty.” *Times*, May 29, 1972, 21.
- “Last Chance’ Study for All Gulf Islands.” *Times*, February 28, 1973, 13.
- “Public first’ for Gulf Island lands.” *Times*, March 17, 1972, 6.
- “You Can Take a Boy Out of the Country....” *Times*, September 6, 1967, 18.
- “\$17,500 Now Asked for Gulf Service.” *Times*, March 14, 1917, 11; “Seek Larger Subsidy,” *Colonist*, March 25, 1917, 14.
- “A B.C Trade Secret.” *Province*, July 4, 1956, 6.
- “A Central Control for Islands Sought.” *Province*, September 6, 1973, 6
- “A Delightful holiday trip.” *Colonist*, August 20, 1901, 5.
- “A Paradise for Tourists: Says Gulf Island Member in Telling Legislature about His Constituency.” *Times*, February 19, 1931, 10

- “Among the Gulf Islands.” *Colonist*, July 3, 1907, 7.
- “Among the Islands.” *The Week*, 15 Oct. 1910, 4.
- “Another One Out to Ruin Our Island.” *Colonist*, November 3, 1970, 2.
- “Asks Support for Islands’ Products.” *Colonist*, April 21, 1923, 5.
- “B.C ‘should buy up’ Island forest lands.” *Times*, March 23, 1972, 7.
- “B.C’s Gulf Islands.” *Province*, January 12, 1946, Magazine Section, 6.
- “Bennett Predicts Gulf Islands Canada’s Hawaii.” *Province*, June 29, 1956, 17
- “Better Service for Islands.” *Colonist*, April 23, 1953, 4.
- “Better Service Needed.” *Colonist*, May 14, 1907, 4.
- “Boom Island.” *Sun*, June 4, 1949, Magazine Section, 6.
- “Campbell Hardens Line on Gulf Island Land Use.” *Times*, January 6, 1970, 13.
- “Campbell Hits Trust Charges.” *Times*, May 28, 1977, 19.
- “Campbell Tees Off on Island Report.” *Times*, September 25, 1973, 2.
- “Campbell Won’t Pass Capital Region Bylaw.” *Colonist*, August 20, 1971, 36.
- “Campbell’s Out of Touch: Curtis.” *Times*, January 28, 1972, 10.
- “Chamber of Commerce Committee Will Seek Improved Ferry Service.” *Colonist*, July 19, 1951, 24
- “Coast Ferries’ Proposed Daily Service From Gulf Islands.” *Colonist*, January 14, 1954, 15.
- “Colonialism in the Gulf Islands - Letter from TA Toynbee.” *Sun*, October 15, 1973, 5.
- “Computer Tells Us Our Fate: Gulf Paradise Doomed.” *Times*, November 1, 1969, 1.
- “Confusion in the Gulf.” *Sun*, October 17, 1973, 4.
- “Constructive Ship Proposals.” *Times*, September 8, 1953, 4.
- “Costly Bridge-Ferry Network Suggested for Gulf Islands.” *Colonist*, October 27, 1954, 11.
- “Curtis Agrees to Overhaul Islands Trust.” *Colonist*, August 26, 1977, 19.
- “Curtis Won’t Say Yes or No on Disbanding Island Trust.” *Colonist*, February 19, 1976, 13.
- “District News: Salt Spring.” *Cowichan Leader*, October 23, 1913, 10.
- “Federal Aid to Islands Brings High Praise.” *Colonist*, March 21, 1952, 5.
- “Ferry Change Feared.” *Colonist*, October 30, 1952, 1.
- “Ferry Run to Islands given Study.” *Colonist*, November 11, 1951, 17.
- “For Lo, the Winter is Past, and the Time of the Litterbug is Come!” *Gulf Islander*, February 28, 1964, 1.

- “Funds Sought for Survey on Inter-Island Monorail.” *Colonist*, February 10, 1954, 11.
- “Gabriola headache cure offered.” *Colonist*, August 18, 1972, 26.
- “German Family Owns 3,000 Island Acres.” *Times*, January 12, 1962, 11.
- “Gulf Islanders ‘worried sick’ by New Act.” *Colonist*, August 27, 1974, 1.
- “Gulf Islanders Hopping Mad.” *Colonist*, November 8, 1964, 39.
- “Gulf Islanders to Mould Own Future,” *Colonist*, November 9, 1971, 21.
- “Gulf Islanders’ Replies Trickle.” *Colonist*, March 16, 1972, 17.
- “Gulf Islands Autonomy Urged.” *Colonist*, August 12, 1972, 16.
- “Gulf Islands Become a Gold Mine.” *Sun*, August 29, 1968, 12.
- “Gulf Islands Blotted Out by Computer.” *Times*, February 21, 1970, 25.
- “Gulf Islands Can’t Cope with Sudden Tourist Boom.” *Colonist*, May 27, 1956, 3.
- “Gulf Islands Ferry Link.” *Colonist*, November 21, 1951, 4.
- “Gulf Islands Form Paradise Whose Beauties are Little Known as Yet.” *Province*, December 27, 1924, 5.
- “Gulf Islands Form Paradise Whose Beauties are Little Known as Yet.” *Vancouver Province*, December 27, 1924, 5.
- “Gulf Islands Growth “Shocking Disgrace.” *Times*, May 16, 1968, 23.
- “Gulf Islands Idea Scorned.” *Colonist*, October 29, 1970, 17.
- “Gulf Islands in Demand for Homes.” *Colonist*, September 21, 1943, 7.
- “Gulf Islands in Industrial Slump; now eye Tourists.” *Sun*, December 3, 1953, 46.
- “Gulf Islands of British Columbia.” *Colonist*, December 3, 1922, 27.
- “Gulf Islands Power Shift ‘unconstitutional.’” *Colonist*, March 12, 1977, 1.
- “Gulf Islands Sanctuary of Seniors.” *Sun*, February 13, 1968, 8.
- “Gulf Islands Service.” *Colonist*, January 30, 1917, 4.
- “Gulf Islands Should Become National Park.” *Colonist*, October 27, 1970, 1.
- “Gulf Islands Studies for Agricultural Renewal.” *Times*, April 12, 1975, 17.
- “Gulf Islands Study Set.” *Sun*, February 23, 1973, 12.
- “Gulf Islands to Protest Cut.” *Colonist*, September 3, 1953, 17.
- “Gulf Islands U.S.-owned?” *Times*, June 21, 1971, 17.
- “Gulf Islands’ Future in Region’s Hands; Who Fixes ‘no-more’ line?” *Colonist*, June 26, 1970, 1-2.
- “Gulf Islands’ Trade Killed by Cost of reaching Markets.” *Times*, November 14, 1953, 14.
- “Gulf to Get 4-Zone Plan.” *Times*, May 21, 1970, 2.

- “Island Checks Backfire.” *Colonist*, June 21, 1970, 13.
- “Island Farmers Not Asking Aid.” *Colonist*, September 20, 1931, 3.
- “Island Proposal ‘Madness.’” *Times*, March 27, 1972, 21.
- “Island Study a Coincidence.” *Times*, November 1, 1969, 40.
- “Island Trust Act Carries Big ‘Stick.’” *Province*, April 25, 1974, 31.
- “Island Trust Proclaimed, Board Named.” *Colonist*, September 7, 1974, 17.
- “Island Trust Softened.” *Province*, April 27, 1974, 33.
- “Island Trustees in Doubt.” *Times*, September 4, 1976, 14.
- “Island Voice - letter from GS Humphreys.” *Times*, November 16, 1973, 4.
- “Islanders choose future options.” *Times*, January 14, 1972, 2.
- “Islanders Oppose Links,” *Times*, April 20, 1972, 47.
- “Islanders Want no Trust Here.” *Driftwood*, 9 May 1974, 1.
- “Islanders Want Trust Action Delayed.” *Colonist*, March 10, 1977, 10
- “Islands Bill: Well Intended but Bad.” *Sun*, May 23, 1974, 5.
- “Islands Keep Winding Roads.” *Times*, November 27, 1976, 1.
- “Islands of Enchantment.” *Times*, August 29, 1925, Magazine Section, 1.
- “Islands Plan ‘misrepresented.’” *Colonist*, February 3, 1972, 47.
- “Islands Seen as Quiet Retreats.” *Times*, October 23, 1972, 17.
- “Islands Study Hits Snag.” *Colonist*, February 21, 1970, 37.
- “Islands Study Zoning.” *Colonist*, September 5, 1971, 13.
- “Islands Trust Power.” *Times*, February 28, 1977, 4.
- “Islands Zoning Opposed.” *Times*, January 27, 1972, 19.
- “Land Development Curbs Upset Study by Computer.” *Colonist*, November 4, 1969, 28.
- “Life on the Islands of British Columbia.” *Colonist*, February 2, 1902, 9.
- “Logging Operations threaten Beauty Spot in Active Pass.” *Colonist*, August 10, 1951, 24.
- “Long Awaited Ship Services Resumes Today.” *Colonist*, April 26, 1953, 17.
- “Lorimer Rebuffs Islands Pressure.” *Times*, May 5, 1973, 41.
- “Many People Buying Islands’ Waterfront.” *Times*, September 20, 1943, 11.
- “More Builders Waiting Gulf Islanders Warn.” *Colonist*, April 3, 1969, 39.
- “NDP Letters to Islanders Called Insult.” *Province*, May 11, 1974, 10.
- “NDP would ‘freeze’ land.” *Colonist*, August 17, 1972, 21.
- “New Deal Pledged For Gulf Islands.” *Colonist* July 23, 1954, 6.

- “New Gulf Islands Board of Trade.” *Times*, October 14, 1919, 2.
- “New Plan to Guide Gulf Islands.” *Times*, October 30, 1972, 6.
- “No One Fooled.” *Times*, June 15, 1972, 4.
- “No Subdivision Limit on Current Projects.” *Colonist*, November 20, 1969, 22.
- “Notes and News.” *Gulf Islander*, February 5, 1965, 1.
- “Now Dan has a new plan.” *Province*, August 21, 1972, 4.
- “Officials Question Marine Park Plan.” *Colonist*, May 5, 1970, 25.
- “Oil Drilling Ruled Out for Straits.” *Times*, November 26, 1969, 1.
- “Oil, Gas Search in Gulf Islands.” *Colonist*, August 3, 1957, 17.
- “Old Island Saltery Site Resurrects Memories.” *Gulf Islands Driftwood*, June 14, 1989, 1.
- “Opposition Hardens Over Trust Changes.” *Colonist*, June 10, 1977, 14.
- “Outer Island Zoning Goes to Hearing.” *Times*, October 28, 1971, 11.
- “Park Plan Favoured.” *Colonist*, April 20, 1972, 16.
- “Plan for Islands Trust Paternalism – Campbell.” *Province*, April 26, 1974, 9.
- “Planning Big Issue in Gulf Islands Vote.” *Times*, December 4, 1971, 28.
- “Planning Options for Gulf Islands.” *Times*, November 9, 1971, 42.
- “Pollution - Letter Ada Ryan.” *Times*, June 20, 1968, 4.
- “Pollution Ugliness Invades the Islands.” *Colonist*, April 25, 1968, 4.
- “Problems of paradise aired.” *Sun*, May 3, 1973, 11.
- “Progress Threatens a B.C Sanctuary.” *Province*, August 24, 1957, 6.
- “Province May Add to Gulf Island Subsidy,” *Colonist*, March 3, 1917, 11.
- “Province Plans to Call for Tenders for Non-Subsidized Salt Spring Run.” *Colonist*, October 5, 1955, 6.
- “Reconsider Islands, Campbell asks MLAs.” *Times*, October 3, 1973, 24.
- “Region gets the Boot on Islands.” *Times*, February 25, 1977, 1.
- “Regions May Lose Islands.” *Times*, July 27, 1973, 6.
- “Reservation System ‘Could Save Beauty.’” *Colonist*, November 2, 1969, 19.
- “Restrict Land Tenure, MLA Urges,” *Colonist*, February 26, 1970, 1.
- “Safeguarding Precious Jewels.” *Sun*, April 26, 1974, 4.
- “Salt Spring Opinion Poll Part of Vote.” *Colonist*, November 18, 1977, 33.
- “Salt Spring Votes Faith in Trust.” *Colonist*, November 20, 1977, 15.
- “Second-guessing’ feared.” *Sun*, February 27, 1973, 14.
- “Ship Service Cut Blow to Islands.” *Colonist*, August 30, 1953, 17.

- “Steamer Service Wanted.” *Province*, April 5, 1905, 1.
- “Subdividing Halt Called.” *Colonist*, October 29, 1969, 19.
- “The Enchanted Isles.” *Victoria Daily Colonist*, September 26, 1943, 4.
- “The Ganges Sewer (March 1962-?).” *Driftwood*, 26 August 1981, 2.
- “The Gulf Islands Service.” *Colonist*, March 16, 1917, 4.
- “The New Democracy.” *Colonist*, June 14, 1974, 4.
- “Through the Islands.” *The Week*, 5 August 1905, 5
- “Tourists Flock to Gulf Islands.” *Colonist*, August 5, 1960, 23.
- “Transport Problems Splits Gulf Island Communities.” *Times*, May 31, 1955, 12.
- “Visiting British Columbia - a nice PACE to go.” *Gulf Islander*, February 25, 1961, 1.
- “We Are Destroying the Unique Gulf Islands.” *Province*, June 18, 1968, 4.
- “We’re Saying to Hell With the Future.” *Times*, November 12, 1969, 41.
- “Where to Quit Work in B.C.” *Sun*, August 10, 1940, Magazine Section, 4.
- “Will Trust Make them Coney Islands?” *Sun*, May 4, 1974, 49.
- “Woodman May Skip Scenic Site.” *Colonist*, August 18, 1951, 1.
- “Wrathful Mayne Island Residents Condem C.P.R Steamship Service.” *Colonist*, January 6, 1951, 15.
- “Zoning Bylaw ‘acceptable.’” *Colonist*, October 28, 1971, 39.
- Beyer, Hubert “Firm’s Galiano Plan Prompts Policy Shift.” *Colonist*, April 20, 1972, 25.
- Bultrum, Charles F.M. “Bring Tourists to the Gulf Islands, Letter.” *Province*, December 1, 1929, Magazine Section, 10
- Connell, Robert. “Among the Gulf Islands.” *Colonist*, September 25, 1938, Magazine Section, 3.
- “Among the Gulf Islands.” *Colonist*, September 25, 1938, Magazine Section, 3.
- Dickson, A. “Boom Island.” *Vancouver Sun*, June 4, 1949, Magazine Section, 6
- Farrow, Moira. “Gulf Islands Become a Gold Mine.” *Sun*, August 29, 1968, 12
- Ferry, Jon. “Islands Trust Fighting for Life.” *Colonist*, January 22, 1976, 11.
- Gibbs, M. “Pearl of the Gulf Islands.” *Colonist*, April 8, 1973, Magazine Section, 4-5.
- Glover, Randy. “Gulf Islands Trust Bill Labelled as “a catastrophe.”” *Sun*, May 7, 1974, 31.
- Hammond, Terry. “Paradise Found by New Ferry Link but Islanders May Call it Paradise Lost.” *Colonist*, July 5, 1963, 1.
- Horel, C.R. “It Is Expropriation Says Horel.” *Gulf Islands Driftwood*, 6 November 1969, 8.

- Loudon, Pete. "Big City Hustle-Bustle Serpent in Gulf 'Eden.'" *Victoria Daily Times*, February 15, 1964, 18.
- . "Hawaii of Canada Taking Form in Sheltered Gulf Island of B.C." *Times*, February 13, 1964, 21.
- . "They'll Commute to Gulf Islands Via hovercraft." *Times*, February 14, 1964, 17.
- Odam, Jes. "Gulf Islander proposes provincial recreation trust." *Sun*, May 4, 1973, 6.
- . "Gulf Islanders begin to fear cruel hoax." *Sun*, May 31, 1973, 6.
- . "How the Gulf Islanders Were Hoaxed." *Sun* October 16, 1973, 6.
- . "Problems of Paradise Aired." *Sun*, May 3, 1973, 11.
- . "Some Gulf Islands need protection soon." *Sun*, May 5, 1973, 12.
- Shreve, Sandi. "Gulf Islands Solutions Tricky." *Sun*, July 30, 1973, 26.
- . "Gulf Islands to Stay Rural." *Sun*, July 27, 1973, 13

Secondary Sources

- Aitken, Neil. *Island Time: Gabriola, 1874-1879*. Gabriola, B.C: Reflections, 1993.
- Altmeyer, George. "Three Ideas of Nature in Canada, 1893–1914." *Journal of Canadian Studies* 11 no.3 (August 1976): 21–36.
- Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, Rev. and extend ed. London, England: Verso, 1991.
- Badir, Patricia. "Our Performance Careless of Praise: Loss, Recollection, and the Production of Space in Walhachin, British Columbia." *BC Studies*, no.133 (Spring 2002): 31-68.
- Baldacchino, Godfrey. "Islands as Novelty Sites." *Geographical Review* 97, no.2 (April, 2007): 165-174.
- . "The Coming of Age of Island Studies." *Tijdschrift Voor Economische En Sociale Geografie* 95 no.3 (July 2004): 272-83
- Bantock, Nick, Iain T. Benson, Lisa Hobbs Birnie, Neil Boyd, Robert Bringhurst, Victor Chan, P. F. Clarke, et al., *Howe Sounds: Facts, Fiction and Fantasy from the Writers of Bowen Island*, Bowen Island, B.C: Bowen Island Arts Council, 1994.
- Jean Barman, *The West Beyond the West: A History of British Columbia*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991.
- Barr, Lorna. *Land of the Trust Islands: A Review of Subdivision, Housing, and Ownership*. Victoria, Islands Trust, 1978.
- Barrett, Dave and William Miller. *Barrett: A Passionate Political Life*. Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1995.

- Bavington, Dean. *Managed Annihilation: An Unnatural History of the Newfoundland Cod Collapse*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2010.
- BC Geological Services. "Gulf Islands." *BC Geographic Names*, <http://apps.gov.bc.ca/pub/bcgnws/names/4119.html> (accessed 5, November, 2015)
- . "Saltspring Island." *BC Geographic Names* <http://apps.gov.bc.ca/pub/bcgnws/names/13666.html> (accessed 8, January, 2016)
- Belasco, Warren. *Americans on the Road: From Autocamp to Motel 1910-1945*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1979.
- Bennett, Jason Patrick. "Blossoms and Borders: Cultivating Apples and a Modern Countryside in the Pacific Northwest, 1890-2001." PhD diss., University of Victoria, 2008.
- Billig, Michael. *Banal Nationalism*, Thousand Oaks, California; London: Sage, 2012.
- Blades, Michael. *Day of Two Sunsets: Paddling Adventures on Canada's West Coast*. Victoria: Orca, 1993.
- Blanchet, M. Wylie. *The Curve of Time*. Sidney: Gray's, 1968
- Bond, Bea. *Looking Back on James Island*. Sidney, BC, Porthole Press Ltd, 1991.
- Bothwell, Robert, Ian Drummond, and John English. *Canada Since 1945: Power, Politics and Provincialism*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1989.
- British Columbia Historical Association, Gulf Islands Branch. *A Gulf Islands Patchwork: Some Early Events on the Islands of Galiano, Mayne, Saturna, North and South Pender*. Sidney, B.C: Peninsula Printing Co., 1961.
- Brown, Dona. *Back to the Land : The Enduring Dream of Self-Sufficiency in Modern America*. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011.
- Budd, Robert. 'The Story of the Country:' Imbert Orchard's Quest for Frontier Folk in British Columbia 1870-1914. MA Thesis University of Victoria, 2000.
- Bultmann, Phyllis. *Border Boating: Twelve Cruises Through the San Juan and Gulf Islands*. Seattle: Pacific Search Press, 1979.
- Bunce, Micheal F. *The Countryside Ideal: Anglo-american Images of Landscape..* New York; London: Routledge, 1994.
- Campbell, Claire. *Shaped by the West Wind: Nature and History in Georgian Bay*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005.
- Campbell, Lara, Gregory S. Kealey, and Dominique Clément. *Debating Dissent: Canada and the Sixties*. London; Toronto; Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 2012.
- Capital Regional District Planning Department, *Summary of Gulf Islands Questionnaires Received to April 15, 1972*. Victoria, Capital Regional District Planning Department, April 1972.
- Capital Regional District. *Gulf Islands Study*. Victoria: Capital Regional District Planning Department, 1970.

- Capra, Fritjof. *The Hidden Connections: Integrating the Biological, Cognitive, and Social Dimensions of Life into a Science of Sustainability*. New York: Doubleday, 2002.
- . *The Web of Life: A New Scientific Understanding of Living Systems*. New York: Anchor Books, 1996.
- Carstairs, Catherine. "Food, Fear and the Environment in the Long Sixties." In *Debating Dissent: Canada and the Sixties*. Edited by Lara Campbell, Gregory S. Kealey, and Dominique Clément. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2012.
- Comgall, Margery. *The History of Hornby Island*. Courtenay: Comox District Free Press, 1969.
- Conover, David. *Once Upon an Island*. Markham: PaperJacks, 1972.
- . *One Man's Island*. Markham: PaperJacks, 1972.
- . *Sitting on a Salt Spring*. Markham: PaperJacks, 1978.
- Cosgrove, Dennis. Review of *Islands of the Mind: How the Human Imagination Created the Atlantic World*," by John R. Gillis. *Geografis Annaler Series B: Human Geography* 7, no.4 (2005): 302-303.
- Cran, Gregory. *Negotiating Buck Naked: Doukhobors, Public Policy, and Conflict Resolution*. Vancouver, B.C: UBC Press, 2006.
- Creates, Marlene. *Places of Presence: Newfoundland kin and Ancestral land, Newfoundland 1989-1991*. St. John's, NL: Killick's Press, 1997.
- Cronin, J. Keri. *Manufacturing National Park Nature: Photography, Ecology, and the Wilderness Industry of Jasper*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2011.
- Cronon, William. "The Uses of Environmental History." *Environmental History Review* 17, no.3 (1993): 1-22.
- Cryer, Beryl Mildred and Chris Arnett. *Two Houses Half-buried in Sand: Oral Traditions of the Hul'q'umi'num' Coast Salish of Kuper Island and Vancouver Island*. Vancouver: Talonbooks, 2007.
- Cummings, Al and Jo Cummings. *Gunkholing in the Gulf Islands*. Rev. ed. Edmonds, WA: Nor'westing, 1989.
- Danbom, David B. "Romantic Agrarianism in Twentieth-century America." *Agricultural History* 65, no.4 (1991): 1-12.
- Dawson, Michael. *Selling British Columbia: Tourism and Consumer Culture, 1890-1970*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2004.
- Demeritt, David. "Visions of Agriculture in British Columbia." *BC Studies* 108, no.29 (December 1995): 29-59.
- Derek Reimer, eds. "The Gulf Islanders," *Sound Heritage*, v. 5 no.4. Victoria, 1976.
- Dunae, Patrick. *Gentlemen Emigrants: From the British Public Schools to the Canadian Frontier*. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1981.

- Dunsmoor-Farley, Dyan. *Weldwood on Gabriola: Dancing With the Giant*, MA Thesis, Athabasca University, 2013.
- Eis, S. & D. Craigdallie. *Gulf Islands of British Columbia: A Landscape Analysis*. Victoria, B.C: Environment Canada Forestry Service, December 1980.
- Elections British Columbia. *An Electoral History of British Columbia, 1871-1986*. Victoria, BC: Legislative Library, 1988.
- Elliot, Marie. "The Japanese of Mayne Island." *British Columbia Historical News* 23, no.4 (Fall 1990): 15-16.
- . "A History of Mayne Island." MA Thesis, University of Victoria, BC, 1982.
- . *Mayne Island and the Outer Gulf Islands: a History*. Ganges, BC: Gulf Islands Press, 1984.
- Fahrni, Magdalena and Robert Rutherford. *Creating Postwar Canada: Community, Diversity, and Dissent, 1945-75*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2008.
- Finkel, Alvin. *Our Lives: Canada After 1945*. Toronto: J. Lorimer, 1997.
- Flucke, A.F. "Early Days on Saltspring Island." *B.C. Historical Quarterly* 15 no.3-4 (1951): 161-198.
- Garrish, Christopher. "Unscrambling the Omelette: Understanding British Columbia's Agricultural Land Reserve," *BC Studies* 136 no.25 (2002): 25-55.
- Gillis, John R. "Not Continents in Miniature: Islands as Ecotones." *Island Studies Journal* 9, no.1 (2014): 155-166.
- . and David Lowenthal. "Introduction." *Geographical Review* 97, no.2 (April 2007): iii-vi.
- Gillis, John. *Islands of the Mind: How the Human Imagination Created the Atlantic World*. New York, NY: Palgrave MacMillan, 2004.
- Glassberg, David. "Public History and the Study of Memory." *The Public Historian*. 18, no.2, (1996): 7-23
- Glover, Julia M. "The Island Trust Concept: A Proposed Institutional Arrangement to Implement a Policy of Controlled Development for the Gulf Islands of British Columbia." MSc Thesis, University of British Columbia, 1970.
- Gordon, Alan. *Making Public Pasts: The Contested Terrain of Montréal's Public Memories, 1891-1930*. Montréal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001.
- Gould, Rebecca Kneale. *At Home in Nature: Modern Homesteading and Spiritual Practice in America*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005.
- Green, A. J., J. P. van Vliet and E. A Kenney. "Soils of the Gulf Islands of British Columbia: Volume 4 Soils of Gabriola and Lesser Islands." *Land Resource Research Centre Reports* no.43 (Vancouver, BC: 1990): 6.
- Hamilton, Bea. *Salt Spring Island*, Vancouver: Mitchell Press, 1969.

- Harper, Marjory. "Aristocratic Adventurers/ British Gentlemen Emigrants on the North American Frontier, ca. 1880-1920." *Journal of the West* 36, no.2 (April 1997): 41-51.
- Harris, Cole and David Demeritt. "Farming and Rural Life." In *The Resettlement of British Columbia: Essays on Colonialism and Geographical Change*, edited by Cole Harris, 219-249. Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press, 1997.
- Harrison, June. *The People of Gabriola: A History of Our Pioneers*. Gabriola Island: Privately Printed, c. 1982
- Hay, Pete. "The Poetics of Island Place - Articulating Particularity." *Local Environment* 8, no.5 (October 2003): 553-558
- Hobsbawm, Eric and Terrence Ranger. *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- Holling, C.S. "Resilience and stability of ecological systems." *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 4 (1973), 1-23.
- Howard, Irene. *Bowen Island 1872-1972*, Bowen Island: Bowen Island Historians, 1973.
- Hurmuses, Paul. *Power Without Glory: The Rise and Fall of the NDP Government in British Columbia*. Vancouver: Balsam Press, 1976.
- Isbister, Winnifred A. *My Ain Folk: Denman Island 1875-1975*. Comox Valley: Bickle, 1976.
- Jacob, Jeffrey. *New Pioneers: The Back-to-the-land Movement and the Search for a Sustainable Future*. University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1997.
- Jasen, Patricia. *Wild Things: Nature, Culture, and Tourism in Ontario, 1790-1914*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995.
- Jones, David Keith. "British Columbia's Islands Trust On The Local Government Continuum- Administrative Agency Or Local Self-Government?" MA Thesis, Simon Fraser University, 1994.
- Kahn, Charles. *Salt Spring: The Story of an Island*. Madeira Park, B.C: Harbour Publishing, 1998.
- Kavic, Lorne and Garry Nixon. *The 1200 Days: A Shattered Dream: Dave Barrett and the NDP in BC 1972-75*. Coquitlam, B.C: Kaen, 1978.
- Kheraj, Sean. *Inventing Stanley Park: An Environmental History*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2013.
- Koroscil, Paul M. "A Gentleman Farmer in British Columbia's British Garden of Eden." In *British Columbia: Settlement History*, edited by Paul M. Koroscil. Burnaby BC: Simon Fraser University, 2000.
- Kostash, Myrna. *Long Way from Home: The Story of the Sixties Generation in Canada*, Toronto: J. Lorimer, 1980.

- Lander, Tim, eds. *To an Inland Sea: Poems for the Strait of Georgia*. Nanaimo: Nanaimo Publisher's Collective, 1992.
- Larkin, Peter. "Crawford Stanley Holling," *The Canadian Encyclopedia*, 2008. <http://thecanadianencyclopedia.com/en/article/crawford-stanley-holling/> (accessed November 20, 2015).
- Lears, Jackson. *No Place of Grace: Antimodernism and the Transformation of American Culture, 1880-1920*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1981.
- Little, J.S. *Crofters and Habitants: Settler Society, Economy, and Culture in a Quebec Township, 1848-1881*. Montreal/Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1991.
- Loo, Tina. "People in the Way: Modernity, Environment, and Society on the Arrow Lakes." *BC Studies* no.142 (Summer 2004): 161-196.
- . "Making a Modern Wilderness: Conserving Wildlife in Twentieth-century Canada." *Canadian Historical Review* 82, no.1 (2001): 91-121.
- MacEachern, Alan. *Natural Selections: Natural Parks in Atlantic Canada, 1935-1970*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001.
- MacLaren, Ian S. eds. *Culturing Wilderness in Jasper National Park: Studies in Two Centuries of Human History in the Upper Athabasca River Watershed*. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2007.
- Martin, Tara, Peter Arcese, and Nanda Scheerder. "Browsing Down Our Natural Heritage: Deer Impacts on Vegetation Structure and Songbird Populations Across an Island Archipelago." *Biological Conservation* 144 no.1 (2011): 459-469.
- Marwick, Arthur. *The Sixties: Cultural Revolution in Britain, France, Italy, and the United States, c.1958-c.1974*. New York; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- McCandless, Robert G. "Postponed Decisions: Petroleum Exploration on Canada's Western Continental Shelf." *BC Studies* 178 (Summer 2013): 71-96.
- McDonald, Lynn and Richard Wanner, *Retirement in Canada*. Toronto: Butterworths, 1990.
- McDonald, Robert A.J. "Holy Retreat' or 'Practical Breathing Spot'?: Class Perceptions of Vancouver's Stanley Park, 1910-1913." *Canadian Historical Review* 45, no.2 (1984): 127-53.
- Mckay, Ian. "History and the Tourist Gaze: The Politics of Commemoration in Nova Scotia, 1935-1964." *Acadiensis* 22, no.2 (1993): 102-38.
- . "The Liberal Order Framework: A Prospectus for a Reconnaissance of Canadian History." *Canadian Historical Review* 81, no.4 (December 2000): 617-651.
- . *Quest of the Folk: Antimodernism and Cultural Selection in Twentieth-Century Nova Scotia*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queens University Press, 1994
- Meggs, Geoff and Rod Mickleburgh. *The Art of the Impossible: Dave Barrett and the NDP in Power, 1972-1975*. Madeira, B.C: Harbour Pub, 2012.

- Mitchell, David. *W.A.C.: Bennett and the Rise of British Columbia*. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1983.
- Montmarquet, James A. *The Idea of Agrarianism: From Hunter-Gatherer to Agrarian Radical in Western Culture*. Moscow, Idaho: University of Idaho Press, 1989.
- Morris, Samantha. "Mapping the Family Road Trip: The Automobile, the Family and Outdoor Recreation in Postwar British Columbia." MA Thesis, University of Victoria, 2008.
- Murray, Peter. *Home From The Hill: Three Gentlemen Adventurers*. Victoria, B.C: Horsdal & Schubart, 1994.
- . *Homesteads and Snug Harbours - The Gulf Islands*. Ganges, BC: Horsdal & Schubart, 1991.
- Murton, James E. *Creating a Modern Countryside: Liberalism and Land Resettlement in British Columbia*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2007.
- Nadasdy, Paul. *Hunters and Bureaucrats: Power, Knowledge, and Aboriginal-State Relations in the Southwest Yukon*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2003.
- Olwig, Karen F. "Islands as Places of Being and Belonging." *Geographical Review* 97, no.2 (April 2007): 260-273.
- Opp, James & John C. Walsh. *Placing Memory and Remembering Place in Canada*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2010.
- Owram, Doug. *Born at the Right Time: A History of the Baby-boom Generation*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996.
- Palmer, Bryan D. "Radical Reasoning," *The Underhill Review* (Fall 2009).
- . *Canada's 1960s: The Ironies of Identity in a Rebellious Era*. London; Toronto; Buffalo: University of Toronto Press. 2009.
- Porcher, Laura Kathryn. "The Islands Trust: An Institutional Experiment in the Management of Scarce Natural and Social Resources." Ph.D. dissertation, University of British Columbia, 1980.
- Province of British Columbia Ministry of Municipal Affairs, Recreation, and Culture. *Statistics Relating to Regional and Municipal Government in British Columbia*. Victoria, Queen's Bench Press, 1990.
- Rajala, Richard. "Forests And Fish: The 1972 Coast Logging Guidelines And British Columbia's First NDP Government." *BC Studies* 159 no.81 (2008): 82.
- Rayner, Anne Patricia. "Everything Becomes an Island: Gulf Islands Writing and the Construction of Region." Ph.D dissertation, University of British Columbia, 1995.
- Rees, William and Erik Karlsen. "The Regional Districts and Environmental Management in B.C." *Papers on Local Government*, 1 no.6. Vancouver, BC: Centre for Continuing Education U.B.C, 1973.

- Resnick, Philip. "Social Democracy in Power: The Case of British Columbia." *BC Studies* no.34 (1977): 3-20.
- Ricard, François. *La génération lyrique: Essai sur la vie et l'oeuvre des premiers-nés du baby-boom*. Montréal: Boréal, 1992.
- Richard, George. "Price Ellison: A Gilded Man in British Columbia's Gilded Age." *BC Historical News* 31, no.3 (Summer 1998): 8-15.
- Riordan, T. O. "An Analysis of the Use and Management of Campgrounds in British Columbia Provincial Parks," *Economic Geography* 49, no.4 (October 1973), 298-308.
- Sandwell, R. W. *Contesting Rural Space: Land Policy and the Practices of Resettlement on Saltspring Island, 1859-1891*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005.
- . "Introduction." In *Beyond the City Limits: Rural History in British Columbia*, edited by R.W Sandwell, 3-16. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1999.
- . "Notes toward a History of Rural Canada, 1870-1940." In *Social Transformation in Rural Canada - Community, Cultures, and Collective Action*, edited by Maureen Gail Reed and John Parkins, 21-42. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012.
- Scott, James C. *Seeing Like a State: Why Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998.
- Selman, Paul H. *Sustainable Landscape Planning: The Reconnection Agenda*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2012.
- Simmons, Terry Allen. "But We Must Cultivate Our Garden: 20th Century Pioneering in Rural British Columbia." Ph.D. Dissertation, University of Minnesota, 1979.
- Stevens, Peter. "Roughing it in Comfort:" Family Cottaging and Consumer Culture in Postwar Ontario." *Canadian Historical Review* 94 no.2 (2013): 234-263.
- Stevenson, Judi and Sheila Harrington. *Islands in The Salish Sea: A Community Atlas*, Surrey, B.C: TouchWood Editions, 2005.
- Stewart, Howard Macdonald. "Five Easy Pieces On The Strait Of Georgia: Reflections On The Historical Geography Of The North Salish Sea," PhD Dissertation, University of British Columbia, 2014.
- Stratford, Elaine. "Flows and Boundaries: Small Island Discourses and the Challenge of Sustainability, Community and Local Environments." *Local Environment* 8 no.5 (October 2003): 495-499.
- Stratton, Morton B. "History of Agriculture on Salt Spring Island." Unpublished report for Saltspring Island Historical Society, 1991.
- Sweet, Arthur Fielding. *Islands in Trust*, Lantzville: Oolichan, 1988
- Swierenga, Robert P. "Theoretical Perspectives on the New Rural History: From Environmentalism to Modernism." *Agricultural History* 56, no.3 (1982): 495-502.

- Thomas, Suzanne. "Littoral Space(s) - Liquid Edges of Poetic Possibility." *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies*, 5 no.1 (Spring/Summer 2007): 21-29.
- Thorpe, Jocelyn. *Temagami's Tangled Wild: Race, Gender, and the Making of Canadian Nature*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012.
- Walden, Keith. *Becoming Modern in Toronto: The Industrial Exhibition and the Shaping of a Late Victorian Culture*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997.
- Wall, Karen. *The Nurture of Nature: Childhood, Antimodernism and Ontario Summer Camps, 1920-55*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2009.
- Wall, Sharon. "Totem Poles, Teepees, and Token Traditions: 'Playing Indian' at Ontario Summer Camps, 1920-1955." *The Canadian Historical Review* 86, no.3 (September 2005): 513-546.
- . *The Nurture of Nature: Childhood, Antimodernism and Ontario Summer Camps, 1920-55*. Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press, 2009.
- Walter, Margaret Shaw. *Early Days Among the Gulf Islands of British Columbia, 2nd ed.* Victoria: Hebden Print. Co., 1966.
- Weaver, Sharon. "First Encounters: 1970s Back-to-the-land Cape Breton, NS and Denman, Hornby and Lasqueti Islands, BC." *Oral History Forum* 30 (2010): 1-30.
- White, Richard. *Land Use, Environment, and Social Change- The Shaping of Island County, Washington*. Seattle and London: University of Washington Press, 1980.
- Williams, Raymond. *The Country and the City*. London: Hogarth Press, 1985.
- Withers, Charles W. J. "Place and the 'Spatial Turn' in Geography and in History." *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 70, no.4, (2009): 637-658.
- Worster, Donald. "Doing Environmental History," In *Canadian Environmental History: Essential Readings*, edited by David Freeland Duke, 9-24. Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press, 2006.
- Wynn, Graeme. Foreword to *Wet Praire: People, Land, and Water in Agricultural Manitoba*, by Shannon Stunden Bower. Vancouver, B.C: University of British Columbia Press, 2011.
- . *Timber Colony: A Historical Geography of Early Nineteenth Century New Brunswick*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981.
- Yorath, C. J. *A Measure of Value: The Story of the D'arcy Island Leper Colony*. Victoria, B.C: TouchWood Editions, 2000.
- Zelizer, Barbie. "Reading the Past Against the Grain: The Shape of Memory Studies." *Critical Studies in Mass Communication* 12, no.2 (June 1995): 214-239.